RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 119 19 AUGUST 2013 PAGES 12248 TO 12289



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Page 12250

Page 12248

[PROCEEDINGS ON 19 AUGUST 2013]

- 2 [14:04] CHAIRPERSON: We are starting later today
- 3 than we'd originally intended to because Advocate Semenya,
- 4 the leading counsel for the police service's mother died
- last week and he and the members of the SAPS team were at 5
- her funeral this morning as was Commissioner Tokota. They 6
- 7 requested us, therefore, to start at 2 o'clock this
- 8 afternoon which we agreed to. I'm sure all those
- 9 associated with the Commission will join with me in
- 10 extending our condolences to the Semenya family for the
- 11 loss of Advocate Semenya's mother and we hope and pray that
- her soul will rest in peace with light perpetually shining 12
- upon it. We hope that what we said will be conveyed to 13
- Advocate Semenya and the family. This morning the 14
- 15 Constitutional -
- SPEAKER: Sorry, Mr Chairman, before you 16
- proceed. 17
- 18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, forgive me.
- 19 SPEAKER: On behalf of SAPS legal team
- 20 and the Semenya family we would like to say thanks for the
- indulgence that we were granted to allow us to go to the 21
- funeral of our colleague's mother and we will also convey 22
- 23 the message.

1

- 24 CHAIRPERSON: This morning the
- 25 Constitutional Court handed down its judgment in the

- course, the answer is no then we will have to have a
- meeting to consider, with the parties as to in what way of
- working with the Commission should be altered to
- accommodate the fact. And we would seek at the meeting to
- 5 find a way of ensuring that the report ultimately produced
- 6 by the Commission is not one sided. But that's a matter
- 7 which may in fact fall away if the potential donor sees its
- 8 way to clear to make the funding available. It would
- 9 render these proceedings more inclusive than they would
- 10 otherwise be. Do you wish to say anything, Mr Mpofu?
 - MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you very much,
- 12 Chairperson, thank you. As I indicated, Chairperson, we
- 13 are here solely just to report back as you've already
- 14 touched on the issue of the Constitutional Court and also
- 15 to maybe map out what the way forward is in terms of our
- 16 instructions from clients. But before I touch on those
- 17 matters, Chairperson, which is the Constitutional Court and
- 18 the instructions of client, I'd like to just indicate that
- 19 we are grateful for the efforts that the commissioners have
- 20 made and we hope that once the decision is taken we will
- 21 have an opportunity to meet with the potential donors.
- 22 Obviously just to iron out the terms of that funding but
- 23 for now it's simply to say thank you to the commissioners
- 24 for those efforts.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofu.

Page 12249

- application brought by the arrested and injured miners for
- relief in respect of the funding they sought for their 2
- 3 costs in respect of their continued participation in the
- 4 proceedings of the Commission. The judgment in paragraph
- 5 19 of the judgement it is stated that the application was
- 6 dismissed. But that doesn't bring the matter before us, as
- 7 far as the funding is concerned, to an end because as I
- 8 have indicated previously, I was informed that there is a
- 9 possible donor who is contemplating providing funding for
- 10 the arrested and injured miners. It was anticipated that
- the decision of the possible donor would already have been 11
- 12 reached but I was informed this morning that the final
- 13 decision will be made tomorrow, and that I would be
- informed by close of business tomorrow afternoon whether 14
- 15 the answer would be yay or nay. I understand that counsel
- 17 here, prepared to continue with the cross-examination of
- 18
- 19 me to be appropriate that they should be permitted to be
- cross-examined. I see Mr Mpofu is here, depending upon the
- 21 decision of the donor, or he may well be back in a funded
- capacity as it were and if he is, he will of course, have 22
- the opportunity of reading the transcript of what's going
- 24 to happen today. Although I don't know how long he's going
- to be with us this afternoon and tomorrow. And if, of

1

12

- 16 for Lieutenant Baloyi and counsel for the Monene family are
- Major-General Mpembe and in the circumstances it seems to

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12251

- MR MPOFU: More particularly a question
- that will arise, which is linked to what I'm going to say
- 3 is whether that funding is in the nature of the interim
- 4 funding that we were talking about or whether it is more
- 5 long term. But those are matters that obviously will be
- 6 ironed out with the funder at the right time. And I say
- 7 that, Chairperson, because the Constitutional Court, in its
- 8 wisdom, decided the matter as you have seen, on the basis
- 9 that it was confined to part A of the application which was
- 10 just the issue of the interim funding. Our own view -
- 11 unfortunately we were not given a hearing, the
- Constitutional Court is entitled to make a decision on 13 their papers. Had we been given that hearing we would have
- 14 indicated that our own view and that in concurrence with
- 15 the counsel for the President and the Minister was that the
- 16 appeal would have been heard on both part A and part B and
- 17 the matter would have been finalised. But unfortunately we
- 18 didn't have that opportunity. And that therefore means
- 19 that - and I've just had a discussion, the counsel for the
- 20 President and the Minister called me about an hour ago,
- 21 also he was equally surprised but felt that what this means
- 22 now is that the Constitutional Court in so many ways has 23 said that it doesn't want to pre-empt the review
- 24 application itself which is part B. So what has happened,
- unfortunately is now to resuscitate that part of the

- application, which means that effectively the
- Constitutional Court is sending us back to the High Court 2
- 3 for the review application, for part B. And in fairness
- 4 the Constitutional Court did say that this decision does
- 5 not pre-empt the outcome of the main application. But what
- 6 it does mean, Chairperson, with your permission just to
- 7 explain, what it does mean is that we are back to square
- one where the issue of interim funding then surfaces. In 8
- 9 other words what should happen between -

10 CHAIRPERSON: To interrupt you, my understanding from what I've heard from the potential donor 11 is it mightn't - what is envisaged might not be limited to 12

13 interim funding.

14

15

16

17

18

1

10

12

14

15

MR MPOFU: Yes. Well it might, or it might not, Chairperson, if we decide to pursue the main application then of course the question - all I'm saying is that the question that arises what happens between now and

then? And I must add, Chairperson, the parties by

- 19 agreement in the amended notice of motion had said that the
- 20 part B should be on an expedited basis. So the question
- 21 that arises is assuming we'll get an expedited date,
- assuming the instructions will be to pursue part B, what 22
- 23 then happens between tomorrow and that date? And as
- 24 Chairperson has correctly pointed out part of the answer to
- 25 that question might be whatever discussions we then have
 - Page 12253
 - with the donor. Another part is the instructions which I
- 2 will talk about just now. And maybe, Chairperson, because
- 3 already there have been some disturbing reporting on the
- 4 outcome of the Constitutional Court, in fairness it is to
- 5 explain that it was only on part A but that also in
- paragraphs 15 and 16 of the Constitutional Court judgment -6

7 CHAIRPERSON: In view of the fact that a 8 number of people in the courts who haven't heard or seen

9 what's in those paragraphs and I take it there may well be

many people watching these proceedings on YouTube or on

11 television, it perhaps would be helpful if you read those

paragraphs out so that they and everybody could in fact be

13 aware of what the CC has said in that regard.

MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. Yes, thank you, Chairperson. Paragraph 15 of the judgment says

16 the following, "It may be that it would be commendable and

17 fairer to the applicants that they be afforded legal

18 representation at state expense in circumstances where

- 19 state organs are given these privileges and where mining
- corporations are able to afford the huge legal fees
- 21 involved. The power to appoint a commission of inquiry is
- mandated by the Constitution. It is afforded by the 22
- President as part of his executive powers. It is open to
- 24 the President to search for the truth through a commission.
- The truth so established could inform corrective measures

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12254

- if any are recommended, influence future policy, execution
- 2 action, executive action and even the initiation of
- 3 legislation." It goes on to say "A commission search for
- 4 truth also serves indispensable accountability and
- transparency purposes. Not only do the victims of the
- 6 events investigated and those closely affected need to know
- 7 the truth, the country at large does too. So ordinarily a
- 8 functionary setting up a commission has to ensure an
- 9 adequate opportunity to all who should be heard by it."

10 And the Constitutional Court goes on "Absent a

11 fair opportunity the search for truth and the purpose of

12 the Commission may be compromised." And paragraph 16,

13 Chairperson, it says "This means" - the Constitutional

14 Court then says "This means that unfairness may arise when

15 adequate legal representation is not afforded." And then

16 it says, "But this doesn't mean that courts have the power

17 to order the executive branch of government on how to

18 deploy state resources. And whether the desirable

19 objective of equality of arm before a commission translates

20 into a right to legal representation that must be provided

21 at State expense is a contestable issue. A consideration

22 that comes into play is that it is the object of the Legal 23

Aid Act to render or make available legal aid to indigent 24

persons and to provide legal representation at State expense as contemplated in the Constitution. It's

Page 12255

- provisions have not been challenged as constitutionally
 - invalids nor has the refusal by Legal Aid, South Africa to
 - 3 grant the applicants legal aid been challenged on review."
 - 4 Thank you, Chairperson. Chairperson, I'm grateful for the
 - 5 indulgence. I'm reading through that, it should be made
 - 6 clear that the question which the Constitutional Court says
 - 7 is contestable which is whether such legal representation 8 should be provided at State expense is still open and it is

 - 9 the question that will be subject to instructions debated
 - 10 when the part B of the application is heard, hopefully on
 - 11 an expedited basis.

MR MPOFU:

13

12 CHAIRPERSON: If it becomes necessary.

Should it become necessary, 14 that's correct. Now the last issue then, Chairperson that

15 I would like to deal with is the guestion of - as you can

16 see our clients arrived at the Constitutional Court and

17 between the delivery of the judgment and now we have been

18 consulting with them.

[14:24] Those consultations are ongoing, Chairperson, but

20 so far I can just mention that their feeling is that

firstly they would have preferred it if they had been given

a hearing to air their views. Whether they win or lose the

23 application is something else but to have been given the

24 opportunity and for that reason they seem inclined at this

stage to want to pursue part B but that was before the news

that we got here. So obviously that will now be

- incorporated into the consultations. They have also asked 2
- 3 us to, or rather instructed my attorneys to seek permission
- 4 for them to hold a peaceful demonstration or gathering for
- 5 lack of a better word, and that is a matter that we are
- also consulting with them and they indicated that they 6
- 7 might be holding a peaceful march to the Union Buildings
- among other places in pursuit of their rights to legal 8
- 9 representation at state expense. But all those matters

will also, I suppose, be incorporated on the outcome of the 10

discussions we'd have with the funders. But those are our

12 instructions at this stage, Chairperson.

There is, of course, still the prospect of it being settled even before we could go to court. But unfortunately, Chairperson, then the most important part of our instructions are that until all those issues are resolved, whether in court or in the streets or with the discussions with the donor or whatever, until there is funding on the table their position is that they their participation will be provisionally withdrawn or rather

20 21 they'll continue with the provisional withdrawal of their

22 participation.

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

23

24

25

1

18

But, Chairperson, as usual when we asked them to give us an opportunity to come to this forum so that we can

say exactly rather than leaving it to speculation, they

Page 12258

- they did was a very touching move where they circulated
- 2 buckets to collect money, or a collection to assist the
- 3 legal team and people were putting R5, R10, whatever they
- 4 could. And I don't think the money - we've entrusted the
- money to Bishop Seoka and I don't know if he has already
- 6 counted it but the issue's not really how much it is. I
- 7 think that the mere fact that they should make that gesture
- 8 also indicates the fact that they want the commission, as
- 9 soon as possible, to continue and to find the truth and for
- 10 them to get the closure that is needed. Thank you,

Chairperson.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofu. Mr 13 Gumbi, are you in a position to cross-examine the Major-

14 General?

11

15

17

MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson but I think my learned colleagues will start first. There are certain information on -

18 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you,

19 that's your colleague Advocate Masevhe.

20 MS MASEVHE: Yes that's correct,

21 Chairperson, we are ready to proceed.

22 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON:

MR MPOFU:

23 MR MPOFU: But before any proceedings, in 24 case I overstep my mandate, could we be excused. Thank

you, Chairperson, for the opportunity.

Page 12257

- kindly allowed us to come and brief the Commission on the
- 2 status quo. Thank you, I appreciate the opportunity.
- 3 Sorry, Chairperson, I've just been given an instruction. A
- 4 small thing, just to say, well two things, Chairperson, one
- 5 might seem unrelated. As the Chairperson knows that on
- 6 Friday was the commemoration service of the victims. It
- 7 turns out that there were two commemoration services and
- 8 just happy to report, Chairperson, that everything went
- 9 smoothly and the statement was made there and I would like
- to repeat it now that the people who are criticising the 10
- commission should exercise some restraint and we made it 11 12 clear that it is not your fault or the commissioners' fault
- 13 that the delays have happened, Chairperson. And also that
- 14 it's unfair to criticise a judge by commentators, some of 15
- whom have never even been here because a judge is not able
- 16 to answer for himself and I think the big crowd that was
- 17 there appreciated those remarks, Chairperson. And we made the point very clear that our confidence in the commission
- 19 remains unshaken. We wouldn't be doing all these efforts
- to get funding and to get legal representation into a
- 21 commission that we believed was a waste of time. That
- 22 would be a contradiction in terms and I just wanted to say
- that those remarks were appreciated, Chairperson. The last
- point, Chairperson, that I've been asked to mention is that
- 25 the congregation that met on Friday among the things that

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 6 7

5

1

- [14:45] CHAIRPERSON:
- [COMMISSION ADJOURNS

here, I don't know whether they want to go as well.

so they can all leave and then we can re-assemble.

Perhaps we should take a short adjournment for five minutes

I'm informed that the

COMMISSION RESUMES1

Yes thank you, Chairperson.

You've got a lot of clients

Page 12259

- interpreter has gone across the courtyard and will be
- 8 interpreting to those who wish to receive the benefit of
- the interpretation in the room opposite where the 10
- 11 simultaneous translation equipment has been set up. Major-
- 12 General, you're still under oath. It's a long time ago
- 13 that you took the oath. Perhaps you should take it again.
- 14 Stand up, please. Do you swear the evidence you'll give
- 15 before the Commission, the further evidence you'll give
- 16 before the Commission will be the truth, the whole truth,
- 17 nothing but the truth. Please raise your right hand, say,
- 18 "I swear, so help me God."
- 19 WILLIAM MPEMBE: I swear, so help me God.
 - CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Please sit
- down. Ms Milwesi, you're going to sorry, Ms Masevhe, I
- must get it right -
 - MS MASEVHE:
- Yes, Chairperson, I'm here

24 now.

20

23

- 25 CHAIRPERSON:
- Ms Masevhe, I got it right

19

1

2

3

4

Page 12260

the second time. Please begin with your cross-examination of the witness. 2

3 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS MASEVHE: 4 you, Chairperson. Just for the record, my name is Takalani

5 Masevhe. I represent the family of Warrant-Officer Hendrik

Tsietsi Monene, the warrant-officer who was murdered on the 6

7 13th of August 2013. General, good afternoon.

8 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Good afternoon,

9 Advocate.

14

15

16

17

18

10 MS MASEVHE: Yes, General, I would like to take you back - or I see my colleagues for the South 11 12 African Police Services would like to mention something, 13 Chairperson.

CHAIRPERSON: Yes, they can do so. I thought they might be going to tell you that it was 2012 when your client's relative was killed, but if there is anything else they want to say, they must say it now or forever hold their peace.

19 MR NGALWANA: Chairperson, I want to say 20 this on the record, so it's rather a challenge when this -21 ah, there it's come out now. Chairperson, sorry for the 22 interruption. I had a brief conversation with my two 23 learned friends who are about to cross-examine now. It's

24 not an objection; it's perhaps something of guidance that I

25 would seek from the Commission. Usually when a crossPage 12262

there? And the weight of the evidence is a matter to be

considered as well, but anyway, we'll deal with that when

we get there. I did understand from Mr Gumbi that he's got

some documents which he will be giving you before he cross-

5 examines. He hasn't done so yet, so your position will be

6 covered as far as he is concerned. You heard what Mr

7 Ngalwana said; please commence with your cross-examination.

MS MASEVHE: Thank you, Chairperson.

9 Although it's a definite sure thing that our cross-

10 examination is going to cover the statement of two

11 witnesses that have been circulated to various parties, and

12 while it's true that those witnesses are not going to be

13 called by us, but they are going to be called by Adv Mpofu.

14 We have canvassed this issue with the evidence leaders and

15 our view, if I might add at this stage, is that if Mr Mpofu

for an example doesn't want to call the specific witnesses,

17 there are statements which are before this Commission and

we believe that we should be able to deal with the contents in as far as it relates to our client, or the circumstances

20 wherein he was killed, with the General. Otherwise if we

21 don't do it we lose this opportunity with the General at

22 this stage, and -

23 CHAIRPERSON: The statements have been

24 filed. I understand that if Mr Mpofu doesn't call them

they may well be called by the evidence leaders in any

Page 12261

1 examiner cross-examines a witness, one of the things he or

2 she does is to put the version of his or her witness to the

3 cross-examinee. Now as I understand it, none of the

4 statements on which my two colleagues are going to cross-

5 examine were deposed to by their witnesses. These are Mr

Mpofu's witnesses. I checked with Mr Mpofu about whether 6

7 or not he's going to call these witnesses so that we can

8 test their version and their evidence under cross-

9 examination. I thought I was going to do this on record

while he was here, but he sprung it on me when he decided 10

no, we are going to step out. So I pulled him by his 11

17 18 with that problem as and when it arises. Of course we have the other problem that if the cross-examiner doesn't put

what the witness says because the witness may not come and

21 the witness then does come, then your client has got to be

22 recalled. So one way to deal with it might be to disregard

that part of the cross-examination based upon statements

24 put by a witness who ultimately doesn't come, but anyway,

25 shall we cross that bridge when we get there, if we get

12 jacket sleeve and asked him a question, and he said well, 13 we're not sure; we may, we may not, and so it puts a little 14 bit of a quandary if a cross-examiner is going to use a 15 statement of a witness who may not be called, we would have no way of testing that in cross-examination. 16 CHAIRPERSON: Well, perhaps you will deal

That is correct.

Page 12263

CHAIRPERSON: So anyway, proceed in the meanwhile and as and when there's an objection we can deal

6 with it.

event.

Chairperson.

7 MS MASEVHE: Thank you, Chairperson. 8

General, on the 7th of June 2013 when you were testifying in 9 chief you testified that you saw Warrant-Officer Monene

10 being chopped and killed in front of you. Do you recall

11 that part of your evidence, General?

MS MASEVHE:

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct.

Chairperson.

And you further testified, MS MASEVHE: General, that you saw how Warrant-Officer Lepaaku was

killed. Do you recall that as well?

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct,

Chairperson.

MS MASEVHE: For ease of reference, that is contained on the record, page 11813, line 4 to 8. I'm not going to read it out. General, the family of Warrant-Officer Monene is particularly interested in finding out

23 that, you know, leading to the event where he was killed,

24 was he entrapped within this group of protesters? General,

my question is that was he entrapped by the protesters,

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

22

Page 12264 Page 12266 that is Warrant-Officer Monene, when he was killed? then we can ask someone - I think the attorney for the 2 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, maybe police services helped us in the past - to pace out the if I may be explained what is meant by "entrapped"? 3 distance. He did it very well last time, so I'm sure he'll 4 MS MASEVHE: Encircled by the group of repeat his success. Can you indicate to us more or less in protesters when he was killed. 5 5 the council chamber how far away you were from Mr Monene, CHAIRPERSON: 6 6 Lieutenant Monene, when he was being attacked? I think the point is the 7 7 people were around him and he couldn't get out, so in that Approximately. 8 8 sense he was trapped there, and then he was then killed. MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, as I 9 9 So what they want to know from you, is that what you saw? indicated last that I'm very weak in what, in measurements, 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 10 but I remember -Chairperson, the 11 CHAIRPERSON: 11 protesters, they, Warrant-Officer Monene was out of the I understand that, but 12 12 Nyala and when they were attacked I couldn't see whether we're not asking you for mathematical precision. You know, 13 more or less a distance between you and that side of the 13 there were protesters behind him. The only incident where 14 I remember is that the protesters were coming from the 14 table, you and the other side of the table, or distance 15 front and there might also be the others that were on the 15 between you and Adv Budlender, or counsel for the police, side, but at the back there were the police. So at this 16 or how far, more or less? 16 17 stage one could not say that he was entrapped. 17 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, from 18 MS MASEVHE: Okay, General, how many that seat and I think somewhere here, that could be the 19 protesters did you see each hacking and killing Warrant-19 distance. I was on the other far side -20 Officer Lepaaku and Warrant-Officer Monene, if you recall 20 CHAIRPERSON: That seat, I'm not sure 21 at all? How many did you see? 21 which one you refer to. 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Let's say the Chairperson, one 23 could not count them, but there was a group of protesters. 23 first seat on the other side -24 I could not count to say how many, but there were many who 24 CHAIRPERSON: Oh, the back row -25 attacked Warrant-Officer Monene. 25 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Ves Page 12265 CHAIRPERSON: Can you give us an 1 CHAIRPERSON: The back row indication, you say they attacked him; did they attack him 2 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: the, he was on the extreme left-hand side and there was a with pangas or with spears or assegais? What weapons did 3 they use? Nyala behind him and the Nyala also moved there. That's MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 5 how I remember. Chairperson, the instruments that I saw there were pangas, inculas, and they 6 CHAIRPERSON: So the distance is from the 7 also utilised knobkieries. back row to where? 8 CHAIRPERSON: Approximately how many? MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: And to that table

1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 You know, you say you can't give us the exact number, but you know, was it two or three? Was it half a dozen or was 10 11 it a dozen or more than that? Approximately how many 12 people were attacking him? 13 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, 14 approximately I can count from five up, plus or minus five, 15 and the only thing that I know also, they took his firearm. And General, how far were 16 MS MASEVHE: 17 you from this attack? 18 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I was 19 not so much closer nor far, but I could see what is 20 happening. I was at a reasonable distance from them. 21 MS MASEVHE: Can you maybe indicate, 22 General, by indication of metres?

It's sometimes easier to

CHAIRPERSON:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

ask him if he can point out in the auditorium, in the

council chamber more or less what the distance was, and

23

Page 12267 And then it was on 9 there. 10 CHAIRPERSON: Is that the table -11 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: It's one, the 12 second table -13 CHAIRPERSON: The second table, yes, I 14 see, from the back. 15 SPEAKER: 15. 1-5. 16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. So 17 there you have the answer; approximately 15 paces. 18 MS MASEVHE: Thank you, Chairperson. And 19 General, if you were at the distance of 15 metres, what prevented you and your colleagues from trying to ward off 21 these protesters from hacking Warrant-Officer Monene to 22 death? 23 CHAIRPERSON: Were there people in 24 between, or were there people between Warrant-Officer Monene and you at the time the hacking was taking place?

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

2

3

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

Page 12270

Chairperson, as I

Page 12268 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, as I been warded off, I also called off the police not to follow 1 2 them. 2 said, the people that were there is Lieutenant Baloyi, who 3 3 was also under attack, and others they were in a Nyala, and MS MASEVHE: Okay. General, in the event 4 there were some few that were outside. So others, as I that this Commission finds that the people who attacked indicated with my drawings, they were at the back. 5 Warrant-Officer - or let me put it rather, who murdered CHAIRPERSON: 6 You say at the back, you 6 Warrant-Officer Monene and Warrant-Officer Lepaaku should 7 7 see, but the question you're being asked is was it possible be prosecuted, will you be in a position to can identify for you to run forward to where the attack was taking place 8 these attackers, General? 8 9 9 and assist in warding off the attack? MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 10 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 10 said, they attacked the Warrant-Officer in such a manner Chairperson, the 11 attack would have been warded off and as it has been seen 11 that there were a group of five, upwards. But the only way 12 that one will be able to identify them is in accordance 12 on the video, there was tear smoke and I think that also 13 13 played a major role, and then the protesters moved with the with the circumstantial evidence. For example, we know 14 14 tear smoke to attack the police, and they were very close that the firearm of Warrant-Officer Monene was taken and I 15 nearer when they attacked the members, and I think that know the people that I spoke with them during the played the major role in terms of how those police were negotiation, and if anything like that firearm which was 16 17 17 the firearm of Warrant-Officer Monene can be found in attacked. 18 MS MASEVHE: General, how did you - I possession. I can place the person on the scene. Correct. 19 would assume that you were with a group of other police Chairperson, but with regard to me having communicated with 20 officers. Is that correct? Were you in a group of other 20 them earlier, and then also other materials that could be 21 21 found in possession of that suspect. police officers? Were you with other police officers when this happened? 22 CHAIRPERSON: 22 I understand people have 23 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. 23 been arrested and charged in respect of this incident. Is 24 24 Chairperson. that correct? 25 25 MS MASEVHE: Now how did you and these MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Page 12269

other police officers evade, you know, this attack at the scene? Because it seems like the police were being

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

attacked. How did you then survive this attack? question of surviving. I think all of us we could also have been attacked, maybe been reached. It was the question that Warrant-Officer Monene was more closer than And General, why didn't you or other officers, or rather you instruct other officers to

fire live ammunition or do something in order to ward off 11 12 these protesters? Why was it difficult to do that? 13 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, it's 14 not an easy instruction to say "fire," because each member 15 when he is under imminent attack, they know that he has to 16 defend himself, and as I have indicated from where I was, 17 the member had a firearm. There were also other members 18 nearer to him, and in such circumstances the member can

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE:

the other police officers.

MS MASEVHE:

19 utilise his own discretion and the attack to the member should be seen by the member, that the attack is unlawful 21 and is imminent. So under those circumstances, but what I

22 can say is that I did make sure that the police officials

also, we ran to the place to assist those members that were attacked, and hence there was a time where the protesters

25 left the scene, and when I realised that the attack has

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Correct,

Page 12271 1 Chairperson. 2 The question really COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: 3 was whether you would be able to identify them if you see them again. 5 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: The answer is yes, on the ground that I did communicate with them and also for 7 the fact that they are being found in possession of the 8 firearm of Warrant-Officer Monene. 9 CHAIRPERSON: Of course you communicated 10 with the whole group of them, didn't you? We saw it on the video, and so at that stage you didn't know which of them 11 12 was the one who, or were the ones who were going to attack 13 Warrant-Officer Monene. As far as the firearm is concerned, that is, you correctly say, would be

circumstantial evidence. The real question is, will you be

attacking Warrant-Officer Monene, and it sounds from what

you say as if the answer to that one would be no, you won't

be able to go that far in your evidence. Is that correct?

able to say I saw that person as one of the people

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson. MS MASEVHE: General, let's go back to your arrival at Marikana. You testified that on your arrival at Marikana the Lonmin management had informed you of the violence that had occurred in the few days before

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 12275

Page 12272 the 13th. Is that correct? 2 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. 3 Chairperson. 4 MS MASEVHE: And you further testified 5 that Brigadier Calitz had informed you that on the 12th of August the protesters had hacked and killed two Lonmin 6 7 security, that is Mr Mabelane and Mr Hasaan Fundi. Is that correct? 8 9 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. Chairperson. 10 [15:04] MS MASEVHE: 11 Now General, knowing the 12 violence that there had occurred in these few days before 13 the 13th, what measures were put in place by the police to 14 ensure the safety of the police officers who were attending 15 to the protesters on the 13th of August? 16 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I did 17 indicate that the commanders, and in particular I did 18 mention Lieutenant-Colonel Merafe, that the members of 19 different units had bulletproofs, and it's also the 20 commander and the members' responsibility to have the 21 bulletproof. Secondly is that they were orientated on the 22 place and Colonel Merafe indicated that because he is 23 working with them, he will continue orientating them. The

correct? We have photographs of them. You don't have to look at them, but the one was hacked and stabbed to death, and the other was hacked and shot. Now can you tell us whether Warrant-Officer Monene was the one who was shot as well as being hacked, or was he the one who was stabbed as well as being hacked? 6 7 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, he 8 was hacked and he was also shot. 9 MS MASEVHE: Now General, I would like to 10 refer the Commission to the revised witness statement of 11 Simphiwe Booi, Mr Simphiwe Booi, which is exhibit BBB3 on 12 page 7, paragraph 33, that is - I don't know if you are in possession of the said statement. It's exhibit BBB3. 13 14 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct, 15 Chairperson, I am in possession of the statement. MS MASEVHE: Now General, would you like 16 17 to look at page 7 of that statement, paragraph 33? 18 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Yes, Chairperson, 19 I'm on page 7, paragraph -20 CHAIRPERSON: Would I be correct in 21 thinking this statement hasn't yet been put as an exhibit? 22 Is that correct? 23 MS PILLAY: Chair, it's exhibit BBB3. 24 CHAIRPERSON: BBB3, oh, thank you. I was wrong then. Thank you.

members, there were also National Intervention members,

members were issued, as I have indicated, there were

different units on that day, that's Public Order Policing

- there were also TRT members, and members of the Public 2
- 3 Order Policing also had pistols on themselves. So those
- 4 were the measures that were taken in order to protect the
- 5 members.

24

25

1

6

7

8

9

Chairperson, I did indicate that I attended the place personally; I applied a situational appropriateness to ensure that there is no unnecessary confrontation with the protesters, and that also made us in terms of the 10 measures that they were there, made me also to believe that 11 the members were safe. Chairperson, the members, and in 12 particular Warrant-Officer Monene, he was also being 13 deployed, or posted to be in the Nyala. It is just maybe 14 the commander that was there, how come that the members 15 went outside the Nyala, because that to me as an iron 16 vehicle could have been used as a safe house for the 17 Warrant-Officer.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Does that mean that you 19 didn't order the occupants of the Nyala to get out of it? 20 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct.

21 Chairperson.

CHAIRPERSON: Now before Adv Masevhe 22 continues, one of the policeman who was killed on the spot

24 was hacked and shot twice, and the other, what happened to

the other? The other was hacked and stabbed. Is that

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12273

1

MS MASEVHE: General, I would like to refer you to line 7 from the top where he testifies of the

events of the 13th of August and he alleges that line 7, it

4 starts with "Official attacks," and then it's got a full

5 stop, but then I would like to start immediately after the

6 full stop wherein he says, "When the negotiations failed

7 and when the General started counting, we stood up, sang a

8 song, and left. It seemed as if there was a non-verbalised

9 understanding in terms of which the police were to escort

10 us until we got back to the koppie. Then out of the blue I

11 later heard shots being fired by the police. There was

12 teargas and stun grenades fired by the police. Thereafter

13 live ammunition was used." Now General, what I want to

14 know from you is that how accurate is this statement? When

15 was live ammunition fired by the police, if it was ever

16 fired by the police?

17 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: I just wanted the 18 question to be repeated.

MS MASEVHE: Okay, General, he says that live ammunition was used by the police. Maybe I can put small questions. The first question would be, was live ammunition ever used by the police on the 13th of August at that scene?

24 CHAIRPERSON: Before you answer, can I ask you this question? You've seen the statement, have

19

23

Page 12276 Page 12278 you? The statement that's been put to you. said that that's the time when they utilised the 2 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 2 ammunition. Yes, Chairperson -3 CHAIRPERSON: Have you read it? 3 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: When you say the 4 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Ja, I've read it. 4 members said they utilised the ammunition, is this 5 CHAIRPERSON: 5 something that was told to you subsequent to the event? I see, fine. So you may 6 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: proceed. I was afraid that the passage might be taken Correct, 6 7 7 Chairperson. effectively out of context - I'm not suggesting deliberately, but effectively out of context, and the 8 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Now at the time, at 8 9 9 witness might be at a disadvantage, but he doesn't seem to the time of the actual event, are you able to say when live 10 be, so you can carry on. 10 ammunition was used? MS MASEVHE: 11 Thank you, Chairperson. Now 11 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson. 12 12 General, the question is that did the police ever fire live CHAIRPERSON: - I asked the question was, ammunition at the scene of the 13th of August? 13 13 as appears from slides 57 and 58 of exhibit L, there were MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 14 Chairperson, when quite a number of shell casings found on the scene 15 the scene was attended there were members that said yes, we 15 afterwards, and 98 sharp-point bullets were fired, and 56 did use the live ammunition in self-defence. But at the 16 non-lethal ones. So there was, a fair amount of ammunition same as the question also indicated, no officer did order 17 17 was fired at the scene. 18 the utilisation of the live ammunition. 18 MS MASEVHE: Chairperson, you asked a 19 MS MASEVHE: So General, according to 19 question and I presume that the witness now has to answer 20 what you have witnessed, when did the police use live 20 what you have asked in relation to exhibit L. 21 ammunition? Was it before or after the attack on the 21 CHAIRPERSON: You heard what I said. I 22 22 pointed out that if you look at exhibit L, particularly police? 23 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 23 slide 58 that is being shown now on the screen, you will Chairperson, I did 24 see that 64 9mm bullets were fired, and 34 5.56mm bullets, 24 testify that the police were attacked. The attack was 25 unlawful. The attack was imminent, and in that process a total of 98, not to mention the 56 non-lethal items as Page 12277 Page 12279 those members that utilised the live ammunition, one could well. So a fair amount of ammunition was expended. Over 1 ever say yes, they utilised the live ammunition in selfwhat period did that take place? We see that six POP 2 3 defence. 3 people fired, six TRT people, three NIU people, so you 4 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: I don't think 4 know, did the engagement - if one can call it that - did 5 you've answered the question though. She wants to know that extend over several minutes? whether the police used live ammunition before or after the 6 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 6 Chairperson, I 7 attack. Do you know that? Can you say? 7 could not check the time, but it was quick and the 8 8 CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps the question should ammunition that were used during that attack. 9 9 be rephrased. It should be before or after or during, MS MASEVHE: General, I would like to 10 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

23

24

25

because if the, depending on the length of time during 11 which the attack took place, it may be that some live 12 ammunition was fired while the attack was taking place, so 13 the real question is was live ammunition used before the 14 attack commenced, or was it after the attack was over, or 15 was it during the attack? 16 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, live 17 ammunition was used while the attack was imminent. 18 CHAIRPERSON: How long did the attack take - the attack, it was, I take it, a series of attacks really because it wasn't just one single attack. How long 21 did the attacks take place? Over what period? 22 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I could not count, but what I saw is that when immediately 24 the protesters came rushing to the police, and particularly when the chopping was taking place, then the members also

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

refer you back to the very same statement of Mr Booi, that is paragraph 34 of this statement, and wherein he states that - are you on -MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Yes, correct, Chairperson. MS MASEVHE: - yes, wherein he states that, "I reiterate that we were a very small group that posed no threat whatsoever either to the police or any other person. The shooting which sparked the violence was completely unnecessary and all the deaths should accordingly be laid squarely at the door of the SAPS." Now General, you hear what he says. What is your comment on this, particularly the fact that they didn't pose any threat and that the shooting by the police sparked the attack? MR NGALWANA: Chair, just for the record,

14

19

20

22

25

3

4

7

9

10

Page 12280

that is one example of a factual account that we would want

2 to cross-examine this witness on.

3 CHAIRPERSON: She's not putting it as a

4 fact. She's saying this is an allegation that's been made

5 by someone, who may or may not come and give evidence, who

may be called by counsel for the arrested strikers, if he 6

7 comes back, or he may be called by the evidence leaders if

8 he doesn't, but this witness is in the box now and she's

9 not putting it as a fact; she's simply asking for his

10 comment. So I don't think there's anything wrong with

11 that, so you can carry on.

12 MS MASEVHE: Thank you, Chairperson.

13 General, would you be able to answer the question?

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: 14 Chairperson, I did

15 indicate that on that day the total number of the

protesters who were armed with dangerous weapons were 16

17 between 100 to 200.

18 CHAIRPERSON: The thrust of what is being

19 put - or sorry, I must rephrase it. The thrust of what's

20 been said in the statement upon which you were asked to

21 comment is that even though they may have had dangerous

22 weapons, they were proceeding towards the koppie, posing no

23 threat whatever to the police or any other person, and that

24 if the shooting by the police hadn't taken place the deaths

25 wouldn't have occurred. That's what is said here in

Page 12281

paragraph 34. Now do you agree with that statement or

2 would you disagree with it?

1

15

17

3 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: I totally disagree

4 with it, Chairperson, and my reasons are as follows. I

5 went personally as a senior officer to speak to the

6 protesters. They vehemently refused to hand over the

7 dangerous weapons to the police. If they did not pose any

threat, why they could not hand over the dangerous weapons 8

9 to the police? Chairperson, in any country any sensible

10 law-abiding citizen when requested by a General in the

11 police to hand over the weapons, he could comply with the

12 instruction. The fact that they refused to hand over

13 weapons, Chairperson, I have a strong belief that they

14 already had an intention to attack the police because if

they did hand over the weapons they did not have any weapon

to attack or to use it to attack the police. 16

Secondly, I made sure that they understand what

18 I'm saying, Chairperson, and I said to them we are not

19 going to arrest you. The only thing that we want, because

20 you are so angry, we want the dangerous weapons, and the

21 reason that NUM was there to attack them is not correct,

22 Chairperson. The police were there to protect everybody,

not only the protesters or any other person. Secondly to

24 say that they were defending themselves against the NUM is

not correct because the NUM was not there, the attack was

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12282 not imminent from the NUM and only the police were there.

2 Chairperson, whether it is correct that the

3 shooting sparked violence, which I totally also disagree,

4 we have utilised teargas in all other operations where we

disperse people; the people never attacked the police in

6 the manner that the police were attacked on that day. In

7 terms of the experience that I have, it was the first time 8

that when the teargas is used, as they claim, then they

9 attacked the police.

10 CHAIRPERSON: Did they start attacking 11 the police before or after the stun grenade, the first stun

12 grenade was fired?

> MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, as it could have been seen there at the video, the movements of the other protesters you could not see clearly, but others

15 16 they reacted because of the teargas, and others said that

17 they reacted because of the stun grenade, so their reasons

18 are different. But what I'm saying is that -

CHAIRPERSON: The question I asked you was did any attack take place by the strikers before the

21 stun grenade, the first stun grenade was fired?

> MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: No, Chairperson.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Now when a stun grenade is

24 fired there are two reports normally, aren't there? There

are two, like explosions. Is that right? Is that correct?

Page 12283

When a stun grenade is fired, one hears two reports. Is

2 that right? Two explosions.

> MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Oh, yes,

Chairperson.

5 CHAIRPERSON: And a person who wasn't

6 familiar with the stun grenade, would such a person

possibly think that live ammunition, sharp ammunition was

8 being used?

MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: It is correct, Chairperson, but the usual reaction will be that you run

away from the explosion, but not to attack the police.

11

12 MS MASEVHE: Now finally, General, I 13 would like to refer you to the statement of Mr Xolani

14 Nzuza, it's a witness statement. It has been circulated

15 amongst all the parties, and I would like to refer you to

16 page 3, paragraph 10 thereof.

17 CHAIRPERSON: Before we do that, I think 18 in the interest of good housekeeping we should mark this

exhibit with an exhibit number, and so Ms Pillay still

20 remembers her skills from over a month ago; can she tell us

21 what the next exhibit number is?

[15:24] MS PILLAY: Chair, it would be exhibit

23 HHH21.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. The witness

statement of Xolani Nzuza has been marked exhibit HHH21.

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 12284 Page 12286 slightly in front of you as well? 1 Thank you. 2 MS MASEVHE: 2 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Thank you, Chair -As I indicated 3 CHAIRPERSON: Now you're being referred 3 before, he was on the, not in front but on the left-hand 4 to that statement. You have a copy, have you, Majorside, but I could see what was happening there. 5 5 General? COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And the protesters, 6 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. the body of protesters were in front of Warrant-Officer 6 7 7 Chairperson. Monene? 8 CHAIRPERSON: What's the paragraph 8 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct 9 9 number? Chairperson. 10 It's paragraph 10 on page 3. 10 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: When the stun MS MASEVHE: 11 grenade and the teargas was fired, did that area, did the CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. 11 12 MS MASEVHE: General, I would like to -12 gas permeate that area, the smoke? 13 13 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: I'm sorry, MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: It was also 14 Chairperson, just also maybe before we leave from this 14 covered with the smoke. point, it's also that even the witness here indicated that 15 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: 15 So when you say you they requested the police to accompany them to the koppie, 16 saw the protesters run towards the police, was there smoke 17 17 and secondly I did indicate that in terms of the Regulation in that area as well? 18 of Gatherings Act, section 9(1), the police could escort 18 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. 19 them to ensure that - that I wanted just to add to my 19 Chairperson. 20 answers. 20 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And at the time of 21 21 the actual attack on Warrant-Officer Monene, could you see CHAIRPERSON: Yes, you've added that to 22 your answers now. Yes, please proceed with the cross-22 the actual attack, or could you just see a lot of people 23 examination. 23 around the police? I'd just like to know exactly what it 24 MS MASEVHE: 24 is that you saw. Thank you, Chairperson. Mr 25 25 Nzuza here, General, states that, "All of a sudden the MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: I saw the actual Page 12285 Page 12287 police released teargas into the crowd, followed by stun 1 attack with a number of people coming to Warrant-Officer 2 Monene. 2 grenades and live ammunition from the ground and from a 3 helicopter. There was pandemonium with strikers running 3 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: You actually saw 4 away mainly in the direction of the koppie. Some of the 4 him being struck by different people? 5 5 policemen were among the fleeing crowd and there were MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Correct. 6 Chairperson. 6 violent encounters with the strikers. I saw one of the 7 workers collapsing in front of me and realised that he had 7 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Yes, thank you. been shot by the police fire." Now General, I would like 8 8 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Maybe I might also 9 9 you to comment on this because he again makes an allegation add that the reasons for the death will assist, or maybe 10 of shooting by the police, and the teargas and the stun 10 corroborate what I'm saying. 11 grenades that were released by the police from the 11 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, General. 12 helicopters. 12 Mr Gumbi, are you ready now to commence your cross-13 MAJOR-GENERAL MPEMBE: Chairperson, I can 13 examination? I know you haven't given all the documents 14 only say that it is only the teargas, the stun grenade that 14 yet -15 15 were used, not live ammunition. The live ammunition was MR GUMBI: only used in self-defence and the reasons that I've given 16 16 CHAIRPERSON: - given notice of all the 17 with the previous statement are the same. 17 documents, but -18 MS MASEVHE: Thank you. Chairperson, 18 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson. 19 19 thank you; that will be all of our questions. Thank you. CHAIRPERSON: - perhaps you can make some 20 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, my colleague Adv 20 progress before 4 o'clock when we adjourn? 21 Hemraj wishes to ask you some questions on this point. 21 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson, I was - it's 22 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Just for some my submission in fact that I've just distributed my index clarity, General, exactly what was it that you saw as 23 of all the document I will rely on my cross-examination of 23 24 regards Warrant-Officer Monene, you say he was about 15 24 General Mpembe. I think there are more than 30 metres away to your left. Do I understand that he was 25 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but the reason, you ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12288 see the reason for our requirement that notice be given beforehand is that it enables the witness to read the 2 3 documents before being cross-examined. 4 MR GUMBI: Yes. 5 CHAIRPERSON: Of course it enables us to prepare as well. 6 7 MR GUMBI: Yes. 8 CHAIRPERSON: And it prevents cross-9 examination by ambush, which is not something we encourage. 10 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson. 11 CHAIRPERSON: So if you can start your cross-examination now in a way which doesn't take undue 12 13 advantage of the witness, if there's for example a document 14 that you want to refer to which the witness hasn't had an 15 opportunity to read - he may well have read them, but if he hasn't had the opportunity to read a particular document 16 you're referring to, then perhaps we can give him an 17 18 opportunity to do so, but please begin, make as much 19 progress as you can. 20 MR GUMBI: Chairperson, it's my 21 submission, because all these documents, quite a number of 22 documents I've referred to, I don't think the witness is in 23 possession of those documents. For effectiveness of my 24 cross-examination I think it will be better if the witness 25 is in possession of all the documents I've indicated in my Page 12289 1 index -2 CHAIRPERSON: Does that mean you're 3 effectively asking for your cross-examination to continue tomorrow morning? 4 5 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: And we should postpone at 6 this stage? 7 8 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson, for sake of 9 the witness to have all the documents. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, in the circumstances 10 11 we will adjourn then until 9 o'clock tomorrow morning. 12 MR GUMBI: Thanks. 13 CHAIRPERSON: We'd like the statements, please, as well. I don't know if you've given it to the 14 15 evidence leaders, so we'd also like to prepare, so not only the General, but also we can have the opportunity this 17 evening of reading the documents. We'll adjourn now and 18 the matter will resume tomorrow morning at 9 o'clock. 19 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED] 20 21 23

A
able 12253:20
12257:15 12262:18 12270:12 12271:3,16
12270:12 12271:3,16 12271:19 12278:9
12280:13
Absent 12254:10
accommodate 12250:4
accompany 12284:16
account 12280:1 accountability 12254:4
accurate 12275:14
Act 12254:23 12284:18
action 12254:2,2
actual 12278:9
12286:21,22,25
add 12252:18 12262:15
12284:19 12287:9
added 12284:21
adequate 12254:9,15
adjourn 12287:20
12289:11,17
ADJOURNED
12289:19
adjournment 12259:3
ADJOURNS 12259:6
Adv 12262:13
12266:15 12273:22
12285:20
advantage 12288:13
Advocate 12248:3,11
12248:14 12258:19 12260:9
afford 12253:20
afforded 12253:17,22
12254:15
afraid 12276:6
Africa 12255:2
African 12260:12
afternoon 12248:8
12249:14,25 12260:7
12260:8
ago 12251:20 12259:12
12283:20
agree 12281:1
agreed 12248:8
agreement 12252:19
ah 12260:21
aid 12254:23,23
12255:2,3
air 12255:22
allegation 12280:4 12285:9
alleges 12275:3
allow 12248:21
allowed 12257:1
altered 12250:3
ambush 12288:9
amended 12252:19
ammunition 12269:11
12275:13,15,20,22
12276:13,16,18,21
12277:1,2,6,12,13,17
12278:2,4,10,16
12279:1,8 12283:7,7

12285:2,15,15
amount 12278:16
12279:1 angry 12281:20
answer 12249:15
12250:1 12252:24 12257:16 12267:17
12271:5,18 12275:24
12278:19 12280:13
answered 12277:5 answers 12284:20,22
anticipated 12249:10
anyway 12261:24
12262:2 12263:4 appeal 12251:16
appears 12278:13
applicants 12253:17 12255:3
application 12249:1,5
12251:9,24 12252:1,3
12252:5,16 12255:10 12255:23
applied 12273:7
appoint 12253:21
appreciate 12257:2 appreciated 12257:17
12257:23
appropriate 12249:19
appropriateness 12273:7
approximately 12265:8
12265:11,14 12266:7 12267:17
area 12286:11,12,17
aren't 12282:24
arises 12252:17,21 12261:18
arm 12254:19
armed 12280:16
arrest 12281:19 arrested 12249:1,10
12270:23 12280:6
arrival 12271:23,24
arrived 12255:16 asked 12256:2,23
12257:24 12261:12
12268:7 12278:12,18 12278:20 12280:20
12278.20 12280.20
asking 12266:12
12280:9 12289:3 assegais 12265:3
assist 12258:2 12268:9
12269:23 12287:9
associated 12248:9 assume 12268:19
assuming 12252:21,22
attack 12265:2,17
12268:3,8,9,11,14 12269:1,3,15,19,20
12269:25 12271:12
12276:21,24,25
12277;7,11,12,14,14 12277:15,17,18,19,20
12279:8,24 12281:14
12281:16,16,21,25

12282:20 12283:11 12286:21.22 12287:1 attacked 12264:12.25 12265:2 12266:6 12268:15,17 12269:3 12269:6,24 12270:4 12270:10 12276:24 12282:5,6,9 attackers 12270:8 **attacking** 12265:12 12271:17 12282:10 attacks 12275:4 12277:19,21 **attended** 12273:6 12276:15 attending 12272:14 attorney 12266:1 attorneys 12256:3 **auditorium** 12265:24 August 12248:1 12260:7 12272:6,15 12275:3,22 12276:13 available 12250:8 12254:23 aware 12253:13 В

B 12251:16,24 12252:3 12252:20,22 12255:10,25 back 12249:21 12250:13 12252:2,7 12260:11 12264:16 12266:24 12267:1,7 12267:14 12268:5,6 12271:22 12275:10 12279:10 12280:7 Baloyi 12249:16 12268:2 **based** 12261:23 basis 12251:8 12252:20 12255:11 **BBB3** 12274:11,13,23 12274:24 behalf 12248:19 **belief** 12281:13 believe 12262:18 12273:10 believed 12257:21 benefit 12259:9 better 12256:5 12288:24 big 12257:16 **Bishop** 12258:5 bit 12261:14 blue 12275:10 body 12286:6 **Booi** 12274:11,11 12279:10 box 12280:8 branch 12254:17 **bridge** 12261:25 brief 12257:1 12260:22 Brigadier 12272:5

buckets 12258:2 **Budlender** 12266:15 **Buildings** 12256:7 bulletproof 12272:21 bulletproofs 12272:19 bullets 12278:15,24,24 business 12249:14 Calitz 12272:5

call 12261:7 12262:16 12262:24 12279:4 called 12251:20 12261:15 12262:13 12262:13,25 12270:1 12280:6,7 canvassed 12262:14 can't 12265:9 **capacity** 12249:22 carry 12276:10 12280:11 case 12258:24 casings 12278:14 CC 12253:13 certain 12258:16 **Chair** 12274:23 12279:25 12283:22 12284:2 **Chairman** 12248:16 **challenge** 12260:20 **challenged** 12255:1,3 **chamber** 12265:25 12266:5 **charged** 12270:23 check 12279:7 **checked** 12261:6 chief 12263:9 **chopped** 12263:10 **chopping** 12277:25 circulated 12258:1 12262:11 12283:14 circumstances 12249:18 12253:18 12262:19 12269:18 12269:21 12289:10 circumstantial 12270:13 12271:15 citizen 12281:10 claim 12282:8 clarity 12285:23 clear 12250:8 12255:6 12257:12,18 clearly 12282:15 **client** 12250:18 12261:21 12262:19 clients 12250:16 12255:16 12259:1 **client's** 12260:16 close 12249:14 confrontation 12273:8 12268:14 congregation 12257:25 closely 12254:6 **consider** 12250:2 closer 12265:19 consideration 12254:21 12269:7 considered 12262:2 closure 12258:10 Constitution 12253:22

collapsing 12285:7

colleague 12258:19

Page 1 12285:20 colleagues 12258:16 12260:11 12261:4 12267:20 colleague's 12248:22 collect 12258:2 collection 12258:2 Colonel 12272:22 come 12256:24 12257:1 12260:21 12261:20 12261:21,24 12273:14 12280:5 comes 12254:22 12280:7 coming 12264:14 12287:1 **commander** 12272:20 12273:14 commanders 12272:17 commemoration 12257:6,7 **commence** 12262:7 12287:12 **commenced** 12277:14 commendable 12253:16 **comment** 12279:21 12280:10,21 12285:9 commentators 12257:14 commission 12248:9 12249:4 12250:3,6 12253:21,24 12254:3 12254:8,12,19 12257:1,11,18,21 12258:8 12259:6,6,15 12259:16 12260:25 12262:17 12270:4 12274:10 12289:19 Commissioner 12248:6 12271:2 12277:4 12278:3,8 12285:22 12286:5,10,15,20 12287:3,7 commissioners 12250:19,23 12257:12 communicate 12271:6 communicated 12270:19 12271:9 completely 12279:19 comply 12281:11 compromised 12254:12 concerned 12249:7 12262:6 12271:14 concurrence 12251:14 condolences 12248:10 confidence 12257:18 **confined** 12251:9

bring 12249:6

brought 12249:1

12254:25

Constitutional 12248:15.25 12250:14.17 12251:7 12251:12,22 12252:2 12252:4 12253:4,6 12254:10,13 12255:6 12255:16 constitutionally 12255:1 consultations 12255:19 12256:2 consulting 12255:18 12256:6 **contained** 12263:20 contemplated 12254:25 contemplating 12249:9 contents 12262:18 contestable 12254:21 12255:7 context 12276:7,8 continue 12249:17 12256:21 12258:9 12272:23 12289:3 continued 12249:3 **continues** 12273:23 contradiction 12257:22 conversation 12260:22 convey 12248:22 conveyed 12248:13 copy 12284:4 corporations 12253:20 correct 12255:14 12258:20 12263:2,12 12263:17 12268:20 12268:23 12270:18 12270:24,25 12271:19,20 12272:1 12272:2,8,9 12273:20 12274:1,14,20,22 12278:6 12279:13 12281:21,25 12282:2 12282:25 12283:9 12284:6 12286:8,18 12287:5 corrective 12253:25 **correctly** 12252:24 12271:14 corroborate 12287:10 costs 12249:3 couldn't 12264:7,12 council 12265:25 12266:5 counsel 12248:4 12249:15.16 12251:15.19 12266:15 12280:6 count 12264:23,24 12265:14 12277:23 counted 12258:6 **counting** 12275:7 country 12254:7 12281:9 course 12249:22 12250:1 12252:16 12256:13 12261:18 12271:9 12288:5 ARCHIVE

```
court 12248:25
  12250:14.17 12251:7
  12251:12.22 12252:2
  12252:2,4 12253:4,6
  12254:10,14 12255:6
  12255:16 12256:14
  12256:17
courts 12253:8
  12254:16
courtyard 12259:8
cover 12262:10
covered 12262:6
  12286:14
criticise 12257:14
criticising 12257:10
cross 12260:25 12261:4
  12261:8,25 12262:4,9
  12284:22 12287:12
  12288:8
cross-examination
  12249:17 12260:1,3
  12261:16,23 12262:7
  12287:23 12288:12
  12288:24 12289:3
cross-examine
  12258:13 12260:23
  12280:2
cross-examined
  12249:20 12288:3
cross-examinee
  12261:3
cross-examiner
  12261:14,19
cross-examines
  12261:1
crowd 12257:16
  12285:1,5
          D
dangerous 12280:16,21
  12281:7,8,20
day 12272:25 12280:15
  12282:6
  12272:12
  12261:17.22 12262:2
```

date 12252:21,23 days 12271:25 deal 12255:15 12262:18 12263:5 death 12267:22 12274:2 12287:9 deaths 12279:19 12280:24 debated 12255:9 decide 12252:15 decided 12251:8 12261:10 decision 12249:11,13 12249:21 12250:20 12251:12 12252:4 **defence** 12277:3 defend 12269:16 defending 12281:24 **definite** 12262:9 delays 12257:13

deliberately 12276:8

delivery 12255:17 demonstration 12256:4 **depending** 12249:20 12277:10 deploy 12254:18 deployed 12273:13 deposed 12261:5 **desirable** 12254:18 didn't 12251:18 12269:9 12271:10,11 12273:19 12279:22 died 12248:4 **different** 12272:19,25 12282:18 12287:4 **difficult** 12269:12 direction 12285:4 disadvantage 12276:9 disagree 12281:2,3 12282:3 **discretion** 12269:19 discussion 12251:19 discussions 12252:25 12256:11,18 dismissed 12249:6 **disperse** 12282:5 disregard 12261:22 distance 12265:20,25 12266:3,13,14,19 12267:6,19 distributed 12287:22 disturbing 12253:3 document 12287:23 12288:13,16 documents 12262:4 12287:13,17 12288:3 12288:21,22,23,25 12289:9,17 doesn't 12249:6 12251:23 12254:16 12261:19,24 12262:16,24 12276:9 12280:8 12288:12 doing 12257:19 donor 12249:9,11,21 12250:7 12252:11 12253:1 12256:18 donors 12250:21 don't 12249:24 12258:4,5 12259:2 12262:21 12274:1,12 12277:4 12280:10 12288:22 12289:14 door 12279:20 dozen 12265:10.11 **drawings** 12268:5

E
earlier 12270:20
ease 12263:19
easier 12265:23
easy 12269:14
effectively 12252:1
12276:7,8 12289:3
effectiveness 12288:23
efforts 12250:19,24
12257:19

either 12279:17 enables 12288:2.5 Encircled 12264:4 encounters 12285:6 encourage 12288:9 engagement 12279:4 ensure 12254:8 12272:14 12273:8 12284:19 **ensuring** 12250:5 entitled 12251:12 **entrapped** 12263:24,25 12264:3,17 entrusted 12258:4 **envisaged** 12252:12 equality 12254:19 equally 12251:21 **equipment** 12259:11 escort 12275:9 12284:18 established 12253:25 evade 12269:1 evening 12289:17 event 12263:1,23 12270:3 12278:5,9 events 12254:6 12275:3 everybody 12253:12 12281:22 evidence 12259:14,15 12261:8 12262:1,14 12262:25 12263:11 12270:13 12271:15 12271:19 12280:5,7 12289:15 exact 12265:9 exactly 12256:25 12285:23 12286:23 examination 12261:9 12262:10 12284:23 12287:13 12288:9 **examine** 12261:5 **examiner** 12261:1 **examines** 12262:5 **example** 12262:16 12270:13 12280:1 12288:13 excused 12258:24 execution 12254:1 **executive** 12253:23 12254:2,17 exercise 12257:11 exhibit 12274:11,13,21 12274:23 12278:13 12278:20.22 12283:19,19,21,22,25 **expedited** 12252:20,21 12255:11 **expended** 12279:1 **expense** 12253:18 12254:21,25 12255:8 12256:9

experience 12282:7

explained 12264:3

explosion 12283:11

explain 12252:7

12253:5

Pa explosions 12282:25 12283:2 extend 12279:5 extending 12248:10 extreme 12267:3 F fact 12250:4,7 12253 12253:12 12258:7,8 12271:7 12279:22

fact 12250:4,7 12253:7 12253:12 12258:7,8 12280:4,9 12281:12 12287:22 factual 12280:1 failed 12275:6 fair 12254:11 12278:16 12279:1 fairer 12253:17 **fairness** 12252:3 12253:4 fall 12250:7 **familiar** 12283:6 **family** 12248:10,14,20 12249:16 12260:5 12263:21 far 12249:7 12255:20 12262:6,19 12265:16 12265:19 12266:5,16 12266:19 12271:13 12271:19 fault 12257:12,12 feeling 12255:20 fees 12253:20 felt 12251:21 filed 12262:24 final 12249:12 **finalised** 12251:17 finally 12283:12 find 12250:5 12258:9 **finding** 12263:22 finds 12270:4 fine 12276:5 fire 12269:11,14 12276:12 12285:8 firearm 12265:15 12269:17 12270:14 12270:16,17 12271:8 12271:13 fired 12275:11.12.15 12275:16 12277:12 12278:15,17,24 12279:3 12282:12,21 12282:24 12283:1 12286:11 first 12258:16 12266:23 12275:21 12282:7,11,21 firstly 12255:21 **five** 12259:3 12265:14 12265:14 12270:11 fleeing 12285:5 follow 12270:1 **followed** 12285:1 **following** 12253:16 follows 12281:4 forever 12260:18 forgive 12248:18

forum 12256:24 forward 12250:15 12268:8 found 12270:17,21 12271:7 12278:14 Friday 12257:6,25 friends 12260:23 front 12263:10 12264:15 12285:7 12286:1,3,6 full 12275:4,6 functionary 12254:8 **funded** 12249:21 funder 12251:6 funders 12256:11 Fundi 12272:7 funding 12249:2,7,9 12250:8,22 12251:3,4 12251:10 12252:8,13 12256:19 12257:20 **funeral** 12248:6,22 **further** 12259:15 12263:14 12272:4 **future** 12254:1 G

gas 12286:12 gathering 12256:4 Gatherings 12284:18 General 12258:14 12259:12 12260:7,10 12262:20,21 12263:8 12263:11,15,21,24 12264:18 12265:16 12265:22 12267:19 12268:18 12269:9 12270:3,8 12271:22 12272:11 12274:9,16 12275:1,7,13,19 12276:12,19 12279:9 12279:21 12280:13 12281:10 12283:12 12284:5,12,25 12285:8,23 12287:11 12287:24 12289:16 gesture 12258:7 give 12256:24 12259:14 12259:15 12265:1.9 12280:5 12288:17 given 12251:11,13 12253:19 12255:21 12255:23 12257:3 12285:16 12287:13 12287:16 12288:1 12289:14 giving 12262:4 **go** 12248:21 12256:14 12259:2 12271:19,22 **God** 12259:18,19 goes 12254:3,10 going 12249:23,24 12251:2 12259:21

12281:19 good 12260:7.8 12283:18 **government** 12254:17 grant 12255:3 granted 12248:21 grateful 12250:19 12255:4 grenade 12282:11,12 12282:17,21,21,23 12283:1,6 12285:14 12286:11 grenades 12275:12 12285:2,11 **ground** 12271:6 12285:2 group 12263:24 12264:4,23 12268:19 12268:20 12270:11 12271:10 12279:16 **guidance** 12260:24 Gumbi 12258:13,15 12262:3 12287:12,15 12287:18,21 12288:4 12288:7,10,20 12289:5,8,12 H

hacked 12272:6 12273:24,25 12274:2 12274:3,5,6,8 hacking 12264:19 12267:21,25 hadn't 12280:24 half 12265:10 hand 12259:17 12281:6 12281:8,11,12,15 handed 12248:25 happen 12249:24 12252:9 **happened** 12251:24 12257:13 12268:22 12273:24 happening 12265:20 12286:4 happens 12252:17,23 happy 12257:8 Hasaan 12272:7 hasn't 12262:5 12274:21 12288:14 12288:16 haven't 12253:8 12287:13 hear 12279:21 heard 12251:16 12252:11 12253:8 12254:9 12255:10 12262:6 12275:11 12278:21 hearing 12251:11,13 12255:22 hears 12283:1 helicopter 12285:3 helicopters 12285:12

help 12259:18,19

helped 12266:2

helpful 12253:11 Hemraj 12271:2 12277:4 12278:3.8 12285:21,22 12286:5 12286:10,15,20 12287:3,7 Hendrik 12260:5 he'll 12266:3 he's 12249:24 12261:7 12262:3 **HHH21** 12283:23,25 High 12252:2 hold 12256:4 12260:18 **holding** 12256:7 hope 12248:11,13 12250:20 hopefully 12255:10 hour 12251:20 house 12273:16 housekeeping 12283:18 huge 12253:20

identify 12270:7,12 12271:3 immediately 12275:5 12277:23 **imminent** 12269:15,21 12276:25 12277:17 12282:1 **important** 12256:15 incident 12264:13 12270:23 inclined 12255:24 inclusive 12250:9 incorporated 12256:2 12256:10 inculas 12265:6 index 12287:22 12289:1 indicate 12250:18 12265:21 12266:4 12272:17 12273:6 12280:15 12284:17 indicated 12249:8 12250:12 12251:14 12256:6 12266:9 12268:5 12269:16 12272:22.24 12276:17 12284:15 12286:2 12288:25 indicates 12258:8 **indication** 12265:2,22 indigent 12254:23 indispensable 12254:4 **indulgence** 12248:21 12255:5 **influence** 12254:1 inform 12253:25 **information** 12258:17 **informed** 12249:8,12 12249:14 12259:7 12271:24 12272:5

instructed 12256:3 instruction 12257:3 12269:14 12281:12 instructions 12250:16 12250:18 12252:22 12253:1 12255:9 12256:12,16 instruments 12265:6 **intended** 12248:3 **intention** 12281:14 interest 12283:18 **interested** 12263:22 **interim** 12251:3,10 12252:8,13 interpretation 12259:10 interpreter 12259:8 interpreting 12259:9 **interrupt** 12252:10 12258:18 interruption 12260:22 **Intervention** 12273:1 invalids 12255:2 investigated 12254:6 involved 12253:21 iron 12250:22 12273:15 ironed 12251:6 issue 12250:14 12251:10 12252:8 12254:21 12255:14 12262:14 issued 12272:24 issues 12256:16 issue's 12258:6 items 12278:25 it's 12250:23 12254:25 12257:14 12259:12 12260:20,21,23,24 12262:9,12 12265:23 12267:11 12269:4,13 12272:19 12274:13 12274:23 12275:4 12283:14 12284:10 12284:15 12287:21 12288:20 I'd 12250:18 12286:23 I'm 12248:8 12251:2 12252:16 12255:4,5 12259:7,23 12263:20 12266:3,9,20 12274:19 12276:7 12281:18 12282:18 12284:13 12287:10 I've 12251:19 12252:11 12257:3,24 12276:4 12285:16 12287:22 12288:22,25

instruct 12269:10

Ja 12276:4 jacket 12261:12 join 12248:9 judge 12257:14,15 judgement 12249:5 iudgment 12248:25 12249:4 12253:6.15 12255:17 June 12263:8

killed 12260:16 12262:20 12263:10 12263:16,23 12264:1 12264:5,8 12272:6 12273:23 killing 12264:19 kindly 12257:1 knobkieries 12265:7 know 12249:24 12254:6 12258:5 12259:2 12263:23 12264:9 12265:9,10 12265:15 12266:12 12269:1,15 12270:13 12270:15 12271:11 12274:12 12275:14 12277:5,7 12279:4 12286:23 12287:13 12289:14 **knowing** 12272:11 knows 12257:5 **koppie** 12275:10 12280:22 12284:16 12285:4

L L 12278:13,20,22 lack 12256:5 laid 12279:20 large 12254:7 law-abiding 12281:10 leaders 12262:14,25 12280:7 12289:15 leading 12248:4 12263:23 learned 12258:16 12260:23 leave 12259:4 12284:14 leaving 12256:25 left 12269:25 12275:8 12285:25 **left-hand** 12267:3 12286:3 legal 12248:19 12253:17.20 12254:15,20,22,23,24 12255:2,3,7 12256:8 12257:20 12258:3 legislation 12254:3 length 12277:10 Lepaaku 12263:15 12264:20 12270:6 let's 12266:22 12271:22 **Lieutenant** 12249:16 12266:6 12268:2 Lieutenant-Colonel 12272:18 light 12248:12

12260:15 12261:4,7,9

12261:11,14

12262:10,12,13

ARCHIVE

12263:21 12271:12

initiation 12254:2

inquiry 12253:21

injured 12249:1,10

limited 12252:12

12287:20 12289:11

7.1.7.1gust 20.10	
line 12263:20 12275:2	12270:3 122
12275:3	12272:4,11 1
linked 12251:2	12274:9,16 1
little 12261:13	12275:19 12:
live 12269:11 12275:13	12276:19 12
12275:15,20,21	12279:9,15 1
12276:12,16,18,20	12283:12 12:
12277:1,2,6,11,13,16	12284:12,24
12278:9 12283:7	12285:18
12285:2,15,15	materials 1227
long 12249:24 12251:5	mathematical
12259:12 12277:18	12266:12
12277:20	matter 12249:
Lonmin 12271:24	12250:6 122
12272:6	12256:5 122
look 12274:2,17	12289:18
12278:22	matters 12250
lose 12255:22 12262:21	12251:5 122:
loss 12248:11	mean 12252:6,
lot 12259:1 12286:22	12254:16 12:
	12289:2
M	means 12251:1
Mabelane 12272:7	12252:1 122:
main 12252:5,15	meant 12264:3
major 12258:13	measurements
12259:11 12268:13	measures 1225
12268:16 12284:4	12272:13 12
Major-General	meet 12250:21
12249:18 12260:8	meeting 12250
12263:12,17 12264:2	member 12269
12264:10,22 12265:5	12269:18,19
12265:13,18 12266:8	members 1224
12266:17,22,25	12268:15 12
12267:2,8,11 12268:1	12269:23 12:
12268:10,23 12269:4	12272:20,24
12269:13 12270:9,25	12273:1,2,2,
12271:5,20 12272:2,9	12273:14 12:
12272:16 12273:20	12277:1,25 1
12274:7,14,18	mention 12255
12275:17 12276:2,4	12257:24 12:
12276:14,23	12272:18 123 Marrafa 12272:
12277:16,22 12278:6	Merafe 12272: mere 12258:7
12278:11 12279:6,13 12280:14 12281:3	message 12248
12282:13,22 12283:3	met 12257:25
12283:9 12284:6,13	met 12237.23 metres 12265:2
12285:13 12286:2,8	12267:19 12
12286:13,18,25	mightn't 1225
12287:5,8	Milwesi 12259
management 12271:24	miners 12249:
mandate 12258:24	mining 12253:
mandated 12253:22	Minister 1225
manner 12270:10	minus 12265:1
12282:6	minutes 12259
map 12250:15	12279:5
march 12256:7	Monene 12249
Marikana 12271:23,24	12260:6 122
mark 12283:18	12264:1,11,2
marked 12283:25	12266:5,6 12
Masevhe 12258:19,20	12267:25 12:
12259:21,23,25	12270:6,14,1
12260:3,5,10 12262:8	12271:8,13,1
12263.2 7 14 19	12273.12.12

```
271:22
              12273:22
              12275:1
               276:11
               278:18
              12280:12
               284:2,10
              70:20
              6
               51:8,17
               62:1
              0:17
               56:9
               .7
               273:18
              18,21
               54:13,14
              s 12266:9
              53:25
              273:4,10
              0:2,4
              9:14,17
               ,20
              48:5
               269:17
               272:18
               12273:1
              5,11,11
              276:15
              12278:4
              5:20
               260:12
              278:25
              2:18,22
              8:23
              22
              285:25
              52:12
              9:21
               1,10
               19
              1:15,20
               14
              9:3
              9:16
               63:9,22
              20,25
              2267:21
               269:7
              17
              17
  12273:12 12274:4
  12285:24 12286:7,21
  12287:2
money 12258:2,4,5
```

month 12283:20 morning 12248:6,14,24 12249:12 12289:4,11 12289:18 mother 12248:4,11,22 motion 12252:19 move 12258:1 moved 12267:4 12268:13 **movements** 12282:14 **Mpembe** 12249:18 12259:19 12260:8 12263:12,17 12264:2 12264:10,22 12265:5 12265:13,18 12266:8 12266:17,22,25 12267:2,8,11 12268:1 12268:10,23 12269:4 12269:13 12270:9,25 12271:5,20 12272:2,9 12272:16 12273:20 12274:7,14,18 12275:17 12276:2,4 12276:14,23 12277:16,22 12278:6 12278:11 12279:6,13 12280:14 12281:3 12282:13,22 12283:3 12283:9 12284:6,13 12285:13 12286:2,8 12286:13,18,25 12287:5,8,24 **Mpofu** 12249:20 12250:10,11,25 12251:1 12252:14 12253:14 12255:13 12258:12,23 12259:5 12261:6 12262:13,15 12262:24 Mpofu's 12261:6 murdered 12260:6 12270:5

N name 12260:4 **National** 12273:1 nature 12251:3 nav 12249:15 nearer 12268:15 12269:18 necessary 12255:12,13 need 12254:6 needed 12258:10 negotiation 12270:16 negotiations 12275:6 never 12257:15 12282:5 news 12255:25 **Ngalwana** 12260:19 12262:7 12279:25 NIU 12279:3 non-lethal 12278:16,25 non-verbalised 12275:8 normally 12282:24

12287:16 12288:1 NUM 12281:21.24.25 12282:1 number 12253:8 12265:9 12278:14 12280:15 12283:19 12283:21 12284:9 12287:1 12288:21 Nyala 12264:12 12267:4,4 12268:3 12273:13,15,19 Nzuza 12283:14,25 12284:25 0 oath 12259:12,13 object 12254:22 **objection** 12260:24 12263:5 **objective** 12254:19 **obviously** 12250:22 12251:5 12256:1 occupants 12273:19

occurred 12271:25 12272:12 12280:25 officer 12263:22 12264:20 12276:17 12281:5 officers 12268:20,21,21 12269:1,8,10,10 12272:14 **Official** 12275:4 officials 12269:22 oh 12266:24 12274:24 12283:3 Okay 12264:18 12270:3 12275:19 once 12250:20 ones 12271:12 12278:16 ongoing 12255:19 open 12253:23 12255:8 operations 12282:4 **opportunity** 12249:23 12250:21 12251:18 12254:9,11 12255:24 12256:24 12257:2 12258:25 12262:21 12288:15.16.18 12289:16 opposite 12259:10 order 12254:17 12269:11 12272:25 12273:3,4,19 12276:17 ordinarily 12254:7 organs 12253:19 **orientated** 12272:21 orientating 12272:23 originally 12248:3 outcome 12252:5 12253:4 12256:10 **outside** 12268:4 12273:15 overstep 12258:24 o'clock 12248:7

12289:18 P pace 12266:2 paces 12267:17 page 12263:20 12274:12,17,19 12283:16 12284:10 pandemonium 12285:3 pangas 12265:3,6 papers 12251:13 paragraph 12249:4 12253:15 12254:12 12274:12,17,19 12279:11 12281:1 12283:16 12284:8,10 **paragraphs** 12253:6,9 12253:12 part 12251:9,16,16,24 12251:25 12252:3,20 12252:22,24 12253:1 12253:5,23 12255:10 12255:25 12256:15 12261:23 12263:11 participation 12249:3 12256:20,22 particular 12272:17 12273:12 12288:16 particularly 12251:1 12263:22 12277:24 12278:22 12279:22 parties 12250:2 12252:18 12262:11 12283:15 passage 12276:6 peace 12248:12 12260:18 peaceful 12256:4,7 people 12253:8,10 12257:10 12258:3 12264:7 12265:12 12267:23,24 12268:2 12270:4,15,22 12271:16 12279:3,3,3 12282:5,5 12286:22 12287:1.4 period 12277:21 12279:2 **permeate** 12286:12 permission 12252:6 12256:3 **permitted** 12249:19 perpetually 12248:12 person 12270:18 12271:16 12279:18 12280:23 12281:23 12283:5,6 personally 12273:7 12281:5 persons 12254:24 photographs 12274:1

12263:2,7,14,19

12264:4,18 12265:16

12268:18,25 12269:9

12265:21 12267:18

notice 12252:19

place 12267:25 12268:8

Pillay 12274:23

pistols 12273:3

12283:19,22

12271:2.15 12275:18

12276:12,17 12277:5

12277:8,13 12278:12

12278:19 12280:13

questions 12275:21

12285:19,21

12275:21.25

12282:19

12269:23 12270:18
12272:13,22 12273:7
12277:11,12,21,25
12277:11,12,21,23
12282:20
places 12256:8
play 12254:22
played 12268:13,16
please 12259:14,17,20
12260:1 12262:7
12284:22 12288:18
12289:14
plus 12265:14
point 12257:18,24
12264:6 12265:24
12284:15 12285:21
pointed 12252:24
12278:22
police 12248:4
12260:12 12264:16
12266:2,15 12268:14
12268:16,19,21,21
12269:1,2,8,22
12270:1 12272:13,14
12275:9,11,12,15,16
12275:20,22
12276:12,20,22,24
12277:6,24 12279:17
12279:23 12280:23
12280:24 12281:7,9
12280:24 12281:7,9
12282:1,5,6,9,11
12283:11 12284:16
12284:18 12285:1,8 12285:10,11
12285:10,11
12286:16,23
policeman 12273:23
policemen 12285:5
Policing 12272:25
12273:3
policy 12254:1
POP 12279:2
pose 12279:22 12281:7
posed 12279:17
posing 12280:22
position 12256:19
12258:13 12262:5
12270:7
possession 12270:18,21
12271:7 12274:13,15
12288:23,25
possible 12249:9,11
12258:9 12268:7
possibly 12283:7
posted 12273:13
postpone 12289:6
potential 12250:7,21
12252:11
power 12253:21
12254:16
powers 12253:23
pray 12248:11
pray 12248:11 precision 12266:12
preferred 12255:21
preferred 12255:21 prepare 12288:6 12289:15

prepared 12249:17
President 12251:15,20
12253:23,24
presume 12278:19 prevented 12267:20
prevents 12288:8
previous 12285:17
previously 12249:8
pre-empt 12251:23 12252:5
privileges 12253:19
problem 12261:18,19
proceed 12248:17 12258:21 12263:4
12258:21 12263:4 12276:6 12284:22
proceeding 12280:22
proceedings 12248:1
12249:4 12250:9
12253:10 12258:23 process 12276:25
produced 12250:5
progress 12287:20
12288:19
prosecuted 12270:7 prospect 12256:13
protect 12273:4
12281:22
protesters 12263:24,25
12264:5,11,13,14,19 12264:23 12267:21
12268:13 12269:12
12269:24 12272:6,15
12273:9 12277:24
12280:16 12281:6,23 12282:15 12286:5,6
12282:15 12280:5,6
provide 12254:24
provided 12254:20
12255:8
providing 12249:9 provisional 12256:21
provisionally 12256:20
provisions 12255:1
Public 12272:25
12273:2 pulled 12261:11
purpose 12254:11
purposes 12254:5
pursue 12252:15,22
12255:25 pursuit 12256:8
put 12261:2,19,24
12270:5 12272:13
12274:21 12275:20
12276:1 12280:19 puts 12261:13
putting 12258:3
12280:3,9
0
Q quandary 12261:14
quanuary 12201.14

12263:19,21
quick 12279:7
quite 12278:14
12288:21
quo 12257:2
440 1220 / 12
R
raise 12259:17
ran 12269:23
reached 12249:12
12269:6
reacted 12282:16,17
reaction 12283:10
read 12253:11
12263:21 12276:3,4
12288:2,15,15,16
reading 12249:23
12255 5 12290 17
12255:5 12289:17
ready 12258:21
12287:12
real 12271:15 12277:1
realised 12269:25
12285:7
really 12258:6 12271:
12277:20
reason 12255:24
12281:21 12287:25
12288:1
reasonable 12265:20
reasons 12281:4
12282:17 12285:16
12287:9
recall 12263:10,16
12264:20
recalled 12261:22
receive 12259:9
recommended 12254:
record 12260:4,20
12261:9 12263:20
12279:25
refer 12266:21
12274:10 12275:2
12279:10 12283:13
12283:15 12288:14 reference 12263:19
reference 12263:19
referred 12284:3
12288:22
referring 12288:17
refusal 12255:2
refused 12281:6,12
regard 12253:13
12270:19
regards 12285:24
Regulation 12284:17
reiterate 12279:16
relates 12262:19
relation 12278:20
relative 12260-16
relative 12260:16
released 12285:1,11

relief 12249:2 relv 12287:23 remains 12257:19 remarks 12257:17,23 remember 12264:14 12266:10 12267:5 **remembers** 12283:20 render 12250:9 12254:23 repeat 12257:10 12266:4 **repeated** 12275:18 rephrase 12280:19 rephrased 12277:9 **report** 12250:5,13 12257:8 reporting 12253:3 reports 12282:24 12283:1 represent 12260:5 representation 12253:18 12254:15 12254:20,24 12255:7 12256:9 12257:20 requested 12248:7 12281:10 12284:16 requirement 12288:1 resolved 12256:17 **resources** 12254:18 respect 12249:2,3 12270:23 responsibility 12272:20 rest 12248:12 restraint 12257:11 resume 12289:18 **RESUMES** 12259:6 resuscitate 12251:25 review 12251:23 12252:3 12255:3 revised 12274:10 re-assemble 12259:4 **right** 12251:6 12254:20 12259:17,22,25 12282:25 12283:2 **rights** 12256:8 role 12268:13,16 room 12259:10 row 12266:24 12267:1 12267:7 run 12268:8 12283:10 12286:16 running 12285:3 rushing 12277:24 R10 12258:3 R5 12258:3 S safe 12273:11,16 safety 12272:14 sake 12289:8

sang 12275:7

12279:20

saw 12263:9,15 12264:9 12265:6

12271:10,16

SAPS 12248:5,19

12277:23 12285:6.23 12286:16.24.25 12287:3 saying 12252:16 12280:4 12281:18 12282:18 12287:10 savs 12253:15 12254:13,14,16 12255:6 12261:20 12275:6,19 12279:21 scene 12269:2,25 12270:18 12275:23 12276:13,15 12278:14,17 screen 12278:23 search 12253:24 12254:3,11 seat 12266:18,20,23 second 12260:1 12267:12,13 secondly 12272:21 12281:17,23 12284:17 section 12284:18 security 12272:7 see 12249:20 12255:16 12260:11 12264:12 12264:19,21 12265:19 12267:14 12268:7 12271:3 12276:5 12278:24 12279:2 12282:15 12286:4,21,22 12288:1 seek 12250:4 12256:3 12260:25 seen 12251:8 12253:8 12268:11 12269:20 12275:25 12282:14 sees 12250:7 self 12277:2 self-defence 12276:16 12285:16 Semenya 12248:3,10 12248:14,20 Semenya's 12248:11 sending 12252:2 senior 12281:5 sense 12264:8 **sensible** 12281:9 Seoka 12258:5 series 12277:19 serves 12254:4 service 12257:6 **services** 12257:7 12260:12 12266:2 service's 12248:4 set 12259:11 setting 12254:8 settled 12256:14 sharp 12283:7 **sharp-point** 12278:15 shell 12278:14 she's 12280:3,4,8,9 **shining** 12248:12 **shooting** 12279:18,23

question 12251:1

12255:6,9,15

12252:16,17,20,25

12261:12 12263:25

12268:7 12269:5,7

				Page
12280:24 12282:3	starts 12275:4	12258:3	12269:24 12277:10	Usually 12260:25
12285:10	state 12253:18,19	tear 12268:12,14	12278:1,8,9 12279:7	utilisation 12276:18
short 12259:3	12254:18,21,24	teargas 12275:12	12282:7 12286:20	utilise 12269:19
shot 12273:24 12274:3	12255:8 12256:9	12282:4,8,16 12285:1	today 12248:2	utilised 12265:7
12274:4,8 12285:8	stated 12249:5	12285:10,14	12249:24	12277:1,2 12278:1,4
shots 12275:11	statement 12257:9	12286:11	Tokota 12248:6	12282:4
shown 12278:23	12261:15 12262:10	television 12253:11	told 12278:5	
side 12264:16 12266:13	12274:10,13,15,17,21	tell 12260:15 12274:3	tomorrow 12249:13,14	V
12266:14,19,23	12275:14,25 12276:1	12283:20	12249:25 12252:23	various 12262:11
12267:3 12286:4	12279:10,11	term 12251:5	12289:4,11,18	vehemently 12281:6
sided 12250:6	12280:20 12281:1	terms 12250:15,22	top 12275:2	vehicle 12273:16
Simphiwe 12274:11,11	12283:13,14,25	12257:22 12268:16	total 12278:25	version 12261:2,8
simply 12250:23	12284:4 12285:17	12273:9 12275:9	12280:15	victims 12254:5
12280:9	statements 12261:4,23	12282:7 12284:17	totally 12281:3 12282:3	12257:6
simultaneous 12259:11	12262:17,23	test 12261:8	touch 12250:16	video 12268:12
single 12277:20	12289:13	testified 12263:9,14	touched 12250:14	12271:11 12282:14
sit 12259:20	states 12279:11,15	12271:23 12272:4	touching 12258:1	view 12251:10,14
situational 12273:7	12284:25	testifies 12275:2	transcript 12249:23	12253:7 12262:15
six 12279:2,3	status 12257:2	testify 12276:24	translates 12254:19	views 12255:22
skills 12283:20	step 12261:11	testifying 12263:8	translation 12259:11	violence 12271:25
sleeve 12261:12	stood 12275:7	testing 12261:16	transparency 12254:5	12272:12 12279:18
slide 12278:23	stop 12275:5,6	thank 12250:11,12,23	trapped 12264:8	12282:3
slides 12278:13	streets 12256:17	12250:25 12253:14	TRT 12273:2 12279:3	violent 12285:6
slightly 12286:1	strikers 12280:6	12253:15 12255:4	true 12262:12	
small 12257:4	12282:20 12285:3,6	12257:2 12258:10,12	truth 12253:24,25	W
12275:21 12279:16	strong 12281:13	12258:24 12259:5,20	12254:4,7,11 12258:9	want 12251:23
smoke 12268:12,14	struck 12287:4	12260:3 12262:8	12259:16,16,17	12255:25 12258:8
12286:12,14,16	stun 12275:12	12263:7 12267:16,18	trying 12267:20	12259:2 12260:17,19
smoothly 12257:9	12282:11,11,17,21,21	12274:24,25	Tsietsi 12260:6	12262:16 12264:9
solely 12250:13	12282:23 12283:1,6	12276:11 12280:12	turns 12257:7	12275:13 12280:1
song 12275:8	12285:1,10,14	12283:24 12284:1,2	twice 12273:24	12281:19,20
soon 12258:9	12286:10	12284:11,24	two 12257:4,7	12288:14
sorry 12248:16	subject 12255:9	12285:18,19,19	12260:22 12261:4	wanted 12257:22
12257:3 12258:18	submission 12287:22	12287:7,11	12262:10 12265:10	12275:17 12284:19
12259:21 12260:21	12288:21 subsequent 12278:5	thanks 12248:20	12272:6 12282:24,25	wants 12277:5
12280:19 12284:13 sought 12249:2	success 12266:4	12289:12 that's 12250:6	12283:1,2	ward 12267:20
sought 12249.2 soul 12248:12	sudden 12284:25	12255:14 12258:19	U	12269:11 warded 12268:11
sounds 12271:17	suggesting 12276:7	12258:20 12267:4	ultimately 12250:5	12270:1
South 12255:2	suggesting 12270.7 suppose 12256:10	12272:25 12276:1	12261:24	warding 12268:9
12260:11	sure 12248:8 12261:13	12272:23 12270:1	understand 12249:15	Warrant 12263:21
sparked 12279:18,23	12262:9 12266:3,20	thereof 12283:16	12261:3 12262:3,24	12264:19
12282:3	12269:22 12281:17	there's 12263:5	12261:3 12262:3,24	warrant-officer
speak 12281:5	surfaces 12252:8	12280:10 12288:13	12281:17 12285:25	12260:5,6 12263:9,15
SPEAKER 12248:16	surprised 12251:21	they'll 12256:21	understanding	12264:1,11,20,25
12248:19 12267:15	survive 12269:3	thing 12257:4 12262:9	12252:11 12275:9	12267:21,24 12269:7
spears 12265:3	surviving 12269:5	12265:15 12281:19	undue 12288:12	12270:5,6,6,10,14,17
specific 12262:16	suspect 12270:21	things 12257:4,25	unfair 12257:14	12271:8,13,17
speculation 12256:25	swear 12259:14,18,19	12261:1	unfairness 12254:14	12273:12,17 12274:4
spoke 12270:15		think 12257:16	unfortunately	12285:24 12286:6,21
spot 12273:23	T	12258:4,7,15 12264:6	12251:11,17,25	12287:1
sprung 12261:10	table 12256:19	12266:1,18 12268:12	12256:15	wasn't 12277:20
square 12252:7	12266:14,14 12267:8	12268:15 12269:5	Union 12256:7	12283:5
squarely 12279:20	12267:10,12,13	12277:4 12280:10	units 12272:19,25	waste 12257:21
stabbed 12273:25	Takalani 12260:4	12283:7,17 12287:24	unlawful 12269:20	watching 12253:10
12274:2,5	take 12253:9 12259:3	12288:22,24	12276:25	way 12250:2,5,8,15
stage 12255:25	12259:13 12260:11	thinking 12274:21	unnecessary 12273:8	12261:16,22
12256:12 12262:15	12277:19,19,21	thought 12260:15	12279:19	12270:11 12288:12
12262:22 12264:17	12279:2 12282:20	12261:9	unrelated 12257:5	ways 12251:22
12271:11 12289:7	12288:12	threat 12279:17,23	unshaken 12257:19	weak 12266:9
Stand 12259:14	taken 12250:20	12280:23 12281:8	upwards 12270:11	weapon 12281:15
start 12248:7 12258:16	12270:14 12273:4	three 12265:10 12279:3	use 12261:14 12265:4	weapons 12265:3
12275:5 12282:10	12276:6 12280:24	thrust 12280:18,19	12276:16,20	12280:16,22 12281:7
12288:11	talk 12253:2	time 12251:6 12257:21	12281:16	12281:8,11,13,15,20
started 12275:7	talking 12251:4	12259:12 12260:1	usual 12256:23	week 12248:5
starting 12248:2	team 12248:5,19	12266:3 12267:25	12283:10	weight 12262:1
ARCHIVE FO	R JUSTICE			

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

		Page 7
went 12257:8 12273:15	12275:22 12276:13	
12281:5	14:04 12248:2	
we'd 12248:3 12256:11	14:24 12255:19	
12289:13,15	14:45 12259:7	
we'll 12252:21 12262:2	15 12253:6,15 12267:15	
12289:17	12267:17,19	
we're 12261:13	12285:24	
12266:12	15:04 12272:11	
we've 12258:4	15:24 12283:22	
whatsoever 12279:17	16 12253:6 12254:12	
what's 12249:23	19 12248:1 12249:5	
12253:9 12280:19	17 12240.1 12247.5	
12284:8	2	
WILLIAM 12259:19	2 12248:7	
win 12255:22	200 12280:17	
wisdom 12251:8	2012 12260:15	
wish 12250:10 12259:9	2013 12248:1 12260:7	
wishes 12285:21	12263:8	
withdrawal 12256:21		
withdrawn 12256:20	3	
witness 12260:2	3 12283:16 12284:10	
12261:1,2,15,20,20	30 12287:24	
12261:21,24	33 12274:12,17	
12274:10 12276:9	34 12278:24 12279:11	
12274:10 12270:3	12281:1	
12283:14,24	12201.1	
T	4	
12284:15 12288:2,13		
12288:14,22,24	4 12263:20 12287:20	
12289:9		
witnessed 12276:20	5	
witnesses 12261:5,6,7	5.56mm 12278:24	
12262:11,12,16	56 12278:15,25	
won't 12271:18	57 12278:13	
word 12256:5	58 12278:13,23	
words 12252:9	00 122 / 0.12 ,20	
workers 12285:7	6	
working 12250:3	64 12278:24	
_	04 122/8:24	
12272:23	7	
wouldn't 12257:19		
12280:25	7 12274:12,17,19	
wrong 12274:25	12275:2,3	
12280:10	7th 12263:8	
X	8	
Xolani 12283:13,25	8 12263:20	
Y	9	
yay 12249:15	9 12289:11,18	
YouTube 12253:10	9mm 12278:24	
you'll 12259:14,15		
you're 12259:14,13	9(1) 12284:18	
	98 12278:15,25	
12268:7 12284:3		
12288:17 12289:2		
you've 12250:13		
12259:1 12275:25		
12277:5 12284:21		
12289:14		
1		
1-5 12267:15	54	
10 12283:16 12284:10	2013	
100 12280:17	1	
11813 12263:20	1 x 18 /12/1/2	
12th 12272:5		
13th 12260:7 12272:1	CO PORTO	
	al your off	
12272:13,15 12275:3	0 11167106	
ARCHIVE FO	n	