RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 126 29 AUGUST 2013 PAGES 13078 TO 13190



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Page 13078 [PROCEEDINGS ON 29 AUGUST 2013]

2 [09:31] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. We

- 3 were asked to wait before commencing this morning so that
- 4 some of Mr Mpofu's clients had an opportunity to be here
- 5 but he's now informed me that they've not yet arrived.
- 6 Perhaps you can say something further on that so we can
- 7 start in their absence. Do you think they may well arrive
- 8 while you're busy?
- 9 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you very much,
- 10 Chairperson.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON: Let's put that on record.
- 12 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, thanks
- 13 or the indulgence. The reason why we're starting half an
- 14 hour late is because I requested the Commissioners in
- 15 chambers to await my clients. We've just called them, they
- 16 said they are not very far, they're crossing the last
- 17 bridge. Unfortunately I don't know which yes, too many
- 18 rivers to cross for them, I think. So we have agreed that
- 19 we should start. If their arrival seems to cause any
- 20 disruption then we'll ask for a five minute adjournment but
- 21 hopefully I'm going to ask my attorneys to make sure that
- 22 they try and move, come in as quietly as possible,
- 23 Chairperson.

1

- 24 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Now what we're
- 25 doing this morning is you're going to tell us orally what

Page 13080

- 1 help us to tailor what we are going to say. At this stage
- 2 the only party that has indicated that it will oppose the
- 3 application are the evidence leaders. They indicated so at
- 4 the meeting of the 21st of August. As far as we know, all
- 5 the other parties at least obviously they're not bound by
- 6 the positions they took in the previous application but in
- 7 that application they had indicated that they would abide
- 8 by the decision of the Commission.
- 9 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, my instructions
- 10 are to oppose so Mr Mpofu must proceed on that basis.
- 11 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, as far as our
- 12 position is concerned, we will reserve our position until
- 13 we've heard the application. We certainly will want to
- 14 respond to it but whether we, what formal position we take
- 15 up will depend on what relief is sought, what the grounds
- 16 are, what the facts are.
- 17 MR SHOZI: Chair, we similarly reserve
- 18 our position until we've heard the application and the
- 19 grounds of the application. Thank you.
- 20 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Does anybody
- 21 else representing any of the parties wish to state at this
- 22 stage already what the attitude of the party concerned will
- 23 be?

4

7

10

17

20

- 24 MR NTSONKOTA: As the Chair pleases, it's
- 25 Thando Ntsonkota on behalf of NUM. We would also like to

Page 13079

- the relief is that you seek as far as postponement is
- 2 concerned, you're going to tell us what the facts are on
- 3 which you rely, so this can then be transcribed or in
- 4 effect be the written notice of motion and the factual
- 5 averments upon which it rests and we will then proceed with
- 6 the evidence. That will be transcribed. I'm assured it
- 7 will be available by 9 o'clock tomorrow. It can then be
- 8 given to the parties and they will then have until Tuesday
- 9 to respond. I was informed this morning that the
- 10 Department of Justice wishes to oppose the application, so
- 11 I stated that they were also to be then given a copy of the
- 12 transcription of what you tell us. Mr Mpofu, would you
- 13 like to commence?
- 14 MR MPOFU: Yes. Thank you, Chairperson.
- 15 Exactly as the Chairperson outlined, we intend to have the
- 16 transcript, as it were, serving as the founding affidavit
- 17 so we'll make both the factual and the legal averment.
- 18 Chairperson, before we start, just a matter of

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

- 19 housekeeping. Thank you for informing us about the
- 20 Department of Justice. We'll consider our position as to
- 21 whether they're entitled to oppose the matter in these
- 22 proceedings but that's another story.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 23 What we would like, Chairperson, with your leave,
- 24 is maybe an indication at some stage, either now or at some
- 25 stage of who is opposing the application because it might

Page 13081

- put forward our position once we've heard the basis for the
- 2 application, Chair. For now we'd like to reserve our
- 3 rights, thank you.
 - MR MPOFU: Thank you very much,
- 5 Chairperson. Maybe it's appropriate to start with
- 6 outlining the relief that would have been in a notice of
 - application.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON: Effectively you're going to
- 9 read what would amount to the notice of motion.
 - MR MPOFU: Yes.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON: I see we've been given some
- 12 documents, I -
- 13 MR MPOFU: Chair, yes, I'll refer to
- 14 those -
- 15 CHAIRPERSON: One of them is the amended
- 16 Notice of Motion -
 - MR MPOFU: In the –
- 18 CHAIRPERSON: In the High Court.
- 19 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 - CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's been marked 1A.
- 21 MR MPOFU: 1A yes. No, hold on,
- 22 everyone's got this, Chair. It's just cross-referencing,
- 23 it's not the others are just cases.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON: I take it you're not going
 - to argue the application today, are you? You're just going

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 13082 to tell us what -2 MR MPOFU: Well, the basis - well, what 3 I'll do is, Chair, what I propose to do is not necessarily 4 to argue it but as one would do in an affidavit, you'd put 5 factual and some of the legal -CHAIRPERSON: 6 Yes, yes -7 MR MPOFU: - legal basis. 8 CHAIRPERSON: No, I understand. 9 MR MPOFU: But I would - thank you. 10 Sorry to interrupt, MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair. The parties don't have copies of that. We will, 11 once we've been given copies by the Commission, arrange to 12 13 distribute to everybody. 14 CHAIRPERSON: I will listen patiently to

Mr Mpofu and, well, Adv Hemraj is ahead of me in proffering 15 her copy so her copies will be taken away and extra copies 16 17 will be made and made available to the evidence leaders and 18 if there's anyone else who wants copies, will they please 19 raise their hands. 20 MR MPOFU: It's just the amended Notice 21

of Motion which I'll read into the record. I don't think anyone needs to have a copy as such or alternatively they already have copies, we served it on everybody. CHAIRPERSON: You carry on. Copies are

24 25 being made in the meanwhile, it doesn't prejudice anybody Page 13084

state funding which has been set down for hearing on the 25th and 26th of September 2013, whichever happens first. I will therefore start by unpacking, as it were, these two events, the happening of which will mark the end date of the postponement period, of the proposed postponement period.

Firstly, I'll talk about the outcome of the application or the main application set down for 26 and 26 September. That application, Chairperson, in a nutshell is for - I'm referring to the document marked 1A and "Ad B" thereof says the following, it's an application for an order in the following terms, "1. Declaring the conduct of the first, second and fourth respondents" - that is the President, the Minister of Justice and the Legal Aid Board, Legal Aid South Africa as it's called these days - "in failing and/or refusing to provide the applicants with legal aid in respect of the Commission proceedings unlawful, unconstitutional and accordingly invalid. 2. Ordering the first, second and third respondents to take all reasonable steps to provide adequate, fair and equitable legal aid to the applicants in respect of the future proceedings of the Commission on the scale or tariff ordinarily employed by the third respondent, in other words on legal aid rates, including all reasonable costs incurred

to date, less any amount received from third parties." The

Page 13083

and those who get the copies will appreciate, so the police

want a copy and the evidence leaders want a copy. Anybody 2

3 else? Mr - perhaps 10 copies could be made.

4 MR MPOFU: Okay. Thank you then,

5 Chairperson, I think that would cover then the issues of

housekeeping. Chairperson -6

22

23

1

10

11

12

13

7 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, that 10, does that include the Human Rights Commission as well? You want 8 9 a copy too, I take it?

MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, what we're doing is we're making 10 copies will be enough to cover everyone who's here for the moment and we're getting it scanned and we will circulate to everyone electronically.

14 MR MPOFU: That's fine. Chairperson, 15 this is - oh sorry, just one more housekeeping matter. I was asked to convey the apologies of my learned colleague 16 17 Mr Ntsebeza who unfortunately could not change his flight 18 for his Bloemfontein engagement. His attorney Mr Mosikidi is here but since he had promised, he asked me to convey his -20

CHAIRPERSON: 21 Thank you. Thanks, Chairperson. 22 MR MPOFU:

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Chairperson, this is an application for the postponement of

24 the Commission pending the attainment of funding, either

from private sources or the outcome of the application for

Page 13085

rest is just the usual prayers for alternative relief and so on. Those are the principal prayers, Chairperson.

3 In other words, Chairperson, what is - if the

4 Chairperson could just bear with me one second. That

5 prayer or rather those prayers must be read in the context

6 of what was said in the Constitutional Court in summing up

7 the position at paragraph 2 of the Constitutional Court

judgment, Chairperson, which says that the Commission -

paragraph 1 talks about when the Commission commenced and

10 so on and then 2 says, "To cover the legal and other

expenses incurred by their participation in the 11

12 Commission's proceedings, the applicants procured funding

13 from a non-governmental entity, the Raith Foundation.

14 However, this funding was only secured for the six month

15 period from October 2012 until March 2013. The applicants

have been unable to secure funding for the period April

17 2013 until October 2013, neither have they been able to

18 secure contingent funding should the Commission's term be

19 extended once again." The Constitutional Court summed up

20

therefore in that paragraph the position. In other words,

21 Chairperson, we've unscientifically postulated that the

22 Commission may be extended and let's say for another five

23 months, in which case it would last 18 months, that's just

24 a working figure. If it does, what is being said that the

funding requested is for the 18 months minus the six

15

3

4

14

15

16

19

21

1

7

8

13

Page 13088

Page 13086

months, which would be the 12 months. That's the period 2

for which no funding has been secured and is being sought. The other issue that I'd like to point out in

relation to that application is that although some of the

5 parties are cited as respondents, in reality and in keeping

with the posture they assumed in the Constitutional Court, 6

7 in reality the applicants are the injured and arrested, the

deceased families, AMCU, the LRC representing the 8

9 Ledingwane family and the Human Rights Commission to some

10 extent. And the practical arrangements in court were that

those parties would be entitled to argue and reply as if 11

they were applicants. I'm told that the clients are here, 12

thank you Chairperson. 13

> CHAIRPERSON: Do you want us to take a short adjournment so that they can come in without disturbing -

17 MR MPOFU: Let's see how it goes, 18 Chairperson, let's see if it's disruptive. If it's not,

we'll just carry on, thanks. Yes, in any event I'll deal

20 with the preliminary issues, Chairperson. So that's the

other thing I wanted to bring to the attention of the

22 court, of the Commission, in relation to the application.

23 The second issue is or second event which may or 24 may not curtail the period of postponement is the

25 attainment of funds from other sources other than the

Page 13087

state, and Chairperson, in respect of that we would submit

that there are reasonable prospects of, at the very least, 2

3 at the minimum, being able - yes, Chairperson, I think

4 we'll have to ask for five minutes.

5 CHAIRPERSON: We'll adjourn for five

minutes. 6

> [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES1

[10:02] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. I

9 see guite a lot of your clients have now arrived.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes

11 CHAIRPERSON: So we're able to proceed?

12 MR MPOFU: We'll proceed. Thank you very

much, Chairperson, for the indulgence. There are problems with buses, and so on, but they're here now. Thank you 14

15 very much, Chairperson, much appreciated. Chairperson, I

was at the point where I was talking about the second 16

17 trigger event, which is the attainment of funds, and I was

18 saying that we believe, Chairperson, in the High Court we

19 were always called eternal optimists, but we have to be

optimistic when we are involved in this kind of struggle,

21 but we believe that there are reasonable prospects of the

22 attainment of funds, at the very least for quicker or

speedier interim return, even before the hearing. That

24 optimism is based on, as I indicated yesterday, firstly the

25 fact that the clients that we represent, the workers, the

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

protesters, so eager are they to come back to the

Commission that they themselves made a collection at the

commemoration service, using buckets that were passed

around there, which I call their own version of the bucket

5 system, and they collected - the exact amount is

R17 201.50. It came mostly in coins and every South 6

7 African coin was there, from 1 cent, to the R5-coin, and my

8 favourite part is that when the money was being counted, we

9 found on top of this money one American dollar and one

10 Maloti from Lesotho. So it means it has both an African

11 and an international flavour in this collection, and they

12 did this in the name of assisting the effort for their

13 lawyers to return to the Commission.

Secondly, Chairperson, I know that they are busy trying to devise other ways of similar fundraising, but secondly there are other more conventional ways of

17 fundraising that have been initiated. Most notably there's

a new organisation which calls itself Citizens4Marikana.

19 Mr Eric De Ridder, who's sitting there - you can lift your

20 hand - comes from that organisation, and they have

21 approached us because they in turn have been approached by

22 people from all walks of life and citizens and

23 organisations who also want to assist in the effort to

24 assist the legal representation of the victims, and

thirdly, there's always the - although I'm not holding my

Page 13089

breath on this one - there's always the off-chance that the

government will come to its senses and settle the matter

3 before the hearing, and a combination of those

4 possibilities might see an earlier return than the dates

5 postulated.

6

7

8

9

16

17

18

19

COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Mr Mpofu, when you talk about returning before the court date, what sort of period are you looking at, if you're talking about interim

funding? I'm sorry, Commissioner, I MR MPOFU:

10 11 missed the second part of the question.

12 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: If you're talking 13 about interim funding and returning possibly before the 14 court date in the High Court, what sort of periods are you 15

looking at? What timeframes are you looking at? MR MPOFU: Oh, yes, thank you, Madam Commissioner. Well, it's difficult to say. I know for a

fact that there's a public march that is being planned, which is also part of the fundraising effort. I'm thinking

20 that by the time that happens, which I've been told is

21 within a week or two, then all these things that I've mentioned would have been pulled together somehow and

23 communicated to us, and if the indication is that there is

24 enough for us to come back, we will come back, and I must

indicate that that, as far as I'm concerned it would mean

Page 13093

- covering costs of overheads and things like that, not
- 2 necessarily the fees, because we have gone so long without
- 3 fees, so another three weeks would not necessarily be
- 4 prohibitive, because we also have to contribute, we have to
- 5 contribute - at least speaking for myself, I would
- contribute to the effort of coming back even if my fees 6
- 7 were not covered. So a couple of weeks at worst.

8 But I think, Commissioner Hemraj, the importance

9 of that happening would not only relate to the period,

let's say between that coming back and the case. It would

obviously, even the period of awaiting judgment or whatever

would have happened, so the advantage would be quite a 12

13 profound one indeed.

10

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

14

15

16

17

Chairperson, it was correctly pointed out and intimated by the Commission itself and by my learned colleagues Mr Budlender and Mr Semenya that this application is no trivial matter, but one whose outcome will have a profound effect on the complexion and texture and the credibility of the ultimate outcome of this Commission. We agree that this is not your conventional

21 postponement application. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I understood you 23 were just going to tell us effectively the relief you seek

24 and the facts on which you rely.

25 MR MPOFU: Yes, I'm getting there. Page 13090

- point that it is trite that the dominant issue in an
- 2 application of this kind is a question of prejudice or
- 3 potential prejudice to the applicants, or indeed to both

4 sides.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I have to say to

6 you, I understand you're not arguing -

7 MR MPOFU: I understand that, Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON: You're going to give us

9 effectively the notice of motion, the relief you seek, and

then you're going to give us the facts on which you rely. 10

11 You're going a little beyond that at the moment. If this

12 is by way of introduction -

13 MR MPOFU: It is.

14 CHAIRPERSON: - I'll give you a little

bit more leeway, but please don't take too much time for

16 that.

15

21

17 MR MPOFU: Well Chairperson, as I 18 understand it, a founding affidavit is not just crudely

19 composed of facts alone; it also sets out the legal basis

20 for which the application -

> CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, I understand, but

22 you haven't got to your founding affidavit yet.

23 MR MPOFU: Ja.

24 CHAIRPERSON: You're still - are you

going to give us a notice of motion first, the relief you

Page 13091

1 CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

2 MR MPOFU: I'm saying that it's profound

3 simply because your unenviable task, Chairperson and

- 4 Commissioners, will be to make a determination as to
- 5 whether the Commission continues in the absence of the
- majority of the victims, or whether it is postponed to 6
- 7 enable them meaningfully to participate in the Commission,
- 8 which cannot be an easy decision. But I would like to
- 9 venture to say that the decision you make might also have
- 10 an impact as to whether at the end of the Commission there
- 11 is ground to suggest that an irregularity has been
- 12 committed or not, in view of a potential refusal and maybe

13 even a granting; who knows?

> So the decision you take may or may not deal a fatal blow to the perceived credibility of the outcome. As the Constitutional Court put it that the outcome would be compromised. This is what the Constitutional Court said -

- 18 I know I've quoted it before, it says, "Ordinarily a
- 19 functionary setting up a Commission," in this case that
- would mean the President, "has to ensure an adequate
- 21 opportunity to all who should be heard by it. Absent a
- 22 fair opportunity, the search for truth and the purpose of
- the Commission may be compromised."
- Well, I'll come back to this point, but just to
- 25 finalise what I'll call the legal point, I just make a

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

seek? 1

4

2 MR MPOFU: No, I've gone past - oh, I

3 understand, Chairperson. No, no, I've gone past that.

> CHAIRPERSON: So I'm interested in what

5 relief you seek.

6 MR MPOFU: The relief – if I may repeat,

7 it's quite short – it's the postponement of the Commission

pending attainment of funding from private sources, or the

9 outcome of the application for State funding, which has

10 been set down for hearing on 25/26 September, whichever

happens first. That's it. So I'm unpacking now that 11

12 relief.

13

15

CHAIRPERSON: Now you're giving us the

14 founding affidavit.

> MR MPOFU: Absolutely.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. We have now the

17 virtual founding affidavit.

18 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I was

19 saying, Chairperson, that the dominant issue is prejudice

20 and convenience, obviously looked at from both sides. I'd

21 like to start with that, Chairperson, but maybe before I do

so, let me - so that the Chairperson doesn't have to remind

me again - just outline some of the facts, the crude facts, 23

24 as it were. One is that -

25 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off, inaudible]

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

```
Page 13094
                                                                                                                        Page 13096
    the facts, I suppose you should really outline all the
                                                                       the point I'm making.
2
    relevant facts.
                                                                   2
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Will the High Court then be
3
           MR MPOFU:
                              All the relevant facts, but
                                                                   3
                                                                       called upon to decide to what extent the legal aid which
4
    some of them are obviously contained in what are fairly
                                                                       has been granted to the families is inadequate and falls
5
    legal submissions.
                                                                       short of what should be granted, and then make an order in
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                       respect of that? Because I don't see that in the notice of
6
                                  I see, alright.
                                                                   6
7
           MR MPOFU:
                                                                   7
                              Yes. But yes, these are the
                                                                       motion.
    main facts. (1), that we represent more than 300 persons
                                                                   8
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                No -
8
                                                                   9
9
    who are described in the terms of reference either as
                                                                              MR MOSIKIDI:
                                                                                                   Chair, Thabo Mosikidi from
    falling under the category of injured or which I think is
                                                                  10
                                                                      SERI. I represent the families of the deceased. Chair,
10
    estimated at 78 in the terms of reference, but the numbers
                                                                  11
                                                                       just to clarify the position, the families are indeed
11
                                                                  12
12
    are not important, and arrested, which in the terms of
                                                                       funded by the Legal Aid Board and as much as we are
                                                                  13
13
    reference is again estimated at about 250. The actual
                                                                       applicants in the High Court, or at least we are applicants
14
    number is 272, but once again the numbers are not -
                                                                  14
                                                                       in the Constitutional Court and we are supporting the High
15
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  I take it some of the
                                                                  15
                                                                       Court application, it is not our aim to seek relief to
    arrested people, or possibly all of the injured people were
16
                                                                       review the equality of arms or the adequacy thereof, or
17
    arrested, were they?
                                                                  17
                                                                       lack of adequacy of the current fund that's been provided.
18
           MR MPOFU:
                              Not all -
                                                                  18
                                                                       It might be something that comes along the line, but it's
19
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Or are there some -
                                                                  19
                                                                       certainly not our relief at this stage.
20
           MR MPOFU:
                              There is an overlap, but it's
                                                                  20
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    So the relief sought only
21
                                                                  21
    not complete, Chairperson.
                                                                       relates actually to the people who've been described as the
                                                                       injured and arrested -
22
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                  22
                                  I see. I see.
23
                                                                  23
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Correct.
           MR MPOFU:
                              Yes, that's why the number
                                                                  24
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - miners.
24
    then jumps to over 300, yes, and then of course my learned
                                                                                                Yes, Chairperson. That is
25
                                                                  25
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
    colleagues represent mostly the deceased's families, which
                                                      Page 13095
                                                                                                                        Page 13097
    we'd say the number is probably, that we're talking about
1
                                                                   1
                                                                       correct.
                                                                   2
2
    is probably just more than 350, give or take.
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    The families are applicants
3
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   The deceased's families
                                                                       - I'm not sure whether they've locus standi to apply, but
    are, I understand, receiving legal aid. Is that correct?
                                                                       that's not a matter that I have to concern myself with.
4
5
            MR MPOFU:
                                                                       They're only applicants on a sort of solidarity basis, if
                               They are - well, not
    adequately. I think Mr -
                                                                   6
                                                                       that's the correct word one can use. Is that right?
6
7
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                   7
                                                                              MR MOSIKIDI:
                                   No, no -
                                                                                                   For a lack of a better
                                                                   8
8
            MR MPOFU:
                               But I don't want to speak for
                                                                       word, yes, we can assume it that way, Chair, thank you.
9
                                                                   9
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
     some -
                                                                                                Yes, Chairperson, maybe for
10
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   The adequacy -
                                                                  10
                                                                       the sake of completion on that point, my understanding,
11
            MR MPOFU:
                               Some legal aid.
                                                                  11
                                                                       subject to what my learned colleague would say, is that is
12
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   Adequacy is another matter.
                                                                  12
                                                                       also the position of AMCU, which is an applicant but in
13
            MR MPOFU:
                               Yes.
                                                                  13
                                                                       solidarity, as the Chairperson explained it. The only
14
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   They did make an
                                                                  14
                                                                       distinction is that the deceased's families - and I'm sure
15
     application to the Legal Aid Board and they were granted
                                                                  15
                                                                       Mr Mosikidi will deal with that - have made what I think is
                                                                  16
    legal aid.
                                                                       a profound statement in their own papers of saying that
16
17
            MR MPOFU:
                               They were granted some legal
                                                                  17
                                                                       because the people that they represent are deceased, they
18
    aid. Mr Ntsebeza explained it in detail on the 26th of
                                                                  18
                                                                       rely for their own closure and knowing the truth on the
19
     February -
                                                                  19
                                                                       testimony of the survivors, namely the injured and
20
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                   Well, there may be a debate
                                                                       arrested, and that without the participation of the injured
21
     about the adequacy -
                                                                       and arrested, their own participation would be meaningless,
            MR MPOFU:
                              Yes, 26th of February, the
                                                                       and they've made that statement here. Thank you,
22
    transcript would assist you, Chairperson, Mr Ntsebeza
                                                                  23
23
                                                                       Chairperson, thank you for seeking that clarity.
    outlined it. But in any event, the point is that they are
                                                                  24
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    We've got clarity on that.
    applicants now to this postponement application. That's
                                                                       That's all I'm asking.
  ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE
```

MR MPOFU: Ja, at least so that the

2 facts -

1

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

21

23

25

3 CHAIRPERSON: - made the point which I 4 hadn't even thought of asking you, but I should have,

what's the position of AMCU, but you've explained that. 5

[10:22] MR MPOFU: 6 Thank you, Chairperson, yes,

7 so that's fact number 1, so to speak. The applicants that

I represent, as you know, Chairperson, just for the record, 8

9 are represented by one advocate and assisted by attorneys

whose number varies from time to time but who comes from

what we call the triumvirate of law firms, that's all explained in the papers.

The third issue is that – or rather fact, is that the main dispute in these proceedings, there are many disputes so I don't want to be drawn into that but the overriding dispute is whether or not these people that we represent and that they represent were killed or injured by the police in self-defence or not.

CHAIRPERSON: I think it's actually self or private defence – that's effectively the only defence raised by the police.

22 MR MPOFU: That's correct, Chairperson.

23 Thank you, Chairperson, yes, self or private defence. The

24 other fact is that at least the version of the people I

25 represent is that their calamities, of whichever type, were

Page 13100 but I'm not sure it's necessarily on the record unless you

just want to refer to the transcript of what you said

yesterday.

4 MR MPOFU: Oh yes, thank you,

Chairperson, yes you're quite correct, so that this one is

compact. Yes, thank you, Chairperson. That matter, in a

7 nutshell, related to the arrest, wave of arrests that have

8 taken place since last Thursday which involves about 10

9 people, five of whom have already been arrested and

10 released on bail and five of whom are - actually as we

11 speak, two of my attorneys are not here now, they are doing

12 the, making the bail applications of the other five right

13 now. And the only relevance of that to you, Chairperson

14 and Commissioners, or to this application is the fact that

all those bail conditions, just like the one of the 272

accused, have been held over until the conclusion of the

17 Commission. I'll find it later, but that fact should be

viewed in conjunction with the wording of phase 1 in this

19 Commission which, among other things, seeks - I'm

20 paraphrasing because I don't have it on hand now – seeks to

21 determine, if I may just, Chairperson - yes, thank you

22 Chairperson. Phase 1, you'll remember - I'm reading this

23 from the affidavit of the Human Rights Commission in the

24 papers with the quote, phase 1, this is what the legal, the

Human Rights Commission says. "The 16th respondent," which

Page 13101

is them "is also of the view that the applicants are

entitled to proper legal representative before the Commission. This view is based on the fact that the

Commission is investigating the applicants and their

5 actions during the week 9 to 16 August 2012. This view is

6 made even stronger by virtue of the fact that the

7 Commission has made a ruling on the scope of phase 1 of the

8 proceedings before the Commission to include '1. an

investigation into whether participants in the crowd of

10 protesters at Wonderkop on 16th August 2012 should be held

criminally liable for the deaths of 34 of their fellow 11

12 protesters and/or in respect of the alleged attempted

13 murder or assault of SAPS members at the scene, and 2. the

14 direct causes of and legal responsibility of any party for

15 the deaths and injuries to any persons and damage to

16 property at Marikana during the period 9 to 16 August

17 2012'."

18 At the risk of stating the obvious, we are currently busy with that phase 1 which will determine, among other things, the things that I've just set out. And 21 therefore we say that the terms of reference or rather the 22 phase as described deals specifically with the criminal

23 liability of the injured and arrested or rather the

24 arrested, mostly, and some of the people who have now been

arrested or rather, subsequently arrested.

Page 13099

caused by a toxic collision between SAPS and Lonmin, that's

2 their version and that those parties in combination are

3 represented by about 12 advocates.

The next fact is that the witness who is testifying at present, General Mpembe, is easily the most important witness in that he was the overall commander of the operation that led to the massacre.

Fact number 6 is that the evidence leaders are currently re-cross-examining that important witness, purportedly to put, among other things, the version of the people that we represent.

Fact number 6 is something that we've already covered, which is that the matter is set down for the 25th and 26th September.

Fact number 7, number 8 is also a matter that we've just covered, namely that the applicants that I represent, with at least two other parties, have provisionally withdrawn from these proceedings.

Fact number 9 is also a matter that we covered when we were dealing with the relief, which is that there are fundraising efforts which may yield earlier temporary 22 relief.

Fact number 10 is an issue we covered yesterday about possible or alleged ongoing harassment of witnesses.

CHAIRPERSON: You covered it yesterday

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

2

21

Commission.

3 need for the legal representative of the applicants, while 4 the state intends to keep its own representation by private 5 lawyers. 6 And then lastly in the dozen of factual averments 7 is what I call some of the statistical issues or the 8 figures. We know now from what the Minister of Justice 9 said last week that the state proposes, on the assumption 10 that the Commission will finish at the end of October -11 which we know is not going to happen – has made a provision 12 of some R115 million to be spent on the Commission, made up as R32 million in the year 2012/2013 and a further R83 13 14 million in the financial year 83, or rather 2013/2014 and 15 that includes the money that they use for, that they spend on legal representatives and that it was made clear that in 16 that amount of 115 million there's no place for the 17 18 assistance for the victims or, to be fair, no place for the 19 victims who were not in the employ of the state. 20 Secondly, because of the already skewed nature of 21 the representation, the estimate of what has been spent on 22 legal representation which was submitted in the 23 Constitutional Court at least and not contested, which is 24 contained at the last page of 1A in front of you there, 25 Chairperson, and according to those estimates - and it's Page 13103 worked on a rounded 20 day month – the applicants that we 1 represent, the injured and arrested, and these are figures 2 3 just for what would be advocates' fees, for such a 20 day 4 month at legal aid rates obviously, the cost for the one 5 advocate who represents the applicants would be about 6 R340 000 and the estimate that is given for the monthly 7 spend for SAPS is R3 million. The estimate that's given 8 for the monthly spend for Lonmin is R2 million and the 9 estimate for what is spent on the evidence leaders is about 10 R3 million per month. Based on the current lifespan of the 11 Commission which will end at the end of October, which 12 would be a 13 month lifespan, the spend on the first 13 applicant would be 4.4 million, on SAPS it would be 39 million, Lonmin 24 million, evidence leaders 39 million. 14 15 And based on the 18 month life span, which is more 16 realistic if there's going to be an extension, the 17 breakdown would be for the applicants 6.1 million, for SAPS 18 54 million, for Lonmin 36 million, evidence leaders 54 19 million and those figures might not be exactly fitting with the 115 million that has been admitted by the Minister but

they are more or less in line. Of course we accept that in

And then the breakdown of the number of advocates

22 the 115 million there are other costs of running the

25 as extended – those representing the applicants that I

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Fact number 11 is that what we call the state

parties or the government is of the view that there is no

Page 13104 represent, one advocate, SAPS seven, Lonmin five, evidence 2 leaders seven. 3 CHAIRPERSON: I think -4 MR MPOFU: Oh ja, Mr Madlanga -5 CHAIRPERSON: - this elevation of Mr 6 Madlanga to the Constitutional Court, it's now down to six. 7 MR MPOFU: Well, six and a half. Six and 8 a half. At least he was here for the, until the 1st of 9 August but I accept that correction. 10 CHAIRPERSON: As far as the relief you 11 seek is concerned, it relates to the future, not the past. 12 MR MPOFU: Yes. 13 CHAIRPERSON: It would be six, but anyway 14 presumably that's a matter the evidence leaders will deal 15 16 MR MPOFU: It's taken into account. 17 CHAIRPERSON: It doesn't affect the 18 principle. 19 MR MPOFU: No, it doesn't but I concede 20 that point, Chairperson. And in terms of the seniority, we 21 state that the number of silks or recommended silks, or 22 someone at the Bar calls it silkworms, these are the people 23 who have been recommended for silk but are awaiting a 24 judgment - one for the first applicant, four for SAPS, three for Lonmin and four for evidence leaders or three now Page 13105

that Mr Madlanga is not here. CHAIRPERSON: I see, you included recommended silks. That's -MR MPOFU: Ja, that's what I -CHAIRPERSON: That's where you get the three from as far as the evidence leaders -MR MPOFU: That's correct, silkworms, that's what we call them at the Bar. They are neither butterflies nor worms. Thank you, Chairperson. So that then, Chairperson, circumscribes the 12 main factual bases for the application. If I may then return to the matter of – let me put it this way, the possible effect of not granting the postponement, which is the same thing as saying what prejudice would be, could be suffered by either the applicants or the public in general. Chairperson, it has been said that an application - or rather let me put it this way. My starting point would be that this is effectively a sui generis kind of postponement application because there's a lot of law on applications for

that's really what this is. It's a postponement for, a

postponement based on seeking legal representation and

postponement while the applicants are seeking to assert

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

19

20

1

Page 13106

1 number 8 of this Commission.

2 [10:41] In numerous - too numerous to mention - cases, it

- 3 has been found that the right to legal representation, or
- 4 the refusal of a postponement based on an applicant seeking
- 5 the right to legal representation may amount to a gross
- 6 irregularity, which undermines or vitiates the proceedings
- 7 per se, and that is covered very briefly in what I've given
- 8 you as case number 1, which is the judgment of Plasket J,
- 9 in S versus Lusu, where he said, just to summarise at the
- 10 end, "In these circumstances I'm of the view that the
- 11 accused's fundamental right to a fair trial was infringed
- 12 by the dismissal of his application for a postponement to
- 13 allow him the opportunity to apply for legal aid. That
- 14 being so, the proceedings that led to the conviction of the
- 15 accused were irregular. This irregularity is of such a
 - / mature that it vitiates the proceedings pay as // I/m
- 16 nature that it vitiates the proceedings per se." I'm
- 17 sorry, I'm reading from paragraph 19, the very last18 paragraph.

In other words, the risk, obviously that was said in the context of a criminal trial, but the risk, fairness

- 21 is fairness: it doesn't matter whether, whatever it is.
- 22 The risk of vitiating the proceedings themselves looms
- 23 large when one is considering the question of a
- 24 postponement for the purposes of obtaining legal
- 25 representation, and in relying on that, one of the passages

Page 13108

MR MPOFU: Well, that's the spectre that

- 2 one doesn't even wants to as the saying goes, too ghastly
- 3 to contemplate, Chairperson. But very two quick points
- 4 that I want to make about that is that, as I said, fairness
- 5 is fairness, but in the particular case of the people I
- 6 represent it must always be remembered that their own
- 7 criminal liability is at issue, (1); they have already been
- 8 arrested and accused, and therefore they are not, you know,
- 9 ordinary participants.

The next point, Chairperson, covers both the

- 11 point I've just made, but also the point of because
- 12 really the issue is this, Chairperson; I think it's common
- 13 cause, as we had the discussion yesterday, that the
- 14 continuation of the Commission under the present
- 15 circumstances is something that's not ideal. That goes
- 16 without saying. So the question is not so much whether
- 17 there's prejudice or not, because there is. It's patent;
- 18 anyone just has to look at Mr Magidiwana, and if I say here
- 19 I am, standing with seven bullet wounds, is it prejudicial20 or not that a Commission about that fact should continue in
- 21 my absence? Clearly it is. So that goes without saying.
- The question is whether the measures that the
- 23 Commission seeks to implement in the meantime would serve
- to cure that blatant prejudice. So that specific question,
- 25 Chairperson, and it's a matter I touched on yesterday about

Page 13107

- relied on came from England in the case of Gideon versus
- 2 Wainwright no, actually it's the US decision of Black,
- 3 the well-known Black, J in Gideon versus Wainwright, who
- 4 said that, and I'm reading against letter E at 542,
- $\,\,$ "Similarly there are few defendants charged with crime, few
- 6 indeed who fail to hire the best lawyers they can get to
- 7 prepare and present their defences. That the government
- 8 hires lawyers to prosecute and defendants who have the
- 9 money hire lawyers in criminal courts are necessities" or
- 10 rather, "hire lawyers to defend, are the strongest
- 11 indication of the widespread belief that lawyers in
- 12 criminal courts are necessities, not luxuries," and that
- 13 can be postulated to proceedings of this kind. "The right
- 14 of one charged with crime to counsel may not be deemed
- 15 fundamental and essential to fair trials in some countries,
- 16 but it is in ours. From the very beginning our State and
- 17 national constitutions and laws have laid great emphasis on
- 18 the procedural and substantive safeguards designed to
- 19 assure fair trials before impartial tribunals, in which
- 20 every defendant stands equal before the law. This noble
- 21 ideal cannot be realised if the poor man charged with a
- 22 crime has to face his accusers without a lawyer to assist
- 23 him."
- 24 CHAIRPERSON:
- On the retrial Mr Gideon
- 25 was acquitted.

- Page 13109 the fairness or otherwise of presenting, or representing or
- 2 presenting a version of someone with whom one has not even
- 3 consulted. That was dealt with in the case of Seri(?),
- 4 which is number 2 of those cases, Chairperson. That case
- 5 dealt with the issue of the irregularity, but more
- 6 specifically relevant to the measures, it says the
- 7 following. I'm reading from page 36 from the letter C, and
- 8 pardon my accent. It says, "Ek het reeds gemeld dat nie
- 9 een van die appellante die staatsgetuies ondervra het nie
- 10 en dat nie een van hulle getuienis afgelê of getuies geroep
- 11 het nie. Daar is geen aanduiding dat hulle versuim in
- 12 hierdie opsig aan iets anders toegeskryf kan word nie dan
- 13 dat hulle, toe hulle hulself onverwags sonder hul
- 14 regsverteenwoordiger bevind aan wie hulle hul verdediging
- 15 toevertrou het, nie voorbereid was om hul eie verdediging
- 16 te behartig nie. Onder hierdie omstandighede was hulle
- 17 klaarblyklik ernstig benadeel en het geregtigheid inderdaad
- 18 nie geskied nie. Die appèl moet gevolglik slaag." Okay,
- 19 Mr Shozi has dared to asked me to paraphrase. What has
- 20 been said is that the -
- 21 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off, inaudible]
- 22 translate in English.
- 23 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I was
- 24 going to do it in Tswana for him.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off,

Page 13113

Page 13110

- 1 inaudible]. "I've already mentioned that not one of the
- 2 appellants questioned the State witnesses and that not one
- 3 of them gave evidence or called witnesses. There's no
- 4 indication that their failure in this respect can be
- 5 attributed to anything other than the fact that they found
- 6 themselves unexpectedly without their legal representative,
- 7 to whom they had entrusted their defence. They were not
- 8 prepared to conduct their own defence. Under the
- 9 circumstances they were clearly seriously prejudiced and
- 10 justice accordingly did not take place. The appeal must

11 accordingly succeed."

12 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Yes, and the –
13 thank you, Chairperson, that's – not all of us come from
14 Cape Town, as the Chairperson, but –

Cape Town, as the Chairperson, but –
 CHAIRPERSON: Are you

5 CHAIRPERSON: Are you going to want to

16 interpret that into Xhosa?

17 MR MAHLANGU: I did.

18 CHAIRPERSON: You did, I see.

19 MR MAHLANGU: Yes, very well.

20 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

21 CHAIRPERSON: And Mr Mpofu wants to

22 interpret it into Tswana.

25

7

23 MR MPOFU: Chair, that was an idle threat

24 which I wouldn't be able to carry out. Chairperson, yes,

the relevance of that of course is that the, what has been

consider whether the sentence imposed on the appellant was

- tonsider whether the sentence imposed on the appendix w
- 2 a proper one, for the entire sentence will have to be
- 3 satisfied and the matter remitted for another magistrate
- 4 for the question of sentence to be considered anew." In
- 5 other words what they were saying is that once a
- 6 postponement was refused for the opportunity to obtain
- 7 legal representation, it was not even necessary to look at
- 8 the outcome of the proceedings. All the proceedings
- 9 themselves were just tainted irretrievably by that refusal10 of the postponement.

11 Moving towards the end of the founding affidavit

12 then, Chairperson, I would say that in -

13 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Mpofu, every 14 now and again you raise your two hands in the air and you

15 make what amounts to quotation mark signs –

16 MR MPOFU: Yes, that is so, Chair.

17 CHAIRPERSON: Those of course won't find

18 their way into the transcript, so I suggest if you want to

19 do that you should say "quote, unquote" rather than –

20 MR MPOFU: Quote, unquote or so-called –

21 CHAIRPERSON: - rather than make gestures 22 which the transcribers won't see when they transcribe.

23 MR MPOFU: Okay, Chairperson, thank you

24 very much. The point I really wanted to make is that the -

I've already made the point about prejudice. As these

Page 13111

1 said here is that these were people, the appeal here

- 2 succeeded on the basis that the proceedings had to be
- 3 nullified because the lawyers on whom these people had
- 4 entrusted their defence, so to speak, had not been able to
- 5 represent them and as a result they were not able
- 6 themselves to cross-examine or ask any questions of the
 - other side, so to speak.

8 The last one, Chairperson, is case number 3, and

- 9 that's State versus Yelani, where his lordship Mr Van
- 10 Rensburg J said, and once again I'll just paraphrase.
- 11 Firstly he relied, at page 806 against the letter G, he
- 12 relied on the following extract from the case of Mthetwa,
- 13 or firstly, he started with the Seri case which I've just
- 14 read out, and then relied on the Mthetwa case which says,
- 15 "Every person is entitled to obtain for himself legal
- 16 representation at his trial and should be afforded an
- 17 opportunity for doing so when it is reasonably demanded."
- 18 It's obviously the last part that's important, asking for
- 19 an opportunity for doing so when it is reasonable demanded.

20 Then I jump, Chairperson, to the following page,

- 21 which is more relevant to this application. Unfortunately
- 22 the letters are not clear, but let's say against the letter
- 23 C on the other side of the page where the learned judge
- 24 says, "The result of the finding that the appellant was
- 25 entitled to a postponement is that it is not necessary to

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- orα
- matters are determined by looking at, then counterweighing
- 2 that against the other prejudice that might be suffered by
- 3 other parties. Now it's undeniable, Chairperson, that a
- 4 postponement would itself –

5 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I don't want to

6 interrupt you unduly. I'm proposing to take the

7 adjournment at some stage shortly after 11, but I don't

8 want to interrupt you at this point. Tell me when it is

9 appropriate for us to take the adjournment and we can then

10 adjourn.

11 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, this would

12 be a natural place because these are, as I say, the kind of

13 concluding remarks.

14 CHAIRPERSON: We will take the tea

15 adjournment, which I hope will be not longer than 15

16 minutes.

17 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

18 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]

19 [11:29] CHAIRPERSON: The Comm

The Commission resumes. Mr

20 Mpofu?

21 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

22 Chairperson, before I move on to the last few points I just

23 want to read out very shortly some of the extracts from Du

24 Toit's Commentary on Criminal Procedure. One says at page

25 22 point 28B dealing with postponements which are dealt

with in section 158 of that Act -

2 CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph?

MR MPOFU: 3 22-28B, capital letter B. The

- 4 first sentence really, says "An adjournment will normally
- 5 be allowed to enable an accused to obtain legal
- representation." And then a few cases including Sihari is 6
- 7 quoted. I jump to the next paragraph which says, "A
- 8 failure to grant any postponement at all to enable the
- 9 accused to obtain legal representation may lead to the
- quashing of a conviction." Then a whole lot of other 10
- cases, in line with what I've already said. And then more 11
- 12 importantly on what one might call the remedial attempt at
- 13 remedial measures on the next page 22-28C, relying on a
- 14 case of Bayer v Director of Public Prosecutions Western
- Cape 2003 (1) SACR 164 (C) it talks about that case but the 15
- 16 relevant part says, "In that case Selikowitz, J indicated
- 17 that the idea of being legally represented cannot simply
- 18 mean having someone stand up and speak on one's behalf.
- 19 Representation entails that the legal adviser will act in
- 20 the client's best interest and will say all that needs to
- 21 be said in favour of the client. This involves calling
- 22 such evidence as is justified in the circumstances in order
- 23 to put the best defence before the court." The court then
- 24 referred with approval to S versus Hilani which I think is
- 25 number 3. It was held that the applicant was deprived of
 - Page 13115
 - effective legal representation, the conviction and sentence
- were set aside on the ground that the applicant did not 2
- 3 have a fair trial. So to transport that to this case it
- 4 would simply mean that, with due respect, the evidence
- 5 leaders are not in a position to present the interests of
- 6 the clients because, through no fault of their own, they
- 7 would not be able to do what Selikowitz says of being able
- 8 to present all that needs to be said.

1

9

11

- CHAIRPERSON: The person whose cell phone 10 went off please must turn it off. Everyone else must turn their cell phones off and if another cell phone goes off
- 12 I'll ask the owner of that phone to leave the room.
- 13 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, that
- 14 then rounds off that point. And when we went to the break
- 15 I was at the point where I was saying, Chairperson, one is
- 16 obviously dealing with a weighing process here. It would
- 17 be silly for me to deny that the granting of the
- 18 postponement somehow will cause some general prejudice to
- others, I think that goes without saying. The question is,
- which prejudice should prevail really in terms of the
- 21 impact thereof in the larger scheme of things.

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

- 22 Now one of the tempting things of course is what I call, you know, the bane of modern societies is short-
- 24 termism. So it must be tempting to want to finish, you
- 25 know, get on with it and all those important things but the

Page 13116

Page 13117

- danger of that approach is that where you might have paused
- 2 for a couple of weeks and maybe save the whole process, we
 - may proceed in faith, which is understandable, and cause
- irreparable damage. So we might be faced with a choice
- 5 between, as I say, tempting instant gratification of
- 6 reaching the finishing line, between that and the real
- 7 achievement of sustainable lasting peace, accepting that
- 8 justice is, by its nature, a very slow animal. That takes
- 9 me, sorry, that takes me to two points -
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: I think Mr Mahlangu wanted 11 to interpret what you said -
- 12 MR MPOFU: Yes, yes.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON: About the slow animal.
- 14 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. Thank
- 15 you, Mr Mahlangu and I had a private deal before we
- started, Chair. I was saying, Chairperson, Mr Mahlangu and
- 17 I had a private deal before we started but we are both not
- 18 implementing it at the right time.
- 19 MR MAHLANGU: I said I will try not to -
- 20 CHAIRPERSON: If I could be aware I can
- 21 bear them in mind but if you don't tell me I'd have to do
- 22 the normal -
- 23 MR MPOFU: Thank you, yes. Yes, we won't
- 24 ask for it to be made a ruling. That, Chairperson, takes
- me to two very, very, very important points about the

- prejudice to the general public interest and I'll take it
- beyond what I said yesterday about the cost of [inaudible]
- 3 sitting in the Commission and all that, to what is really
- 4 crucial and it is this, we have always to remember that
- when all is said and done and one has gone through the
- 6 terms of reference and so on, the purposes of this
- 7 Commission can be reduced to two crucial things. One, it
- 8 is to establish the truth of what happened during those
- 9 fateful days, which is important and in which the people we
- 10 represent have an obvious interest so I don't have to
- 11 belabour that, but the second one and maybe even more
- 12 profound is to ensure that something like this never
- 13 happens again. That second aspect is sometimes – because
- 14 even in this debate about representation the issue of the
- 15 truth is obviously one that lends itself to that debate and
- 16 sometimes people forget that the second aspect of ensuring
- 17 that this doesn't happen again is equally, if maybe not
- 18 more important in the sense that we cannot bring back the 19 people who died but at least we can ensure that this never
- 20 happens again.
- 21 Now that aspect is more nebulous, so to speak, 22 and maybe subtle but it relates to something that I want to
- 23 bring to the Commission, that these people who are victims
- 24 have actually a right to participate in this process almost

 - as a self standing right, irrespective of the outcome,

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

4

10

11

Page 13118

irrespective of what happened, but their right to 2 participate, to be part of the process is crucial and 3 should not be underestimated.

4 Now I say that, Chairperson, because this 5 Commission has achieved things even before - and as I say, irrespective of whatever the outcome is, the mere fact that 6 7 the Commission has sat and to that I must say particularly 8 the way that it has been conducted by yourselves as the 9 Commissioners has had many, well, I wouldn't say unintended but let's say bonus outcomes already by the mere way in 10 which the victims are treated, the very fact that on the 11 12 very first day the first thing that happened was reading out of the names - of a minute of silence and so on. Those 13 14 things were, as I say, intangible but would have 15 contributed a lot to what we all want to see after the Commission. 16

17 Now, and I think there are moments in this 18 Commission where that gets realised, obviously by different 19 people at different times but for me that moment was 20 yesterday, Chairperson, when the widows of the police 21 victims and some, and the security guards, said to me we 22 want you back here, we started this together and we would 23 like all the victims to be here. That was a moment which I 24 think was more profound than any witness that has given

Page 13120

Page 13121

The point of that story, Chairperson, is that 1 without the participation of the majority of the victims, 2 3 those kinds of outcomes both intended and unintended, will 4 be lost and that we will have, really we will have finished, so to speak, quote/unquote, the race as it were 6 and we'll all put our books and go home and do whatever it 7 is that we do, but we would have left a yawning gap in the 8 real outcomes which is reconciliation and never again 9 having to face this. 10

Last two points - and I must say Chairperson, that I had a discussion this morning again with Mrs Fundi just to explain the importance of what transpired here yesterday - the last two points is that the Chairperson, I'd like to appeal to you who has to make this unenviable, who have this unenviable task of making this decision, to consider that of course a postponement application is a matter which is in your discretion, as we know, which must be exercised judicially.

CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you, Mr Mpofu, it sounds to me, if you'll forgive my saying this, as if you're now busy arguing the matter.

22 MR MPOFU: No.

23 CHAIRPERSON: At the moment you're 24 telling us what's in your founding affidavit. Obviously the point you want to make to us is a point that would be

Page 13119

quote to you cases, I'm going to quote that legal document 1

evidence here and that, Chairperson, I'm no longer going to

- 2 called The Sowetan of today where it is said there that,
- 3 particularly quoting Mrs Ayesha Fundi who is the lady in
- 4 the black veil, the widow of security guard Hassan Fundi
- 5 who was killed during the unrest, said she sympathised with
- 6 the rest of those affected by the events at Marikana and
- wanted closure. Fundi said she wanted to hear what 7
- 8 happened to her husband's missing organs including his
- 9 tongue and lower jaw and she went on to explain the
- 10 gruesomeness. But the point is when they approached me and
- 11 spoke to me but also when they obviously before that spoke
- 12 to the media, what they were saying is that for the truth
- 13 to be found and for true reconciliation, everyone should be
- heard. And that cannot have come easy, Chairperson, 14
- 15 because when she says that she is saying that about the
- people I represent who allegedly are the people who are the 16
- 17 killers of her husband or associated with them, whoever
- 18 those killers might be.

25

19 So this Commission is not an ordinary Commission, it's a mini TRC, so to speak, where not only the truth but

- 21 reconciliation and justice will hopefully eventuate and
- 22 that experience of talking to those widows taught me that
- it's possible through this Commission, as I say,
- 24 irrespective of the outcome, to achieve things that one
- 25 could not even have dreamt of when we started.

- included in your founding affidavit -1
- 2 MR MPOFU: Yes.
- 3 CHAIRPERSON: - and you can carry on, but
 - if it's really the peroration of the end your argument, I
- 5 think you must reserve it for the argument.

6 MR MPOFU: Yes, yes, Chairperson, I

7 appreciate that. These are literally, as I say what, if it

8 was an affidavit, a real affidavit I would put it as a

9 conclusion, concluding the matter.

CHAIRPERSON: Well, on that basis please proceed.

12 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. And

13 it's simply to say, Chairperson, that at least the

14 perception of the people that we represent is that, you

15 know, everyone has turned their backs on them, starting

16 from the employer, the police, some government officials or

- 17 ministers, there are BEE partners and all sorts of people
- 18 but they do have confidence in this Commission, as I've
- 19 already indicated before, and we hope that the Commission
- 20 will not find itself joining that illustrious list and we
- 21 know that if they feel like that, we will be the first ones
- to point out that, about the difficulty of the task that
- you have in balancing the interests of everybody. So I 23
- 24 just wanted to assure you, Chairperson, that we will, as
- we've always done, ensure that whatever the outcome of the

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Page 13122

application, that it's not construed in a manner that

- indicates that indeed everyone has turned their back on
- them. And their only voice, Chairperson, even if I say so 3
- 4 myself at this point, are the people who represent them
- 5 legally, whatever the difficulties that those people face
- and all they want really is a chance to have that voice 6

7 continuing to be heard, for what it's worth.

8 The last point, Chairperson, is that the -

9 something again that happened yesterday when one of the

applicants said to me, well, if they want to continue with 10

11 this without us then they mustn't call it the Marikana

12 Commission because we are the people who come from Marikana

13 and those people who will remain there are not from

14 Marikana. And I took it at first blush as a joke but when

15 I reflected later, it really said something to me about

what the applicants feel should be the character or the 16

17 continuing character of this Commission and this one didn't

18 come from them, it came from me when I was thinking later

19 that if we, if indeed it continues without them then it

will only be a Commission of those who have the money to 20

21 continue their participation and that it would then be not

22 the Marikana Commission but the Moneykana Commission, M-O-

23 N-E-Y, and we don't want that to happen, Chairperson. We

24 would like to continue with the Marikana Commission as we

25 know it and we appeal to you to ensure that the Marikana Page 13124

Thank you, Chair. Chair, we MR SHOZI:

2 do support the application. When the first "postponement

3 application" was brought we were the so-called co-

4 applicants or second applicant, Chair. Chair, I would like

5 to send my, Mr Ntsebeza's apologies again for not making it

6 this morning. He did try to make alternative arrangements

7 but that did not work out. Indeed Chair, as you also

8 pointed out earlier on, in particular the families of the

9 deceased, they do have funding from the Legal Aid Board to

10 participate, to at least continue with participating in the

11 Commission. However, our instructions are that they cannot

12 continue, at least they see the representation of the 13

applicants at the Commission as very critical at least for

14 the families' meaningful participation at this Commission.

15 They say this because they view the applicants as the only

people who can give direct evidence as to what happened at 16

17 Marikana between the 9th and the 16th of August. In

18 particular they see them as people who really lived to tell

19 the tale or to tell the story as to what happened on that 20 day.

We are instructed again, Chair, to record that

22 the families, the way as they view things, they can never

23 achieve the peace and reconciliation that is intended

24 through the process as the truth about Marikana will remain

unknown if the applicants do not continue participating at

Page 13123

21

25

10

1 Commission continues after a postponement to allow us to do

2 whatever we can to obtain legal representation for the

3 victims, failing which if we fail, because there's always

4 that possibility, we'll come back and say so, Chairperson,

5 but for now we are very optimistic that starting where, or

6 rather ending where is started, that either one of the two

7 events, either the litigation or the other event will put

8 us back to where we should have been. Yes, we might have

9 lost a month or so but in the fullness of time, in 100

10 years' time when historians look at this I'm sure they will

11 not count a couple of weeks here and a couple of weeks

12 there. What they will count is whether or not the

13 objectives that are on that just behind you, Chairperson,

14 truth, restoration and justice and I might add

15 reconciliation, whether it was achieved or not and it

16 cannot be achieved without the victims' presence. Thank

17 you, Chairperson.

20

22

18 CHAIRPERSON: Do you wish to say anything on behalf of the families who are in a stance of solidarity

with the injured and arrested persons?

21 MR SHOZI: Indeed, sir.

> CHAIRPERSON: If you filed an affidavit

in support of the application, what would you say because

24 this is all we're concerned with at the moment, what would

you say in such an affidavit, if anything?

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Page 13125

the Commission. They in effect, Chair, say that their

the applicants would essentially be meaningless or at least

involvement, that means the families' involvement without

redundant without any version by the applicants.

5 Now Chair, I've been asked, at least I'm trying

6 to persuade at least to plead with you to postpone the

7 Commission at least pending the return of the Commission,

8 to read a statement by one of the ladies of the deceased,

9 which will be the widow Ms Zaneka Nungu. I would therefore

beginning the -

11 CHAIRPERSON: If it's something that you 12 would have incorporated in an affidavit, a supporting

13 affidavit if such an affidavit had been file -

14 MR SHOZI: Indeed, Chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON: If that's the case you can

16 read it out.

17 MR SHOZI: Indeed, Chair. I thank you

18 for your indulgence, Chair. Chair, just to make sure I

don't lose the essence of the statement I will read the

20 statement as is, in Ms Nungu's words, as the representative

21 of the rest of the families, Chair. This is what, it says,

22 "The reason we are participating in the Commission and our

23 interest in it is to find out the truth about what happened

24 to our loved ones. We want and need to know why they were

taken away from us in such a sudden and violent manner, why

Page 13126

1 our husbands, fathers, brothers, sons and cousins who were

- 2 in most cases our only breadwinners, were shot and killed
- 3 by the police. We seek the truth about what happened at
- 4 Marikana, primarily for three reasons 1. In the hope
- 5 that this will bring us some measure of healing, closure
- 6 and restoration and thus give effect to our right to human
- 7 dignity. 2. To safeguard our rights in relation to
- 8 possible future civil claims against SAPS for the unlawful
- 9 killing of our loved ones. Our interest in this regard
- 10 will clearly be impacted by the Commission's finding. 3.
- 11 In the hopes of seeing those responsible for our loved
- 12 ones' deaths brought to justice. The Commission is
- 13 empowered to make recommendations that specific persons be
- 14 prosecuted." Mr Mahlangu, maybe you could translate that.
- 15 "As things stand, SAPS is denying that its members acted
- 16 unlawfully when they killed our loved ones. In summary,
- 17 the case that SAPS is advancing before the Commission is
- 18 that our loved ones were charging at the police and that
- 19 the police shot and killed them in self-defence and/or
- 20 private defence. Indeed our loved ones have been painted
- 21 as violent and brutal men who wanted to kill the police and
- 22 were in the process of attempting to do so when they were
- 23 shot and killed. From what we know of our loved ones and
- 24 the evidence that has been presented at the Commission to
- 25 date, including the video footages, we have seen the
 - Page 13127
 - pictures, we simply don't believe this to be the case. We
- 2 are of the view that they would not" that means their
- 3 loved ones "they would have not attempted to attack and
- 4 kill the police. In addition, in our opinion the video
- 5 footage of the shooting does not support the SAPS version.
- 6 The only persons who gave, at least the only persons who
- 7 have given evidence to gainsay the police version are the
- 8 witnesses who have testified to date on behalf of the first
- 9 applicant, in particular Mr Magidiwana and Mr Pasha. They
- 10 have given an explanation for why some of the protesters
- 11 appear from the video footage of the shooting at scene 1 to
- 12 be advancing in the direction of the police. It is only
- 13 due to the evidence of Mr Magidiwana and Mr Pasha that we
- 14 have been provided with the protesters' side of the story
- 15 that contradicts the SAPS version. It was only due to the
- 16 witnesses' participation that we have some understood as to
- 17 why our loved ones acted in a manner in which they did, of
- 18 what they were thinking, feeling on that day in the hours,
- 19 the minutes preceding the killings. These versions relate
- 20 to the central dispute in the Commission, namely whether or
- 21 not there were any legally acceptable justifications for
- 22 the killing of our loved ones. These are two diametrically
- 23 opposed versions before the Commission regarding whether
- 24 SAPS acted lawfully when it shot and killed our loved ones.
- 25 The contrary version has come from the witnesses of the
- ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 13128

- 1 first applicant. This, to us, is not surprising. They are
- 2 the only party to the Commission's proceedings, apart from
- 3 SAPS, who were there and when the relevant events happened,
- 4 who witnessed them. Indeed it is safe to say that aside
- 5 from the journalists who are unlikely to testify, they were
- 6 the only other eye witnesses. It is for this reason that
- 7 the first applicant's full and effective participation is
- 8 crucial to our case and to legitimise the Commission.
- 9 Without their full and effective participation, the other
- 10 side of the story cannot be told, nor can it be said that
- 11 there will be no further need for evidence from the
- 12 applicants, from the first applicant. This is so because
- 13 there are other critical issues in relation to which the
- 14 first applicants would be required to give evidence if the
- 15 other side of the story is to be told. I will refer to two
- 16 examples of these critical issues. The first example is
- 17 the incident of the 13th of August 2012 during which three
- 18 protesters and two police officers were killed. The first
- 19 applicant has not testified in relation to this incident.
- 20 Major-General Mpembe, the commander who was in charge of
- 21 the relevant police operation on that date, is currently
- 22 giving evidence. He testified that what led to the
- 23 killings on that day was that the protesters suddenly
- 24 changed direction while being escorted by the police and
 - started moving in the direction of the informal settlement.

Page 13129

- 1 This made it necessary for the police to use force in the
 - 2 form of teargas, stun grenades and rubber bullets in order
 - 3 to deter them from moving in that direction. It is common
 - 4 cause from the inspection in loco conducted by the
 - 5 Commission that the first applicants dispute this version.
 - 6 Their version is that they were simply on their way to the
 - 7 koppie when they suddenly came under attack by the police.
 - 8 The applicants' version has not been given as evidence
 - 9 under oath as yet. Therefore if the applicants are not
 - 10 able to participate fully and effectively, their version in
 - 11 this regard will not become part of the record. The
 - 12 contrary version will simply not be before the Commission.
 - 13 The only way of disputing the police version will be by
 - 14 means of objective evidence of the incident, including the
 - 15 video footage of the day. There will be no-one to speak on
 - 16 behalf of our slain loved ones. It is our respectful
 - 17 submission this could never be in the interests of justice
 - 18 and the outcome of the Commission would not be legitimate
 - 19 if it were to continue in this manner.

The second example is that of Mr X. Mr X, as

yet, is an unidentified witness who has provided a

statement and who is allegedly going to give evidence on

behalf of SAPS. He was allegedly one of the leaders of the

protesters. He makes a number of allegations against the

protesters, both the living and the deceased. If, by the

Page 13130

- Commission, his evidence could lead if accepted by the
- Commission, his evidence could lead to adverse inferences 2
- 3 being drawn against the protesters, for example that the
- 4 protesters were highly organised, they had a clear command
- 5 structure, they were brutal in nature and committed a
- 6 number of violent crimes in an organised and premeditated
- 7 fashion and that they believed themselves to be invisible,
- invincible, due to having used muti and undergone certain 8
- 9 rituals with a sangoma.
- 10 [12:09] In our view the only persons who can dispute this
- are the first applicants, particularly those against whom 11
- 12 he makes specific allegations. In addition, it will be
- 13 extremely unfair to require them to do so without having
- 14 legal representative to advise and protect them. This is
- so because Mr X makes specific allegations of criminal 15
- conduct against them. In seeking to refute these 16
- 17 allegations, they do therefore run the risk of
- 18 incriminating themselves.
- 19 In particular, Mr X also makes allegations of
- 20 criminal conduct against one of the deceased, that being Mr 21 Noki. Mr Noki is Ms Veronica Noki's partner. Accordingly,
- 22 the applicants who were the witnesses to the event in
- 23 question are thus the only persons who can possibly speak
- 24 on Mr Noki's behalf and dispute the allegations which Mr X
- 25 makes against him.

1

2

14

15

Page 13132

- we will be deprived of our best opportunity of ensuring
- that those who killed our loved ones are brought to
- 3 justice. Chair, that's the end of the statement by Ms
- 4 Nungu.

15

5 Chair, as is also known that SERI also represents

6 AMCU, I put on record that AMCU does support the stance, at

7 least the postponed application, and obviously based on the

8 reasons as submitted by the families, and further AMCU

9 regard it as, it will be very difficult for itself to be

10 involved in the Commission and not to be seen to support

11 its members, of which the majority of the applicants are

12 its members. For those reasons they also support the

13 postponed application. I thank you, Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Well, what has been said will be transcribed. I'm told it will be available at 9

o'clock tomorrow morning. It will be given to the evidence

17 leaders who will then send it electronically to all the

parties. As I have indicated, the Departments of Justice 19 and Constitutional Development wishes to oppose the

20 application also and it will be made available to them as

21 well and it may be that locus standi points may be raised,

22 but clearly we will send the transcript to them. Thank you

23 very much. Then we'll take a short - sorry, Mr Budlender?

24 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, could I just ask

for clarity on one aspect of the relief which is being

The applicants are thus the only party to the

- Commission's proceedings who can counter such version and
- 3 the degradation of their loved one. In our view they speak
- 4 for our dead husbands, sons, fathers, brothers, uncles and
- 5 cousins. If they are not able to participate fully and
- 6 effectively, we will be forced to sit and listen to their
- 7 version with no witness to counter it. Our participation
- 8 in the Commission will thus be rendered meaningless and
- 9 redundant. Rather than enabling the family members to
- 10 achieve some measure of healing and restoration, this will
- 11 only add to our pain, unbearably so. In addition, in our
- 12 respectful view, such one-sided Commission will not have
- 13 any legitimacy. We simply could not take part in it.

Thus, in conclusion, if the applicants are not enabled to participate fully and effectively in the

16 Commission's proceedings, the consequences for the family

17 members will be devastating. This will be devastating 18 because our rights to restorative justice, which is an

19 incident of the right to human dignity, will be infringed.

It will be a violation of our loved ones' right to life

- 21 because we will be deprived of the right to participate in
- 22 the State-appointed Commission of Inquiry into our loved
- ones' deaths in order to safeguard our rights and

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

- 24 legitimate interests. The civil claims which we intend to
- 25 institute against the State may be prejudiced, and finally,

- Page 13131
- sought in the application? Mr Mpofu has explained that
 - this is an application for a postponement pending the
- attainment of funding from private sources or the outcome
- of the pending application in the High Court, whichever
- 5 comes first. Can I just ask for clarity on what is
- 6 intended by the outcome of the High Court application?
- 7 Does that include the outcome of any appeal which follows
- on the decision of the High Court? 8
- 9 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu?
- 10 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. Yes,
- 11 that's a fair question. No, it does not. As I indicated,
- 12 maybe not clearly, we're talking about the outcome in the
- 13 first instance. In other words we would assume to
- 14 ourselves a duty to come back at that stage of the outcome
- 15 of the first instance. We would not simply hide behind the
- word "outcome" and say well, it's the final-final outcome. 16
- 17 I'd like to place that on record. Thank you, Mr Budlender.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think that
- 19 makes the point clear, Mr Budlender. Before we bring this
- 20 part of the proceedings to an end, I understand that Mr
- 21 Semenya – am I correct? – Mr Semenya wishes to say
- 22 something, and there may be other who wish to say something
- 23 as well.
- 24 MR SEMENYA SC: Not anymore, Chair, thank
- you.

25

[12:34] CHAIRPERSON:

Major-General, you're still under oath.

Page 13136

Page 13134 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsonkota? 1 2 MR NTSONKOTA: Thank you, Chair. Now 3 that we've had the privilege of being apprised of the basis 4 and the foundation on which the application and the request 5 by Mr Mpofu stands, I beg to record on behalf of NUM that we will not be opposing the application. In fact, we will 6 7 abide the ruling of the Commission regarding the request. 8 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you. That can 9 be - is there anybody else who wishes to say anything before we conclude this part of the proceedings? It 10 doesn't seem so. So I think we'll take a short adjournment 11 now. It's 20 past 12. We'll carry on with our normal work 12 13 for the time being. Mr Mpofu and his party are excused 14 and, but we'll adjourn to enable them to make a dignified 15 departure, and also of course to enable General Mpembe to be requested to come. I don't know if he's in the building 16 17 or wherever he is, but we'll take an adjournment and we'll 18 resume when we are told that it's appropriate for us to do 19 SO. 20 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, thank you, I just 21 wanted to say thank you for giving us a hearing. We 22 appreciate it. Thank you, Chairperson. 23 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS **COMMISSION RESUMES**]

wanted to go, it could have assisted to de-escalate the violence. 4 MS PILLAY: General, just to round up this point, I just want to put to you what was the evidence 6 of the Reverend Seoka who was asked, was being cross-7 examined by Mr Ntsebeza on the basis that he's an expert in 8 conflict resolution within a mining context, and he was 9 asked to comment on the "negotiation" that you undertook on 10 the 13th at the railway line. Now I've asked for copies of 11 the relevant portions of the transcript to be made, if I 12 can just - it's day 18 of the transcript, 1-8, at page 13 2002. Now I'll just read to you, General, what the 14 question from Mr Ntsebeza was and what Reverend Seoka's answer to the question was. Mr Ntsebeza says, "Not very long, Mr Chairman, you know I keep my promises. Now in 17 fact as it is just for the record, the witness has said in 18 paragraph 3 of his statement he has specialised knowledge 19 of and experience in conflict in the mining industry. Now 20 I was asking you for your views on, given the volatile 21 nature of that situation as you see it on the video, what 22 do you think of General Mpembe's reaction to what seems to 23 be a proposition in a tense situation?" Now just for 24 context, General, the video he's referring to is Z1, and the answer by Reverend Seoka is, "I think it was a

what I targeted, and for them to have marched where they

Page 13135

The Commission resumes.

Correct, Chairperson. 1 WILLIAM MPEMBE: 2 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay, you're still 3 cross-examining? 4 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS PILLAY (CONTD.): 5 Thank you, Chair. General, just in fairness to you, as we concluded the proceedings yesterday, you were answering 6 around how you understood what you did on the 13th to be the 7 8 best of both worlds. I think that's the point at which we concluded yesterday. Would you like to complete the answer 9 now? 10 11 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. 12 Chairperson. What I wanted to achieve, or to end the 13 negotiation on that day was on the fact that since the protesters were having the dangerous weapons, the win-win 14 15 situation that I spoke about, it was with reference to if 16 they can drop their dangerous weapons, because that to me 17 was extremely important because that is what they can use 18 to maim or kill people. I know that them possessing the 19 dangerous weapons was against the law, and I know that they were not marched legally, but that to me in, when I compare it with the situation, I find only the, for them to lay down their weapons and to allow them to march, that could have, be in a better position for them, and that could have been a win-win in the sense that the laying of, down of

weapons, it could have been a win to me because that is

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Page 13137 desperate, unprofessional way of handling a situation that could explode at any time, as he assumed. If I were him, I would have handled it differently." Mr Ntsebeza says, "Yes, I will not go into how you would have dealt with it. If I heard him correctly or clearly, he began to count even as Xolani, or the worker as beginning to talk to him. He 6 7 says, 'I am now counting, like listen, you hand over. It's my way, or the highway.' Did you observe that when he said 8 9 'I'm counting?'" and the Reverend Seoka's answer is, 10 "That's an indication of being impatient and threatening, 11 really; if I counted this number and have not done what 12 I've asked of you, I will do something. That's my 13 assumption." Can I ask you just to comment on Reverend 14 Seoka's analysis of what you did on the day? 15 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, it's 16 true that the situation was tense and I need to indicate 17 that the negotiation that took place at the railway was not 18 a normal negotiation where the environment, which is very conducive, is prepared, all strategies are being applied. 20 I can make an example of all conflict resolutions that they

have been dealt with where you put the environment in a

Secondly, in that circumstances, taking the

these are not hostile to each other.

proper manner and the approaches are being determined, but

background of what has happened on the previous day, and I

21

22

23

24

Page 13138

did say that I did not know who were busy killing and who

- 2 were doing any other when I started speaking to them. The
- 3 protesters were carrying extremely dangerous weapons and
- 4 the manner in which, and the song that they sang that day,
- 5 is not a song that is normally, or the weapons that are
- normally being carried in any conflict resolution process 6
- 7 that I have ever seen, or understand, which maybe in the
- 8 case of Reverend Seoka that he knows himself, and secondly
- 9 - and what was also very crucial there, inasmuch as myself
- I was realising that by allowing them to march, it's still 10
- 11 against the law, I had also to look at the compromise of
- 12 the dangerous weapons because the dangerous weapons was
- 13 what was actually being utilised to commit all the crimes
- 14 that were happening. Even though I did not know who in
- 15 particular amongst the protesters was committing crime, but
- 16 it could have been that they were amongst those protesters.

But what was more crucial for me is if they could lay down their weapons and in laying down their weapons then we will, we could have avoided a lot of the damages

- that had happened, and what was very crucial for me in that 21 instance, in terms of the police crowd management policies
- 22 and conflict resolution we have to show an extreme
- 23 tolerance to the protesters, however vulgar words or any
- 24 other weapons or any other action that they could do,
- 25 because there were so many provocative actions that were

anybody to go and, allow them to go and negotiate with me

- because they were feeling that they wanted to go with
- 3 weapons.

4 Secondly, I could not have changed the

5 environment in any way to be conducive because what was

6 more important, it was to disarm them, and that is what

7 they could not have allowed me to have done, as they did on

8 that day. Comparatively speaking, on the following day, on

9 the 14th when we were now going to negotiate with them, that

10 was the negotiation that was done, initiated by the police,

11 the five brave "madoda" were asked to negotiate. They were

put at ease. They asked, they requested that we should 12

13 bring "umlungu." I need just to indicate, they asked that

14 we should bring "umlungu" on the 13th. I did that. It's

15 the South African Police Service that initiated the

negotiation between the unions and the mine. That could

not have happened if the police did not take the

18 initiative.

19

20

7

9

20

21

22

RealTime Transcriptions

Thirdly, on the following day, because those were the alternatives after what had happened on the 13th when we

21 said we have to continue, because to us negotiation, it was

22 the extremely better position of ending up the conflict on

23 that day. That's why then we continued with the

24 negotiation. Five brave "madoda" were called. On that day

they requested to see "umlungu" through Colonel McIntosh.

Page 13139

coming from the protesters, but I could, I keep the members

to be tolerant because I could see the situation could have

3 gone either way.

MS PILLAY:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

17

18

19

20

1

2

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14 15

18

19

21

As I have indicated, I had to get dangerous weapons, so at a certain point I had to put them to comply, and I need to say in any country where a senior police official requested any responsible citizen to hand over a dangerous weapon, that is all what I expected on that day, and that could not have happened.

2002, General, that Reverend Seoka describes your way of handling the situation as both desperate and unprofessional, and he says that he could have handled it differently. Did you consider at the time, General, that there may have been different ways of handling the

Now we see at line 13 on page

16 negotiations so that you could get the miners to hand over 17 their weapons?

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, on that day, as a senior police official I felt that, as I've explained already in HHH3, that I could handle the matter also in a manner of, for example asking one of their, two 22 or what of their representatives to talk to me, to negotiate, but in the manner that they were acting 24 themselves, you could see that they could not have allowed,

there was no element of trust. They could not have allowed

Page 13141 Myself, Colonel McIntosh, and now Colonel Moolman, we went

to the Lonmin management; we said the protesters, they

still want to see you. That message is conveyed to the

Lonmin management, and my witnesses in this case is Colonel

McIntosh, as well as Moolman can confirm that. Colonel

6 McIntosh, and I think in his statement does state it.

I need just to demonstrate the alternatives that one could have done, depending on different circumstances, and the situations that were changing from time to time.

10 Chairperson, I need to add that we were extremely

11 considerate in terms of whatever they were requesting.

12 There was a time where they wanted my telephone numbers and

13 I said they need to come to the JOC, and that the Adv

14 Shapiro of Pretoria wants to talk to me. The information

15 was conveyed to them many times to say the General is now

at the JOC, he wants to talk to you. So any person could 16

17 have come there, and secondly, Colonel McIntosh did check

18 who's this Adv Shapiro, and we could not find and establish

19 who is this Adv Shapiro.

> In ending my answer, it will be that in what Reverend Seoka is referring in terms of the police on that day, I do not know whether he was referring to a normal process of negotiation, like if I may give an example, you could do that if the environment is conducive, like the negotiation that was done between what was happening at

> > Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Gallagher Estate, but, or in any place where negotiation

- 2 has to take place, but there it has, I am a law enforcer; I
- 3 need to enforce the law of the country. I need also to
- 4 ensure that the people whenever they march, they march
- 5 peacefully, unarmed, but I do believe that we did what we
- 6 could to persuade and to negotiate with the protesters on
- 7 that day.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry to interrupt.
- 9 Could I ask a question? Do you know whether Adv Shapiro's
- telephone number was ever furnished to you or to any other 10

11 member of the SAPS?

- 12 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, they 13 were not given, but I tasked Colonel McIntosh to follow
- 14 this Adv Shapiro. He had one Adv Shapiro that he knew, and
- he followed it up with him and then he said it's not him. 15
- 16 The one that he phoned, he was dealing with actually the
- 17 divorces. He was not actually - and he said that he's not
- 18 of his lawyer. He didn't know which Adv Shapiro that they
- 19 were referring to.
- 20 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay, are you going to 21 ask any questions about Lonmin's response to this request,
- or because if you are, I won't ask any questions about 22
- 23 it.
- 24 MS PILLAY: No, you could ask them.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. You said you
 - Page 13143
- and Colonel McIntosh and Captain Moolman, as she then was, 1
- 2 went to see Lonmin to convey what you mentioned to us, the
- 3 request of the strikers. Did you speak to people at Lonmin
- 4 about that?
- 5 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, we
- did go and talk with Lonmin people, and I think Colonel 6
- 7 McIntosh will confirm and Colonel Moolman, Adv Moolman.
- To whom did you speak at 8 CHAIRPERSON:
- 9 Lonmin?
- 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: I did.
- 11 Chairperson -
- 12 CHAIRPERSON: To whom?
- 13 [12:54] MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: We did speak to,
- at that time it's, one member was Mr Sinclair, he was also 14
- 15 having, the gentleman is Abey Kgotle, but - I think it's
- 16 Abey Kgotle and then it was on the early morning, if I
- 17 remember very well, of the 15th, that was before that
- 18 meeting which I was supposed to hold with the unions later,
- and then they said we will get the answer. Now, and it was
- also at that time that I emphasised to them to say then I
- 21 need also to get the unions, so Chairperson, then the
- 22 answer which I got, then I got the answer which was
- recorded at the exhibit OO4. 23
- MS PILLAY: General, there's a further

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

dimension to what I've been putting to you, and it's a

- Page 13144
- contention that was advanced both on behalf of the miners
- and on behalf of the families, and that is this; that the
- police had at their disposal a seasoned and experienced
- negotiator who had experience with conflict resolution in a
- mining context, who was a man of God, trusted by the
- 6 miners, and on two occasions, or specifically on the 16th,
- 7 but also in relation to the 13th, he could have been used as
- 8 a resource to negotiate with the miners. Now what's your
- 9 response to that?
- 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson,
- 11 according to the statement of Colonel McIntosh, the people
- 12 are the ones that actually couldn't want to continue with
- 13 the negotiations any further. Maybe I, we should actually
- check the statement of Colonel McIntosh because he does put 14
- it clearly what happened on the 16th.
- 16 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: But perhaps Ms
- 17 Pillay wants to know why the police did not use someone who
- comes with the reputation that the Reverend Seoka has of
- 19 dealing with these situations. Why did the police not
- 20 elect to use him in any of the negotiations?
- 21 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: As far as my
- 22 recollection is concerned, we did utilise Colonel McIntosh
- 23 and he has good experience.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, that's not the
- question. The question is Colonel McIntosh did his best,

Page 13145

- but then the Right Reverend Bishop Seoka arrives on the
- scene; he's an experienced person facilitating and
- negotiating and so on, and as we know, he subsequently
- assisted materially in bringing about the peace accord,
- 5 facilitating the arrangement that took place subsequently
- 6 after the 16th, made a very important contribution, as I
- 7 understand. Now the question you're being asked is why
- didn't you use, take advantage of his willingness to be
- involved I think that's the question, is that right, Ms 9
- 10 Pillay?

14

- 11 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair.
- 12 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Thanks
- 13 Chairperson. I didn't understand the question.
 - CHAIRPERSON: That's why I clarified it.
- 15 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Yes. Chairperson,
- 16 and I think Reverend Seoka can confirm, I did not know
- 17 about Reverend Seoka at all. The second part that I need
- 18 also to mention is, Chairperson, and the Commission, you'll
- 19 recall in terms of my pleading with all the leaders of the
- 20 unions in as far as GGG4 is concerned, because if Reverend
- 21 Seoka was known by one of those leaders and he was
- 22 introduced, because I even told them that we need somebody
- 23 that will have to bring change, so if for example I could
- 24 see now with the benefit of hindsight that he's actually
- very close to Mr Mathunjwa, if by then he was there, then

Page 13146

we could have utilised him. But myself as an overall

2 commander, I did not know about his services at that time.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, no I understand that,

4 and to be fair, I don't think he was close to Mr Mathunjwa

- 5 at that stage. It was only subsequently when he came and
- facilitated what amounted to a settlement, but that was all 6
- 7 after the 16th. So I understand your answer. Is this an
- 8 appropriate stage for us to take the lunch adjournment?
- 9 MS PILLAY: It is, Chair.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: Can you give us an
- indication, Ms Pillay I know it's difficult of how long 11
- you're likely to be, when we resume, with the witness? 12
- 13 MS PILLAY: Chair, a maximum of an hour.
- 14 CHAIRPERSON: I see. Alright, we'll bear 15 that in mind. We'll now take the lunch adjournment. We'll
- resume at quarter to 2. 16
- [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] 17
- 18 [14:01] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
- 19 Major-General, you're still under oath.
- 20 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct.
- 21 Chairperson.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON: The reason we are late is
- 23 that we had a visit in chambers from counsel for the police
- 24 services who wishes to say something which doesn't amount
- 25 to an objection. Yes, Mr Ngalwana.

Page 13148

- clear, Chair, that I am not talking about versions that are
- contained in statements being put to the General, I am
- 3 talking about general versions attributed to people who are
- 4 not represented here and that being said to be their
- 5 version. So we fear that it may very well be argued at the
- 6 end by Mr Mpofu and his team and perhaps Mr Ntsebeza that
- 7 the process has been irregular and that may very well be a
- 8 ground for review. We just thought we should place that on
- 9 record without any objection at all so that we are all
- 10 alive to this possibility.
 - CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Ngalwana. Mr
- 12 Budlender, as the Chief evidence leader, do you wish to
- 13 comment at all on what's been said.
- 14 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, we understand
- 15 the problem that is raised by our colleagues. It seems to
- 16 us that the way to resolve it is as follows; that where a
- 17 witness gives evidence and we have on record a version by
- the injured and arrested persons put by them themselves
- 19 either in the form of a statement which they have submitted
- 20 or in the form of a proposition or a case which is being
- 21 put by their counsel then we will say, according to the
- 22 statement of Mr So and So, he says this. And say to the
- 23 witness what do you say to that or alternatively according
- 24 to what was said by counsel for the injured or arrested
 - persons their case is this, what do you say to that. That

Page 13147

- MR NGALWANA: 1 Thank you, Chair, let me
- 2 emphasise again that this is not an objection. It's just
- 3 an observation of concern that the police team has conceded
- over the lunch break, the concern is that and I'm dealing
- 5 only with the witness. This issue relates to the witness
- 6 who's currently in cross-examination. The concern that the
- 7 police team has discussed is where the evidence leaders
- 8 place the version of the miners or the injured workers who
- with them. And, of course, in light of what Mr Mpofu has 10
- said this morning that has also brought this to a head. It 11
- 12 made us think a bit and so we consider that if this were to
- 13
- 14 little can stop him from saying well look I am now here,
- 15 I've consulted with my witnesses. I want to cross-examine
- 16
- 17 it to me, the evidence leaders could not possibly have
- 18 articulated fairly the version of my witnesses. We've
- 19 considered that there may be a way around this problem and
- it's one of two ways, there may be more, either the
- 21 evidence leaders, before they put a version of
- consultation with the miners who are not here represented
- 25 of the miners or by way of subpoena. And let me make it

- 4
- 9 are not currently represented here without having consulted

- happen and Mr Mpofu comes back it seems to us that very
- General Mpembe on my witness's version as they've conveyed

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 22 unrepresented people to the Major-General they could have a
- 24 either voluntarily, in other words of their free volition

- Page 13149
- putting of a version will carry no evidential weight
- whatsoever, it will give the witness some opportunity to
- 3 deal with it so that the witness doesn't have to be called
- 4 back subsequently. And if the injured and arrested persons
- 5 subsequently come back and say well that's not really what
- 6 we meant, when we said this that's not what we meant, we
- 7 meant something else. Well they can deal with that and
- 8 that can be dealt with in due course but it seems to us
- 9 that it's both fair to the witnesses and important for the 10
- work of the Commission that where we have a version on
- record from the injured and arrested person, a version 11
- 12 created by them themselves is important that should be put 13 to the witnesses.
- 14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. That seems to 15 be prima facie correct - Mr Ngalwana do you want to
- 16 comment?
- 17 MR NGALWANA: I just want to say
- 18 something briefly by way of reply. The difficulty, of
- 19 course, there may not be a difficulty with the injured
- 20 miners but the difficulty will be that Major-General Mpembe
- 21 may very well have to be recalled in the event of the
- injured miners amending the version that was put to Major-
- 23 General Mpembe and that we think will be an unfair approach 24 to take.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON: Shouldn't we cross that

Page 13150

- bridge if and when we get there? It may not happen. It
- would affect weight, I understand the point you make that 2
- 3 it might be contended it's an irregularity. Whether that's
- 4 ever likely to be upheld by a court applies its mind
- 5 properly to the question is another matter if you don't
- 6 have to go into it at the moment. But thank you for making
- 7 the point, for giving us cause to think about it. I think
- I've already reminded you you're under oath, Major-General. 8
- 9 Ms Pillay.
- 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct,
- 11 Chairperson.
- Thank you, Chair. Chair 12 MS PILLAY:
- 13 during the cross-examination of General Phiyega Mr Mpofu -
- 14 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Sorry, Ms Pillay,
- 15 are you moving away from the extract?
- 16 MS PILLAY: Yes, I am.
- 17 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: I can't remember,
- did you put lines 24 and 25 to him? I can't remember if 18
- 19 you did read it out or not.
- 20 MS PILLAY: Yes, I did -
- 21 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Okay, thank you.
- 22 Sorry to interrupt.

1

- 23 MS PILLAY: General, during the cross-
- 24 examination of General Phiyega Mr Mpofu dealt with what he
- 25 described as ten prescripts, legal prescripts which were

Page 13151

- extracted from the legal framework of the various legal
- documents that bind SAPS and regulates their conduct. Now 2
- 3 General Phiyega agreed with all ten of then and so I think
- 4 they're largely uncontentious. The one that I want to deal
- 5 with you today specifically is what was described by Mr
- Mpofu legal and moral duty on the part of SAPS to act in an 6
- impartial and unbiased manner. Now General Phiyega 7
- 8 accepted that such a duty exists, do you similarly that
- 9 SAPS has to act, when they do act they have to act in an
- 10 impartial and unbiased manner?
- 11 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct, Chair.
- 12 MS PILLAY: Now General, Mr Mpofu argued
- 13 before the Commission that in relation to the Marikana
- 14 operation that SAPS did not act in an unbiased and
- 15 impartial manner, in fact he alleged that there was what he
- 16 called a toxic collusion between SAPS and Lonmin. And he
- 17 put to both General Annandale and General Phiyega 13
- 18 indications of what - factual indications of what he
- 19 submitted amounted to a toxic collusive relationship
- between SAPS and Lonmin. Chair, what I've done just to go
- 21 quite quickly through these points is I've just tabulated
- 22 them in a table and cross-referenced to where they where
- they appear in the record and I just seek to go quite
- quickly through them, General, and get your response.
- CHAIRPERSON: I suggest you read all 13

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 13152

- without interruption, you know just to get them on record
- as it were and then the witness can deal with them either
- one by one or globally as he considers it appropriate or
- you consider it appropriate. Shall we give it an exhibit
 - number?
- 6 MR NGALWANA: Chair, before we give it an
- 7 exhibit number, it's not an objection, I'm just alerting us
- 8 to the fact, I am wondering if this is necessary because I
- remember distinctly Mr Burger dealing with each and every
- 10 one of these and quite ably with respect and it seems the
- 11 effect of that was really to torpedo each and every one of
- these out of the water. So I wonder if it's necessary for 12
- this witness to deal with it. 13
- 14 CHAIRPERSON: Lonmin don't agree there 15 was collusion, perhaps it's appropriate to get a police
- comment as well but let's not just spend too much time on
- it, let's rather get it the next exhibit as far as I can 17
- see will HHH49. You'll bear in mind the point that was
- 19 made by Mr Ngalwana, not by way of objection. Carry on 20 please, Ms Pillay.
- 21 MS PILLAY: The 13 points, General, are
- 22 firstly the appointment of Mr Sinclair as the liaison
- 23 person to manage the relationship between SAPS and Lonmin.
- 24 The second point is the partnership between SAPS and Lonmin
 - identifying individuals who were suspects. The third is

Page 13153

- the establishment and use of the Lonmin JOC, essentially
- that relates to the fact that the JOC was based on Lonmin's
- premises. The fourth was the joint use of the CC TV
- material by Lonmin and SAPS. The fifth was the joint
- deployment of medical personnel ad forward holding area 1.
- The sixth was Mr Botes', the fact that Mr Botes was
- permanently based at the SAPS JOC. The seventh was the use
- 8 of the Coin Security helicopter which is referred to in
- certain documents as the Lonmin Chopper. The eighth was
- 10 the use of the Lonmin employee George as the Fanagalo
- 11 interpreter. The ninth was the fact that Mr Kwadi was with
- 12 the Union representative, sorry the Union President when
- 13 they were taken to the koppie on the 14th. The tenth was
- 14 the miners who were arrested on the 16th were processed at
- 15 the Lonmin Number 1 shaft. The eleventh is the fact that 16 Mr Botes attended the 6am JOC on 16th of August. The
- 17 twelfth is that there were daily briefing meetings between
- 18 Lonmin and NUM and that SAPS would occasionally attend the
- 19
- daily briefings and the thirteenth is that when the people
- were shot the overall commander, that is yourself, was in
- 21 the Lonmin chopper and not in the JOC at the time.
- 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson.
- 23 MS PILLAY: General, if I could ask you
- to respond first to the general allegations that was some sort of improper relationship between SAPS and Lonmin
- Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

during the operation. If I could have your comment to

2 that.

3 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson, 4 there was no toxic relationship between SAPS and Lonmin. I

5 can deal with each item if the Commission does allow me to

do that 6

7

MS PILLAY: You can go ahead, General, and deal with whichever points you feel it's necessary to

8 9 deal with. 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: The appointment of 11 Mr Sinclair as liaison officer - was liaison person to

manage relationship between SAPS and Lonmin, Mr Sinclair in 12 terms of his work, he is a most senior officer of the 13

14 security in Lonmin and he's not appointed by us. So it is

15 by virtue of his work that he worked with South African

Police Service. Chairperson, number 2 recalls me of what I 16

said in terms of on the 13th where people were identified. 17

18 Lonmin was the employer and for us to know who were the

19 people, we had no any other place to go except to go to

20 Lonmin. And secondly the Commission will recall that I

said when the Provincial Commissioner was briefed on Monday 21

22 the senior officers of Lonmin said we don't know who are

23 these people, they are faceless. So that's why then we had

24 to go there. It was not a partnership. To us to establish

25 that there is a partnership, there should have been a

Page 13155

11

19

20

21

22

memorandum of understanding whereby we do share resources

or any other issue but this is any other department where 2

3 we can help. But in this case Lonmin were the employer

4 where we could get more information in order to enable us 5

to do our work.

1

17

6 Chairperson, with regard to number 3 there is no policy that says you cannot establish a JOC to any other 7 place. Secondly, is that we normally, in any operation, we 8 9 normally establish a JOC where we will be nearer to the 10 problem than any other. The issue that we look at is efficiency, effectiveness. The EEE, economical, efficiency 11 12 and effectiveness rather than to be away from the place to 13 travel from all over the place where we were not because we were supposed to deploy throughout the day and the night 14 15 and you have to work to know all the places within a short space of time. We were getting different police officials 16

18 basis be orientated. 19 Chairperson, with regard to number 4 the CC TV it was an asset to enable us to do the work. We did not utilise it because there was any other agreement between us 22 and Lonmin. There was no even a prior arrangement or prior - it was an asset that is there that we could utilise it to 24 do our work properly. With regard to number 5, the medical 25 personnel of Lonmin, we couldn't see any reason why we

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

from different provinces but they had to be on a continuous

Page 13156

could not utilise it because in most cases it was in the

case of emergency. What happened on the 13th and then with

regard to - on the 16th there was no any other prior

arrangements in terms of saying we have to plan together so

that we should get you to go there. So that to me it

6 didn't show any other toxic relationship. Chairperson,

7 with regard to number 6, Mr Botes is the second in command

8 of Mr Sinclair, he knew the environment very well and in

9 this case for us to have operated in a better way one of

10 the areas that we need to muster well it is the - that

environment in which we have to work. So in regard to that 11

12 that's why Mr Botes was in the JOC.

13 [14:20] But I need to indicate, Chairperson, with regard

14 to the JOC and that can also be confirmed. And I did state

that our JOC was established on Saturday. It worked on

Saturday and at that time Mr Botes was there and the police

17 were there and when I arrive on Monday the JOC was

separated. So Lonmin JOC was at another place and SAPS JOC

19 was on another place, so it was on the issue of - it's not

20 that he was always there when we were doing the briefing.

21 When we were doing the briefing it was only the police and

22 then Mr Botes will come at a later stage and he will be -

23 the briefing could be done for the operation to continue on

24 a highly classified manner. Chairperson, with regard to

number 7, the use of Coin Security helicopter, I need also

Page 13157

to state that there was no prior arrangements with SAPS

that the Coin Security should be used by SAPS. Coin is

contracted by Lonmin so we saw it as a tool that you can

utilise it in that regard. It was not because Lonmin -

5 there was any other prior arrangement between us and Lonmin

6 and in all of my testimony exactly what was said by Lonmin,

7 exactly what was said - I said it without any fear to show

that there was no any other relationship. We have just to 8

9 talk what has happened on that day.

10 Chairperson, with regard to number 8, the situation at that time needed any resource to use and as 12 I've indicated earlier on that if we knew of the skills of 13 Reverend Walker we could have used him. And in this case 14 the only people that could assist us with the Fanagalo 15 because we didn't have any expect in the police to talk 16 Fanagalo, it was to use one of the Lonmin people. As I 17 indicated that we didn't get those services on Monday but 18 on the following day we did get those services from Lonmin.

CHAIRPERSON: Wasn't there some evidence that Lieutenant-Colonel McIntosh also can speak Fanagalo? Or am I confusing that with something else? I seem to remember some evidence to that effect, am I right?

23 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, what I know is he did do a conflict resolution in the mines but that he is very good in Fanagalo I do not know.

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

Page 13160

Page 13161

Page 13158

- Chairperson, with regard to number 9, Mr Kwadi it is his
- 2 work in Lonmin to be a labour relations officer. As I have
- 3 indicated that what happened in Lonmin was labour related
- and the police intervened when people started to be killed, 4
- 5 vehicles starting to be torched. We did request Lonmin and
- Lonmin tasked Mr Kwadi because he had a good relationship 6
- 7 with the President already, he's the one that facilitated
- 8 the meeting that took place on the 15th. So we did not see
- 9 any toxic relationship. He was there to assist and the
- 10 meeting that was organised and it was organised by him but
- 11 called by us and also to go to the mine it was to assist

12 but not to have any other toxic relationship.

Chairperson, with regard to number 10, I did testify that the police station at that time did not have electricity and there were problems that we could have experienced. And with the number and the volume of the people that we could have processed and then what we had to do is to get another place in terms of to process this. It

- 18
- 19 was arranged prior, it was when we said it was - it was
- 20 arranged prior, yes in the sense that when we realised that
- 21 the police station there's no electricity because it was
- under construction. Then we had to get a place where we 22
- 23 could process.

13

14

15

16

17

4

7

8

- 24 CHAIRPERSON: When exactly - what time
- 25 was that that you made that arrangement with Lonmin that

terms of planning together to do any other thing. The

- daily briefings, I do not have any knowledge of any Lonmin
- and NUM meeting that were attended by SAPS members. That is number 12.

Chairperson, with regard to number 13, my answer is still the same, that as I have said, the chopper was a resource that was there that could be used, but there is no policy that says I must have been at the JOC as an overall commander.

CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS PILLAY (CONTD.): But General, whether or not these factors indicate a toxic collusion or not, what I've put to you is at the very least from the perception of the miners involved, it may have created a perception that there was an improper working relationship between Lonmin and SAPS, from the perception of the miners involved.

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I understand the perception, but what was more important is that all what the miners asked the police during all the activities that happened here, we did convey it to the Lonmin management, and secondly, we have been transparent even in this Commission to say what did we convey to Lonmin and coming from the miners themselves. Our communication with the miners, between the miners and Lonmin was conveyed on both parties.

Page 13159

- they would make that place available for the processing of 1
- 2 the arrested persons? Can you remember?
- 3 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, if my
 - recollection serves me well it was on the 16th by the time
- 5 when we were doing the taskings in the morning.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON: In the morning.
 - MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: And I do remember
 - that Brigadier Van Zyl, Seboloke and myself we were
- 9 responsible for that one.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: We're just going to take a 11 short adjournment of five minutes. There's something that
- 12 one of my commissioners has to attend to.
- 13 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS **COMMISSION RESUMES**] 14 [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
- 15 You're still under oath, Major-General.
- 16 WILLIAM MPEMBE: Correct, Chairperson.
- 17 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Ms Pillay? I think
- 18 the Major-General was going through the list and you just
- finished dealing, I think with number 10, when we took that 19
- 20 short adjournment.
- MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 21
- 22 Chairperson. Chairperson, for Mr Botes to attend the 6
- o'clock JOC meeting at the, on the 16th, it was when he was
- 24 just to inform the JOC how they have posted their

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25 securities, so it didn't show any other relationship in

- 1 Secondly, for us to do our work in, as the
 - 2 Constitution says and in terms of the Police Act, Lonmin
 - 3 was the employer and we did feel that Lonmin has the duty
 - 4 to ensure that the situation has to be brought under
 - control. But not only Lonmin; we also felt that the labour
 - 6 unions should also have a duty, and in terms of that, if
 - 7 there was any toxic relationship, with all the meetings and
 - 8 the relationship that I had with the presidents of the
 - 9 unions, in relation - we can check both OOO4 and GGG4, I
 - 10 said to them I'm always 24 hours here; if is there any
 - 11 other thing, just talk to us. So if there was any other
 - 12 issues, we also brought in element of the presidents
 - 13 talking to the miners and also to Lonmin. So it could have
 - 14 been addressed at that time.

MS PILLAY: Within that theme, General, there are just two further points that I need to draw to

- 17 your attention. The first is that I put it to you that on
- 18 the morning of the 16th that Lonmin had made available to
- 19 SAPS additional barbed wire, that was eventually not used.
- 20 MR NGALWANA: Chair, whose version is
- 21 this? Which witness has said it? I'm not aware of this 22 evidence.
- 23 MS PILLAY: Chair, we have photographic 24 evidence to that effect, but if needs be we can get a

15

16

```
Page 13162
                                                                                                                           Page 13164
            COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ:
                                             Was this apropos
                                                                         this case they were referring to, I was referring to the
1
    the police saying there was insufficient barbed wire to go
                                                                         incident. That's what I thought that they were referring
2
3
    around the copy?
                                                                         to the incident that happened when the securities were
4
           MS PILLAY:
                               To encircle the koppie, yes.
                                                                         attacked and killed, and I knew that there was a docket
                                                                     5
5
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                   You know, the rule we've
                                                                         that was opened.
                                                                     6
6
    got is that if statements and things are going to be put,
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      But the point in question
                                                                     7
7
    the person to be cross-examined should get notice of it
                                                                         is that what the miners said was that the mine security,
                                                                     8
8
    beforehand. If this wasn't part of the material that the
                                                                         which are obviously Lonmin employees, had shot at them.
9
                                                                     9
    witness was given, then I don't think you can ask him the
                                                                         That was their allegation. I understand there may be other
10
    question. It may well be that the question can be asked of
                                                                    10
                                                                         allegations from other parties, but that was the miners'
                                                                    11
                                                                         allegation. That's the basis of the question which Ms
11
    other people - I think in relation to the barbed wire maybe
                                                                    12
12
    Brigadier Calitz or somebody can deal with the question,
                                                                         Pillay is asking you.
                                                                    13
                                                                                MS PILLAY:
13
    and presumably by the time he gives evidence, the relevant
                                                                                                  The question, General, is if
14
    statement to which you refer and the photograph to which
                                                                    14
                                                                         you look at exhibit L, and if you look at slide 43 onwards
    you refer can be put to him. But I think Mr Ngalwana was
                                                                    15
                                                                         of exhibit L -
15
                                                                    16
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      Which particular bullet are
16
    on the point of raising something which would have been an
                                                                    17
                                                                         you referring to in slide 43 of exhibit L?
17
    objection and which I would have upheld, but don't concur -
18
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   [Inaudible] objection.
                                                                    18
                                                                                MS PILLAY:
                                                                                                  It's no particular bullet,
19
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                   You don't have to, Mr
                                                                    19
                                                                         Chair. I'll just wait for the witness to open the slide
20
    Ngalwana.
                                                                    20
                                                                         and I'll pose my question.
21
           MS PILLAY:
                                                                    21
                                                                                CHAIRPERSON:
                              General, the second point
                                                                                                      I see. Alright, okay.
                                                                    22
                                                                                MS PILLAY:
22
    which I wish to put to you, is the following. You were
                                                                                                  The question, General, is if
23
    aware that the miners on the 13th had reported to you that
                                                                    23
                                                                         you look at slide 43 to 48 of exhibit L, it's a summary of
24
                                                                    24
    there were incidents of violence on the part of Lonmin
                                                                         the sequence of events that took place on the 13th. Now you
25
    against the miners. Is that correct?
                                                                         will see that there is absolutely no mention in those
                                                       Page 13163
                                                                                                                           Page 13165
           MR SHOZI:
                             Chair, again might we enquire
                                                                         slides of reports or allegations even by the miners that
1
                                                                         they were shot at by Lonmin.
2
    as to whose version is being put to General Mpembe?
3
           MS PILLAY:
                              Chair, it appears from
                                                                     3
                                                                               MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE:
                                                                                                                 Chairperson, as I
4
    General Mpembe's statement, GGG15, that on the day, on the
                                                                     4
                                                                         indicated earlier on, the inputs that were made in exhibit
5
    13th the miners informed him that they wished to be armed
                                                                         L were coming from different people and it depends from the
                                                                         compiler how did he compile it. So, but what I do believe
6
    because they were shot at by Lonmin.
7
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                     7
                                                                         is that the versions were put, but how it was compiled is
                                  - Lonmin, NUM. Do they say
                                                                     8
8
    Lonmin as well? What is that statement? Just give me the
                                                                         something that I did not have any control of.
9
                                                                     9
    reference again. I remember them saying they wanted to
                                                                               MS PILLAY:
                                                                                                 General, as overall commander
                                                                    10
```

retain their arms to protect themselves against NUM, but if 10 they said Lonmin as well, then I don't remember that, but 11 12 can you give me the reference, please? 13 MS PILLAY: I'll give you the reference in two seconds, Chair. GGG12 at paragraph 14. 14 15 CHAIRPERSON: GGG12, paragraph? 16 MS PILLAY: Paragraph 14. 17 CHAIRPERSON: 14. Yes, I see that is 18 correct. It is correct. What they stated was, "They refused to hand over the weapons. One of them stated that the mine security fought with them and it was the mine 21 security that were shooting at them, and that was why they 22 don't want to give their weapons to the police." That's what you yourself said [microphone off, inaudible] told 24 you.

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, in

RCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

of the operation, did you see exhibit L before it was 11 presented to this Commission? 12 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I 13 would say that exhibit L, it was presented to all of us, 14 including myself, but thereafter there were some, many 15 changes that were made, whom I cannot know when were they 16 being made. 17 MS PILLAY: And it goes further than 18 that, General. Are you aware that there was a docket opened on the 10th of August, recording allegations by two 20 residents of Marikana that they had been shot at by mine 21 security? 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson, 23 as on the 10th I was still on leave. I started reporting on 24 the 13th. 25 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may hand up two

24

25

```
Page 13166
    statements. These are both statements taken from the SAPS
2
    hard drive. The first is by Mr Thando Elias Mutengwane,
3
    and the second by Mr Bulelani Kluvet Dlomo. Now I've drawn
4
    these statements to the attention of both representatives
5
    for SAPS and Lonmin, Chair.
           CHAIRPERSON:
6
                                 I take it you want me to
7
    mark Mr Mutengwane's statement as HHH50?
8
           MS PILLAY:
                             That's correct, Chair.
9
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 And Mr Dlomo's statement as
    HHH51. I have so marked them.
10
11
           MS PILLAY:
                             Now General, you will see
12
    from the statements of both Mr Mutengwane and Mr Dlomo that
13
    they allege that they were shot at from a Lonmin Security
14
    twin-cab on the 10th of August.
15
           MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE:
                                            Chairperson, as
    I'm saying, on the 10th I was not, on leave, not running
16
17
    away from my responsibilities; on the 13th, I might have
18
    made some enquiries, but I did receive now this document
19
    here, I could have checked what was done to process of the
20
    investigations, is there any other arrests were made or not
21
    on this.
22
           MS PILLAY:
                             The proposition that I've put
```

to you, General, as overall commander of the operation, is

that we've had a look at slides 11, 12, 13 to 16 to exhibit

L, which records a summary of the sequence of events on the

Page 13168 Pillay goes a bit further than that, because she asked you 2 whether you were aware of the contents of exhibit L before 3 it was finalised, and you told us that it was presented 4 just before it was finalised, because you said some changes 5 were made after that, after it was presented to a group, 6 including you. So I think what Ms Pillay wants to know is 7 were you aware at that stage when the draft, as it were, of 8 exhibit L was presented, that these complaints had been 9 made by these two people of their being attacked, or 10 assaulted by Lonmin people. 11 [14:50] So what's the answer? Did you know of these two 12 dockets, these two cases, allegations at the time when the 13 draft of exhibit L was presented to a group, including you? 14 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: At that time, 15 Chairperson, I was not aware in terms of - I do not remember that this was mentioned in the exhibit L, but as I 17 have indicated, there were so many times that exhibit L was 18 updated. 19 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, I know, but you 20 see, the point is this; we've got the final version of 21 exhibit L. Exhibit L doesn't mention that at this time 22 some of the workers were complaining, miners were 23 complaining that they were being attacked by Lonmin people 24 in the circumstances set out in these statements, and I think the point being made - if I'm wrong, Ms Pillay will Page 13169

Page 13167 1 10th of August and nowhere in those slides does it mention 2 allegations by residents of having been shot at by Lonmin. 3 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Yes, Chairperson, 4 my answer is still the same, that this is being brought to 5 me. This was never being brought to my attention on the 13th, as it happened on the 10th. 6 7 CHAIRPERSON: I think the question goes a 8 bit further than that. I understand you just came back 9 from leave. 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct, 11 Chairperson. 12 CHAIRPERSON: But the -13 MR NGALWANA: Not on the 10th, Chair. 14 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, no, I'm sorry, I 15 didn't make myself clear. You came back from leave after 16 the 10th. This happened on the 10th apparently, and you 17 didn't know about it because you were on leave. 18 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 19 Chairperson. 20 And I think you're saying CHAIRPERSON: 21 it wasn't drawn to your attention before the 13th. Is that right? 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 23 Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: But the question of Ms

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

correct me - was that in order to present a fair picture of 2 the situation, this should have been mentioned in L. If 3 you knew about these statements at the time and you were 4 present when presumably a draft of L was presented, you 5 should have put your hand up and say hey, this isn't fair, 6 this isn't completely fair and complete version; there 7 should also be mention of these two incidents that are 8 referred to in HHH50 and 51. I think that's your point, Ms 9 Pillay. Is that right? 10 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair. 11 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, as 12 I've indicated that I was not aware of this since I was on 13 leave, but also that as my memory serves me well, I didn't 14 see it when exhibit L was presented to me at that time. 15 MS PILLAY: General, if I may refer you 16 to a further statement -17 MR NGALWANA: Chair, can I just make one, 18 or two corrections? As I understand Ms Pillay, she said that there were two dockets that record people being shot. She can correct me if I'm wrong. It seems to me if you 21 look at the top of the page it's in fact one docket. 22 MS PILLAY: Chair, I'm about to introduce 23 the second docket. 24 CHAIRPERSON: What we've got at the moment, exhibits HHH50 and 51, those are from one docket,

18

19

20

21

22

Page 13172

Page 13173

```
Page 13170
    but we're now coming to the second docket. Is that right?
2
                            The second docket, that's
          MS PILLAY:
3
   correct, Chair.
                                 The second point of
4
          MR NGALWANA:
```

correction; it was mentioned that these two mentioned that 5 people were shot from a bakkie, twin-cab that opened fire 6 7 at them. I haven't seen that allegation in HHH51, Chair.

8 Perhaps our learned friend can help the witness. It seems 9

paragraph 4 is the one that talks about a shooting.

10 MS PILLAY: Chair, in paragraph 4 it's 11 mentioned of people who were there or from the Lonmin 12 Security.

CHAIRPERSON: So the statement as put to you may not have been precise in the sense that it should have said that the one case that the shots were fired from a Lonmin Security twin-cab. The second case it was said fired from a Lonmin Security, and not stating whether or not it was a twin-cab. That's the difference, but either way the allegation was that Lonmin Security had been involved in shooting at these people, and these two complainants' statements were filed together in one file, one docket, which apparently is CAS69/08/2012, and that's not referred to in exhibit L, and now we're coming to the second docket. How many statements are there? Just one? in paragraph 2 that on Monday, the 13th of August, he was on

duty at Lonmin Marikana Operations. They encountered a group, a crowd marching towards the K3 Shaft. The crowd

was stopped next to the railway line. They were dispersed

by members of Lonmin Security. As they were marching back

towards the gathering they were stopped by SAPS in order to

7 negotiate. Mr Kellerman says in paragraph 3, General, that

8 they stayed behind on the bridge to keep observation on the

9 movement of the crowd, and when SAPS dispersed the crowd

10 they tried to follow the movements of the people, and he

11 says that they then saw a group of five people moving

12 towards the K4 concentrator. He says in paragraph 4 that 13 they rushed towards the K4 concentrator and shouted at the

people to move away from the concentrator area. He says

the Lonmin Security team shot a warning round with rubber

ammunition towards the suspects.

MR NGALWANA: Chair, I must apologise. I notice my learned friend is paraphrasing. There's some excerpts that she doesn't read. I'm not sure if that creates an accurate picture for the witness.

CHAIRPERSON: Has the witness got the document in front of him?

23 MS PILLAY: Chair, the witness was also given notice a few days ago that we intend relying on this document.

Page 13171

1 CHAIRPERSON: So that will be HHH52, I

2 take it.

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

7

8

15

17

3 MS PILLAY: This will be HHH52. General. 4 do you have the statement of Mr Kellerman in front of you? 5 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct.

It's just one document.

Chairperson. 6

> MS PILLAY: You will see from paragraph 1 of the statement, General – firstly this statement belongs

9 to Marikana CAS118, and you will confirm, General, that

10 that's one of the dockets opened as a result of the 11

shooting of the 13th of August?

MS PILLAY:

12 MR NGALWANA: Chair, we're a bit 13 handicapped because we don't have the statement to which our learned friend is referring. 14

MS PILLAY: Chair, the team was furnished with a copy of the Kellerman statement, but I can get them another copy, if I'm just given 30 seconds.

18 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: You can have my 19 copy, Mr Ngalwana.

20 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Commissioner 21 Hemraj.

Now you will see, General, 22 MS PILLAY: that Mr Kellerman is employed as a senior - or was at the

24 time employed as a senior security officer for mining security at Lonmin Platinum Marikana Operations. He says

MR NGALWANA: All I'm asking is that perhaps she should read the document, Chair, inasmuch as

this seems to be misleading.

4 MS PILLAY: Chair, I'm very conscious of the commitment I made as to time. I did give notice to the

SAPS team of my intention to rely on this document. I 6

7 think in the circumstances it's unreasonable to expect me

8 to read every word on the page. I think the witness will

9 correct me if I'm not accurately portraying what's on

the statement.

11 CHAIRPERSON: I think go on as you are 12 for the moment, but I'll keep an eye on it and if I think that you're skipping over things that are relevant I'll 14 raise the alarm, and Mr Ngalwana will do the same if he 15 thinks so. We were busy with para 4. "We rushed towards the concentrator and shouted at the people to move away from the concentrator area." That's where you were, was

17

18

10

19 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair. They kept on coming and members of the security team shot a warning round with rubber ammunition towards the suspects to deter them from entering the concentrator area. In

23 paragraph 5 Mr Kellerman states that the suspect ran into

24 the veld behind the concentrator and disappeared behind the

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

small mounds of earth which are situated behind the

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

18

19

Page 13176

Page 13174

- concentrator. He says then that the concentrator security
- 2 superintendent had a high vantage point and directed him to
- 3 where the suspect disappeared behind the mound. In
- 4 paragraph 6, General, Mr Kellerman then says, and the sharp
- 5 point of what he says in paragraph 6 is that Superintendent
- 6 Botha, who was covering him, shot the suspect with rubber
- 7 12-gauge rounds to deter him from coming towards Mr
- Kellerman. 8
- 9 MR NGALWANA: Well, it also says that the superintendent was covering him, Chair. That's been left 10
- 11 out. Surely that gives a -
- 12 CHAIRPERSON: I don't know if that's a
- 13 material omission, though. The point is that these rounds
- 14 were fired. Please carry on, Ms Pillay.
- 15 MS PILLAY: He states then that the
- 16 suspect changed direction and tried to run away in the
- 17 direction of Superintendent - I'm not sure what that word
- 18 is, it looks like Segwai to me. He then decided to shoot
- 19 the suspect on the legs in order to stop him from escaping.
- 20 He indicates that he shot the suspect with rubber rounds
- 21 and that when he fell, he apprehended the suspect. I think
- 22 in the remainder of the statement, General, Mr Kellerman
- 23 indicates that he then apprehended the suspect and took him
- 24 to SAPS, where he was then arrested and where he received
- 25 medical treatment. Now the point is, General, that this
 - Page 13175
- incident occurred on the 13th of August and yet in the 1
- summary of events of the 13th of August that's set out in 2
- 3 exhibit L, there is no mention that any of the strikers
- 4 were shot with rubber bullets by Lonmin Security.
- 5 CHAIRPERSON: The same point applies, you
- see. If you were present when the draft of L was 6
- 7 presented, and if you knew about this - or let me put the
- question, then you can make your point and you knew about 8
- 9 this, why didn't you raise your hand and say hey, but this
- 10 isn't complete, we should include this? That's the
- 11 question, Ms Pillay?
- 12 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON: Now I think there may be an
- 14 objection from the Lonmin side to that. You put your light
- 15 on, did you?
- 16 MR SHOZI: Chair, it's not an objection
- 17 as such. We seek clarity from Ms Pillay in two respects
- 18 because it's important for us to follow the debate since
- 19 they concern Lonmin. The first aspect in respect of, we
- seek clarity in regard to the statements of Mutengwane and
- 21 Bulelani Dlomo. We would like to know whether Ms Pillay
- 22 intends to call them as witnesses. Secondly, we would like
- to know whether the statements are being relied upon to
- prove this alleged toxic collusion between Lonmin and SAPS,
- 25 or is she now dealing with a separate subject matter?
- ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Thank you.

2 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: The statements are

3 not the only place where there's reference being made to

shooting by Lonmin security guards; there are other

5 statements as well which refer to it.

6 CHAIRPERSON: In answer to your first

7 question, you will remember the ruling said that if a party

8 to whom a version is put, or I suppose who's affected by a

9 version wishes to do so, they can apply for the person

whose version was put to be subpoenaed. So it's not 10

11 incumbent upon Ms Pillay to say that she will definitely

12 call this person. If the version is relevant, you may -

and you want the person concerned to come - you can apply

14 for the person to be subpoenaed, and if it's a relevant

15 issue, the person will be subpoenaed. So that's the answer

to the first question. She doesn't have to say whether 16

17 she's going to call the person.

The second point is as to why it's put, that I think is something you're entitled to ask. Is it put to

20 check this witness's knowledge and the fact that he appears

21 to have refrained from asking that this point be included

22 in exhibit L? If that's the purpose, then that's really

23 the end of the matter. If on the other hand it's put

24

forward as evidence from which a toxic collusion or

something approximating thereto can be inferred, then I

Page 13177

suppose you're entitled to know the answer to that. So

2 what's the answer to the second question, Ms Pillay, put by

3 counsel for Lonmin?

> MS PILLAY: Sorry, just repeat the second

5 question.

4

14

6 MR SHOZI: The question really is whether 7 the statements are being relied upon as part of proving this so-called toxic collusion between Lonmin and SAPS, or

9 whether you're now dealing with a separate subject matter 10

altogether.

11 MS PILLAY: The statements are put within 12 a broader theme of an improper relationship between SAPS 13 and Lonmin, as further indicia of an improper relationship

15 CHAIRPERSON: It can't be as simple as

between SAPS and Lonmin.

16 that. The mere fact that a Lonmin official allegedly fired

17 - he admitted he did, actually, or so he appears to in the

18 statement - fired rubber rounds at a person who was

19 injured, that in itself doesn't prove a toxic collusion

20 between the police and Lonmin. But the fact that in the

21 official police presentation this incident, which would

- 22 have a bearing on that aspect, was not disclosed, and if
- 23 this witness knew about this incident and didn't raise up
- 24 his hand at the exhibit L preparatory discussion, then
- inferences can be drawn, I take it. So in itself it

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

3

6

7

9

10

11

12

13

14

Page 13180

Page 13178 doesn't prove the collusion, but the fact that this incident was, as it were, not disclosed in L when there was 2 3 knowledge of it, might lead to some kind of inference. So 4 I think - Ms Pillay, I don't want to put words in your 5 mouth - that seems to be the way the point presents itself to me -6 7 MR NGALWANA: No -8 CHAIRPERSON: Am I reading it correctly? 9 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair. 10 CHAIRPERSON: Now you know the answer to 11 you question. 12 MR NGALWANA: Chair -13 CHAIRPERSON: [Microphone off, inaudible] 14 points put is that there are really a number of preliminary points that should be established before the inference can 15 be drawn. 16 17 MS PILLAY: Chair, we are well aware of 18 that. The witness indicated that there were limitations to 19 how far he could take this, and we will certainly put it to 20 further witnesses who come and testify before the 21 Commission. 22 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, so we just need to 23 get the short answer to the question then. Were you aware 24 of this incident? 25 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson.

examining General Annandale, he described seven indications of the fact that the operation was hijacked - in his terms - by Hawks, who are more militant members of SAPS from what he called the Doves, and in this analysis you were cast as a Dove. 6 Now the proposition put was that the Hawks, the 7

more militant members of SAPS, were really General Annandale, Lieutenant-Colonel Scott. On the other hand, you represented the Doves, and the proposition put by Mr Mpofu was that you were sidelined, deliberately sidelined 11 during the operation by the Hawks, and he referred to a 12 number of factors which he submitted demonstrated the fact 13 that you were sidelined. 14 Now there are five such factors, General, and I'd

just like to briefly put them to you and just to record your response. The first factor is the statement by Mr Mathunjwa that you informed him that you were not in charge of the operation. General, can I have your response to that? MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, in

terms of my statement HHH3 I did deny that I, I did not tell Mr Mathunjwa that I'm no more in charge of the operation, and when I introduced him to the Provincial Commissioner I said it's the Provincial Commissioner of the province, and I don't see any reason why I could have lied

Page 13179

Chairperson, maybe to say that [microphone off, inaudible]

2

1

12

13

3 CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay, isn't that the 4 end of it as far as this witness is concerned? He says he 5 didn't know. If he didn't know about it, he couldn't be expected to have stood up at the exhibit L discussion 6 7 meeting and said this incident should be included for the 8 interest of completeness, because if he didn't know about 9 it, obviously he couldn't be expected to do that. That's his answer. 10 11

MS PILLAY: We agree with that, Chair. We simply felt it necessary to put it to this witness, given that he is the overall commander, give him an opportunity to answer -

14 15 CHAIRPERSON: You've got his answer. [15:10] MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I 17 need also to add that in that is a CAS number where, I

18 think it's one of the - where the police officer was

19 killed, so the statement was taken and placed in the docket, but however, I need also to state that Brigadier 20

21 Van Zyl, who's heading the Detective, he didn't also bring

22 this to my attention at that time.

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

MS PILLAY: General, just the final point 23

draw to your attention that when Mr Mpofu was cross-

24 that I intend to deal with in my cross-examination is to

Page 13181

Chairperson, the,

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

to Mr Mathunjwa. Chairperson, maybe I may be explaining this proposition, what is meant by the Dove and the Hawk.

MS PILLAY: General, the Hawks are the more militant members who adopted a more militant approach, and the Doves are the peacemakers, those that adopted a more passive approach. The second factor, General, which was advanced as an indication of the fact that you were sidelined is your statement in GGG12, paragraph 51, that you could only give guidance if it was sought, and that on

I did respond in terms of my HHH3. If I heard the question correctly in terms of paragraph 28, page 11, to say that I should add to say on my original statement that as an overall commander, I understand the importance of the operational commander in the JOC when problems arise and

17 they inform me through the radio or cell phone of those

the day guidance was not sought.

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE:

18 problems and seek my guidance. This did not happen. It is

19 not the function of the overall commander to usurp the

functions of the operational commander, particularly when

21 the operational commander is better positioned as being on

22 the ground and experienced action, best action, but that it 23 doesn't mean that I was sidelined.

24 MS PILLAY: General, the third factor was the fact that death threats were made against you on the

13th of August and that Colonel Vermaak proposed to remove

2 you from the scene on the 13th.

3 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, as I 4 said, I don't, I didn't see anyone who threatened me, maybe

5 is he coming from the Hawk or from the Dove. So it will

6 very difficult for me maybe - maybe I may say this, whereas

7 it was actually coming from the Dove where I was falling.

So I, if I knew who were the one that threatened me, I 8

9 might be in a position, because as I said, I was also told

10 when I was in Potch that the people who actually threatened

me, it was Captain Tupe and Merafe. So I don't know 11

12 whether they're classified as Doves or as Hawks, but that I

was also told and I did not see them doing that. 13

14 MS PILLAY: The fourth factor, General, 15 is the fact that at the JOCCOM which took place at 1:30 on

the 16th, General Mbombo gave the instruction to General 16

Annandale, and not to you, to execute stage 3 of the 17

18 operational plan. Do you agree, General, that this is 19

evidence of you being sidelined during the operation?

20 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson, 21 what I would – in my response I did respond in terms of my

22 original statement, paragraph 12, GGG12, I'm sorry, and

23 also on my HHH3. Major-General Annandale, since from his

24 arrival on the 13th he has been always in the JOC and he was

25 a JOC commander. He was chairing most of the meetings and Page 13184

General Annandale being instructed by the Provincial

Commissioner to implement stage 3. That doesn't quite make

sense to me, I must tell you, but I'd be interested to hear

your comment on it.

5 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson,

6 notwithstanding what the Provincial Commissioner might also

7 say, because the instruction came from her, but my

8 understanding at the time, it was that because Major

9 Annandale was often the, he was the one that was normally

10 chairing the meetings of the JOC.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Anyway, I just wonder if 12 this would not be a question we should ask her, why she did 13 what she did. You can merely speculate, really, as to what

14 she had in mind. Sorry, Ms Pillay, I interrupted you.

15 Please forgive me.

16 MS PILLAY: Chair, just a final factor,

17 General, which was advanced as a further indication that

you were sidelined during the operation is the absence of

19 specific mention in the minute of the crucial meeting,

20 that's the 1:30 JOCCOM on the 16th, there was an absence of

21 specific mention of input from you in the minute.

22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, when

23 the, there were some inputs that I did make on the 16th and

24 inputs like the resources that there has to be utilised,

for example, if I have to give an example, the taskings

Page 13183

I explained why I did choose him to be a JOC commander, and

2 in my absence he will also assume my responsibilities. So

3 in the South African Police we don't see ourselves as Hawks

4 or as Doves. We work as a team and as officers, but if

5 there was any other thing that I would not have agreed, I

would have stated it. 6

1

7

8

CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure it's as simple

as that. If you look at slide 67 of exhibit L, you'll see

9 we get the designated command position. Have you got that?

10 Slide 67, exhibit L. Now your role, you were the commander

11 of the JOC and your role was overall commander of the

12 operation. General Annandale was your chief of staff and

13 his role was to coordinate the running of the operation by

14 managing the JOC with the designated role players

15 representing each field, and he explained also - and you've

16 said that it's so too - that he was to chair the meetings

17 of the JOCCOM. But inasmuch as you are described as the

18 person in overall command, and his role was simply to

coordinate the running of the operation by managing the JOC

20 and carrying the JOC, I would have not expected him to have

21 been instructed to implement stage 3. Surely the person to

22 implement stage 3 would have been the person in overall

command, namely yourself, or possibly the operational

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

24 commander, Brigadier Calitz, who was going to coordinate

25 the operation on the ground. But somehow we find Major-

Page 13185

that were given to Brigadier Seboloke, Brigadier Van Zyl,

and as a result that Major-General Annandale was coming

3 from head office, then some of the issues in terms of how

4 they should be done and which police stations, they were

5 done by me. But they did not appear in the minutes. My

6 understanding was that for the fact that they did not

7 appear in the minutes, they seem not to be the decisions

8 because I do understand that in the minutes in most of the

9 times the decisions are what's being recorded, but not

10 everything that was said in the meeting. But as I'm

11 saying, Major-General Annandale came from head office;

12 surely he could not have known anything that could have

13 been happening in the province. So I was there to, also to 14 play that role.

15 MS PILLAY: Chair, I have no further

16 questions. 17 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. [Microphone

18 off, inaudible] who wishes to cross-examine the witness? 19 No. Mr Ngalwana, you did indicate to me, I think -

MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just -

21 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, I beg your pardon.

22 MS PILLAY: If I may just ask for a 30-

23 second indulgence; one of my colleagues just wants to draw

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

24 something to my attention. General, there's just one

further proposition that I need to put to you, and the

20

Page 13186

proposition is the following, and I preface the proposition

- with the following, that we as yet do not have a statement 2
- 3 from the witness, who is Brigadier Seboloke, but if he
- 4 testifies the following, and I'd just like to hear your
- 5 comment if the Brigadier does come to this Commission and
- testifies -6

10

11

12 13

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

1

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

7 MR NGALWANA: If the question is going to 8 start like that I'm already objecting, Chair. She must 9 rephrase it.

MS PILLAY: All we want to do, Chair, is give the witness the benefit of commenting on this evidence, which we believe will be placed before the Commission in due course.

14 CHAIRPERSON: From the Brigadier? 15 MS PILLAY: From the Brigadier, that's 16 correct.

CHAIRPERSON: Well Mr Ngalwana, you know, I understand where you are coming from, that there should have been a statement filed and he should have had notice of it so he could deal with it. I understand that. On the other hand, if we are going to say the question can't be put because there wasn't a statement, and they then get the statement and it's immaterial, I don't know what the answer

24 is going to be - the question is going to be, then we'll

25 have to get, and if it's important to get the witness's

Page 13187

response to it then we have to get him back. So isn't it

- 2 practical and convenient for the question to be put and he
- 3 can say well I, he can either say I can't answer it or I
- 4 don't know, or answer it, or not, as the case may be?
- 5 Maybe he'll give an answer that's so decisive on the matter
- 6 that the point will be dead from now on. Isn't it
- 7 practical to do it that way? Or would you want to be
- 8 impractical? You must tell me.

MR NGALWANA: Chair, my objection is not about the absence of a statement. It's the uncertainty about whether or not he is going to come and testify. If so and so is going to come and testify, I mean -

I get the impression, and I CHAIRPERSON: may be wrong, that the evidence leaders have interviewed him and he's told them something and they are fairly

confident that he's going to come and say that -16

17 MR NGALWANA: Then why don't they put the 18 question when he's done so, Chair?

19 CHAIRPERSON: Then we have to get the

witness back. That's the point. 20

21 MR CHASKALSON SC: Mr Chairperson, I wonder if I could add something to this debate? We sit with a real difficulty as evidence leaders in this respect.

24 In order to cooperate with SAPS we have hitherto

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

interviewed their witnesses in their presence and haven't

Page 13188

- insisted that the witnesses sign statements immediately.
- We have sent notes back to SAPS with draft statements. In
- some cases those draft statements have waited for months on
- end and still haven't come back. If the ruling is going to
- be that we cannot put what SAPS witnesses say to us in
- 6 consultations unless we have a statement, then we'll have
- 7 to reconsider our relationship with SAPS in this regard and
- 8 insist that witnesses who consult with us sign statements
- 9 immediately.

10 MR NGALWANA: Well, Chair, with respect, 11 maybe they should because we've had witness statements

12 prepared by the evidence leaders which the witness

13 themselves are not prepared to sign. So I mean, this

14 suggestion that we should agree to an arrangement where the

evidence leaders interview or consult with witnesses whom

they are going to cross-examine and then present a witness

17 statement to that witness to sign, is ridiculous, with

respect.

[15:29] But that doesn't deal with the issue that we are

concerned with here. Here there is no clarity about

21 whether or not the evidence, or the version, the witness

22 whose version is sought to be put here is going to come and

23 testify. Now -

24 CHAIRPERSON: Well, I'm reluctant to deal

with the matter now by way of a ruling one way or the other

because it seems to me that it may well have important

implications for our way forward. What is suggested by Mr

Chaskalson is that if necessary the evidence leaders when

4 they interview members of the police, in the present of

legal representatives of the police - that's the important

6 point - may well then insist that the statement be signed.

7 Obviously if the witness isn't happy to sign the statement

8 that's proffered to him, he can change it, but that will

9 alter the whole way of working. I prefer to leave it open

10 for the moment for discussions perhaps with the legal

11 representatives of the police, Mr Semenya and Mr Budlender

12 and others, and then so at the moment if we have to have

13 this witness coming back if the Brigadier gives the

14 evidence that the evidence leaders thinks he'll give on

15 this particular issue, then so be it. We'll have wasted a

16 bit of time, but there's nothing we can do about it. So

17 the matter can stand over and if need be, the witness can

18 be recalled on this point. That's the end of your

19 questioning, Ms Pillay?

> That is it. MS PILLAY:

21 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ngalwana, I understand

that you need time to prepare for re-examination. So I

23 suggest we take the adjournment now and start again at 9

24 tomorrow.

20

25 MR NGALWANA: Not so much to prepare for

29th	August 2013	Marikana Comm	ission of Inquiry	Pretoria
1	it Chair just to streamline my question	Page 13190		
1 2	it, Chair, just to streamline my questio CHAIRPERSON: You see,	I meant that.		
3	Obviously you've got a lot of material			
4	You'd like to coordinate it and put som	-		
5	wastepaper basket and others at the t			
6	that can be quite a lengthy process. I			
7	the resultant re-examination. That's w			
8	MR NGALWANA: Yes, tha	nk you, Chair,		
9	that's it.			
10	CHAIRPERSON: 9 tomorr	ow be good enough?		
11		erfect, Chair.		
12	Just one housekeeping matter which h			
13	attention; it appears the statement of			
14	don't recall it having been entered as a	an exhibit. Perhaps		
15	I'm wrong.			
16	MS PILLAY: Chair, I think			
17 18	CHAIRPERSON: My recol [microphone off, inaudible]. I think it	lection, you may be		
19	exhibit HHH52, but I didn't mark it and			
20	that omission and I've now done [micr			
21	inaudible].	σρσ		
22		ir, thank you.		
23		e will adjourn now		
24	until 9 o'clock tomorrow morning.			
25	[COMMISSION ADJOURNED]			
1				
(Registration of the control of the c			
- 35	A Labor Etty Change			

A
aan 13109:12,14
aanduiding 13109:11
Abey 13143:15,16
abide 13080:7 13134:7 able 13085:17 13087:3
13087:11 13110:24
13111:4,5 13115:7,7
13129:10 13131:5
ably 13152:10
absence 13078:7
13091:5 13108:21 13183:2 13184:18,20
13187:10
Absent 13091:21
absolutely 13093:15 13164:25
accent 13109:8
accept 13103:21
13104:9
acceptable 13127:21 accepted 13130:1
13151:8
accepting 13116:7
accord 13145:4
account 13104:16
accurate 13172:20 accurately 13173:9
accused 13100:16
13106:15 13108:8
13114:5,9
accused's 13106:11 accusers 13107:22
achieve 13119:24
13124:23 13131:10
13135:12
achieved 13118:5 13123:15,16
achievement 13116:7
acquitted 13107:25
act 13114:1,19 13151:6
13151:9,9,9,14 13161:2
acted 13126:15
13127:17,24
acting 13139:23
action 13138:24 13181:22,22
actions 13101:5
13138:25
activities 13160:20
actual 13094:13
ad 13084:10 13153:5 add 13123:14 13131:11
13141:10 13179:17
13181:14 13187:22
addition 13127:4
13130:12 13131:11
additional 13161:19 addressed 13161:14
adequacy 13095:10,12
adequacy 13095:10,12 13095:21 13096:16
13096:17
adequate 13084:20 13091:20
13071.20

adequately 13095:6
adjourn 13087:5
13113:10 13134:14 13190:23
ADJOURNED
13190:25
adjournment 13078:20 13086:15 13113:7,9
13113:15 13114:4
13134:11,17 13146:8
13146:15 13159:11 13159:20 13189:23
13159:20 13189:23 ADJOURNS 13087:7
13113:18 13134:23
13146:17 13159:13
admitted 13103:20
13177:17 adopted 13181:4,5
Adv 13082:15
13141:13,18,19
13142:9,14,14,18 13143:7
advanced 13144:1
13181:7 13184:17
advancing 13126:17
13127:12 advantage 13090:12
13145:8
adverse 13130:2
advise 13130:14
adviser 13114:19 advocate 13098:9
13103:5 13104:1
advocates 13099:3
13103:3,24 affect 13104:17
13150:2
affidavit 13079:16
13082:4 13092:18,22 13093:14,17
13100:23 13112:11
13120:24 13121:1,8,8
13123:22,25
13125:12,13,13 afforded 13111:16
afgelê 13109:10
Africa 13084:15
African 13088:7,10
13140:15 13154:15 13183:3
ago 13172:24
agree 13090:20
13152:14 13179:11 13182:18 13188:14
agreed 13078:18
13151:3 13183:5
agreement 13155:21
ahead 13082:15 13154:7
aid 13084·14 15 17 21
13084:24 13095:4,11 13095:15,16,18
13095:15,16,18 13096:3,12 13103:4
13106.13 13124.9
aim 13096:15
oir 12112.14

```
alarm 13173:14
alerting 13152:7
alive 13148:10
allegation 13164:9,11
  13170:7,19
allegations 13129:24
  13130:12,15,17,19,24
  13153:24 13164:10
  13165:1,19 13167:2
  13168:12
allege 13166:13
alleged 13099:24
  13101:12 13151:15
  13175:24
allegedly 13119:16
  13129:22,23
  13177:16
allow 13106:13
  13123:1 13135:22
  13140:1 13154:5
allowed 13114:5
  13139:24,25 13140:7
allowing 13138:10
alright 13094:6
  13146:14 13164:21
  13178:22
alter 13189:9
alternative 13085:1
  13124:6
alternatively 13082:22
  13148:23
alternatives 13140:20
  13141:7
altogether 13177:10
AMCU 13086:8
  13097:12 13098:5
  13132:6,6,8
amended 13081:15
  13082:20
amending 13149:22
American 13088:9
ammunition 13172:16
  13173:21
amount 13081:9
  13084:25 13088:5
  13102:17 13106:5
  13146:24
amounted 13146:6
  13151:19
amounts 13112:15
analysis 13137:14
  13180:4
anders 13109:12
and/or 13084:16
  13101:12 13126:19
anew 13112:4
animal 13116:8,13
Annandale 13151:17
  13180:1,8 13182:17
  13182:23 13183:12
  13184:1,9 13185:2,11
answer 13135:9
  13136:15,25 13137:9
  13141:20 13143:19
```

```
13168:11 13176:6.15
  13177:1.2 13178:10
  13178:23 13179:10
  13179:14,15
  13186:23 13187:3,4,5
answering 13135:6
anybody 13080:20
  13082:25 13083:2
  13134:9 13140:1
anymore 13133:24
anyway 13104:13
  13184:11
apart 13128:2
apologies 13083:16
  13124:5
apologise 13172:17
apparently 13167:16
  13170:22
appeal 13110:10
  13111:1 13120:14
  13122:25 13133:7
appear 13127:11
  13151:23 13185:5,7
appears 13163:3
  13176:20 13177:17
  13190:13
appellant 13111:24
  13112:1
appellante 13109:9
appellants 13110:2
applicant 13097:12
  13103:13 13104:24
  13106:4 13114:25
  13115:2 13124:4
  13127:9 13128:1,12
  13128:19
applicants 13084:16,21
  13085:12,15 13086:7
  13086:12 13092:3
  13095:25 13096:13
  13096:13 13097:2,5
  13098:7 13099:16
  13101:1,4 13102:3
  13103:1,5,17,25
  13105:16,23
  13122:10,16 13124:4
  13124:13.15.25
  13125:3,4 13128:12
  13128:14 13129:5,8,9
  13130:11,22 13131:1
  13131:14 13132:11
applicant's 13128:7
application 13079:10
  13079:25 13080:3,6,7
  13080:13,18,19
  13081:2,7,25
  13083:23,25 13084:8
  13084:8,9,11 13086:4
  13086:22 13090:17
  13090:21 13092:2,20
  13093:9 13095:15,25
  13096:15 13100:14
  13105:11,17,19
  13106:12 13111:21
  13120:16 13122:1
  13123:23 13124:2,3
                        arrests 13100:7
```

13132:7,13,20 13133:1,2,4,6 13134:4.6 applications 13100:12 13105:20 **applied** 13137:19 **applies** 13150:4 13175:5 apply 13097:3 13106:13 13176:9,13 **appointed** 13154:14 appointment 13152:22 13154:10 appreciate 13083:1 13121:7 13134:22 appreciated 13087:15 apprehended 13174:21 13174:23 **apprised** 13134:3 **approach** 13116:1 13149:23 13181:4,6 approached 13088:21 13088:21 13119:10 approaches 13137:22 appropriate 13081:5 13113:9 13134:18 13146:8 13152:3,4,15 approval 13114:24 approximating 13176:25 appèl 13109:18 **April** 13085:16 apropos 13162:1 area 13153:5 13172:14 13173:17,22 areas 13156:10 argue 13081:25 13082:4 13086:11 argued 13148:5 13151:12 arguing 13092:6 13120:21 argument 13121:4,5 armed 13163:5 arms 13096:16 13163:10 **arrange** 13082:12 arranged 13158:19,20 arrangement 13145:5 13155:22 13157:5 13158:25 13188:14 arrangements 13086:10 13124:6 13156:4 13157:1 arrest 13100:7 **arrested** 13086:7 13094:12,16,17 13096:22 13097:20 13097:21 13100:9 13101:23,24,25,25 13103:2 13108:8 13123:20 13148:18 13148:24 13149:4,11 13153:14 13159:2

air 13112:14

13143:22,22 13146:7

13160:5 13167:4

13174:24

13166:20
arrival 13078:19
13182:24
arrive 13078:7
13156:17
arrived 13078:5
13087:9
arrives 13145:1
articulated 13147:18
aside 13115:2 13128:4
asked 13078:3
13083:16,19
13109:19 13125:5
13136:6,9,10
13137:12 13140:11
13140:12,13 13145:7
13160:19 13162:10
13168:1
asking 13097:25
13098:4 13111:18
13136:20 13139:21
13164:12 13173:1
13176:21
aspect 13117:13,16,21
13132:25 13175:19
13177:22
assault 13101:13
assaulted 13168:10
assert 13105:23
asset 13155:20,23
assist 13088:23,24
13095:23 13107:22
13157:14 13158:9,11
assistance 13102:18
assisted 13098:9
13136:2 13145:4
assisting 13088:12
associated 13119:17
assume 13097:8
13133:13 13183:2
assumed 13086:6
13137:2
assumption 13102:9
13137:13
assure 13107:19
13121:24
assured 13079:6
attack 13127:3 13129:7
attacked 13164:4
13168:9,23
attainment 13083:24
13086:25 13087:17
13087:22 13093:8
13133:3
attempt 13114:12
attempt 13114.12
13127:3
attempting 13126:22
attend 13153:18
13159:12,22
attended 13153:16
13160:3
attention 13086:21
13161:17 13166:4 13167:5,21 13179:22
13167.5 21 13179.22
13101.3,21 13117.22
13179:25 13185:24
13179:25 13185:24

13190:13 attitude 13080:22 attorney 13083:18 attorneys 13078:21 13098:9 13100:11 attributed 13110:5 13148:3 August 13078:1 13080:4 13101:5,10 13101:16 13104:9 13124:17 13128:17 13153:16 13165:19 13166:14 13167:1 13171:11 13172:1 13175:1,2 13182:1 available 13079:7 13082:17 13132:15 13132:20 13159:1 13161:18 averment 13079:17 averments 13079:5 13102:6 avoided 13138:19 await 13078:15 **awaiting** 13090:11 13104:23 aware 13116:20 13161:21 13162:23 13165:18 13168:2,7 13168:15 13169:12 13178:17,23 Ayesha 13119:3 В **B** 13084:10 13114:3 13089:24 13090:6,10

back 13088:1 13089:24 13091:24 13117:18 13118:22 13122:2 13123:4,8 13133:14 13147:13 13149:4,5 13167:8,15 13172:5 13187:1,20 13188:2,4 13189:13 background 13137:25 backs 13121:15 bail 13100:10.12.15 **bakkie** 13170:6 **balancing** 13121:23 bane 13115:23 Bar 13104:22 13105:8 **barbed** 13161:19 13162:2,11 based 13087:24 13101:3 13103:10,15

13105:21 13106:4 brave 13140:11,24 13132:7 13153:2,7 breadwinners 13126:2 bases 13105:10 break 13115:14 basis 13080:10 13081:1 13147:4 **breakdown** 13103:17 13082:2,7 13092:19 13103:24 13097:5 13111:2 breath 13089:1 13121:10 13134:3 13136:7 13155:18 bridge 13078:17 13150:1 13172:8 13164:11 **briefed** 13154:21 basket 13190:5

Bayer 13114:14

bear 13085:4 13116:21 13146:14 13152:18 **bearing** 13177:22 **BEE** 13121:17 beg 13134:5 13185:21 began 13137:5 **beginning** 13107:16 13125:10 13137:6 behalf 13080:25 13114:18 13123:19 13127:8 13129:16,23 13130:24 13134:5 13144:1,2 **behartig** 13109:16 belabour 13117:11 **belief** 13107:11 believe 13087:18,21 13127:1 13142:5 13165:6 13186:12 **believed** 13130:7 belongs 13171:8 benadeel 13109:17 **benefit** 13145:24 13186:11 best 13107:6 13114:20 13114:23 13132:1 13135:8 13144:25 13181:22 **better** 13097:7 13135:23 13140:22 13156:9 13181:21 **bevind** 13109:14 beyond 13092:11 13117:2 **bind** 13151:2 **Bishop** 13145:1 bit 13092:15 13147:12 13167:8 13168:1 13171:12 13189:16 black 13107:2,3 13119:4 blatant 13108:24 Bloemfontein 13083:18 **blow** 13091:15 blush 13122:14 **Board** 13084:14 13095:15 13096:12 13124:9 bonus 13118:10 books 13120:6 **Botes** 13153:6,6,16 13156:7,12,16,22

13156:20.21.23 **briefings** 13153:19 13160:2 briefly 13106:7 13149:18 13180:15 Brigadier 13159:8 13162:12 13179:20 13183:24 13185:1,1 13186:3,5,14,15 13189:13 bring 13086:21 13117:18,23 13126:5 13133:19 13140:13 13140:14 13145:23 13179:21 **bringing** 13145:4 **broader** 13177:12 **brothers** 13126:1 13131:4 **brought** 13124:3 13126:12 13132:2 13147:11 13161:4,12 13167:4,5 13190:12 **brutal** 13126:21 13130:5 **bucket** 13088:4 **buckets** 13088:3 **Budlender** 13080:11 13082:10 13083:10 13090:16 13132:23 13132:24 13133:17 13133:19 13148:12 13148:14 13189:11 **building** 13134:16 **Bulelani** 13166:3 13175:21 **bullet** 13108:19 13164:16,18 **bullets** 13129:2 13175:4 Burger 13152:9 buses 13087:14 busy 13078:8 13088:14 13101:19 13120:21 13138:1 13173:15 butterflies 13105:9 \mathbf{C} C 13109:7 13111:23 13114:15 calamities 13098:25

Calitz 13162:12 13183:24 call 13088:4 13091:25 13098:11 13102:1,7 13105:8 13114:12 13115:23 13122:11 13175:22 13176:12 13176:17 called 13078:15 13084:15 13087:19 13096:3 13110:3 13119:2 13140:24 13149:3 13151:16 13158:11 13180:4

calling 13114:21

calls 13088:18 13104:22 can't 13177:15 13186:21 13187:3 Cape 13110:14 13114:15 **capital** 13114:3 **Captain** 13143:1 13182:11 carried 13138:6 carry 13082:24 13086:19 13110:24 13121:3 13134:12 13149:1 13152:19 13174:14 **carrying** 13138:3 13183:20 CAS 13179:17 case 13085:23 13090:10 13091:19 13106:8 13107:1 13108:5 13109:3,4 13111:8,12,13,14 13114:14,15,16 13115:3 13125:15 13126:17 13127:1 13128:8 13138:8 13141:4 13148:20,25 13155:3 13156:2,9 13157:13 13164:1 13170:15,16 13187:4 cases 13081:23 13106:2 13109:4 13114:6,11 13119:1 13126:2 13156:1 13168:12 13188:3 cast 13180:4 CAS118 13171:9 CAS69/08/2012 13170:22 category 13094:10 cause 13078:19 13108:13 13115:18 13116:3 13129:4 13150:7 caused 13099:1 causes 13101:14 CC 13153:3 13155:19 cell 13115:9,11,11 13181:17 cent 13088:7 central 13127:20 certain 13130:8 13139:5 13153:9 certainly 13080:13 13096:19 13178:19 **chairing** 13182:25 13184:10 **Chairman** 13136:16 **chambers** 13078:15 13146:23 **chance** 13122:6 **change** 13083:17 13145:23 13189:8 **changed** 13128:24

briefing 13153:17

13159:22

Botha 13174:6

bound 13080:5

13140:4 13174:16

	_			Page
changes 13165:15	13094:25 13148:15	13150:14,17,21	13121:9 13131:14	13144:12 13156:23
13168:4	13185:23	13154:21 13162:1	concur 13162:17	continued 13140:23
changing 13141:9	collected 13088:5	13171:18,20 13176:2	conditions 13100:15	continues 13091:5
character 13122:16,17	collection 13088:2,11	13180:24,24 13184:2	conducive 13137:19	13122:19 13123:1
charge 13128:20	collision 13099:1	13184:6	13140:5 13141:24	continuing 13122:7,17
13180:17,22	collusion 13151:16	commissioners	conduct 13084:12	continuous 13155:17
charged 13107:5,14,21	13152:15 13160:12	13078:14 13091:4	13110:8 13130:16,20	contracted 13157:3
charging 13126:18	13175:24 13176:24	13100:14 13118:9	13151:2	contradicts 13127:15
Chaskalson 13187:21	13177:8,19 13178:1	13159:12	conducted 13118:8	contrary 13127:25
13189:3	collusive 13151:19	Commission's	13129:4	13129:12
check 13141:17	Colonel 13140:25	13085:12,18	confidence 13121:18	contribute 13090:4,5,6
13144:14 13161:9	13141:1,1,4,5,17	13126:10 13128:2	confident 13187:16	contributed 13118:15
13176:20 checked 13166:19	13142:13 13143:1,6,7	13131:2,16 commit 13138:13	confirm 13141:5	contribution 13145:6 control 13161:5
chief 13148:12	13144:11,14,22,25 13182:1	commitment 13173:5	13143:7 13145:16 13171:9	13165:8
13183:12	combination 13089:3	committed 13091:12	confirmed 13156:14	convenience 13093:20
choice 13116:4	13099:2	13130:5	confirms 13161:25	convenient 13187:2
choose 13183:1	come 13078:22	committing 13138:15	conflict 13136:8,19	conventional 13088:16
chopper 13153:9,21	13086:15 13088:1	common 13108:12	13137:20 13138:6,22	13090:20
13160:6	13089:2,24,24	13129:3	13140:22 13144:4	convey 13083:16,19
circulate 13083:13	13091:24 13110:13	communicated	13157:24	13143:2 13160:20,22
circumscribes	13119:14 13122:12	13089:23	confusing 13157:21	conveyed 13141:3,15
13105:10	13122:18 13123:4	communication	conjunction 13100:18	13147:16 13160:24
circumstances	13127:25 13133:14	13160:23	conscious 13173:4	conviction 13106:14
13106:10 13108:15	13134:16 13141:13	compact 13100:6	consequences 13131:16	13114:10 13115:1
13110:9 13114:22	13141:17 13149:5	Comparatively	consider 13079:20	cooperate 13187:24
13137:24 13141:8	13156:22 13176:13	13140:8	13112:1 13120:16	coordinate 13183:13
13168:24 13173:7	13178:20 13186:5	compare 13135:20	13139:14 13147:12	13183:19,24 13190:4
cited 13086:5	13187:11,12,16	compile 13165:6	13152:4	copies 13082:11,12,16
citizen 13139:7	13188:4,22	compiled 13165:7	considerate 13141:11	13082:16,18,23,24
citizens 13088:22	comes 13088:20	compiler 13165:6	considered 13112:4	13083:1,3,11
Citizens4Marikana	13096:18 13098:10	complainants 13170:21	13147:19	13136:10
13088:18	13133:5 13144:18	complaining 13168:22	considering 13106:23	copy 13079:11
civil 13126:8 13131:24	13147:13	13168:23	considers 13152:3	13082:16,22 13083:2
claims 13126:8	coming 13090:6,10	complaints 13168:8	Constitution 13161:2	13083:2,9 13162:3
13131:24	13139:1 13160:23	complete 13094:21	Constitutional 13085:6	13171:16,17,19
clarified 13145:14	13165:5 13170:1,23	13135:9 13169:6	13085:7,19 13086:6	correct 13095:4
clarify 13096:11	13173:20 13174:7	13175:10	13091:16,17	13096:23 13097:1,6
clarity 13097:23,24	13182:5,7 13185:2	completely 13169:6	13096:14 13102:23	13098:22 13100:5
13132:25 13133:5	13186:18 13189:13	completeness 13179:8	13104:6 13132:19	13105:7 13133:21
13175:17,20	command 13130:4	completion 13097:10	constitutions 13107:17	13135:1,11 13145:11
13188:20 classified 13156:24	13156:7 13183:9,18 13183:23	complexion 13090:18 comply 13139:5	construction 13158:22 construed 13122:1	13146:20 13149:15 13150:10 13151:11
13182:12	commander 13099:6	composed 13092:19	consult 13188:8,15	13159:16,21
clear 13102:16	13128:20 13146:2	compromise 13138:11	consultation 13147:23	13162:25 13163:18
13111:22 13130:4	13153:20 13160:9	compromised 13091:17	consultations 13188:6	13162:23 13163:18
131313:19 13148:1	13165:9 13166:23	13091:23	consulted 13109:3	13167:10,18,23
13167:15	13179:13 13181:15	concede 13104:19	13147:9,15	13169:1,10,20
clearly 13108:21	13181:16,19,20,21	conceded 13147:3	contained 13094:4	13170:3 13171:5
13110:9 13126:10	13182:25 13183:1,10	concentrator 13172:12	13102:24 13148:2	13173:9,19 13175:12
13132:22 13133:12	13183:11,24	13172:13,14	CONTD 13135:4	13178:9 13186:16
13137:5 13144:15	commemoration	13173:16,17,22,24	13160:10	correction 13104:9
client 13114:21	13088:3	13174:1,1	contemplate 13108:3	13170:5
clients 13078:4,15	commence 13079:13	concern 13097:4	contended 13150:3	corrections 13169:18
13086:12 13087:9,25	commenced 13085:9	13147:3,4,6 13175:19	contention 13144:1	correctly 13090:14
13115:6	commencing 13078:3	concerned 13079:2	contents 13168:2	13137:5 13178:8
client's 13114:20	comment 13136:9	13080:12,22	contested 13102:23	13181:13
close 13145:25 13146:4	13137:13 13148:13	13089:25 13104:11	context 13085:5	cost 13103:4 13117:2
closure 13097:18	13149:16 13152:16	13123:24 13144:22	13106:20 13136:8,24	costs 13084:24 13090:1
13119:7 13126:5	13154:1 13184:4	13145:20 13176:13	13144:5	13103:22
coin 13088:7 13153:8	13186:5	13179:4 13188:20	contingent 13085:18	couldn't 13144:12
13156:25 13157:2,2	Commentary 13113:24	conclude 13134:10	continuation 13108:14	13179:5,9
coins 13088:6	commenting 13186:11	concluded 13135:6,9	continue 13108:20	counsel 13107:14
colleague 13083:16	Commissioner 13089:6	concluding 13113:13	13122:10,21,24	13146:23 13148:21
13097:11	13089:10,12,17	13121:9	13124:10,12,25	13148:24 13177:3
a all a a a ser - 12000 16	12000 0 121 11 12			
colleagues 13090:16	13090:8 13144:16	conclusion 13100:16	13129:19 13140:21	count 13123:11,12

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

13137:5
counted 13088:8
13137:11
counter 13131:2,7
counterweighing
13113:1
counting 13137:7,9
countries 13107:15
country 13139:6
13142:3
couple 13090:7
13116:2 13123:11,11
course 13094:24
13103:21 13110:25
13112:17 13115:22
13120:16 13134:15
13147:10 13149:8,19
13186:13
court 13081:18
13085:6,7,19 13086:6
13085:10,22
13080:10,22
13087:18 13089:7,14
13091:17 13096:2,13
13096:14,15
13102:23 13104:6
13102:23 13104:6 13114:23,23 13133:4
13114.23,23 13133.4
courts 13107:9,12
courts 13107:9,12 cousins 13126:1
13131:5
cover 13083:5,11
13085:10
covered 13090:7
13099:13,16,19,23,25
13106:7
covering 13090:1
13174:6,10
covers 13108:10
created 13149:12
13160:14
creates 13172:20
credibility 13090:19
13091:15
crime 13107:5,14,22
13138:15
crimes 13130:6
13138:13
criminal 13101:22
13106:20 13107:9,12
13108:7 13113:24
13130:15,20
criminally 13101:11
critical 13124:13
13128:13,16
cross 13078:18 13136:6
13149:25 13150:23
13179:25
crossing 13078:16
cross-examination
13135:4 13147:6
13150:13 13160:10
13179:24
cross-examine 13111:6
13147:15 13185:18
13188:16
ARCHIVE FO

Ма
cross-examined 13162:7
cross-examining 13135:3
cross-referenced 13151:22
cross-referencing
13081:22
crowd 13101:9 13138:21 13172:3,3,9 13172:9
crucial 13117:4,7 13118:2 13128:8
13138:9,17,20 13184:19
crude 13093:23 crudely 13092:18
cure 13108:24
current 13096:17 13103:10
currently 13099:9
13101:19 13128:21 13147:6,9
curtail 13086:24
D
Daar 13109:11 daily 13153:17,19 13160:2
damage 13101:15 13116:4
damages 13138:19 dan 13109:12
danger 13116:1
dangerous 13135:14,16 13135:19 13138:3,12 13138:12 13139:4,8
dared 13109:19 dat 13109:8,10,11,13
date 13084:4,25
13089:7,14 13126:25 13127:8 13128:21
dates 13089:4

13101:19 13128:21	
13147:6,9	d
curtail 13086:24	d
	d
D	
Daar 13109:11	
daily 13153:17,19	d
13160:2	d
damage 13101:15	Ι
13116:4	d
damages 13138:19	d
dan 13109:12	
danger 13116:1	
dangerous 13135:14,16	d
13135:19 13138:3,12	d
13138:12 13139:4,8	d
dared 13109:19	d
dat 13109:8,10,11,13	d
date 13084:4,25	d
13089:7,14 13126:25	d
13127:8 13128:21	d
dates 13089:4	d
day 13103:1,3	d
13118:12 13124:20	u
	d
13127:18 13128:23 13129:15 13135:13	u
13136:12 13137:14	ہ ا
	d
13137:25 13138:4	d
13139:8,19 13140:8,8	
13140:19,23,24	I
13141:22 13142:7	d
13155:14 13157:9,18	d
13163:4 13181:10	d
days 13084:15 13117:9	d
13172:24	d
De 13088:19	d
dead 13131:4 13187:6	d
deal 13086:19	
13091:14 13097:15 13104:14 13116:15	d
13116:17 13149:3,7	
13151:4 13152:2,13	
13154:5,8,9 13162:12	d
13179:24 13186:20	d
13188:19,24	d
RIUSTICE	l

dealing 13099:20 13113:25 13115:16 13142:16 13144:19 13147:4 13152:9 13159:19 13175:25 13177:9 deals 13101:22 dealt 13109:3,5 13113:25 13137:4,21 13149:8 13150:24 death 13181:25 deaths 13101:11,15 13126:12 13131:23 debate 13095:20 13117:14,15 13175:18 13187:22 **deceased** 13086:8 13096:10 13097:17 13124:9 13125:8 13129:25 13130:20 deceased's 13094:25 13095:3 13097:14 decide 13096:3 decided 13174:18 decision 13080:8 13091:8,9,14 13107:2 13120:15 13133:8 decisions 13185:7,9 **decisive** 13187:5 **Declaring** 13084:12 deemed 13107:14 defence 13098:20,20,23 13110:7,8 13111:4 13114:23 13126:20 defences 13107:7 defend 13107:10 defendant 13107:20 **defendants** 13107:5,8 **definitely** 13176:11 degradation 13131:3 deliberately 13180:10 demanded 13111:17,19 demonstrate 13141:7 demonstrated 13180:12 deny 13115:17 13180:21 denving 13126:15 department 13079:10 13079:20 13155:2 Departments 13132:18 departure 13134:15 depend 13080:15 depending 13141:8 depends 13165:5 deploy 13155:14 deployment 13153:5 deprived 13114:25 13131:21 13132:1 described 13094:9 13096:21 13101:22 13150:25 13151:5 13180:1 13183:17 describes 13139:11 designated 13183:9,14 designed 13107:18

desperate 13137:1 13139:12 detail 13095:18 **Detective** 13179:21 deter 13129:3 13173:22 13174:7 determination 13091:4 **determine** 13100:21 13101:19 determined 13113:1 13137:22 devastating 13131:17 13131:17 **Development** 13132:19 devise 13088:15 de-escalate 13136:2 diametrically 13127:22 didn't 13122:17 13142:18 13145:8,13 13159:25 13167:15 13167:17 13169:13 13175:9 13177:23 13179:5,5,8,21 13182:4 13190:19 die 13109:9,9,18 died 13117:19 **difference** 13170:18 **different** 13118:18,19 13139:15 13141:8 13155:16,17 13165:5 differently 13137:3 13139:14 **difficult** 13089:17 13132:9 13146:11 13182:6 difficulties 13122:5 **difficulty** 13121:22 13149:18,19,20 13187:23 **dignified** 13134:14 dignity 13126:7 13131:19 **dimension** 13143:25 direct 13101:14 13124:16 **directed** 13174:2 **direction** 13127:12 13128:24,25 13129:3 13174:16,17 **Director** 13114:14 disappeared 13173:24 13174:3 disarm 13140:6 disclosed 13177:22 13178:2 **discretion** 13120:17 discussed 13147:7 **discussion** 13108:13 13120:11 13177:24 13179:6 discussions 13189:10 **dismissal** 13106:12 **dispersed** 13172:4,9 **disposal** 13144:3 **dispute** 13098:14,16 13127:20 13129:5

13130:10.24 **disputes** 13098:15 **disputing** 13129:13 disruption 13078:20 **disruptive** 13086:18 **distinction** 13097:14 distinctly 13152:9 **distribute** 13082:13 **disturbing** 13086:16 divorces 13142:17 **Dlomo** 13166:3,12 13175:21 **Dlomo's** 13166:9 docket 13164:4 13165:18 13169:21 13169:23,25 13170:1 13170:2,22,24 13179:20 dockets 13168:12 13169:19 13171:10 **document** 13084:10 13119:1 13166:18 13170:25 13172:22 13172:25 13173:2,6 **documents** 13081:12 13151:2 13153:9 doesn't 13082:25 13093:22 13104:17 13104:19 13106:21 13108:2 13117:17 13134:11 13168:21 13172:19 13176:16 13177:19 13178:1 13181:23 13184:2 13188:19 doing 13078:25 13083:10 13100:11 13111:17,19 13138:2 13156:20,21 13159:5 13182:13 dollar 13088:9 dominant 13092:1 13093:19 don't 13078:17 13082:11,21 13092:15 13095:8 13096:6 13098:15 13100:20 13113:5,7 13116:21 13117:10 13122:23 13125:19 13127:1 13134:16 13146:4 13162:9,17 13162:19 13163:11 13163:22 13171:13 13174:12 13178:4 13180:25 13182:4,11 13183:3 13186:23 13187:4,17 13190:14 **Dove** 13180:5 13181:2 13182:5,7 **Doves** 13180:4,9 13181:5 13182:12 13183:4 dozen 13102:6

13169:4 13175:6

draft 13168:7,13

13188:2.3 draw 13161:16 13179:25 13185:23 drawn 13098:15 13130:3 13166:3 13167:21 13177:25 13178:16 dreamt 13119:25 drive 13166:2 drop 13135:16 **Du** 13113:23 due 13115:4 13127:13 13127:15 13130:8 13149:8 13186:13 duty 13133:14 13151:6 13151:8 13161:3,6 13172:2

 \mathbf{E} E 13107:4 eager 13088:1 earlier 13089:4 13099:21 13124:8 13157:12 13165:4 early 13143:16 earth 13173:25 ease 13140:12 easily 13099:5 easy 13091:8 13119:14 economical 13155:11 **EEE** 13155:11 een 13109:9,10 **effect** 13079:4 13090:18 13105:13 13125:1 13126:6 13152:11 13157:22 13161:24 effective 13115:1 13128:7,9 effectively 13081:8 13090:23 13092:9 13098:20 13105:19 13129:10 13131:6,15 effectiveness 13155:11 13155:12 efficiency 13155:11,11 effort 13088:12.23 13089:19 13090:6 efforts 13099:21 eie 13109:15 eighth 13153:9 either 13079:24 13083:24 13094:9 13105:15 13123:6.7 13139:3 13147:20,24 13148:19 13152:2 13170:18 13187:3 Ek 13109:8 elect 13144:20 **electricity** 13158:15,21 electronically 13083:13 13132:17 element 13139:25

Elias 13166:2 emergency 13156:2 **emphasis** 13107:17 **emphasise** 13147:2 **emphasised** 13143:20 **emplov** 13102:19 **employed** 13084:23 13171:23,24 **employee** 13153:10 employees 13164:8 **employer** 13121:16 13154:18 13155:3 13161:3 **empowered** 13126:13 en 13109:10,17 enable 13091:7 13114:5,8 13134:14 13134:15 13155:4,20 enabled 13131:15 **enabling** 13131:9 **encircle** 13162:4 encountered 13172:2 **enforce** 13142:3 **enforcer** 13142:2 engagement 13083:18 **England** 13107:1 English 13109:22 **enquire** 13163:1 **enquiries** 13166:18 **enshrined** 13105:25 ensure 13091:20 13117:12,19 13121:25 13122:25 13142:4 13161:4 **ensuring** 13117:16 13132:1 **entails** 13114:19 entered 13190:14 **entering** 13173:22 entire 13112:2 entitled 13079:21 13086:11 13101:2 13111:15,25 13176:19 13177:1 entity 13085:13 entrusted 13110:7 13111:4 environment 13137:18 13137:21 13140:5 13141:24 13156:8,11 equal 13107:20 equality 13096:16 **equally** 13117:17 **equitable** 13084:21 Eric 13088:19 ernstig 13109:17 **escaping** 13174:19 **escorted** 13128:24 **essence** 13125:19 **essential** 13107:15 essentially 13125:3 13153:1 establish 13117:8 13141:18 13154:24 13155:7,9

13178:15 establishment 13153:1 **Estate** 13142:1 **estimate** 13102:21 13103:6,7,9 **estimated** 13094:11,13 **estimates** 13102:25 eternal 13087:19 event 13086:19,23 13087:17 13095:24 13123:7 13130:22 13149:21 events 13084:4 13119:6 13123:7 13128:3 13164:24 13166:25 13175:2 **eventually** 13161:19 **eventuate** 13119:21 **everybody** 13082:13,23 13121:23 everyone's 13081:22 **evidence** 13079:6 13080:3 13082:17 13083:2 13099:8 13103:9,14,18 13104:1,14,25 13105:6 13110:3 13114:22 13115:4 13118:25 13124:16 13126:24 13127:7,13 13128:11,14,22 13129:8,14,22 13130:1,2 13132:16 13136:5 13147:7,17 13147:21 13148:12 13148:17 13157:19 13157:22 13161:22 13161:24 13162:13 13176:24 13182:19 13186:12 13187:14 13187:23 13188:12 13188:15,21 13189:3 13189:14,14 evidential 13149:1 exact 13088:5 exactly 13079:15 13103:19 13157:6.7 13158:24 examination 13150:24 **examined** 13136:7 examining 13180:1 **example** 13128:16 13129:20 13130:3 13137:20 13139:21 13141:23 13145:23 13184:25,25 **examples** 13128:16 **excerpts** 13172:19 **excused** 13134:13 execute 13182:17 **exercised** 13120:18 **exhibit** 13143:23 13152:4,7,17

13168:13.16.17.21.21 13169:14 13170:23 13175:3 13176:22 13177:24 13179:6 13183:8,10 13190:14 13190:19 **exhibits** 13169:25 exists 13151:8 **expect** 13157:15 13173:7 **expected** 13139:8 13179:6,9 13183:20 **expenses** 13085:11 experience 13119:22 13136:19 13144:4,23 experienced 13144:3 13145:2 13158:16 13181:22 expert 13136:7 **explain** 13119:9 13120:12 **explained** 13095:18 13097:13 13098:5,12 13133:1 13139:20 13183:1,15 explaining 13181:1 explanation 13127:10 **explode** 13137:2 extended 13085:19,22 13103:25 **extension** 13103:16 extent 13086:10 13096:3 extra 13082:16 extract 13111:12 13150:15 extracted 13151:1 extracts 13113:23 extreme 13138:22 **extremely** 13130:13 13135:17 13138:3 13140:22 13141:10 eye 13128:6 13173:12 F

face 13107:22 13120:9 13122:5 faced 13116:4 faceless 13154:23 facie 13149:15 facilitated 13146:6 13158:7 facilitating 13145:2,5 fact 13087:25 13089:18 13098:7,13,24 13099:4,8,12,15,19 13099:23 13100:14 13100:17 13101:3,6 13102:1 13108:20 13110:5 13118:6,11 13134:6 13135:13 13136:17 13151:15 13152:8 13153:2,6,11 13153:15 13169:21 13176:20 13177:16 13177:20 13178:1

13180:2.12 13181:7 13181:25 13182:15 13185:6 factor 13180:16 13181:6,24 13182:14 13184:16 factors 13160:11 13180:12,14 facts 13079:2 13080:16 13090:24 13092:10 13092:19 13093:23 13093:23 13094:1,2,3 13094:8 13098:2 factual 13079:4,17 13082:5 13102:6 13105:10 13151:18 **fail** 13107:6 13123:3 **failing** 13084:16 13123:3 failure 13110:4 13114:8 fair 13084:20 13091:22 13102:18 13106:11 13107:15,19 13115:3 13133:11 13146:4 13149:9 13169:1,5,6 fairly 13094:4 13147:18 13187:15 **fairness** 13106:20,21 13108:4,5 13109:1 13135:5 faith 13116:3 **falling** 13094:10 13182:7 falls 13096:4 **families** 13086:8 13094:25 13095:3 13096:4,10,11 13097:2,14 13123:19 13124:8,14,22 13125:2,21 13132:8 13144:2 family 13086:9 13131:9 13131:16 **Fanagalo** 13153:10 13157:14,16,20,25 far 13078:16 13079:1 13080:4,11 13089:25 13104:10 13105:6 13144:21 13145:20 13152:17 13178:19 13179:4 **fashion** 13130:7 **fatal** 13091:15 **fateful** 13117:9 fathers 13126:1 13131:4

established 13156:15

13161:12

elevation 13104:5

eleventh 13153:15

ARCHIVE

13164:14,15,17,23

13166:24 13168:2,8

13165:4,10,13

fault 13115:6

favour 13114:21

favourite 13088:8

fear 13148:5 13157:7

February 13095:19,22

feel 13121:21 13122:16

13154:8 13161:3

feeling 13127:18

13140:2

13102:13 13128:11

13132:8 13143:24

further 13078:6

fees 13090:2,3,6
13103:3
fell 13174:21
fellow 13101:11
felt 13139:19 13161:5 13179:12
field 13183:15
fifth 13153:4
figure 13085:24
figures 13102:8 13103:2,19
file 13125:13 13170:21
filed 13123:22
13170:21 13186:19
final 13168:20 13179:23 13184:16
finalise 13091:25
finalised 13168:3,4
finally 13131:25
final-final 13133:16
financial 13102:14 find 13100:17 13112:17
13121:20 13125:23
13135:21 13141:18
13183:25
finding 13111:24
13126:10 fine 13083:14
finish 13102:10
13115:24
finished 13120:5
13159:19
finishing 13116:6 fire 13170:6
fired 13170:15,17
13174:14 13177:16
13177:18
firms 13098:11 first 13084:2,13,19
13092:25 13093:11
13092:25 13093:11 13103:12 13104:24
13114:4 13118:12,12
13121:21 13122:14 13124:2 13127:8
13124:2 13127:8
13128:18 13129:5
13130:11 13133:5,13 13133:15 13153:24
13133:15 13153:24
13161:17 13166:2 13175:19 13176:6,16
131/3:19 131/6:0,16
firstly 13084:7
13087:24 13111:11
13111:13 13152:22
13171:8 fitting 13103:19
five 13078:20 13085:22
13087:4,5 13100:9,10
13100:12 13104:1
13140:11,24
13159:11 13172:11 13180:14
flavour 13088:11
flight 13083:17
follow 13142:13
13172:10 13175:18

```
followed 13142:15
following 13084:11,12
  13109:7 13111:12.20
  13140:8,19 13157:18
  13162:22 13186:1,2,4
follows 13133:7
  13148:16
footage 13127:5,11
  13129:15
footages 13126:25
force 13129:1
forced 13131:6
forget 13117:16
forgive 13120:20
  13184:15
form 13129:2 13148:19
  13148:20
formal 13080:14
forward 13081:1
  13153:5 13176:24
  13189:2
fought 13163:20
found 13088:9 13106:3
  13110:5 13119:13
foundation 13085:13
  13134:4
founding 13079:16
  13092:18,22
  13093:14,17
  13112:11 13120:24
  13121:1
four 13104:24,25
fourth 13084:13
  13153:3 13182:14
framework 13151:1
free 13147:24
friend 13170:8
  13171:14 13172:18
front 13102:24 13171:4
  13172:22
full 13128:7,9
fullness 13123:9
fully 13129:10 13131:5
  13131:15
function 13181:19
functionary 13091:19
functions 13181:20
fund 13096:17
fundamental 13106:11
  13107:15
funded 13096:12
Fundi 13119:3,4,7
  13120:11
funding 13083:24
  13084:1 13085:12,14
  13085:16,18,25
  13086:2 13089:9,13
  13093:8,9 13124:9
  13133:3
fundraising 13088:15
  13088:17 13089:19
  13099:21
funds 13086:25
  13087:17,22
furnished 13142:10
 13171:15
```

```
13144:13 13161:16
  13165:17 13167:8
  13168:1 13169:16
  13177:13 13178:20
  13184:17 13185:15
  13185:25
future 13084:22
  13104:11 13126:8
          G
G 13111:11
gainsay 13127:7
Gallagher 13142:1
gap 13120:7
gathering 13172:6
geen 13109:11
gemeld 13109:8
general 13099:5
  13105:16 13115:18
  13117:1 13134:15
  13135:5 13136:4,13
  13136:22,24
  13139:11,14
  13141:15 13143:24
  13147:16 13148:2,3
  13149:23 13150:13
  13150:23,24 13151:3
  13151:7,12,17,17,24
  13152:21 13153:23
  13153:24 13154:7
  13160:11 13161:15
  13162:21 13163:2,4
  13164:13,22 13165:9
  13165:18 13166:11
  13166:23 13169:15
  13171:3,8,9,22
  13172:7 13174:4,22
  13174:25 13179:23
  13180:1,7,14,18
  13181:3,6,24
  13182:14,16,16,18
  13183:12 13184:1,17
  13185:24
generis 13105:19
gentleman 13143:15
George 13153:10
geregtigheid 13109:17
geroep 13109:10
geskied 13109:18
gestures 13112:21
getting 13083:12
  13090:25 13155:16
getuienis 13109:10
getuies 13109:10
gevolglik 13109:18
GGG12 13163:14,15
  13181:8 13182:22
GGG15 13163:4
GGG4 13145:20
  13161:9
ghastly 13108:2
Gideon 13107:1,3,24
                        great 13107:17
give 13092:8,10,14,25
```

13095:2 13124:16 13126:6 13128:14 13129:22 13141:23 13146:10 13149:2 13152:4,6 13163:8,12 13163:13,22 13173:5 13179:13 13181:9 13184:25 13186:11 13187:5 13189:14 given 13079:8,11 13081:11 13082:12 13103:6,7 13106:7 13118:24 13127:7,10 13129:8 13132:16 13136:20 13142:13 13162:9 13171:17 13172:24 13179:13 13185:1 gives 13148:17 13162:13 13174:11 13189:13 **giving** 13093:13 13128:22 13134:21 13150:7 **globally** 13152:3 go 13120:6 13136:2 13137:4 13140:1,1,2 13143:6 13150:6 13151:20,23 13154:7 13154:19,19,24 13156:5 13158:11 13162:2 13173:11 **God** 13144:5 goes 13086:17 13108:2 13108:15,21 13115:11,19 13165:17 13167:7 13168:1 going 13078:21,25 13079:2 13080:1 13081:8,24,25 13090:23 13092:8,10 13092:11,25 13102:11 13103:16 13109:24 13110:15 13118:25 13119:1 13129:22 13140:9 13142:20 13159:10 13159:18 13162:6 13176:17 13183:24 13186:7,21,24,24 13187:11,12,16 13188:4,16,22 good 13144:23 13157:25 13158:6 13190:10 **government** 13089:2 13102:2 13107:7 13121:16 grant 13114:8 granted 13095:15,17 13096:4,5 **granting** 13091:13 13105:13 13115:17 gratification 13116:5

grenades 13129:2 gross 13106:5 ground 13091:11 13115:2 13148:8 13181:22 13183:25 grounds 13080:15,19 group 13168:5,13 13172:3,11 gruesomeness 13119:10 guard 13119:4 guards 13118:21 13176:4 **guidance** 13181:9,10 13181:18

Н hadn't 13098:4 half 13078:13 13104:7 13104:8 hand 13088:20 13100:20 13137:7 13139:7,16 13163:19 13165:25 13169:5 13175:9 13176:23 13177:24 13180:8 13186:21 handicapped 13171:13 handle 13139:20 handled 13137:3 13139:13 **handling** 13137:1 13139:12,15 hands 13082:19 13112:14 happen 13102:11 13117:17 13122:23 13147:13 13150:1 13181:18 happened 13090:12 13117:8 13118:1,12 13119:8 13122:9 13124:16,19 13125:23 13126:3 13128:3 13137:25 13138:20 13139:9 13140:17.20 13144:15 13156:2 13157:9 13158:3 13160:20 13164:3 13167:6,16 **happening** 13084:4 13090:9 13138:14 13141:25 13185:13 happens 13084:2 13089:20 13093:11

13117:13,20

harassment 13099:24

13170:7 13187:25

Hawk 13181:2 13182:5

happy 13189:7

hard 13166:2

13188:4

Hassan 13119:4

hasten 13190:19

haven't 13092:22

Hawks 13180:3,6,11
13181:3 13182:12
13181.3 13182.12
head 13147:11 13185:3
13185:11
heading 13179:21
healing 13126:5
13131:10
hear 13119:7 13184:3
13186:4
heard 13080:13,18
13081:1 13091:21
13119:14 13122:7
13137:5 13181:12
hearing 13084:1
13087:23 13089:3
13093:10 13134:21
held 13100:16
13101:10 13114:25
helicopter 13153:8
13156:25
help 13080:1 13155:3
13170:8
Hemraj 13082:15
13089:6,12 13090:8
13144:16 13150:14
13150:17,21 13162:1
13171:18,21 13176:2
het 13109:8.9.11.15.17
het 13109:8,9,11,15,17 hey 13169:5 13175:9
he'll 13187:5 13189:14
he's 13078:5 13134:16
13136:7,24 13142:17
13145:2,24 13187:15
13187:16,18
НННЗ 13139:20
13180:21 13181:12
13182:23
ННН49 13152:18
HHH50 13166:7
13169:8,25
HHH51 13166:10
13170:7
HHH52 13171:1,3
13190:16,19
hide 13133:15
hierdie 13109:12,16
high 13081:18
13087:18 13089:14
13096:2,13,14
13133:4,6,8 13174:2
highly 13130:4
13156:24
highway 13137:8
hijacked 13180:2
Hilani 13114:24
hindsight 13145:24
hire 13107:6,9,10
hires 13107:8
historians 13123:10
hitherto 13187:24
hold 13081:21
13143:18
holding 13088:25
13153:5
home 13120:6

hope 13113:15 13121:19 13126:4 hopefully 13078:21 13119:21 hopes 13126:11 hostile 13137:23 hour 13078:14 13146:13 hours 13127:18 13161:10 housekeeping 13079:19 13083:6,15 13190:12 hul 13109:13,14,15 hulle 13109:10,11,13 13109:13,14,16 **hulself** 13109:13 human 13083:8 13086:9 13100:23,25 13126:6 13131:19 husband 13119:17 husbands 13126:1 13131:4 husband's 13119:8 idea 13114:17 ideal 13107:21 13108:15 **identified** 13154:17 identifying 13152:25 idle 13110:23 iets 13109:12 **illustrious** 13121:20 **immaterial** 13186:23 **immediately** 13188:1,9 impact 13091:10 13115:21 **impacted** 13126:10 **impartial** 13107:19 13151:7,10,15 **impatient** 13137:10 **implement** 13108:23 13183:21,22 13184:2 implementing 13116:18 implications 13189:2 importance 13090:8 13120:12 13181:15 **important** 13094:12 13099:6,9 13111:18 13115:25 13116:25 13117:9,18 13135:17 13140:6 13145:6 13149:9,12 13160:18 13175:18 13186:25 13189:1.5 **importantly** 13114:12 **imposed** 13112:1 impractical 13187:8 **impression** 13187:13

improper 13153:25

inadequate 13096:4

inasmuch 13138:9

13173:2 13183:17

13177:13

13160:14 13177:12

inaudible 13093:25 13109:21 13110:1 13117:2 13162:18 13163:23 13178:13 13179:1 13185:18 13190:1,18,21 incident 13128:17,19 13129:14 13131:19 13164:2,3 13175:1 13177:21,23 13178:2 13178:24 13179:7 **incidents** 13162:24 13169:7 **include** 13083:8 13101:8 13133:7 13175:10 **included** 13105:2 13121:1 13176:21 13179:7 **includes** 13102:15 **including** 13084:24 13114:6 13119:8 13126:25 13129:14 13165:14 13168:6,13 incorporated 13125:12 incriminating 13130:18 **incumbent** 13176:11 incurred 13084:24 13085:11 **inderdaad** 13109:17 **indicate** 13089:25 13137:16 13140:13 13156:13 13160:11 13185:19 indicated 13080:2,3,7 13087:24 13114:16 13121:19 13132:18 13133:11 13139:4 13157:12,17 13158:3 13165:4 13168:17 13169:12 13178:18 indicates 13122:2 13174:20,23 **indication** 13079:24 13089:23 13107:11 13110:4 13137:10 13146:11 13181:7 13184:17 **indications** 13151:18 13151:18 13180:1 **indicia** 13177:13 **individuals** 13152:25 **indulgence** 13078:13 13087:13 13125:18 13185:23 industry 13136:19 **inference** 13178:3,15 inferences 13130:2 13177:25 **inferred** 13176:25 **inform** 13159:24 13181:17 informal 13128:25 **information** 13141:14 13155:4

informed 13078:5 13079:9 13163:5 13180:17 **informing** 13079:19 **infringed** 13106:11 13131:19 **initiated** 13088:17 13140:10,15 **initiative** 13140:18 injured 13086:7 13094:10,16 13096:22 13097:19 13097:20 13098:17 13101:23 13103:2 13123:20 13147:8 13148:18,24 13149:4 13149:11,19,22 13177:19 **injuries** 13101:15 **input** 13184:21 **inputs** 13165:4 13184:23,24 **Inquiry** 13131:22 insist 13188:8 13189:6 **insisted** 13188:1 inspection 13129:4 **instance** 13133:13,15 13138:21 **instant** 13116:5 **institute** 13131:25 **instructed** 13124:21 13183:21 13184:1 **instruction** 13182:16 13184.7 instructions 13080:9 13124:11 insufficient 13162:2 **intangible** 13118:14 intend 13079:15 13131:24 13172:24 13179:24 **intended** 13120:3 13124:23 13133:6 intends 13102:4 13175:22 **intention** 13173:6 interest 13114:20 13117:1,10 13125:23 13126:9 13179:8 interested 13093:4 13184:3 **interests** 13115:5 13121:23 13129:17 13131:24 **interim** 13087:23 13089:8,13 international 13088:11 **interpret** 13110:16,22 13116:11 interpreter 13153:11 **interrupt** 13082:10 13113:6,8 13120:19 13142:8 13150:22 **interrupted** 13184:14 interruption 13152:1 intervened 13158:4

interview 13188:15 13189:4 **interviewed** 13187:14 13187:25 **intimated** 13090:15 **introduce** 13169:22 **introduced** 13145:22 13180:23 introduction 13092:12 invalid 13084:18 investigating 13101:4 investigation 13101:9 investigations 13166:20 invincible 13130:8 **invisible** 13130:7 involved 13087:20 13132:10 13145:9 13160:13,16 13170:20 **involvement** 13125:2,2 **involves** 13100:8 13114:21 **irregular** 13106:15 13148:7 irregularity 13091:11 13106:6,15 13109:5 13150:3 irreparable 13116:4 irrespective 13117:25 13118:1,6 13119:24 irretrievably 13112:9 isn't 13169:5,6 13175:10 13179:3 13187:1,6 13189:7 issue 13086:3.23 13092:1 13093:19 13098:13 13099:23 13108:7,12 13109:5 13117:14 13147:5 13155:2,10 13156:19 13176:15 13188:19 13189:15 issues 13083:5 13086:20 13102:7 13128:13,16 13161:12 13185:3 item 13154:5 it's 13080:24 13081:5 13081:22,23 13082:20 13084:11 13084:15 13086:18 13086:18 13089:17 13091:2 13093:7.7 13094:20 13096:18 13098:19 13100:1 13102:25 13104:6,16 13105:22 13107:2 13108:12,17,25 13111:18 13113:3 13119:20,23 13121:4 13121:13 13122:1,7 13125:11 13133:16 13134:12,18 13136:12 13137:7,15 13138:10 13140:14

13142:15 13143:14
13143:15,25
13146:11 13164:18
13164.23 13169.21
13164:23 13169:21 13170:10,25 13173:7
13175:16,18
13176:10,14,18,23
13179:18 13180:24
13183:7,16 13186:23
13186:25 13187:10
13190:16
I'd 13093:20 13116:21
13133:17 13180:14
13184:3 13186:4
I'll 13091:24,25
13092:14 13111:10
13136:13 13163:13
13164:19,20
13173:12,13
I'm 13088:25 13089:10
13089:19,25
13090:25 13091:2
13093:4,11 13096:1
13097:3,14,25
13106:10,16,17
13107:4 13109:7
13112:13 13113:6
13132:15 13137:9
13142:8 13161:10,21
13166:16 13167:14
13168:25 13169:20
13169:22 13171:17
13172:19 13173:1,4,9
13172:19 13173:1,4,9 13174:17 13180:22
13182:22 13183:7
13185:10 13186:8
13188:24 13190:15
I've 13089:20,21
13091:18 13093:2,3
13106:7 13108:11
13110:1 13111:13
13110.1 13111.13
13137:12 13139:19
13143:25 13160:12
13166:3,22 13169:12
13190:20
J 13106:8 13107:3 13111:10 13114:16
13111.10 13114.10

13111:10 13114:16 ia 13092:23 13098:1 13104:4 13105:4 iaw 13119:9 **JOC** 13141:13,16 13153:1,2,7,16,21 13155:7,9 13156:12 13156:14,15,17,18,18 13159:23,24 13160:8 13181:16 13182:24 13182:25 13183:1,11 13183:14,19,20 13184:10 **JOCCOM** 13182:15 13183:17 13184:20 **joining** 13121:20 joint 13153:3,4

ioke 13122:14 journalists 13128:5 judge 13111:23 **judgment** 13085:8 13090:11 13104:24 13106:8 **judicially** 13120:18 jump 13111:20 13114:7 jumps 13094:24 justice 13079:10,20 13084:14 13102:8 13110:10 13116:8 13119:21 13123:14 13126:12 13129:17 13131:18 13132:3,18 justifications 13127:21 **justified** 13114:22

K kan 13109:12 keep 13102:4 13136:16 13139:1 13172:8 13173:12 **keeping** 13086:5 **Kellerman** 13171:4,16 13171:23 13172:7 13173:23 13174:4,8 13174:22 13190:13 **kept** 13173:20 **Kgotle** 13143:15,16 kill 13126:21 13127:4 13135:18 killed 13098:17 13119:5 13126:2,16 13126:19,23 13127:24 13128:18 13132:2 13158:4 13164:4 13179:19 killers 13119:17,18 killing 13126:9 13127:22 13138:1 **killings** 13127:19

13128:23 kind 13087:20 13092:2 13105:19 13107:13 13113:12 13178:3 kinds 13120:3 klaarblyklik 13109:17 Kluvet 13166:3 knew 13142:14

13156:8 13157:12 13164:4 13169:3 13175:7,8 13177:23 13182:8 know 13078:17 13080:4 13088:14

13089:17 13091:18 13098:8 13102:8,11 13108:8 13115:23,25 13120:17 13121:15 13121:21 13122:25 13125:24 13126:23 13134:16 13135:18 13135:19 13136:16

13138:1,14 13141:22

13142:9.18 13144:17 13145:3.16 13146:2 13146:11 13152:1 13154:18,22 13155:15 13157:24 13157:25 13162:5 13165:15 13167:17 13168:6,11,19 13174:12 13175:21 13175:23 13177:1 13178:10 13179:5,5,8 13182:11 13186:17 13186:23 13187:4 **knowing** 13097:18 **knowledge** 13136:18 13160:2 13176:20 13178:3 known 13132:5 13145:21 13185:12 **knows** 13091:13 13138:8 koppie 13129:7 13153:13 13162:4 Kwadi 13153:11 13158:1,6 **K3** 13172:3

L L 13164:14,15,17,23 13165:5,10,13 13166:25 13168:2,8 13168:13,16,17,21,21 13169:2,4,14 13170:23 13175:3,6 13176:22 13177:24 13178:2 13179:6 13183:8,10 labour 13158:2,3 13161:5 lack 13096:17 13097:7 ladies 13125:8 lady 13119:3

K4 13172:12,13

laid 13107:17 large 13106:23 largely 13151:4 larger 13115:21 **lasting** 13116:7 lastly 13102:6 late 13078:14 13146:22 law 13098:11 13105:20 13107:20 13135:19 13138:11 13142:2,3 lawfully 13127:24 laws 13107:17

lawyer 13107:22 13142:18 lawyers 13088:13 13102:5 13107:6,8,9 13107:10,11 13111:3 lay 13135:21 13138:18 laying 13135:24 13138:18

lead 13114:9 13130:1,2 13178:3 leader 13148:12

leaders 13080:3 13082:17 13083:2 13099:8 13103:9.14 13103:18 13104:2,14 13104:25 13105:6 13115:5 13129:23 13132:17 13145:19 13145:21 13147:7,17 13147:21 13187:14 13187:23 13188:12 13188:15 13189:3,14 learned 13083:16 13090:15 13094:24 13097:11 13111:23 13170:8 13171:14 13172:18 leave 13079:23 13115:12 13165:23

13166:16 13167:9,15 13167:17 13169:13 13189:9 led 13099:7 13106:14 13128:22

Ledingwane 13086:9 leeway 13092:15 **left** 13120:7 13174:10 legal 13079:17 13082:5 13082:7 13084:14,15

13084:17,21,24 13085:10 13088:24 13091:25 13092:19 13094:5 13095:4,11 13095:15,16,17 13096:3,12 13100:24 13101:2,14 13102:3 13102:16,22 13103:4 13105:21,24 13106:3 13106:5,13,24 13110:6 13111:15 13112:7 13114:5,9,19

13115:1 13119:1 13123:2 13124:9 13130:14 13150:25 13151:1,1,6 13189:5 13189:10 legally 13114:17

13135:20 **legitimacy** 13131:13 **legitimate** 13129:18 13131:24

13122:5 13127:21

legitimise 13128:8 legs 13174:19 lends 13117:15

lengthy 13190:6 **Lesotho** 13088:10 letter 13107:4 13109:7 13111:11,22 13114:3 letters 13111:22

let's 13078:11 13085:22 13086:17 13086:18 13090:10 13111:22 13118:10

let's 13152:16,17 liability 13101:23 13108:7

liable 13101:11 liaison 13152:22 13154:11.11 lied 13180:25 **Lieutenant-Colonel** 13157:20 13180:8 life 13088:22 13103:15 13131:20 **lifespan** 13103:10,12 lift 13088:19 **light** 13147:10 13175:14 limitations 13178:18 line 13096:18 13103:21 13114:11 13116:6 13136:10 13139:10 13172:4 lines 13150:18 list 13121:20 13159:18 **listen** 13082:14 13131:6 13137:7 **literally** 13121:7 litigation 13123:7 little 13092:11,14 13147:14 lived 13124:18 living 13129:25

locus 13097:3 13132:21 long 13090:2 13136:16 13146:11 longer 13113:15 13118:25

loco 13129:4

Lonmin's 13142:21 **Lonmin's** 13153:2 look 13108:18 13112:7

13123:10 13138:11 13147:14 13155:10 13164:14,14,23 13166:24 13169:21 13183:8

looked 13093:20 looking 13089:8,15,15 13113:1

looms 13106:22 lordship 13111:9 lose 13125:19 lost 13120:4 13123:9

looks 13174:18

lot 13087:9 13105:20 13114:10 13118:15

13138:19 13190:3 loved 13125:24

13126:9,11,16,18,20 13126:23 13127:3,17 13127:22,24 13129:16 13131:3,20

13131:22 13132:2 lower 13119:9

LRC 13086:8 lunch 13146:8,15 13147:4

Lusu 13106:9 **luxuries** 13107:12

M

Madam 13089:16
Madlanga 13104:4,6
13105:1
madoda 13140:11,24
Magidiwana 13108:18
13127:9,13
magistrate 13112:3
Mahlangu 13110:17,19
13116:10,15,16,19
13126:14
maim 13135:18
main 13084:8 13094:8
13098:14 13105:10
Major 13149:22
13183:25 13184:8
majority 13091:6
13120:2 13132:11
Major-General
13128:20 13134:25
13135:11 13137:15
13139:18 13142:12
13143:5,10,13
13144:10,21
13145:12,15
13146:19,20
13147:22 13149:20
13150:8,10 13151:11
13153:22 13154:3,10
13157:23 13159:3,7
13159:15,18,21
13160:17 13163:25
13165:3,12,22
13166:15 13167:3,10
13167:18,23
13168:14 13169:11
13171:5 13178:25
13179:16 13180:20
13181:11 13182:3.20
13181:11 13182:3,20 13182:23 13184:5,22
13185:2,11
making 13083:11
13096:1 13100:12
13120:15 13124:5
13150:6
Maloti 13088:10
man 13107:21 13144:5
manage 13152:23
13154:12
management 13138:21
13141:2,4 13160:21
managing 13183:14,19
manner 13122:1
13125:25 13127:17
13129:19 13137:22
13138:4 13139:21,23
13150:4 13137:21,23
13156:24
march 13085:15
13089:18 13135:22
13138:10 13142:4,4
marched 13135:20
13136:1
marching 13172:3,5
Marikana 13101:16
13119:6 13122:11,12
13122:14,22,24,25
13122.11,22,27,23

13124:17,24 13126:4
13151:13 13165:20 13171:9,25 13172:2
mark 13084:4
13112:15 13166:7
13190:19 marked 13081:20
13084:10 13166:10
massacre 13099:7 material 13153:4
13162:8 13174:13
13190:3
materially 13145:4 Mathunjwa 13145:25
13146:4 13180:17,22
13181:1 matter 13079:18,21
13083:15 13089:2
13090:17 13095:12
13097:4 13099:13,15 13099:19 13100:6
13104:14 13105:12
13106:21 13108:25
13112:3 13120:17,21 13121:9 13139:20
13150:5 13175:25
13176:23 13177:9 13187:5 13188:25
13189:17 13190:12
matters 13113:1
maximum 13146:13 Mbombo 13182:16
McIntosh 13140:25
13141:1,5,6,17 13142:13 13143:1,7
13144:11,14,22,25
13157:20
mean 13089:25 13091:20 13114:18
13115:4 13181:23
13187:12 13188:13
meaningful 13124:14 meaningfully 13091:7
meaningless 13097:21
13125:3 13131:8 means 13088:10
13125:2 13127:2
13129:14
meant 13149:6,6,7 13181:2 13190:2
measure 13126:5
13131:10 measures 13108:22
13109:6 13114:13
media 13119:12
medical 13153:5 13155:24 13174:25
meeting 13080:4
13143:18 13158:8,10 13159:23 13160:3 13179:7 13184:19
13179:7 13184:19
13185:10 meetings 13153:17
13161:7 13182:25
13183:16 13184:10
member 13142:11

13143:14
members 13101:13
13126:15 13131:9,17 13132:11,12 13139:1
13160:3 13172:5
13173:20 13180:3,7 13181:4 13189:4
memorandum 13155:1
memory 13169:13 men 13126:21
mention 13106:2
13145:18 13164:25 13167:1 13168:21
13169:7 13175:3
13184:19,21 mentioned 13089:22
13110:1 13143:2
13168:16 13169:2 13170:5,5,11
Merafe 13182:11
mere 13118:6,10 13177:16
merely 13184:13
message 13141:3 microphone 13093:25
13109:21,25
13163:23 13178:13
13179:1 13185:17 13190:18,20
militant 13180:3,7
13181:4,4 million 13102:12,13,14
13102:17 13103:7,8
13103:10,13,14,14,14 13103:17,18,18,19,20
13103:22
mind 13116:21 13146:15 13150:4
13152:18 13184:14
mine 13140:16 13158:11 13163:20
13163:20 13164:7
13165:20
miners 13096:24 13139:16 13144:1,6,8
13147:8,23,25
13149:20,22 13153:14 13160:13
13160:16,19,23,24,24
13161:13 13162:23 13162:25 13163:5
13164:7,10 13165:1
13168:22 mines 13157:24
mini 13119:20
minimum 13087:3
mining 13136:8,19 13144:5 13171:24
Minister 13084:14
13102:8 13103:20 ministers 13121:17
minus 13085:25
minute 13078:20 13118:13 13184:19
13184:21
minutes 13087:4,6

```
13113:16 13127:19
  13159:11 13185:5.7.8
misleading 13173:3
missed 13089:11
missing 13119:8
modern 13115:23
moet 13109:18
moment 13083:12
  13092:11 13118:19
  13118:23 13120:23
  13123:24 13150:6
  13169:25 13173:12
  13189:10,12
moments 13118:17
Monday 13154:21
  13156:17 13157:17
  13172:1
money 13088:8,9
  13102:15 13107:9
  13122:20
Moneykana 13122:22
month 13085:14
  13103:1,4,10,12,15
  13123:9
monthly 13103:6,8
months 13085:23,23,25
  13086:1,1 13188:3
Moolman 13141:1,5
  13143:1,7,7
moral 13151:6
morning 13078:3,25
  13079:9 13120:11
  13124:6 13132:16
  13143:16 13147:11
  13159:5,6 13161:18
  13190:24
Mosikidi 13083:18
  13096:9,9 13097:7,15
motion 13079:4
  13081:9,16 13082:21
  13092:9,25 13096:7
mound 13174:3
mounds 13173:25
mouth 13178:5
move 13078:22
  13113:22 13172:14
  13173:16
movement 13172:9
movements 13172:10
moving 13112:11
  13128:25 13129:3
  13150:15 13172:11
Mpembe 13099:5
  13128:20 13134:15
  13135:1.11 13137:15
  13139:18 13142:12
  13143:5,10,13
  13144:10,21
  13145:12,15
  13146:20 13147:16
  13149:20,23
  13150:10 13151:11
  13153:22 13154:3,10
  13157:23 13159:3,7
  13159:16,21
  13160:17 13163:2,25
```

13165:3,12,22 13166:15 13167:3.10 13167:18.23 13168:14 13169:11 13171:5 13178:25 13179:16 13180:20 13181:11 13182:3,20 13184:5,22 **Mpembe's** 13136:22 13163:4 Mpofu's 13078:4 Mthetwa 13111:12,14 murder 13101:13 muster 13156:10 mustn't 13122:11 Mutengwane 13166:2 13166:12 13175:20 Mutengwane's 13166:7 muti 13130:8 M-O 13122:22

name 13088:12 names 13118:13 national 13107:17 **natural** 13113:12 **nature** 13102:20 13106:16 13116:8 13130:5 13136:21 **nearer** 13155:9 nebulous 13117:21 necessarily 13082:3 13090:2,3 13100:1 necessary 13111:25 13112:7 13129:1 13152:8,12 13154:8 13179:12 13189:3 necessities 13107:9,12 need 13102:3 13125:24 13128:11 13137:16 13139:6 13140:13 13141:7,10,13 13142:3,3 13143:21 13145:17,22 13156:10,13,25 13161:16 13178:22 13179:17.20 13185:25 13189:17 13189:22 needed 13157:11 needs 13082:22 13114:20 13115:8 13161:24 **negotiate** 13139:23 13140:1,9,11 13142:6

13144:8 13172:7

negotiating 13145:3

negotiation 13135:13

13136:9 13137:17,18

13141:23,25 13142:1

13140:10,16,21,24

negotiations 13139:16

13144:13,20

13105:8

negotiator 13144:4 **neither** 13085:17

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

never 13117:12,19
13120:8 13124:22
13129:17 13167:5
new 13088:18
Ngalwana 13146:25
13147:1 13148:11
13149:15,17 13152:6 13152:19 13161:20
13162:15,18,20
13167:13 13169:17
13170:4 13171:12,19
13171:20 13172:17
13173:1,14 13174:9 13178:7,12 13185:19
13178:7,12 13185:19 13186:7,17 13187:9
13187:17 13188:10
13189:21,25 13190:8
13190:11,22
nie 13109:8,9,10,11,12
13109:15,16,18,18
night 13155:14
ninth 13153:11 noble 13107:20
Noki 13130:21,21
Noki's 13130:21,24
non-governmental
13085:13
normal 13116:22
13134:12 13137:18
13141:22
normally 13114:4
13138:5,6 13155:8,9 13184:9
notably 13088:17
notes 13188:2
notice 13079:4 13081:6
13081:9,16 13082:20
13092:9,25 13096:6
13162:7 13172:18,24
13173:5 13186:19 notwithstanding
13184:6
no-one 13129:15
Ntsebeza 13083:17
13095:18,23 13136:7
13136:14,15 13137:3
13148:6
Ntsebeza's 13124:5 Ntsonkota 13080:24,25
13134:1,2
nullified 13111:3
NUM 13080:25
13134:5 13153:18
13160:3 13163:7,10
number 13094:14,23
13095:1 13098:7,10 13099:8,12,15,15,19
13099:23 13102:1
13103:24 13104:21
13106:1,8 13109:4
13111:8 13114:25
13129:24 13130:6
13137:11 13142:10
13152:5,7 13153:15 13154:16 13155:6,19
13155:24 13156:7,25

12157.10 12159.1 12
13157:10 13158:1,13
13158:16 13159:19
13160:4,5 13178:14 13179:17 13180:12
13179:17 13180:12
numbers 13094:11,14
13141:12
numerous 13106:2,2
Nungu 13125:9
13132:4
Nungu's 13125:20
nutshell 13084:9
13100:7
N-E-Y 13122:23
0
oath 13129:9 13134:25
13146:19 13150:8
13159:15
objecting 13186:8
objection 13146:25
121.47.2.121.40.23
13147:2 13148:9
13152:7,19 13162:17
13162:18 13175:14
13175:16 13187:9
objective 13129:14
objectives 13123:13
observation 13147:3
13172:8
observe 13137:8
obtain 13111:15
13112:6 13114:5,9
13123:2
obtaining 13106:24
obvious 13101:18
13117:10
obviously 13080:5
13090:11 13093:20
13094:4 13103:4
13106:19 13111:18
12115.16 12117.15
13115:16 13117:15 13118:18 13119:11
13118:18 13119:11
13120:24 13132:7
13164:8 13179:9
13189:7 13190:3
occasionally 13153:18
occasions 13144:6 occurred 13175:1
occurred 13175:1
October 13085:15,17
13102:10 13103:11
office 13185:3,11
officer 13154:11,13
13158:2 13171:24
13179:18
officers 13128:18
12154.22 12192.4
13154:22 13183:4
official 13139:7,19
13177:16,21
officials 13121:16
13155:16
off-chance 13089:1
oh 13083:15 13089:16
13093:2 13100:4
13104:4
okay 13083:4 13091:1
13109:18 13112:23
13150:21 13164:21
13130.21 13101.21

```
om 13109:15
omission 13174:13
  13190:20
omstandighede
  13109:16
once 13081:1 13082:12
  13085:19 13094:14
  13111:10 13112:5
Onder 13109:16
ondervra 13109:9
ones 13121:21
  13125:24 13126:9,12
  13126:16,18,20,23
  13127:3,17,22,24
  13129:16 13131:20
  13131:23 13132:2
  13144:12
one's 13114:18
one-sided 13131:12
ongoing 13099:24
onverwags 13109:13
onwards 13164:14
OOO4 13161:9
OO4 13143:23
open 13164:19 13189:9
opened 13164:5
  13165:19 13170:6
  13171:10
operated 13156:9
operation 13099:7
  13128:21 13151:14
  13154:1 13155:8
  13156:23 13165:10
  13166:23 13180:2,11
  13180:18.23
  13182:19 13183:12
  13183:13,19,25
  13184:18
operational 13181:16
  13181:20,21
  13182:18 13183:23
Operations 13171:25
  13172:2
opinion 13127:4
opportunity 13078:4
  13091:21,22
  13106:13 13111:17
  13111:19 13112:6
  13132:1 13149:2
  13179:14
oppose 13079:10,21
  13080:2,10 13132:19
opposed 13127:23
opposing 13079:25
  13134:6
opsig 13109:12
optimism 13087:24
optimistic 13087:20
  13123:5
optimists 13087:19
orally 13078:25
order 13084:12
  13096:5 13114:22
  13129:2 13131:23
  13155:4 13169:1
```

13187:24 **Ordering** 13084:19 **ordinarily** 13084:23 13091:18 ordinary 13108:9 13119:19 organisation 13088:18 13088:20 organisations 13088:23 organised 13130:4,6 13158:10,10 organs 13119:8 **orientated** 13155:18 original 13181:14 13182:22 outcome 13083:25 13084:7 13090:17,19 13091:15,16 13093:9 13112:8 13117:25 13118:6 13119:24 13121:25 13129:18 13133:3,6,7,12,14,16 13133:16 **outcomes** 13118:10 13120:3,8 outline 13093:23 13094:1 outlined 13079:15 13095:24 **outlining** 13081:6 overall 13099:6 13146:1 13153:20 13160:8 13165:9 13166:23 13179:13 13181:15,19 13183:11,18,22 overheads 13090:1 overlap 13094:20 **overriding** 13098:16 owner 13115:12 o'clock 13132:16 13159:23 13190:24 o'clock 13079:7 P 13111:11.20.23

page 13102:24 13109:7 13113:24 13114:13 13136:12 13139:10 13169:21 13173:8 13181:13 pain 13131:11 painted 13126:20 papers 13097:16 13098:12 13100:24 para 13173:15 **paragraph** 13085:7,9 13085:20 13106:17 13106:18 13114:2,7 13136:18 13163:14 13163:15,16 13170:9 13170:10 13171:7 13172:1,7,12 13173:23 13174:4,5 13181:8,13 13182:22 paraphrase 13109:19

13111:10 paraphrasing 13100:20 13172:18 pardon 13109:8 13185:21 part 13088:8 13089:11 13089:19 13111:18 13114:16 13118:2 13129:11 13131:13 13133:20 13134:10 13145:17 13151:6 13162:8,24 13177:7 participants 13101:9 13108:9 participate 13091:7 13117:24 13118:2 13124:10 13129:10 13131:5,15,21 participating 13124:10 13124:25 13125:22 participation 13085:11 13097:20,21 13120:2 13122:21 13124:14 13127:16 13128:7,9 13131:7 particular 13108:5 13124:8,18 13127:9 13130:19 13138:15 13164:16,18 13189:15 particularly 13118:7 13119:3 13130:11 13181:20 parties 13079:8 13080:5,21 13082:11 13084:25 13086:5,11 13099:2,17 13102:2 13113:3 13132:18 13160:25 13164:10 partner 13130:21 partners 13121:17 partnership 13152:24 13154:24,25 party 13080:2,22 13101:14 13128:2 13131:1 13134:13 13176:7 Pasha 13127:9,13 passages 13106:25 passed 13088:3 passive 13181:6 patent 13108:17 patiently 13082:14 paused 13116:1 peace 13116:7 13124:23 13145:4 peacefully 13142:5 peacemakers 13181:5 **pending** 13083:24 13093:8 13125:7 13133:2,4 people 13088:22 13094:16,16 13096:21 13097:17 13098:16,24

13172:6 13174:19

13099:11 13100:9

13101:24 13104:22
13101:24 13104:22
13108.5 13111.1,5
13118:19 13119:16
13119:16 13121:14
13121:17 13122:4,5
13122:12,13
13124:16,18
13135:18 13142:4
13143:3,6 13144:11
13147:22 13148:3
13153:19 13154:17
13154:19,23
13157:14,16 13158:4
13158:17 13162:11
13165:5 13168:9,10
13168:23 13169:19
13170:6,11,20
13172:10,11,14
13173:16 13182:10
perceived 13091:15
perception 13121:14
13160:13,14,15,18
perfect 13190:11
period 13084:5,6
13085:15,16 13086:1
13086:24 13089:8
13090:9,11 13101:16
periods 13089:14
permanently 13153:7
peroration 13121:4
person 13111:15
13115:9 13141:16
13145:2 13149:11
13152:23 13154:11
13162:7 13176:9,12
13176:13 14 15 17
13176:13,14,15,17 13177:18 13183:18
13183:21,22
personnel 13153:5
13155:25
persons 13094:8
12101.15 12122.20
13101:15 13123:20
13126:13 13127:6,6 13130:10,23
13130:10,23
13148:18,25 13149:4 13159:2
persuade 13125:6
13142:6
phase 13100:18,22,24
13101:7,19,22
Phiyega 13150:13,24
13151:3,7,17
phone 13115:9,11,12
13181:17
phoned 13142:16
phones 13115:11
photograph 13162:14
photographic 13161:23
picture 13169:1
13172:20
pictures 13127:1
pieces 13190:4
pile 13190:5
place 13100:8 13102:17
13102:18 13110:10

13113:12 13133:17 13137:17 13142:1,2 13145:5 13147:8 13148:8 13154:19 13155:8,12,13 13156:18,19 13158:8 13158:18,22 13159:1 13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
13145:5 13147:8 13148:8 13154:19 13155:8,12,13 13156:18,19 13158:8 13158:18,22 13159:1 13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
13148:8 13154:19 13155:8,12,13 13156:18,19 13158:8 13158:18,22 13159:1 13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
13156:18,19 13158:8 13158:18,22 13159:1 13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
13158:18,22 13159:1 13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
13164:24 13176:3 13182:15 placed 13179:19
placed 13179:19
piaceu 151/9:19
13186:12
places 13155:15
plan 13156:4 13182:18 planned 13089:18
planning 13160:1
Plasket 13106:8 Platinum 13171:25
play 13185:14
players 13183:14
plead 13125:6 pleading 13145:19
please 13082:18
13092:15 13115:10 13121:10 13152:20
13163:12 13174:14
13184:15
pleases 13080:24 point 13086:3 13087:16
13091:24,25 13092:1
13095:24 13096:1 13097:10 13098:3
13104:20 13105:18
13108:10,11,11 13112:24,25 13113:8
13113:25 13115:14
13115:15 13119:10
13120:1,25,25 13121:22 13122:4,8
13133:19 13135:8
13136:5 13139:5 13150:2,7 13152:18 13152:24 13162:16
13152:24 13162:16
13162:21 13164:6 13168:20,25 13169:8
13170:4 13174:2,5,13
13174:25 13175:5,8
13176:18,21 13178:5 13179:23 13187:6,20
13189:6,18
pointed 13090:14 13124:8
points 13108:3
13113:22 13116:9,25
13120:10,13 13132:21 13151:21
13132:21 13151:21 13152:21 13154:8
13161:16 13178:14 13178:15
police 13083:1
13098:18,21 13118:20 13121:16
13126:3,18,19,21
13127:4,7,12
13128:18,21,24 13129:1,7,13
13138:21 13139:6,19

```
13140:10.15.17
  13141:21 13144:3.17
  13144:19 13146:23
  13147:3,7 13152:15
  13154:16 13155:16
  13156:16,21
  13157:15 13158:4,14
  13158:21 13160:19
  13161:2 13162:2
  13163:22 13177:20
  13177:21 13179:18
  13183:3 13185:4
  13189:4,5,11
policies 13138:21
policy 13155:7 13160:8
poor 13107:21
portions 13136:11
portraying 13173:9
pose 13164:20
position 13079:20
  13080:12,12,14,18
  13081:1 13085:7,20
  13096:11 13097:12
  13098:5 13115:5
  13135:23 13140:22
  13182:9 13183:9
positioned 13181:21
positions 13080:6
possessing 13135:18
possibilities 13089:4
possibility 13123:4
  13148:10
possible 13078:22
  13099:24 13105:13
  13119:23 13126:8
possibly 13089:13
  13094:16 13130:23
  13147:17 13183:23
posted 13159:24
postpone 13125:6
postponed 13091:6
  13132:7,13
postponement 13079:1
  13083:23 13084:5,5
  13086:24 13090:21
  13093:7 13095:25
  13105:14.19.21.22.23
  13106:4,12,24
  13111:25 13112:6,10
  13113:4 13114:8
  13115:18 13120:16
  13123:1 13124:2
  13133:2
postponements
  13113:25
postulated 13085:21
  13089:5 13107:13
posture 13086:6
Potch 13182:10
potential 13091:12
  13092:3
practical 13086:10
  13187:2,7
prayer 13085:5
prayers 13085:1,2,5
preceding 13127:19
```

```
precise 13170:14
preface 13186:1
prefer 13189:9
prejudice 13082:25
  13092:2,3 13093:19
  13105:15 13108:17
  13108:24 13112:25
  13113:2 13115:18,20
  13117:1
prejudiced 13110:9
  13131:25
prejudicial 13108:19
preliminary 13086:20
  13178:14
premeditated 13130:6
premises 13153:3
preparatory 13177:24
prepare 13107:7
  13189:22,25
prepared 13110:8
  13137:19 13188:12
  13188:13
prescripts 13150:25,25
presence 13123:16
  13187:25
present 13099:5
  13107:7 13108:14
  13115:5,8 13169:1,4
  13175:6 13188:16
  13189:4
presentation 13177:21
presented 13126:24
  13165:11,13 13168:3
  13168:5,8,13 13169:4
  13169:14 13175:7
presenting 13109:1,2
presents 13178:5
President 13084:14
  13091:20 13153:12
  13158:7
presidents 13161:8,12
presumably 13104:14
  13162:13 13169:4
Pretoria 13141:14
prevail 13115:20
previous 13080:6
  13137:25
prima 13149:15
primarily 13126:4
principal 13085:2
principle 13104:18
prior 13155:22,22
  13156:3 13157:1,5
  13158:19.20
private 13083:25
  13093:8 13098:20,23
  13102:4 13116:15,17
  13126:20 13133:3
privilege 13134:3
probably 13095:1,2
problem 13147:19
  13148:15 13155:10
problems 13087:13
  13158:15 13181:16
  13181:18
procedural 13107:18
```

```
Procedure 13113:24
proceed 13079:5
  13080:10 13087:11
  13087:12 13116:3
  13121:11
proceedings 13078:1
  13079:22 13084:17
  13084:22 13085:12
  13098:14 13099:18
  13101:8 13106:6,14
  13106:16,22
  13107:13 13111:2
  13112:8,8 13128:2
  13131:2,16 13133:20
  13134:10 13135:6
process 13115:16
  13116:2 13117:24
  13118:2 13124:24
  13126:22 13138:6
  13141:23 13148:7
  13158:18,23
  13166:19 13190:6
processed 13153:14
  13158:17
processing 13159:1
procured 13085:12
proffered 13189:8
proffering 13082:15
profound 13090:13,18
  13091:2 13097:16
  13117:12 13118:24
prohibitive 13090:4
promised 13083:19
promises 13136:16
proper 13101:2
  13112:2 13137:22
properly 13150:5
  13155:24
property 13101:16
propose 13082:3
proposed 13084:5
  13182:1
proposes 13102:9
proposing 13113:6
proposition 13136:23
  13148:20 13166:22
  13180:6,9 13181:2
  13185:25 13186:1,1
prosecute 13107:8
prosecuted 13126:14
Prosecutions 13114:14
prospects 13087:2,21
protect 13130:14
  13163:10
protesters 13088:1
  13101:10,12
  13127:10,14
  13128:18,23
  13129:24,25 13130:3
  13130:4 13135:14
  13138:3,15,16,23
  13139:1 13141:2
  13142:6
prove 13175:24
  13177:19 13178:1
provide 13084:16,20
```

provided 13096:17
13127:14 13129:21
province 13180:25
13185:13
provinces 13155:17
Provincial 13154:21
13180:23,24 13184:1
13184:6
proving 13177:7
provision 13102:11
provisionally 13099:18
provocative 13138:25
public 13089:18
13105:16 13114:14
13117:1
pulled 13089:22
purportedly 13099:10
purpose 13091:22
13176:22
purposes 13106:24
13117:6
put 13078:11 13081:1
13082:4 13091:16
13099:10 13105:13
13105:17 13114:23
13105:17 13114:23 13120:6 13121:8
13123:7 13132:6
13136:5 13137:21
13139:5 13140:12
13144:14 13147:21
13148:2,18,21
13149:12,22
13147.14,44
13150:18 13151:17 13160:12 13161:17
13160:12 13161:17
13162:6,15,22
13163:2 13165:7
13166:22 13169:5
13170:13 13175:7,14
13176:8,10,18,19,23
13177:2,11 13178:4
13178:14,19
13179:12 13180:6,9
13180:15 13185:25
13186:22 13187:2,17
13188:5,22 13190:4
putting 13143:25
13149:1
13149:1
Q
V

quarter 13146:16 **quashing** 13114:10 question 13089:11 13092:2 13106:23 13108:16,22,24 13112:4 13115:19 13130:23 13133:11 13136:14,15 13142:9 13144:25,25 13145:7 13145:9,13 13150:5 13162:10,10,12 13164:6,11,13,20,22 13167:7,25 13175:8 13175:11 13176:7,16 13177:2,5,6 13178:11 13178:23 13181:12 13184:12 13186:7,21

13186:24 13187:2.18 questioned 13110:2 questioning 13189:19 questions 13111:6 13142:21,22 13185:16 13190:1 quick 13108:3 quicker 13087:22 quickly 13151:21,24 quietly 13078:22 quite 13087:9 13090:12 13093:7 13100:5 13151:21,23 13152:10 13184:2 13190:6 **quotation** 13112:15 **quote** 13100:24 13112:19,20 13119:1 13119:1 quoted 13091:18 13114:7 quote/unquote 13120:5 **quoting** 13119:3

R

13137:17 13172:4

13112:14 13173:14

13175:9 13177:23

race 13120:5

radio 13181:17

raise 13082:19

raised 13098:21

railway 13136:10

13132:21 13148:15 raising 13162:16 Raith 13085:13 ran 13173:23 rates 13084:24 13103:4 reaching 13116:6 reaction 13136:22 read 13081:9 13082:21 13085:5 13111:14 13113:23 13125:8,16 13125:19 13136:13 13150:19 13151:25 13172:19 13173:2,8 **reading** 13100:22 13106:17 13107:4 13109:7 13118:12 13178:8 real 13116:6 13120:8 13121:8 13187:23 realised 13107:21 13118:18 13158:20 **realising** 13138:10 **realistic** 13103:16 reality 13086:5,7 really 13094:1 13105:22 13108:12 13112:24 13114:4 13115:20 13117:3 13120:4 13121:4 13122:6,15 13124:18 13137:11 13149:5 13152:11 13176:22 13177:6 13178:14

13180:7 13184:13 reason 13078:13 13125:22 13128:6 13146:22 13155:25 13180:25 reasonable 13084:20 13084:24 13087:2,21 13111:19 reasonably 13111:17 reasons 13126:4 13132:8,12 recall 13145:19 13154:20 13190:14 recalled 13149:21 13189:18 recalls 13154:16 **receive** 13166:18 received 13084:25 13174:24 receiving 13095:4 recollection 13144:22 13159:4 13190:17 recommendations 13126:13 recommended 13104:21,23 13105:3 reconciliation 13119:13,21 13120:8 13123:15 13124:23 reconsider 13188:7 record 13078:11 13082:21 13098:8 13100:1 13124:21 13129:11 13132:6 13133:17 13134:5 13136:17 13148:9,17 13149:11 13151:23 13152:1 13169:19 13180:15 recorded 13143:23 13185:9 **recording** 13165:19 records 13166:25 **reduced** 13117:7 redundant 13125:4 13131:9 reeds 13109:8 refer 13081:13 13100:2 13128:15 13162:14 13162:15 13169:15 13176:5 reference 13094:9,11 13094:13 13101:21 13105:25,25 13117:6 13135:15 13163:9,12 13163:13 13176:3 **referred** 13114:24 13153:8 13169:8 13170:23 13180:11 13190:18 **referring** 13084:10 13136:24 13141:21 13141:22 13142:19 13164:1,1,2,17 13171:14

refrained 13176:21 refusal 13091:12 13106:4 13112:9 **refused** 13112:6 13163:19 refusing 13084:16 refute 13130:16 regard 13126:9 13129:11 13132:9 13155:6,19,24 13156:3,7,11,13,24 13157:4,10 13158:1 13158:13 13160:5 13175:20 13188:7 **regarding** 13127:23 13134:7 regsverteenwoordiger 13109:14 regulates 13151:2 **relate** 13090:9 13127:19 related 13100:7 13158:3 relates 13096:21 13104:11 13117:22 13147:5 13153:2 **relation** 13086:4,22 13126:7 13128:13,19 13144:7 13151:13 13161:9 13162:11 relations 13158:2 relationship 13151:19 13152:23 13153:25 13154:4,12 13156:6 13157:8 13158:6,9,12 13159:25 13160:15 13161:7,8 13177:12 13177:13 13188:7 released 13100:10 relevance 13100:13 13110:25 relevant 13094:2,3 13109:6 13111:21 13114:16 13128:3,21 13136:11 13162:13 13173:13 13176:12 13176:14 relied 13107:1 13111:11,12,14 13175:23 13177:7 relief 13079:1 13080:15 13081:6 13085:1 13090:23 13092:9,25 13093:5,6,12 13096:15,19,20 13099:20,22 13104:10 13132:25 **reluctant** 13188:24 rely 13079:3 13090:24 13092:10 13097:18 13173:6 relying 13106:25 13114:13 13172:24 remain 13122:13

remarks 13113:13 remedial 13114:12.13 remedy 13190:19 remember 13100:22 13117:4 13143:17 13150:17,18 13152:9 13157:22 13159:2,7 13163:9,11 13168:16 13176:7 remembered 13108:6 remind 13093:22 reminded 13150:8 **remitted** 13112:3 remove 13182:1 rendered 13131:8 **Rensburg** 13111:10 repeat 13093:6 13177:4 **rephrase** 13186:9 reply 13086:11 13149:18 reported 13162:23 **reporting** 13165:23 reports 13165:1 **represent** 13087:25 13094:8,25 13096:10 13097:17 13098:8,17 13098:17,25 13099:11,17 13103:2 13104:1 13108:6 13111:5 13117:10 13119:16 13121:14 13122:4 representation 13088:24 13102:4,21 13102:22 13105:21 13105:24 13106:3,5 13106:25 13111:16 13112:7 13114:6,9,19 13115:1 13117:14 13123:2 13124:12 representative 13101:2 13102:3 13110:6 13125:20 13130:14 13153:12 representatives 13102:16 13139:22 13166:4 13189:5.11 represented 13098:9 13099:3 13114:17 13147:9,23 13148:4 13180:9 representing 13080:21 13086:8 13103:25 13109:1 13183:15 represents 13103:5

reflected 13122:15

13124:24

remainder 13174:22

13132:5

13158:5 **requested** 13078:14

reputation 13144:18

13142:21 13143:3

13085:25 13134:16

requesting 13141:11

require 13130:13

required 13128:14

13139:7 13140:12,25

request 13134:4,7

reserve 13080:12,17	13157:13	sang 13138:4	13185:1 13186:3	seeks 13100:19,20
13081:2 13121:5	review 13096:16	sangoma 13130:9	second 13084:13,19	13108:23
residents 13165:20	13148:8	SAPS 13099:1	13085:4 13086:23,23	seen 13126:25
13167:2	re-cross-examining	13101:13 13103:7,13	13087:16 13089:11	13132:10 13138:7
resolution 13136:8	13099:9	13103:17 13104:1,24	13117:11,13,16	13170:7
13138:6,22 13144:4	re-examination	13126:8,15,17	13124:4 13129:20	Segwai 13174:18
13157:24	13189:22 13190:7	13127:5,15,24	13145:17 13152:24	self 13098:19,23
resolutions 13137:20				13117:25
	Ridder 13088:19	13128:3 13129:23	13156:7 13162:21	
resolve 13148:16	ridiculous 13188:17	13142:11 13151:2,6,9	13166:3 13169:23	self-defence 13098:18
resource 13144:8	right 13097:6 13100:12	13151:14,16,20	13170:1,2,4,16,24	13126:19
13157:11 13160:7	13105:24,24 13106:3	13152:23,24 13153:4	13176:18 13177:2,4	Selikowitz 13114:16
resources 13155:1	13106:5,11 13107:13	13153:7,18,25	13181:6 13185:23	13115:7
13184:24	13116:18 13117:24	13154:4,12 13156:18	secondly 13088:14,16	Semenya 13080:9
respect 13084:17,21	13117:25 13118:1	13157:1,2 13160:3,15	13102:20 13137:24	13090:16 13133:21
13087:1 13096:6	13126:6 13131:19,20	13161:19 13166:1,5	13138:8 13140:4	13133:21,24
13101:12 13110:4	13131:21 13145:1,9	13172:6,9 13173:6	13141:17 13154:20	13189:11
13115:4 13152:10	13157:22 13167:22	13174:24 13175:24	13155:8 13160:21	send 13124:5 13132:17
				13132:22
13175:19 13187:23	13169:9 13170:1	13177:8,12,14	13161:1 13175:22	
13188:10,18	rights 13081:3 13083:8	13180:3,7 13187:24	seconds 13163:14	senior 13139:6,19
respectful 13129:16	13086:9 13100:23,25	13188:2,5,7	13171:17	13154:13,22
13131:12	13126:7 13131:18,23	sat 13118:7	section 13114:1	13171:23,24
respects 13175:17	risk 13101:18 13106:19	satisfied 13112:3	secure 13085:16,18	seniority 13104:20
respond 13079:9	13106:20,22	Saturday 13156:15,16	secured 13085:14	sense 13117:18
13080:14 13153:24	13130:17	save 13116:2	13086:2	13135:24 13158:20
13181:12 13182:21	rituals 13130:9	saw 13157:3 13172:11	securities 13159:25	13170:14 13184:3
respondent 13084:23	rivers 13078:18	saw 13137.3 13172.11 saying 13087:18	13164:3	senses 13089:2
13100:25	role 13183:10,11,13,14	13091:2 13093:19	security 13118:21	sent 13188:2
respondents 13084:13	13183:18 13185:14	13097:16 13105:14	13119:4 13153:8	sentence 13112:1,2,4
13084:19 13086:5	room 13115:12	13108:2,16,21	13154:14 13156:25	13114:4 13115:1
response 13142:21	round 13136:4	13112:5 13115:15,19	13157:2 13163:20,21	Seoka 13136:6,25
13144:9 13151:24	13172:15 13173:21	13116:16 13119:12	13164:7 13165:21	13138:8 13139:11
13180:16,18	rounded 13103:1	13119:15 13120:20	13166:13 13170:12	13141:21 13144:18
13182:21 13187:1	rounds 13115:14	13147:14 13156:4	13170:16,17,19	13145:1,16,17,21
responsibilities	13174:7,13,20	13162:2 13163:9	13171:24,25 13172:5	Seoka's 13136:14
13166:17 13183:2	13177:18	13166:16 13167:20	13172:15 13173:20	13137:9,14
responsibility 13101:14	rubber 13129:2	13185:11	13174:1 13175:4	separate 13175:25
responsible 13126:11	13172:15 13173:21	says 13084:11 13085:8	13176:4	13177:9
13139:7 13159:9	13174:6,20 13175:4	13085:10 13091:18	see 13081:11 13086:17	separated 13156:18
rest 13085:1 13119:6	13177:18	13100:25 13109:6,8	13086:18 13087:9	September 13084:2,9
13125:21	rule 13162:5	13111:14,24	13089:4 13094:6,22	13093:10 13099:14
restoration 13123:14	ruling 13101:7	13113:24 13114:4,7	13094:22 13096:6	sequence 13164:24
13126:6 13131:10	13116:24 13134:7	13114:16 13115:7	13105:2 13110:18	13166:25
restorative 13131:18	13176:7 13188:4,25	13119:15 13125:21	13112:22 13118:15	Seri 13096:10 13109:3
rests 13079:5	run 13130:17 13174:16	13136:15 13137:3,7	13124:12,18	13111:13 13132:5
result 13111:5,24	running 13103:22	13139:13 13148:22	13136:21 13139:2,10	seriously 13110:9
13171:10 13185:2	13166:16 13183:13	13155:7 13160:8	13139:24 13140:25	serve 13108:23
resultant 13190:7	13183:19	13161:2 13171:25	13141:3 13143:2	served 13082:23
resume 13134:18	rushed 13172:13	13172:7,11,12,14	13145:24 13146:14	served 13082.23 serves 13159:4
13146:12,16	13173:15 D115 13103-13	13174:1,4,5,9	13152:18 13155:25	13169:13
resumes 13078:2	R115 13102:12	13179:4	13158:8 13163:17	service 13088:3
13087:7,8 13113:18	R17 13088:6	SC 13080:9,11	13164:21,25	13140:15 13154:16
13113:19 13134:23	R2 13103:8	13082:10 13083:10	13165:10 13166:11	services 13146:2,24
13134:24 13146:17	R3 13103:7,10	13132:24 13133:24	13168:20 13169:14	13157:17,18
13146:18 13159:13	R32 13102:13	13148:14 13187:21	13171:7,22 13175:6	serving 13079:16
13159:14	R340 13103:6	scale 13084:22	13180:25 13182:4,13	set 13084:1,8 13093:10
retain 13163:10	R5-coin 13088:7	scanned 13083:12	13183:3,8 13190:2	13099:13 13101:20
retrial 13107:24	R83 13102:13	scene 13101:13	seeing 13126:11	13115:2 13168:24
return 13087:23		13127:11 13145:2	seek 13079:1 13090:23	13175:2
13088:13 13089:4	S	13182:2	13092:9 13093:1,5	sets 13092:19
			•	
13105:12 13125:7	S 13106:9 13114:24	scheme 13115:21	13096:15 13104:11	setting 13091:19
returning 13089:7,13	SACR 13114:15	scope 13101:7	13126:3 13151:23	settle 13089:2
Reverend 13136:6,14	safe 13128:4	Scott 13180:8	13175:17,20	settlement 13128:25
13136:25 13137:9,13	safeguard 13126:7	se 13106:7,16	13181:18	13146:6
13138:8 13139:11	13131:23	search 13091:22	seeking 13097:23	seven 13104:1,2
13141:21 13144:18	safeguards 13107:18	seasoned 13144:3	13105:21,23 13106:4	13108:19 13180:1
13145:1,16,17,20	sake 13097:10	Seboloke 13159:8	13130:16	seventh 13153:7
ARCHIVE FO	R JUSTICE			

shaft 13153:15 13172:3
Shapiro 13141:14,18
13141:19 13142:14
13142:14,18
Shapiro's 13142:9
share 13155:1
sharp 13174:4 she's 13176:17
shoot 13174:18
shooting 13127:5,11
13163:21 13170:9,20
13171:11 13176:4
short 13086:15 13093:7
13096:5 13115:23
13132:23 13134:11
13155:15 13159:11
13159:20 13178:23 shortly 13113:7,23
shortly 13113:7,23 shot 13126:2,19,23
13127:24 13153:20
13163:6 13164:8
13165:2,20 13166:13
13167:2 13169:19
13170:6 13172:15
13173:20 13174:6,20
13175:4
shots 13170:15
shouted 13172:13
13173:16 show 13138:22 13156:6
13157:7 13159:25
Shozi 13080:17
13109:19 13123:21
13124:1 13125:14,17
13163:1 13175:16
13177:6
side 13111:7,23
13127:14 13128:10
13128:15 13175:14
sidelined 13180:10,10 13180:13 13181:8,23
13180:13 13181:8,23
sides 13092:4 13093:20
sign 13188:1,8,13,17
13189:7
signed 13189:6
signs 13112:15
Sihari 13114:6
silence 13118:13
silk 13104:23
silks 13104:21,21
13105:3
silkworms 13104:22 13105:7
silly 13115:17
similar 13088:15
similarly 13080:17
13107:5 13151:8
simple 13177:15
13183:7
simply 13091:3
13114:17 13115:4
13121:13 13127:1
13129:6,12 13131:13 13133:15 13179:12
13183:18
ARCHIVE EO

Ma
Sinclair 13143:14
13152:22 13154:11
13154:12 13156:8
sir 13123:21 sit 13131:6 13187:22
sitting 13088:19
13117:3
situated 13173:25
situation 13135:15,21 13136:21,23 13137:1
13130:21,23 13137:1
13157:10 13157:2;12
13169:2
situations 13141:9
13144:19 six 13085:14,25
13104:6,7,7,13
sixth 13153:6
skewed 13102:20
skills 13157:12 skipping 13173:13
slaag 13109:18
slain 13129:16
slide 13164:14,17,19,23
13183:8,10
slides 13165:1 13166:24 13167:1
slow 13116:8,13
small 13173:25
societies 13115:23
solidarity 13097:5,13 13123:19
somebody 13145:22
13162:12
sonder 13109:13
song 13138:4,5 sons 13126:1 13131:4
sorry 13082:10
13083:7,15 13089:10
13106:17 13112:13
13116:9 13120:19
13132:23 13142:8 13150:14,22
13153:12 13167:14
13177:4 13182:22
13184:14 13185:21
13190:23
sort 13089:7,14 13097:5 13153:25
sorts 13121:17
sought 13080:15
13086:2 13096:20
13133:1 13181:9,10 13188:22
sounds 13120:20
sources 13083:25
13086:25 13093:8
13133:3
South 13084:15 13088:6 13140:15
13154:15 13183:3
Sowetan 13119·2
so-called 13112:20
13124:3 13177:8

```
speak 13095:8 13098:7
  13100:11 13111:4.7
  13114:18 13117:21
  13119:20 13120:5
  13129:15 13130:23
  13131:3 13143:3,8,13
  13157:20
speaking 13090:5
  13138:2 13140:8
specialised 13136:18
specific 13108:24
  13126:13 13130:12
  13130:15 13184:19
  13184:21
specifically 13101:22
  13109:6 13144:6
  13151:5
spectre 13108:1
speculate 13184:13
speedier 13087:23
spend 13102:15
  13103:7,8,12
  13152:16
spent 13102:12,21
  13103:9
spoke 13119:11,11
  13135:15
staatsgetuies 13109:9
staff 13183:12
stage 13079:24,25
  13080:1,22 13096:19
  13113:7 13133:14
  13146:5,8 13156:22
  13168:7 13182:17
  13183:21,22 13184:2
stance 13123:19
  13132:6
stand 13114:18
  13126:15 13189:17
standi 13097:3
  13132:21
standing 13108:19
  13117:25
stands 13107:20
  13134:5
start 13078:7,19
  13079:18 13081:5
  13084:3 13093:21
  13186:8 13189:23
started 13111:13
  13116:16,17
  13118:22 13119:25
  13123:6 13128:25
  13138:2 13158:4
  13165:23
starting 13078:13
  13105:18 13121:15
  13123:5 13158:5
state 13080:21 13084:1
  13087:1 13093:9
  13102:1,4,9,19
  13104:21 13107:16
  13110:2 13111:9
  13131:25 13141:6
```

13163:18.19 13183:6 statement 13097:16.22 13125:8,19,20 13129:22 13132:3 13136:18 13141:6 13144:11,14 13148:19,22 13161:25 13162:14 13163:4,8 13166:7,9 13169:16 13170:13 13171:4,8,8,13,16 13173:10 13174:22 13177:18 13179:19 13180:16,21 13181:8 13181:14 13182:22 13186:2,19,22,23 13187:10 13188:6,17 13189:6,7 13190:13 statements 13148:2 13162:6 13166:1,1,4 13166:12 13168:24 13169:3 13170:21,24 13175:20,23 13176:2 13176:5 13177:7,11 13188:1,2,3,8,11 states 13173:23 13174:15 **State-appointed** 13131:22 **stating** 13101:18 13170:17 **station** 13158:14,21 **stations** 13185:4 statistical 13102:7 stayed 13172:8 steps 13084:20 stood 13179:6 stop 13147:14 13174:19 stopped 13172:4,6 story 13079:22 13120:1 13124:19 13127:14 13128:10,15 strategies 13137:19 **streamline** 13190:1,6 **strikers** 13143:3 13175:3 **stronger** 13101:6 **strongest** 13107:10 **structure** 13130:5 struggle 13087:20 stun 13129:2 subject 13097:11 13175:25 13177:9 **submission** 13129:17 submissions 13094:5 **submit** 13087:1 **submitted** 13102:22 13132:8 13148:19 13151:19 13180:12 **subpoena** 13147:25 subpoenaed 13176:10 13176:14,15 subsequently 13101:25 13145:3,5 13146:5

stated 13079:11

13149:4.5 substantive 13107:18 **subtle** 13117:22 succeed 13110:11 succeeded 13111:2 sudden 13125:25 suddenly 13128:23 13129:7 suffered 13105:15 13113:2 suggest 13091:11 13112:18 13151:25 13189:23 suggested 13189:2 suggestion 13188:14 sui 13105:19 **summarise** 13106:9 **summary** 13126:16 13164:23 13166:25 13175:2 summed 13085:19 **summing** 13085:6 superintendent 13174:2,5,10,17 **support** 13123:23 13124:2 13127:5 13132:6,10,12 **supporting** 13096:14 13125:12 suppose 13094:1 13176:8 13177:1 **supposed** 13143:18 13155:14 sure 13078:21 13097:3 13097:14 13100:1 13123:10 13125:18 13172:19 13174:17 13183:7 surely 13174:11 13183:21 13185:12 surprising 13128:1 **survivors** 13097:19 **suspect** 13173:23 13174:3,6,16,19,20 13174:21,23 suspects 13152:25 13172:16 13173:21 sustainable 13116:7 sympathised 13119:5 system 13088:5

T

table 13151:22 tabulated 13151:21 tailor 13080:1 tainted 13112:9 take 13080:14 13081:24 13083:9 13084:19 13086:14 13091:14 13092:15 13094:15 13095:2 13110:10 13113:6,9 13113:14 13117:1 13131:13 13132:23 1314:11,17 13140:17 13142:2

space 13155:16

span 13103:15

13156:14 13157:1

13179:20

				Page
13145:8 13146:8,15	13180:2,21 13181:12	13174:12 13175:2,10	third 13084:19,23,25	13175:24 13176:24
13149:24 13159:10	13181:13 13182:21	13174:12 13175:2,10	13098:13 13152:25	13177:8,19
13166:6 13171:2	13185:3	13176:22,22 13178:9	13181:24	transcribe 13112:22
13177:25 13178:19	testified 13127:8	13179:9 13184:20	thirdly 13088:25	transcribed 13079:3,6
13189:23	13128:19,22	13186:15 13187:5,20	13140:19	13132:15
taken 13082:16	testifies 13186:4,6	13189:5,8,18 13190:7	thirteenth 13153:19	transcribers 13112:22
13100:8 13104:16	testify 13128:5	13190:9,11	thought 13098:4	transcript 13079:16
13125:25 13153:13	13158:14 13178:20	theme 13161:15	13148:8 13164:2	13095:23 13100:2
13166:1 13179:19	13187:11,12	13177:12	threat 13110:23	13112:18 13132:22
takes 13116:8,9,24	13188:23	thereof 13084:11	threatened 13182:4,8	13136:11,12
tale 13124:19	testifying 13099:5	13096:16 13115:21	13182:10	transcription 13079:12
talk 13084:7 13089:7	testimony 13097:19	thereto 13176:25	threatening 13137:10	translate 13109:22
13137:6 13139:22	13157:6	there's 13082:18	threats 13181:25	13126:14
13141:14,16 13143:6	texture 13090:18	13088:17,25 13089:1	three 13090:3 13104:25	transparent 13160:21
13157:9,15 13161:11	Thabo 13096:9	13089:18 13102:17	13104:25 13105:6	transpired 13120:12
talking 13087:16	Thando 13080:25	13103:16 13105:20	13126:4 13128:17	transport 13115:3
13089:8,12 13095:1	13166:2	13108:17 13110:3	Thursday 13100:8	travel 13155:13
13119:22 13133:12	thank 13078:9,12,24	13123:3 13143:24	time 13089:20	TRC 13119:20
13148:1,3 13161:13	13079:14,19	13172:18 13176:3	13092:15 13098:10	treated 13118:11
	•			
talks 13085:9 13114:15	13080:19,20 13081:3	13185:24 13189:16	13098:10 13116:18	treatment 13174:25
13170:9	13081:4 13082:9	they're 13078:16	13123:9,10 13134:13	trial 13106:11,20
targeted 13136:1	13083:4,21 13086:13	13079:21 13080:5	13137:2 13139:14	13111:16 13115:3
tariff 13084:22	13087:12,14	13087:14 13097:5	13141:9,9,12	trials 13107:15,19
task 13091:3 13120:15	13089:16 13093:16	13182:12	13143:14,20 13146:2	tribunals 13107:19
13121:22	13093:18 13097:8,22	they've 13078:5	13152:16 13153:21	tried 13172:10
tasked 13142:13	13097:23 13098:6,23	13097:3,22	13155:16 13156:16	13174:16
13158:6	13100:4,6,21 13105:9	thing 13086:21	13157:11 13158:14	trigger 13087:17
taskings 13159:5	13109:23 13110:12	13105:14 13118:12	13158:24 13159:4	trite 13092:1
13184:25	13110:13,20	13160:1 13161:11	13161:14 13162:13	triumvirate 13098:11
taught 13119:22	13112:23 13113:17	13183:5	13168:12,14,21	trivial 13090:17
te 13109:16	13113:21 13115:13	things 13089:21	13169:3,14 13171:24	true 13119:13
tea 13113:14	13116:14,14,23	13090:1 13099:10	13173:5 13179:22	13137:16
team 13147:3,7	13121:12 13123:16	13100:19 13101:20	13184:8 13189:16,22	trust 13139:25
13148:6 13171:15	13124:1 13125:17	13101:20 13115:21	timeframes 13089:15	trusted 13144:5
13172:15 13173:6,20	13132:13,22	13115:22,25 13117:7	times 13118:19	truth 13091:22
13183:4	13133:10,17,18,24	13118:5,14 13119:24	13141:15 13168:17	13097:18 13117:8,15
teargas 13129:2	13134:2,8,20,21,22	13124:22 13126:15	13185:9	13119:12,20
telephone 13141:12	13135:5 13142:25	13162:6 13173:13	today 13081:25	13123:14 13124:24
13142:10	13147:1 13148:11	think 13078:7,18	13119:2 13151:5	13125:23 13126:3
tell 13078:25 13079:2	13149:14 13150:6,12	13082:21 13083:5	toe 13109:13	try 13078:22 13116:19
13079:12 13082:1	13150:21 13171:20	13087:3 13090:8	toegeskryf 13109:12	13124:6
13090:23 13113:8	13176:1 13185:17	13094:10 13095:6	toegeskiyi 13109:12 toevertrou 13109:15	trying 13088:15
13116:21 13124:18	13170.1 13183.17	13094:10 13093:0	Toit's 13113:24	13125:5
13110.21 13124.16	thanks 13078:12		told 13086:12 13089:20	Tswana 13109:24
		13104:3 13108:12		
13184:3 13187:8	13083:22 13086:19	13114:24 13115:19	13128:10,15	13110:22
telling 13120:24	13145:12	13116:10 13118:17	13132:15 13134:18	Tuesday 13079:8
temporary 13099:21	that's 13079:22	13118:24 13121:5	13145:22 13163:23	Tupe 13182:11
tempting 13115:22,24	13081:20 13083:14	13133:18 13134:11	13168:3 13182:9,13	turn 13088:21
13116:5	13085:23 13086:1,20	13135:8 13136:22,25	13187:15	13115:10,10
ten 13150:25 13151:3	13093:11 13094:23	13141:6 13143:6,15	tolerance 13138:23	turned 13121:15
tense 13136:23	13095:25 13096:17	13145:9,16 13146:4	tolerant 13139:2	13122:2
13137:16	13097:4,6,25 13098:7	13147:12 13149:23	tomorrow 13079:7	TV 13153:3 13155:19
tenth 13153:13	13098:11,20 13099:1	13150:7,7 13151:3	13132:16 13189:24	twelfth 13153:17
term 13085:18	13103:7 13104:14	13159:17,19 13162:9	13190:10,24	twin-cab 13166:14
13105:25	13105:3,4,5,8,22	13162:11,15 13167:7	tongue 13119:9	13170:6,16,18
termism 13115:24	13108:1,15 13110:13	13167:20 13168:6,25	tool 13157:3	two 13084:3 13089:21
terms 13084:12	13111:9,18 13125:15	13169:8 13173:7,8,11	top 13088:9 13169:21	13099:17 13100:11
13094:9,11,12	13132:3 13133:11	13173:12 13174:21	13190:5	13108:3 13112:14
13101:21 13104:20	13135:8 13137:10,12	13175:13 13176:19	torched 13158:5	13116:9,25 13117:7
13105:25 13115:20	13140:23 13144:24	13178:4 13179:18	torpedo 13152:11	13120:10,13 13123:6
13117:6 13138:21	13145:9,11,14	13185:19 13190:16	touched 13108:25	13127:22 13128:15
13141:11,21	13163:22 13164:2,11	13190:18	Town 13110:14	13128:18 13139:21
13145:19 13154:13	13166:8 13169:8,10	thinking 13089:19	toxic 13099:1 13151:16	13144:6 13147:20
13154:17 13156:4	13170:2,18,22	13122:18 13127:18	13151:19 13154:4	13161:16 13163:14
13158:18 13160:1	13171:10 13173:17	thinks 13173:15	13156:6 13158:9,12	13165:19,25 13168:9
The state of the s	Photo Mark and Mark Special		1	
13161:2,6 13168:15	13173:19 13174:10	13189:14	13160:11 13161:7	13168:11.12 13169:7
13161:2,6 13168:15	13173:19 13174:10	13189:14	13160:11 13161:7	13168:11,12 13169:7

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

13169:18,19 13170:5 13170:20 13175:17 type 13098:25
U
ultimate 13090:19
umlungu 13140:13,14
13140:25
unable 13085:16
unarmed 13142:5
unbearably 13131:11
unbiased 13151:7,10
13151:14
uncertainty 13187:10
uncles 13131:4
unconstitutional
13084:18
uncontentious 13151:4
undeniable 13113:3
underestimated
13118:3
undergone 13130:8
undermines 13106:6
understand 13082:8
understand 13082:8 13092:6,7,18,21 13093:3 13095:4
13093:3 13095:4
13133:20 13138:7
13145:7,13 13146:3,7
13148:14 13150:2
13160:18 13164:9
13167:8 13169:18
13181:15 13185:8
13181:15 13185:8 13186:18,20
13189:21
understandable
13116:3
understanding
13097:10 13155:1
13184:8 13185:6
13184:8 13185:6 understood 13090:22 13127:16 13135:7
13127:16 13135:7
undertook 13136:9
unduly 13113:6
unenviable 13091:3
13120:14,15
unexpectedly 13110:6
unfair 13130:13
13149:23
unfortunately
13078:17 13083:17
13111:21
unidentified 13129:21
unintended 13118:9
13120:3
Union 13153:12,12
unions 13140:16
13143:18,21
13145:20 13161:6,9
unknown 13124:25
unlawful 13084:18
13126:8
unlawfully 13126:16
unpacking 13084:3
13093:11

```
unquote 13112:19,20
unreasonable 13173:7
unrepresented
  13147:22
unrest 13119:5
unscientifically
  13085:21
updated 13168:18
upheld 13150:4
  13162:17
use 13097:6 13102:15
  13129:1 13135:17
  13144:17,20 13145:8
  13153:1,3,7,10
  13156:25 13157:11
  13157:16
usual 13085:1
usurp 13181:19
utilise 13144:22
  13155:21,23 13156:1
  13157:4
utilised 13138:13
  13146:1 13184:24
          \mathbf{v}
v 13114:14
van 13109:9,10
  13111:9 13159:8
  13179:21 13185:1
vantage 13174:2
varies 13098:10
various 13151:1
vehicles 13158:5
veil 13119:4
veld 13173:24
venture 13091:9
verdediging 13109:14
  13109:15
Vermaak 13182:1
Veronica 13130:21
version 13088:4
  13098:24 13099:2,10
  13109:2 13125:4
  13127:5,7,15,25
  13129:5,6,8,10,12,13
  13131:2,7 13147:8,16
  13147:18.21 13148:5
  13148:17 13149:1.10
  13149:11.22
  13161:20 13163:2
  13168:20 13169:6
  13176:8,9,10,12
  13188:21,22
versions 13127:19,23
  13148:1,3 13165:7
versuim 13109:11
versus 13106:9 13107:1
  13107:3 13111:9
  13114:24
victims 13088:24
```

13091:6 13102:18,19

13118:21,23 13120:2

13127:4,11 13129:15

13117:23 13118:11

13123:3,16

video 13126:25

13136:21.24 view 13091:12 13101:1 13101:3.5 13102:2 13106:10 13124:15 13124:22 13127:2 13130:10 13131:3,12 viewed 13100:18 views 13136:20 violation 13131:20 **violence** 13136:3 13162:24 violent 13125:25 13126:21 13130:6 virtual 13093:17 **virtue** 13101:6 13154:15 visit 13146:23 vitiates 13106:6,16 **vitiating** 13106:22 **voice** 13122:3,6 volatile 13136:20 volition 13147:24 **volume** 13158:16 voluntarily 13147:24 voorbereid 13109:15 vulgar 13138:23 W **Wainwright** 13107:2,3 wait 13078:3 13164:19 waited 13188:3

Walker 13157:13 walks 13088:22 want 13080:13 13083:2 13083:2,8 13086:14 13088:23 13095:8 13098:15 13100:2 13108:4 13110:15 13112:18 13113:5,8 13113:23 13115:24 13117:22 13118:15 13118:22 13120:25 13122:6,10,23 13125:24 13136:5 13141:3 13144:12 13147:15 13149:15 13149:17 13151:4 13163:22 13166:6 13176:13 13178:4 13186:10 13187:7 13190:7 wanted 13086:21 13112:24 13116:10 13119:7,7 13121:24 13126:21 13134:21 13135:12 13136:2 13140:2 13141:12 13163:9 wants 13082:18 13108:2 13110:21 13141:14,16 13144:17 13168:6 13185:23 warning 13172:15 13173:21 wasn't 13162:8

13167:21 13186:22 Wasn't 13157:19 wasted 13189:15 wastepaper 13190:5 water 13152:12 wave 13100:7 wav 13092:12 13097:8 13105:13,18,24 13112:18 13118:8,10 13124:22 13129:6,13 13137:1,8 13139:3,11 13140:5 13147:19,25 13148:16 13149:18 13152:19 13156:9 13170:19 13178:5 13187:7 13188:25,25 13189:2,9 ways 13088:15,16 13139:15 13147:20 weapon 13139:8 weapons 13135:14,16 13135:19,22,25 13138:3,5,12,12,18 13138:18,24 13139:5 13139:17 13140:3 13163:19,22 week 13089:21 13101:5 13102:9 weeks 13090:3,7 13116:2 13123:11,11 **weighing** 13115:16 weight 13149:1 13150:2 well-known 13107:3 went 13115:10,14 13119:9 13141:1 13143:2 Western 13114:14 we'd 13081:2 13095:1 we'll 13078:20 13079:17,20 13086:19 13087:4,5 13087:12 13120:6 13123:4 13132:23 13134:11,12,14,17,17 13146:14,15,15 13186:24 13188:6 13189:15 we're 13078:13,24 13083:10,11,12 13087:11 13095:1 13123:24 13133:12 13170:1,23 13171:12 we've 13078:15 13080:13,18 13081:1 13081:11 13082:12 13085:21 13097:24 13099:12,16 13121:25 13134:3 13162:5 13166:24 13168:20 13169:24 13188:11 We're 13159:10 We've 13147:18

whatsoever 13149:2

what's 13098:5

13120:24 13144:8 13168:11 13173:9 13177:2 13185:9 whichever 13084:2 13093:10 13098:25 13133:4 13154:8 who's 13083:12 13088:19 13141:18 13176:8 13179:21 who've 13096:21 widespread 13107:11 widow 13119:4 13125:9 widows 13118:20 13119:22 wie 13109:14 **WILLIAM** 13135:1 13159:16 willingness 13145:8 win 13135:25 win-win 13135:14,24 wire 13161:19 13162:2 13162:11 wish 13080:21 13123:18 13133:22 13148:12 13162:22 wished 13163:5 wishes 13079:10 13132:19 13133:21 13134:9 13146:24 13176:9 13185:18 withdrawn 13099:18 witness 13099:4,6,9 13118:24 13129:21 13131:7 13136:17 13146:12 13147:5,5 13148:17,23 13149:2 13149:3 13152:2,13 13161:21 13162:9 13164:19 13170:8 13172:20,21,23 13173:8 13177:23 13178:18 13179:4,12 13185:18 13186:3,11 13187:20 13188:11 13188:12,16,17,21 13189:7.13.17 witnessed 13128:4 witnesses 13099:24 13110:2,3 13127:8,16 13127:25 13128:6 13130:22 13141:4 13147:15,18 13149:9 13149:13 13175:22 13178:20 13187:25 13188:1,5,8,15 witness's 13176:20 13186:25 witness's 13147:16 wonder 13152:12 13184:11 13187:22 wondering 13152:8 **Wonderkop** 13101:10 won't 13112:17,22 13142:22 word 13097:6,8

unprofessional 13137:1

13139:13

13109:12 13133:16
13173:8 13174:17
wording 13100:18
words 13084:23
13085:3,20 13106:19
13112:5 13125:20
13133:13 13138:23
13147:24 13178:4
work 13124:7 13134:12
13149:10 13154:13
13154:15 13155:5,15
13155:20,24
13156:11 13158:2
13161:1 13183:4
13190:3
worked 13103:1
13154:15 13156:15
worker 13137:6
workers 13087:25
13147:8 13168:22
working 13085:24
13160:14 13189:9
worlds 13135:8
worms 13105:9
worst 13090:7
worth 13122:7
wouldn't 13110:24
13118:9
wounds 13108:19
written 13079:4
wrong 13168:25
13169:20 13187:14
13190:15
X
X 13129:20,20
13130:15,19,24
Xhosa 13110:16

X
X 13129:20,20
13130:15,19,24
Xhosa 13110:16
Xolani 13137:6

yawning 13120:7 year 13102:13,14 years 13123:10 Yelani 13111:9 yesterday 13087:24 13099:23.25 13100:3 13108:13.25 13117:2 13118:20 13120:13 13122:9 13135:6.9 vield 13099:21 vou'd 13082:4 13190:4 vou'll 13100:22 13120:20 13145:18 13183:8 you're 13078:8,25 13079:2 13081:8,24 13081:25 13089:8,12 13092:6,8,10,11,24 13093:13 13100:5 13120:21,23 13134:25 13135:2 13145:7 13146:12 13159:15 13167:20 13173:13 13176:19 13177:1,9

```
you've 13098:5
  13179:15 13183:15
  13190:3
```

 \mathbf{Z} Zaneka 13125:9 Zvl 13159:8 13179:21 13185:1 **Z1** 13136:24

000 13103:6 **09:31** 13078:2

1 13084:12 13085:9 13088:7 13094:8 13098:7 13100:18,22 13100:24 13101:7,8 13101:19 13106:8 13108:7 13114:15 13126:4 13127:11 13153:5,15 13171:7 **1A** 13081:20,21 13084:10 13102:24 1st 13104:8 **1-8** 13136:12 **1:30** 13182:15 13184:20 **10** 13083:3,7,11 13099:23 13100:8 13158:13 13159:19 10th 13165:19,23 13166:14,16 13167:1 13167:6,13,16,16 **10:02** 13087:8 10:22 13098:6 **10:41** 13106:2 **100** 13123:9 **11** 13102:1 13113:7 13166:24 13181:13 **11:29** 13113:19 **115** 13102:17 13103:20 13103:22 **12** 13086:1 13099:3 13105:10 13134:12 13160:4 13166:24 13182:22 **12-gauge** 13174:7 **12:09** 13130:10 12:34 13134:24 **12:54** 13143:13 **13** 13103:12 13139:10 13151:17,25 13152:21 13160:5 13166:24 13th 13128:17 13135:7 13136:10 13140:14 13140:20 13144:7

13154:17 13156:2

13162:23 13163:5

13171:11 13172:1

13182:24

13164:24 13165:24

13166:17 13167:6,21

13175:1,2 13182:1,2

14 13163:14.16.17 14th 13140:9 13153:13 **14:01** 13146:18 14:20 13156:13 14:30 13159:14 **14:50** 13168:11 **15** 13113:15 15th 13143:17 13158:8 **15:10** 13179:16 15:29 13188:19 **158** 13114:1 **16** 13101:5,16 13166:24 16th 13100:25 13101:10 13124:17 13144:6,15 13145:6 13146:7 13153:14,16 13156:3 13159:4,23 13161:18 13182:16 13184:20,23 **164** 13114:15 **18** 13085:23,25 13103:15 13136:12

19 13106:17 **2** 13084:18 13085:7,10 13101:13 13109:4 13126:7 13146:16 13154:16 13172:1 **20** 13103:1,3 13134:12 **2002** 13136:13 13139:11 **2003** 13114:15 **201.50** 13088:6 **2012** 13085:15 13101:5 13101:10,17 13128:17 2012/2013 13102:13 **2013** 13078:1 13084:2 13085:15,17,17

21st 13080:4 22 13113:25 22-28B 13114:3 22-28C 13114:13 **24** 13103:14 13150:18 13161:10 **25** 13150:18 25th 13084:2 13099:13 25/26 13093:10 **250** 13094:13

2013/2014 13102:14

26 13084:8,8 26th 13084:2 13095:18 13095:22 13099:14 **272** 13094:14 13100:15

28 13181:13 28B 13113:25 **29** 13078:1

3 **3** 13111:8 13114:25 13126:10 13136:18 13155:6 13172:7 13182:17 13183:21 13183:22 13184:2

30 13171:17 13185:22

300 13094:8.24 **34** 13101:11 **350** 13095:2 **36** 13103:18 13109:7 39 13103:13,14

4 13155:19 13170:9,10 13172:12 13173:15 4.4 13103:13 43 13164:14,17,23 48 13164:23

5 **5** 13155:24 13173:23 **51** 13169:8,25 13181:8 **54** 13103:18,18 **542** 13107:4

6 **6** 13099:8,12 13156:7 13159:22 13174:4,5 **6am** 13153:16 **6.1** 13103:17 **67** 13183:8,10

7 **7** 13099:15 13156:25 **78** 13094:11

8 **8** 13099:15 13106:1 13157:10 806 13111:11 **83** 13102:14

9 13079:7 13099:19 13101:5,16 13132:15 13158:1 13189:23 13190:10,24 9th 13124:17