# RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

# **COMMISSION OF INQUIRY**

## MARIKANA

#### **BEFORE TRIBUNAL**

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MS HEMRAJ SC

#### **HELD ON**

DAY 58 04 MARCH 2013

PAGES 6135 TO 6235

#### **HELD AT**

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



#### © REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za

Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278

Page 6135 Page 6137 [PROCEEDINGS ON 04 MARCH 2013] 15th, we shall lead evidence that not only places you on [10:09] CHAIRPERSON: the koppie on the 15th but also places you there with two 2 The Commission resumes. weapons. Would you care to comment? 3 You're still under oath. 4 MR MAGIDIWANA: 4 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chairperson and I need those things to be 5 members of the Commission. May I just remind you again of brought forward. 6 MR NGALWANA: Well let me ask you a 6 the importance of telling the truth. I've asked you on 7 7 direct question. It's a different question from the one previous occasions to be candid with this commission and 8 I've just asked you about whether or not you were there on 8 tell us that you were on the koppie on the 15th to which 9 9 your response was you don't recall being at the koppie on the 15th. Do you persist in your version that the only time 10 the 15th. The South African Police Service will lead 10 that you were carrying two weapons was when you were seated on the 16th of August 2012 at the koppie and that you had 11 11 evidence that places you firmly at the koppie on the 15th 12 borrowed the, they call it [African language] from the 12 August 2012. Do you want to reconsider your answer in that 13 regard or do you persist in saying that you were not - you person who was seated next to you? 14 do not recall having been at the koppie on the 15th August 14 MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm still persisting in 2012? Perhaps before you answer that question can I say 15 that, I'm still saying it. 15 this, if you do know that you were in fact at the koppie on 16 MR NGALWANA: 16 You persist that that is 17 the only occasion that you had those two weapons? 17 the 15th but you don't say so the Commission will be none 18 the wiser about the true events of that day from your 18 MR MAGIDIWANA: If there was any other 19 perspective. 19 occasion then you can prove or show it. 20 MR HANABE: The Commission will? 20 MR NGALWANA: Well what would your 21 MR NGALWANA: The Commission will be none 21 response be if the police presented such evidence? the wiser, in other words the Commission will not get to 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: 22 It is clear, Sir, because 23 23 the bottom of the truth as regards what happened on the the only weapon that was taken from me was a stick and that 24 koppie on that day the 15th. And that's because none of us 24 happened at the time I was holding it and I was lying down. 25 MR NGALWANA: I'm not sure I understand 25 will be able to ask you questions that will elicit an Page 6136 Page 6138 informative answer about the events of that day if you say your answer. Are you saying that if the police were to categorically that you were not there on that day. And if 2 present evidence placing two weapons, in other words 3 in fact you were there on the 15th and you deny that you placing you on the scene on the 15th or on any other day 4 were there and it is discovered that you were in fact there other than the 16th with two weapons that you would still 5 and could have shed light on the events of the 15th you then persist that you were not holding two weapons? would have committed perjury. Do you now want to 6 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so. 6 reconsider your answer? Were you or were you not at the 7 MR NGALWANA: Even if it is 7 koppie on the 15th August 2012? 8 incontrovertible evidence? 8 9 CHAIRPERSON: 9 MR MAGIDIWANA: Before you answer the I said, Sir, show it to question I'd like to add something extra. You've seen the 10 me so I can see it. 10 video clip of the 15th with someone whom you concede seems 11 11 MR NGALWANA: But your answer to the 12 to be you. Now having seen that video clip of what was 12 question of whether or not you were carrying two weapons on happening on the 15th has perhaps helped to jog your memory? 13 13 the 15th cannot depend on whether the police can produce 14 You say you couldn't remember before but when you saw the 14 evidence. You know whether or not you were carrying two 15 video clip did that perhaps jog your memory and help you to 15 weapons on the 15th. remember what happened on the 15th which you previously 16 MR MAGIDIWANA: But it's something that 16 couldn't remember? 17 17 is coming from you. 18 MR MAGIDIWANA: 18 No, it did not remind me. MR NGALWANA: So I take it you -19 CHAIRPERSON: Is it correct to say then 19 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, can I just interrupt that you still can't remember anything, you still can't for a moment? The point is this, if there is evidence led remember being on the koppie on the 15th August? 21 21 by the police to the effect that you were on the koppie on 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. 22 the 15th with two weapons or any other day apart from the MR NGALWANA: Mr Magidiwana, the police 23 16th with two weapons will that evidence be correct or 23 24 will also lead evidence, this is now a separate point from 24 incorrect? - cannot depend upon anything else, either it's

the evidence that you were in fact at the koppie on the

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

true or it's not true. If they lead that evidence would it

MR NGALWANA:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

And what was your answer?

```
Page 6139
                                                                                                                           Page 6141
    be correct or would it be incorrect?
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        I am saying I don't
 2
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                        recall ever being there on the 15th. The day that I
                                    What I know is in fact
 3
    what happened on the 16th. The day I remember is what
                                                                        remember very well is the 16th. The 16th the whole day.
 4
    happened on the 16th but anything that happened on the other
                                                                    4
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     Sir, still you have not
 5
    days I have no knowledge about such events or things.
                                                                        answered my question but yet let us proceed. May I direct
           MR NGALWANA:
 6
                                 Are you saying you have no
                                                                    6
                                                                        your attention to the first page of exhibit EEE7? The
 7
                                                                    7
    knowledge of whether or not you were carrying weapons, two
                                                                        police maintain that that photograph was taken on the 15th
    weapons on a day other than the 16th or are you saying
                                                                    8
                                                                        of August. You will see a yellow arrow in the top
8
                                                                    9
 9
    categorically that you were not carrying any two weapons on
                                                                        photograph which seeks to depict where you are standing.
10
    any day other than the 16th?
                                                                   10
                                                                        And the photograph below that is a blown up version, albeit
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
11
                                   I don't know, Sir, how
                                                                   11
                                                                        blurred that shows you clearer than the top photograph.
    you want me to explain it because what I said is I don't
                                                                   12
12
                                                                        Can you dispute that that is you in the photograph?
    remember ever going there to the mountain except the 16th.
                                                                        Perhaps if you focus more on the lower photograph.
13
    On the -
                                                                   14
                                                                        [10:29] MR MAGIDIWANA:
14
                                                                                                          That's what I am looking
                                                                   15
15
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 I'm sorry to interrupt.
                                                                        at.
    You still haven't answered my question. My question was if
                                                                   16
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     You recall that the top you
16
    there is evidence led by the police or anybody for that
                                                                   17
                                                                        were wearing, the sweater, was a green sweater written UZZI
17
18
    matter that you were there with two weapons on any day
                                                                        or U-Z-Z-I.
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
19
    other than the 16th will that evidence be true or false?
                                                                   19
                                                                                                        Yes, I remember that was
20
    Will it be correct or incorrect?
                                                                   20
                                                                        what I was wearing on the 16th.
21
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    That will not be true.
                                                                   21
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     Can you make out at least
22
           MR NGALWANA:
                                 Okay, so it is clear now
                                                                   22
                                                                        the U and part of the Z in the lower photograph on the
23
    that you categorically deny that you were there on the 15th
                                                                   23
                                                                        chest of your sweater?
                                                                   24
24
    and that you were carrying two weapons on the 15th.
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        It seems like the other
25
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                   25
                                   I said to you, Sir, if
                                                                        letters - it looks like a Z, but there is a person in fact
                                                        Page 6140
                                                                                                                           Page 6142
     you have such evidence you must present it because I know
                                                                        who is standing in front that it cannot be clearly seen.
 1
                                                                    1
    nothing about what you are saying.
                                                                    2
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
 2
                                                                                                      So you accept that that is
 3
            MR NGALWANA:
                                   Okay well now you seem to
                                                                        a UZ on the chest of that green sweater.
 4
    be reverting back to pleading ignorance. Perhaps this will
                                                                    4
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        Yes, I agree,
                                                                    5
 5
    jog your memory, Chair we beg leave to hand out some
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      You also accept that the
    exhibits, these have already been discovered in the police
                                                                        sweater you were wearing at least on the 16th was a sweater
 6
 7
                                                                    7
     external hard drive on my instructions -
                                                                        that was green, the same colour as this and written UZZI on
8
                                                                    8
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Will this be exhibit EEE7?
                                                                        the chest.
 9
                                                                    9
            MS PILLAY:
                              That's correct, Chair, EEE7.
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        Yes on the 16th that is
10
            COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ:
                                                                   10
                                                                        what I was wearing.
                                            Mr Magidiwana, is
     there anything at all that impedes your memory of what
11
                                                                   11
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      The police's evidence will
12
     might have happened on any of the days preceding the 16th?
                                                                   12
                                                                        be that on the 15th you were wearing the same sweater.
13
            MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     The reason why I'm saying
                                                                   13
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        No.
14
     that is that I don't recall ever going there except on the
                                                                   14
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      Can you dispute that if
15
     16th because I also remember all the occurrences or what
                                                                   15
                                                                        assuming that you were - no let me put it this way. Can
                                                                        you dispute that on this photograph that is indeed you?
16
     happened on the 16th.
                                                                   16
17
            MR NGALWANA:
                                  Sir, you are not answering
                                                                   17
                                                                        Forget the date, that is the evidence that the police will
    the question as directed to you but the question that was
18
                                                                   18
                                                                        lead later. Can you dispute, that on this photograph that
19
     asked is there anything that impedes your memory that
                                                                   19
                                                                        is indeed you, in as much as you have now accepted that you
     causes you not to remember ever being there besides the
                                                                        were wearing a sweater with the UZZI and you can clearly
21
     16th?
                                                                   21
                                                                        see UZ on that photograph. Can you dispute that, that is
22
            MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     I think earlier on when I
                                                                   22
                                                                        vou?
    was talking I gave an answer so I don't know what kind of
                                                                   23
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
23
                                                                                                        I don't know.
    answer you want me to give.
                                                                   24
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      Mr Magidiwana, the truth
```

again. I think you need to be reminded of telling the

		г -	
1	Page 6143 truth. You have accepted here that the green top you were	1	Page 6145 rod, you call it a bar, a sharpened bar or sharpened iron
2	wearing on the 16th was emblazoned with four letters, UZZI	2	bar.
3	and that that top was green, pretty much like the one we	3	MR MAGIDIWANA: I never carried an iron
		4	
4	see in the picture. That is correct, isn't it?	l -	bar, a sharpened iron bar.
5	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, the top or the	5	MR NGALWANA: No?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I never carried an
6	sweater I was wearing was green in colour.	6	
7	MR NGALWANA: Ja not just green, this	7	sharpened iron bar but the day which I remember where I
8	particular shade of green.	8	carried a sharpened iron bar was only on the 16th and I had
9	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, it was this	9	taken it from someone.
10	particular shade.	10	CHAIRPERSON: Now what we see here on
11	MR NGALWANA: It was in fact this	11	this photograph, did you ever possess an instrument of that
12	particular sweater.	12	kind that looks like that, even if it is during the
13	MR MAGIDIWANA: It was like this.	13	relevant period in August last year, did you possess an
14	MR NGALWANA: It was this.	14	instrument that looks like that?
15	MR MAGIDIWANA: That's why I am saying I	15	MR MAGIDIWANA: That's why I am saying
16	am not sure because if I look at the bottom I see there is	16	that I don't remember ever carrying such an object. I can
17	a sight of jeans that is appearing and together with a shoe	17	see it in this picture though I don't remember what object
18	that seems to be cream or I was not wearing this kind of	18	it was.
19	shoe.	19	CHAIRPERSON: Did you ever have in your
20	MR NGALWANA: Very well.	20	possession apart from the 16th which, we are not talking
21	MR MAGIDIWANA: A shoe like this and a	21	about that, did you ever have in your possession an
22	jean.	22	instrument that looked like that.
23	MR NGALWANA: Would you turn the page of	23	MR MAGIDIWANA: This is confusing me
24	that same exhibit. With your untrammelled vision and your	24	because what I remember, the day I remember in fact is the
25	un-obscured view can you now dispute that that is indeed	25	16th.
	Page 6144		Page 6146
1	Page 6144 you in the picture?	1	Page 6146 CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an
1 2	=	1 2	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement
	you in the picture?		CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an
2	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it	2	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement
2	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  But the face is mine, it is my face.	2	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is
2 3 4	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two	2 3 4	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period
2 3 4 5	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.	2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in
2 3 4 5 6	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.	2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind
2 3 4 5 6 7	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.	2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.  MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.  MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see. MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done. MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see. MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done. MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me. MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.  MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me.  MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite sure that you are not carrying a knobkierie there, alone or	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see. MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done. MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me. MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite sure that you are not carrying a knobkierie there, alone or only. Can you dispute that protruding from your left hand	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.  MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me.  MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite sure that you are not carrying a knobkierie there, alone or only. Can you dispute that protruding from your left hand is what appears to be an object other than the knobkierie	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th of August having had in your possession an object of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see.  MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done.  MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me.  MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite sure that you are not carrying a knobkierie there, alone or only. Can you dispute that protruding from your left hand is what appears to be an object other than the knobkierie that you say you've been carrying.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, it is clear that it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th of August having had in your possession an object of the kind you see on the photograph.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I see in this picture
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th of August having had in your possession an object of the kind you see on the photograph.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I see in this picture that I am carrying something but I am really confused. I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see. MR NGALWANA: You say it is your face. MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that was never done. MR NGALWANA: So, then you are saying that is in fact you? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is me. MR NGALWANA: You can see, I am quite sure that you are not carrying a knobkierie there, alone or only. Can you dispute that protruding from your left hand is what appears to be an object other than the knobkierie that you say you've been carrying.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, it is clear that it is something that is carried which I am not sure whether it is an iron bar.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th of August having had in your possession an object of the kind you see on the photograph.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I see in this picture that I am carrying something but I am really confused. I can see, I am hearing it here but I don't as to how I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	you in the picture?  MR MAGIDIWANA: But the face is mine, it is my face.  MR NGALWANA: Can you see the first two letters U and Z and the red blanket.  MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: You are not suggesting that it is your face that has been super imposed on someone else's body, do you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: MR NGALWANA: MR NGALWANA	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: Ja but that is not an answer my question. I know you said you had an implement in your hand on the 16th, but what I am asking you is something different. Did you at any stage in the period from say the 9th of August to the 15th of August have in your possession and implement or instrument of that kind such as we see on that photograph?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear in this picture that I am carrying something, I am holding something.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, I understand that, but you say you can't remember. That's why I am asking you can you remember at any stage from the 9th to the 15th having had in your possession an instrument of that kind.  MR MPOFU: Chairperson, can we stick with object at this stage.  CHAIRPERSON: An object of that kind.  Can you ever recall during the period of the 9th to the 15th of August having had in your possession an object of the kind you see on the photograph.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I see in this picture that I am carrying something but I am really confused. I

1	Page 6147	_	Page 6149
1	it an iron bar or an iron rod, you said [African language].	1	MR NGALWANA: Was he a coward or was he
2	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I said it seems like	2	brave?
3	it is an iron bar. I didn't say it is in fact an iron bar,	3	MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know.
4	I said it seems like it is one.	4	MR NGALWANA: Would you consider yourself
5	MR NGALWANA: If it is one you will	5	a coward or a brave man?
6	accept that [African language] is a weapon?	6	[10:49] MR MAGIDIWANA: I consider myself a
7	MR MAGIDIWANA: In your own way then I	7	coward.
8	can accept, but I don't think it is weapon.	8	MR NGALWANA: Would you consider yourself
9	MR NGALWANA: You don't think an iron rod	9	a weak man or a strong man?
10	shape like this is a weapon?	10	MR MAGIDIWANA: I then don't know as to
11	MR MAGIDIWANA: No.	11	how I am as to whether I am weak or not perhaps according
12	MR NGALWANA: It is not a dangerous	12	to the way you are looking at me you can consider me weak
13	weapon.	13	or otherwise, I don't know.
14	MR MAGIDIWANA: No.	14	MR NGALWANA: You know very well that I'm
15	MR NGALWANA: Okay. If you flip over the	15	not talking about appearances. I'm talking about your
16	page, Mr Magidiwana, you will see pretty much the same	16	character.
17	image and so will the forth page. The police will lead	17	MR MAGIDIWANA: No then if you put it
18	evidence that this was not only the 15th of August but that	18	that way I am a coward.
19	you were carrying a sharpened iron rod, you call it an iron	19	MR NGALWANA: You've answered that
20	bar, the police will confirm that it was in fact a	20	question, I'm asking you a different one.
21	sharpened iron bar.	21	MR MAGIDIWANA: Which question are you
22	MR HANABE: Are you saying, Counsel, not	22	asking?
23	only on the 15th.	23	MR NGALWANA: Would you consider yourself
24	MR NGALWANA: Yes this is not, we will	24	a weak man or a strong man?
25	lead evidence that not only was this picture taken on the	25	MR MAGIDIWANA: I consider myself a weak
	Page 6148		Page 6150
1	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying	1	man.
2	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.	2	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?
2	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?	2	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since
2 3 4	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.	2 3 4	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision
2	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened	2	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if
2 3 4 5 6	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from	2 3 4 5 6	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.
2 3 4 5 6 7	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to	2 3 4 5 6 7	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer? MR NGALWANA: Go ahead. MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar. MR NGALWANA: Right. CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you? MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	15th but also that on the 15th he was on the koppie carrying a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I accept that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	man.  MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer? MR NGALWANA: Go ahead. MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right. CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I accept that. CHAIRPERSON: You therefore accept that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that.  CHAIRPERSON: You therefore accept that it is a dangerous weapon?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when the going gets tough would run away?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that.  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I accept that.  CHAIRPERSON: You therefore accept that it is a dangerous weapon?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when the going gets tough would run away?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The one who runs away
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that:  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I accept that:  CHAIRPERSON: You therefore accept that it is a dangerous weapon?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes,  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Alright. Would you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when the going gets tough would run away?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I accept that it is a dangerous weapon?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I accept that it is a dangerous weapon?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: Alright. Would you consider Mambush to have been a brave man?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when the going gets tough would run away?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The one who runs away
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	a sharpened iron rod.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Go ahead.  MR MAGIDIWANA: If it was a sharpened iron bar, I cannot lie. I don't know where I got it from or to whom I took it, from whom I took it, but according to my observation here it looks like an iron bar.  MR NGALWANA: Right.  CHAIRPERSON: An iron bar is a dangerous weapon. You can do a lot of damage with an iron bar can't you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No then maybe it is like that, Sir.  CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what that answer means. Would you accept that if it is an iron bar you can do a lot of damage with an iron bar if you hit someone on the head with it? Would you accept that:  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I accept that:  CHAIRPERSON: You therefore accept that it is a dangerous weapon?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes,  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Alright. Would you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MR NGALWANA: You are a man aren't you?  Not as opposed to being a woman, I'm talking about since you are a Xhosa man you would have gone to circumcision school. I'm going somewhere with this Chairperson if you'll indulge me.  CHAIRPERSON: Isn't he a Momvana, do they have circumcision? That's something you can look at it  MR NGALWANA: I'm giving him the opportunity to answer that question, Chairperson.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I am not a man, I'm a young man.  MR NGALWANA: So I take you haven't gone to circumcision school then.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not like that. I am circumcised. A man is an old man who is a head of house and a person like me is a young man and a boy is someone who has never been to initiation school.  MR NGALWANA: Thanks for the lecture.  Would you consider yourself the sort of young man who when the going gets tough would run away?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The one who runs away when it's tough. It is so, when it is tough you have to

Page 6151 Page 6153 just answered the question that you just posed. young man who perseveres? 1 2 2 MR NGALWANA: Do you remember what view MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I'm not that type of 3 young man. you held in your evidence in chief? 4 MR NGALWANA: You're not the sort of MR MAGIDIWANA: You can tell me. 5 5 young who would stand his ground for what he wants, MR NGALWANA: Well you have just told the believing it to be rightfully his? 6 Commission that you held a different view then than you 6 7 7 MR MAGIDIWANA: If then that thing that hold now so surely you must know what the different version is rightfully mine is the right thing then in that sense I 8 8 was earlier. 9 9 can stand my grounds but if it is something that is not MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm saying then you can right and something I cannot stand against then I just 10 tell me. 10 What is the difference 11 leave it. 11 MR NGALWANA: 12 12 between your version now and your version then about the MR NGALWANA: Well you considered the fear of losing your job? 13 demand for R12 500 to be a right demand not so? 13 MR MAGIDIWANA: 14 MR MAGIDIWANA: Indeed and even now I 14 There are many things still want it, in fact very much. 15 that I said earlier on. It's not just one thing. 15 16 MR NGALWANA: Specifically about the fear 16 MR NGALWANA: So you would stand your of losing your job. 17 ground in demanding the 12 500 because you believe it to be 17 18 rightfully yours? 18 MR MAGIDIWANA: It was the thought of 19 MR MAGIDIWANA: I can stand and then 19 going home that if I were to go home and that the people 20 speak if the circumstances are compelling especially when I 20 would - if it happened that people go back to work what I 21 want such a demand. said was that now the fear would be that the fact that I'm 21 22 remaining at home would cause me to lose employment alone MR NGALWANA: And when someone or people 22 23 stand in your way to your getting the 12 500 that you 23 which is being one. 24 believe to be rightfully yours are you saying you'll simply 24 MR NGALWANA: But you were as much at 25 walk away? risk of losing your job if you went home as you were if you Page 6152 Page 6154 joined and supported an unprotected strike, not so? 1 MR MAGIDIWANA: In the way in which you 2 MR MAGIDIWANA: 2 are putting it that's what happened and it happened that It is not the same thing. 3 the people died and died and that is what made me want it 3 MR NGALWANA: But on both occasions you 4 even more as I still want it. 4 lose your job. 5 5 MR NGAI WANA: Well and if the employer MR MAGIDIWANA: If the employer had said refuses what then? I am firing you and then he would get rid and throw away 6 6 7 7 MR MAGIDIWANA: The employer never said all the documents and say I am employing other people then 8 8 he is refusing. It's only that never came to the workers. it could have been like that but if then the employer just 9 What I saw is that we were then destroyed by the police. remained there - there is then still hope that he will come 10 10 back. Yes there is still that hope that the employer then MR NGALWANA: You're not answering my 11 will come back to us. question. You're saying you will persist in the R12 000 11 because people have died for it, I'm paraphrasing, I'm 12 MR NGALWANA: I next want to take you 12 13 saying to you if the employer refuses what then? 13 back to where we left off on Friday. Perhaps Chairperson 14 MR MAGIDIWANA: I will sit down and not 14 if this is the convenient time to adjourn. 15 15 CHAIRPERSON: - quarter past 11, because go to work just as in the manner in which we did. MR NGALWANA: You know of course that 16 we only started at 10 o'clock. 16 17 that would be the quickest way to your losing your job not 17 MR NGALWANA: Oh okay. If there's a particular 18 18 CHAIRPERSON: reason why you want an earlier adjournment I'll consider it 19 MR MAGIDIWANA: But then it is better to 19 lose employment being many mine employees rather than 20 but that was my plan. 20 21 losing a job being one person standing alone. 21 MR NGALWANA: No I'll continue, 22 MR NGALWANA: You held a different view 22 Chairperson. earlier in your evidence in chief. 23 CHAIRPERSON: We started slightly after 23 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes my view had to be 24 10 anyway but I won't use that against you. different at the time I was giving evidence but now I have 25 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair, I'm ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

```
Page 6155
                                                                                                                        Page 6157
    indebted to the Chairperson and the Commission. Well
                                                                      that when we do will you still persist that you were not at
                                                                  2
                                                                      the koppie on the 14th?
2
    before I go there can I come back to this recurring theme
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
3
    of your presence at the koppie on a particular date? We
                                                                  3
                                                                                                       No I was never there.
4
    dealt with the 15th, we dealt with the 16th. Would you deny
                                                                  4
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    So you will dispute it
5
    having been on the koppie on the 14th August 2012?
                                                                      despite evidence.
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                  6
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
6
                                    No, no, no I can dispute
                                                                                                       I'm saying I was never
7
    that.
                                                                  7
                                                                      there.
8
           COMMISSIONER TOKOTO:
                                                                  8
                                                                                                     You will say that despite
                                            Sorry, Mr Ngalwana,
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
9
    before you go to the 16th or the 14th can you look at photo
                                                                  9
                                                                      evidence showing the contrary?
10
    number five? That with three I think, yes. Let's start
                                                                  10
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       I am saying I was not
    with three. I take it you admit that person depicted there
                                                                  11
11
                                                                      there on that day.
                                                                  12
12
    is you. That person is pointed out on the top photograph
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    Let's start with, this is
13
    but it's clearer on the photograph - you see that, this we
                                                                  13
                                                                      the first part of the evidence, it's in phases. Can I take
14
    have agreed now is an iron rod, that iron rod which is
                                                                  14
                                                                      you to page six of the EEE7, documents that you have in
    appearing on this previous photo, you're still carrying it
                                                                      front of you? You will see in the bottom photographs it
15
    there, do you see that?
                                                                      appears to be naked persons or on the left hand side of the
16
17
                                                                  17
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    I can see it.
                                                                      photograph, bottom left, can you see that?
18
           COMMISSIONER TOKOTO:
                                            That there the
                                                                  18
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       Yes I can see.
    stick, a knobkerrie protruding on the right hand side is
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
19
                                                                  19
                                                                                                    There is another group on
20
    that your knobkerrie?
                                                                  20
                                                                      the other side of that beaten track, a group standing
21
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    It is mine.
                                                                  21
                                                                      there. Can you see that?
22
           COMMISSIONER TOKOTO:
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                            It also appears in
                                                                  22
                                                                                                       I can see these people
23
    photograph number five.
                                                                  23
                                                                      who are wearing clothes.
24
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                  24
                                    Yes, it is appearing.
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    The police allege that that
25
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Thank you Commissioner. So
                                                                      is when the rituals were taking place. Are you in a
                                                      Page 6156
                                                                                                                        Page 6158
    Mr Magidiwana, you appear, correct me if I am wrong, to be
                                                                      position to dispute that?
1
                                                                  1
    denying rather emphatically your presence on the koppie on
                                                                  2
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
2
                                                                                                      I don't know about that,
3
    the 14th than you did the one of the 15th, correct?
                                                                      I was not there.
4
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    No, no, no I don't agree.
                                                                  4
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    So you cannot dispute it.
                                                                  5
5
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  What don't you agree with?
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                      I'm saying I don't know
                                                                      about it, I was not there as to whether, what they were
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
6
                                    What you are saying.
7
                                                                  7
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  You don't agree that you've
                                                                      doing I wouldn't know.
                                                                  8
8
    denied emphatically your presence on the koppie on the 14th
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    May I ask you to turn the
9
    than you did on the 15th?
                                                                      page to page seven? You will see it is now some 25 minutes
10
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    No, I disagree.
                                                                  10
                                                                      later than the first photograph. If you look at the top
11
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  I think the nuance is lost
                                                                  11
                                                                      photograph do you see the group that is huddled at, or
12
    here.
                                                                  12
                                                                      higher, almost close to the intersection of the two beaten
                                                                      paths?
13
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 I think he may not
                                                                  13
14
    understand the subtlety of the point you're putting and I
                                                                  14
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                      I can see all these
15
    wonder whether the effort expending in trying to convey it
                                                                  15
                                                                      people who are here as seated.
    to him will be rewarded. Perhaps you can approach the
                                                                  16
16
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    The police will show that
17
    point from a different angle.
                                                                  17
                                                                      that is the group that participated in the ritual and that
18
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Yes no let me move on,
                                                                      you were present in that group. If you look at the
19
    Chairperson, thank you. The police, Mr Magidiwana, will
                                                                  19
                                                                      photograph which is almost an insert below, the yellow
    place you firmly on the koppie on the 14th of August during
                                                                      arrow is pointing at where you are seated in that group.
21
    the performance of the rituals. Will you be in any
                                                                      No we cannot see your face but will you dispute that that
    position to dispute that if incontrovertible evidence is
                                                                  22
                                                                      is indeed you?
    placed before the Commission?
                                                                  23
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                      No, no, no this is not
24 [11:09] MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                      No show that thing.
                                                                  24
                                                                      me.
           MR NGALWANA:
                                 No we will. I'm asking you
                                                                  25
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                    Can I ask you to turn to
```

		т —	
1	Page 6159 page eight of that same document? If you cast your eye in	1	Page 6161 MR NGALWANA: Whether the top garment is
2	the lower photograph is the image not clearer that that is	2	a T-shirt or not what colour is it?
3	you?	3	MR MPOFU: Chairperson, I know I'm not an
4	MR MAGIDIWANA: This is not me.	4	interpreter but the interpreter is struggling with the
5	MR NGALWANA: Do you see the red blanket?	5	colour that has been described as [African language] and I
6	MR MAGIDIWANA: It seems like this is not	6	think I've looked at the evidence leaders and we agree that
7	even a blanket, is this not a T-shirt?	7	it means it looks paler. Ja so [African language] is to
8	MR NGALWANA: Do you see the green	8	fade as it where or ja maybe faded would be better than
9	garment below the red blanket?	9	what Mr Ngalwana says.
10	MR MAGIDIWANA: No this is not green.	10	CHAIRPERSON: Before, just before we take
11	MR NGALWANA: What colour would you give	11	the tea adjournment let's finish this point before we take
12	it?	12	the tea adjournment, finish this point, repeat your
13	MR MAGIDIWANA: It seems like it's	13	question, listen carefully to the translation. If you
14	yellowish.	14	don't agree with the translation let's get an agreed
15	MR NGALWANA: Yellowish.	15	translation before the witness answers because we'll go
16	MR MAGIDIWANA: Like almost yellow.	16	around and around in circles and we'll never have our tea.
17	MR NGALWANA: The colour below the red or	17	MR NGALWANA: Thank you Chair. What
18	maroon? You say -	18	colour you say is faded or -
19	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	19	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes it is faded.
20	MR NGALWANA: I thought I was colour	20	MR NGALWANA: Faded unless I don't know
21	blind. Can I ask you to turn to page nine? In the lower	21	my colours doesn't strike me as a colour.
22	photograph does that still appear yellow to you?	22	MR MAGIDIWANA: That is why I'm saying
23	MR MAGIDIWANA: This which is depicted here looks	23	that it's because the colour itself is confusing me and in
24	exactly like the one which we were looking at before.	24	fact it's not what I was wearing.
25	MR NGALWANA: Are you looking at where	25	MR NGALWANA: It's closer to red isn't
		ļ	
1	Page 6160	1	Page 6162
1	the yellow arrow is pointing?	1	it?
2	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking	2	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red
2 3	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.	2	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?
2 3 4	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the	2 3 4	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say
2 3 4 5	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.	2 3 4 5	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?
2 3 4	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the	2 3 4	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.	2 3 4 5 6 7	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph	2 3 4 5 6	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me? MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your
2 3 4 5 6 7	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me? MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes. MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me? MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes. MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it - MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat it so that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me? MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes. MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it - MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes.  Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes.  Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON:  Perhaps this is - well
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes.  Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON:  Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.  CHAIRPERSON: The question doesn't relate	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes.  Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON:  Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air. Let's sort it out before we go. If you look at the photograph, that is the lower photograph of exhibit EEE7.10
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.  CHAIRPERSON: The question doesn't relate to the red garment, sorry, the question doesn't relate	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes.  Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON:  Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air. Let's sort it out before we go. If you look at the photograph, that is the lower photograph of exhibit EEE7.10
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.  CHAIRPERSON: The question doesn't relate to the red garment, sorry, the question doesn't relate to the red garment it relates to the lower, what appears to be	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA:  That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE:  Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA:  It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON:  Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air.  Let's sort it out before we go. If you look at the photograph, that is the lower photograph of exhibit EEE7.10 you'll see there's an arrow pointing to someone who appears
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.  CHAIRPERSON: The question doesn't relate to the red garment it relates to the lower, what appears to be the lower garment and the question is what is the colour of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA: It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air.  Let's sort it out before we go. If you look at the photograph, that is the lower photograph of exhibit EEE7.10 you'll see there's an arrow pointing to someone who appears to have two garments.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	the yellow arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That's where I'm looking at.  MR NGALWANA: And you persist that the lower, call it a garment is not green but yellow.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know exactly the colour but it looks brighter.  MR NGALWANA: Perhaps the next photograph might help put things in perspective. Would you turn to page 10? Do you see the lower photograph where the arrow is pointing?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.  MR NGALWANA: Does the lower garment still look yellow to you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I asked if this red thing that is appearing is not a T-shirt.  MR NGALWANA: The answer is no but you haven't answered my question.  CHAIRPERSON: The question doesn't relate to the red garment it relates to the lower, what appears to be the lower garment and the question is what is the colour of that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	it?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because then I had a red towel are you trying to say then that this was me?  MR NGALWANA: That colour which you say is faded is closer to red is it not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: The answer to your question is yes. Although I'm not - I shouldn't be answering your questions is yes.  MR HANABE: Which is exactly what I was saying that his answer to you is yes, I said it -  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat it so that as I'm saying yes you must tell me what is it that I'm saying yes to?  MR NGALWANA: It appears the witness doesn't remember his own question to me but perhaps -  CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps this is - well maybe we shouldn't leave his point hanging in the air.  Let's sort it out before we go. If you look at the photograph, that is the lower photograph of exhibit EEE7.10 you'll see there's an arrow pointing to someone who appears to have two garments.  MR HANABE: Is it page 10 Commissioner,

1	Page 6163 MR HANABE: Page 10.		Page 6165
	ğ ,	1	MR MAGIDIWANA: No it is not so Sir.
2	MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it.	2	MR NGALWANA: we do not consider that a
3	CHAIRPERSON: Okay now what colour would	3	declaration of war on you.
4	you say is the top garment?	4	MR MAGIDIWANA: I can't agree to fight
5	MR MAGIDIWANA: It's red.	5	with you whereas we have never quarrelled.
6	CHAIRPERSON: And the lower garment?	6	MR NGALWANA: You are being evasive. I'm
7	MR MAGIDIWANA: The one at the bottom is	7	not talking about the reason to fight, I'm saying to you
8	the one that is not quite clear. I don't really know the	8	that I'm going to kill you here. Is that not a challenge?
9	colour thereof.	9	MR MAGIDIWANA: No.
10	CHAIRPERSON: It looks like that's	10	MR NGALWANA: Even if I then say I'm
11	greenish but it seems to have what looked like yellowish	11	going to finish you off here, leave here is that not a
12	tones to it as well, would you agree with that?	12	challenge?
13	MR MAGIDIWANA: That's why I said that	13	MR MAGIDIWANA: No "eish" it is not.
14	it's also confusing me because it looks like yellow.	14	MR NGALWANA: The problem sir – No sorry
15	CHAIRPERSON: It looks like greenish with	15	I am not going to comment.
16	yellow tones. Would that be fair?	16	CHAIRPERSON: How much further do you
17	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	17	want to take this point, he seems to have dug his heels in
18	CHAIRPERSON: I think we've all earned a	18	the sand, and set his position in the concrete. I'm not
19	cup of tea including you Mr Magidiwana.	19	sure that you are going go persuade him to a different
20	[COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]	20	view.
21	[11:53] CHAIRPERSON: The commission resumes. Mr	21	MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair.
22	Magidiwana, you are still under oath?	22	CHAIRPERSON: You may find a way of
23	MR NGALWANA: Sir, I'm asking you just	23	dealing - using our time more profitably, but if you can
24	listen carefully what I'm about to say, what I'm about to	24	take another point.
25	ask you? We have been here before but unfortunately as in	25	MR NGALWANA: Thank you chair, we shall
	David (4) 4		Page 1411
1	Page 6164 many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to	1	Page 6166 argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among
1 2	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to	1 2	Page 6166 argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr
	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die		argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among
2	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to	2	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr
2	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a	2 3	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that
2 3 4	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are	2 3 4	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?
2 3 4 5	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us	2 3 4 5	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.
2 3 4 5 6	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are	2 3 4 5 6	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?
2 3 4 5 6 7	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill	2 3 4 5 6 7	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  People spoke they gave
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  Yes.  MR NGALWANA:  But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA:  People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA:  You yourself, didn't leave
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave. MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you are going to die here, let us sign a paper me and you, so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave. MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made it clear that it was not prepared to negotiate with RDOs
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you are going to die here, let us sign a paper me and you, so that the whole world can see how the two of us, meaning	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made it clear that it was not prepared to negotiate with RDOs not so?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you are going to die here, let us sign a paper me and you, so that the whole world can see how the two of us, meaning myself Mariana and you Magidiwana kill each other. By so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made it clear that it was not prepared to negotiate with RDOs not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Where?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you are going to die here, let us sign a paper me and you, so that the whole world can see how the two of us, meaning myself Mariana and you Magidiwana kill each other. By so doing I'll will be challenging you. Forget now about	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave.  MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made it clear that it was not prepared to negotiate with RDOs not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Where?  MR NGALWANA: Didn't the employer say
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	many instances I did not get a clear answer. If I say to you, that you are not going any where you are going to die here, I am going to finish you off here that will be a declaration of war on you, not so?  Are you declaring war if I say to you, you are not going to leave here, you are going to die here? Let us sign a paper so that the whole world can see how we kill each other today. I will be issuing a challenge by making a challenge by that isn't?  MR MAGIDIWANA: I said to that question you asked that the right person to answer it, is the person who uttered those words because I never heard such a thing being said.  MR NGALWANA: You are not answering the question sir. I just want to be patient with you because this issue is really important. I want your view I'm not talking about Mambush, I'm talking about myself and you. I'm saying If I say to you, you are not going anywhere, you are going to die here, let us sign a paper me and you, so that the whole world can see how the two of us, meaning myself Mariana and you Magidiwana kill each other. By so doing I'll will be challenging you. Forget now about Mambush I'm just talking about me and you, if then I say	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	argue of course with reference to this sort of answer among others, about the evasiveness of the witness. When Mr Mathunjwa addressed you at the koppie, you testified that he knelt he went on his knees and pretty much begged you to leave the Koppie and go home is that not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But you did not leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: People spoke they gave the reasons why they did not leave. MR NGALWANA: You yourself, didn't leave did you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: And the reasons you advanced was as I recall that you were waiting for an employer to come and address you on your demands not so? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: But the employer had made it clear that it was not prepared to negotiate with RDOs not so?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Where? MR NGALWANA: Didn't the employer say there was a two year wage agreement that was in place and

Page 6169

Page 6170

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

```
Page 6167
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     I never heard about that.
1
           MR MOTAU:
2
                              Chairperson, the members of
3
    the commission if I may just correct one thing from what Mr
4
    Ngalwana is putting, the position by the employer was that
5
    they are not going to negotiate with the RDO's outside of
    the Collective Bargaining Structure. So if that question
6
7
    can be properly put?
8
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 The question was actually
9
    wrongly formulated, as far as I can recall, the point about
    two year agreement was actually made by the NUM shop
10
    stewards at various meetings that were spoken about. And I
11
12
    do not recall any evidence to the effect that Lonmin put
13
    the point and based their refusal on that ground. So I
14
    think the question should be reformulated to meet those
15
    points.
16
           MR MPOFU:
                              Chairperson, just to add the
17
    further point is that even if, even if that had happened -
18
    the gist of the question is that this was communicated to
19
    the employees. And if that is what has been put -
20
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 The witness has denied that
21
    so the problem falls away - but Lonmin's counsel was
22
    concerned because the impression was being created about
23
    Lonmin, which he did not agree with. Lonmin's stance as I
24
    recall was we are not prepared to negotiate with people at
25
    least they give up their arms, and we are not prepared to
                                                       Page 6168
1
    negotiate on the Koppie.
```

point, Chair. The employer had conveyed to people at the koppie, not so, that the employer was not going to come and 3 address you? 4 MR HANABE: You mean the employer sent two people? 6 MR NGALWANA: Well Mr Mathunjwa conveyed 7 to members on the koppie, on that day, the 16th that the 8 employer was not coming. 9 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I never heard that 10 being said. 11 MR NGALWANA: Well you appear to have 12 selective memory, Mr Magidiwana, may I take you to I think I was corrected it is 009 or 0009 is it double 009, which 14 is an exert or a transcription of Mr Mathunjwa's address. I take you in particular to - as mine is not paginated three pages from the back, in other words the third last 17 page. Where the employees is written in bold, and there's it is ours with an exclamation mark that is written along 19 side that, do you see that? 20 CHAIRPERSON: Nobody has ever ascertained 21 whether he can read, and even if he can read I doubt if he can read something in English. Of course it is available in isiXhosa on the left hand column. But perhaps before 24 you ask him whether he can see something in English on a written document you should ascertain whether, A he can

2 MR MPOFU: Outside. 3 CHAIRPERSON: We negotiate in an office 4 and we negotiate with representatives? 5 MR MPOFU: Correct. CHAIRPERSON: And there was also a point 6 7 about the Collective Bargaining Structures - that was their 8 stance as I indicate it, as I remember that. 9 MR MPOFU: Thank you chair. 10 CHAIRPERSON: But anyway the witness 11 doesn't know anything about that, so your point doesn't 12 even rise 13 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair, my 14 learned friend for Lonmin is quite right, the position was 15 that Lonmin was not prepared to negotiate outside the Collective Bargaining. 16 17 CHAIRPERSON: I think that may be 18 relevant to the point that I think you're making, is that 19 Mr Mathuniwa reported that he tried to get - he had spoken to the employer, and my recollection is it seemed clear 21 from what he had to say, that the employer was not coming 22 and if they stayed there'll be very drastic consequences which he then outlined, which I take it, is the direction 24 which you are trying to move.

MR NGALWANA: Well that's precisely the

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

2 not material to the point you are trying to make or 3 anything. 4 MR MPOFU: Sorry Chairperson, sorry Mr Ngalwana, also this was raised two days ago also, so that the witness is not deliberately misled or confused, the 6 7 last two questions were asked about the second Mathunjwa 8 visit, it must be made clear that this -9 CHAIRPERSON: I'm quite sure that any 10 misleading would not be deliberate so I don't think that is 11 an issue. 12 MR MPOFU: Fair enough. 13 CHAIRPERSON: But the point you make is 14 correct but what is now being put is a transcript of what was said on the first occasion, and it is in fact now 15 common cause that the second speech wasn't recorded. So 16 17 they probably said to some extent at least, some of the -18 MR MPOFU: Similar, thank you. 19 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chairperson. 20 Can you read - I take it you can read, Mr Magidiwana? 21 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can read. 22 MR NGALWANA: I take it you can read the 23 English Language and understand it? 24 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, it is not like that I don't know it.

read and B whether he can understand in English. But it is

	Page 6171		Page 6173
1	MR NGALWANA: If - you can read English?	1	will also not go to work, I will sit there until he comes
2	CHAIRPERSON: If he can read he can read	2	back here again.
3	the isiXhosa and the English is just the translation of the	3	MR NGALWANA: But Mr Mathunjwa has just
4	isiXhosa. He would say, let's get back to the original	4	told you that the employer is not talking about R12 500.
5	text and not mess around with the translation. If that	5	So you must accept that it is unreasonable of you to expect
6	were his attitude it would not be unreasonable would it?	6	the employer who said categorically according to Mr
7	MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair. Well I	7	Mathunjwa, that he's not talking about R12 500 to come and
8	shall read in English and the translation will be done in	8	address you on the very issue that he says he's not talking
9	Xhosa, it is along side the English version anyway.	9	about.
10	MR MAGIDIWANA: It is also mixed with	10	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes it was like that. We
11	isiZulu.	11	had to wait as employees because they were tired of working
12	MR NGALWANA: That is fine you can	12	for peanuts.
13	understand it surely, can't you, you can understand a mix	13	MR NGALWANA: You're not answering my
14	of Zulu and Xhosa both being Nguni Languages can't you?	14	question.
15	MR MAGIDIWANA: You can then – but I am	15	MR MAGIDIWANA: What do you want me to
16	not familiar with Zulu that is where I will miss, I will	16	say?
17	not understand.	17	MR NGALWANA: I am not talking about R12
18	MR NGALWANA: Well you just try.	18	500 with these people who are sitting there. I have not
19	CHAIRPERSON: Isn't the way to do it, the	19	yet finished asking my question. I am not going to talk
20	interpreter can read - counsel will read the English	20	about R12 500 with these people. This was Mr Mathunjwa
21	translation, the interpreter then can put to you what was	21	talking, telling the workers what he was told by the
22	said by Mr Mathunjwa in the original Xhosa, Zulu language	22	employer. You were there you heard the words of Mr
23	that he spoke, and if there is something you do not	23	Mathunjwa. I see you're nodding so I take it that's a yes.
24	understand about the Zulu part you can raise that and then	24	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I heard it.
25	you will be helped with that.	25	MR NGALWANA: When the employer says I'm
	Page 6172		Page 6174
1	Page 6172 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.	1	Page 6174 not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for
1 2	9	1 2	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.		not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for
2	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,	2	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come
3	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000	2	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.
2 3 4	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?	2 3 4	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here
2 3 4 5	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	2 3 4 5	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired
2 3 4 5 6	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer	2 3 4 5 6	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to
2 3 4 5 6 7	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?	2 3 4 5 6 7	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says, "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that? MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says, "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that? MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat? MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says, "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that? MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat? MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says, "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that? MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat? MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500? MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh. MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand. MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR MAGIDIWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR MAGIDIWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR MAGIDIWANA: Pes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MR MAGIDIWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on what reasonable basis can you expect the employer to come	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd of which you were a part, "the life of a black person in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR MAGIDIWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on what reasonable basis can you expect the employer to come to the koppie and address you on that issue of R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Well I asked the question	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd of which you were a part, "the life of a black person in Africa is so cheap," I'm in the second last page, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I understand.  MR NGALWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on what reasonable basis can you expect the employer to come to the koppie and address you on that issue of R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd of which you were a part, "the life of a black person in Africa is so cheap," I'm in the second last page, the middle of the page, sort of two thirds of the way down.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR MAGIDIWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on what reasonable basis can you expect the employer to come to the koppie and address you on that issue of R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Well I asked the question	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd of which you were a part, "the life of a black person in Africa is so cheap," I'm in the second last page, the middle of the page, sort of two thirds of the way down. Has my learned friend found the page?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MR MAGIDIWANA: Right Mr Mathunjwa says,  "Comrades what I bring to you is that we heard that 12 000 is needed." Do you understand that part?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat?  MR NGALWANA: We hear that the employer is not talking about that, in other words about the R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Oh.  MR NGALWANA SC: You understand that?  [12:13] MR MAGIDIWANA: I hear you.  MR NGALWANA: That being so why would the employer come to the koppie to address you, well let me phrase it this way. If the employer is not talking about the R12 500 demand as Mr Mathunjwa is reporting to you on what reasonable basis can you expect the employer to come to the koppie and address you on that issue of R12 500?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Can I answer?  MR NGALWANA: Well I asked the question so please answer. I'm talking about you, I'm not talking	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	not going to talk about R12 500 then there is no reason for the workers to wait for an employer - the employer to come and address them about the R12 500.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Also but the reason here is clear. I said they are working hard and they are tired of working for peanuts and that the employer must come to us and talk to us. We are employees and he is our employer so let him come to us so that we can go back to our employment. He never came.  MR NGALWANA: Yes because he said he wasn't going to talk to you about R 12 000. Why should he come?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The employers also said that - the employees also said they are not going back to work, they are going to sit in that place. We are going to sit in that place.  MR NGALWANA: Okay then Mr Mathunjwa issues a gruesome warning. He says, addressing the crowd of which you were a part, "the life of a black person in Africa is so cheap," I'm in the second last page, the middle of the page, sort of two thirds of the way down. Has my learned friend found the page?  CHAIRPESON: Thank you.

Page 6177

Page 6178

25

Page 6175 them and pay them these salaries that do not do anything in the black person's life." There can be no doubt he's 2 3 talking about the employer there, not the police because 4 police don't employ anyone as normally. He then says "that 5 would mean we were defeated but capitalists will be the 6 ones who win, but we have a way that you showed us that 7 here is the way to go." Then he kneels down and begs you to stop this blood. He says "we do not want bloodshed but we 8 9 want your problems to be solved and get your salaries." Now 10 despite this warning, despite the employer having said he's not going to discuss R12 500 with you, still you remained 11 on the koppie. That was not a reasonable thing or prudent 12 13 thing to do was it? 14 MR MAGIDIWANA: That thing was very 15 prudent because what was right for the employer was for him to come to the employees or the workers and tell them that 16 17 if you are not going back to employment then I'm going to 18 dismiss you instead of the world to be destroyed because of 19 employment. 20 MR NGALWANA: Your mike is still on are you done? 21 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: I am done. 23 MR NGALWANA: Sir, the employer says I'm not coming and the employees are saying we are not going 24

back to work. Mr Mathunjwa says "leave here, if you don't

2 MR MAGIDIWANA: I repeat, Sir, the reason why after that, Mr Mathunjwa, we did not leave, in fact the employees said let the employer come and then talk to us about this. We are not leaving this place because we are 6 not working for you, we have been employed by the employer 7 so then, Sir, I don't know what you want me to do. 8 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry can I interrupt, 9 sorry. In his second address to you what did Mr Mathunjwa 10 say? 11 MR MAGIDIWANA: When he came for the second time he said the situation is bad. 12 13 CHAIRPERSON: Go on. Why was it bad? 14 A decision was made MR MAGIDIWANA: 15 regarding you. You are going to be killed here. 16 CHAIRPERSON: Now did you not believe him? He had been to see the employer. Between his first 17 address and his second address he'd been to see the 19 employers, did you not believe him when he said that 20 there's a decision that you would be killed? 21 MR HANABE: What, first the witness said 22 earlier on Commissioner he said "I did not believe him in 23 fact in what he said." By the way the employees or the 24 workers never even wanted to involve the unions. 25 MR MAGIDIWANE: Yes that was also said to

the other reason for you to leave the koppie?

Page 6176 leave there will be bloodshed." He says "the life of a 1 black person which is so cheap." 2 3 MR MAGIDIWANA: It really turned out that 4 way. 5 MR NGALWANA: You have at least two reasons to leave the koppie, the one is that the employer 6 is not going to talk about R12 500. The other is "if you 7 don't leave the koppie there will be bloodshed." 8 9 MR MPOFU: Mr Chairperson, I'm sorry Chairperson, sorry that's another misleading question. 10 This has now moved from the employer is not talking, he's 11 12 not going to and my learned cannot subtly change the 13 tense of what he was quoting. 14 CHAIRPERSON: I think you must put the 15 quotation in the words of the original quotation and not change things. 16 17 MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair. Regarding the R12 500 Mr Mathunjwa said the employer is 18 saying "I am not talking about the R12 500" that is the first reason, the first reason for you not to sit there and 21 wait for the employer. The second reason Mr Mathunjwa who 22 is the leader of the workers he goes down on his knees 23 saying "leave here and if you don't leave there will be

24 bloodshed." Clearly he's talking about black person because

25 he said "the life of a black person is cheap." Is that not

him that to go back to the employer, we are not going to leave this place, we are not going back to the employment in which he thinks we must go back to. CHAIRPERSON: But he told you that there had been a decision that you'd be killed. MR MAGIDIWANA: It was when he said that. when he said a decision was taken that the workers - when Mr Mathunjwa told us that we are going to be finished off here they said we are not going anywhere, we would rather die here. Because we don't know that a person who wants money is going to be killed, but we are not leaving this place. CHAIRPERSON: Did you think you might die? Did you believe him when he said there'd been that decision? MR MAGIDIWANA: I never believed that. CHAIRPERSON: Did you not think you might die at all? MR MAGIDIWANA: No I never thought about that. CHAIRPERSON: What reason did you have to think that what Mr Mathunjwa had told you in this regard was incorrect?

black and white that - it was said clearly in fact that no

Because it was said in

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

2

3

4

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

MR MAGIDIWANA:

Page 6179 Page 6181 unions will be involved and that the employer is the one that's how I personally think. that wanted to go there and address the employees. That is 2 **COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ:** 2 You weren't 3 then that I saw that in fact what Mathunjwa was saying not 3 awaiting the return of any other person who gone off to 4 true. 4 speak with the employer on your behalf. 5 5 MR MAGIDIWANA: [12:33] CHAIRPERSON: You running a big risk No one was accepted because if Mathunjwa was right that the decision had been 6 6 according to Mathunjwa who had left. 7 taken to kill you, then you would be still in danger of 7 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: No according to 8 being killed that afternoon. you, the strikers you weren't expecting anyone else to 9 9 MR MAGIDIWANA: No I didn't see it that return at that stage with words from the employer after Mr 10 way, but I realised that eventually when there was that 10 Mathunjwa's second visit? which was happening, which was not good, it is then that I 11 MR MAGIDIWANA: The only person that I 11 12 12 said here then are the words which were uttered. What left there at the time I had gone to eat is only the 13 Mathunjwa said is really happening now. 13 Pastor, he's the person who was there when I left. 14 CHAIRPERSON: Proceed, Mr Ngalwana. 14 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: You talking about 15 Thank you, Chair. So 15 Bishop Seoka. MR NGALWANA: I don't know his name but 16 subsequent events you must accept prove Mr Mathunjwa to 16 MR MAGIDIWANA: 17 have been correct in his warning to you not so? 17 I just saw him and then went away. 18 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. 18 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: But he never MR NGALWANA: 19 So reasonably speaking 19 returned, he never returned. 20 you're not believing Mr Mathunjwa was not reasonable was 20 MR HANABE: When he say went away, means 21 it? With the benefit of hindsight. 21 himself. 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: There is a reason. 22 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Well the Bishop 23 MR NGALWANA: And what reason is that? 23 didn't return? 24 MR MAGIDIWANA: Because the main Union in 24 MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't recall him coming 25 25 fact that represented the employees in fact was untruthful back on that day. Page 6180 Page 6182 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: particularly at the time the employees were putting forward 1 Thank you. 1 2 their demands. 2 MR NGALWANA: Mr Magidiwana, there is of 3 MR NGALWANA: Are you blaming Mr course a third reason for you to have left the Koppie when 4 Mathuniwa for that? Mr Mathunjwa issued this warning and you gave that reason 5 5 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes I also, I blamed him earlier on this morning albeit it in a different context, because he is also one of the Unions. It could have been although in a different context, in a different context, 6 6 7 7 but before we go there let's take you back to your evidence that he was also the head speaker by the employer. 8 8 MR NGALWANA: The main Union that you in chief. You were asked a question by my learned friend 9 spoke about was that the AMCU or the NUM? 9 about the clicking of weapons and you were asked what you 10 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes it is NUM. 10 observed. As a follow up question to you as well you 11 MR NGALWANA: explained that you disobeyed the clicking of weapons So Mathunjwa was the 11 12 President of AMCU? 12 because it was a form of clapping. The follow up question 13 was did people welcome Mr Mathunjwa with aggression? Do MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. 13 14 You couldn't blame him for, 14 you remember what your answer was? MR NGALWANA: 15 irrespective of the allegation that you made NUM could you? 15 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I remember the 16 16 MR MAGIDIWANA: I am saying is also like answer. 17 those who wanted us to go back to work and that eventually 17 MR NGALWANA: You said people were happy 18 we would lose employment and not even get at the end the 18 not so. 19 money. 19 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. 20 MR NGALWANA: Oh, Mr Mathunjwa -20 MR NGALWANA: People were happy because 21 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Mr Magidiwana after Mr Mathunjwa had come to address them, tell them about the Mr Mathunjwa's second visit there was no other line of 22 latest. communication opened with the employer okay. 23 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, yes. MR MAGIDIWANA: There was a way to talk 24 MR NGALWANA: Now if you are happy for Mr Mathunjwa to come does it make sense to you that the person to the employer. I don't know how he was thinking but ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

```
Page 6183
                                                                                                                           Page 6185
    about whose presence you are happy, no let me start again.
                                                                        workers, the koppie there where you were, did they discuss
2
    If you are happy that Mr Mathunjwa had come to address you
                                                                    2
                                                                        what he said?
3
    does it make sense to you that you should distrust that
                                                                    3
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        Yes.
4
    same person you were happy to see come to address you?
                                                                    4
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     Who spoke?
                                                                    5
5
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 I think the word you
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        It's the workers.
                                                                    6
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
    looking for is disbelieve.
                                                                                                     I take it they didn't all
6
7
                                                                    7
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Thank you, Mr Chairman.
                                                                        three thousands of them didn't talk, so it must have been
    Let me start again. You said people were happy to have Mr
                                                                    8
8
                                                                        someone specifically spoke.
                                                                    9
9
    Mathunjwa come and address them.
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        The reason why I am
10
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                   10
                                                                        saying it was, they were talking, because I think, what I
           MR NGALWANA:
                                                                        am thinking is if people are two or three, those people are
11
                                  It doesn't make sense then
                                                                   11
12
    you must agree, that you would disbelieve someone you were
                                                                   12
    happy to see come to address you, does it?
13
                                                                   13
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     Sir I am not disputing it
14
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    It has then to be like
                                                                   14
                                                                        with you, I am just trying to get clarity. Did any of the
15
    that not to make sense then to you Sir, because of the pain
                                                                        leaders of the group speak to you, address the group after
    people were going through and where they were seated and
16
                                                                   16
                                                                        Mr Mathunjwa were gone?
    then in such a situation then when someone like Mathunjwa
                                                                   17
17
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        The person who spoke to
18
    appeared then they knew or believed that now things are
                                                                   18
                                                                        us on that day was a worker by the name of Mambush.
                                                                   19
                                                                                                      What did Mambush say? Is
19
    fine, things are going well.
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
20
           MR MPOFU:
                              No sorry the witness said
                                                                   20
                                                                        this after Mr Mathunjwa left?
21
                                                                   21
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        Yes.
    [African language].
22
           MR HANABE:
                                                                   22
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      What did Mr Mambush say, he
                               Sorry I didn't hear him
23
    correctly. That one seems then about to be fine.
                                                                   23
                                                                        is Mr Noki isn't he, what did Mambush, Mr Noki say?
                                                                   24
24
           MR NGALWANA:
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                  If you had such high hopes
                                                                                                        You must know that in the
25
                                                                        position in which we are it is not nice at all. We want
    in the emergence of Mr Mathunjwa it doesn't make sense for
                                                                                                                           Page 6186
                                                        Page 6184
    you to disbelieve him, to disbelieve what he tells you.
1
                                                                        our rights, we want money so that we can feed our children.
2
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                        If there's employees who can come forward and then comment
                                    The reason I say that
3
    disbelieve is because the people in fact did not want
                                                                        as to what we should do then they should come. Thirteen
4
    Mathunjwa, they wanted the employer and the fact that they
                                                                    4
                                                                        men then came forward even though I don't know their names,
5
    didn't, they didn't believe in fact because the person they
                                                                    5
                                                                        but they spoke. They were saying in this place where we
    expected did not come.
                                                                    6
                                                                        are seated we are not leaving, we are not going to leave
6
7
           MR NGALWANA:
                                                                    7
                                                                        before this employer comes and address us and tell us what
                                  But you were happy to see
                                                                    8
8
    Mr Mathunjwa come.
                                                                        he has. We can only leave after we know what in fact is
9
                                                                    9
           MR HANABE:
                              You mean him personally or
                                                                        there for us, what we have. So if then he is not coming we
    the whole group?
                                                                   10
                                                                        are going to wait and then those chimneys, the big ones,
10
11
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Ja him and the entire
                                                                   11
                                                                        then there won't be any smoke in those big chimneys because
12
    group.
                                                                   12
                                                                        we are, it is to - that there is a smoke coming out of
13
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    Yes.
                                                                   13
                                                                        those big towers or chimneys.
                                                                   14
14
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Simple point Mr Magidiwana
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Was anything else said?
                                                                   15
    is if you were happy to see Mr Mathunjwa come it doesn't
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
15
                                                                                                       Yes, there were many
    make sense for you to disbelieve the very person you are
                                                                        other things but I don't remember others, some of them.
16
                                                                   16
17
    happy to see come to address you.
                                                                   17
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Did anybody discuss what Mr
18
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    What I am saying, Sir,
                                                                   18
                                                                        Mathunjwa had said in his statement, that a decision has
19
    was that because we did not in fact want Mathunjwa, we
                                                                        been made, that you would be killed and therefore you must
20
    wanted the employer, then upon seeing Mathunjwa we were
                                                                   20
                                                                        leave the koppie. Was that discussed at all?
21
    happy because there was someone that we at least were going
                                                                   21
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       The decision that was
22 to send there, but even though he was also told that the
                                                                        taken was that no one is leaving until the employer comes
    employer should come there, but so that then we could go to
                                                                   23
                                                                        to that place and that if the employer is not coming we are
24 work.
                                                                   24
                                                                        not going anywhere, we are going to sit there.
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 After he left did the
                                                                   25
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Yes I understand that, but
```

+1111	Walter 2013 Walkana Cullin	112210	in or inquiry Rusteriburg
	Page 6187		Page 6189
1	you haven't answered my question. Was anything said about	1	reasonable, any reasonable person could have seen that the
2	what Mr Mathunjwa had stated, namely that there had been a	2	intention was to kill because as they were deploying it
3	decision taken that you would be killed?	3	they were staying on the side [African language] and the
4	MR MAGIDIWANA: No one said we going to	4	others at the same time were putting on those big things
5	be killed here let us flee, no one said that.	5	that I don't know what to call them or what they are
6	CHAIRPERSON: Did everybody stay after Mr	6	called. It is then that it was cleared that there will be
7	Mathunjwa had spoken and left or did some people who were	7	deaths now.
8	on the koppie leave?	8	CHAIRPERSON: No but some people actually
9	[12:53] MR MAGIDIWANA: It is them because on	9	said Mathunjwa was right, they then believed Mathunjwa
10	that day people were busy going up and down.	10	finally, that he was correct, that what he said was going
11	CHAIRPERSON: I understand that, but	11	happen was going to happen, is that right?
12	after Mr Mathunjwa had spoken and then there would be these	12	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, after that thing
13	further addresses, firstly by Mr Noki and thereafter by the	13	happened, after we were shot people then believed that what
14	other people you mentioned, did everybody stay or did some	14	Mathunjwa said was in fact true.
15	people leave?	15	CHAIRPERSON: I understood you to say
16	MR MAGIDIWANA: There are some who left	16	that they said that when the barbed wire started being
17	after Mathunjwa had left because they saw the barbed wire	17	unrolled, as you were being boxed in like animals.
18	being deployed and they said that this thing now has	18	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes what people didn't
19	started.	19	want was to be encircled, it was then that they saw that no
20	CHAIRPERSON: Yes, please proceed.	20	they should flee to Nkaneng, and the other thing they
21	MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair. What	21	didn't know after the encircled element what was going to
22	thing had started?	22	happen, as to whether they were going to be thrown into the
23	MR MAGIDIWANA: Is the killing of the	23	bakkies or the vans. It is then that they decided they
24	people.	24	should leave then that place.
25	MR NGALWANA: Had anyone been killed that	25	CHAIRPERSON: I understood you to say
1	Page 6188 day by the police at that stage?	1	Page 6190 earlier, but when the barbed wire started being unrolled
2	MR MAGIDIWANA: It is when people were	2	the people then said that they realised that Mathunjwa was
3	being encircled as if they were Springboks and they said	3	right, that there was decision to kill you people. Who was
4	this thing that Mathunjwa said is now starting.	4	going to kill you?
5	MR NGALWANA: I take it your answer to my	5	MR MAGIDIWANA: The police officers were
6	question is no? My question was have the police on that	6	in front of us.
7	day, the 16th, at the time they were putting up the barbed	7	CHAIRPERSON: So why did you run towards
8	wire had they killed anyone on that day?	8	the police who were in front of you? They were the ones
9	MR MPOFU: Mr Chairman, I am sorry I	9	that you thought were going to kill you.
10	don't want to be pedantic but this is very crucial	10	MR HANABE: Can you repeat, Commissioner.
11	evidence. The Springbok was not mentioned. The word that	11	CHAIRPERSON: Who is asking me to repeat
12	was used was [African language], which a more generic, who	12	the question, the Interpreter or the witness? If you
13	are not animals.	13	thought that the police were going to kill you, the police
14	CHAIRPERSON: Animals yes, now that we've	14	were in front of you, why did you run towards them in their
15	got that correct we can carry on.	15	direction, you make it easier for them to kill you because
16	MR NGALWANA: In the greater scheme of	16	you were then closer?
17	things that is such an insignificant, that's why I didn't	17	MR MAGIDIWANA: We never in fact
18	raise that issue.	18	confronted or went to the police. They are the once in
19	CHAIRPERSON: See it is a good thing to	19	fact who closed the path at the way in which we were going
20_	strive for it, let's just carry on.	20	to walk.
21	MR NGALWANA: Thank you Chair. I take it	21	CHAIRPERSON: The fact is you were going,
70	Thank jou onail. I take it		on many and the second going,

22

23

24

25

them and you.

MR MAGIDIWANA:

you were going towards them, they were in front in you, you

going towards them, you were reducing the distance between

No, it is not like that,

22 your answer to my question which was by the time the police

Anyone then, a

23 put up the barbed wire on the 16th of August 2012 they

24 haven't killed anyone?

MR MAGIDIWANA:

_	Page 6191		Page 6193
1	Sir.	1	MR MAGIDIWANA: It's only the two that we
2	CHAIRPERSON: I see, well at that note we	2	decided, if you know of any other road then you can tell
3	will take the lunch adjournment.	3	me.
4	MR MAGIDIWANA: People were walking on	4	MR NGALWANA: Then I take you to slide
5	the narrow path which was leading to the broad one that is	5	L191.
6	leading Nkaneng.	6	MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm looking at it.
7	CHAIRPERSON: On this point I think we	7	MR NGALWANA: Do you see where the Nyalas
8	take the lunch adjournment.	8	are stationed in a straight line?
9	MR HANABE: Chair, are we back at 1.30 or	9	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I can see them.
10	2.00.	10	MR NGALWANA: That is where the barbed
11	CHAIRPERSON: Two o'clock because we've	11	wire was deployed, correct?
12	got people coming who talk to us about the move or the	12	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.
13	possible move and the investigation being done in that	13	MR NGALWANA: You in your words dashed in
14	regard. So we will be seeing them at lunchtime so we	14	that direction, correct?
15	better make it two o'clock.	15	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.
16	[COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]	16	MR NGALWANA: Do you know what dash
17	[14:09] MR NGALWANA: - members of the	17	means?
18	Commission. You must accept then that there did come a	18	MR MAGIDIWANA: I have explained earlier,
19	time during that afternoon of the 16th August 2012 when you	19	Sir, that we were told not to run but to go - to walk
20	began to believe Mr Mathunjwa. As you've testified you	20	whilst the singing is going on, we were encouraged to sing
21	said when the police put barbed wire you then believed that	21	not running.
22	the killing is going to start, something to that effect,	22	MR NGALWANA: Do you know what to dash
23	correct?	23	means?
24	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	24	MR MAHLANGU: Should I be right in saying
25	MR NGALWANA: So the reasonable thing to	25	that to dash is by going there fast?
	Page 6192		Page 6194
1	do then would have been to leave the koppie not so?	1	MR NGALWANA: Yes.
2	• •		IVIIN INCALIVANA. I Co.
	MR MAGIDIWANA: That was what was	2	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only
3	MR MAGIDIWANA: That was what was supposed to be done according to what you said but the	2	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only
3 4			MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only
	supposed to be done according to what you said but the	3	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around
4	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question	3	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the
4 5	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.	3 4 5	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.
4 5 6	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA:  No, you said Mr Mathunjwa	3 4 5 6	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your
4 5 6 7	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA:  No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be	3 4 5 6 7	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because
4 5 6 7 8	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA:  No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.	3 4 5 6 7 8	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?
4 5 6 7 8	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he	3 4 5 6 7 8	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.
4 5 6 7 8 9	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.  MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.  MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed.  Yes.  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.  MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed.  Yes.  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.  MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed.  Yes.  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief?  MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief? MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief? MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then started spraying us with water. We turned away from the	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR MAGIDIWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same things today and then some other day you ask other things
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so.  MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed.  Yes.  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief?  MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then started spraying us with water. We turned away from the direction in which we were going, turned the other way, we	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same things today and then some other day you ask other things that you did not ask the day before?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief? MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then started spraying us with water. We turned away from the direction in which we were going, turned the other way, we turned towards the kraal and that is exactly where they	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same things today and then some other day you ask other things that you did not ask the day before?  MR NGALWANA: In your statement you say
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief? MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then started spraying us with water. We turned away from the direction in which we were going, turned the other way, we turned towards the kraal and that is exactly where they managed to close us up that we could not go out.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same things today and then some other day you ask other things that you did not ask the day before?  MR NGALWANA: In your statement you say the trigger for dashing was the deployment of barbed wire.
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	supposed to be done according to what you said but the workers had been expecting the employer about the question of money.  MR NGALWANA: No, you said Mr Mathunjwa warned you that if you don't leave there's going to be bloodshed. MR MAGIDIWANA: I agree with you, Sir, he said so. MR NGALWANA: So when the barbed wire was rolled out you then believed Mr Mathunjwa? MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes about the bloodshed. Yes. MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you then leave because the bloodshed was about to happen according to your belief? MR MAGIDIWANA: As I was saying, Sir, I was on my way out when they closed the road. They then started spraying us with water. We turned away from the direction in which we were going, turned the other way, we turned towards the kraal and that is exactly where they	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR MAGIDIWANA: We started running only when they started spraying us with water. We turned around the kraal and in doing so they had already gone on the other side of the kraal in front of us.  MR NGALWANA: Did you tell that to your lawyers, that the reason you started running was because water was being poured on you?  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I did not.  MR NGALWANA: Why not?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Because there are so many things that I had to explain.  MR NGALWANA: It is an important aspect of your version.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is important, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so you must accept that you should have told your lawyers about it.  MR MAGIDIWANA: As you are asking me questions now, Sir, is it not true that you ask the same things today and then some other day you ask other things that you did not ask the day before?  MR NGALWANA: In your statement you say

```
Page 6195
                                                                                                                          Page 6197
     on the same day, others you ask later.
                                                                       vou haven't I'll allow it.
 2
                                                                    2
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  It is irrelevant, I'm not
                                                                                                     Chairperson, the witness
 3
     going to answer your questions. Please answer my question.
                                                                    3
                                                                       says on the hand, well in his statement he dashed in the
 4
     In your statement you say the trigger for your dashing in
                                                                        direction of Nkaneng and that dashing was triggered by the
 5
    the direction of Nkaneng was the deployment of barbed wire.
                                                                        deployment of barbed wire. Now he says he dashed because
     Now you say under oath that it was because the police shot
                                                                    6
                                                                       water was sprayed on them.
 6
 7
                                                                    7
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
     water at you. One of them is incorrect, which one is it?
                                                                                                 No that is not true, Mr
8
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                    8
                                    Only you know that there
                                                                       Ngalwana.
                                                                    9
 9
    is no truth in what I'm saying. There was spraying of
                                                                                                     My true thinking is which
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
    water which made us turn and towards the road that would
                                                                   10
10
                                                                       version of -
11
     lead us to Nkaneng.
                                                                   11
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 What the witness said is that
12
           MR NGALWANA:
                                                                   12
                                  Which version, Mr
    Magidiwana, should the Commission believe? Should the
13
                                                                   13
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Mr Mpofu please behave
     Commission believe that you dashed because barbed wire was
14
                                                                       yourself. He's still busy addressing us, when he's
15
     deployed, or should it believe that you dashed after you
                                                                        finished I'll give you an opportunity -
     were sprayed with water?
                                                                   16
16
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 Thank you very much.
17
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    What I am saying now,
                                                                   17
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    - to reply, it's your
18
    Sir, is it the first time that you are hearing this?
                                                                   18
                                                                       objection, he's got a right to reply.
                                                                   19
19
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Which version must the
                                                                              MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                 I apologise, Chairperson.
20
     Commission believe?
                                                                   20
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     All I'm asking him is which
21
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                   21
                                                                       version must the Commission believe. Did he dash because
                                    What I am telling this
22
                                                                       there was a barbed wire put up or did he dash because water
     Commission are things that happened there.
                                                                   22
23
                                                                   23
                                                                       was sprayed on him?
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  So in other words you
                                                                   24
24
    refuse to pin your colours to the mast.
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       I will explain this to
25
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                       you how this thing happened because they were singing,
                                    I am pinning, Sir, to
                                                       Page 6196
                                                                                                                          Page 6198
                                                                       whilst they were singing we were walking along the smaller
     where I actually fell there along the road where I died.
 1
 2
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   So you're refusing to
                                                                        path which would have led us to the main path that leads to
 3
     answer my question.
                                                                    3
                                                                        the Nkaneng settlement. Before we reached the road the
 4
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     In answering your
                                                                    4
                                                                        Casper that was pulling the last barbed wire then started
 5
                                                                        putting on speed to close the gap that was open where we
     question -
                                                                    6
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   I want you to answer my
                                                                       were going to go through to reach the road. It was at that
 6
 7
     question, which version is the correct version?
                                                                    7
                                                                        stage when we reached the gap that they had closed that's
                                                                   8
 8
            MR MPOFU:
                              Chairperson I'm sorry. Mr
                                                                       at the time the water was sprayed and the people then
 9
                                                                    9
     Ngalwana he must clarify this question. If he's suggesting
                                                                        started rushing to go beyond the kraal. After the spraying
     that the dashing that is being referred to in the statement
                                                                   10
                                                                       of the water the people would once again come together and
10
     is synonymous to the running in reference to the water then
                                                                   11
                                                                        continue with the songs they were singing. When they
11
12
     he's right that there is an inconsistency but if it is not,
                                                                   12
                                                                        appeared on the other side of the kraal that was when the
13
     or rather he must lay the basis to say that is the same
                                                                   13
                                                                       firing started. I went past that place, I don't know how I
     thing. Otherwise there is no inconsistency, he's just
                                                                   14
                                                                       managed to between two people who had guns and were
14
15
     wasting time.
                                                                   15
                                                                        shooting. As I was looking ahead of me there were others,
16
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  What do you say to the
                                                                   16
                                                                       many who were shooting and that is where I fell. You will
17
     objection Mr Ngalwana?
                                                                   17
                                                                        not know what it is exactly and what I have now explained
18
            MR NGALWANA:
                                   Chairperson my learned
                                                                   18
                                                                       that you don't understand so clear.
                                                                   19
19
     friend should refrain from -
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     I shall move on. I
20
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  No, no, no that's not an
                                                                   20
                                                                       referred you to slide L191.
21
     answer to an objection. When he does that I get cross with
                                                                   21
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        I'm looking at it.
     him, I'm cross with you too now, don't do that. When you
                                                                   22
22
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     There is a path that runs
     have objection you've got to answer it, the same applies to
                                                                   23
                                                                       across or in front of the two koppies in parallel to the
24 him, it applies to you too. Just answer the objection. If
                                                                   24
                                                                       Nyala barbed wire line.
   you've got a good answer I'll disallow the objection, if
                                                                   25
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        I see it yes.
   ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE
```

1	Page 6199	1	Page 6201
1	MR NGALWANA: It joins up with another	1	his interpretation. If there are nuances of meaning and so
2	path across it.	2	on where there is disagreement, we have the advantage that
3	MR MAGIDIWANA: Where is it meeting, Sir?	3	we have Mr Mpofu who speaks isiXhosa and Adv Madlanga as
4	MR NGALWANA: Between the two koppies	4	well and Mr Tokota. So if there are points upon which,
5	there is a path that runs there down towards the kraal.	5	yes, and Mr Ngalwana respect by leaving him out, so if
6	MR MAGIDIWANA: There are quite a number	6	there is any points upon which there may be differences
7	of paths visible on this slide, which one exactly is it?	7	about the interpretation I'm sure these four gentlemen will
8	MR NGALWANA: Look at the path that runs	8	assist us to get the right interpretation.
9	across from 330 metres past 80, it runs across towards the	9	MR MAGIDIWANA: I do not understand his
10	bottom of that picture.	10	Xhosa so well, his Xhosa is not that strong.
11	MR MAGIDIWANA: I see that one, yes.	11	MR NGALWANA: I don't think he is
12	MR NGALWANA: Then there is a path that	12	referring to me, Chairperson.
13	crosses it. Do you see that?	13	MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I'm referring to the
14	MR MAGIDIWANA: I see it, yes.	14	interpreters.
15	MR NGALWANA: You dashed, your group led	15	MR NGALWANA: May I continue –
16	by Mr Mambush dashed towards where that pole is, do you see	16	CHAIRPERSON: With the previous
17	where the pole is? Where 80 is if you look behind there's	17	interpreter there were arguments about the correct
18	a yellow arrow that points both ways, slightly to the left	18	interpretation, so I don't think that there is any reason
19	of that arrow you will see -	19	to change. As I said if there are problems and something
20	MR MAGIDIWANA: Going towards the pole?	20	that the witness can't understand he can explain it, if
21	MR NGALWANA: Yes, in the vicinity of	21	they have difficulty with the interpretation with the four
22	that pole. That's where you dashed for the first time.	22	gentlemen to whom I've referred, I think it should be
23	MR MAGIDIWANA: Where was the barbed wire	23	brought to my attention, and I'm sure they'll do so, so
24	at that time?	24	let's carry on as we are at the moment.
25	MR NGALWANA: You dashed in that	25	MR MPOFU: Chairperson, I accept the
-			
	B (000		D 1000
1	Page 6200 direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first	1	Page 6202 assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do
1 2	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first	1 2	Page 6202 assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to
	=		assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to
2	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did	2	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do
2	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is	2	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept
2 3 4	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the	2 3 4	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily
2 3 4 5	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission	2 3 4 5	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original
2 3 4 5 6	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?	2 3 4 5 6	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle
2 3 4 5 6 7	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand	2 3 4 5 6 7	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation. Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation. Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other accomplishments what, do you say about this request?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four of you, gentlemen, who will help us if there is a problem
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other accomplishments what, do you say about this request?  MR NGALWANA: I would rather not comment	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four of you, gentlemen, who will help us if there is a problem and if the witness has a problem he can tell us so. Let's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other accomplishments what, do you say about this request?  MR NGALWANA: I would rather not comment on the request but say perhaps where there is a need we may	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four of you, gentlemen, who will help us if there is a problem and if the witness has a problem he can tell us so. Let's carry on.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other accomplishments what, do you say about this request?  MR NGALWANA: I would rather not comment on the request but say perhaps where there is a need we may assist, Mr Chairman.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four of you, gentlemen, who will help us if there is a problem and if the witness has a problem he can tell us so. Let's carry on.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Thank you.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	direction towards that pole, near that pole for the first time when the barbed wire was being deployed. Now why did you not go through where the wire was to be deployed? Is there any path near that pole going in the I suppose the westerly direction?  MR MAGIDIWANA: May I ask for permission that the former interpreter comes because I understand better?  [14:30] CHAIRPERSON: I don't think that's necessary. I understand the problem with the present interpreter's interpretation which I understand is of a very high standard, but I will speak to my co commissioner, Adv Tokota, whose himself a Xhosa linguist and get his views on that. Mr Tokota who is himself a Xhosa linguist seems to have no problem with Mr Mahlangu's interpretation.  Mr Mahlangu, you're also Xhosa linguist.  MR MAHLANGU: My - is Xhosa.  CHAIRPERSON: Amongst your many other accomplishments what, do you say about this request?  MR NGALWANA: I would rather not comment on the request but say perhaps where there is a need we may assist, Mr Chairman.  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I think that's the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	assignment that the chairperson has given us. What I do want to say is that my inclination would have been to listen to what the witness' reference is and I also accept Mr Mahlangu's interpretation, it is not necessarily incorrect but I do think that there are some subtle differences between the other interpreter whose original language is Xhosa, and maybe the witness is more comfortable with him. Mr Mahlangu, as it happens is a multi linguist, much more than the other interpreter, but I think when it comes to this particular language the witness prefers the other interpreter.  CHAIRPERSON: Of course it is a bad principle, a bad precedent to allow witnesses to dictate who should be the interpreter, but one of the things that influenced me to make this ruling I did was that when the previous interpreter was interpreting there were also arguments about points of language and nuances and so on. So, anyway we fortunately have a safety net with the four of you, gentlemen, who will help us if there is a problem and if the witness has a problem he can tell us so. Let's carry on.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Thank you.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Mr Magidiwana, just turn to

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

1	Page 6203 MR NGALWANA: Can you indicate where	1	Page 6205 correct?
	Nkaneng is?	2	
3	MR MAGIDIWANA: Towards the place where	3	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
4	there is one shack, that is in the northerly direction	4	that post?  MR NGALWANA: The police say you
5	where, next to where the N is.	5	MR NGALWANA: The police say you attempted to dash there, are you denying that?
6	MR NGALWANA: So in other words in the	6	MR MAGIDIWANA: I said I'm going to
7	direction of where the N depicting north is, is that	7	explain to you as I've said earlier, I explained to you if
8	correct?	8	there is something you don't understand. Where the 80
9	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that's the road	9	metres is and at the end of the yellow, towards the right
10	leading to Nkaneng.	10	hand side there are people on top there, those people came
11	MR NGALWANA: Now I take you back to	11	down the hill whilst the barbed wire was being deployed,
12	slide 191. Do you see where the lamp, I don't know whether	12	the people were then moving. As you see the smaller road
13	it is a lamppost or it is a post of some kind, if you look	13	is pointing at the road, it looks like a footpath at the
14	at the number, if you look at the line in yellow, well, the	14	end of the line marked by 330, this is where the people
15	number, it is written 80 metres, there is an arrow pointing	15	turned off to go and join at the main road. As the hippos
16	across the page, do you see that, the yellow arrow, the	16	were standing there straight it pulled in front -
17	small yellow arrow next to 80 metres?	17	MR MPOFU: Sorry, when you say [African
18	MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it, yes.	18	language], it means deviated from that straight path?
19	MR NGALWANA: Now to the left of that	19	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, indicating towards
20	arrow, in the direction of the 100 metres you'll see there	20	the right.
21	is a little lamppost there.	21	MR NGALWANA: I don't see where you are
22	MR MAGIDIWANA: I see it, yes.	22	referring to.
23	MR NGALWANA: You can see that post?	23	MR MAGIDIWANA: Do you see the white
24	MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see it, yes.	24	arrow, that is the one with 330 metres where it starts,
25	MR NGALWANA: Do you deny that you	25	towards the N, I'm referring now to the other side of that
			<u> </u>
	Page 6204		Page 6206
1	attempted to dash in that direction?	1	white, where there is a hippo between the N - there is a
2	MR MAGIDIWANA: That is, if I may use the	2	hippo in front.
3	word, nonsense.	3	MR NGALWANA: Continue?
4	MR NGALWANA: Can I just try, before I go	4	MR MAGIDIWANA: That is where the turning
5	on to the next question just orientate ourselves here? At	5	of the barbed wire that was being pulled was then directed
6	209, that path that runs across the page –	6	towards the kraal, and the reason for the deviation was
7	MR MAGIDIWANA: I see it –	7	that they had realised they were heading in that direction.
8	MR NGALWANA: - passed the top of the	8	It was at this place that I've indicated that they started
9	kraal –	9	spraying us with the water. The people then left there
10	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, that is the road	10	heading westwards, as he indicates, that is towards the
11	from Marikana.	11	number 191 which indicates the slide, and from there they turned towards the road, the road that would have led them
12 13	MR NGALWANA: And then continues towards	13	to Nkaneng settlement. That's when they appeared, that the
14	the N sign depicting north.  MR MAGIDIWANA: That is correct.	14	police was at that stage near and then the shooting
15	MR NGALWANA: And you're saying that is	15	started. That was just when we turned across the kraal.
16	the path to Nkaneng?	16	Let me further explain to you that the road that leads
17	MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.	17	towards the kraal starts from the veld there where the
18	MR NGALWANA: If you go to slide 191, the	18	cattle are grazing, but it comes to meet with the road that
19	path that runs between the two koppies towards the crawl,	19	leads towards Nkaneng. That is why I am saying these are
20	that is the same path as defined in 201, leading to	20	the only two roads that we could use towards Nkaneng, which
21	Nkaneng, not so?	21	was then closed by the police.
22	MR MAGIDIWANA: That is the road, yes.	22	MR NGALWANA: None of which answers my
23	MR NGALWANA: Alright, now going back to	23	question. Are you denying –
24	that lamppost on 191, you're saying, you're denying that	24	MR MAGIDIWANA: How should I respond to
25	you crossed in the vicinity of that lamppost, is that	25	the question?
	January T. Maria Lange Co., in that		•

```
Page 6207
                                                                                                                         Page 6209
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Are you denying that your
                                                                       that way he could have gone straight to the pole and went
1
    group, the front group, you yourself said you were the
                                                                   2
                                                                       through.
2
3
    front group, are you denying that the front group sought to
                                                                   3
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      Mr Magidiwana, if you look
4
    dash in the direction of that lamppost?
                                                                   4
                                                                       at the slide, 191, the path that leads, that you say leads
5
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                   5
                                                                       to Nkaneng is nowhere near that lamppost, is it?
                                     We took the way in which
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        That's correct, it is far
6
    we showed you, if it was as you say there could have been
                                                                   6
7
                                                                   7
                                                                       from the post.
    people on the other side of the fence. What we tried to do
    was to go through the opening which still was there but the
                                                                   8
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      And therefore you wouldn't
8
                                                                   9
9
    hippo was too fast and then came in front of us and closed
                                                                       reach that path that you say is going towards Nkaneng by
10
    the opening.
                                                                  10
                                                                       going in the direction of the lamppost.
11
                                                                       [14:50] MR MAGIDIWANA:
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Shall I take it you deny
                                                                  11
                                                                                                          What I'm saying, I am
12
    that your group sought to dash towards the lamppost?
                                                                  12
                                                                       saying what you are putting to me cannot be true, say
13
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     Then they would have gone
                                                                  13
                                                                       something else.
14
    past there.
                                                                  14
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                      Well, it is pretty clear,
15
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  So you're denying my
                                                                  15
                                                                       that if you are going in the direction of that lamp post
                                                                       and seeking to go past it you are leaving the road that you
16
    proposition?
                                                                  16
                                                                       say, or the path that you say is leading towards Nkaneng
17
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     Yes.
                                                                  17
18
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  I take you to slide 198.
                                                                  18
                                                                       behind you, or to your left.
19
    Do you see where that lamppost is?
                                                                  19
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                        This road, as you can see
                                                                       when you look at slide 191 and you look to the mountain,
20
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     I'm looking at 198, hey?
                                                                  20
21
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Yes, do you see where that
                                                                  21
                                                                       you are a bit past the pole that you have mentioned.
22
                                                                  22
    lamppost is?
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                     Well, the problem I've got
23
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                  23
                                     I can see it, yes.
                                                                       with the proposition you're putting is that it is difficult
24
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  It is the same lamppost as
                                                                  24
                                                                       sometimes to interpret accurately, but if you look at 198,
25
    the one in 191.
                                                                  25
                                                                       what you see is the group of people who appear to be
                                                                                                                         Page 6210
                                                       Page 6208
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    Yes, that is true, it is
                                                                       passing, going along in the direction which is the left of
1
                                                                       the pole, following the direction they were going and
2
    that post.
3
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Do you see where the front
                                                                   3
                                                                       between them and the pole is at least the widths of the
4
    group is trying to go?
                                                                   4
                                                                       Nyala and it is difficult to see from the photograph what
                                                                   5
5
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    I can see it very
                                                                       the distance was between the pole and Nyala. If we then go
                                                                       back to 191, you'll see that there is a path which you've
                                                                   6
6
    clearly.
7
           MR NGALWANA:
                                                                   7
                                  Is it not close to the
                                                                       pointed out which is, again if one is facing Nkaneng I
                                                                   8
8
    lamppost?
                                                                       suppose, with one's back to the koppie, while we talk about
9
                                                                   9
                                                                       the left side, there is a path some distance to the left
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    No, it is not close.
10
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Is that group not trying to
                                                                  10
                                                                       from the pole. Now how that relates to firstly the width
                                                                       to the Nyala, secondly the distance between the Nyala and
11
    dash past that post?
                                                                  11
12
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    The pole is under the
                                                                  12
                                                                       the pole on the one side and then the widths of the group
13
    upper side, we are on the lower side.
                                                                  13
                                                                       of people, isn't quite clear. So I think just to say that,
14
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Is that group not
                                                                  14
                                                                       if you'll look at 198 the people who were going towards the
15
                                                                  15
                                                                       pole without having regard to the facts as I've mentioned,
    attempting to dash past that post?
16
           MR MPOFU:
                              Sorry, Chairperson, once
                                                                  16
                                                                       could lead to misunderstanding and possibly confusion on
17
    again, I don't want to be pedantic but the proposition that
                                                                  17
                                                                       the part of the witness.
    was put to the witness was that they were dashing towards
18
                                                                  18
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     May I refer him, Chair, to
19
    the post and now he is being asked whether the dashing past
                                                                       a slide that seems to show this much clearer and that
20
    the post.
                                                                  20
                                                                       you'll find at 160.
21
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Can you see that the front
                                                                  21
                                                                              MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       I can see it, yes.
    group is dashing in the direction of that post and past it?
                                                                  22
                                                                              MR NGALWANA:
22
                                                                                                     When you and your group
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    No, the position is,
                                                                  23
23
                                                                       dashed in the direction of that pole or in that vicinity
24 these people are not near the pole, they're on the other
                                                                  24
                                                                       you were not on that path that runs across, past the kraal,
25 side of the vehicle. If the person in front wanted to go
                                                                       were you?
  ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE
```

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

21

22

is not part of the final approach around the kraal.

200 with the yellow arrow, I take it one must assume that

And that is absolutely

And then if one looks at

MR NGALWANA:

RCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

23 correct, Commissioner.

CHAIRPERSON:

4th I	March 2013 Marikana Comr	nissic	on of Inquiry Rustenburg
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Page 6211  MR MAGIDIWANA: If the question could be repeated again?  MR NGALWANA: Well, let me rephrase it.  You moved from where there is an intersection here at the bottom of the two koppies.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Which one, slide 160?  MR NGALWANA: You moved from slightly the left to the right of that intersection.  CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you, that is the right as facing in Nkaneng?  MR NGALWANA: The right facing Nkaneng, what he says.  CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And so to get to the vicinity of that pole you would have had to cross the path in front of you. I'm not talking about the path that you say leads to Nkaneng, I'm talking to the path that runs across the two koppies, are you with me?  CHAIRPERSON: You're referring to the path which has got a group of people on it, you have a red circle around them?  MR NGALWANA: The one, Chair.  MR MAGIDIWANA: I can see the people in the red ring, yes.  MR NGALWANA: And that is the group in	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Page 6213 if they were at the end of the arrow they then went backwards in the direction of, presumably in the westerly direction, I take it, the north is correctly marked, went to the westerly direction for some distance and then turned and then went back in an easterly direction, possibly a north easterly direction, as we see that being the direction of that yellow arrow on 200, is that correct?  MR NGALWANA: That is correct, Chair, that is the second attempt.  CHAIRPERSON: It is maybe an idea to take the tea adjournment now so that you can get your bearings on that. I must tell you during the tea adjournment there is some matter we have to attend to, so we will be probably only back at about half past three, but we will take the tea adjournment now.  [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [15:28] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes, you're still under oath.  MR NGALWANA: Yes, thank you, Chair. Mr Magidiwana, it will be the police's evidence that your group dashed in the direction of the police line near that lamppost and that there is no path leading to Nkaneng in that direction. That was the first attempt, would you care to comment?  MR MAGIDIWANA: That is a lie.
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	which you were.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. MR NGALWANA: And that is the Noki's group.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It was a group of workers and not Noki's or Mambush's group.  MR NGALWANA: Mambush was in that group. CHAIRPERSON: If we're looking at — MR MAGIDIWANA: I must intervene here and stop because this is not good, this was a group of workers and not a group belonging to Mambush.  CHAIRPERSON: The point I want to make was that according to the legend, if one calls it that, that picture was taken at 10:56 in the morning, so it helps us to work out where the paths are and the pole is, but it	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 6214 MR NGALWANA: If you look at slide 160 of Exhibit L, your group was in fact standing where there is, I can see the time, never mind the time, this is used for just bearings, your group was standing to, if you treat the intersection as an X, the lower intersection nearest to the two koppies, your group was standing on the lower side of the X.  MR MPOFU: I'm sorry, Chairperson, is the evidence going to be that the group was at that stage standing, in other words it was stationed and if that evidence is going to be led then it must be made clear, because from the picture of course we can't tell.  MR NGALWANA: The evidence of the police will be that you moved from the lower part of, whether it is described as the X, and —
16 17 18 19 20	doesn't help us at all in relation to the movements of the [inaudible] and so forth at 15:40 in the afternoon.  COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And the one, I have a difficulty with 198, it wasn't the evidence that that was their first approach and that they back after that, so it	16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you, the legend 198 says, the protestors approached information which implies motion.  MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair, I'm alive to that. What I'm saying, Mr Magidiwana is, and the

23

24

21 evidence will be from the lower side of that X, if you are

22 with me, where there is a more, what is it, a bare surface

of the soil, it is more barren than the rest, you dashed

from that position in the direction of that pole where

there is no path leading to Nkaneng, to what you say is

```
Page 6215
                                                                                                                        Page 6217
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Yes.
 1
    Nkaneng to your left.
                                                                  2
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
2
            MR MADLANGA SC:
                                      Mr Chairman.
                                                                                                    Put a pencil point at the
3
    Commissioners, just a matter of clarity, I'm not sure what
                                                                  3
                                                                      intersection.
4
    my learned colleague is referring to by the lower side of
                                                                  4
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Correct.
5
    X. Yes, I'm not sure whether the lower side is exactly
                                                                  5
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Now you can either go
    where that group circled in red is, or whether that's
                                                                      straight upwards or you can go straight downwards.
6
                                                                  6
7
                                                                  7
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Yes, but -
    beyond the X, the intersection that is more to the right
    but below the path or road that comes from the extreme
                                                                  8
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
8
                                                                                                    Or you can go to the right
9
                                                                  9
    right of the page. I'm not sure where that lower side is.
                                                                      or left or you can go diagonally towards the 1056 at the
10
            MR NGALWANA:
                                   That's exactly as my
                                                                  10
                                                                      bottom right hand corner. Now explain it, following those
    learned friend has presumed it to be. It is not in the
                                                                  11
                                                                      alternatives, can you tell us where in this group - after
11
    direction of where the red oval shape is, but below that on
                                                                  12
12
                                                                      we had it at the intersection?
                                                                  13
13
    the other side of the intersection.
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     It is in the quadrant going
14
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  In fact I'm not
                                                                  14
                                                                      towards 1056, Chair, close to that intersection.
15
    understanding properly, by the other side of the
                                                                  15
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Ja, Chair, all I'm saying if
    intersection do you mean if one puts one's finger on the
                                                                      this helps, the problem, when you say below, if you go
16
17
    oval and one moves it right -
                                                                  17
                                                                      right to the mountain now we know the elevation, so below
18
            MR NGALWANA:
                                                                  18
                                                                      would mean one thing, but the -
19
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  - down, along that path,
                                                                  19
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    That's why try I to
                                                                  20
20
    you then come to a cross road?
                                                                      eliminate it the way I did.
21
                                                                  21
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   Yes.
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Yes, but on the page below is
22
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  And then does one continue
                                                                  22
                                                                      something else.
23
    moving one's finger along the continuation of the path
                                                                  23
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    I don't like the word
                                                                      below, that's why I've tried to put it in more precise, in
24
    that's been coming on from the oval?
                                                                  24
25
                                                                  25
            MR NGALWANA:
                                    No, Chair, once one reaches
                                                                      possibly more neutral language.
                                                      Page 6216
                                                                                                                        Page 6218
    the intersection, then one veers on the inside and that's
                                                                   1
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                Yes.
1
    where the group would be moving from to dash towards the
2
                                                                   2
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    If you're happy with the
3
    pole.
                                                                   3
                                                                      way your colleague explained it in a response to my
4
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                 I'm not sure what the word
                                                                   4
                                                                      questions, then we can carry on.
                                                                  5
5
    "inside" means in that context. I know it is difficult
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     Has the witness seen the -
    sometimes to express these things in languages easy to
                                                                  6
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    No, no, as I understand it,
6
7
    follow, that's why I talked about putting my finger on the
                                                                  7
                                                                      you moved your pencil or your finger or whatever is, from
8
                                                                      the cross roads in the direction of 10:56. So -
9
                                                                  9
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
                                                                                                It is at the beginning of that
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Can I take it, Chair,
                                                                  10
    slowly -
10
11
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Sorry -
                                                                  11
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Ja, at the bottom, the
           MR NGALWANA:
12
                                  - to help myself in the
                                                                  12
                                                                      white 10:56, at the bottom right hand corner.
                                                                  13
                                                                                                Alright.
13
    process as well -
                                                                             MR MPOFU:
14
                                                                  14
                                                                             CHAIRPERSON:
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Be patient with me, take it
                                                                                                    It is rather tedious, but
15
                                                                  15
                                                                      one has got to tie these things down firmly. So when
    slowly, we can't -
16
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  If we take our finger and
                                                                      you're showing the counsel, has the witness seen this,
17
    put it in the oval in the red, shall we call it oval, where
                                                                  17
                                                                      because he is the most important person here?
18
    the group is, and move our finger rightwards along the path
                                                                  18
                                                                             MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                       This was shown to me, Mr
19
    to the intersection, at the intersection then follow
                                                                  19
                                                                      Chairperson, the witness.
    neither path but go in between them below.
                                                                  20
                                                                             MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                     It is the quadrant with the
21
           MR MPOFU:
                              Chairperson, sorry, I'm trying
                                                                  21
                                                                      white 1056 at the bottom left, - the right hand corner that
   to follow this. I think what's confusing here is that
                                                                      we are talking about, but the position is in that quadrant
    below -
                                                                  23
                                                                      at the beginning, next to where the intersection is, for
        CHAIRPERSON:
                                 Sorry, let's go back to the
                                                                  24
                                                                      the lack of a better word, is it clear to the witness,
   intersection.
                                                                      that's the important thing?
```

l .	Page 6219		Page 6221
1	CHAIRPERSON: We've showed him, so	1	the barbed wire. We can see, it is so clear that we were
2	perhaps we can proceed and if he gets stuck he will raise	2	far away from where the wire was being pulled.
3	it with the interpreter or the panel of assistant	3	MR NGALWANA: Mr Magidiwana, that 1056,
4	interpreters and we'll eventually get it right.	4	I'm not talking about what happened at 1056 in the morning.
5	MR NGALWANA: Thank you, Chair.	5	I'm simply using that slide for bearings. I'm saying your
6	MR MAHLANGU: Counsel seems to be	6	group, that group which is in the oval red, at the time
7	speaking of an intersection, I'm not clear which part of	7	when it dashed at the police line it wasn't there, it was
8	this is now the intersection. Is it where the two roads	8	where it was indicated to you now. It then dashed from
9	meet?	9	where it has been indicated to you across the path that
10	MR NGALWANA: Yes. No, but has he has	10	runs there, leaving the path to Nkaneng according to you on
11	seen it, he has been pointed now to the points that I'm	11	their left and headed towards the direction of the pole.
12	talking about.	12	MR MAGIDIWANA: That is what I'm saying,
13	MR MAGIDIWANA: This has been shown to	13	it is not true, please come up with something else.
14	me.	14	MR NGALWANA: You are not saying at that
15	MR NGALWANA: Now the police evidence	15	time, at the time that you dashed at the police line you
16	will be that the group, your group among which was Mr Noki	16	were walking on the road that goes to Nkaneng.
17	and yourself of course, when it dashed it dashed from that	17	MR MAGIDIWANA: I said we were along the
18	position towards where that lamppost is, to the left hand	18	smaller road that meets the main road that leads to Nkaneng
19	side of that lamppost. Would you care to comment?	19	from Marikana.
20	MR MAGIDIWANA: I am still saying what	20	MR NGALWANA: But you were not on the
21	you're saying to me is not the truth, if you could come up	21	main road to Marikana.
22	with something else.	22	MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't know how you want
23	MR NGALWANA: You were not on that path	23	me to explain it to you, Sir.
24	that leads to Nkaneng when you dashed at the police line.	24	MR NGALWANA: You were not on that main
25	MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you see the pole	25	road that leads to Nkaneng past the kraal.
	Page 6220		Page 6222
1	which you earlier about and directed me to on this slide?	1	MR MAGIDIWANA: I said, Sir, and I don't
2	First we were in line with that pole, as it is right now we	2	know what you expect me to say, that we were in the smaller
3	were on the lower side and it is on the upper side of us.	3	road which if one travels it, it meets the main road that
4	There are two other roads that are not very clear, it		
l '	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	4	leads to Nkaneng past the kraal. What else do you want me
5	indicates on the left hand side of the red oval. There is	5	leads to Nkaneng past the kraal. What else do you want me to say, Sir?
	indicates on the left hand side of the red oval. There is the main road, the big road that we left behind us which		
5		5	to say, Sir?
5 6	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which	5	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big
5 6 7	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.	5 6 7	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you
5 6 7 8	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?	5 6 7 8	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?
5 6 7 8 9	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on	5 6 7 8 9	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where
5 6 7 8 9 10	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.	5 6 7 8 9 10	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I 'm under cross-	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road that would be in front of us as we were going.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: 197 shows?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road that would be in front of us as we were going.  MR NGALWANA: Where are you headed, I'm	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr  Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: 197 shows?  MR NGALWANA: It shows clearly where you
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road that would be in front of us as we were going.  MR NGALWANA: Where are you headed, I'm not with you at all?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr  Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: 197 shows?  MR NGALWANA: It shows clearly where you moved from.
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road that would be in front of us as we were going.  MR NGALWANA: Where are you headed, I'm not with you at all?  MR MAGIDIWANA: The workers were singing,	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: 197 shows?  MR NGALWANA: It shows clearly where you moved from.  MR MAGIDIWANA: Where?
5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	the main road, the big road that we left behind us which goes straight to Nkaneng.  MR NGALWANA: Yes?  MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the road on which we appear on the slide here.  MR NGALWANA: It is this road on which we are walking?  MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, he indicates it on the slide.  MR NGALWANA: No, I don't see that.  MR MAGIDIWANA: He indicates where the red oval is.  MR NGALWANA: I -  MR MAGIDIWANA: I'm under crossexamination. As you proceed further then there is the road that would be in front of us as we were going.  MR NGALWANA: Where are you headed, I'm not with you at all?	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to say, Sir?  MR NGALWANA: Why didn't you join the big road to Nkaneng from that spot that I indicate to you earlier?  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is clear that is where the Nyala started closing the road which we were to use.  MR NGALWANA: No, that's not correct.  MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.  MR NGALWANA: At the time you dashed the hippos were still around the pole, they were nowhere near the main path.  MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no, we will keep on arguing about something that I'm telling you is not so.  MR NGALWANA: In fact slide 197, Mr  Magidiwana, it shows clearly from where you started when you dashed.  MR MAGIDIWANA: 197 shows?  MR NGALWANA: It shows clearly where you moved from.

Page 6225

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

MR MAGIDIWANA:

more to your back according to the sketch.

here that we had gone past the pole as we were there, but

as time went on we left, moving away from where the

MR NGALWANA:

[15:48] MR MAGIDIWANA:

CHAIRPERSON:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25 if you put your finger on the bottom of that arrow, or

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

electric pole is.

Page 6223 whatever that colour, the gold arrow shows clear the direction in which your group was going, it is not on that 2 3 main path. 4 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, that is not true, 5 Sir, unless you say something else I'm still saying it. MR NGALWANA: 6 Are you saying you were on 7 that main path? 8 MR MAGIDIWANA: On the smaller road, the 9 main road is the one that comes from Marikana straight to the shack settlement. 10 11 MR NGALWANA: But you were not on that 12 road as you were dashing. 13 MR MAGIDIWANA: But it is clear form this 14 road that we had to deviate from the small road in order to reach the other road. 15 16 MR NGALWANA: No, you were not on the big 17 road that comes from Marikana towards the shacks. Yes, you 18 were not on that main road.

No, not on that road.

That road was to your left,

The sketch shows clearly

golden arrow and you just move it up slightly towards the 2 right you will see that the arrow, a path crosses the arrow 3 and that path, if you continue to the right into the right 4 top corner, directly to the right top corner of the photograph, you'll see the path crosses another path and 5 then it goes to what looks like between the two koppies. I 6 7 suspect that that is the path you're talking about. 8 MR MAGIDIWANA: That is the road I am 9 referring to, yes. 10 MR NGALWANA: I am completely at sea, 11 Chairperson. I still can't, my eye sight is not very good. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Do you see at the bottom is 13 the golden arrow, put your finger at the, - do you see on the screen, do you see the golden arrow, at the bottom of the golden arrow which is actually higher up on the slide than part of the head, put your finger on the bottom of the 16 17 golden arrow and move it slightly towards the right, you'll 18 see that there is a path which is traversed by the arrow. 19 Now at the point where the arrow and the patch coincide, 20 move your finger to the right but in the direction of the 21 top right hand corner of the slide. That, as I understand 22 it, is the path and it goes between the two koppies and I 23 understood the witness to say that that's correct. 24 MR MAGIDIWANA: That is the road I am 25 referring to, Mr Chairperson.

Page 6224 MR NGALWANA: You talk about a small path 1 2 that you were on. 3 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. 4 MR NGALWANA: Where is that path on this 5 map? MR MAGIDIWANA: 6 That is the old road 7 which comes and joins what is now known as the main road 8 from Marikana. 9 MR NGALWANA: I don't want to be unfair to you, because perhaps it doesn't show on slide 197. Is 10 there any other slide of Exhibit L where that small road is 11 12 depicted? 13 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, there is. 14 MR NGALWANA: Which slide? 15 MR MAGIDIWANA: Showing slide 200, yes. 16 MR NGALWANA: Yes, where? 17 MR MAGIDIWANA: Do you see the path that 18 leads between the two mountains? 19 MR NGALWANA: Well, perhaps we should do this one way, if the witness could be permitted to mark it 21 on his script so that the Commission can see and we can see and all the parties can see where he is saying this path is, Chairperson?

I think I can follow him,

Page 6226 1 MR NGALWANA: Is it the road that runs 2 past the kraal? 3 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes. You are not saying you were 4 MR NGALWANA: on that road? Is that the main path -6 MR MAGIDIWANA: I don't understand you? 7 MR NGALWANA: You say you were not on that road? You talked about a small road, the road, if 9 that's the road you're talking about, that's the main path 10 to Nkaneng, according to you. 11 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, but do you see the 12 smaller road that leads to that big one? 13 MR NGALWANA: Oh, that's the one I'm 14 waiting for you to show me. MR MPOFU: 15 Chairperson, sorry, if you can, just to alleviate to the train of this questioning, it 17 would seem that the questioner is talking about the first 18 approach and the witness is dealing with the second 19 approach, so we'll never, the roads will never meet guite. 20 I've always been talking MR MAGIDIWANA: 21 about the first approach. 22 CHAIRPERSON: 200 shows the second 23 approach, that's Mr Mpofu's point. 24 MR NGALWANA: Well, that's where the witness took me. I asked him, where -

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

4

1

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

23

24

CHAIRPERSON:

MR MAGIDIWANA:

CHAIRPERSON:

about the little path.

Page 6229

Page 6230

I take it you understand

Alright, now we're trying

It is the one on which

```
Page 6227
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  If you look carefully at
1
    the, I don't whether this is literally or metaphorically a
2
3
    dwaal spoor, if you look carefully at the foot of that
4
    arrow and you move your pen slightly or pencil slightly to
5
    the left there appears to be a faint path which goes all
    the way to the left hand side of the slide and of course at
6
7
    that that time it would appear to have been blocked or
8
    certainly at some stage it would appear to have been
9
    blocked by the barbed wire, but by the time the second
10
    approach took place, of course it was blocked by the barbed
11
    wire but at some stage earlier, when the barbed wire was
12
    still coming down as it were, that would have been opened.
13
    So there is a faint path which runs from, on slide 200 from
14
    the foot of the golden arrow to the left hand side of the
    page. I don't know whether that's what he is talking
15
16
    about. Maybe he should be asked.
17
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     If that question could
18
    again be, what was said could be repeated, Sir?
19
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  I'll try again. Mr
    Interpreter, can you please show him the foot of the golden
20
21
    arrow, not the head of the arrow but the foot of the golden
22
    arrow? Now if you put your pen there or finger there, at
23
    that spot and you move it slightly to the left, eventually
24
    it goes past where the barbed wire fence was, but the
25
    barbed wire fence was at some point not there and if you go
                                                        Page 6228
```

```
the arrow appears, that is the small road.
6
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   On the first approach,
7
    Chairperson, this is very important, I'm not talking about
8
    the second approach.
9
           CHAIRPERSON:
                                  And if you go back to 194,
    you'll see the first approach what amounts to a yellow
10
     arrow. The arrow I was talking about is the golden arrow,
11
12
    but there is a yellow arrow, that's the first approach. If
13
    you look very carefully at that photograph you'll see there
14
    is what looks like a faint path going to the left and side
15
     of the photograph. Now one doesn't want to put words in
16
     the witness' mouth but if he could perhaps show us or show
17
     the interpreter because he could explain it in the kind of
    language he has been using, the first path he talks about,
19
    the little path, that would probably help us.
20
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   Can he put a pencil through
21
    it and just show by drawing a line, bearing in mind we are
22
    talking about the first approach next to that pole, we are
23
    not talking about the second approach. He said there is a
24
     small path on which they were. I want him to show us where
    that path is?
```

to see which path you're talking about when you talked

on you'll see there is a faint path which runs all the way 1 from the foot of the golden arrow to the left hand side of 2 3 the page. Is that the path you're talking about? 4 MR MAGIDIWANA: There is the one that crosses that one, yes. 5 MR NGALWANA: 6 Mr Chairperson, it is very 7 important that we get this right, certainly for my sake 8 because I have no clue what the witness is describing. I 9 could move on to something else to give him the opportunity overnight to draw what small path he is talking about and 10 11 we'll start there tomorrow morning. 12 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, I have no reason to 13 be looking at this because I know this. 14 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Magidiwana, I -15 MR MAGIDIWANA: - to look at it. 16 CHAIRPERSON: I understand you know it, 17 but we want to understand what you're saying and we've only 18 been there once or twice and there are a number of paths 19 and it is quite important for Mr Ngalwana's argument that we be quite clear what you're saying and what path you're 21 referring to. Now I know you know what path you're 22 referring to. So that's why we look at this photograph,

slide 200 and you'll see there are a number of paths we can

Yes, it is, yes.

24 see on the photograph.

MR MAGIDIWANA:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

the path that I was referring to, the faint little path which runs from the foot of the golden arrow to the left hand side of the page, now if that's what the witness shows the interpreter can tell us. MR NGALWANA: I don't understand, Chair, and I don't see it, so I would like to see the witness drawing a line on that path. CHAIRPERSON: Well, if you look at 200 and you look at the foot of the golden arrow, now the foot of the golden arrow, remember, is where the first approach took place, and you move your pencil leftwards, through what was later the barbed wire, you'll see there is a faint path going all the way to the left hand side of the page. You must be able to see that. Do you want me to repeat it? Now is that the path, Mr Interpreter, that he is showing? MR MAGIDIWANA: That is the road, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Can you see it? MR NGALWANA: In other words behind the cars parked here, behind those cars, MR TIP SC: Mr Chair, very helpfully, the technician has drawn a red line on a path and if that's the path that you're describing -CHAIRPERSON: He is trying to describe the path and the witness said it is the path. The only one

```
Page 6231
                                                                                                                           Page 6233
    that doesn't see it is Mr Ngalwana, but hopefully now that,
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                       There was no police with
                                                                    1
2
    - he says he is colour blind, but it is red - is now moving
                                                                        barbed wire on the road at that time.
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                         How did it come to the
3
    along it.
                                                                    3
4
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    What happened is, we came
                                                                    4
                                                                        kraal?
                                                                                                       You're running in front of
5
    from up, we came down straight, singing, we came down, now
                                                                    5
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
                                                                        me, I haven't reached the kraal as yet. I'm speaking of
    the pole, we left it above us on the side. As counsel is
                                                                    6
6
7
                                                                    7
    saying, we were going towards the police. At that stage
                                                                        the first occurrence.
    the pole would then have been behind us.
                                                                    8
8
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                                                                                         What stopped us then from
9
                                                                    9
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Yes, but judging by where
                                                                        going towards those police during that first time? I'm
10
    the police says you dashed from -
                                                                        listening.
                                                                   10
11
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    They are lying.
                                                                   11
                                                                        [16:08] MR NGALWANA:
                                                                                                         If you say the police put
12
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  I haven't asked my
                                                                   12
                                                                        the barbed wire, the answer is, Sir, please respond to my
    question. Judging by where the police says you dashed
13
                                                                   13
                                                                        question, I'm answering yours. You say the police deployed
    from, if you were headed towards Nkaneng in a large group
14
                                                                        the barbed wire in front of you, they closed up to where
    of about 200 people it makes sense that you would have
                                                                        that pole is. I showed you the pole, you went past,
    joined the big path that goes to Nkaneng and leave the
16
                                                                        slightly past that pole. At that time the main road was
    police line alone. Why didn't you do that because there
                                                                   17
17
                                                                        still not blocked by the police, it wasn't closed by the
18
    was no Nyala blocking that path at that time?
                                                                   18
                                                                        police.
19
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    I'm trying to fix this
                                                                   19
                                                                               MR NGAI WANA:
                                                                                                       But if you wanted to go to
                                                                        Nkaneng at the time why did you not make use of that road
20
    thing but it doesn't come right, I can understand what you
                                                                   20
21
    are saying now.
                                                                   21
                                                                        before it was closed?
22
                                                                   22
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
           MR NGALWANA:
                                  Well, why didn't you take
                                                                                                         I like your Xhosa, it is
23
    the big path? That would have avoided the police to your
                                                                   23
                                                                        very clear.
    right.
                                                                   24
24
                                                                                                       I wanted to understand,
                                                                               MR NGALWANA:
25
                                                                        Sir, that at the time before the barbed wire was deployed
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                    Don't you see that the
                                                        Page 6232
                                                                                                                           Page 6234
                                                                        the workers were signing there, not at all thinking that
    road was being blocked here, Sir?
1
2
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   It hasn't been blocked yet.
                                                                        they would be attacked by the police. The police then
3
           MR MAGIDIWANA:
                                     That's why I told you
                                                                        started deploying the barbed wire. When they started
4
    earlier before the closing of the road the workers were
                                                                        deploying the barbed wire you said yourself that it came to
5
    going around there, coming down singing.
                                                                        you what Mathunjwa was saying could be true and that was an
6
           MR NGALWANA:
                                   Mr Magidiwana, I'm going to
                                                                        opportune time for you to take the main road, get out of
7
    say this for the last time. You chose what you say is the
                                                                    7
                                                                        the place without any problems, is it not so?
                                                                    8
                                                                               MR MAGIDIWANA:
8
    narrow road which brings you in line with the police line,
                                                                                                       I will repeat the same
9
                                                                    9
    instead of joining immediately with the wider main path
                                                                        thing again, I've been saying the same thing over and over
                                                                   10
```

that you say leads to Nkaneng. The police was deploying 10 11 barbed wire to the right of that path, the big path. On 12 your own version you chose to go directly where that barbed 13 wire was being deployed, instead of taking the big path or the wider path which avoids the barbed wire. 14 15 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is not as you say, 16 unless you can put it in some different manner. I 17 definitely cannot agree with you when you say something 18 that did not happen. 19 MR NGALWANA: If I misrepresented your evidence your lawyer would have objected. Your evidence 21 is, the police was deploying barbed wire in front of you. 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, the police deployed

the barbed wire in front of us, but whilst the police were

deploying this barbed wire in front of you there was on

your left side the main, the big road.

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

23

again. The majority of them started moving away when the barbed wire was deployed, but it did not help much because the hippo then put speed and closed the place towards the crawl. We then turned around the crawl to another road and that road was also blocked. MR NGALWANA: The difficulty, Chairperson, is the witness is talking about the second and third incident, I'm talking about the first incident. The kraal hasn't come into play at all where I am, you know I said this and I will say it for the last time, let me -CHAIRPERSON: Would you like to approach the matter again tomorrow morning at half past nine? MR NGALWANA: I was hoping to put it to bed but, Chair, perhaps I should take your advice. CHAIRPERSON: I hear that the way things are going we're never going to get anywhere with this. We

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

	Page 6235	
1	will now take the adjournment until 9:30 tomorrow morning.	
2	[COMMISSION ADJOURNED]	
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16	•	
17		
18		
19	•	
20		
21	•	
22	•	
23 24	•	
25		
23	•	
	102 54 20 m	
- R	C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	
/	As Int to 1st a	
0	my home, bare or to have	
Ca.	of gardly all your offer	
	DOMINE END THEFTICE	

A
able 6135:25 6230:15
absolutely 6212:22
accept 6142:2,5 6147:6
6147:8 6148:16,18,19 6148:20 6173:5
6179:16 6191:18
6194:16 6201:25
6202:3
accepted 6142:19
6143:1 6181:5 accomplishments
6200:19
accurately 6209:24
add 6136:10 6167:16
address 6166:16 6169:3,14 6172:16,20
6173:8 6174:3 6177:9
6177:18,18 6179:2
6182:21 6183:2,4,9
6183:13 6184:17
6185:15 6186:7 addressed 6166:3
addresses 6187:13
addressing 6174:18
6197:14
adjourn 6154:14
ADJOURNED 6235:2 adjournment 6154:19
6161:11,12 6191:3,8
6213:11,12,15 6235:1
<b>ADJOURNS</b> 6163:20
6191:16 6213:16
admit 6155:11 Adv 6200:13 6201:3
advanced 6166:15
advantage 6201:2
advice 6234:23
<b>Africa</b> 6174:20 <b>African</b> 6135:10
6137:12 6147:1,6
6161:5,7 6183:21
6188:12 6189:3
6205:17
<b>afternoon</b> 6179:8 6191:19 6212:17
aggression 6182:13
ago 6170:5
agree 6142:4 6156:4,5
6156:7 6161:6,14
6163:12 6165:4 6167:23 6183:12
6192:9 6232:17
agreed 6155:14
6161:14
agreement 6166:23,25
6167:10 <b>ahead</b> 6148:4 6198:15
air 6162:18
albeit 6141:10 6182:5
alive 6214:19
allegation 6180:15 allege 6157:24
alleviate 6226:16
allow 6197:1 6202:13

<b>Alright</b> 6148:23
6204:23 6218:13 6229:1
alternatives 6217:11
<b>AMCU</b> 6180:9,12 <b>amounts</b> 6229:10
angle 6156:17
animals 6188:13,14
6189:17 <b>answer</b> 6135:12,15
6136:1,7,9 6138:1,11
6140:23,24,25 6146:2 6148:3,16 6150:10
6160:17 6162:7,11
6164:1,11 6166:1 6172:21,23 6182:14
6182:16 6188:5,22
6195:3,3 6196:3,6,21 6196:23,24,25
6200:24 6233:12
answered 6139:16
6141:5 6149:19 6153:1 6160:18
6187:1
<b>answering</b> 6140:17 6152:10 6162:8
6164:14 6173:13
6196:4 6233:13 answers 6161:15
6206:22
anybody 6139:17
6186:17 <b>anyway</b> 6154:24
6168:10 6171:9 6202:18
apart 6138:22 6145:20
<b>apologise</b> 6197:19 <b>appear</b> 6156:1 6159:22
6169:11 6209:25
6220:10 6227:7,8
appearances 6149:15 appeared 6183:18
6198:12 6206:13
<b>appearing</b> 6143:17 6155:15,24 6160:16
appears 6144:19
6155:22 6157:16 6160:21 6162:15,21
6227:5 6229:5
applies 6196:23,24
approach 6156:16 6212:20,21 6226:18
6212:20,21 6226:18 6226:19,21,23
6227:10 6229:6,8,10 6229:12,22,23
6230:11 6234:20
<b>approached</b> 6214:17 <b>argue</b> 6166:1
<b>arguing</b> 6222:17
argument 6228:19
arguments 6201:17 6202:17
arms 6167:25
<b>arrow</b> 6141:8 6158:20 6160:1,10 6162:21
6190:18 19 6203:15

6199:18,19 6203:15

В
awaiting 6181:3
avoids 6232:14
available 6169:22 avoided 6231:23
available 6169:22
6188:23 6191:19
6146:5,5,19 6147:18 6155:5 6156:20
6141:8 6145:13
6136:8,21 6137:11
August 6135:12,14
attitude 6171:6
6201:23
attention 6141:6
attend 6213:13
attempting 6208:15
6205:5
<b>attempt</b> 6213:9,23 <b>attempted</b> 6204:1
attacked 6234:2
assuming 6142:15
assume 6212:25
assistant 6219:3
assist 6200:22 6201:8
assignment 6202:1
aspect 6194:13
6197:20
6190:11 6194:18
6163:23 6173:19
6149:20,22 6156:25
asking 6146:3,12
6227:16 6231:12
6208:19 6226:25
6172:22 6182:8,9
6164:11 6170:7
6140:19 6160:15
asked 6135:6 6137:8
ascertain 6169:23
6230:11 ascertain 6169:25
6229:11,12 6230:3,10 6230:11
6228:2 6229:5,11,11
6227:14,21,21,22
6225:17,18,19 6227:4
6225:1,2,2,13,14,15
6223:1 6224:25
6213:1,7 6222:25
6205:24 6212:25
6203:16,17,20

### **B** 6170:1 back 6140:4 6153:20 6154:10,11,13 6155:2 6169:16 6171:4 6173:2 6174:8,14 6175:17,25 6178:1,2 6178:3 6180:17 6181:25 6182:7 6191:9 6203:11 6204:23 6210:6,8 6212:20 6213:5,14 6216:24 6223:21 6229:9 backwards 6213:2 **bad** 6177:12,13 6202:12,13

bakkies 6189:23 bar 6144:23 6145:1.1.2 6145:4.4.7.8 6147:1.3 6147:3,20,21 6148:6 6148:8,10,11,16,17 barbed 6187:17 6188:7 6188:23 6189:16 6190:1 6191:21 6192:11 6193:10 6194:23 6195:5,14 6197:5,22 6198:4,24 6199:23 6200:2 6205:11 6206:5 6221:1 6227:9,10,11 6227:24,25 6230:13 6232:11,12,14,21,23 6232:24 6233:2,12,14 6233:25 6234:3,4,11 bare 6214:22 **Bargaining** 6167:6 6168:7,16 **barren** 6214:23 **based** 6167:13 basis 6172:19 6196:13 **bearing** 6229:21 bearings 6213:11 6214:4 6221:5 beaten 6157:20 6158:12 bed 6234:23 beg 6140:5 began 6191:20 **begged** 6166:4 beginning 6218:9,23 begs 6175:7 behalf 6181:4 behave 6197:13 **belief** 6192:17 believe 6151:17,24 6177:16,19,22 6178:14 6184:5 6191:20 6195:13,14 6195:15,20 6197:21 **believed** 6178:16 6183:18 6189:9,13 6191:21 6192:12 believing 6151:6 6179:20 **belonging** 6212:11 benefit 6179:21 better 6152:19 6161:8 6191:15 6200:8 6218:24 beyond 6198:9 6215:7 **big** 6179:5 6186:10,11 6186:13 6189:4 6220:6 6222:6 6223:16 6226:12 6231:16,23 6232:11 6232:13,25 Bishop 6181:15,22 bit 6209:21

black 6174:19 6175:2

**blame** 6180:14

blamed 6180:5

6176:2,24,25 6178:25

**blaming** 6180:3 blanket 6144:5 6159:5 6159:7.9 **blind** 6159:21 6231:2 **blocked** 6227:7,9,10 6232:1,2 6233:17 6234:14 **blocking** 6231:18 blood 6175:8 bloodshed 6175:8 6176:1,8,24 6192:8 6192:13,16 blown 6141:10 **blurred** 6141:11 body 6144:11 **bold** 6169:17 **borrowed** 6137:12 **bottom** 6135:23 6143:16 6157:15,17 6163:7 6199:10 6211:5 6217:10 6218:11,12,21 6224:25 6225:12,14 6225:16 boxed 6189:17 **boy** 6150:17 **brave** 6148:24 6149:2,5 bright 6160:25 **brighter** 6160:7 bring 6172:3 **brings** 6232:8 **broad** 6191:5 **brought** 6137:5 6201:23 busy 6187:10 6197:14 C call 6137:12 6145:1

#### 6147:19 6160:5 6189:5 6216:17 called 6146:25 6189:6 calls 6212:13 candid 6135:7 can't 6146:12 6148:11 6165:4 6171:13,14 6201:20 6214:12 6216:15 6225:11 capitalists 6175:5 care 6137:3 6213:23 6219:19 carefully 6161:13 6163:24 6227:1,3 6229:13 carried 6144:22 6145:3 6145:6,8 6146:24 carry 6188:15,20 6201:24 6202:21 6218:4 **carrying** 6137:10 6138:12,14 6139:7,9 6139:24 6144:17,20 6145:16 6146:9,22

6147:19 6148:1

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

6155:15

cars 6230:20,20

Casper 6198:4

cast 6159:1
categorically 6136:2
6139:9,23 6173:6
cattle 6206:18
cause 6153:22 6170:16
causes 6140:20
certain 6194:25 certainly 6227:8
6228:7
<b>chair</b> 6140:5,9 6154:25
6161:17 6165:21,25
6168:9,13 6169:1
6171:7 6176:17
6179:15 6187:21
6188:21 6191:9 6210:18 6211:22
6213:8,19 6214:19
6215:25 6216:9
6217:14,15 6219:5
6230:6,21 6234:23
Chairman 6183:7
6188:9 6200:22
6215:2
CHAIRPESON
6174:23 <b>challenge</b> 6164:8,9
6165:8,12
<b>challenging</b> 6164:22,24
<b>change</b> 6176:12,16
6201:19
character 6149:16
<b>cheap</b> 6174:20 6176:2
6176:25 <b>chest</b> 6141:23 6142:3,8
chief 6152:23 6153:3
6182:8
children 6186:1
chimneys 6186:10,11
6186:13
chose 6232:7,12 circle 6211:21
circled 6215:6
circles 6161:16
circumcised 6150:16
circumcision 6150:4,8
6150:14
circumstances 6151:20
<b>clapping</b> 6182:12 <b>clarify</b> 6148:25 6196:9
clarity 6185:14 6215:3
clear 6137:22 6139:22
6144:21 6146:8
6163:8 6164:1
6166:19 6168:20
6170:8 6174:5
6198:18 6209:14
6210:13 6214:11
6218:24 6219:7 6220:4 6221:1 6222:9
6223:1,13 6228:20
6233:23
cleared 6189:6
clearer 6141:11
6155:13 6159:2
6210:19
clearly 6142:1,20

Mar
6176:24 6178:25
6208:6 6222:19,22 6223:22
clicking 6182:9,11 clip 6136:11,12,15
close 6158:12 6192:23 6198:5 6208:7,9
6217:14 closed 6190:19 6192:19
6198:7 6206:21
6207:9 6233:14,17,21 6234:12
closer 6161:25 6162:5 6190:16
closing 6222:10 6232:4 clothes 6157:23
clue 6228:8 coincide 6225:19
colleague 6215:4 6218:3
Collective 6167:6 6168:7,16
colour 6142:7 6143:6
6159:11,17,20 6160:7 6160:22,25 6161:2,5
6161:18,21,23 6162:4 6163:3,9 6223:1
6231:2 colours 6161:21
6195:24 column 6169:23
come 6154:9,11 6155:2 6166:16 6169:2
6172:16,19 6173:7 6174:2,6,8,12
6175:16 6177:4
6182:21,25 6183:2,4 6183:9,13 6184:6,8
6184:15,17,23 6186:2 6186:3 6191:18
6198:10 6215:20 6219:21 6221:13
6231:20 6233:3 6234:18
comes 6173:1 6186:7 6186:22 6200:7
6202:10 6206:18 6215:8 6223:9,17
6224:7
comfortable 6202:8 coming 6138:17
6168:21 6169:8 6175:24 6181:24
6186:9,12,23 6191:12 6215:24 6227:12
6232:5 comment 6137:3
6165:15 6186:2 6200:20 6213:24
6219:19 commission 6135:2,5,7
6135:17,20,21,22 6153:6 6155:1
6156:23 6163:20,20
6163:21 6167:3

6195:13.14.20.22 6197:21 6213:16.16 6213:17 6224:21 6235:2 commissioner 6140:10 6155:8,18,22,25 6162:23 6177:22 6180:21 6181:2,7,14 6181:18,22 6182:1 6190:10 6200:12 6212:18,23 Commissioners 6215:3 committed 6136:6 **common** 6170:16 communicated 6167:18 communication 6180:23 compelling 6151:20 completely 6225:10 Comrades 6172:3 **concede** 6136:11 **concerned** 6167:22 **concrete** 6165:18 confirm 6147:20 confronted 6190:18 **confused** 6146:22 6170:6 **confusing** 6145:23 6161:23 6163:14 6216:22 **confusion** 6210:16 consequences 6168:22 **consider** 6148:24 6149:4,6,8,12,23,25 6150:20 6154:19 6165:2 considered 6151:12 context 6182:5,6,6 6216:5 continuation 6215:23 **continue** 6154:21 6198:11 6201:15 6206:3 6215:22 6225:3 **continues** 6174:24 6204:12 contrary 6157:9 convenient 6154:14 convey 6156:15 conveved 6169:1,6 corner 6217:10 6218:12.21 6225:4.4 6225:21 correct 6136:19 6138:23 6139:1.20 6140:9 6143:4 6156:1 6156:3 6167:3 6168:5 6170:14 6179:17 6188:15 6189:10 6191:23 6193:11,14 6196:7 6201:17

**corrected** 6169:13 **correctly** 6183:23 6213:3 couldn't 6180:14 counsel 6147:22 6167:21 6171:20 6218:16 6219:6 6231:6 course 6152:16 6166:1 6169:22 6182:3 6202:12 6214:12 6219:17 6227:6,10 coward 6149:1,5,7,18 **crawl** 6204:19 6234:13 6234:13 cream 6143:18 created 6167:22 cross 6196:21,22 6211:15 6215:20 6218:8 6220:19 crossed 6204:25 **crosses** 6199:13 6225:2 6225:5 6228:5 crowd 6174:18 **crucial** 6188:10 **cup** 6163:19 D damage 6148:11,17 danger 6179:7 dangerous 6147:12 6148:10,21 dash 6193:16,22,25 6197:21,22 6204:1

6205:5 6207:4,12 6208:11,15 6216:2 dashed 6193:13 6195:14,15 6197:3,5 6199:15,16,22,25 6210:23 6213:21 6214:23 6219:17,17 6219:24 6221:7,8,15 6222:13,20 6231:10 6231:13 dashing 6194:23 6195:4 6196:10 6197:4 6208:18.19.22 6223:12 date 6142:17 6155:3 day 6135:18,24 6136:1 6136:2 6138:3,22 6139:3,8,10,18 6141:2,3 6145:7,24 6157:11 6169:7 6181:25 6185:18 6187:10 6188:1,7,8 6194:20,21 6195:1 days 6139:5 6140:12 6170:5 6194:25 **dealing** 6165:23 6226:18 dealt 6155:4,4 deaths 6189:7 **decided** 6172:25 6189:23 6193:2 decision 6177:14,20

6178:5.7.15 6179:6 6186:18.21 6187:3 6190:3 declaration 6164:4 6165:3 declaring 6164:5 defeated 6175:5 defined 6204:20 definitely 6232:17 deliberate 6170:10 deliberately 6170:6 demand 6151:13,13,21 6172:18 demanding 6151:17 **demands** 6166:16 6180:2 denied 6156:8 6167:20 deny 6136:3 6139:23 6155:4 6203:25 6207:11 **denying** 6156:2 6204:24 6205:5 6206:23 6207:1,3,15 depend 6138:13,24 depict 6141:9 depicted 6155:11 6159:23 6224:12 depicting 6203:7 6204:13 **deployed** 6187:18 6193:11 6195:15 6200:2,3 6205:11 6232:13,22 6233:13 6233:25 6234:11 deploying 6189:2 6232:10,21,24 6234:3 6234:4 deployment 6194:23 6195:5 6197:5 describe 6230:24 described 6161:5 6214:15 describing 6228:8 6230:23 despite 6157:5,8 6175:10,10 destroved 6152:9 6175:18 deviate 6223:14 **deviated** 6205:18 deviation 6206:6 diagonally 6217:9 dictate 6202:13 didn't 6147:3 6166:11 6166:22 6179:9 6181:23 6183:22 6184:5,5 6185:6,7 6188:17 6189:18,21 6222:6 6231:17,22 die 6164:2,6,19 6178:10,14,18 died 6152:3,3,12 6196:1 difference 6153:11 differences 6201:6 6202:6

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

6191:16,16,18

6203:8 6204:14

6205:1 6209:6

6217:4 6222:11

6225:23

6212:23 6213:7,8

<b>different</b> 6137:7 6146:4
6149:20 6152:22,25
6153:6,7 6156:17
6165:19 6182:5,6,6
6232:16
difficult 6209:23
6210:4 6216:5
<b>difficulty</b> 6201:21 6212:19 6234:15
direct 6137:7 6141:5
directed 6140:18
6206:5 6220:1
direction 6168:23
6190:15 6192:21
6193:14 6195:5
6197:4 6200:1,5
6203:4,7,20 6204:1 6206:7 6207:4
6208:22 6209:10,15
6210:1,2,23 6213:2,3
6213:4,5,6,7,21,23
6214:24 6215:12
6218:8 6221:11
6223:2 6225:20
directions 6192:25
directly 6225:4
6232:12 disagree 6156:10
disagreement 6201:2
disallow 6196:25
<b>disbelieve</b> 6183:6,12
6184:1,1,3,16
discovered 6136:4
6140:6
discuss 6175:11 6185:1
6186:17 <b>discussed</b> 6186:20
dismiss 6175:18
disobeyed 6182:11
<b>dispute</b> 6141:12
6142:14,16,18,21
6143:25 6144:18,24
6155:6 6156:22
6157:4 6158:1,4,21
disputing 6185:13 distance 6190:23
6210:5,9,11 6213:4
distrust 6183:3
document 6159:1
6169:25
documents 6154:7
6157:14
doesn't 6168:11,11
6183:11,25 6184:15 6212:16 6224:10
6212:16 6224:10 6229:15 6231:1,20
doing 6158:7 6164:22
6194:4
don't 6142:23 6145:16
6145:17 6146:23,24
6147:8,9 6148:6,15
6149:3 6170:10,25
6180:25 6181:16,24
6186:4,16 6188:10 6189:5 6200:24
6201:11,18 6203:12
A R C H I V F F O

```
6217:23 6220:15
  6221:22 6222:1
  6224:9 6226:6 6227:2
  6227:15 6230:6,7
  6231:25
double 6169:13
doubt 6169:21 6175:2
downwards 6217:6
drastic 6168:22
draw 6228:10
drawing 6229:21
  6230:8
drawn 6230:22
drive 6140:7
dug 6165:17
dwaal 6227:3
          \mathbf{E}
earlier 6140:22
  6152:23 6153:8,15
  6154:19 6177:22
  6182:5 6190:1
  6193:18 6205:7
  6220:1 6222:8
  6227:11 6232:4
earned 6163:18
easier 6190:15
easterly 6213:5,6
easy 6216:6
eat 6181:12
EEE7 6140:8,9 6141:6
  6157:14
EEE7.10 6162:20
effect 6138:21 6167:12
  6191:22
effort 6156:15
eight 6159:1
eish 6165:13
either 6138:24 6217:5
electric 6223:25
element 6189:21
elevation 6217:17
elicit 6135:25
eliminate 6217:20
else's 6144:11
emblazoned 6143:2
emergence 6183:25
emphatically 6156:2,8
employ 6175:4
employed 6177:6
employees 6152:20
  6167:19 6169:17
  6173:11 6174:7,14
  6175:16,24 6177:4,23
  6179:2,25 6180:1
  6186:2
employer 6152:5,7,13
  6154:5,8,10 6166:16
  6166:18,22 6167:4
  6168:20,21 6169:1,2
  6169:4,8 6172:6,9,16
  6172:17,19 6173:4,6
  6173:22,25 6174:2,2
  6174:6,7 6175:3,10
  6175:15,23 6176:6,11
```

6205:8.21 6208:17

6176:18.21 6177:4.6 6177:17 6178:1 6179:1 6180:7.23.25 6181:4,9 6184:4,20 6184:23 6186:7,22,23 6192:4 **employers** 6174:13 6177:19 employing 6154:7 employment 6152:20 6153:22 6174:9 6175:17,19 6178:2 6180:18 encircled 6188:3 6189:19,21 encouraged 6193:20 **English** 6169:22,24 6170:1,23 6171:1,3,8 6171:9,20 entire 6184:11 especially 6151:20 **evasive** 6165:6 evasiveness 6166:2 events 6135:18 6136:1 6136:5 6139:5 6179:16 eventually 6179:10 6180:17 6219:4 6227:23 everybody 6187:6,14 **evidence** 6135:11 6136:24,25 6137:1,21 6138:2,8,14,20,23,25 6139:17,19 6140:1 6142:11,17 6144:25 6147:18,25 6152:23 6152:25 6153:3 6156:22 6157:5,9,13 6161:6 6167:12 6182:7 6188:11 6212:19 6213:20 6214:9,11,13,21 6219:15 6232:20,20 exactly 6159:24 6160:6 6160:24 6162:10 6192:22 6198:17 6199:7 6215:5.10 examination 6220:20 exclamation 6169:18 exert 6169:14 exhibit 6140:8 6141:6 6143:24 6162:20,24 6214:2 6224:11 **exhibits** 6140:6 **expect** 6172:19 6173:5 6222:2 **expected** 6184:6 expecting 6181:8 6192:4 expending 6156:15 **explain** 6139:12 6194:12 6197:24 6201:20 6205:7 6206:16 6217:10 6221:23 6229:17 explained 6182:11

extent 6170:17 external 6140:7 extra 6136:10 **extreme** 6215:8 eve 6159:1 6225:11 F face 6144:2,3,7,10 6158:21 facing 6210:7 6211:10 6211:11 fact 6135:16 6136:3,4 6136:25 6139:2 6141:25 6143:11 6144:14,25 6145:24 6147:3,20 6151:15 6153:21 6161:24 6170:15 6177:3,23 6178:25 6179:3,25,25 6184:3,4,5,19 6186:8 6189:14 6190:17,19 6190:21 6214:2 6215:14 6222:18 facts 6210:15 **fade** 6161:8 **faded** 6161:8,18,19,20 6162:5 faint 6227:5,13 6228:1 6229:14 6230:2,13 fair 6163:16 6170:12 falls 6167:21 false 6139:19 **familiar** 6171:16 far 6167:9 6200:25 6209:6 6221:2 fast 6193:25 6207:9 fear 6153:13,16,21 feed 6186:1 fell 6196:1 6198:16 fence 6207:7 6227:24 6227:25 fight 6165:4,7 final 6212:21 finally 6189:10 **find** 6165:22 6210:20 fine 6171:12 6183:19 6183:23 **finger** 6215:16,23 6216:7,16,18 6218:7 6224:25 6225:13,16 6225:20 6227:22 **finish** 6161:11.12 6164:3 6165:11 6174:25 **finished** 6173:19 6178:8 6197:15 **firing** 6154:6 6198:13 **firmly** 6135:11 6156:20 6218:15 **first** 6141:6 6144:4 6157:13 6158:10 6170:15 6176:20,20 6177:17,21 6195:18

6193:18 6198:17

6205:7 6218:3

**express** 6216:6

6199:22 6200:1 6212:20 6213:23 6220:2 6226:17.21 6229:6,10,12,18,22 6230:11 6233:7,9 6234:17 firstly 6187:13 6210:10 five 6155:10,23 fix 6231:19 flee 6150:24 6187:5 6189:20 flip 6147:15 focus 6141:13 follow 6182:10,12 6216:7,19,22 6224:24 following 6210:2 6217:10 **foot** 6227:3,14,20,21 6228:2 6230:3,10,10 **footpath** 6205:13 Forget 6142:17 6164:22 **form** 6182:12 6223:13 former 6200:7 formulated 6167:9 forth 6147:17 6212:17 fortunately 6202:18 forward 6137:5 6180:1 6186:2,4 found 6174:22 four 6143:2 6201:7,21 6202:18 Friday 6154:13 **friend** 6168:14 6174:22 6182:8 6196:19 6215:11 front 6142:1 6157:15 6190:6,8,14,22 6194:5 6198:23 6205:16 6206:2 6207:2,3,3,9 6208:3 6208:21,25 6211:16 6220:21 6232:21,23 6232:24 6233:5,14 further 6165:16 6167:17 6187:13 6206:16 6220:20

#### $\mathbf{G}$ gap 6198:5,7 garment 6159:9 6160:5 6160:13,20,21,22 6161:1 6163:4,6 garments 6162:22 generic 6188:12 **gentlemen** 6201:7,22 6202:19 **getting** 6151:23 gist 6167:18 give 6140:24 6159:11 6167:25 6197:15 6228:9 given 6202:1 giving 6150:9 6152:25 go 6148:4 6152:15

6153:19,20 6155:2,9

T

6161:15 6162:19
6165:19 6166:5
6173:1 6174:8 6175:7
6177:13 6178:1,3
6179:2 6180:17
6182:7 6184:23
6192:23,25 6193:19
6198:6,9 6200:3
6204:4,18 6205:15
6207:8 6208:4,25
6209:16 6210:5
6216:20,24 6217:5,6
6217:8,9,16 6227:25
6229:9 6232:12
6233:19
goes 6176:22 6220:7
6221:16 6225:6,22
6227:5,24 6231:16
gold 6223:1
golden 6225:1,13,14,15
6225:17 6227:14,20
6227:21 6228:2
6229:11 6230:3,10,11
<b>good</b> 6179:11 6188:19
6196:25 6212:10 6225:11
6225:11 grazing 6206:18
grazing 6206:18 greater 6188:16
green 6141:17 6142:3,7
6143:1,3,6,7,8 6159:8
6159:10 6160:5
greenish 6163:11,15
ground 6151:5,17
6167:13
grounds 6151:9
group 6157:19,20
6158:11,17,18,20
6184:10,12 6185:15
6185:15 6199:15
6207:2,2,3,3,12
6208:4,10,14,22
6209:25 6210:12,22
6211:20,25 6212:4,5
6212:6,7,10,11
6213:21 6214:2,4,6,9
6215:6 6216:2,18
6217:11 6219:16,16
6221:6,6 6223:2
6231:14
<b>gruesome</b> 6174:18
guns 6198:14
<u>H</u>
half 6213:14 6234:21

<b>guns</b> 6198:14		
Н		
half 6213:14 6234:21		
HANABE 6135:20		
6147:22 6162:10,23		
6163:1 6169:4		
6177:21 6181:20		
6183:22 6184:9		
6190:10 6191:9		
hand 6140:5 6144:18		
6146:3 6155:19		
6157:16 6169:23		
6197:3 6205:10		
6217:10 6218:12,21		
6219:18 6220:5		
ARCHIVE E		

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

6225:21 6227:6,14
6228:2 6230:4,14
hanging 6162:18 happen 6189:11,11,22
6192:16 6232:18
happened 6135:23
6136:16 6137:24 6139:3,4,4 6140:12
6140:16 6152:2,2
6153:20 6167:17
6189:13 6195:22 6197:25 6221:4
6231:4
happening 6136:13
6179:11,13 happens 6202:8
happy 6182:17,20,24
6183:1,2,4,8,13
6184:7,15,17,21 6218:2
hard 6140:7 6174:5
hasn't 6232:2 6234:18
<b>haven't</b> 6187:1 6188:24 6231:12 6233:6
head 6148:18 6150:16
6180:7 6225:16
6227:21
<b>headed</b> 6220:22 6221:11 6231:14
heading 6206:7,10
hear 6172:6,9,14
6183:22 6234:24 <b>heard</b> 6164:12 6167:1
6169:9 6172:3
6173:22,24
<b>hearing</b> 6146:23 6195:18
heels 6165:17
held 6152:22 6153:3,6
<b>help</b> 6136:15 6160:9 6202:19 6212:16
6216:12 6229:19
6234:11
<b>helped</b> 6136:13 6171:25
helpfully 6230:21
helps 6212:14 6217:16
<b>HEMRAJ</b> 6140:10 6180:21 6181:2,7,14
6181:18,22 6182:1
6212:18
hey 6207:20 he's 6181:13
high 6183:24 6200:12
higher 6158:12
6225:15 <b>hill</b> 6205:11
hindsight 6179:21
<b>hippo</b> 6206:1,2 6207:9
6234:12 hippos 6205:15
6222:14
hit 6148:17
hold 6153:7
<b>holding</b> 6137:24 6138:5

home 6153:19.19.22.25 6166:5 hope 6154:9.10 hopefully 6231:1 hopes 6183:24 hoping 6234:22 house 6150:16 huddled 6158:11 idea 6213:10 ignorance 6140:4 image 6147:17 6159:2 immediately 6232:9 **impedes** 6140:11,19 **implement** 6146:2,6 **implies** 6214:18 importance 6135:6 **important** 6164:16 6194:13,15 6218:17 6218:25 6228:7,19 6229:7

**imposed** 6144:10 **impression** 6167:22 **inaudible** 6212:17 incident 6234:17,17 inclination 6202:2 **including** 6163:19 inconsistency 6196:12 6196:14 incontrovertible 6138:8 6156:22 **incorrect** 6138:24 6139:1,20 6178:23 6195:7 6202:5 **indebted** 6155:1 indicate 6168:8 6203:1 6222:7 **indicated** 6206:8 6221:8,9 indicates 6206:10,11 6220:5,13,16 indicating 6205:19 **indulge** 6150:6 influenced 6202:15 **information** 6214:17 informative 6136:1 **initiation** 6150:18 insert 6158:19 inside 6216:1,5 insignificant 6188:17 instances 6164:1 instructions 6140:7 instrument 6145:11.14 6145:22 6146:6,14 insult 6200:24 **intention** 6189:2 **interpret** 6209:24 interpretation 6200:11 6200:15 6201:1,7,8 6201:18,21 6202:4 **interpreter** 6161:4,4 6171:20,21 6190:12 6200:7 6201:17 6202:6,9,11,14,16 6219:3 6227:20

6229:17 6230:5.16 interpreters 6201:14 6219:4 **interpreter's** 6200:11 interpreting 6202:16 **interrupt** 6138:19 6139:15 6177:8 6211:9 6214:16 intersection 6158:12 6211:4,8 6214:5,5 6215:7,13,16 6216:1 6216:19,19,25 6217:3 6217:12,14 6218:23 6219:7,8 intervene 6212:9 investigation 6191:13 involve 6177:24 **involved** 6179:1 **iron** 6144:23 6145:1,3 6145:4,7,8 6147:1,1,3 6147:3,9,19,19,21 6148:2,6,8,10,11,16 6148:17 6155:14,14 irrelevant 6195:2 irrespective 6180:15 isiXhosa 6169:23 6171:3,4 6201:3 isiZulu 6171:11 isn't 6164:9,25 6210:13 issue 6164:16 6170:11 6172:20 6173:8 6188:18 **issued** 6182:4 issues 6174:18 **issuing** 6164:8 It's 6185:5 I'll 6164:22 6227:19 I'm 6163:23,24,24 6164:16,17,18,23 6165:6,7,8,10,18 6170:9 6201:7,13,23 6202:25 6205:6,25 6207:20 6209:11 6211:16,17 6214:8,19 6214:20 6215:3,5,9 6215:14 6216:4,21 6217:15 6219:7.11 6220:19,22 6221:4,5 6221:5,12 6222:17 6223:5 6226:13 6229:7 6231:19 6232:6 6233:6,9,13 6234:17 I've 6201:22 6205:7 6206:8 6209:22 6210:15 6217:24 6226:20 6234:9 J ja 6143:7 6146:1

iog 6136:13.15 6140:5 ioin 6205:15 6222:6 ioined 6154:1 6231:16 joining 6232:9 joins 6199:1 6224:7 judging 6231:9,13

keep 6222:16 kill 6164:7,21 6165:8 6174:25,25 6179:7 6189:2 6190:3,4,9,13 6190:15 killed 6177:15,20 6178:5,11 6179:8 6186:19 6187:3,5,25 6188:8,24 **killing** 6187:23 6191:22 **kind** 6140:23 6143:18 6145:12 6146:6,14,17 6146:20 6203:13 6229:17 kneels 6175:7 **knees** 6166:4 6176:22 knelt 6166:4 knew 6183:18 knobkerrie 6155:19,20 **knobkierie** 6144:17,19 know 6135:16 6138:14 6139:2,11 6140:1,23 6142:23 6146:2 6148:6,15 6149:3,10 6149:13,14 6152:16 6153:7 6158:2,5,7 6160:6,24 6161:3,20 6163:8 6168:11 6170:25 6177:7 6178:10 6180:25 6181:16 6185:24 6186:4,8 6189:5,21 6193:2,16,22 6195:8 6198:13,17 6200:25 6203:12 6216:5 6217:17 6221:22 6222:2 6227:15 6228:13,16,21,21 6234:18 **knowledge** 6139:5.7 known 6224:7 **koppie** 6135:8,9,11,14 6135:16,24 6136:8,21 6136:25 6137:2,11 6138:21 6148:1 6155:3,5 6156:2,8,20 6157:2 6166:3,5 6168:1 6169:2,7 6172:16,20 6175:12 6176:6,8 6177:1 6182:3 6185:1 6186:20 6187:8 6192:1,25 6210:8

**job** 6152:17,21 6153:13 6225:6,22 6153:17,25 6154:4 kraal 6192:22 6194:4,5

**koppies** 6198:23

6199:4 6204:19

6211:5,18 6214:6

6198:9,12 6199:5	6198:2 6199:15
6204:9 6206:6,15,17	6206:12 6214:11
6210:24 6212:21	<b>left</b> 6144:18 6154:13
6221:25 6222:4	6157:16,17 6169:23
6226:2 6233:4,6	6181:6,12,13 6182:3
6234:18	6184:25 6185:20
0234.18	6187:7,16,17 6199:18
	6203:19 6206:9
L 6214:2 6224:11	6209:18 6210:1,9,9
lack 6218:24	6211:8 6215:1 6217:9
lamp 6203:12 6209:15	6218:21 6219:18
lamppost 6203:13,21	6220:5,6 6221:11
6204:24,25 6207:4,12	6223:20,24 6227:5,6
6207:19,22,24 6208:8	6227:14,23 6228:2
6209:5,10 6213:22	6229:14 6230:3,14
6219:18,19	6231:6 6232:25
language 6137:12	leftwards 6230:12
6147:1,6 6161:5,7	legend 6212:13
6170:23 6171:22	6214:17
6183:21 6188:12	<b>letters</b> 6141:25 6143:2
6189:3 6202:7,10,17	6144:5
6205:18 6217:25	<b>let's</b> 6171:4 6182:7
6229:18	6188:20 6201:24
languages 6171:14	6202:20 6216:24
6216:6	<b>let's</b> 6155:10 6157:12
large 6231:14	6161:11,14 6162:19
latest 6182:22	<b>lie</b> 6148:6 6213:25
lawyer 6232:20	<b>life</b> 6174:19 6175:2
lawyers 6194:7,17	6176:1,25
lay 6196:13	<b>light</b> 6136:5
lead 6135:10 6136:24	line 6180:22 6193:8
6137:1 6138:25	6198:24 6203:14
6142:18 6144:25	6205:14 6213:21
6147:17,25 6195:11	6219:24 6220:2
6210:16	6221:7,15 6229:21
leader 6176:22	6230:8,22 6231:17
leaders 6161:6 6185:15	6232:8,8
<b>leading</b> 6191:5,6	linguist 6200:13,14,16
6203:10 6204:20	6202:9
6209:17 6213:22	<b>listen</b> 6161:13 6163:24
6214:25	6202:3
<b>leads</b> 6198:2 6206:16	listening 6233:10
6206:19 6209:4,4	literally 6227:2
6211:17 6219:24	<b>little</b> 6203:21 6229:3,19
6221:18,25 6222:4	6230:2
6224:18 6226:12	<b>Lonmin</b> 6167:12,23
6232:10	6168:14,15
<b>learned</b> 6168:14	<b>Lonmin's</b> 6167:21,23
6174:22 6176:12	look 6143:16 6150:8
6182:8 6196:18	6155:9 6158:10,18
6215:4,11	6160:14 6162:19
leave 6140:5 6151:11	6199:8,17 6203:13,14
6162:18 6164:6	6209:3,20,20,24
6165:11 6166:5,7,10	6210:14 6214:1
6166:11 6175:25	6227:1,3 6228:15,22
6176:1,6,8,23,23	6229:13 6230:9,10
6177:1,3 6178:2	looked 6145:22 6161:6
6186:6,8,20 6187:8	6163:11
6187:15 6189:24	looking 6141:14
6192:1,7,15,25	6149:12 6159:24,25
6231:16	6160:2 6183:6 6193:6
leaving 6177:5 6178:11	6198:15,21 6202:25
6186:6,22 6201:5	6207:20 6212:8
6209:16 6221:10	6228:13
lecture 6150:19	looks 6141:25 6145:12

```
6159:23 6160:7.25
  6161:7 6163:10.14.15
  6205:13 6212:24
  6225:6 6229:14
lose 6152:20 6153:22
  6154:4 6180:18
losing 6152:17,21
  6153:13,17,25
lost 6156:11
lot 6148:11,17
lower 6141:13,22
  6159:2,21 6160:5,10
  6160:13,21,22
  6162:20 6163:6
  6208:13 6214:5,6,14
  6214:21 6215:4,5,9
  6220:3
lunch 6191:3,8
lunchtime 6191:14
lying 6137:24 6231:11
L191 6193:5 6198:20
          M
Madlanga 6201:3
  6215:2
MAGIDIWANE
  6177:25
Mahlangu 6193:24
  6200:16,17,24 6202:8
  6219:6
Mahlangu's 6200:15
  6202:4
main 6179:24 6180:8
  6198:2 6205:15
  6220:6 6221:18,21,24
  6222:3,15 6223:3,7,9
  6223:18 6224:7
  6226:5,9 6232:9,25
  6233:16 6234:6
maintain 6141:7
majority 6234:10
making 6164:8 6168:18
Mambush 6148:24
  6164:17,23 6185:18
  6185:19,22,23
  6199:16 6212:7,11
Mambush's 6212:6
man 6148:24 6149:5.9
  6149:9.24.24 6150:1
  6150:2,4,11,12,16,16
  6150:17,20 6151:1,3
managed 6192:23
  6198:14
```

6173:20,23 6174:17 6175:25 6176:18,21 6177:3,9 6178:8,22 6179:3,6,13,16,20 6180:4,11,20 6181:6 6182:4,13,21,25 6183:2,9,17,25 6184:4,8,15,19,20 6185:16,20 6186:18 6187:2,7,12,17 6188:4 6189:9,9,14 6190:2 6191:20 6192:6,12 6234:5 **Mathunjwa's** 6169:14 6180:22 6181:10 matter 6139:18 6213:13 6215:3 6234:21 mean 6164:24 6169:4 6175:5 6184:9 6215:16 6217:18 meaning 6164:20 6201:1 means 6148:16 6161:7 6181:20 6193:17,23 6205:18 6216:5 meet 6167:14 6206:18 6219:9 6226:19 **meeting** 6199:3 meetings 6167:11 meets 6221:18 6222:3 members 6135:5 6167:2 6169:7 6191:17 memory 6136:13,15 6140:5,11,19 6169:12 men 6186:4 **mentioned** 6187:14 6188:11 6209:21 6210:15 mess 6171:5 metaphorically 6227:2 metres 6199:9 6203:15 6203:17,20 6205:9,24 middle 6174:21 mike 6175:20 mind 6214:3 6229:21 mine 6144:2 6151:8 6152:20 6155:21 6169:15 **minutes** 6158:9 misleading 6170:10 6176:10 misled 6170:6 misrepresented 6232:19 misunderstanding 6210:16 mix 6171:13 **mixed** 6171:10 moment 6138:20

material 6170:2

Mathunjwa 6166:3

6168:19 6169:6

6170:7 6171:22

6172:2,18 6173:3,7

6201:24 **Momvana** 6150:7 money 6178:11 6180:19 6186:1 6192:5 morning 6182:5 6212:14 6221:4 6228:11 6234:21 6235:1 MOTAU 6167:2 **motion** 6214:18 mountain 6139:13 6209:20 6217:17 **mountains** 6224:18 mouth 6229:16 move 6156:18 6168:24 6191:12,13 6198:19 6216:18 6225:1,17,20 6227:4,23 6228:9 6230:12 moved 6176:11 6211:4 6211:7 6214:14 6218:7 6222:23 movements 6212:16 moves 6215:17 moving 6205:12 6215:23 6216:2 6223:24 6231:2 6234:10 **Mpofu** 6146:15 6161:3 6167:16 6168:2,5,9 6170:4,12,18 6176:9 6183:20 6188:9 6196:8 6197:7,11,13 6197:16,19 6201:3,25 6205:17 6208:16 6214:8 6216:21 6217:1,4,7,15,21 6218:1,9,13 6226:15 Mpofu's 6226:23 multi 6202:9 N **N** 6203:5,7 6204:13 6205:25 6206:1 naked 6157:16

name 6181:16 6185:18 names 6186:4 narrow 6191:5 6232:8 near 6200:1,4 6206:14 6208:24 6209:5 6213:21 6222:14 **nearest** 6214:5 necessarily 6202:4 necessary 6200:10 need 6137:4 6142:25 6200:21 needed 6172:4 negotiate 6166:19,24 6167:5,24 6168:1,3,4 6168:15 neither 6216:20 net 6202:18 neutral 6217:25 never 6144:12 6145:3,6 6150:18 6152:7,8

led 6138:20 6139:17

6145:14 6148:8

manner 6152:15

MARCH 6135:1

Mariana 6164:21

marked 6205:14

maroon 6159:18

**Marikana** 6204:11

6221:19,21 6223:9,17

mark 6169:18 6224:20

6232:16

map 6224:5

6224:8

6213:3

mast 6195:24

6157:3.6 6161:16 6164:12 6165:5 6167:1 6169:9 6174:9 6177:24 6178:16,19 6181:18,19 6190:17 6214:3 6226:19,19 6234:25 **Ngalwana's** 6228:19 Nguni 6171:14 nice 6185:25 nine 6159:21 6234:21 Nkaneng 6189:20 6191:6 6195:5,11 6197:4 6198:3 6203:2 6203:10 6204:16,21 6206:13,19,20 6209:5 6209:9,17 6210:7 6211:10,11,17 6213:22 6214:25 6215:1 6219:24 6220:7 6221:10,16,18 6221:25 6222:4,7 6226:10 6231:14,16 6232:10 6233:20 **nodding** 6173:23 Noki 6185:23,23 6187:13 6219:16 Noki's 6212:3,6 nonsense 6204:3 normally 6175:4 north 6203:7 6204:13 6213:3,6 northerly 6203:4 note 6191:2 nuance 6156:11 nuances 6201:1 6202:17 NUM 6167:10 6180:9 6180:10,15 number 6155:10,23 6199:6 6203:14,15 6206:11 6228:18,23 numerous 6192:24 Nyala 6198:24 6210:4,5 6210:11,11 6222:10 6231:18 Nyalas 6193:7  $\mathbf{o}$ oath 6135:3 6163:22

## 6195:6 6213:18 object 6144:19 6145:16 6145:17 6146:16,17 6146:19.24 **objected** 6232:20 **objection** 6196:17,21 6196:23,24,25 6197:18 observation 6148:8 **observed** 6182:10 occasion 6137:17,19 6170:15 occasions 6135:7 6154:3 occurrence 6233:7 occurrences 6140:15

ARCHIVE

office 6168:3 officers 6190:5 **Oh** 6154:17 6172:12 6180:20 6226:13 okav 6139:22 6140:3 6147:15 6154:17 6163:3 6174:17 6180:23 old 6150:16 6224:6 once 6190:18 6198:10 6208:16 6215:25 6228:18 ones 6175:6 6186:10 6190:8 one's 6210:8 6215:16 6215:23 open 6198:5 opened 6180:23 6227:12 opening 6207:8,10 **opportune** 6234:6 opportunity 6150:10 6197:15 6228:9 **opposed** 6150:3 order 6223:14 orientate 6204:5 original 6171:4,22 6176:15 6202:6 **outlined** 6168:23 outside 6166:24 6167:5 6168:2,15 oval 6215:12,17,24 6216:17,17 6220:5,17 6221:6 overnight 6228:10 o'clock 6191:11,15 o'clock 6154:16

#### P

page 6141:6 6143:23 6147:16,17 6157:14 6158:9,9 6159:1,21 6160:10 6162:23 6163:1 6169:17 6174:20,21,22 6203:16 6204:6 6215:9 6217:21 6227:15 6228:3 6230:4.14 pages 6169:16 paginated 6169:15 pain 6183:15 paler 6161:7 panel 6219:3 paper 6164:7,19 parallel 6198:23 paraphrasing 6152:12 parked 6230:20 part 6141:22 6157:13 6171:24 6172:4 6174:19 6210:17 6212:21 6214:14 6219:7 6225:16 participated 6158:17 particular 6143:8,10 6143:12 6154:18

6155:3 6169:15 6202:10 particularly 6180:1 parties 6224:22 passed 6204:8 **passing** 6210:1 Pastor 6181:13 patch 6225:19 paths 6158:13 6199:7 6212:15 6228:18,23 patient 6164:15 6216:14 pay 6175:1 peanuts 6173:12 6174:6 **pedantic** 6188:10 6208:17 pen 6227:4,22 pencil 6217:2 6218:7 6227:4 6229:20 6230:12 **people** 6151:22 6152:3 6152:12 6153:19,20 6154:7 6157:22 6158:15 6166:9 6167:24 6169:1,5 6173:18,20 6182:13 6182:17,20 6183:8,16 6184:3 6185:11,11 6187:7,10,14,15,24 6188:2 6189:8,13,18 6190:2,3 6191:4,12 6198:8,10,14 6205:10 6205:10,12,14 6206:9 6207:7 6208:24 6209:25 6210:13,14 6211:20,23 6231:15 performance 6156:21 period 6145:13 6146:4 6146:18 perjury 6136:6 permission 6200:6 **permitted** 6224:20 **persevere** 6150:24 perseveres 6151:1 persist 6135:13 6137:9 6137:16 6138:5 6152:11 6157:1 6160:4 persisting 6137:14 person 6137:13 6141:25 6150:17 6152:21 6155:11.12 6164:11,11 6172:24 6174:19 6176:2,24,25 6178:10 6181:3,11,13 6182:25 6183:4 6184:5,16 6185:17 6189:1 6208:25

persuade 6165:19 phases 6157:13 photo 6155:9,15 **photograph** 6141:7,9 6141:10,11,12,13,22 6142:16,18,21 6145:11 6146:7,20 6155:12,13,23 6157:17 6158:10,11 6158:19 6159:2,22 6160:8,10 6162:20,20 6210:4 6225:5 6228:22,24 6229:13 6229:15 photographs 6157:15 phrase 6172:17 picture 6143:4 6144:1 6145:17 6146:9,21 6147:25 6199:10 6212:14 6214:12 PILLAY 6140:9 pin 6195:24 pinning 6195:25 place 6156:20 6157:25 6166:23 6174:15,16 6177:5 6178:2,12 6186:5,23 6189:24 6198:13 6203:3 6206:8 6227:10 6230:12 6234:7,12 **placed** 6156:23 places 6135:11 6137:1 6137:2 placing 6138:2,3 plan 6154:20 play 6234:18 pleading 6140:4 please 6172:23 6187:20 6195:3 6197:13 6221:13 6227:20 6233:12 point 6136:24 6138:20 6156:14,17 6161:11 6161:12 6162:18 6165:17,24 6167:9,13 6167:17 6168:6,11,18 6169:1 6170:2.13 6184:14 6191:7 6212:12 6217:2 6225:19 6226:23 6227:25 pointed 6155:12 6210:7 6219:11 **pointing** 6158:20 6160:1.11 6162:21 6203:15 6205:13 points 6167:15 6199:18 6201:4,6 6202:17 6219:11 **pole** 6199:16,17,20,22 6200:1,1,4 6208:12 6208:24 6209:1,21 6210:2,3,5,10,12,15 6210:23 6211:15 6212:15 6214:24

6216:3 6219:25

6220:2 6221:11 6222:14 6223:23.25 6229:22 6231:6.8 6233:15,15,16 police 6135:10 6136:23 6137:21 6138:1,13,21 6139:17 6140:6 6141:7 6142:17 6144:25 6147:17,20 6152:9 6156:19 6157:24 6158:16 6175:3,4 6188:1,6,22 6190:5,8,13,13,18 6191:21 6195:6 6205:4 6206:14,21 6213:21 6214:13 6219:15,24 6221:7,15 6231:7,10,13,17,23 6232:8,10,21,22,23 6233:1,9,11,13,17,18 6234:2,2 police's 6142:11 6213:20 posed 6153:1 **position** 6156:22 6158:1 6165:18 6167:4 6168:14 6185:25 6208:23 6214:24 6218:22 6219:18 possess 6145:11,13 possession 6145:20,21 6146:6,14,19 possible 6191:13 **possibly** 6210:16 6213:5 6217:25 post 6203:13,23 6205:3 6208:2.11.15.19.20 6208:22 6209:7,15 poured 6194:8 **precedent** 6202:13 **preceding** 6140:12 precise 6217:24 **precisely** 6168:25 prefers 6202:11 prepared 6166:19,24 6167:24.25 6168:15 presence 6155:3 6156:2 6156:8 6183:1 present 6138:2 6140:1 6158:18 6200:10 **presented** 6137:21 President 6180:12 presumably 6213:2 **presumed** 6215:11 pretty 6143:3 6147:16 6166:4 6209:14 **previous** 6135:7 6155:15 6201:16 6202:16 previously 6136:16 **principle** 6202:13 probably 6170:17 6213:13 6229:19 **problem** 6165:14 6167:21 6200:10,15

6218:17

6184:9

6160:9

personally 6181:1

**persons** 6157:16

person's 6175:2

perspective 6135:19

6200:25 6202:19,20
6209:22 6217:16
problems 6175:9
6201:19 6234:7
proceed 6141:5
6179:14 6187:20
6219:2 6220:20
PROCEEDINGS
6135:1
process 6216:13
<b>produce</b> 6138:13
profitably 6165:23
properly 6167:7
6215:15
proposition 6207:16
6208:17 6209:23
protestors 6214:17
protruding 6144:18
6155:19
<b>prove</b> 6137:19 6179:16
prudent 6175:12,15
pulled 6205:16 6206:5
6221:2
pulling 6198:4 6220:25
put 6142:15 6149:17
6160:9 6167:7,12,19
6170:14 6171:21
6174:25 6176:14
6188:23 6191:21 6197:22 6208:18
6216:17 6217:2,24
6224:25 6225:13,16
6227:22 6229:15,20
6232:16 6233:11
6234:12,22
puts 6215:16
putting 6152:2 6156:14
6167:4 6180:1 6188:7
6189:4 6198:5
6209:12,23 6216:7
0
quadrant 6217:13
6218:20.22

6218:20,22 quarrelled 6165:5 quarter 6154:15 **question** 6135:15 6136:10 6137:7.7 6138:12 6139:16.16 6140:18,18 6141:5 6146:2 6149:20,21 6150:10 6152:11 6153:1 6160:18,19,20 6160:22 6161:13 6162:7,16 6164:10,15 6167:6,8,14,18 6172:22 6173:14,19 6176:10 6182:8,10,12 6187:1 6188:6,6,22 6190:12 6192:4 6195:3 6196:3,5,7,9 6204:5 6206:23,25 6211:1 6227:17 6231:13 6233:13 questioner 6226:17

questioning 6226:16

questions 6135:25 6162:9 6170:7 6194:19 6195:3 6218:4 quickest 6152:17 quite 6144:16 6163:8 6168:14 6170:9 6199:6 6210:13 6226:19 6228:19,20 **quotation** 6176:15,15 quoting 6176:13

#### R

raise 6171:24 6188:18

R 6174:11

6219:2

raised 6170:5

**RDOs** 6166:19

**RDO's** 6167:5

6223:15

reach 6198:6 6209:9

reached 6198:3,7 6233:6 reaches 6215:25 **read** 6169:21,21,22 6170:1,20,20,21,22 6171:1,2,2,8,20,20 **realised** 6179:10 6190:2 6206:7 really 6146:22 6163:8 6164:16 6176:3 6179:13 reason 6140:13 6154:19 6165:7 6174:1,4 6176:20,20 6176:21 6177:1,2 6178:21 6179:22,23 6182:3,4 6184:2 6185:9 6194:7 6201:18 6206:6 6228:12 reasonable 6172:19 6175:12 6179:20 6189:1,1 6191:25 reasonably 6179:19 reasons 6166:10,14 6176:6 recall 6135:9.14 6140:14 6141:2.16 6146:18 6166:15 6167:9,12,24 6181:24 recollection 6168:20 reconsider 6135:12 6136:7 recorded 6170:16 recurring 6155:2 red 6144:5 6159:5,9,17 6160:15,20,21 6161:25 6162:2,5 6163:5 6211:20,24 6215:6,12 6216:17 6220:5,17 6221:6 6230:22 6231:2 **reducing** 6190:23 refer 6210:18 reference 6166:1

6196:11 6202:3 **referred** 6196:10 6198:20 6201:22 **referring** 6201:12,13 6205:22,25 6211:19 6215:4 6225:9,25 6228:21,22 6230:2 reformulated 6167:14 refrain 6196:19 refusal 6167:13 refuse 6195:24 refuses 6152:6,13 refusing 6152:8 6196:2 regard 6135:13 6178:22 6191:14 6210:15 regarding 6176:18 6177:15 **regards** 6135:23 **relate** 6160:19,20 relates 6160:21 6210:10 **relation** 6212:16 relevant 6145:13 6168:18 **remained** 6154:9 6175:11 remaining 6153:22 remember 6136:14,16 6136:17,20,21 6139:3 6139:13 6140:15,20 6141:3,19 6145:7,16 6145:17,24,24 6146:12,13 6153:2 6162:16 6168:8 6182:14,15 6186:16 6230:11 remind 6135:5 6136:18 **reminded** 6142:25 repeat 6161:12 6162:12 6172:8 6177:2 6190:10,11 6230:15 6234:8 repeated 6211:2 6227:18 **rephrase** 6211:3 reply 6197:17.18 reported 6168:19 **reporting** 6172:18 representatives 6168:4 represented 6179:25 request 6200:19,21 **respect** 6201:5 respond 6206:24 6233:12 **response** 6135:9 6137:21 6218:3 rest 6214:23 **resumes** 6135:2 6163:20,21 6191:16 6213:16,17 return 6181:3,9,23 returned 6181:19,19 reverting 6140:4 rewarded 6156:16

**right** 6148:9 6151:8.10 6151:13 6155:19 6164:11 6168:14 6172:2 6175:15 6179:6 6189:9,11 6190:3 6193:24 6196:12 6197:18 6201:8 6205:9,20 6211:8,10,11 6215:7 6215:9,17 6217:8,10 6217:17 6218:12,21 6219:4 6220:2 6225:2 6225:3,3,4,17,20,21 6228:7 6231:20,24 6232:11 rightfully 6151:6,8,18 6151:24 **rights** 6186:1 rightwards 6216:18 ring 6211:24 rise 6168:12 **risk** 6153:25 6179:5 **ritual** 6158:17 rituals 6156:21 6157:25 road 6192:19 6193:2 6195:10 6196:1 6198:3,6 6203:9 6204:10,22 6205:12 6205:13,15 6206:12 6206:12,16,18 6209:16,19 6215:8,20 6220:6,6,9,11,20 6221:16,18,18,21,25 6222:3,3,7,10 6223:8 6223:9,12,14,14,15 6223:17,18,19,20 6224:6,7,11 6225:8 6225:24 6226:1,5,8,8 6226:8,9,12 6229:5 6230:17 6232:1,4,8 6232:25 6233:2,16,20 6234:6,13,14 roads 6206:20 6218:8 6219:8 6220:4 6226:19 rod 6145:1 6147:1.9.19 6148:2 6155:14,14 rolled 6192:12 ruling 6202:15 run 6150:21 6190:7,14 6193:19 **running** 6179:5 6193:21 6194:2,7 6196:11 6233:5 runs 6150:22 6198:22 6199:5,8,9 6204:6,19 6210:24 6211:17 6221:10 6226:1 6227:13 6228:1 6230:3 rushing 6198:9 **R12** 6151:13 6152:11 6172:10,18,20 6173:4 **selective** 6169:12 6173:7,17,20 6174:1 send 6184:22 6174:3 6175:11 sending 6200:24

6176:7,18,19 safety 6202:18 sake 6228:7 salaries 6175:1,9 sand 6165:18 saw 6136:14 6152:9 6179:3 6181:17 6187:17 6189:19 saying 6135:13 6137:15 6138:1 6139:6,8 6140:2,13 6141:1 6143:15 6144:13 6145:15 6147:22 6151:24 6152:11,13 6153:9 6156:6 6157:6 6157:10 6158:5 6161:22 6162:11,13 6162:14 6164:18 6165:7 6175:24 6176:19,23 6179:3 6180:16 6184:18 6185:10 6186:5 6192:18 6193:24 6195:9,17 6204:15,24 6206:19 6209:11,12 6214:20 6217:15 6219:20,21 6221:5,12 6221:14 6223:5,6 6224:22 6226:4 6228:17,20 6231:7,21 6234:5,9 says 6144:25 6161:9 6172:2 6173:8,25 6174:18 6175:4,8,23 6175:25 6176:1 6197:3,5 6211:12 6214:17 6231:2,10,13 SC 6172:13 6215:2 6230:21 scene 6138:3 scheme 6188:16 school 6150:5,14,18 screen 6225:14 script 6224:21 sea 6225:10 **seated** 6137:10.13 6158:15.20 6183:16 6186:6 second 6170:7,16 6174:20 6176:21 6177:9,12,18 6180:22 6181:10 6213:9 6226:18,22 6227:9 6229:8,23 6234:16 secondly 6210:11 seeing 6184:20 6191:14 seeking 6209:16 seeks 6141:9 seen 6136:10,12 6142:1

rid 6154:6

6189:1 6218:5,16

6219:11

sense 6151:8 6182:25	6184:18 6185:13	spoke 6166:9 6171:23
6183:3,11,15,25	6191:1 6192:9,18	6180:9 6185:4,8,17
6184:16 6231:15	6193:19 6194:19	6186:5
sent 6169:4	6195:18,25 6199:3	<b>spoken</b> 6167:11
Seoka 6181:15	6202:25 6221:23	6168:19 6187:7,12
separate 6136:24	6222:1,5 6223:5	<b>spoor</b> 6227:3
<b>Service</b> 6135:10	6227:18 6232:1	<b>spot</b> 6222:7 6227:23
set 6165:18	6233:12,25	<b>sprayed</b> 6195:16
settlement 6198:3	sit 6152:14 6173:1	6197:6,23 6198:8
6206:13 6223:10	6174:15,16 6176:20	spraying 6192:20
seven 6158:9	6186:24	6194:3 6195:9 6198
shack 6203:4 6223:10	sitting 6173:18	6206:9
shacks 6223:17	situation 6177:12	<b>Springbok</b> 6188:11
shade 6143:8,10	6183:17	<b>Springboks</b> 6188:3
<b>shape</b> 6147:10 6215:12	six 6157:14	stage 6146:4,13,16
<b>sharpened</b> 6144:25 6145:1,1,4,7,8	sketch 6223:21,22 slide 6193:4 6198:20	6181:9 6188:1 6198 6206:14 6214:9
6147:19,21 6148:2,5	6199:7 6202:24	
shed 6136:5	6203:12 6204:18	6227:8,11 6231:7 stance 6167:23 6168:
shed 6130.3 shoe 6143:17,19,21	6206:11 6207:18	stance 0107.23 0108. stand 6151:5,9,10,16
shoe 0143.17,19,21 shooting 6198:15,16	6209:4,20 6210:19	6151:19,23
6206:14	6211:6 6214:1 6220:1	standard 6200:12
shop 6167:10	6220:10,14 6221:5	standard 0200:12 standing 6141:9 6142
shot 6189:13 6195:6	6222:18 6224:10,11	6152:21 6157:20
show 6137:19 6138:9	6224:14,15 6225:15	6205:16 6214:2,4,6
6156:24 6158:16	6225:21 6227:6,13	6214:10
6210:19 6224:10	6228:23	start 6155:10 6157:12
6226:14 6227:20	slightly 6154:23	6183:1,8 6191:22
6229:16,16,21,24	6199:18 6211:7	6228:11
showed 6175:6 6207:6	6225:1,17 6227:4,4	started 6154:16,23
6219:1 6233:15	6227:23 6233:16	6187:19,22 6189:16
<b>showing</b> 6157:9	slowly 6216:10,15	6190:1 6192:20
6218:16 6224:15	<b>small</b> 6203:17 6223:14	6194:2,3,7 6198:4,9
6230:16	6224:1,11 6226:8	6198:13 6206:8,15
<b>shown</b> 6218:18 6219:13	6228:10 6229:5,24	6220:25 6222:10,19
shows 6141:11 6222:19	smaller 6198:1 6205:12	6234:3,3,10
6222:21,22 6223:1,22	6221:18 6222:2	starting 6188:4
6226:22 6230:4	6223:8 6226:12	starts 6205:24 6206:1
side 6155:19 6157:16	smoke 6186:11,12	stated 6187:2
6157:20 6169:19	soil 6214:23	statement 6186:18
6171:9 6189:3 6194:5	solved 6175:9	6194:22 6195:4
6198:12 6205:10,25 6207:7 6208:13,13,25	<b>songs</b> 6198:11 <b>sorry</b> 6138:19 6139:15	6196:10 6197:3
	6155:8 6160:20	stationed 6193:8 6214:10
6210:9,12 6214:6,21 6215:4,5,9,13,15	6165:14 6170:4,4	stay 6187:6,14
6219:19 6220:3,3,5	6176:9,10 6177:8,9	stay 6187:0,14 stayed 6168:22
6227:6,14 6228:2	6183:20,22 6188:9	stayeu 6168:22 staying 6189:3
6229:14 6230:4,14	6196:8 6205:17	staying 0189.3 stewards 6167:11
6231:6 6232:25	6208:16 6211:9	stick 6137:23 6146:15
sight 6143:17 6225:11	6214:8,16 6216:11,21	6155:19
sign 6164:7,19 6204:13	6216:24 6226:15	stop 6175:8 6212:10
signing 6234:1	sort 6150:20,25 6151:4	stopped 6233:8
Similar 6170:18	6162:19 6166:1	straight 6193:8
Simple 6184:14	6174:21	6205:16,18 6209:1
simply 6151:24 6221:5	sought 6207:3,12	6217:6,6 6220:7
sing 6193:20	South 6135:10	6223:9 6231:5
singing 6193:20	speak 6151:20 6181:4	strike 6154:1 6161:21
6197:25 6198:1,11	6185:15 6200:12	strikers 6181:8
6220:24 6231:5	speaker 6180:7	strive 6188:20
6232:5	speaking 6179:19	strong 6149:9,24
	6219:7 6233:6	6201:10
sir 6137:22 6138:9	0219.7 0233.0	
sir 6137:22 6138:9 6139:11,25 6140:17	speaks 6201:3	Structure 6167:6
		Structure 6167:6 Structures 6168:7
6139:11,25 6140:17	speaks 6201:3	
6139:11,25 6140:17 6141:4 6148:14	speaks 6201:3 specifically 6153:16	Structures 6168:7
6139:11,25 6140:17 6141:4 6148:14 6163:23 6164:15	speaks 6201:3 specifically 6153:16 6185:8	Structures 6168:7 struggling 6161:4

3 subtle 6202:5 subtlety 6156:14 **subtly** 6176:12 suggesting 6144:9 6196:9 **super** 6144:10 supported 6154:1 **suppose** 6200:4 6210:8 **supposed** 6192:3 sure 6137:25 6143:16 8:9 6144:17,22 6165:19 6170:9 6201:7,23 6215:3,5,9 6216:4 **surely** 6153:7 6171:13 **surface** 6214:22 8:7 **suspect** 6225:7 sweater 6141:17,17,23 6142:3,6,6,12,20 8:8 6143:6,12 synonymous 6196:11 T 2:1 take 6138:18 6150:13 6154:12 6155:11 6157:13 6161:10,11 6165:17,24 6168:23 2 6169:12,15 6170:20 6170:22 6173:23 6182:7 6185:6 6188:5 6188:21 6191:3,8 6 6193:4 6203:11 6207:11,18 6212:25 9 6213:3,10,14 6216:9 6216:14,16 6230:1 9 6231:22 6234:6,23 6235:1 taken 6137:23 6141:7 17 6145:9 6147:25 6178:7 6179:7 6186:22 6187:3 6212:14 talk 6173:19 6174:1,7 6174:11 6176:7 6177:4 6180:24 6185:7 6191:12 6210:8 6224:1 talked 6216:7 6226:8 6229:2 5 talking 6140:23 6145:20 6149:15,15 6150:3 6164:17,17,23 6165:7 6172:7,10,17 6172:23,23 6173:4,7 6173:8,17,21 6175:3 6176:11,19,24 6181:14 6185:10 1 6211:16,17 6218:22 6219:12 6221:4 6225:7 6226:9,17,20 6227:15 6228:3,10 6229:2,7,11,22,23 6234:16,17 talks 6229:18 tea 6161:11,12,16 6163:19 6213:11,12

technician 6230:22 tedious 6218:14 tell 6135:8 6153:4,10 6162:13 6175:16 6182:21 6186:7 6193:2 6194:6 6202:20 6213:12 6214:12 6217:11 6230:5 telling 6135:6 6142:25 6173:21 6195:21 6222:17 tells 6184:1 tense 6176:13 testified 6166:3 6191:20 text 6171:5 thank 6135:4 6154:25 6155:25 6156:19 6161:17 6165:21,25 6168:9,13 6170:18,19 6171:7 6174:23 6176:17 6179:15 6182:1 6183:7 6187:21 6188:21 6197:16 6202:22 6213:19 6214:19 6219:5 Thanks 6150:19 that's 6141:14 6143:15 6145:15 6146:12 6150:8 6168:25 6181:1 6188:17 6200:23 6203:9 6206:13 6209:6 6215:6,10,24 6216:1 6216:7 6217:19,24 6218:25 6222:11 6225:23 6226:9,9,13 6226:23,24 6227:15 6228:22 6229:12 6230:4,22 6232:3 theme 6155:2 thereof 6163:9 there'll 6168:22 there's 6169:17 6186:2 they'll 6201:23 they're 6208:24 thing 6151:7,8 6153:15 6154:2 6156:24 6160:15 6164:12 6167:3 6175:12,13,14 6187:18,22 6188:4,19 6189:12,20 6191:25 6196:14 6197:25 6217:18 6218:25 6231:20 6234:9,9 **things** 6137:4 6139:5 6153:14 6160:9 6176:16 6183:18,19 6186:16 6188:17 6189:4 6194:12,20,20 6194:25 6195:22 6202:14 6216:6 6218:15 6234:24 think 6140:22 6142:25

6213:15

Page 9

6147:8,9 6155:10
6156:11,13 6161:6
6163:18 6167:14
6168:17,18 6169:12
6170:10 6176:14
6178:13,17,22 6181:1
6183:5 6185:10
6191:7 6200:9,23
6201:11,18,22 6202:5
7 7
6202:10 6210:13 6216:22 6224:24
<b>thinking</b> 6180:25 6185:11 6197:9
6234:1
thinks 6178:3
third 6169:16 6182:3
6234:17
thirds 6174:21
Thirteen 6186:3
thought 6153:18
6159:20 6178:19
6190:9,13
thousands 6185:7
three 6155:10,11
6169:16 6185:7,11
6213:14 <b>throw</b> 6154:6
thrown 6189:22
tie 6218:15
time 6137:9,24 6152:25
6154:14 6165:23
6177:12 6180:1
6181:12 6188:7,22
6189:4 6191:19
6195:18 6196:15
6198:8 6199:22,24
6200:2 6214:3,3
6221:6,15,15 6222:13
6223:24 6227:7,9
6231:18 6232:7
6233:2,9,16,20,25
6234:6,19
<b>TIP</b> 6230:21
tired 6173:11 6174:5
today 6164:8 6194:20
<b>Tokota</b> 6200:13,14
6201:4
<b>TOKOTO</b> 6155:8,18
6155:22
told 6153:5 6173:4,21
6178:4,8,22 6184:22
6193:19 6194:17
6232:3
tomorrow 6228:11
6234:21 6235:1
tones 6163:12,16
top 6141:8,11,16
6143:1,3,5 6155:12
6158:10 6161:1
6163:4 6204:8
6205:10 6225:4,4,21
tough 6150:21,23,23,24
towel 6162:3
towers 6186:13
towing 6220:25
track 6157:20
A D C H I V E E C

train 6226:16 transcript 6170:14 transcription 6169:14 **translation** 6161:13,14 6161:15 6171:3,5,8 6171:21 travels 6222:3 traversed 6225:18 treat 6214:4 tried 6168:19 6207:7 6217:24 trigger 6194:23 6195:4 triggered 6197:4 true 6135:18 6138:25 6138:25 6139:19,21 6179:4 6189:14 6194:19,24 6197:7,9 6208:1 6209:12 6221:13 6223:4 6234:5 **truth** 6135:6,23 6142:24 6143:1 6195:9 6219:21 **try** 6171:18 6204:4 6217:19 6227:19 trying 6156:15 6162:3 6168:24 6170:2 6185:14 6208:4,10 6216:21 6229:1 6230:24 6231:19 turn 6143:23 6158:8,25 6159:21 6160:9 6195:10 6202:23 turned 6176:3 6192:20 6192:21,22 6194:3 6205:15 6206:12,15 6213:4 6234:13 turning 6206:4 twice 6228:18 two 6137:2,10,17 6138:2,4,5,12,14,22 6138:23 6139:7,9,18 6139:24 6144:4 6158:12 6162:22 6164:20 6166:23,24 6167:10 6169:5 6170:5.7 6174:21 6176:5 6185:11 6191:11,15 6193:1 6198:14,23 6199:4 6204:19 6206:20 6211:5,18 6214:6 6219:8 6220:4 6224:18 6225:6,22 type 6151:2 **T-shirt** 6159:7 6160:16 6161:2 U

U 6141:22 6144:5 understand 6137:25 6146:11 6156:14 6170:1,23 6171:13,13 6171:17,24 6172:1,4 6172:13 6186:25 6187:11 6198:18

6200:7.10.11 6201:9 6201:20 6205:8 6218:6 6225:21 6226:6 6228:16,17 6230:1,6 6231:20 6233:24 understanding 6215:15 understood 6189:15,25 6225:23 unfair 6224:9 unfortunately 6163:25 **Union** 6179:24 6180:8 unions 6177:24 6179:1 6180:6 unprotected 6154:1 unreasonable 6171:6 6173:5 unrolled 6189:17 6190:1 untrammelled 6143:24 **untruthful** 6179:25 **un-obscured** 6143:25 **upper** 6208:13 6220:3 **upwards** 6217:6 use 6154:24 6204:2 6206:20 6222:10 6233:20 utter 6164:24 **uttered** 6164:12 6179:12 **UZ** 6142:3,21 **UZZI** 6141:17 6142:7 6142:20 6143:2 U-Z-Z-I 6141:18

V vans 6189:23 various 6167:11 veers 6216:1 vehicle 6208:25 veld 6206:17 version 6137:9 6141:10 6153:7,12,12 6171:9 6194:14 6195:12,19 6196:7,7 6197:10,21 6232:12 vicinity 6199:21 6204:25 6210:23 6211:15 video 6136:11,12,15 view 6143:25 6152:22 6152:24 6153:2,6 6164:16 6165:20 views 6200:14 visible 6199:7

W wage 6166:23 wait 6173:11 6174:2 6176:21 6186:10 waiting 6166:15 6226:14 walk 6151:25 6190:20

vision 6143:24

6181:10

visit 6170:8 6180:22

6193:19 walking 6191:4 6198:1 6220:12,25,25 6221:16 want 6135:12 6136:6 6139:12 6140:24 6151:15,21 6152:3,4 6154:12,19 6164:15 6164:16 6165:17 6173:15 6175:8,9 6177:7 6184:3,19 6185:25 6186:1 6188:10 6189:19 6196:6 6200:24 6202:2 6208:17 6212:12 6221:22 6222:4 6224:9 6228:17 6229:15,24 6230:15 wanted 6177:24 6179:2 6180:17 6184:4,20 6208:25 6233:19,24 wants 6151:5 6178:10 war 6164:4,5 6165:3 warned 6192:7 warning 6174:18 6175:10 6179:17 6182:4 wasn't 6166:24 6170:16 6212:19 6221:7 6233:17 wasn't 6174:11 wasting 6196:15 water 6192:20 6194:3,8 6195:7,10,16 6196:11 6197:6,22 6198:8,10 6206:9 way 6142:15 6147:7 6149:12,18 6151:23 6152:1,17 6165:22 6171:19 6172:17 6174:21 6175:6,7 6176:4 6177:23 6179:10 6180:24 6190:19 6192:19,21 6207:5 6209:1 6217:20 6218:3 6224:20 6227:6 6228:1 6230:14 6234:24 wavs 6199:18 weak 6149:9,11,12,24 6149:25 weapon 6137:23 6147:6,8,10,13 6148:11,21 weapons 6137:3,10,17 6138:2,4,5,12,15,22 6138:23 6139:7,8,9 6139:18,24 6182:9,11 wearing 6141:17,20

6142:6,10,12,20

6161:24

welcome 6182:13

went 6153:25 6166:4

6143:2,6,18 6157:23

6181:17,20 6190:18 6198:13 6205:2 6209:1 6213:1,3,5 6223:24 6233:15 weren't 6181:2,8 westerly 6200:5 6213:2 6213:4 westwards 6206:10 we'll 6219:4 6226:19 6228:11 we're 6212:8 6229:1 6234:25 we've 6188:14 6191:11 6219:1 6228:17 we'll 6161:15,16 we've 6163:18 what's 6216:22 whilst 6193:20 6198:1 6205:11 6232:23 white 6178:25 6205:23 6206:1 6218:12,21 wider 6232:9,14 width 6210:10 widths 6210:3,12 win 6175:6 wire 6187:17 6188:8,23 6189:16 6190:1 6191:21 6192:11 6193:11 6194:23 6195:5,14 6197:5,22 6198:4,24 6199:23 6200:2,3 6205:11 6206:5 6221:1,2 6227:9,11,11,24,25 6230:13 6232:11,13 6232:14,21,23,24 6233:2,12,14,25 6234:3,4,11 wiser 6135:18,22 witness 6161:15 6162:15 6166:2 6167:20 6168:10 6170:6 6177:21 6183:20 6190:12 6197:2,11 6201:20 6202:3,7,10,20 6208:18 6210:17 6218:5,16,19,24 6224:20 6225:23 6226:18,25 6228:8 6229:16 6230:4,7,25 6234:16 witnesses 6202:13 woman 6150:3 wonder 6156:15 won't 6186:11 word 6183:5 6188:11 6204:3 6216:4 6217:23 6218:24 words 6135:22 6138:2 6164:12,24 6169:16 6172:10 6173:22

6176:15 6179:12

6181:9 6193:13

6195:23 6203:6

6214:10 6229:15

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 10

			Page 1
6230:19	<b>Z</b> 6141:22,25 6144:5		
work 6152:15 6153:20		2	
	<b>Zulu</b> 6171:14,16,22,24	<b>2.00</b> 6191:10	
6173:1 6174:15		<b>200</b> 6212:25 6213:7	
6175:25 6180:17	0	6224:15 6226:22	
6184:24 6212:15	<b>000</b> 6152:11 6172:3	6227:13 6228:23	
worker 6185:18	6174:11	6230:9 6231:15	
workers 6152:8	<b>0009</b> 6169:13	<b>201</b> 6204:20	
6172:24 6173:21	<b>009</b> 6169:13,13		
6174:2 6175:16	<b>04</b> 6135:1	<b>2012</b> 6135:12,15 6136:8	
	<b>04</b> 0133.1	6137:11 6155:5	
6176:22 6177:24	1	6188:23 6191:19	
6178:7 6185:1,5		<b>2013</b> 6135:1	
6192:4 6212:5,10	<b>1.30</b> 6191:9	<b>209</b> 6202:24,24 6204:6	
6220:24 6232:4	<b>10</b> 6154:16,24 6160:10	<b>25</b> 6158:9	
6234:1	6162:23 6163:1	20 01000	
working 6173:11	<b>10:09</b> 6135:2	3	
6174:5,6 6177:6	<b>10:29</b> 6141:14		
world 6164:7,20	<b>10:49</b> 6149:6	<b>330</b> 6199:9 6205:14,24	
6175:18			
	<b>10:56</b> 6212:14 6218:8	5	
wouldn't 6209:8	6218:12	<b>500</b> 6151:13,17,23	
wouldn't 6158:7	<b>100</b> 6203:20	6172:11,18,20 6173:4	
written 6141:17 6142:7	<b>1056</b> 6217:9,14 6218:21	6173:7,18,20 6174:1	
6169:17,18,25	6221:3,4	6174:3 6175:11	
6203:15	<b>11</b> 6154:15		
wrong 6156:1	<b>11:09</b> 6156:24	6176:7,18,19	
wrongly 6167:9			
wiongry 0107.9	<b>11:53</b> 6163:21	8	
X	<b>12</b> 6151:17,23 6172:3	<b>80</b> 6199:9,17 6203:15	
	6174:11	6203:17 6205:8	
<b>X</b> 6214:5,7,15,21	<b>12:13</b> 6172:14		
6215:5,7	<b>12:33</b> 6179:5	9	
<b>Xhosa</b> 6150:4 6171:9	<b>12:53</b> 6187:9	9th 6146:5,13,18	
6171:14,22 6200:13	<b>14th</b> 6155:5,9 6156:3,8		
6200:14,16,17	6156:20 6157:2	<b>9:30</b> 6235:1	
6201:10,10 6202:7	<b>14:09</b> 6191:17		
6233:22	<b>14:30</b> 6200:9		
	<b>14:50</b> 6209:11		
Y	<b>15th</b> 6135:8,10,11,14		
year 6145:13 6166:23	6135:17,24 6136:3,5		
6166:24 6167:10	6136:8,11,13,16,21		
yellow 6141:8 6158:19	6137:1,2,9 6138:3,13		
6159:16,22 6160:1,5	6138:15,22 6139:23		
6160:14 6163:14,16	6139:24 6141:2,7		
6199:18 6203:14,16	6142:12 6146:5,13,18		
6203:17 6205:9	6147:18,23 6148:1,1		
6212:25 6213:7	6155:4 6156:3,9		
6222:25 6229:10,12	<b>15:28</b> 6213:17		
yellowish 6159:14,15	<b>15:40</b> 6212:17		
6163:11	<b>15:48</b> 6223:22		
young 6150:12,17,20	<b>16th</b> 6137:11 6138:4,23		
6151:1,3,5	6139:3,4,8,10,13,19		
you'll 6203:20 6210:6	6140:12,15,16,21		
6210:14,20 6225:5,17	6141:3,3,20 6142:6,9		
6228:1,23 6229:10,13	6143:2 6145:8,20,25		
6230:13	6146:3 6155:4,9		
<b>you're</b> 6168:18	6169:7 6188:7,23		
6179:20 6200:16	6191:19		
6204:15,24,24	<b>16:08</b> 6233:11		
6207:15 6209:23	<b>160</b> 6210:20 6211:6		
6211:19 6213:18	6214:1		
6218:2,16 6219:21	<b>191</b> 6203:12 6204:18,24		
6225:7 6226:9 6228:3	6206:11 6207:25		
6228:17,20,20,21	6209:4,20 6210:6		
6229:2 6230:23	<b>194</b> 62 <b>29</b> :9		
6233:5	<b>197</b> 6222:18,21 6224:10		
you've 6144:20 6210:6	<b>198</b> 6207:18,20 6209:24		
you ve 0144.20 0210.0			
Z	6210:14 6212:19		
	6214:17		
ARCHIVE FO	R JUSTICE	l	