

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 6 30 OCTOBER 2012 PAGES 490 TO 677

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

Page 490

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 30 OCTOBER 2012]
 2 [09:05] CHAIRPERSON: Good morning, the
 3 Commission resumes. I understand from Mr Madlanga that he
 4 has received information from the Legal Aid Board regarding
 5 the decision which they were to make yesterday afternoon.
 6 Mr Madlanga, can you tell us about it please?
 7 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chairman,
 8 commissioners. It's an e-mail sent at 5:26 pm by the chief
 9 executive officer of Legal Aid South Africa and it reads as
 10 follows, "Further to your telephone discussion with the
 11 Chairperson of our board, Judge President Mlambo, and the
 12 e-mail addressed to him dated 28 October 2012 on the matter
 13 of Legal Aid South Africa providing funding for legal
 14 representation for the arrested and injured miners
 15 represented by the legal team Maluleke Msimang Attorneys, I
 16 wish to advise that the matter was once again discussed by
 17 the board executive committee and management this morning.
 18 Having considered the arguments advanced by the
 19 Commission's evidence leading team, the board executive
 20 committee agrees that the arguments advanced did not
 21 persuade it to change its decision in this matter. We
 22 therefore confirm our earlier decision that, for the
 23 reasons presented in our e-mail to Adv Budlender, we have
 24 decided that we will not fund the arrested and injured
 25 miners, represented by Messrs Maluleke Msimang Attorneys."

Page 491

1 Thank you, Chairperson.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: Do any of the
 3 representatives of any of the parties wish to say anything
 4 at this stage?
 5 MR MPOFU: No, no, Mr Chair.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I understand we
 7 also have a new party here this morning who wishes to put
 8 themselves on record, is that correct?
 9 ADV MASEBE: Yes, it's Adv Takarane
 10 Maseba from the Pretoria Bar. I represent the families of
 11 Warrant Officer Lepaaku and Warrant Officer Monene.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: And you're applying to be
 13 allowed to participate in the proceedings, I take it?
 14 ADV MASEBE: That is correct.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: The request is granted.
 16 The proceedings up to now have been transcribed and I take
 17 it that if you request copies of the transcripts, they will
 18 be made available to you. Colonel Botha, u is nog onder u
 19 eed wat u afgelê het om die waarheid te vertel.
 20 MR CHASKALSON SC: Mr Chairperson, I'm
 21 sorry to interject but might I put two further matters on
 22 record before we get into the evidence of Colonel Botha?
 23 CHAIRPERSON: I don't know what the
 24 matters are. If you tell me that they are, I can consider
 25 your request.

Page 492

1 MR CHASKALSON SC: They're matters
 2 flowing from the pre-hearing conference of the 24th of
 3 October. The first relates to the status of documents
 4 exchanged in the discovery processes of the Commission and
 5 the second relates to the definition of issues for the
 6 first phase of the hearings.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: They both sound very
 8 important matters, please tell us about them.
 9 MR CHASKALSON SC: In relation to the
 10 first matter it was placed on record at the pre-hearing of
 11 the 24th that a document that had been discovered by Lonmin
 12 in the processes of the Commission had been leaked to the
 13 press before it had been tabled in the Commission hearing.
 14 Now, Mr Chairperson, I would like to read the provisions of
 15 regulation 4 of the regulations published on 28 September
 16 2012. It states that, "No person shall, without the
 17 written permission of the Chairperson, (a) disseminate any
 18 document submitted to the Commission by any person in
 19 connection with the inquiry or publish the contents or any
 20 portion of the contents of such document." And regulation
 21 17(1)(b) makes a contravention of regulation 14 a criminal
 22 offence.
 23 At the pre-hearing of 24 October we confirmed
 24 that until a discovered document has been tabled in open
 25 hearings of the Commission, there is no permission for it

Page 493

1 to be disclosed to any third parties or for it to be
 2 published further. No opposition was expressed to this
 3 principle at the pre-hearing meeting and we trust that this
 4 problem will not arise again.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Chaskalson,
 6 and what is the second matter that you wish to raise?
 7 MR CHASKALSON SC: The second matter
 8 concerns the definition of issues in relation to phase 1 of
 9 these hearings. A concern was expressed or two concerns
 10 were expressed at the pre-hearing meeting. The first was
 11 that there had been insufficient precision in the
 12 definition of issues for the first phase of the hearing,
 13 theme 1 that we've come to know, to be described as. The
 14 second was, some parties expressed opposition to the
 15 principle that the Commission might make findings at the
 16 end of theme 1 in advance of further hearings of the
 17 Commission.
 18 The evidence leaders have in the meantime
 19 circulated a document which defines with more precision the
 20 issues which they see as being the issues to be the subject
 21 matter of theme 1 and the first phase of the hearings. The
 22 parties only received that document yesterday. Our
 23 submission is that the parties should be given time to
 24 consider that document and that it may be convenient, as
 25 the first item of business on, when we reconvene on Monday,

Page 494

1 to finalise this issue.

2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Chaskalson,

3 that seems to be a satisfactory suggestion, a satisfactory

4 way of approaching the matter which you have suggested. So

5 we'll do that, the first item of business on Monday, the

6 Commission has been made – as we indicated previously,

7 we're sitting today and tomorrow, we can't sit on Thursday

8 and Friday so we're resuming again on Monday and then as

9 you've said, the first item of business on Monday will be

10 the topic that you've just raised.

11 Is there any other preliminary matter which

12 anyone wishes to raise before we continue with the evidence

13 of Lieutenant-Colonel Botha? No. I've already reminded

14 him that he's under oath. You were cross-examining him, Mr

15 Ntsebeza. Would you – I take it you wish to proceed?

16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, I wish

17 to proceed. I won't be long and against the backdrop of

18 all the sad news that we heard in the preliminary stages,

19 if you will allow me just to lighten the atmosphere by

20 saying something which I've been told is a true story

21 relevant to Colonel Botha and that is that, spotting some

22 anxiety on the face of one of her many husbands, I'm told

23 Elizabeth Taylor told him that please don't worry, I don't

24 intend to keep you for long. So let's carry on, I don't

25 intend to keep you for long.

Page 495

1 CORNELIUS JACOBUS BOTHA: s.u.o.

2 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTINUED):

3 Last – when we left off yesterday it appeared to me you

4 were explaining something about the footage in the video

5 that you took when I pointed out to you that in one of your

6 statements you had recorded that you made a recording of

7 the scene at 15:49. If you could repeat what you said

8 again because I just want to take off from there?

9 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I said that I

10 realised when I looked at my digital camera, that the video

11 camera is about eight minutes behind and there was a

12 specific reason why I did that. I asked myself, but why

13 was I late? If my video camera says 15:49, I mean I don't

14 know when the shooting happened but I should've been, on my

15 video, more correct than on my camera and then I realised

16 but the video camera is eight minutes behind, the time on

17 the video camera.

18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. So the – what

19 did you say about the digital camera? Just –

20 LT-COL BOTHA: The video camera time is

21 eight minutes behind my digital camera and my digital

22 camera's time was the same as on my arm, so I took that as

23 correct and – because I can see what time I took, the first

24 digital photo was taken.

25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. Okay, now I'll

Page 496

1 come to this at a later stage but let me just recap on the

2 events of that day on the 16th of August 2012 when you came

3 to do this operation. You told the Commission that you

4 arrived at 15:00 at the joint operations centre, is that

5 right?

6 LT-COL BOTHA: I said I can confirm it, I

7 wasn't sure, more or less 15:00. I did say that I can

8 confirm it.

9 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, can I ask a

10 question just to -

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON: - lay the foundation for

13 something possibly. There was reference made to your

14 diary, I think, and there's also some other document that

15 you said you could bring, if my memory is correct, that you

16 could bring if you were asked to bring it and I said if you

17 – you'd better bring it. Have you brought the documents,

18 the document and the diary with you today?

19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did make copies of

20 the page of the 16th of my diary which has got the times. I

21 do have it with me.

22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, I'll come to that

23 also, Mr Chairman, with your permission.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Permission granted.

25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Chairman.

Page 497

1 Just to say, relevant thereto Lieutenant, it would assist

2 if you also brought the original, the diary and then the

3 copies.

4 LT-COL BOTHA: I do have it with me.

5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now is it correct

6 – or let me just ask you, are your SAPS helicopters fitted

7 with cameras?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: I know there are police

9 helicopters fitted with cameras, I do not know if that

10 specific ones on that day were fitted with cameras.

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. So you were not

12 using a camera affixed to the helicopter in your video

13 covering of the events on the day?

14 LT-COL BOTHA: I used the hand held

15 camera.

16 CHAIRPERSON: That's not a precise answer

17 to the question. We know you used your hand held camera.

18 Counsel established that certainly some, if not all, police

19 helicopters have cameras which are fitted to the helicopter

20 and so the thrust of the question is, was there a fitted

21 camera in that helicopter?

22 LT-COL BOTHA: I don't know, Mr Chair.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Can I just ask a further

25 question? As an expert, would you not have or was it not

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 498</p> <p>1 expected of you to check whether the chopper you were going 2 to go up into the sky and do the video covering, had or did 3 not have an affixed camera? 4 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Let me ask another 6 question. In your experience have you ever had to go on a 7 crime scene in a chopper in which you also had to use the 8 camera affixed to the chopper? 9 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir, not in my 10 experience. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would that be because 12 there is a specific skill that is required for one to be 13 able to do so? 14 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm not sure. I presume 15 someone must be trained to use it. 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So are you then saying 17 your own training has not extended that far? 18 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir. That's what I'm 19 saying, sorry, yes. 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. Now when you say 21 you arrived at more or less 3 o'clock, would it be safe to 22 say you arrived from Phokeng where you are based? 23 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir, I did not arrive 24 from Phokeng. I arrived from the scene of the 13th. 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Are you saying that on</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 500</p> <p>1 LT-COL BOTHA: She. 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: She -she is, she is, I'm 3 sorry, I'm sorry. She is the provincial commissioner. 4 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir. 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you know Major- 6 General Annandale? 7 LT-COL BOTHA: I do know him, sir. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: What is he? 9 LT-COL BOTHA: I know he is a general in 10 the police. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: He is from head office, 12 is he not? 13 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm not sure. I know he's 14 from Pretoria. 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Were you aware 16 that he was around on that day? 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir. 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: In document A197/3 he's 19 given as a Major-General Annandale, specialised high risk 20 force commander. Do you know him as that? 21 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I just get to know 22 him as General Annandale. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. Now, there is a 24 record of a special JOC COM meeting on that day at 13:30. 25 Now I know that you are not listed as one of the attendees,</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 499</p> <p>1 the 16th you went to the scene of the 13th? 2 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir. 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So you – was it the 4 second time that you were visiting that scene? 5 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir. 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So would it be fair then 7 to say you were in the vicinity of the scene, Marikana, 8 that area, the joint operations and all of those areas or 9 the scene in the area, the Lonmin mines, the joint 10 operations centre, they are more or less in the same area? 11 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir. 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And can I assume that 13 because you were in the area on that day you would've been 14 aware that there were meetings of the top brass of the SAPS 15 that were going on, planning sessions, or am I assuming too 16 much? 17 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I wasn't – ja, 18 you're assuming too much, sir. 19 [09:25] MR NTSEBEZA SC: I think I'm making too 20 much of your expertise, Mr – Colonel Botha, but on that day 21 you were – let me ask the question, do you know Lieutenant- 22 General Mbombo? 23 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir. 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: He is the provincial 25 commissioner in this area, isn't it?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 501</p> <p>1 which is why I asked the question whether you were aware 2 that there were goings on, on that day, but one of the 3 things that was decided there, according to this minute 4 A197/2, was that there should be enough video operators to 5 capture sequence of events as unfolds. Are you aware of 6 that? 7 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir. 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The question was enough 9 video operators, not helicopters. 10 MR MUSHWANA: Oh, I'm sorry. 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And talking about your 12 mistake about your camera, Major-General Annandale also 13 went through, according to the minute, a check list to 14 ensure that everything was in place and the first thing 15 was, you must ensure adequate batteries for radios and 16 video cameras. Did you set your own radio and video 17 cameras for – 18 LT-COL BOTHA: My own video camera 19 battery was charged, so I did check it. 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay – digital camera? 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Both cameras had charged 22 batteries. 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. Now on the day 24 when you were asked by Brigadier Van Zyl, had there been 25 any formal gathering of video operators who were addressed</p>

Page 502

1 by Brigadier Van Zyl or did he just call you aside?
 2 LT-COL BOTHA: When I arrived I had a
 3 conversation with him alone.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. Now from your
 5 evidence so far it doesn't appear as though there was much
 6 conversation between the two of you, but let me explore
 7 that. Did he tell you about this meeting that had been
 8 held at 13:30 at which, amongst other things, the purpose
 9 of the meeting was described as dealing with the protestors
 10 on the koppie, what you referred to in your evidence as the
 11 disarming and the dispersal thereof.
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, he did not discuss
 13 the meeting with me. He gave me my tasking, that I must
 14 the video and the disarming of the people.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Did you ask which
 16 people?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: He did explain to me that,
 18 the people that's at the koppie.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So in the short
 20 conversation you had, he contextualised what you were going
 21 to do. It is people in the koppie, they're going to have
 22 to be disarmed, they're going to have to be dispersed and
 23 your task was to video that operation as it unfolded.
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, sir.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. I'm asking you

Page 503

1 because according to this minute of the 16th of August of
 2 the meeting that I said took place at 13:30, Brigadier Van
 3 Zyl was there and one of the closing remarks, as they are
 4 labelled in this minute, is that Major-General Annandale
 5 wanted the operation to commence at 15:30. The minute
 6 reads, "Major-General Annandale instructed Brigadier
 7 Pretorius and Lieutenant-Colonel Scott to report back at
 8 the JOC at 15:15 as he wants the operation to commence at
 9 15:30." Now, I'm again trying to see in what way you would
 10 have left closer to four when Brigadier Van Zyl knew that
 11 the Major-General, specialised high risk force commander,
 12 had indicated that the operation should commence at 15:30.
 13 Do you probably have an explanation?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now let's just get a
 16 picture of moments just before you took off. These
 17 choppers that you say in total were about four, were they
 18 all on the ground when you took off or some of them or all
 19 of them were already in the air, other than the one you
 20 were going to take off in?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: All of them were already
 22 in the air except the one that we were taking off in.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And in your chopper, who
 24 were the crew? In other words, other than yourself, who
 25 else was in the chopper?

Page 504

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, it's the pilot and
 2 then I don't think it's a co-pilot but a crew to the pilot
 3 –
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, let's take it
 5 step by step. It's a pilot, does he have a name, if you
 6 remember?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: I know his rank is captain
 8 and I know him, his name is André. I think it's – no, I'm
 9 not going to take a guess on his surname, André.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay, fair enough.
 11 Captain André. You don't know if there was a co-pilot?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I don't think it's a
 13 co-pilot. I think the person that sits next to him is the
 14 crew to the pilot.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The crew to the pilot.
 16 Do you know his name?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Warrant Officer, I think
 18 it's Venter.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Venter.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: That was the person to whom
 21 you handed your digital camera, as far as I can recall?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, sir. I
 23 think she's a sergeant, I've just promoted her. I think
 24 she's a sergeant.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, I'll come to what

Page 505

1 the Chairman has said but maybe let me get there. You do
 2 say in your statement, the one statement that you gave,
 3 that – I'll come to that at an appropriate time. So it's
 4 Captain André, if that is who he is, and then there is
 5 Sergeant Venter or Warrant Officer Venter, then there is
 6 General, Brigadier Fritz and who else?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, next to Brigadier
 8 Fritz there was a gentleman in private clothing, which also
 9 had a camera and – which I saw had a camera with him.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You wouldn't know his
 11 name?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: I do not know his name,
 13 sir.
 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you know why he was
 15 in that chopper and having a camera?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did not. I didn't
 17 ask. I presume if he's got a camera with him, he must take
 18 photos.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. I suppose
 20 because the Brigadier, being of a higher rank and allowing
 21 him to be on the aircraft, you didn't want to ask where is
 22 this guy going to.
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: I did not ask, sir.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: Do you know if this person
 25 was a member of the SAPS or was he a civilian?

Page 506

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I – no, I don't know.
 2 I presumed he was a policeman because he was with us in a
 3 police chopper but I cannot confirm that.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Could he have been a
 5 civilian?
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot confirm that,
 7 sir.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: I take it if you can't
 9 confirm it, the answer is he could've been a civilian?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: He was in private
 11 clothing, it's possible.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You see, Colonel Botha,
 13 I ask these questions because you will recall that at the
 14 beginning of my enquiry I asked if you had made a report,
 15 other than just downloading what you had recorded - in
 16 other words, a detailed report that tells us or tells
 17 anyone what exactly you did on that day. Don't you think
 18 we would have benefited if you'd done so?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, it's not part of my
 20 duties. I've never done it before, so I haven't done it.
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I find that
 22 difficult to accept –
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, you know it's
 24 not proper for a cross-examiner to make comments like that.
 25 If we find it difficult to accept it at the end of the day,

Page 507

1 well and good, but it's not for you to say what you find
 2 difficult or easy to accept. I think you must confine
 3 yourself to asking questions.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
 5 Mr – Colonel Botha, forgive me for that comment. We have a
 6 document bundle from the SAPS, it's document bundle 1 and
 7 it purports to be addressing itself to Public Order Police.
 8 It seems to me to be a standing order and I'd like to draw
 9 your attention to pages 687 and 688 thereof and I will
 10 invite your commentary relevant thereto. There is there,
 11 in paragraph 16, record-keeping, under the title "Record-
 12 keeping and reporting," this order says, "For the purposes
 13 of the proper keeping of records and accurate reporting, a
 14 video register must be drawn up. The following heads must
 15 be set out in columns." And then it says, "Column A1
 16 serial number beginning with 1 every year. Column B, date
 17 of recording, time of recording, duration of recording.
 18 Column C, title of and place at which recording was made.
 19 Column D, video camera operator. Comments. Column E,
 20 annual serial number of tape, format of tape. Column F,
 21 CAS number if applicable." Are you aware of this order?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Mr Chair.
 23 [09:45] MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now 16.3 goes on to say,
 24 "and the recordings of actions and incidents which are
 25 related through POP actions may be used as evidence at a

Page 508

1 later stage. The following information must be recorded on
 2 the soundtrack before the actual recording begins. Bullet
 3 1, day, date, time and place of the recording. Bullet 2,
 4 the number, rank and name in full of the camera's operator
 5 and of the commentator. Bullet 3, the name of the POP unit
 6 to which the camera operator is attached. Bullet 4, what
 7 the recording is about, for example, a meeting, gathering
 8 or funeral. Bullet 5, how the recording is to be made, for
 9 example, from a selected vantage point, from a moving Nyala
 10 vehicle, or while moving on feet. Bullet 6, the length of
 11 the tape being used. Bullet 7, if there is a break in the
 12 recording, the reason for the break must be stated clearly,
 13 for example, shielding from those throwing stones or a
 14 fault in the camera, or tapes are being changed, or it is
 15 the end of the first recording, or it is the beginning of
 16 the second recording, etcetera. Next bullet, comments can
 17 also be made regarding the weather conditions, for example,
 18 that it is raining, overcast. The last bullet, remember
 19 that the prime test for the evidence from the digital
 20 recording on the memory card to be admissible is that of
 21 relevance, that is the digital recording must be relevant
 22 to the case brought before the court." Are you aware of
 23 it?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Mr Chair.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There doesn't seem to

Page 509

1 be, unless I've missed something in the evidence that you
 2 have given so far, you don't seem to have complied with,
 3 for instance, recording on the soundtrack before the actual
 4 recording begins, the day, the date, the time and the place
 5 of the recording.
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I normally would
 7 do it, a normal still crime scene, I do it. What happened
 8 is, when I switched on – when we came over and I could see
 9 that there is – and I could see the policemen, I switched
 10 on the camera, and I immediately started taping. So yes, I
 11 omitted that, but that was in the spur of the moment that I
 12 switched the – you'll see that I switched the camera on,
 13 it's white, then I realised that the lens cap is not open,
 14 and I opened the lens cap.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Are you saying there was
 16 something happening on the ground, the urgency of which
 17 necessitated you to just switch on your camera and start to
 18 shoot?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, when I said, when I
 20 saw the people – what I said is, when I saw the people on
 21 the ground, I switched on my camera, and I started taping.
 22 I could – I mean, you can see on the tape that police
 23 vehicles are moving around, and I switched on the camera,
 24 and I immediately started taping.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Forgive me, Colonel, I

Page 510

1 do admit that there were people. There doesn't seem to
2 have been much or many people, for most of the time that
3 you had the camera on. One would have been forgiven to
4 think that it's a National Geographic video of the
5 landscape. Which people are these that – and what were
6 they doing, the nature of which caused you to want to
7 photograph them with such urgency that you didn't comply
8 with a standing order of the nature that I've read to you?

9 LT-COL BOTHA: I saw police vehicles
10 moving, and for that reason, I started videoing
11 immediately. I did not see what was happening
12 specifically.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. I thought I
14 heard you say you saw the people, but you seem to clarify
15 that now by saying that you saw police vehicles, are those
16 the people that you saw and you realised that you need to
17 act with urgency?

18 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, when I saw the police
19 vehicles moving, I switched my camera on, and starting
20 recording.

21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I don't want to be
22 appearing to badger you, is that who you meant when you
23 said you saw the people, and then you determined that it
24 was urgent for you to switch on your camera? Were you
25 referring to the police vehicles?

Page 511

1 LT-COL BOTHA: I was referring to police
2 vehicles, I wasn't necessarily so urgent. I saw police
3 vehicles moving, and I immediately switched my camera on
4 and I started recording.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Counsel is interested in a
6 slightly different point. Previously you said that you saw
7 the people on the ground, as I understand it. When you saw
8 the people on the ground, you started taping. You then
9 later said you saw police vehicles moving. What counsel
10 wants to know is, when you – the earlier reference to
11 people, was that really a reference to the police vehicles?
12 I think that's the question, Mr Ntsebeza, is that correct?

13 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Mr Chair.

14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

15 CHAIRPERSON: If that's the question,
16 what's the answer.

17 LT-COL BOTHA: I said, that is correct,
18 Mr Chair.

19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
20 You see, my impression of the video shown yesterday, was
21 that – maybe let me precede that by another question. You
22 do confirm that your camera had a zooming facility by which
23 I understand that it -

24 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Mr Chair.

25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, you'll correct me

Page 512

1 if I am wrong, my impression of the taking of the video,
2 which is ascribed to you, was that there were fleeting
3 moments of capturing what one would have thought are the
4 subject matter of your operation, the Nyalas, the police
5 vehicles, the people. At one stage, I was struggling to
6 know whether those were police people or were police
7 running. There didn't seem to be an attempt by you to zoom
8 and focus on them for a clearer view. Did I get the wrong
9 impression of the video?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did zoom it at some
11 stages, but I mean, because I did not know what was
12 happening on the ground, I videographed what I saw from the
13 side which I was on the chopper with.

14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Were you at liberty to
15 ask the pilot or even Brigadier Fritz to say, please,
16 please, I would like to zoom with my camera on that
17 occurrence down there?

18 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did not know what
19 was happening on the ground, so I videoed, you will see in
20 the video there was a lot of people that's in the veld that
21 I also videoed. According to me, that was part of the
22 dispersal, that's why I videoed it.

23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I do not think that you
24 are answering my question.

25 LT-COL BOTHA: I am not finished answer.

Page 513

1 I am sure that I was at liberty to ask him, yes.

2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. And Brigadier Van
3 Zyl had given you a specific task to go and video record
4 the operation.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Mr Chair.

6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And you obviously had an
7 obligation to capture as much of the operation as
8 opportunity presented itself for you to do so. Is that
9 correct?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct.

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You would have been at
12 liberty to direct the pilot to go to those areas which you
13 saw people running, police vehicles, so that you can at
14 least have content to a subject matter, or your instruction
15 from Brig Van Zyl.

16 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct.

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You did not consider
18 that Brig Fritz would not respond favourable to your
19 request that the particular area must receive your focal
20 point of attention.

21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, according to me, I
22 was recording what I was supposed to do, and I presume
23 according to Brigadier Fritz also. I can't answer for him.

24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well, I would like you
25 to answer for yourself, and why then didn't you ask the

1 pilot to go to those areas where you would have zoomed in
2 and given a better content of the goings on, on the ground,
3 than we have been able to gather from –

4 LT-COL BOTHA: Because I was under the
5 impression that the people in the veld and the people that
6 dispersed, the living area also is part of the dispersal,
7 and that's what I also videoed that.

8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I thought when the
9 Chairman put a question to you last week, you estimated
10 that there were about 3 000 people on that koppie. You
11 were aware of that?

12 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot remember
13 confirming that, but the overall talk was that there were
14 3 000 people on the koppie.

15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And I battle to recall
16 from the video footage that was flighted after 41 minutes
17 of recording, anything near the kind of numbers that
18 reflect the number or the crowd that was there. I didn't
19 anything approaching more than a hundred people in that
20 video of yours.

21 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, there, if I
22 remember correctly, you can see people moving. I was asked
23 yesterday, by the Nyalas, when you look at the video, at
24 some stage there were groups of people in the veld, there
25 were people dispersing, I did not count them, I think there

1 were many more than a hundred.

2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It was put to you in
3 cross-examination, I think by Mr Mpofu, that it seemed that
4 more of the footage was of the surrounding areas. I am
5 just battling to, if you will enlighten me, I am just
6 battling to find where the 3 000 people went to that a 41
7 minutes video could only capture at its most liberal, the
8 hundred people or more that you are talking about.

9 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, when I started
10 videographing, there weren't anyone on the koppie anymore.
11 I videographed the people on the ground that I saw.

12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would that include the –
13 did you say 300 people that were being arrested?

14 LT-COL BOTHA: I am not sure if they
15 appear on the video, we will have to look at the video
16 again.

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: They were not – I
18 suppose I was trying to say to you, it doesn't seem that
19 your video does capture most, or most of the events that
20 seem to matter that would be the content of your operation.

21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I've included police
22 vehicles in my video. I have included people running, you
23 can clearly see them, we can't dispute that on my video. I
24 included people standing around on my video, and I've
25 included people walking around in the video. That is all

1 people in the veld, which I presume came from the koppie.

2 [10:05] MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, when did you
3 realise that there was a fault in the camera? I'm just
4 moving on to something else now.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: Did you talk about the
6 fault in the camera?

7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

8 LT-COL BOTHA: What camera?

9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The digital camera. You
10 remember you were explaining that there had been –

11 LT-COL BOTHA: The timing fault?

12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

13 LT-COL BOTHA: Okay, so after I gave – I

14 think my statement is given out on the 1st September, and
15 because we – I obviously were late, I mean there's no two
16 things about it, for – I think we've concluded last

17 Tuesday, the chairperson asked me, "What happened is you
18 were either late, or it happened to early." I think that

19 was the last statement that before left. And I asked

20 myself the question but why? I mean if I was in the air,
21 according to the video camera, at 15:49, I don't whenever

22 what happened, but then something doesn't make sense, and I

23 had a look at my digital camera and it was the same as my

24 watch time, and I take that as the correct time, so it

25 looked like my video camera was 8 minutes out.

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I'm concerned about you
2 having an impression that you and the chairman concluded
3 that there could have been – you could have been late, or I
4 think the chairman was debating with you in much the same
5 way as I'm debating just to –

6 LT-COL BOTHA: Then the word concluded is
7 not the right choice.

8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now, I'm asking
9 because there is this – would have regarded that as a break
10 in the recording, what happened there, that now accounts
11 for the minutes that you cannot explain?

12 LT-COL BOTHA: No, that's not the break
13 in the recording.

14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see, okay. Now, if we
15 look at your statement which you just referred to, the one
16 you made on the 12th of September 2012, 001075, you say this
17 in paragraph 6, "On 2012, 08 16, I was in an SAPS chopper
18 at Wonderkop, Marikana during an SAPS operation." That
19 would be relevant to what we are debating about.

20 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Sir. Is

21 that the statement that was given in here at the –

22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The one that you was –

23 no, no, not the one that was handed in on Tuesday, it's the
24 one that you commissioned, or you were commissioned, as a
25 Commissioner of Oaths by Mosweu Bolmulwa.

Page 518

1 CHAIRPERSON: I think this is the
 2 statement that was part of IPED file.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: What was made available to
 5 the evidence leaders and the parties, and also the
 6 Commission, was the files of IPED, which contain all sorts
 7 of statements and so forth, included a statement which you
 8 had made – at least one statement, there may be another but
 9 I only saw one, and the one that I saw, I think is the one
 10 that counsel is referring to. So it's not the statement
 11 that was handed in when you gave evidence, which was
 12 confirmed as being correct, it's an earlier statement which
 13 you made, I think, as part of the IPED Inquiry. So is that
 14 correct, Mr Ntsebeza?
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, it is.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Is that the same one that
 17 you referred to yesterday?
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Okay.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Can I correct that?
 21 There seems to have been, including the statement
 22 yesterday, there seems to be three statements that you
 23 made. I mean, including the statement that you made on the
 24 basis of which you testified on the Tuesday last week.
 25 There's that statement, which you swore should be accepted

Page 519

1 as the truth. Then there the statement, 001120 A213, where
 2 you record - and that was on the 1st of September 2012.
 3 That's where you record the time that you made a recording
 4 at Marikana, the duration of the recording, being 41
 5 minutes and 8 seconds. Now, there is another statement,
 6 001075, where you say – and that also is made before
 7 Commissioner of Oaths, Mosweu Bolmulwa, and that statement
 8 is dated the 12th of September 2012. In that statement you
 9 say what I have just read in paragraph 6, first sentence,
 10 that you were in that SAPS chopper at Marikana. Now, I
 11 just want you to assist us in understanding what you meant
 12 by the following.
 13 MR MADLANGA SC: Chairman, Commissioners,
 14 may we ask to avail the witness a copy of the statement
 15 that my learned friend is referring to.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that seems a very
 17 reasonable request.
 18 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chairperson.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: I think it's fair to the
 20 witness that he should see the statements that you're
 21 questioning him on. Is there a copy? Oh, I see Ms Pillay
 22 is taking an electronic to him.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you Mr Chairman, I
 24 concur it is fair that the statement should be given to the
 25 witness.

Page 520

1 CHAIRPERSON: The passage in it that you
 2 want to put to him, I suppose you want to give him
 3 opportunity to read it first, before you put –
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja, it's a very short
 5 statement, Mr Chairman.
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I've read it. Sorry,
 7 is there a question? I have read it.
 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, we were talking
 9 –
 10 CHAIRPERSON: He's now read it, so you
 11 can proceed with the question.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Alright, okay. I take
 13 it we are okay, it's your statement?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, let me just ask Ms
 15 Pillay, how do I scroll down, I can't see the bottom of the
 16 statement?
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You can't be as bad as I
 18 am in electronics, Colonel. I just wanted you to just
 19 elucidate. You will see in paragraph 6 you say, "As I was
 20 busy making a video recording, I handed my digital camera
 21 to Warrant Officer A Venter, the co – I suppose that was
 22 suppose that was supposed to be co-pilot of the chopper.
 23 Warrant Officer Venter photographed the SAPS operation on
 24 the ground. When we landed, she handed my camera back to
 25 me. I had the emails she downloaded, and I compiled the

Page 521

1 attached photo album," and I don't have an attached photo
 2 album. Now, firstly, so it's part of what took place there
 3 on that day that, whilst you were doing the video
 4 recording, the digital camera photographing was being done
 5 by Warrant Officer Venter.
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And I'm not making an
 8 issue about it, but you didn't think that she was a co-
 9 pilot, but here, under oath, you say she is a co-pilot?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: I thought was she was a
 11 co-pilot, but apparently I promoted her into a co-pilot,
 12 she isn't a co-pilot.
 13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Well you –
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: She's a crew.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Oh.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: I said previously she's a
 17 crew, I don't think she's a co-pilot.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Oh, I see. Chairman, I
 19 won't take it further, but it now raises a question.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Look, obviously he made a
 21 mistake about her rank and whether she's a co-pilot, I'm
 22 not sure that it's necessary for us to decide either of
 23 those issues for the purposes of the work that this
 24 Commission has got. The real question is what sort of
 25 photographer was she? Did she take good photographs? What

Page 522

1 did she photograph? My copy of the photo album is in black
 2 and white, which means you can see nothing on it, but
 3 presumably, at some stage we may see the colour
 4 photographs.
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman. I
 6 see. You don't know if she was trained in photography or
 7 whether she was just an amateur?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: I do not know if she was
 9 trained in photography, but I do know that she can handle a
 10 camera. She did confirm with me that she can handle the
 11 camera.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Right. Now, as I
 13 conclude, I gather that you, in your evidence – Mr
 14 Chairman, please correct me if I make a mistake here, but
 15 in your evidence you seem to suggest that SAPS had a
 16 weeklong meeting, was it in Potchefstroom?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And was your, or do we
 19 have minutes, I'm not so sure, do we have minutes of that
 20 Potchefstroom meeting or wouldn't you know?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: No, Sir, I don't know.
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Did you consider at that
 23 meeting the events of the 16th of August and available
 24 evidence relevant thereto? Like, for instance, materials
 25 from you chopper, material from the other choppers that you

Page 523

1 say have been encircling the area?
 2 LT-COL BOTHA: Are you asking if I
 3 considered it?
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: At that gathering, was
 5 there a discussion of all the available evidence relevant
 6 to the 16th, in particular?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that was in
 8 preparation of the presentation for the SA Police Service,
 9 so we -
 10 CHAIRPERSON: But – sorry, yes carry on.
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: So we did consider it.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I would consider that
 13 there were other video material that was conceded having
 14 come from the other choppers in which you were not?
 15 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot recall any other
 16 video material from any other choppers.
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You know sometimes when
 18 a witness says "I don't remember," it can be either of two
 19 things, it could have happened, except that the witness
 20 doesn't remember, or I do not remember, because it never
 21 happened. Which of the two would you –
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can't remember if
 23 we looked at any other video material than my video
 24 material.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. Was your video

Page 524

1 shown?
 2 LT-COL BOTHA: I've handed my video I
 3 think to Colonel Scott. And, again, I can remember if it
 4 was shown. I don't know. I really can't make a call on
 5 that.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, you talked about
 7 video – helicopter video material?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm talking about
 9 helicopter video material.
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Was there any other video
 11 material? From the standing order that was read, there's
 12 reference to video material possibly being obtained from
 13 Nyalas, maybe, I don't know whether the water canon, you
 14 can get video material from the water canon, so there would
 15 have been – presumably, if everything had been done
 16 according to the standing order, there would have been
 17 video material, not only from the helicopters, but also
 18 from other sources. I can take that's a fair assumption
 19 one can make?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Now, what I think counsel
 22 is after and he will forgive me if I interrupt him, was any
 23 other video material, apart from helicopter video material,
 24 shown or seen by you during that week long meeting?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.

Page 525

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, now I think you got
 2 interrupted when I was seeking to find out whether your
 3 video, the one that was shown here, whether it was shown
 4 there and was it discussed?
 5 CHAIRPERSON: He answered the question.
 6 He said he couldn't remember whether his video was shown,
 7 that's as I understood his evidence.
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Sir.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: So it was at that point,
 10 because the concentration was on helicopter video material,
 11 I endeavoured to ascertain whether there was any other
 12 material – video material, other than helicopter video
 13 material, and he gave the answer that you heard and if you
 14 want to take it further, you may, or you may not.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, can I just ask the
 16 question, you may or may not know? Are you aware of any
 17 other video recording material by SAPS, whether it was from
 18 Nyalas or from helicopters or from photographs, that is in
 19 the possession of the SAPS?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: Of the day of the 16th, of
 21 when?
 22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Particularly the 16th.
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm not aware of anything
 24 like that, Sir. Sorry, you specifically asked videos?
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

Page 526

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Okay.

2 [10:25] MR NTSEBEZA SC: Is there any other

3 material, photographic material, digital camera material?

4 LT-COL BOTHA: I am aware that there were

5 photos taken, yes.

6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Colonel, it's not your

7 fault that there doesn't seem – you've said what you can,

8 but maybe there's other evidence, there will be other

9 people who will come to tell the Commission about what they

10 have by way of video material but given what I told you

11 about the planning meeting at 13:30 on that day, everything

12 else, wouldn't it be remarkable that the only material that

13 would be available is the one that was shown here?

14 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, the only video

15 material, SA Police video material that I know of is my

16 video material.

17 CHAIRPERSON: That's not an answer to the

18 question. What counsel asked you, speaking I imagine as an

19 expert, knowing what the standing instructions say or

20 standing order says, knowing how important it is for

21 police, public order policing operations to be covered by

22 video material, so if there are arguments later that the

23 police misbehaved it can be refuted by reference to the

24 video material – it's against that background that counsel

25 asks you, is it not remarkable that – whether it's true or

Page 527

1 not, I don't know, I'm just repeating his question – is it

2 not remarkable that the only material that appears to be

3 available is your material which, frankly, doesn't help us

4 very much, as we've all seen. Is that a fair summary of

5 your question, Mr Ntsebeza?

6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, indeed.

7 CHAIRPERSON: What's your answer?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: Well, I can only say yes.

9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: It's remarkable –

10 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, it's nearly

11 half past 10. I'll do again what I did last night. When a

12 suitable stage arises for the adjournment, please indicate

13 and we can take the adjournment. I don't want to stop you

14 at this stage if you want to ask further questions before

15 the adjournment, but when it's appropriate please tell me.

16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, I should

17 keep to my word of not keeping the Colonel for long. Can I

18 just take instructions from – Mr Chairman, can we take the

19 adjournment now?

20 CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will adjourn

21 for 15 minutes.

22 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES]

23 [10:51] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. Mr

24 Ntsebeza, you were cross-examining the witness. I assume

25 you wish to ask further questions.

Page 528

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, Mr Chairman, thank

2 you very much.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Warrant Officer –

4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Lieutenant-Colonel.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Lieutenant-Colonel, you are

6 still under oath.

7 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NTSEBEZA SC (CONTD):

8 Thank you, Mr Chairman. The witness jocularly told me that

9 I had not kept my promise and I told him that Elizabeth

10 Taylor did keep Richard Burton more, longer than any other,

11 Chair.

12 CHAIRPERSON: She married him twice.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, just a couple of –

14 the pilots and their logs, do they keep any logs that you,

15 are you aware whether the pilots, whenever you go on that

16 kind of mission, whether they keep any logs or logbooks?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I don't know.

18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, yesterday I think

19 there was an uncompleted question I wanted to pursue. The

20 post-mortems of what you did on the 13th and the 14th, which

21 did you do and which do you have records of?

22 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, sir I did the post-

23 mortems – can I quote the CAS numbers?

24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes and the dates.

25 LT-COL BOTHA: All the post-mortems were

Page 529

1 done on the 16th, okay.

2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

3 LT-COL BOTHA: It's the five post-mortems

4 of the people that died in Marikana CAS115-119/8/2012.

5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, did you –

6 CHAIRPERSON: Those five are the five

7 bodies – no, it's the four bodies that were found by you at

8 the scene on the 13th, is that correct? Plus the person

9 who, the policeman who died in hospital thereafter, do I

10 understand it correctly?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: It is the two bodies that

12 I found on my scene CAS117 and 118, Marikana CAS117 and

13 118. The two bodies of Captain Moshwana, 115 and 116 and

14 then the body of the policeman that died in hospital,

15 CAS119.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Those all relate to the

17 incident of the 13th, is that correct?

18 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Mr Chair.

19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now did those post-

20 mortems include the person who was found just across the

21 river? You remember we had a debate yesterday about the

22 person who was, whose body was found across the river?

23 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, I didn't complete

24 the answer. There's one outstanding because I've only

25 mentioned five now.

Page 530

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Oh, okay.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: Then CAS121, that's the

3 person that was found behind the koppie on the 14th.

4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: To answer the second

6 question, that included the person that died in CAS115 on

7 the other side of the river.

8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And in each of those

9 cases would you know why physically performed the post-

10 mortems?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Mr Chair.

12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Tell us?

13 LT-COL BOTHA: A gentleman by the name of

14 Dr Nkosi.

15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Dr Nkosi, all of them?

16 LT-COL BOTHA: All six of them.

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: All six of them. Thank

18 you, Colonel. Now, I think indeed to – I think the

19 Commission would like to know a little bit more about the

20 week long meeting that you said was held at Potchefstroom.

21 I understood that the purpose of the meeting – and you'll

22 correct me if I'm wrong – was to make a presentation, to

23 prepare a presentation for this Commission, or am I wrong?

24 LT-COL BOTHA: It was to prepare a

25 presentation for the National Commissioner and then

Page 531

1 eventually for this Commission.

2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I see. Yes, you will

3 forgive me if I then take you back again just to get a

4 little bit more detail about the meeting because I only got

5 aware of it from your evidence last week. Now, which of –

6 on how many days were there meetings? I just get the sense

7 that it was a week long meeting. Did you meet every day,

8 Monday to Friday –

9 LT-COL BOTHA: If I did say a week long,

10 I must correct myself. It was five days the one week and I

11 think four days the other week.

12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So for nine days

13 actually.

14 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes.

15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: You attended on all five

16 days, I mean on all five days, four days.

17 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I did not attend to

18 all of them. Half a day I wasn't there but let's say then

19 I attended all of them, because half a day I wasn't there.

20 One day, for part of the day I wasn't there.

21 CHAIRPERSON: You attended for eight and

22 a half days.

23 LT-COL BOTHA: More or less, sir.

24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now who, who was

25 convening the meetings, do you know?

Page 532

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, there were a lot of

2 officers. I can't really say who convened the meeting.

3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, or who then

4 attended the meetings at which you were present? We'll

5 come to the meetings in a moment. For instance, let me

6 just give you a sense of probably who would have attended

7 the meeting. You remember that I told you there was a

8 meeting on the 16th of August at the special, a special JOC

9 COM meeting at the centre where I said the operation, stage

10 1, stage 2, stage 3 of the operation was going to be

11 embarked upon was discussed and I indicated to you, you

12 were not there. Now these are the people who were in

13 attendance, according to this minute A197/1. Lieutenant-

14 General Mbombo, Major-General Annandale, Major-General

15 Mpembe, M-P-E-M-B-E, Brigadiers Van Zyl, Fritz, Silwane,

16 Pretorius and then Colonel Isaacs from crime intelligence

17 and Adv Moolman from legal services. Were any of these

18 people in attendance at the nine day meeting that you

19 attended?

20 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Mr Chair.

21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I would assume that

22 there was an agenda –

23 CHAIRPERSON: We haven't got clarity yet

24 on the last point that you covered. A list of names was

25 read to you of people who were at the JOC meeting on the

Page 533

1 16th and you were asked whether any of them were there at

2 the nine day meeting and you said yes, but you didn't tell

3 us whether they were all there or, if all of them weren't

4 there, which of them were there at the nine day meeting.

5 So that point is left in the air, so can you perhaps help

6 us on that before counsel proceeds to his next point?

7 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, sorry – no, I'm

8 fine sir, thank you. I can recall General Annandale. I

9 cannot say that General Mpembe was there the whole time, I

10 know he was there. Brigadier Pretorius was there, Adv

11 Moolman was there, Brigadier Fritz wasn't there. What's

12 the other – I maybe missed some names now.

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mbombo?

14 LT-COL BOTHA: I've commented on that.

15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Annandale you have said.

16 Mpembe, Van Zyl, Fritz, Silwane, Brigadier Silwane,

17 national –

18 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier – I cannot

19 recall that Brigadier Van Zyl was there all the time but I

20 can recall seeing him there. I do not, I don't know all

21 the people that were there by their names, so I cannot say

22 if Brigadier Silwane was there or wasn't there.

23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay, perhaps so that we

24 don't get lost, let's start – you do have your diary with

25 you, don't you? You said you do.

Page 534

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I do have it with me.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would you tell us who,
 3 on the first day, chaired the meeting and who, in your
 4 knowledge other than you, attended the meeting?
 5 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, there were a lot of
 6 people. I – it's going to be difficult now to say who
 7 attended the meeting. There were a lot of people. I know
 8 that General Annandale was there, Brigadier – the names
 9 that I've now known. I cannot recall – on the first day
 10 Brigadier Van Zyl for instance, he might've, he might not
 11 have been there. I cannot recall Brigadier – General
 12 Mbombo, I do not think she was there the first day. So
 13 it's going to be very difficult for me to say out of my
 14 head and I did not note that.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I don't want
 16 to interrupt you. I'm not sure if this is the best witness
 17 to obtain this information from. I would imagine that in
 18 the course of the inquiry it'll be fairly easy for you to
 19 obtain the information you now seek. I wonder, unless
 20 you've got a particular reason for asking the question, in
 21 which case I won't stop you, but if you are in effect
 22 endeavouring to lay a foundation for things that will
 23 follow, it may be that - if you're wasting your time with
 24 this witness on this issue, but you will be able to get the
 25 information later. But if you have a reason for asking the

Page 535

1 question now, then you must carry on.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Two reasons –
 3 CHAIRPERSON: You don't have to tell me
 4 what – if there are reasons, you can carry on.
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you. Colonel,
 6 your diary, does it show on each day who at least chaired
 7 the meeting and who attended the meeting?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: No, it does not.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Of the nine days - can
 10 you just tell us which witness statement the first day of
 11 the meeting?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I'll have to go and
 13 confirm that. I do not know what the first day – I know it
 14 was a Monday, I cannot remember the date now.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And that would be so in
 16 respect of the remainder of the days, you wouldn't remember
 17 what days the meetings were held, or in respect of the
 18 remaining eight days or seven and a half days?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: It was held from the
 20 Monday till the Friday –
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: And then from the Monday
 23 till the Thursday, if I'm not mistaken.
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. You are not sure
 25 who attended, there were many people.

Page 536

1 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Mr Chair.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Right. Were there any
 3 agendas, written agendas that were circulated to those who
 4 attended?
 5 LT-COL BOTHA: No, Mr Chair.
 6 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Let's take the first
 7 day. Who chaired the meeting of the first day?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I'm not sure who
 9 chaired the first day. I cannot remember who chaired the
 10 days. It was – I know that General Annandale and General
 11 Naidoo was there, I cannot even say that General Naidoo was
 12 there the whole time and so I presume they were the senior
 13 people, they chaired the meeting.
 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now were there any oral
 15 reports given, seeing that the whole purpose of the
 16 meeting, according to you, was to prepare a comprehensive
 17 report for the National Commissioner of police and, as I
 18 understood you, also for this Commission.
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, sir.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Would you recall who
 21 made oral representations – who made oral reports at the
 22 meeting?
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, there were a lot
 24 of people.
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: One or two? You must

Page 537

1 remember that there was a particular report that caught
 2 your attention, I would assume.
 3 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, there was a lot of
 4 people talking and there was a lot of people present and I
 5 mean we all know that we were there to make a
 6 representation for the National Commissioner, so the
 7 discussion was obviously what happened.
 8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Surely, Colonel, the
 9 meetings were structured. I don't gainsay what you're
 10 saying but you must remember something of the nine days
 11 that caught your attention.
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: We discussed the
 13 happenings of the 16th, so I – it's general discussions. I
 14 can't remember specific things that were said.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Were there any written
 16 reports that were handed in that you are aware of?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Not that I am aware of,
 18 sir.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Were there times when
 20 there were footages of what happened on the 16th flighted?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 22 [11:11] MR NTSEBEZA SC: And were those only SAPS
 23 footages that were flighted or all footages that have been
 24 recorded of what took place on the 16th?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: I can recall SAPS footage,

1 like my photos for instance or the photos taken by Warrant
 2 Officer Venter. I can't recall that we looked at any other
 3 footage.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And would your answer be
 5 that, except only for the half a day that you were not
 6 there, in the nine days that you gathered in Potchefstroom,
 7 all footage that would have been shown is the one that was
 8 shown to this Commission from the SAPS?
 9 LT-COL BOTHA: Just repeat the question?
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: The question is, unless
 11 something else was shown in the half a day that you were
 12 not there, in the eight and a half days that you were in
 13 attendance, on one or more days of which footage was shown,
 14 all footage that was shown is the one that you presented to
 15 us here at this Commission. Am I correct in saying so?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Maybe you must rephrase
 17 the question. Sorry, I'm not trying to be difficult –
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: As I understand the
 20 question, what counsel is asking you is, this video that
 21 you showed us yesterday or was shown yesterday that you
 22 took, was that the only video which was seen while you were
 23 there during the eight and a half days at the meeting?
 24 That's counsel's question, as I understand it. I think you
 25 can – I hope you can understand it now.

1 LT-COL BOTHA: But you asked of the 16th,
 2 the happenings on the 16th of –
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I take it he's talking
 4 – yes, I think that was in, that was part of the question,
 5 but there may have been earlier footage about the 13th which
 6 would possibly form the subject matter of another question
 7 but as far as the events of the 16th are concerned, what
 8 counsel wants to know from you is, the footage that we saw
 9 yesterday which you took from the helicopter, was that the
 10 only video footage which was shown in your presence at the
 11 meeting over the eight and a half days.
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: Of the 16th. Sir, I did
 13 say previously that I cannot recall that this, my video was
 14 shown there, but there were aerial photos of the 16th that
 15 were shown or that we looked at.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's what I
 17 understood you to say earlier, that you couldn't recall
 18 your footage, your video footage being shown. What you do
 19 recall is that the pictures taken on your camera by
 20 Sergeant or Warrant Officer Venter were shown and I
 21 understood you to say that they were the only visual
 22 material which you saw at these meetings. Did I understand
 23 correctly?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, that's not – there
 25 were other, I did say there were other aerial photos also.

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
 2 Thank you, Colonel. Just now to be, to put this point
 3 beyond doubt – as far as you are aware, or your evidence is
 4 that you do not recall that even your footage was flighted
 5 in the eight and a half days that you were present at this
 6 meeting.
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: Not the video, but I do
 8 recall that the aerial photos were flighted.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, that's clear.
 10 Can we take that a little bit further and say, is it
 11 because you do not remember now because there are a number
 12 of things that's happened along the route, you do not
 13 remember now whether or not that video footage was flighted
 14 during the meetings, or it was never done at all because if
 15 it was, you would remember.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, no, I cannot remember
 17 now. As you've said, a lot of things happened in between.
 18 I cannot remember now if it was flighted.
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And your evidence will
 20 be if it was flighted at all, in your recollection it
 21 would've been the only video material of the events of the
 22 16th that would have been flighted.
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Mr Chair.
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, as you
 25 remarked earlier on, it is remarkable that it is the only

1 video material –
 2 CHAIRPERSON: I just asked, rephrased
 3 your question. The witness said yes, so it's the witness's
 4 remark
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes indeed, Mr Chairman.
 6 I think that's where we should leave it. Oh ja, my junior
 7 always wants to make sure I do the right thing. My learned
 8 friend is not going to like this. Was there anyone from
 9 Lonmin at that meeting, at the end of those meetings?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, as far as I can
 11 recall there were only policemen at that meeting.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Okay. May I just place
 13 on the record also, Mr Chairman, that Adv Budlender
 14 educated me a little bit yesterday. He told me that papa
 15 refers to Nyalas, it has nothing to do – remember I asked
 16 the question, is papa the same thing as the – he said no,
 17 no, papa, Dumisa – except that he calls me "Mr Ntsebenza".
 18 So papa, I now accept to be a reference to Nyalas. Thank
 19 you, Mr Chairman, no more questions.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Before I give the counsel
 21 for some of the parties the opportunity to ask further
 22 questions arising from the extra material, particularly the
 23 video, is there anyone representing any of the parties who
 24 hasn't yet had the opportunity to cross-examine and wishes
 25 to do so? A hand is being raised at the back, yes? Please

Page 542

1 put yourself on record and then ask the questions you want
2 to ask.

3 MR RAMPHELE: That is correct, Chair. My
4 name is Tshepiso Ramphele, I'm representing the families of
5 the two security officers that perished on the 12th. Just
6 to make clear, I'm an attorney, not an advocate.

7 CHAIRPERSON: I take it you have what is
8 known as "verskyningsbevoegdheid", but there's no reason
9 why you shouldn't participate in these proceedings. Please
10 carry on without any sense of inadequacy.

11 MR RAMPHELE: Colonel, just because
12 you're not involved in the issues around the 12th, my
13 questions will just basically relate to clarity so I should
14 understand the workings in your area of expertise. Tell
15 me, under what circumstances would you normally have video
16 recordings of incidents?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that's a call made
18 entirely by the expert when he gets to a crime scene, he
19 will decide if he's going to make a video or not. Me
20 personally, in serious cases I will make videos.

21 MR RAMPHELE: And in your 26 years or so
22 of experience, ordinarily if you have continuous marches in
23 an area and the area is volatile there would be a need for
24 some sort of recording.

25 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, LCRCs only record

Page 543

1 passive crime scenes, not active crime scenes, so I don't
2 know.

3 MR RAMPHELE: If you could explain that?
4 If you say – because we learn from the dockets that have
5 been opened on the 10th and the 11th that there were marches
6 in Lonmin. So the question is, would these kinds of
7 incidents require some sort of observation by the police?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: That's not my field of
9 expertise, I don't know.

10 MR RAMPHELE: Now Colonel, even if it's
11 not your field of expertise, on the 10th of August there
12 were two cases that were reported at Marikana police
13 station of shooting and there were marches. Would you –
14 I'm just giving you this information – and on the 11th of
15 August there were a further two cases of shootings reported
16 at Marikana police station and there were marches. So just
17 in terms of your experience, would this kind of incident
18 not require some sort of police attention?

19 LT-COL BOTHA: If there are shootings and
20 marches, it does require police attention.

21 MR RAMPHELE: And in this particular case
22 the reports were that it was the security of Lonmin that
23 were involved in the shooting at first and, secondly, it
24 was the warring unions that were involved. So that, you
25 would agree with me, required some sort of police

Page 544

1 attention.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if the case was
3 reported at the police they must give attention to it.

4 MR RAMPHELE: And ordinarily in these
5 kinds of instances you would agree with me that the police
6 would have to do some sort of probing, that the police
7 would find out what the situation is in Lonmin, would you
8 agree with me?

9 LT-COL BOTHA: If you say probing into
10 the case, they investigate the case. The rest I can't
11 comment on.

12 MR RAMPHELE: I see. Colonel, I am
13 referring to a situation where you have shootings in a
14 march and that is reported to the police. Would the
15 police, say public order policing, not have an interest in
16 this kind of matter?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, again, it's not my
18 field of expertise. I'm not a POP, public order policeman.
19 I've been a fingerprint expert or criminalistic expert for
20 26 years.

21 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ramphele, I don't want
22 to unduly interfere with your cross-examination but it
23 occurs to me that – I take it there will be public order
24 policemen, policing people here and if these questions are
25 relevant to the issues before us at this stage, not merely

Page 545

1 to a possible claim that your clients may have against
2 somebody else, then I'll the questions then but I think – I
3 hope you'll forgive me if I say that I don't know if the
4 inquiry is being advanced very much at the moment by asking
5 questions of this kind to this witness. As I say, there
6 may be other witnesses to whom you can fruitfully ask the
7 questions but I wonder whether you shouldn't be -

8 MR RAMPHELE: I appreciate, I accept,
9 Judge. Let me just then move on to the other areas.
10 Colonel, in a situation of a big organisation like Lonmin,
11 would you be aware that they would have some sort of
12 surveillance that could assist in your investigation?

13 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry Mr Ramphele, again is
14 this the kind of question we can expect a meaningful answer
15 from the Colonel? I don't mean any disrespect to the
16 Colonel but it's not his field of expertise either. I can
17 understand why you're asking the questions, where you're
18 coming from. I'm not sure that they'll necessarily help us
19 at this stage of the inquiry but in any event I don't think
20 this is the right witness to ask the questions of but –
21 unless you wish to address me on that, I'm proposing to
22 disallow the question.

23 MR RAMPHELE: Yes, let me address you –
24 thank you, Chair, let me address you on that. My
25 understanding is that the Colonel is the most senior in his

Page 546

1 experience – I mean he's got 26 years' experience, he's
 2 indicated that in the unit where he was operating he is the
 3 most senior, so in terms of the protocols I think he would
 4 be the most appropriate official to give an indication of
 5 what would be practice in the operation.

6 CHAIRPERSON: You should first ask him
 7 what his field of – to define more precisely what his field
 8 of expertise is, to see whether he's able to give
 9 meaningful answers on the points that you want to cover.
 10 Colonel, can you deal with that point?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, my field of
 12 expertise, I'm a criminalistic expert in the South African
 13 Police Service. I videograph, photograph crime scenes and
 14 I also lift fingerprints and do comparisons, filing and
 15 identifications of fingerprints. I'm a bloodstain pattern
 16 analysis, trained bloodstain pattern analysis and also
 17 footprints. That's my – in short, I might miss one or two
 18 but that's my field of expertise.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Now how can any –
 20 MR RAMPHELE: Thank you, Chair. Now the
 21 reason why I'm asking is because the surveillance is part
 22 of video material that may actually be relevant to the
 23 investigation by the police and I'm trying to establish,
 24 with respect Chair, the interaction between the police and
 25 probable available material in areas where they operate.

Page 547

1 CHAIRPERSON: Can you assist us on that
 2 line of enquiry, Colonel?

3 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot, sir.

4 MR RAMPHELE: So what you are telling
 5 this Commission is that even if there could be video
 6 material at Lonmin that could have assisted you, you would
 7 not know how to interface with that?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, what I'm saying is
 9 I'm not investigating the case, I'm not an investigating
 10 officer. I made the video.

11 [11:31] MR RAMPHELE: Thank you, Colonel. Let's
 12 go to – because you see, like I say, I just want to
 13 understand the processes. The –

14 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Ramphele. I
 15 don't know that obtaining an understanding of the processes
 16 is a necessary exercise to perform before the Commission in
 17 open session. I'm sure one of the police people will give
 18 you the information you require but I don't think this is
 19 the right witness, in any event, to give you the
 20 understanding of the processes. So I propose disallowing
 21 this line of cross-examination. If you want to deal with
 22 something that's directly relevant to what we're busy with,
 23 you can proceed.

24 MR RAMPHELE: Chair, I – let me just
 25 explain. When I say processes I'm referring to protocols

Page 548

1 as – because I went through the directive in relation to
 2 how they would operate and I think, Chair, questions have
 3 been extensively asked on that directive and the Colonel
 4 has duly obliged and responded and I just wanted to make
 5 enquiries about certain of the issues that are in the
 6 directive, Chairperson.

7 CHAIRPERSON: Ask the question, let's see
 8 if the witness can help you.

9 MR RAMPHELE: Thank you. Colonel, in
 10 your evidence you gave an indication that in your work on
 11 the day of the 16th you were having both a video camera and
 12 a digital camera.

13 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Mr Chair.

14 MR RAMPHELE: And you indicated that the
 15 digital camera time was actually the correct time, in your
 16 understanding.

17 LT-COL BOTHA: As far as I could
 18 determine it.

19 MR RAMPHELE: And if I understand it
 20 correctly, the properties on the video recording will give
 21 the exact time at which the picture was taken.

22 LT-COL BOTHA: No, if you have a look at
 23 my video, for some reason there's something wrong with the
 24 programme. The properties do not show correctly. We've
 25 experienced it in Brits and we've experienced it here.

Page 549

1 What I do when I type my statement, I open the video
 2 camera, then at the bottom it shows the time when I started
 3 - it doesn't show when you film – and I take that time and
 4 then afterwards I realised but this time is wrong, but if
 5 you even look at my video the properties will not be
 6 correct. There's some glitch in the programme and I'm not
 7 a computer expert.

8 MR RAMPHELE: But would I be correct if I
 9 say that the slides as they appear in your, the photos that
 10 you've provided follow one another?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, if you spoke about
 12 the properties of the photos, that is correct. I thought
 13 you talked about the properties of the video, there's a
 14 glitch in the programme but the properties of the photos
 15 will be correct, that will give you the actual time.

16 MR RAMPHELE: Now I would like to, and
 17 Chairperson with your guidance because there are some – we
 18 received some photos that I wanted to just establish from
 19 the Colonel in terms of times they were taken and the order
 20 in which they actually are placed, that maybe this could be
 21 shown so that the Colonel could respond to some of the
 22 questions.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Are these photographs of
 24 something that happened on the 13th or the 12th or on the
 25 16th?

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 550</p> <p>1 MR RAMPHELE: The 16th, Chair.</p> <p>2 CHAIRPERSON: Are these –</p> <p>3 MR RAMPHELE: And this is on the –</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: Are these supposed to be</p> <p>5 Sergeant or Warrant Officer Venter's photographs?</p> <p>6 MR RAMPHELE: These are from the folio</p> <p>7 that is Colonel Botha's folio.</p> <p>8 CHAIRPERSON: Colonel Botha provided a</p> <p>9 photo album which is in the bundle of documents.</p> <p>10 MR RAMPHELE: Yes.</p> <p>11 CHAIRPERSON: It's not been handed in</p> <p>12 yet, I don't think, but it's the photographs taken, as I</p> <p>13 understand it, by Warrant Officer Venter using the</p> <p>14 Colonel's digital camera. Is that what you're asking</p> <p>15 about?</p> <p>16 MR RAMPHELE: Yes.</p> <p>17 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Madlanga, you look</p> <p>18 puzzled. Do you want to say something at this stage?</p> <p>19 MR MADLANGA SC: Well Chair, no</p> <p>20 arrangement, as far as I'm aware, was made for the</p> <p>21 photographs to be shown but I believe those photographs are</p> <p>22 on the SAPS hard drive. So if an arrangement could have</p> <p>23 been made, could have taken them up there to Mr Rice for</p> <p>24 them to be shown or to be viewed.</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, well obviously you're</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 552</p> <p>1 Chairperson to ask the gentleman upstairs whether he's got</p> <p>2 those ready and whether everything is set up for that</p> <p>3 viewing, Chair.</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: He is standing up and</p> <p>5 raising his thumb, which I take it is an indication of yes.</p> <p>6 So would you please proceed to show us the first three</p> <p>7 photographs? Just to put on record, what we're now going</p> <p>8 to see is presumably the first three photographs in the</p> <p>9 photo album which the Colonel prepared of the photographs</p> <p>10 taken on his digital camera by Sergeant or Warrant Officer</p> <p>11 Venter.</p> <p>12 MR RAMPHELE: Chair, let me just</p> <p>13 indicate, the photographs that I would like the Colonel to</p> <p>14 just respond on are photographs 5131, 5132 and 5134.</p> <p>15 CHAIRPERSON: And have you arranged that</p> <p>16 those are the photographs that we will now see?</p> <p>17 MR RAMPHELE: Yes.</p> <p>18 CHAIRPERSON: Alright, let's see those</p> <p>19 three photographs. They may not be the first three but we</p> <p>20 know, we can – they have been identified, but please show</p> <p>21 them to us, please?</p> <p>22 [PHOTOGRAPHS ARE SHOWN]</p> <p>23 MR RAMPHELE: These photographs, Colonel,</p> <p>24 the time that will appear in the properties you said will</p> <p>25 be the correct time at which the photograph was taken.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 551</p> <p>1 not able to do it now –</p> <p>2 MR MADLANGA SC: We can't do it now.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: So it's possibly</p> <p>4 appropriate then, I'm not quite sure what point Mr Ramphele</p> <p>5 is making but perhaps the sensible way to do it is to stand</p> <p>6 this, down this part of his cross-examination and when</p> <p>7 you're ready to show the photographs then we can get the</p> <p>8 Colonel back perhaps and Mr Ramphele can ask his questions.</p> <p>9 Would that be acceptable, Mr Ramphele?</p> <p>10 MR RAMPHELE: The arrangement has been</p> <p>11 made, Chairperson, with I think - we spoke to Adv</p> <p>12 Chaskalson and then we were referred to someone who's</p> <p>13 operating –</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: Are you telling me – well,</p> <p>15 let's find out from Mr Madlanga. If the photographs are</p> <p>16 available and they can be shown now – I don't know about</p> <p>17 all of them but – do you want all of them shown or just one</p> <p>18 or two?</p> <p>19 MR RAMPHELE: No, just about three, four,</p> <p>20 just to understand how –</p> <p>21 CHAIRPERSON: Okay. If the photographs</p> <p>22 are available it will probably save time, we'll just see</p> <p>23 the three, the first three now and then Mr Ramphele can</p> <p>24 carry on.</p> <p>25 MR MADLANGA SC: May I ask the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 553</p> <p>1 LT-COL BOTHA: Where's the properties?</p> <p>2 Sir, according to me that must be the correct time. It</p> <p>3 says 16:04.</p> <p>4 CHAIRPERSON: I can't see but if -</p> <p>5 MR RAMPHELE: It seems to be 16:04,</p> <p>6 201208 at 16 – at 16:04.1736.</p> <p>7 CHAIRPERSON: May I suggest that the</p> <p>8 Colonel may wish to stand up and go closer to the screen to</p> <p>9 see if he can see it more clearly.</p> <p>10 MR MAHLANGU: The time is 4:17 as</p> <p>11 indicated.</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: That's evidence given by</p> <p>13 the interpreter who hasn't been sworn in but Colonel, can</p> <p>14 you tell us, is that time that we were given the correct</p> <p>15 time that we can see?</p> <p>16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, according to me that</p> <p>17 must be the correct time, and to my watch.</p> <p>18 MR RAMPHELE: And the line of people that</p> <p>19 we see there, are these police officers on that day?</p> <p>20 LT-COL BOTHA: I can't really –</p> <p>21 MR MAHLANGU: The date seems to be the</p> <p>22 20th, 20 – yes, 201208, the date the 16th and the time 4.17</p> <p>23 –</p> <p>24 LT-COL BOTHA: Correct.</p> <p>25 MR MAHLANGU: .36.</p>

Page 554

1 CHAIRPERSON: For the sake of good order,
 2 you confirm that, Colonel?
 3 LT-COL BOTHA: I can confirm that, sir.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Now the next question is
 5 the line of people, you were asked about that and you were
 6 going to answer when we got that extra information about
 7 the time.
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can see a line of
 9 people there. I cannot comment on who it is. I mean maybe
 10 –
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Is there a facility for
 12 zooming in on the picture which we have on the screen and
 13 enlarging that particular part of the picture, which will
 14 give us perhaps more definition as to the people from which
 15 we can identify whether they are policemen or protestors?
 16 It's being done, I see.
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can most probably
 18 say it's policemen. I wasn't on the ground so I can't
 19 swear to that, that it's policemen.
 20 MR RAMPHELE: Would you say that this was
 21 before the incident or after?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, just repeat the
 23 question?
 24 MR RAMPHELE: Would you say that this
 25 line of police officers happened before the incident or

Page 555

1 after?
 2 LT-COL BOTHA: Well, now I can say it
 3 happened after the incident if I look at the time.
 4 MR RAMPHELE: Can we then go to 5134?
 5 CHAIRPERSON: What do you want to know
 6 about that picture, Mr Ramphele? Do you want to know the
 7 time or what we can see on it –
 8 MR RAMPHELE: Yes.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Or do you want to –
 10 enlarged, so that we can see it more clearly?
 11 MR RAMPHELE: Yes. This also was taken
 12 at 14, at 15:18:10 would you agree with that?
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct.
 14 MR RAMPHELE: And if you were to sort of
 15 give some light, would you say this was before or after the
 16 incident of the 16th?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I will have to
 18 qualify the incident of the 16th because by now I know
 19 that's the small koppie, I know there was an incident. I
 20 don't know if it was before or after the incident on the
 21 small koppie happened, so we must – we must – what incident
 22 are we talking about now?
 23 MR RAMPHELE: The killing that happened
 24 on the koppie.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: No, Mr Ramphele, I think

Page 556

1 that question is a bit imprecise and I also think that
 2 you're actually asking the witness to speculate. You ask
 3 him to look at the picture and then tell us what he thinks
 4 was the situation. The difficulty is, as I understand the
 5 allegations on the table, there was – the first incident is
 6 at scene 1 where, in the space of a very short period of
 7 time, a substantial number of rounds of ammunition were
 8 fired and a number of people were killed and their bodies
 9 were found on what we can describe as the field between the
 10 koppie and the informal settlement. Thereafter, it is
 11 alleged that the action moved to the small koppie and
 12 various things happened there. It's not quite clear, as I
 13 understand at this stage, at what time those incidents took
 14 place and/or over what period they extended. The
 15 suggestion is, for example by some people, that a number of
 16 miners were lying on the ground and police came up and
 17 cold-bloodedly shot them. How long that – if that's true,
 18 we'll ascertain perhaps in the course of the evidence.
 19 It's also not clear over what period of time those
 20 individual shootings took place. So in the absence of
 21 precise timing of this incident of the second scene, all
 22 this witness can tell us is what time that picture was
 23 taken, that it depicts the second scene. I'm not sure one
 24 can take it any further, but –
 25 MR RAMPHELE: Yes.

Page 557

1 CHAIRPERSON: I don't want to stop you
 2 unduly because if you have an important point to make I
 3 must give you an opportunity, but I'm also concerned about
 4 the fact that we haven't got unlimited time to go down all
 5 these ways and byways.
 6 MR RAMPHELE: As it pleases. So Colonel,
 7 because you – clearly this is one area where you could zoom
 8 – you will not be able to, you are not able to zoom at the
 9 koppie and make some sort of picture on exactly what was
 10 happening on the koppie.
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I did not take
 12 the photo.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Is it possible to enlarge
 14 this photograph or a particular part of it, so we can see
 15 more clearly what's happening at the little koppie? It's
 16 now being enlarged for us but – perhaps we can have expert
 17 evidence later, if such evidence is available, as to what
 18 can be seen by a magnification, as it were, of some of
 19 these photographs. But I'm not sure that you can help us
 20 on this, Colonel, can you?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, on the enlargement
 22 or on what happened?
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Both.
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry. On the
 25 enlargement, I can enlarge it the same way and on what

Page 558

1 happened, I can't really comment on that.
 2 MR RAMPHELE: So Colonel, if by any
 3 chance the shooting happened between these two periods then
 4 it means that at that time you were actually in the
 5 helicopter.
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I think we have to –
 7 yes, I was in the chopper, sorry.
 8 MR RAMPHELE: Yes. So you can safely say
 9 that of the evidence that you will provide, there will
 10 always be unclarity on some aspects.
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: I don't know how to answer
 12 the question, Mr Chair.
 13 MR RAMPHELE: Because you've just said
 14 you could've been in the helicopter when the shooting
 15 happened but you say that you did not capture it.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: I didn't say that. I
 17 think we established here at some stage that I did not know
 18 even that there was a shooting at the koppie until I got
 19 back onto the ground.
 20 MR RAMPHELE: Now part of the reason why
 21 you have video recording, Colonel, is to prevent
 22 emergencies or tragedies from happening. Would you agree
 23 with me?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, video will not
 25 prevent a tragedy from happening.

Page 559

1 CHAIRPERSON: Colonel, it depends on how
 2 the tragedy is defined. If the tragedy is a cold-blooded
 3 murder by a policeman of miners, then the fact that there's
 4 video footage being taken would discourage, one assumes,
 5 the policemen from doing what they're otherwise alleged to
 6 have done. So to that extent the fact that the video
 7 recording is being taken is a useful way of ensuring that
 8 atrocities don't occur because there is a strong likelihood
 9 that people aren't going to perform atrocities if it's all
 10 being recorded on video. So that extent the question put
 11 is, elicits a positive answer.
 12 [11:51] LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 13 MR RAMPHELE: Actually you're directive
 14 is very clear that the video operator must communicate with
 15 the POP officials. That is what one clause of the
 16 directive tells us.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: But what is the question?
 18 You're not going to just argue with the witness or debate
 19 with him. You've got to ask him questions to get
 20 information that helps us. What is the question?
 21 MR RAMPHELE: Okay, do you agree with me
 22 that your own directive as a video operator that you have
 23 provided us, say that you interact with a member of the POP
 24 and receive instructions from the operations commander?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that is not correct.

Page 560

1 That Standing Order that was read is a POP Standing Order,
 2 which will be for POP members, which means POP video person
 3 will speak to the POP commander.
 4 MR RAMPHELE: With your permission,
 5 Chair, let me just read the colonel the relevant –
 6 CHAIRPERSON: It's been read already, Mr
 7 Ramphele. It's on record. Again, the purpose of this
 8 questioning isn't to have a debate with him to persuade him
 9 he's wrong; it's to put information before us which helps
 10 us to find the answer to the difficult questions submitted
 11 for us to answer. May I suggest that you move on to the
 12 third photograph you wanted to take, and then let's see
 13 what comes from that?
 14 MR RAMPHELE: Chairperson, I believe that
 15 this interaction is very important to make because it is
 16 our case that if – and the Terms of Reference of the
 17 Commission are clear, whether there's any commission or
 18 omission on the part of persons that will appear, amongst
 19 others the Police, before the Commission, that led to, in
 20 my case, the death of a security officer on the 12th, and
 21 I'm, it is important, Chair, that I make it clear these are
 22 the Standing Order, that this Standing Order is not being
 23 regularly complied with –
 24 CHAIRPERSON: The Standing Order is
 25 already before us and can be put before us more fully

Page 561

1 later. The photographs that you're asking him about relate
 2 to what happened not on the 12th, but on the 16th. It
 3 already appears from answers that were given in response to
 4 earlier cross-examination that the Standing Order doesn't
 5 appear to have been complied with. So I don't know
 6 whether, you know you can go on asking questions as long as
 7 you like, but I have the power and in fact the duty under
 8 the regulations to regulate the proceedings to make sure
 9 that time isn't unduly waste. I rule this line of
 10 questioning, I disallow this line of questioning. Would
 11 you like to move on to the next photograph? You made the
 12 point that they don't always comply with the Standing
 13 Regulations. That's what you want. That fact is a fact
 14 you want to use for the purposes of your submissions in
 15 relation to what happened on the 12th, but if you made the
 16 point once, you don't have to make it again and again. So
 17 move on now please to the next photograph.
 18 MR RAMPHELE: Chairperson, I think that
 19 in view of your acceptance that the Standing Orders are not
 20 usually complied with and it seems to be the finding, I
 21 will not take this matter any further.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: I don't accept anything,
 23 and I make no findings. I'm merely indicating what
 24 evidence is already before the Commission. It may be that
 25 we'll have other evidence to the effect that the Standing

Page 562

1 Order is complied with. It may be difficult for that case
 2 to be presented in the light of what we've already been
 3 told, but I certainly am not going to make any findings
 4 until the appropriate time to do so comes, and I don't
 5 accept anything either again until the appropriate time for
 6 that is there. So, but anyway, so now that I have
 7 disabused your mind of that misapprehension, would you like
 8 to carry on with further questioning?
 9 MR RAMPHELE: Okay, Chairperson, I rest
 10 my case because I am satisfied that even though you've not
 11 made a finding, you have a provisional inclination and I
 12 don't have to take this matter any further.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: I am not even prepared to
 14 concede I have a provisional inclination, but I have
 15 summarised to you the evidence that's been given and I
 16 think we can leave it there. Anyway, I think it's clear
 17 that you don't propose asking anymore questions of this
 18 witness. So thank you very much. Let me now go to the
 19 other counsel. Mr Semenya, are there any further questions
 20 you'd like to ask in the light of the extra points that
 21 arose particularly in relation to the video that was shown?
 22 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, not.
 23 MR GUMBI: Yes Chairperson, before you
 24 could even allow Mr Semenya to ask any question, I wanted
 25 to ask few seeking clarity question from colonel.

Page 563

1 CHAIRPERSON: I did indicate at one
 2 point, I asked whether did anyone else want to ask
 3 questions and I didn't see you, but I see you in the
 4 background. That's probably the reason. Yes, I didn't
 5 deliberately intend to deprive you of your opportunity –
 6 MR GUMBI: I understand, Chairperson.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: So please ask the questions
 8 you want to ask and then we'll give Mr Semenya and his
 9 other colleagues in what I can call the front row an
 10 opportunity to ask further questions, if they wish to do so
 11 in the light of the video that we saw, but please carry on
 12 with your questions.
 13 MR GUMBI: Thank you very much, Chairman.
 14 To place myself on record again, my name is Louis Gumbi.
 15 I'm from the Johannesburg Bar. I'm representing the
 16 interest of POPCRU in this proceeding, specifically the
 17 interest of Lieutenant Baloyi and Warrant Officer Lepaaku
 18 and his family. Colonel, before you boarded in that
 19 chopper you used to captured those video images you
 20 displayed before this Commission, I wanted to deal with
 21 your observation of the police officers that were there.
 22 Is it correct that the police officers who were there, some
 23 of them they were in uniform and some of them they were not
 24 in uniform?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, there were

Page 564

1 policemen in and, with and without uniform.
 2 MR GUMBI: But the majority of the police
 3 officers, were they in uniform?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes.
 5 MR GUMBI: You testified before this
 6 Commission that there were different units of the police
 7 officers who were there on that day before you captured
 8 those video images.
 9 LT-COL BOTHA: I think I said that I
 10 cannot dispute the list that was read to me.
 11 MR GUMBI: As an experienced police
 12 officer, Colonel, would I be correct that each and every
 13 unit has his, its own commander?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: It's supposed to be like
 15 that.
 16 MR GUMBI: When one looks at the video
 17 footage you captured on that day in question, would I be
 18 correct, Colonel, that those video images captured the
 19 uniformed police officers, it also captured the marked
 20 police vehicles?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Chair, if I look in
 22 hindsight now, there are policemen on the, uniformed
 23 policemen on the scene and there are marked police vehicles
 24 on the scene.
 25 MR GUMBI: The police officers you

Page 565

1 observed on that day in question, would I be correct,
 2 Colonel, that they were armed with ammunition that are used
 3 to disperse crowds? That's correct?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did not inspect any
 5 policeman. I cannot give any comment on what they were
 6 armed with.
 7 MR GUMBI: While you were inside the
 8 chopper taking those video footages you displayed before
 9 this honourable Commission, would I be correct that you
 10 observed police officers dispersing crowds there?
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I saw police vehicles
 12 move and I, and as on the video, you can see people
 13 walking, running in a bundle, standing around, and
 14 according to me that is dispersement.
 15 MR GUMBI: But you testified that at
 16 certain occasions you observed one of the police officers
 17 while you were there releasing a stun grenade. You
 18 remember that?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, I did say the stun
 20 grenade was released from my chopper – from the chopper,
 21 not my chopper – from the chopper that I was in.
 22 MR GUMBI: And that stun grenade is used
 23 to disperse crowds. Is that correct?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I'm not a OPS member,
 25 I'm not operational member. It was used.

Page 566

1 MR GUMBI: Thank you, Chairman, I don't
2 have any further questions.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Mr
4 Semenya? Oh sorry, Mr Mogagabe, do you wish to ask
5 questions?

6 MR MOGAGABE SC: Tell us, you said that
7 the object of you, I mean getting airborne in the chopper
8 was to video record the disarming and dispersal of the
9 people on the ground. Is that correct?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: That is the information
11 that was given, yes.

12 MR MOGAGABE SC: What did you understand
13 by dispersal of the people on the ground to mean?

14 LT-COL BOTHA: That people will be
15 dispersed. I, that's my understanding.

16 MR MOGAGABE SC: What does it entail?
17 What does it mean?

18 LT-COL BOTHA: So what is that, what is
19 entailed, what it does entail I don't know. I wasn't with
20 any planning or anything like that. I was informed that
21 the people will be dispersed and disarmed and I need to get
22 into the air to make an aerial video.

23 MR MOGAGABE SC: The next question is,
24 what did you understand by the disarming of people?

25 LT-COL BOTHA: I understand that arms

Page 567

1 will be taken away from people.

2 MR MOGAGABE SC: Colonel, who gave you
3 these orders on the day in question?

4 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier Van Zyl.

5 MR MOGAGABE SC: I beg your pardon?

6 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier Van Zyl gave me
7 the instruction.

8 MR MOGAGABE SC: Was this during a
9 briefing session before you get into the chopper?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: I met him at the outside
11 of the JOC. He told me that they're going to need a video
12 person because people are going to be dispersed and
13 disarmed and I must, when the chopper goes into the air I
14 must go into the air with it.

15 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mogagabe, I don't want
16 to interrupt you unfairly. These questions have all been
17 covered already. We've heard nothing new. This cross-
18 examination you're now busy with doesn't in any way relate
19 to the extra material that we were shown. So unless you're
20 going to bring your cross-examination closer to that aspect
21 of the matter I don't think you should proceed. But
22 anyway, carry on for the moment. Endeavour to bear in mind
23 what I said.

24 MR MOGAGABE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
25 I'll try to keep my question as brief as possible.

Page 568

1 CHAIRPERSON: Don't cover matters that
2 we've had already because that's not helping us. I mean
3 you got him to repeat what he told us previously.
4 Fortunately for you he stuck to his story, but I mean it
5 might not always have that result, so I suggest you deal
6 with new matter rather than just re-traversing old matter.

7 MR MOGAGABE SC: Yes. Thank you.
8 Colonel, my next question is, you said in this Commission
9 that you only have expertise or experience in recording
10 passive crime scenes and not active ones. Is that correct?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: That's not what I said. I
12 said in video recording, and then I said that normally LCRC
13 guys will record passive crime scenes and POPS members will
14 record active crime scenes.

15 MR MOGAGABE SC: Was it the first time
16 that you're recording from airborne, from a helicopter?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: It might sound strange, in
18 26 years, yes.

19 MR MOGAGABE SC: Did you tell Brigadier
20 Van Zyl about this?

21 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I didn't tell him
22 about it. Let me just rectify the previous answer, Sir. I
23 was also airborne on the 14th, which I did say during my
24 evidence, that I switched off the video camera and I went
25 over to aerial photos. No, I did not tell the brigadier

Page 569

1 that.

2 MR MOGAGABE SC: Colonel, I think I have
3 only two or three questions left. Was there a flight plan
4 on the 16th of August?

5 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm not sure. I don't
6 know. I can't answer on that.

7 MR MOGAGABE SC: You also testified that,
8 I mean when the other two shooting incidents occurred, you
9 were airborne but didn't capture the incidents. May I ask
10 you then, who was in control of the pilot as to which
11 direction the chopper should fly, to which spot and
12 location?

13 LT-COL BOTHA: Can I just ask you to
14 repeat the statement and then the question?

15 MR MOGAGABE SC: I said, you testified
16 that in fact at the time that the two incidents which
17 happened which resulted in the killing of the protesters or
18 strikers had occurred, you were airborne at the time in the
19 chopper.

20 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I was. Let me just
21 say that in hindsight I know now that the first incident
22 obviously took place because I can see it on the video.
23 When the shooting in the koppie took place, I don't know,
24 so I can't say that I did or did not videograph it.

25 MR MOGAGABE SC: Colonel, my next

Page 570

1 question is, I mean at the time who was giving the pilot
 2 orders as to in which direction to fly the chopper? Was it
 3 you or was it brigadier Van Zyl.
 4 [12:11] LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, it wasn't me. As far
 5 as I know, the chopper pilot flew where he see, where he
 6 saw things happen, where people walked, where police
 7 vehicles were driving, where people ran, where people were
 8 standing, and that's how we videographed it.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: It follows then from your
 10 answer that nobody, while you were there in the helicopter,
 11 actually gave an oral instruction to the pilot as to where
 12 to go?
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: No, Sir.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: I think the answer that I
 15 put to you [inaudible] no-one gave him instructions to
 16 where to fly. Is that right?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, at some stage, you
 18 will see at the last part of my video, it does not really
 19 concentrate on any area, to the koppie or that area. Then
 20 Brigadier Fritz made a call and said we are going to die
 21 here, there, because you'll hear if you listen closely on
 22 the video I at some stage said to the pilot, "Check the
 23 white chopper," and he said we must move away and then
 24 that's where I photographed the people regrouping at the
 25 side of the road and stuff like that. According to me that

Page 571

1 was part of the dispersed people and I videographed it.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: The answer is that
 3 generally speaking the pilot wasn't given instructions as
 4 to where to fly, but at one point he was by Brigadier
 5 Fritz. Is that correct?
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Sir.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.
 8 MR MOGAGABE SC: Colonel, the next
 9 question is, I will assume that during the whole period
 10 that you were encircling the area, that you were in
 11 constant contact with JOC?
 12 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure how an
 13 assumption can be a question. If you want to ask whether
 14 he was in contact, you can ask him, but you can't just
 15 preface your remarks by making an assumption.
 16 MR MOGAGABE SC: Let me rephrase the
 17 question, Mr Chairperson. During the whole period that you
 18 were airborne and circling the area, were you in constant
 19 contact with JOC, either you, Brigadier Van Zyl or the
 20 pilot?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I cannot remember if
 22 we were in contact with the JOC. I can remember speaking,
 23 people speaking on the radio. If it was, and it was the
 24 JOC, I can't remember if we were in constant contact with
 25 the JOC.

Page 572

1 MR MOGAGABE SC: Who gave the order that
 2 the chopper should return to the ground?
 3 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier Van Zyl
 4 contacted the chopper and said that I must come back to the
 5 ground.
 6 MR MOGAGABE SC: Can you recall what time
 7 was that?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I think I said under
 9 my evidence, if you take when I started making the video
 10 and I, and when I switched the camera off, it should have
 11 been in the area of 17:40.
 12 MR MOGAGABE SC: My last question is, who
 13 gave the order to release the two stun grenades from your
 14 chopper?
 15 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier Fritz.
 16 MR MOGAGABE SC: Do you know for what
 17 purpose was that order given?
 18 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, he's the
 19 operations person, he made the call and he instructed the –
 20 I'm not sure is it Warrant Officer or Sergeant Venter, to
 21 release the stun grenade.
 22 MR MOGAGABE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair, no
 23 more questions.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr –
 25 MR SEMENYA SC: Sorry Chair, can I just

Page 573

1 tidy one aspect?
 2 CHAIRPERSON: I thought you were, Mr
 3 Mogagabe was dealing with the matter on your behalf, but
 4 obviously if there's a further point you want to deal with
 5 you may.
 6 MR SEMENYA SC: He represents a different
 7 team.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Oh, I see. I'm sorry.
 9 MR SEMENYA SC: Alright. Colonel, can we
 10 tidy up one aspect? The document called Standing Order,
 11 firstly it is a POP document. Am I correct?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: The one that was read to
 13 me was a POP document, yes.
 14 MR SEMENYA SC: Secondly, the document is
 15 a draft document, is it not?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, no I don't know if
 17 it's a draft. If you told me it is, it might be.
 18 MR SEMENYA SC: Well I can show you that.
 19 That's how it is indicated at the top. At page 649 you
 20 will see it's a draft, but I'm merely putting it to you.
 21 Can you accept that?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: I can accept it.
 23 MR SEMENYA SC: Thirdly, it is not a
 24 standing order. Would you dispute that, Colonel?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: No, Sir, I cannot really

Page 574

1 say if it's not – well, if it says Standing Order whatever
2 the number is, then it must be a Standing Order. If it's a
3 draft, then it's a draft. I'm not sure, Sir.

4 MR SEMENYA SC: It is merely being used
5 by POP as a guide, correct? Would you know?

6 LT-COL BOTHA: I won't know, Sir.

7 MR SEMENYA SC: Can I just read what the
8 heading of the document is? It reads, "A divisional
9 directive 20," in Roman figures - I'm told it's XX, not 20
10 in Roman figures, "-2012 POP Operational Standards." You
11 can accept that reading to be correct at least?

12 LT-COL BOTHA: If that's the official
13 document of the SA Police Service, I can presume that it's
14 correct.

15 MR SEMENYA SC: Thank you, Chair.

16 CHAIRPERSON: No further questions?

17 MR SEMENYA SC: No.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, have you got any
19 questions?

20 MR BURGER SC: Yes, thank you, Chair.
21 Colonel, my colleagues and I represent Lonmin in this
22 inquiry and with the permission of the Chair I want to
23 probe two issues with you in some more detail. One is the
24 chopper flight on the 16th and the second is the
25 Potchefstroom nine-day conference. Can I start with the

Page 575

1 first subject? Would it be correct for the Commission to
2 accept that on the 16th of August there was constant radio
3 communication between the JOC, the units in the area of the
4 koppie, and the SAPS helicopters?

5 LT-COL BOTHA: Just ask the question
6 again, sorry.

7 MR BURGER SC: Let me put it again. May
8 we assume that on the day of the 16th during the operation,
9 take it from 3 o'clock in the afternoon, there was constant
10 radio communication between the JOC on the one hand, the
11 operational units in the area of the koppie on the other
12 hand, and the helicopters in the air, operated by SAPS?

13 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if you say we must
14 assume it, then I cannot think that we can dispute it
15 because I don't think we can have such a big operation
16 without radio communication. I did say that I cannot
17 remember that we had constant comms, or my chopper had
18 constant comms with the JOC. I can't remember that.

19 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, I'll probe your
20 memory presently. I'm just trying to get the facts before
21 the Commission. We know for example that there was direct
22 contact between the JOC and your chopper because there was
23 an instruction given by Brigadier Van Zyl that you should
24 return. That was given by radio, I accept.

25 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, that was given by

Page 576

1 radio.

2 MR BURGER SC: Would it be correct that
3 the two people inside the chopper who spoke on the radio
4 would be firstly Brigadier Fritz, correct?

5 LT-COL BOTHA: So I did say that
6 Brigadier Fritz, I can remember that he did speak on the
7 radio at some stage. You can even hear it on the – but I
8 cannot remember what he said.

9 MR BURGER SC: And the second person
10 would be the pilot. He would know where to fly.

11 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Sir.

12 MR BURGER SC: Did Brigadier Fritz have
13 earphones or did he simply speak in a microphone and heard
14 the response on an open microphone?

15 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, he had earphones.

16 MR BURGER SC: Does that mean when he
17 spoke into the microphone, you could hear it sitting next
18 to him, but you couldn't hear what came back to him through
19 the earphones?

20 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, there was a lot of
21 talking. I heard some, I heard people talking in my
22 earphones.

23 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, let me put the
24 question again. I don't think you followed it. Brigadier
25 Fritz is sitting next to you. He's talking into a

Page 577

1 microphone. You can clearly hear what he says, but the
2 Commissioner must accept that you can't hear what comes
3 back to him because he's got earphones on. Is that
4 correct?

5 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I did not say that I
6 cannot hear what is coming back to him.

7 MR BURGER SC: So you could also hear
8 what was said to him, what instructions he got or
9 information he got from the other side?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: I could hear everything
11 that was said on the radio. We had, I did say also we had
12 difficulty with radio communication but I could hear what
13 was said.

14 MR BURGER SC: I see. So you could hear
15 what the brigadier was saying and the response he got, I
16 take it both from the units around the koppie and from the
17 JOC.

18 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I cannot recall that
19 Brigadier Fritz spoke specifically to the JOC or
20 specifically to people on, to specific people on the
21 ground. I know that he spoke on the radio. I cannot
22 remember whether it was, what was said.

23 MR BURGER SC: The function of Brigadier
24 Fritz is to direct the operation from the helicopter?

25 LT-COL BOTHA: I did say I don't know

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 578</p> <p>1 what the function of Brigadier Fritz was.</p> <p>2 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, you're a</p> <p>3 lieutenant-colonel in the South African Police Service.</p> <p>4 You've got 26 years service. What do you think was the</p> <p>5 function performed by Brigadier Fritz on that day in the</p> <p>6 helicopter?</p> <p>7 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I already said I</p> <p>8 do not know what the function of Brigadier Fritz was in the</p> <p>9 chopper.</p> <p>10 MR BURGER SC: I will make two</p> <p>11 submissions on that answer to the Commissioner and if you</p> <p>12 think it's unfair or incorrect, this will be the</p> <p>13 opportunity to say so. My first submission will be that</p> <p>14 Brigadier Fritz was clearly in charge of the chopper and</p> <p>15 had to direct the business of the chopper on that day. Do</p> <p>16 you want to comment on that?</p> <p>17 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot comment on that.</p> <p>18 I have said I don't know what the role of Brigadier Fritz</p> <p>19 was.</p> <p>20 CHAIRPERSON: You did also say that on</p> <p>21 one occasion at least he did give instructions to the – is</p> <p>22 that correct? Did he give instructions to the pilot or was</p> <p>23 it Brigadier Van Zyl? You said generally the pilot flew</p> <p>24 where he wanted to fly. You said at one point he received</p> <p>25 an instruction. Was that from Brigadier Van Zyl or</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 580</p> <p>1 LT-COL BOTHA: Brigadier Fritz.</p> <p>2 MR BURGER SC: In what capacity did he</p> <p>3 give that order?</p> <p>4 LT-COL BOTHA: As a capacity of the</p> <p>5 brigadier in the chopper.</p> <p>6 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, I was thinking</p> <p>7 about the role of a chopper in this situation and I could</p> <p>8 think of three roles to be played. Let me put them to you</p> <p>9 and if there are more, will you assist the Commission and</p> <p>10 identify the additional ones. The first role of a chopper</p> <p>11 will be to record events by video camera, by camera, very</p> <p>12 much in the fashion that you have done, and that would be a</p> <p>13 role of a chopper in the situation on the 16th of August.</p> <p>14 Can we accept that?</p> <p>15 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes Sir, because that was</p> <p>16 why I was in the air.</p> <p>17 MR BURGER SC: May we also accept that in</p> <p>18 performing that role, radio communication is pivotal</p> <p>19 because if you don't have radio communication, the chopper</p> <p>20 wouldn't know what to look for?</p> <p>21 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Sir.</p> <p>22 MR BURGER SC: The second role of a</p> <p>23 helicopter in this situation is to act as an aerial command</p> <p>24 post.</p> <p>25 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I'm not an</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 579</p> <p>1 Brigadier Fritz?</p> <p>2 LT-COL BOTHA: Because we moved away from</p> <p>3 the koppie I can remember that he said that we, there's a</p> <p>4 lot of air traffic, we must move away otherwise we might</p> <p>5 die.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Was that Brigadier Fritz</p> <p>7 who said that?</p> <p>8 LT-COL BOTHA: That was Brigadier Fritz.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Sorry, Mr</p> <p>10 Burger.</p> <p>11 MR BURGER SC: And the second submission</p> <p>12 I will make is that your answer that you did not know what</p> <p>13 Brigadier Fritz was doing in the helicopter, is not a</p> <p>14 reliable answer.</p> <p>15 LT-COL BOTHA: Just say again? Sorry.</p> <p>16 MR BURGER SC: I will submit at the end</p> <p>17 of this proceeding that your answer to the Commission that</p> <p>18 you did not know what Brigadier Fritz's role in the</p> <p>19 helicopter was on the 16th of August 2012, is an unreliable</p> <p>20 answer.</p> <p>21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can just stick to</p> <p>22 my point. I do not know what the role of Brigadier Fritz</p> <p>23 was next to me in the chopper.</p> <p>24 MR BURGER SC: Who gave the order for the</p> <p>25 stun grenades to be fired?</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 581</p> <p>1 operational person. I cannot say that the chopper will be</p> <p>2 an aerial command post.</p> <p>3 MR BURGER SC: Do you accept, Colonel,</p> <p>4 that it could have been a role performed by the chopper in</p> <p>5 which you were on the 16th of August to act as an aerial</p> <p>6 command post to give directions and strategic input to the</p> <p>7 ground forces? Do you accept that?</p> <p>8 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot accept it because</p> <p>9 I don't know what the role of Brigadier Fritz was and I</p> <p>10 don't, I went into the air to go and make a video.</p> <p>11 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, do you tell the</p> <p>12 Commission that you're in the helicopter; the first thing</p> <p>13 you see is a number of dead bodies on the ground. You're</p> <p>14 in a helicopter for 40 minutes and the trip ends when</p> <p>15 there's a command to say we must get out of here, we're</p> <p>16 going to get killed, and you don't have any idea of what</p> <p>17 the brigadier next to you is saying in taking part in the</p> <p>18 process?</p> <p>19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I said when I started</p> <p>20 the video I did not see any dead people on the ground. I</p> <p>21 saw police vehicles moving. What I also said is I cannot,</p> <p>22 there was a lot of talking, I cannot remember what</p> <p>23 Brigadier Fritz or anyone else said. I just can't</p> <p>24 remember.</p> <p>25 MR BURGER SC: I want to put the third</p>

Page 582

1 function of a helicopter, because I want to, trying to
2 explore to what extent these functions were performed on
3 the day. The third function is that of crowd control
4 performed by a helicopter, and I put it in the context that
5 if you put a helicopter above a crowd of people, that might
6 well be inhibiting them to do what they're busy with and it
7 might also serve as a place to launch a stun grenade from
8 and to do crowd control from the helicopter, would you
9 accept that?

10 [12:31] LT-COL BOTHA: I can accept it but I'm
11 not an operational person to say that yes, I can use a
12 chopper for crowd control.

13 MR BURGER SC: Can you think of any other
14 function to be performed by a helicopter on that day or can
15 we stay with these three functions?

16 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot think of any
17 other function.

18 MR BURGER SC: Now let us just decide how
19 this helicopter performed its functions on the day in
20 question. The first function, that of recording events, we
21 know in your evidence that the first incident at scene 1
22 was not recorded.

23 LT-COL BOTHA: In hindsight we can say
24 that it was not recorded, yes.

25 MR BURGER SC: We know that the second

Page 583

1 scene was not recorded because you didn't know about it.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: As I have said, that I've
3 recorded the koppie at some stage. I do not know at what
4 stage the scene happened, so it could've been recorded, it
5 could not have been recorded. We look at the video, I
6 can't say.

7 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, does the
8 Commission have to understand, in view of your evidence,
9 that you did not know what was happening on the ground,
10 that the Brigadier did not tell you that people were being
11 killed at scene 2 while you were in the chopper?

12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, as far as I can
13 remember there was no conversation on the radio that
14 anyone, that there's a shooting or a second scene or
15 killings at the koppie.

16 MR BURGER SC: Were you made aware while
17 you were in the helicopter that some 16 people had been
18 killed at scene 1?

19 LT-COL BOTHA: I became aware of dead
20 people on the ground when Colonel Vermaak said he can see
21 two people, two dead – two bodies on the ground at the
22 kraal. Then I realised there was a shooting on the ground.
23 I did not, there was – according to me, I can't remember
24 any conversation that said that people were killed.

25 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, does that mean

Page 584

1 that you're in a police helicopter on the 16th of August
2 during a period when some 31 people lose their lives on the
3 ground and the people in the helicopter are blissfully
4 unaware of what's happening on the ground?

5 LT-COL BOTHA: That is what I'm saying, I
6 did not now.

7 MR BURGER SC: And may we assume that it
8 is inconceivable that Brigadier Fritz and/or the pilot
9 would know about these tragedies and not telling you about
10 it?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: They definitely would've
12 told me about it.

13 MR BURGER SC: Just before I want to put
14 to you what we will argue on behalf of the performance of
15 the first function, that is the observation function on the
16 day in question, can I just get clarity? You arrive at the
17 JOC at three o'clock that afternoon.

18 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I said I can't
19 confirm it. It can be a bit before, a bit after three, but
20 it must be more or less at three o'clock.

21 MR BURGER SC: I accept that. We know
22 from documents produced or read to you by my learned
23 friends on my left that the plan was to commence the
24 operation at 3:30 that afternoon, you heard that?

25 LT-COL BOTHA: I've heard that.

Page 585

1 MR BURGER SC: What did you do between
2 three o'clock and 3:30 that afternoon at the JOC?

3 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I wasn't at the JOC.
4 I met Brigadier Van Zyl outside, then I went – I stood
5 outside. I could have had a cool drink, then I went to the
6 chopper and I waited because the instruction was, when the
7 chopper goes into the air you must go with it.

8 MR BURGER SC: And was the chopper ready
9 to fly when you came to it shortly after three o'clock?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, the chopper was
11 standing on the parking, I think if we can call it a
12 parking ground, landing strip, whatever. The pilot and the
13 co-pilot were there.

14 MR BURGER SC: Let me ask you the obvious
15 question. There's a major operation starting at 3:30,
16 there's a chopper, there's a pilot, there's a substitute
17 for the pilot, you're ready, why doesn't the chopper fly?

18 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot answer that, sir.

19 MR BURGER SC: We will submit at the end
20 that the police chopper on that day failed to perform its
21 function in recording the events on the ground as it was
22 supposed to do. If you want to comment, you may. If you
23 do not have a comment it's your free will not to respond.

24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, according to my duty
25 I feel that I did what I had to. I videographed what I

Page 586

1 could see on the ground. I videographed the people being
 2 dispersed, people in informal settlements regrouping,
 3 people running, people walking. According to me, that was
 4 what I was supposed to do. People were dispersed.
 5 MR BURGER SC: Now the facts I will rely
 6 upon for that submission are briefly the following. There
 7 are two tragedies happening, you don't record either of
 8 them and you take about 80% of your time to film what is,
 9 with great respect, irrelevant.
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot comment on that.
 11 MR BURGER SC: We will also submit that,
 12 to the extent that there was an aerial command post
 13 function, that was not performed because on the facts
 14 before the Commission, Brigadier Fritz did not know about
 15 the killings on the ground.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: If that's your – sorry, if
 17 that is your submission, I'm not going to comment on that.
 18 MR BURGER SC: And on the third possible
 19 function, namely that of crowd control, we do not have
 20 enough facts yet to make a submission so may I ask you, why
 21 was it necessary to fire stun grenades at the crowd when it
 22 was done?
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that's an operational
 24 call that was made by Brigadier Fritz. I don't know,
 25 you'll have to ask him.

Page 587

1 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, just help us.
 2 You're in the helicopter. Where in the process does that
 3 take place in your 42 minutes of recording? Where is that
 4 demand given? How high above the ground is the helicopter
 5 and how big is the crowd to be scared off? Help us on
 6 that, please.
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I think the first is
 8 – and now I'm under correction – on the video more or less
 9 seven minutes, I'm not sure, in the video. It can be 13 or
 10 seven, I cannot – I can't remember now. I do not know how
 11 high the chopper was. I mean we're above the ground, I
 12 don't know how high we are. And according to me, the crowd
 13 wasn't big that had to be dispersed.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: Did I understand you to say
 15 it was the first stun grenade? Were the two stun grenades
 16 fired off –
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: - at the same time, or was
 19 one fired off at one stage and the second at another stage?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: One at one stage and one
 21 at another stage.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: I understood you to say the
 23 first one was either seven or 13 minutes into the video, is
 24 that right?
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes. I cannot remember

Page 588

1 now but it is at some stage in the early stages in the
 2 video.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: And the second?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: Phew, I can't remember
 5 now, it's either seven or 13 or 13 or 25, I can't remember
 6 sir.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: And how big were the crowds
 8 that were to be dispersed on those two occasions?
 9 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, the first – the first
 10 stun grenade was a very small group of people. The second
 11 stun grenade, I did not see a crowd.
 12 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, we know there
 13 were three other helicopters in the air on that day,
 14 correct?
 15 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct.
 16 MR BURGER SC: May the Commission assume
 17 that, on probability, they would all have carried camera or
 18 video equipment?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: I don't know, sir.
 20 MR BURGER SC: No, but you were at
 21 Potchefstroom for nine days and I'm sure that because you
 22 go there as the video person in the helicopter, the first
 23 thing you ask around is, do I have comrades, video people
 24 in helicopters, can we compare notes? Now what's the
 25 answer you get to that at Potchefstroom?

Page 589

1 LT-COL BOTHA: I did not ask any such
 2 question at Potchefstroom.
 3 MR BURGER SC: I want to deal with
 4 Potchefstroom separately but let me just ask you this. The
 5 format during the nine days, would that be a meeting of all
 6 the policemen together in a room?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: There were a lot of
 8 policemen together, yes. Some sub-meetings, some big
 9 meetings, there were a lot of policemen.
 10 MR BURGER SC: Did you attend all the big
 11 meetings?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, most – yes, let's say
 13 yes.
 14 MR BURGER SC: Now I'm paraphrasing but
 15 you'll forgive me. You're for nine days in big meetings,
 16 do you ever hear anybody asking whether there was a chopper
 17 with a camera or a video apart from your one?
 18 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did not hear that
 19 anyone asked if anyone else than me made a video.
 20 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, as there was no
 21 Lonmin representative at Potchefstroom, I must put to you
 22 there was no Lonmin helicopter in the air on the 16th of
 23 August in the area of the koppie, so you accept that?
 24 MR BURGER SC: Sir, I do know there was
 25 an extra helicopter in the air. I cannot say if it was a

Page 590

1 Lonmin or not a Lonmin. If you tell me it wasn't a Lonmin
2 one then I will accept it.

3 MR BURGER SC: And I also put to you
4 there was no civil helicopter in the air instructed by
5 Lonmin.

6 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot comment on that,
7 I don't know.

8 MR BURGER SC: I just want to briefly
9 understand the instruction you get from Brigadier Van Zyl
10 at the beginning of the flight and when you arrived back.
11 At the beginning of the flight was Brigadier Van Zyl in a
12 hurry, was he flustered, was he anxious that you should get
13 into the air or did he give you an instruction as you would
14 expect from a Brigadier in the normal course of events?

15 LT-COL BOTHA: He gave me an instruction
16 as in the normal course of events.

17 MR BURGER SC: And on your return, can
18 you just picture for the Commission what was said on the
19 ground when you meet Brigadier Van Zyl? What did he tell
20 you?

21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, Brigadier Van Zyl
22 told me that there's a lot of people being killed and we
23 need to get people in that can process the scenes.

24 MR BURGER SC: No, but clearly the next
25 thing he asks you is, did you record it, do you have film

Page 591

1 of that for us?

2 LT-COL BOTHA: I did tell him that I made
3 a video recording but I didn't know when the shooting
4 happened so I didn't know if I recorded it.

5 MR BURGER SC: Try to help us and
6 remember what you told him of the filming?

7 LT-COL BOTHA: I told him I made a video
8 recording but – that is what I told him, I made a video
9 recording, because I saw – remember I sat in the chopper, I
10 saw people running, I saw police vehicles moving, that is
11 what I recorded and that is, I told him that I made a video
12 recording. I did not tell him that I made a video
13 recording of shootings or killings or anything like that
14 because I mean I didn't know if I recorded it or not. The
15 first one I know now and then something must've happened, I
16 did not record it. The second one I did not know about.

17 MR BURGER SC: I have difficulty
18 understanding the evidence, bear with me. You get off a
19 helicopter and you're told by a senior police officer that
20 there has been killing of many people. You find that a
21 most disturbing piece of news to receive, I take it,
22 correct?

23 LT-COL BOTHA: It was quite disturbing.

24 MR BURGER SC: Absolutely. You then tell
25 the Brigadier that you have some film footage in your

Page 592

1 camera.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, because
3 he sent me there to go and make a video.

4 MR BURGER SC: And you say to me that the
5 next question doesn't follow, did you video the killings,
6 did you see the killings?

7 [12:51] LT-COL BOTHA: The Brigadier did not ask
8 me if I did see or videograph killings.

9 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, as I understand
10 the sources of your information in this case, information
11 which you use to tell the Commission what you know, the
12 first would be Warrant Officer Opperman and that's about
13 the killing of the two security officers on the 12th of
14 August, is that correct?

15 LT-COL BOTHA: What do you mean by
16 sources, sorry?

17 MR BURGER SC: People would tell you what
18 had happened on the scene.

19 LT-COL BOTHA: No, why I know there were
20 people killed on the 12th is because I had to make an aerial
21 or a Google map for the evidence leaders and Inspector –
22 Warrant Officer Opperman took me to the scene so that I can
23 get a GPS reading.

24 MR BURGER SC: And then we know you were
25 invited to the Potch nine day seminar.

Page 593

1 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I was there, sir.

2 MR BURGER SC: What was the format of the
3 presentations during the day – and let us first understand
4 the big meeting, the plenary session. What would typically
5 happen in a day's plenary session at Potchefstroom?

6 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, you'll have to
7 explain plenary to me.

8 MR BURGER SC: A big meeting, the big
9 meeting where everybody is present, die algemene
10 vergadering.

11 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, as I've said, there
12 was a lot of discussions around what happened, to see what
13 footage is available, all that stuff. So that was
14 literally the – I want to say what happened in all the
15 meetings.

16 MR BURGER SC: Yes. Colonel, and just
17 before the luncheon adjournment can I just ascertain this
18 from you, am I correct to think that the two main events
19 being discussed during that nine day period would be the
20 killing of 16 people at scene 1 and the killing of 13
21 people at scene 2?

22 LT-COL BOTHA: That made out part of the
23 discussions, yes. Can I just say it's 14 people at scene
24 2.

25 MR BURGER SC: Yes, I think in the end it

1 was 16 and 18 but certain people died afterwards, so don't
 2 hold me to the number. Chair, is it convenient now -
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Is it a convenient stage to
 4 take the adjournment? The Commission will adjourn for
 5 lunch. In view of the fact that it's five to one by my
 6 watch, we'll start at five to two.
 7 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES]
 8 [14:02] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. Mr
 9 Burger, you were still cross-examining. Kolonel, u is nog
 10 steeds onder eed. Yes, Mr Burger.
 11 MR BURGER SC: Thank you, Chairman.
 12 Colonel, before the luncheon adjournment we were discussing
 13 the events at Potchefstroom and that nine-day event, and
 14 you and I agreed that two of the matters pivotal to the
 15 debate were the two incidents on the 16th of October, to
 16 which we've referred to as scene 1 and scene 2 - 16 August
 17 2012 - and I think we ended off by your answer to say that
 18 was part of the discussion. Can I pick it up from there
 19 and ask you what else in general terms were discussed
 20 during that period?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, in general terms the
 22 whole situation that became, that led to the incident, let
 23 me call it the incidents that took place, what happened,
 24 what the police did, stuff like that. That was what was
 25 discussed.

1 MR BURGER SC: Yes. But do I understand
 2 it correct that to the extent that we look at the events of
 3 the 9th to the 16th of August, pivotal in that discussion
 4 would have been what happened at scene 1 and what happened
 5 at scene 2?
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot say what happened
 7 at scene 1 or what happened at scene 2. What was looked at
 8 is what footage is available, what is available, what
 9 happened, things like that, ja. But I mean it was
 10 discussed.
 11 MR BURGER SC: And may we accept that you
 12 were invited because of your role behind the video camera
 13 in the chopper on the 16th in particular?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: I think we can accept it.
 15 MR BURGER SC: Yes. Now what was your
 16 contribution to the seminar? You're in front of the top
 17 brass of the South African Police, quite an important
 18 occasion, a very tragic event being inquired into, and your
 19 role is a video camera in the chopper. How did you present
 20 it during that nine-day period?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I said I cannot
 22 remember that we looked at the video. I cannot recall that
 23 we looked at the video. I must also say that I represented
 24 the LCRCs of the province there. Obviously the crime
 25 scenes were processed by members of the LCRC and there were

1 certain questions and feedback had to be given.
 2 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, what was your
 3 contribution during that period of nine days? You
 4 personally, Colonel Botha's contribution, what did you say
 5 to the people there?
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: The role that the LCRCs
 7 played in the processing of all these crimes.
 8 MR BURGER SC: No, but you speak to
 9 police generals. You don't have to teach them Criminology
 10 101. They're clearly interested in what happened from your
 11 vantage point in the helicopter on the 16th. Let's get
 12 serious on this now.
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, no-one asked me to
 14 explain what happened from the chopper on the 16th.
 15 MR BURGER SC: As I understand your
 16 evidence, you know of only one video recording of that
 17 scene and that's the one you took.
 18 LT-COL BOTHA: Of one police video that
 19 was taken, that was the one that I took, yes.
 20 MR BURGER SC: Correct. Do we have to
 21 accept then that you being the only person who took a
 22 video, you were not asked during a nine-day period about
 23 the video, in Potchefstroom?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, as I said, I cannot
 25 recall if we watched the video or not. I can, no-one

1 specifically interrogated or asked me about the video. My,
 2 the aerial photos that was taken by Warrant-Officer Venter
 3 was actually a discussion point, but not the video.
 4 MR BURGER SC: Did you go forward and
 5 give a lecture, or were you asked by people in a hall
 6 questions, or how did your debriefing take place?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: I did not go forward to
 8 give a lecture. If I was asked about crime scenes and the
 9 processing of crime scenes, then I gave feedback.
 10 MR BURGER SC: Were you asked, Colonel?
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: About what members of the
 12 LCRC did at the crime scenes?
 13 MR BURGER SC: No, about you in the
 14 helicopter taking a video. Were you asked anything on
 15 that?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: As far as I recall, no
 17 Sir.
 18 MR BURGER SC: In that nine-day period
 19 were questions asked about the first shooting at scene 1?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: It was a discussion point,
 21 yes.
 22 MR BURGER SC: And what was discussed?
 23 Who spoke and what was the outcome of the discussion?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I've already
 25 said that a lot of things were said, a lot of things

Page 598

1 happened afterwards, and there was a lot of people talking,
 2 there was a lot of commanders with. I cannot remember
 3 specifics and what was said and who made specific points
 4 and statements and stuff like that.

5 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, just give us the
 6 gist of what was said by the top brass of the Police about
 7 scene 1 when 16 people were killed, at Potchefstroom. What
 8 was said?

9 LT-COL BOTHA: Just give me the, the gist
 10 of what?

11 MR BURGER SC: What was said, just in
 12 general terms, about scene 1?

13 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can't remember what
 14 was said about specific scenes, who said what. There was a
 15 lot of people talking, members make, made statements.
 16 There were legal representatives, and there was a lot of
 17 things that happened in between. I can't remember.

18 MR BURGER SC: Now scene 2 would really
 19 have made you very inquisitive because you were not aware
 20 that scene 2 was playing out while you were in the
 21 helicopter. Is that correct?

22 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I was not, Sir.

23 MR BURGER SC: By the time you get to
 24 Potchefstroom you know that 13 people lost their lives at
 25 the Klein Koppie.

Page 599

1 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Sir.

2 MR BURGER SC: May the Commission assume
 3 that you as a citizen of the land would now like to
 4 understand what happened there? Not as a policeman, but as
 5 a concern citizen.

6 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that was obviously
 7 part of the discussions, and again, I'm not trying to be
 8 difficult, I cannot remember everything that was said. I
 9 cannot remember all the things that was done. I was there
 10 to brief the, or not to brief, to give feedback on what
 11 processes was followed by the members of the LCRCs, if they
 12 have to I'll phone them and ask them and the processing of
 13 the scenes. I, it's not that I wasn't interested. It was
 14 obviously discussed.

15 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, take us into your
 16 confidence. I don't want detail. Tell us anything that
 17 was discussed about scene 2 during that nine-day period,
 18 anything you remember.

19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can remember that
 20 people had to determine who was at scene 2, what happened
 21 at scene 2, stuff like that. I mean I cannot remember that
 22 the guys said well I was here and I was here, because I
 23 don't even know the members that were there.

24 MR BURGER SC: Can I jog your memory and
 25 see whether you – you have a memory which becomes clearer

Page 600

1 if it is led into a version. I'm asking you to have a look
 2 at page 19 of 30 of the opening statement by SAPS in this
 3 matter. Have you got that in front of you? Now Colonel,
 4 to orientate you, you'll see on page 1 this is part of the
 5 opening statement on behalf of the South African Police
 6 Service. It was addressed to the Commission at the
 7 beginning of these proceedings, and on page 19 in paragraph
 8 45 we are told what we are likely to hear about the events
 9 at scene 2. I want to read it to you and ask you whether
 10 you remember that this was discussed at Potchefstroom.
 11 45.4, in fact to lead in I start three lines earlier,
 12 "Water canons were used to disperse the protesters. Some
 13 dispersed westwards and through the TRT line led by Captain
 14 Kidd, without incident." Does that jog your memory?

15 LT-COL BOTHA: I know that Captain Kidd
 16 was there. I can't remember that someone had said that
 17 water canons were - we, I saw the water canons on the
 18 ground when I was in the chopper. I can't remember that
 19 someone said well water canons were brought in and they
 20 were dispersed, but I mean I saw them on the video.

21 MR BURGER SC: "Others remained obdurate
 22 and police officers heard shots being fired from inside the
 23 koppie crevices and bushes. Believing this to be fire from
 24 the protesters, some of the police officers returned fire
 25 with sharp ammunition. Other police officers returned fire

Page 601

1 against specific protesters they had seen firing at them."
 2 Do you remember that discussion at Potchefstroom?

3 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, can I just say that
 4 the meeting a lot of times broke up in smaller groups which
 5 I had, which I did not attend to. I sat with my computer
 6 and then I did some of my work. I can't recall that this
 7 was discussed in the big meeting. It could have been
 8 discussed in a smaller meeting. I can't recall this.

9 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, the last portion
 10 I want to read with you, let's read it together again,
 11 45.5, "The evidence will be that some of the 13 protesters
 12 who were shot and killed at koppie 3 had charged at the
 13 police officers with dangerous sharp weapons and had been
 14 shot in self-defence. These are accounted for below.
 15 Others could have been killed when police officers returned
 16 sharp fire, believing shots to have been fired from the
 17 bushes and crevices in the koppies by protesters. The
 18 police officers are prepared to accept that they may have
 19 been responding to friendly fire, believing it to be fire
 20 from protesters." Does that ring a bell with you?

21 LT-COL BOTHA: The first part does, yes.

22 MR BURGER SC: Tell us, please.

23 LT-COL BOTHA: Okay, I don't there was
 24 any discussion in the meeting, but I do know that Captain
 25 Kidd or some of his members were involved and because I

Page 602

1 heard it, I must have heard it at the meeting from him,
2 that a person stormed at them with sharp weapons and that
3 he was then shot. I can recall that.

4 MR BURGER SC: The purpose of
5 Potchefstroom was to prepare two reports, one a report to
6 the National Commissioner of Police, and the second a
7 presentation to the Commission. Is that correct?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir no, the purpose was,
9 as far as I can – well no, it was a presentation for the
10 National Commissioner and then a presentation for the
11 Commission. That is why the legal representatives of the
12 South African Police Service were also present.

13 MR BURGER SC: And what was the
14 conclusion reached in these two presentations by the
15 Police? They now report the first one to their
16 Commissioner. What did they say, that everything went
17 perfect and they're very proud of their performance, or
18 what was the conclusion?

19 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can just say that
20 the presentation wasn't finalised after that nine days, so
21 I do not know what the conclusion was.

22 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, eight and a half
23 out of the nine days you're there. You drive back after
24 that period home now. Is the belief of the Police there
25 that everything went fine, or that things went wrong?

Page 603

1 What's your – what do you take away from that nine-day
2 course?

3 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, what I take away from
4 the nine-day thing is, that course, is that it was an
5 unfortunate incident that happened, 34 people were killed.
6 The Police were involved in it. I cannot say that we felt
7 we did right or we did wrong. I, it's just not my
8 decision.

9 MR BURGER SC: You seem to be unable to
10 tell us whether your video was shown, but you told the
11 Commission that other video material was shown. Can you
12 particularise that, what other video material was shown
13 during that period?

14 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, that's the
15 photos the witness spoke about, not another video.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, the evidence is that –
17 Mr Semanya is right. What he said was what was seen were,
18 was other visual material, namely the photographs which
19 Sergeant, or Warrant-Officer Venter took with his digital
20 camera. He did not say, as far as I can recall, according
21 to my notes, that any other videos were shown. So perhaps
22 you could reformulate the question.

23 MR BURGER SC: My notes stand to be
24 corrected then. I recorded it differently, but then we
25 immediately accept that's the position. Can I ask you was

Page 604

1 any other video material shown during that nine-day period?

2 [14:22] LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I can at least recall
3 one. There might be more, but I can recall one.

4 MR BURGER SC: I thought so. Tell us
5 what it was.

6 LT-COL BOTHA: It was the video footage
7 of the – I don't want to call it strikers, but of the
8 miners that, on the Monday the 13th, that were next to the
9 railway line where General Mpembe - I cannot say negotiated
10 with them because I don't understand the language - had a
11 conversation with them and that was it. I can recall that
12 video being shown.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Are we to understand that
14 video material was shown, at least two items of video
15 material were shown, one being your video of the events of
16 the 16th, as far as one can see them on your video, the
17 other being the video of the events or incident on the 13th
18 by the railway line in that field were you found certain –

19 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I cannot recall
20 that we looked at my video. I do recall clearly –

21 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, you didn't look at
22 your video.

23 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I can't recall that.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I'm sorry, I'm wrong.

25 LT-COL BOTHA: We, I can –

Page 605

1 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I'm incorrect.

2 You did say you couldn't remember if your video was shown.
3 What you can remember is that the video of the 13th was
4 shown.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I can remember that,
6 Sir.

7 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

8 MR BURGER SC: Your video camera's time
9 mechanism is wrong, is defective, correct?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, it's not
11 defective; it was just eight minutes out.

12 MR BURGER SC: Do you then go to
13 Potchefstroom, make your contribution, come back and you
14 don't realise that your video camera's time is eight
15 minutes out?

16 LT-COL BOTHA: When I came back I asked
17 myself, it was in that period that we were in
18 Potchefstroom, I asked myself but how is it possible that
19 it looks like I'm late, but, according to the video time,
20 but the video shows the, what I videographed, and then I
21 realised, because the 1st of September I was still in
22 Potchefstroom, then I realised but the video time is out.

23 MR BURGER SC: Colonel, you make me doubt
24 my own notes now because I seem to remember your evidence
25 of this morning was to the effect that it was after the

Page 606

1 Chairman asked you questions last Tuesday that you were
2 puzzled, you drove back and the penny dropped and you
3 discovered that your video camera's timing mechanism was
4 eight minutes out.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, that wasn't my
6 evidence.

7 MR BURGER SC: Do we have to deduce from
8 that evidence that you had your video camera in Potch?
9 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I had my video camera
10 in Potch.

11 MR BURGER SC: And the film?
12 LT-COL BOTHA: It's not a film, it's a
13 CD, yes.

14 MR BURGER SC: And the CD. Can I ask you
15 this, at Potchefstroom do you remember any debate about the
16 role of the Department of Mining & Energy Affairs in the
17 events between the 6th and the, the 9th and the 16th of
18 August?

19 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, I cannot remember
20 such a debate.

21 MR BURGER SC: Do you remember any debate
22 about the role of Lonmin in the events of the 9th to the
23 16th of August?
24 LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, I cannot recall
25 something like that.

Page 607

1 MR BURGER SC: Just in conclusion, we are
2 puzzled by the fact that in Potchefstroom your recollection
3 is that the photographs taken by Sergeant Venter are used,
4 but not the main piece of evidence, the video recording
5 made by Lieutenant-Colonel. Can you give an explanation
6 for that?
7 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir. If you have a
8 look – and I think you've all got my photos – if you have a
9 look at the photos, the photos clearly show where the
10 police vehicles are situated on the scene and where the, or
11 you can even see policemen behind vehicles on those photos
12 and why I remember that is I was requested to go and
13 enlarge them for members, A1-size, so that they can have a
14 look at it and discuss it in smaller meetings. I know that
15 they broke up and in smaller meetings they had a look at
16 it.

17 MR BURGER SC: And that despite the fact
18 that the main area of interest was and should have been
19 scene 1 and scene 2, not the parking of police vans.

20 LT-COL BOTHA: No, you misunderstood me.
21 The vehicles that you can see in the photos are around
22 koppie number 2. There are aerial photos of that. You can
23 see that, I think it's available to all the parties, and I
24 was requested by General Naidoo to enlarge it A1-size so
25 that the people can have a look at it and that they, then

Page 608

1 they can discuss it.

2 MR BURGER SC: Thank you, Chair.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip, would you like to –
4 MR TIP SC: Yes, thank you, Chair.
5 CHAIRPERSON: - do you have further
6 cross-examination, essentially arising from the video?
7 MR TIP SC: Arising from the video,
8 purely that, and one aspect only. Colonel, I want to
9 pursue with you your evidence that you can't recall whether
10 or not this video that we've seen here was shown during the
11 session at Potchefstroom.

12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I cannot recall that
13 we looked at it. It's, I just cannot remember it.

14 MR TIP SC: Now let us just establish
15 when that session took place, from when to when?
16 LT-COL BOTHA: I think it is from the
17 last Monday in August till the, I'm not sure if it is then
18 the first Friday or the second Friday in September. I'm
19 not sure.

20 MR TIP SC: Yes, very well. But that is
21 in recent time, isn't it? Not a long time ago.

22 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.

23 MR TIP SC: You told us earlier that this
24 video that you had produced from the helicopter was the
25 very first time in your 26-year career of taking a video of

Page 609

1 a live operation. Is that correct?
2 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Sir.
3 MR TIP SC: It wasn't a minor piece, it
4 was 41 minutes long.
5 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Sir.
6 MR TIP SC: A few weeks later you are at
7 a session in Potchefstroom with, as my learned colleague Mr
8 Burger put it, with the top brass of the South African
9 Police Services in attendance.
10 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, Sir.
11 MR TIP SC: Now I should have thought,
12 Colonel, that if you displayed your 41-minute video to the
13 top officers of the South African Police Service, that that
14 would have been something that you would most certainly
15 have recalled in detail.

16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I do recall that I
17 gave the video to Lieutenant-Colonel Scott. If it was
18 showed in the, in my absence or not, I'm not sure. I
19 cannot recall that we looked at the video. That means we
20 looked it or we didn't look at it. I cannot recall that we
21 looked at the video.

22 MR TIP SC: Yes, I am challenging the
23 credibility of what you say about that, and I'll repeat
24 that it is to me inconceivable that a person in your
25 position who is in the company of the most senior officers

Page 610

1 of the country and who shows a video, would not remember
 2 it, and that when you say you can't recall whether or not
 3 it was shown, you are not being frank with this Commission.
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I cannot say
 5 something that I cannot remember. If I can't, if I don't
 6 remember, I don't remember.
 7 MR TIP SC: The evidence was given
 8 yesterday, and a number of questions were put around it and
 9 you fully agreed that the very purpose of making a video of
 10 this nature of an operation scene was so that there would
 11 be a reliable audiovisual source of information for a
 12 review that would be subsequently taken. Do you remember
 13 that?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: I can remember that I said
 15 I had to make the video. I cannot remember that we said it
 16 must be for a review.
 17 MR TIP SC: Colonel, I'm not going to
 18 spend time debating my recollection of your evidence with
 19 you on that point. I'm just going to put it to you that it
 20 is very clear from the evidence as a whole that the purpose
 21 of making such a video is to have it available for scrutiny
 22 when an evaluation is undertaken of the event subsequently.
 23 Do you disagree with that?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I don't disagree with
 25 it.

Page 611

1 MR TIP SC: And let me remind you that
 2 Brigadier Van Zyl specifically requested you to go and make
 3 that video, presumably for that very purpose. Is that not
 4 correct?
 5 LT-COL BOTHA: He asked me to make a
 6 video and if we then have to presume it's for that purpose,
 7 then it might be correct.
 8 MR TIP SC: Brigadier Van Zyl was at
 9 Potchefstroom?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 11 MR TIP SC: He knew very well that you
 12 had made this video.
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, Sir.
 14 MR TIP SC: Did he offer it for the
 15 attention of the senior officers of the Police?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Not as far as I can
 17 recollect. I gave the video to Colonel Scott.
 18 MR TIP SC: And I want to suggest to you
 19 that the senior officers of the South African Police
 20 Service are also well aware of the need for video material
 21 to be made of operation scenes, and for that material to be
 22 scrutinised in a subsequent review of what took place. Do
 23 you agree?
 24 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry, just repeat the
 25 question?

Page 612

1 MR TIP SC: Yes, with pleasure. I'm
 2 suggesting to you that the senior officers of the South
 3 African Police who were in attendance at Potchefstroom were
 4 all as aware of you of the importance of looking at
 5 audiovisual material for the purpose of examining what took
 6 place at a scene of controversy. Is that clear?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: That is clear, that it is
 8 a suggestion. I cannot really confirm or not confirm.
 9 What I can say is that's why I gave the video to Colonel
 10 Scott. He collected all the footage, all the videos,
 11 everything from us.
 12 MR TIP SC: Are we to understand your
 13 evidence as implying that none, not one of the senior
 14 officers made a specific request for all audiovisual
 15 material to be produced?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir no, we were requested
 17 at the meeting to give all our footage and all our photos
 18 that was taken that's available to Colonel Scott and,
 19 because he collected all the evidence.
 20 MR TIP SC: Was Colonel Scott present
 21 when that request came from the senior officers?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes Sir, he was present.
 23 MR TIP SC: So we are to understand that
 24 Colonel Scott had your audiovisual material that senior
 25 officers asked for anything of the sort, and he failed to

Page 613

1 produce it for their scrutiny and attention?
 2 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I don't know if he
 3 showed it to them at another stage or in my absence or
 4 whenever. I don't know what, I mean I gave it to him.
 5 MR TIP SC: You know, Colonel Botha, from
 6 time to time you appear to seek an escape by saying well
 7 perhaps it wasn't in my presence that something happened,
 8 but I'm going to suggest to you that that can't possibly be
 9 the case here. You were the person who made the film,
 10 correct?
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, Sir.
 12 MR TIP SC: And you are suggesting that
 13 perhaps it was played in a sub-room to a sub-group without
 14 anybody telling you or inviting you to come along and to
 15 give whatever commentary you could to elucidate it?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that is not what I'm
 17 suggesting. What I'm saying is I cannot recall that the
 18 video was played. If it was played in my absence, that is
 19 a possibility, but I don't think that's an escape route.
 20 MR TIP SC: You can give us an insight
 21 into the thinking of senior police officers, I'm sure. If
 22 they had a 41-minute video of a highly controversial event,
 23 are you suggesting that they'd be content to look at it in
 24 a viewing without the person present who had filmed it and
 25 who could give them commentary and explain what was being

Page 614

1 shot?

2 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip, I'm not sure that

3 he's saying that. He's saying it's a possibility, but

4 there's another possibility and that's that Lieutenant

5 Scott had already, Colonel Scott had already told them, or

6 told them after they called for material that he'd seen it

7 and took the case no further, and other questions would

8 flow from that, that is another possibility, to be fair.

9 But I'm not sure that pressing him on this restricted line

10 is necessarily fair or helpful in getting to the truth in

11 the matter.

12 [14:42] MR TIP SC: Well, Mr Chair, that really

13 concludes the points that I wanted to raise in any event,

14 the central propositions have been put. Colonel Botha, I

15 just want to take a sideways step and to go back to the 16th

16 of August. We know that you were in the last chopper to go

17 into the air.

18 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir.

19 MR TIP SC: And that you were in the

20 vicinity of that helicopter for a good length of time

21 before you took off at about 15:53.

22 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir.

23 MR TIP SC: Can you give us an indication

24 of when the other three helicopters took off?

25 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, no, I can't remember.

Page 615

1 I cannot remember if they were on the ground when I got

2 there, if some of them were still – or already in the air.

3 I think when I stood at my – when I came to our chopper,

4 that was the only chopper that was there.

5 MR TIP SC: So we can conclude from that,

6 that they had gone into the air quite some time before you

7 did with the chopper that you embarked on?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: I was at the chopper for a

9 good 10 minutes or so and if I recall correctly, we were

10 the only chopper that was still there, sir.

11 MR TIP SC: Lastly, you saw yesterday

12 when we viewed your 41 minute video that there was an

13 excerpt from a second video that was shown as well.

14 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir.

15 MR TIP SC: We observed it for five or

16 six minutes, you will recall that.

17 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir.

18 MR TIP SC: It was clearly taken from

19 another helicopter other than yours.

20 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, that wasn't the

21 chopper that I was in.

22 MR TIP SC: And it appeared to focus on

23 the koppie during the events of 16 August, is that correct?

24 LT-COL BOTHA: That's correct, sir.

25 MR TIP SC: Was that video produced at

Page 616

1 Potchefstroom?

2 LT-COL BOTHA: The first time I've seen

3 the video was here, sir.

4 MR TIP SC: And finally, as far as you

5 know, news coverage, news video footage, that also was not

6 called for or produced at the deliberations in

7 Potchefstroom?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: I do think that we did

9 look at the news footage and now again – I'm not sure. We

10 could've or we couldn't have. I really am not sure.

11 MR TIP SC: We will leave it at that

12 rather uncertain note, Colonel. Thank you, Mr Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Tip. Mr

14 Bruinders, have you got any further cross-examination

15 arising from this new video material that came out during

16 the cross-examination?

17 FURTHER CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR BRUINDERS SC:

18 Colonel, the video that you say you saw of the 13th, was

19 that a video that showed an encounter between the SAPS and

20 strikers?

21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if you say encounter

22 do you mean we – okay, let me explain what I saw. I saw a

23 video where General Mpembe is with a group of miners on a

24 side road next to the railway line and having a discussion

25 with them. That is the video that I saw.

Page 617

1 MR BRUINDERS SC: In that video did you

2 see any footage of Lonmin security personnel?

3 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I can remember

4 policemen on the video, I cannot remember Lonmin security

5 personnel. I don't think they were there on the video.

6 MR BRUINDERS SC: There appears then to

7 be a video or video footage of General Mpembe talking to

8 miners, as you call it or call them, and are you aware of

9 another video which shows footage of Lonmin security

10 talking to strikers or miners?

11 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I have not seen

12 such a video.

13 MR BRUINDERS SC: Who took the video

14 footage that you saw at the Potch meeting?

15 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I don't know who took

16 the video footage. I just know there are video footage of

17 that.

18 MR BRUINDERS SC: Can I take you very

19 briefly back to the Potch meeting by the SAPS? As I

20 understand it, what you – well, firstly can we start off

21 with this. Were you the only person from the LCRC there?

22 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, yes sir.

23 MR BRUINDERS SC: So you were not

24 accompanied by an LCRC team of people to support you there?

25 LT-COL BOTHA: No, I was alone, sir.

Page 618

1 MR BRUINDERS SC: During the eight and a
 2 half days that you were there you made a presentation, as I
 3 understand it, on behalf of the LCRC.
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I didn't make a
 5 presentation on behalf of the LCRC. If there were any
 6 questions about the processing of the crime scenes then I
 7 was there to answer.
 8 MR BRUINDERS SC: And were there any
 9 questions to you about the crime scenes?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes sir, there was.
 11 MR BRUINDERS SC: How many?
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: There were questions. I
 13 can't say 10, 20, 30 or 40. There were questions that were
 14 asked which I had to get clarity on and then give answers.
 15 MR BRUINDERS SC: Did this all happen in
 16 one – in one session?
 17 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, it did not only
 18 happen in one session.
 19 MR BRUINDERS SC: Did it happen on more
 20 than one day during the eight and a half days that you were
 21 there?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir.
 23 MR BRUINDERS SC: On how many of those
 24 eight and a half days did you have to answer questions
 25 about crime scenes?

Page 619

1 LT-COL BOTHA: I can't remember if it was
 2 six or seven or four or five days. There were questions
 3 which I had to answer, sometimes it could be someone that
 4 would come to me and ask me a question, then not from the
 5 meeting, stuff like that. So there was information sought
 6 that was done, of things that were done on the crime scenes
 7 that I had to clarify for specific reasons.
 8 MR BRUINDERS SC: Who asked these
 9 questions or questioned the information?
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: Various people. There
 11 were a lot of people, so there were various people that
 12 asked questions about what we found and how we processed
 13 and things like that.
 14 MR BRUINDERS SC: So you answered
 15 questions when these were asked of you?
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir.
 17 MR BRUINDERS SC: Did you present the
 18 photographs by Warrant Officer Venter?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, I did, sir.
 20 MR BRUINDERS SC: And then you watched
 21 another video taken on the 13th?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: One of the things, yes.
 23 MR BRUINDERS SC: When you say one of the
 24 things, what else did you do during those eight and a half
 25 days?

Page 620

1 LT-COL BOTHA: That's why I say one of
 2 the things. I also answered a lot of other questions and
 3 in spare time I was doing my own work on my laptop.
 4 MR BRUINDERS SC: So besides answering
 5 questions, watching somebody else's video, presenting
 6 photographs and working on your laptop, what else did you
 7 do in those eight and a half days?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: That is what I did in the
 9 eight and a half days, sir.
 10 MR BRUINDERS SC: No further questions.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bruinders.
 12 Mr Bizos, are you going to ask any more questions relating
 13 to these matters or are you going to get someone –
 14 MR BIZOS SC: My learned friend Mr
 15 Ngcukait –
 16 MR NGCUKAITOBI: I'll announce myself.
 17 MR BIZOS SC: I wanted to spell it for
 18 the record, but he will do the –
 19 CHAIRPERSON: He will put himself on
 20 record, spell his name and then cross-examine.
 21 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
 22 MR NGCUKAITOBI: In that order, Mr
 23 Chairperson. The surname is Ngcukaitobi, N-G-C-U-K-A-I-T-
 24 O-B-I. I'm told by my learned friend on the right that
 25 it's too fast.

Page 621

1 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR NGCUKAITOBI:
 2 Right Mr – Colonel Botha, can I start off with the
 3 transcript of the bail hearing? It appears at – I can't
 4 remember the bundle. It's a marked bundle, it's with the
 5 bundle C at page 195 to 196. I wonder if someone can help
 6 you. Alright, I'll read out to you – this is the evidence
 7 that was given by Brigadier Van Zyl as to how the people
 8 who were arrested on the 16th were identified. Now, he had
 9 spoken about a monitor belonging to the SAPS and a CCTV
 10 camera in the mine premises. He didn't say who it belonged
 11 to. He said there was a CCTV camera in the mine premises.
 12 The question that was asked to him, of him, was "Now, if
 13 you can just explain for the purposes of everybody's
 14 understanding, where was this monitor?" His answer was,
 15 "They have got CCTV cameras n the mine premises and we also
 16 had access to aerial communication as to what happened on
 17 the ground." So then there's a further question asked, "So
 18 the observation you made is after the incident?" And then
 19 he says "That is correct." Then he talks about the opening
 20 of the docket, have you got that? It's at page 195.
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Got it, yes.
 22 MR NGCUKAITOBI: You've got it. And
 23 you've seen the words I've just read out to you. Okay, if
 24 you go then to the following page at 196 you're then asked
 25 at line 5, "Now it is common knowledge also that here was a

Page 622

1 shooting that took place on the 16th. Did you observe this
 2 on the monitor?" What is his answer? What did Brigadier
 3 Van Zyl say? Is the answer yes? Look on your transcript.
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes.
 5 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Now, then he's asked a
 6 further question. "Tell us what you observed with regard
 7 to the shooting and then he says, "There was a group of
 8 people who broke through and the police fired shots at
 9 them." Can you see that? So according to Brigadier Van
 10 Zyl, there were at least two video footage sources that
 11 were presented to him by the 27th August showing a group of
 12 people breaking through and the police firing shots at
 13 them. Now in these nine days that you spent with him at
 14 Potchefstroom, did he mention this in your presence?
 15 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir.
 16 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Did he make any
 17 presentation at all in your presence?
 18 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir.
 19 MR NGCUKAITOBI: So could he have made it
 20 in your absence, maybe when you were looking at your
 21 laptop?
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: If I was looking at my
 23 laptop I definitely would have known about it. In my
 24 absence, that's always a possibility.
 25 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes. Now if what

Page 623

1 Brigadier Van Zyl said at the bail hearing is true, there
 2 would be CCTV footage and monitors belonging to the SAPS
 3 that captured the incident live. Where is that material?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: I do not know about any
 5 CCTV footage or CCTV cameras of the SA Police Service and I
 6 do not know of such footage.
 7 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Do you think Brigadier
 8 Van Zyl was telling the truth when he spoke about the CCTV
 9 footage and the monitors belonging to the SAPS?
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Is it a permissible
 11 question to ask a witness –
 12 MR NGCUKAITOBI: No – I'll proceed. I'll
 13 leave the question.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: It would be better
 15 withdrawn.
 16 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes, I'll leave, I
 17 withdraw the question. Now, if Brigadier Van Zyl was
 18 telling the truth about this, this surely exists somewhere
 19 within the SAPS. Would you at least confirm that?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot confirm that it
 21 is in SAPS. I just said I don't know about any CCTV
 22 footage and I do not know that the SAPS own CCTV cameras.
 23 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes, alright. And the
 24 aerial communication that belonged to the SAPS, that's
 25 apart from the CCTV footage – he said you relied on two

Page 624

1 sources, the CCTV footage and the aerial communication –
 2 did he mention that at the Potchefstroom meeting, the nine
 3 day meeting?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, not as far as I
 5 can recall.
 6 MR NGCUKAITOBI: But you would agree with
 7 me, surely Colonel Botha, that if that's what he said
 8 existed, it should still be somewhere within the SAPS today
 9 and can be made available to the Commission.
 10 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if it exists, I don't
 11 see any reason why it doesn't, cannot be made available. I
 12 do not know of such existence.
 13 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes. Now you were asked
 14 earlier about cameras that are installed in the helicopters
 15 of the SAPS. Was your answer that you know about these
 16 cameras that are installed or you don't know about these
 17 cameras?
 18 LT-COL BOTHA: I said I do know that
 19 there are police choppers with cameras. I do not know if
 20 the ones that we had were equipped –
 21 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Did you check whether
 22 the one that you flew in had a camera installed in it?
 23 [15:02] LT-COL BOTHA: No Sir, I did not.
 24 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Don't you believe that
 25 it as of material significance that you check whether that

Page 625

1 camera was working and you check whether the helicopter in
 2 fact had a camera prior to you taking off, as a seasoned
 3 cameraman of 26 years' standing?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: I was requested to make an
 5 aerial view. I did not even think that the chopper can or
 6 cannot have a camera. I presume at that stage that I
 7 thought, well, it doesn't have a camera because otherwise
 8 why will I be on the chopper?
 9 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Colonel Botha, what do
 10 you think is the purpose of video recording a crime scene,
 11 particularly a live crime scene? Isn't it to eliminate
 12 disputes of fact?
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: That can be one of the
 14 reasons.
 15 MR NGCUKAITOBI: The primary reason.
 16 LT-COL BOTHA: It can be.
 17 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Now, why don't you check
 18 whether the helicopter that you are flying in has a camera
 19 or not, because I'm told by an expert that the LRC will
 20 bring that those cameras are very powerful and capture the
 21 incidents clearly.
 22 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I did not check if
 23 the chopper had a camera. I'm not a camera expert, I don't
 24 know how powerful they are. I was placed on the chopper to
 25 go and make an aerial view and for that reason I assumed,

Page 626

1 well, there is no camera. I didn't even ask if there's a
 2 camera on the chopper. I mean they – if it was there, I'm
 3 not – no, I don't know if the chopper had a camera.
 4 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Will you give us the
 5 details of this chopper that you were in, so that we can
 6 inspect whether it had a camera or not?
 7 LT-COL BOTHA: Details as in?
 8 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Well, the only way to
 9 identify it – how do you identify that chopper that you
 10 were in?
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: It was an SAPS chopper.
 12 MR NGCUKAITOBI: And it's got no
 13 registration number?
 14 LT-COL BOTHA: I did not take note of the
 15 registration number. I do know the type of chopper, it was
 16 a Squirrel.
 17 MR NGCUKAITOBI: So you would not be able
 18 today to identify the specific chopper that you were in?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: No, sir.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: I don't want to interrupt
 21 you but I assume that this is the kind of information which
 22 the SAPS should be able to provide you. I imagine there
 23 must be logs -
 24 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: - and other records

Page 627

1 relating to the helicopters they had and who were in them
 2 at the relevant time. I'm not sure if it's a productive
 3 exercise to ask this witness about it. I'm sure possibly
 4 even outside the actual formal sittings of the Commission
 5 you can get this information from the SAPS representatives.
 6 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: I don't want to stop you
 8 but I just want to suggest to you that, you know, the time
 9 we have could be possibly more fruitfully spent than by
 10 asking these questions of this witness.
 11 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes, Mr Chairperson, I
 12 have made the request to my learned friends prior to
 13 commencing this cross-examination. They undertaken to do
 14 what they can to make the information available. Now if
 15 you look at the IPID documents and I don't want to go
 16 through those documents because I'm sure this is something
 17 you would accept, each water cannon is installed with two
 18 cameras. There's a front camera which takes CCTV footage
 19 and there's a rear camera. Do you accept that?
 20 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I can't – I don't
 21 even know how to open a water cannon's door so - I've never
 22 been in a water cannon.
 23 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Well, I don't want to
 24 take you through the IPID documents but I've inspected them
 25 and I've seen that they – each water cannon has a camera

Page 628

1 installed in front and at the back. Now at the subsequent
 2 debriefing session in Potchefstroom did no-one who operated
 3 these water cannons produce any video footage taken from
 4 the water cannon?
 5 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I have not seen any
 6 such video footage.
 7 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Were there no enquiries
 8 made by any official in the eight and a half days in
 9 Potchefstroom about what happened to the footage that
 10 should have been contained by the water cannons?
 11 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm not sure if it was
 12 made. If it was made it was not – I didn't hear it, I
 13 can't recall something like that.
 14 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Because at the meeting
 15 held, at the JOC meeting at half past one on the 16th of
 16 August 2012 there was an explicit reference to checking
 17 that the water cannons work and are capable of being - of
 18 deployment during the incident.
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: I was not at the meeting,
 20 I don't know.
 21 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes. Now finally, we
 22 know that Brigadier Van Zyl has spoken about a CCTV, about
 23 aerial communication, we know that possibly the water
 24 cannons that you confirm having seen on the ground
 25 potentially had cameras and out of all of this, all we have

Page 629

1 is the 41 minutes that does not record any of the
 2 shootings. What is your comment to that?
 3 CHAIRPERSON: That's not quite correct.
 4 There is other footage which we saw after we saw the
 5 Colonel's footage yesterday, remember.
 6 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: So, well, he said he saw it
 8 for the first time yesterday but the fact is it's not
 9 correct to put to the witness that the only footage we have
 10 is his footage because we know there's the other footage as
 11 well. So perhaps you should reformulate the question.
 12 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes. Was the only
 13 footage of the 16th that was shown at the Potchefstroom
 14 meeting for nine days, was the footage that you took?
 15 CHAIRPERSON: No, no, he didn't say that.
 16 On the contrary, he said the opposite. He said he can't
 17 recall his footage being shown at all. In fact all he can
 18 remember of footage being shown relates to the 13th –
 19 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: And the visual material he
 21 recalls being shown were, consisted of the photographs
 22 taken on his camera by Sergeant or Warrant Officer Venter.
 23 I don't think that question is correct either -
 24 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Yes.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: - reformulate that one

Page 630

1 also.

2 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Let me put it another

3 way then, Mr Chairperson. The only footage that you are

4 aware of is the footage that you personally took.

5 LT-COL BOTHA: Video footage, yes.

6 MR NGCUKAITOBI: And can you eliminate

7 the possibility that other video footage actually recording

8 the shooting does exist in the light of what I've put to

9 you?

10 LT-COL BOTHA: I cannot dispute that but

11 I also can't say it does exist.

12 MR NGCUKAITOBI: Those are the questions,

13 Mr Chair.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much. Mr

15 Madlanga, do you have any re-examination of the witness?

16 RE-EXAMINATION BY MR MADLANGA SC: Yes

17 Chair, thank you. Colonel, you referred under cross-

18 examination to a correcting statement, a statement that was

19 correcting what you had recorded or observed as the time at

20 which you commenced videoing on the 16th. Where is that

21 correcting statement? You mentioned in your evidence that

22 it's in a docket. Which docket is that?

23 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, it is in the video

24 docket.

25 MR MADLANGA SC: And that video docket,

Page 631

1 where is it? Is it part of the IPID documents?

2 LT-COL BOTHA: It's part of the IPID

3 documents.

4 MR MADLANGA SC: That's maybe unfair to

5 you because the statement is not in front of you but I'll

6 ask the question nonetheless, do you perhaps know what the

7 date of that statement is?

8 LT-COL BOTHA: I think it was said

9 yesterday the date of the statement is the 1st of the 9th

10 month.

11 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you for that,

12 Colonel. Colonel, you referred to somebody who was in

13 civilian clothing in the helicopter in which you were on

14 the 16th and you said that this person had a camera. What

15 type – not brand, what type of camera was this? Was it a

16 still camera or was it a video camera?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if I recall correctly

18 it was a video camera.

19 MR MADLANGA SC: It's almost certain from

20 the evidence that you've given that you've never had sight

21 of any footage from this person's video camera.

22 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I did not.

23 MR MADLANGA SC: Responding to a question

24 by my learned friend Mr Burger, you said that you heard of

25 two dead people from Colonel Vermaak. Do you recall saying

Page 632

1 that?

2 LT-COL BOTHA: I recall saying that.

3 MR MADLANGA SC: At what stage did

4 Colonel Vermaak tell you this? What was the occasion, what

5 was happening, where were you?

6 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I said that when we

7 were in the air, when I realised, the first time I realised

8 that the shooting happened or someone has been shot, was

9 when Colonel Vermaak mentioned on the air that he can see

10 two bodies.

11 MR MADLANGA SC: Over the radio?

12 LT-COL BOTHA: Over the radio, yes.

13 MR MADLANGA SC: I will paraphrase

14 another question that was put to you by Mr Burger. He said

15 that because scene 2 played itself out – I hope I'm

16 paraphrasing it correctly – because scene 2 played itself

17 out without you being aware, you would have been

18 inquisitive as to what had happened there. Do you recall

19 that question?

20 LT-COL BOTHA: I recall the question,

21 sir.

22 MR MADLANGA SC: I might have captured

23 your response incorrectly but I captured something like "I

24 wasn't" and I wasn't quite sure what the substance of your

25 response was. If I'm incorrect, please correct me and just

Page 633

1 state again what your response to that question was.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, if I can remember

3 correctly I said that we did, it was discussed – sorry – it

4 was discussed and obviously I wanted to know what happened

5 there but I didn't specifically ask and then were

6 inquisitive because of that.

7 MR MADLANGA SC: In quite a number of

8 your –

9 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, are you moving on to

10 another point now, Mr Madlanga? I'm not sure that you

11 quite understood the question perhaps. Inquisitive doesn't

12 necessarily mean you ask questions. You know, in your mind

13 you wanted to know the answer to certain questions but you

14 don't have to actually ask them to be inquisitive. I think

15 nuuskierig is probably the correct – the interpreter nods

16 his head – is probably the correct Afrikaans translation.

17 MR MAHLANGU: That's the correct

18 Afrikaans, Chair.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Right. Now – so we'll ask

20 you the question again. When you were told that there were

21 bodies at the kraal and when you were told other things

22 that you heard, were you not nuuskierig, even though you

23 might not have actually asked questions?

24 LT-COL BOTHA: I think I was but because

25 I – I saw the crime scene photos, I mean I – a lot of the

Page 634

1 things I could, not answer for myself but I saw it.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: But you also saw the crime
 3 scene photos later, didn't you? So why - if you were
 4 inquisitive, in the sense I've explained, at the time why
 5 didn't you ask questions?
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: I did not ask questions
 7 about scene 2 when I learnt about it, sir.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: I know that, but I've asked
 9 you why? If you were curious, nuuskierig, inquisitive,
 10 wouldn't the natural response have been to have asked, to
 11 say but what's this, how can this be, what exactly happened
 12 – other questions along those lines.
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: No sir, I did not ask
 14 questions along those lines.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: No, but Colonel, I'm not
 16 asking you whether you asked questions. We know you didn't
 17 ask questions. The question is a different question and
 18 it's why didn't you?
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Mr Chair, I was – I sent
 20 out people to the crime scenes and then at some stage I
 21 also went to the crime scenes so I was, I did see scene 2.
 22 I did not ask questions before that, so then I wasn't
 23 inquisitive before that. I hope that answers the question.
 24 MR MADLANGA SC: Colonel, you were asked
 25 a number of questions around discussions that would have

Page 635

1 taken place inside the helicopter in which you were –
 2 whether over the radio or amongst the people that were
 3 inside the helicopter. You remember that?
 4 LT-COL BOTHA: I remember that.
 5 MR MADLANGA SC: Am I correct that, for
 6 the most part, your response was that you do not recall
 7 what the content of those communications was?
 8 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, sir.
 9 MR MADLANGA SC: I do recall from your
 10 evidence that at least you do recall three communications –
 11 the instructions by Brigadier Fritz that stun grenades be
 12 shot or thrown, I don't know what the correct verb is –
 13 LT-COL BOTHA: It is thrown – I actually
 14 recall it because it was an action that took place in my
 15 presence.
 16 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes. The second one,
 17 you also recall him when he warned the pilot of a likely or
 18 possible collision between the helicopters.
 19 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes sir, because that
 20 influenced my video. We moved away from what I know now is
 21 the koppie.
 22 MR MADLANGA SC: And the third one
 23 obviously was directed at you and that was that you should
 24 go back.
 25 LT-COL BOTHA: That is correct, sir, and

Page 636

1 then the one of Colonel Vermaak.
 2 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes, yes, so the four.
 3 Four, you do recall four. But the distinct impression I
 4 get is that that would be a tiny percentage of what you
 5 recall.
 6 LT-COL BOTHA: Yes, sir.
 7 MR MADLANGA SC: You don't recall most of
 8 the communications.
 9 LT-COL BOTHA: I said there was a lot of
 10 communications so I don't recall – these are things that
 11 directly either influenced me or I mean the moment you hear
 12 bodies, you think dead people and that is why maybe it
 13 stuck in my mind but that is what I recall.
 14 [15:22] MR MADLANGA SC: Can you, just for
 15 clarity – because if you were able to hear these four
 16 communications, I want to get an idea of why it is that you
 17 did not hear the rest of the communications – is it that
 18 you might've heard but now as you're sitting there you no
 19 longer remember, or is it that you did not hear at all or
 20 you did not listen or pay attention at all?
 21 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, I do think it's two
 22 of those. I do think I might've heard but I can't recall
 23 at the moment. I don't want to say I'm sitting in the
 24 spotlight but I can't recall at the moment, and I was
 25 really trying to concentrate on the video camera because

Page 637

1 with a hand held video camera in a chopper, it's not easy.
 2 You can see, when the chopper turns you go down, if the
 3 chopper goes up you go up and – because at some stages
 4 there are only blue light and I think due to those too, I
 5 cannot recall a lot of these things.
 6 MR MADLANGA SC: Lastly – and Chair,
 7 commissioners, it doesn't arise from the cross-examination
 8 but with your leave may I just ask the Colonel to confirm
 9 under oath now the correctness of what he pointed out at
 10 the inspection in loco, was it on the 2nd of October?
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.
 12 LT-COL BOTHA: Sir, that was on the 2nd of
 13 October and I confirm that under oath as correct.
 14 MR MADLANGA SC: There are no further
 15 questions, Chair, thank you.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: We will take the tea
 17 adjournment at this stage and it is now 25 past by my watch
 18 – I don't know what it is by the Colonel's watch and we
 19 will resume at 20 to four.
 20 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES]
 21 [15:45] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
 22 Thank you, Colonel, for your evidence. You're excused.
 23 LT-COL BOTHA: Thank you, Mr Chairman.
 24 [NO FURTHER QUESTIONS – WITNESS EXCUSED]
 25 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson might –

Page 638

1 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya?

2 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, to the

3 extent that there might be a lingering misunderstanding, I

4 think the Colonel referred to the legal team being in

5 Potchefstroom –

6 CHAIRPERSON: I understood the earlier

7 reference to be a reference to an Adv Moolman who is, I

8 think he was described as a legal officer in the SAPS. I

9 didn't understand him to refer to you or your colleagues

10 who are appearing, but let's just get clarity from him on

11 that, just for the record's sake.

12 MR SEMENYA SC: On the light side –

13 CHAIRPERSON: Colonel, you heard Mr

14 Semenya's point. These lawyers who were present, were they

15 practising lawyers or were they lawyers who were permanent

16 members of the South African Police Force, Police Service?

17 LT-COL BOTHA: I'm talking about members

18 of the South African Police Force, sir.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Service.

20 LT-COL BOTHA: Police Service, sorry.

21 MR SEMENYA SC: I'm saying thankfully

22 you're not at risk of being disbarred.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, no, I'm – you know, I

24 would've been astonished if there was any problem in that

25 regard. No, it's still the SAPS as far as the name is

Page 639

1 concerned, it hasn't been re-militarised.

2 LT-COL BOTHA: Sorry for that Mr Chair.

3 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Madlanga, have you got

4 another witness to lead?

5 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes Chairman,

6 commissioners, the next witness is Captain Moses Moshwana.

7 Can he please come forward and may I ask to hand up – or

8 no, not at this stage, not at this stage.

9 CHAIRPERSON: Captain, do you wish to

10 swear or do you wish to affirm?

11 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Swear.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Do you swear that the

13 evidence that you will give before this Commission will be

14 the whole truth and nothing but the truth. Please raise

15 your right hand and say so help me God.

16 MOSES MOSHWANA: So help me God.

17 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may be

18 seated. Yes, Mr Madlanga?

19 EXAMINATION BY MR MADLANGA SC: Thank

20 you, Chair. There is an unsigned statement bearing your

21 name. Have you had sight of it, have you read it? This,

22 Chair and commissioners, was handed up on the first day of

23 Colonel Botha's testimony so the commissioners, I believe,

24 already have a copy of it.

25 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, we do.

Page 640

1 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON: I take it you intend it

3 being handed in as an exhibit.

4 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes, Chair.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Perhaps we can give it its

6 exhibit letter now. I take it Ms Pillay's been keeping

7 note of these things, if she can tell us what it will be.

8 MR MADLANGA SC: Is it not D? It should

9 be D, Chair.

10 CHAIRPERSON: So it'll be, we'll mark it

11 Exhibit D.

12 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed.

14 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you. Do you

15 confirm the truthfulness of the contents of this statement,

16 Captain?

17 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, I confirm.

18 MR MADLANGA SC: Your experience,

19 training, et cetera are reflected in the statement, I will

20 not make you read that. What I'll ask you to please read

21 into the record are paragraphs 4 and 5 of the statement.

22 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Thank you,

23 Chairperson. "On the 13th of August 2012 I attended and

24 processed a crime scene involving Marikana CAS115/8/2012

25 and 116/8/2012 at Donkerhoek, Marikana, wherein two

Page 641

1 civilians were found dead."

2 MR MADLANGA SC: Now on the screen

3 slightly to your left, roughly behind you there is a slide.

4 I assume Colonel Botha left a hard copy there in front of

5 you or are you looking at the screen?

6 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I'm looking at the

7 screen.

8 MR MADLANGA SC: The laptop screen, yes.

9 Chair, I'm referring the witness to B9 on the hard copies.

10 Do you want to take us through that slide and indicate what

11 observations you made?

12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, the

13 aerial photograph is to indicate the relationship between

14 my crime scenes and also Lieutenant-Colonel Botha's crime

15 scenes.

16 MR MADLANGA SC: My understanding is that

17 there was a dirt road that separated the part of the scene

18 that was processed by Colonel Botha and that part that was

19 processed by you. Is that part which is linear and lighter

20 in colour, that's dirt road, there's a motor vehicle

21 further up close to where N for north is – is that the dirt

22 road?

23 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct,

24 Chairperson.

25 MR MADLANGA SC: Now the CAS116/08/2012

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 642</p> <p>1 does show on the slide, you agree?</p> <p>2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p> <p>3 MR MADLANGA SC: What did you find there,</p> <p>4 if anything?</p> <p>5 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, there is</p> <p>6 an informal house number C05 and in front of this informal</p> <p>7 house I found a civilian body.</p> <p>8 MR MADLANGA SC: Now before I forget, you</p> <p>9 were also at the in loco inspection on the 2nd of October</p> <p>10 2012, were you not?</p> <p>11 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p> <p>12 MR MADLANGA SC: And you also</p> <p>13 participated in the sense that you pointed out certain</p> <p>14 spots.</p> <p>15 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, I pointed certain</p> <p>16 spots.</p> <p>17 MR MADLANGA SC: Do you confirm the</p> <p>18 correctness of what you pointed out during your</p> <p>19 participation at that inspection?</p> <p>20 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, that's correct.</p> <p>21 MR MADLANGA SC: Now, continue and tell</p> <p>22 us what else you observed and if you prefer showing us on a</p> <p>23 different slide, you may do so.</p> <p>24 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Okay, on a spot on</p> <p>25 CAS115/8/2012 there was also a body of a civilian across</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 644</p> <p>1 MR MADLANGA SC: Now on B10 I see what</p> <p>2 looks like a motor vehicle close to a circle. Is that the</p> <p>3 spot that you are referring to?</p> <p>4 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Correct, Chairperson.</p> <p>5 MR MADLANGA SC: And now when you go</p> <p>6 across where you found the body, is it where "body" is</p> <p>7 written?</p> <p>8 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, correct.</p> <p>9 MR MADLANGA SC: And obviously that is on</p> <p>10 the western – or rather eastern side of the stream.</p> <p>11 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Correct, Chairperson.</p> <p>12 MR MADLANGA SC: At B11 you give a number</p> <p>13 of measurements, do you see that?</p> <p>14 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, I can see.</p> <p>15 MR MADLANGA SC: Do you want to just</p> <p>16 quickly read those into the record?</p> <p>17 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, to</p> <p>18 explain my measurements from the main road until the body</p> <p>19 in front of the informal house number C05, it's 93.5 metres</p> <p>20 which is CAS116/8/2012 –</p> <p>21 MR MADLANGA SC: And by main road would</p> <p>22 you be referring to the dirt road I earlier referred you</p> <p>23 to?</p> <p>24 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct,</p> <p>25 Chairperson.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 643</p> <p>1 the street.</p> <p>2 MR MADLANGA SC: It does show also on the</p> <p>3 same slide, that is B9 but –</p> <p>4 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p> <p>5 MR MADLANGA SC: Is that spot not visible</p> <p>6 in B10 as well, even though perhaps it's not marked that</p> <p>7 case number or is it? Oh ja, it is, it's marked at the top</p> <p>8 to the left of the letter W for "work", it is marked</p> <p>9 CAS115. This is at B10, the next slide. Do you see that,</p> <p>10 the following slide?</p> <p>11 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p> <p>12 MR MADLANGA SC: My understanding is - or</p> <p>13 perhaps before you crossed that stream, after you had found</p> <p>14 the body next to what you referred to as an informal house,</p> <p>15 before one crosses the stream is there anything else you</p> <p>16 observed?</p> <p>17 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, Chairperson.</p> <p>18 There were cartridge cases before you cross the stream.</p> <p>19 MR MADLANGA SC: How far from the stream</p> <p>20 was this, if you can tell?</p> <p>21 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, from the</p> <p>22 stream it can be plus-minus 50 metres.</p> <p>23 MR MADLANGA SC: And would I be correct</p> <p>24 to say that this was on the western side of the stream?</p> <p>25 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 645</p> <p>1 MR MADLANGA SC: Please continue.</p> <p>2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: And Chairperson, from</p> <p>3 the body in front of the informal house to the body across</p> <p>4 the stream is 500 metres.</p> <p>5 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes?</p> <p>6 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I just want to correct</p> <p>7 something, not 550, 500.</p> <p>8 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes, continue.</p> <p>9 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, from the</p> <p>10 position of cartridge cases to a body across the stream,</p> <p>11 74.4 metres which is – the body across the stream</p> <p>12 CAS115/8/2012.</p> <p>13 MR MADLANGA SC: And the last</p> <p>14 measurement?</p> <p>15 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, the last</p> <p>16 measurement from the body in front of the informal house</p> <p>17 until to Lieutenant-Colonel Botha's scene, which is</p> <p>18 CAS117/8/2012, is 120 metres.</p> <p>19 MR MADLANGA SC: Chair, commissioners,</p> <p>20 that is the evidence of the witness, thank you.</p> <p>21 CHAIRPERSON: Do you have any questions</p> <p>22 for the witness?</p> <p>23 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, thank you,</p> <p>24 no.</p> <p>25 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Burger, do you have any</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 646</p> <p>1 questions?</p> <p>2 MR BURGER SC: No thank you, Mr Chairman.</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: To shorten things, has</p> <p>4 anyone got any questions? Do you have questions?</p> <p>5 MR BRUINDERS SC: I do, yes.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Please begin your cross-</p> <p>7 examination.</p> <p>8 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR BRUINDERS SC:</p> <p>9 Thank you. Captain, there's one measurement I'd like you</p> <p>10 to confirm for us, is – have you any idea what the distance</p> <p>11 is between B and G?</p> <p>12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I did not attend to</p> <p>13 that. Just repeat the question?</p> <p>14 MR BRUINDERS SC: The distance between B</p> <p>15 and G?</p> <p>16 MR MADLANGA SC: Chair, may I just try to</p> <p>17 establish if my learned friend is referring to B1, the</p> <p>18 page?</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: That's Colonel Botha scene</p> <p>20 that he did. I'm not sure whether this witness can deal</p> <p>21 with it but if he can then obviously he will do so.</p> <p>22 MR BRUINDERS SC: I beg your pardon,</p> <p>23 Captain.</p> <p>24 CHAIRPERSON: Captain, do you see the</p> <p>25 Google photograph which is, I think, B1? I think that's</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 648</p> <p>1 can be possible because I didn't measure.</p> <p>2 MR BRUINDERS SC: On the 13th, what time</p> <p>3 did you arrive at the crime scene that you say you</p> <p>4 investigated?</p> <p>5 [16:05] CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, I arrived</p> <p>6 at 16:31.</p> <p>7 MR BRUINDERS SC: How long did you spend</p> <p>8 there?</p> <p>9 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Are you referring, at</p> <p>10 the crime scene?</p> <p>11 MR BRUINDERS SC: Yes.</p> <p>12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: It can be plus-minus</p> <p>13 four hours.</p> <p>14 MR BRUINDERS SC: So you were there</p> <p>15 between half past four and half past eight that evening?</p> <p>16 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, I</p> <p>17 departed from the crime scene at 20:15.</p> <p>18 MR BRUINDERS SC: Now you do say G is</p> <p>19 what you call your crime scene.</p> <p>20 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: That's correct.</p> <p>21 MR BRUINDERS SC: What did you find</p> <p>22 there?</p> <p>23 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: It was a body of a</p> <p>24 civilian across the street.</p> <p>25 MR BRUINDERS SC: And did you look at the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 647</p> <p>1 what counsel is referring to.</p> <p>2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, Chairperson –</p> <p>3 CHAIRPERSON: Can you give him the</p> <p>4 information that he seeks?</p> <p>5 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, I don't have the</p> <p>6 measurement from B to G because letter B is Colonel Botha's</p> <p>7 crime scene.</p> <p>8 MR BRUINDERS SC: When you say – so you</p> <p>9 did not go to the point at B?</p> <p>10 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: No, I didn't go to</p> <p>11 point B.</p> <p>12 CHAIRPERSON: I take it what you're</p> <p>13 asking for is the distance between the railway line which</p> <p>14 is B –</p> <p>15 MR BRUINDERS SC: Yes.</p> <p>16 CHAIRPERSON: - and the place where the</p> <p>17 body on the other side of the stream was found?</p> <p>18 MR BRUINDERS SC: Yes.</p> <p>19 CHAIRPERSON: Can you perhaps give us an</p> <p>20 estimation, even if you didn't measure it?</p> <p>21 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, if I can</p> <p>22 give an estimation, it can be plus-minus 8 to 900 metres.</p> <p>23 MR BRUINDERS SC: Is it possibly more</p> <p>24 than one kilometre?</p> <p>25 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes Chairperson, it</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 649</p> <p>1 body?</p> <p>2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes.</p> <p>3 MR BRUINDERS SC: What did you see?</p> <p>4 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: The deceased was lying</p> <p>5 on his stomach.</p> <p>6 MR BRUINDERS SC: Was the deceased a man?</p> <p>7 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, it was a man.</p> <p>8 MR BRUINDERS SC: Did he have any wounds?</p> <p>9 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, he was having</p> <p>10 some wounds.</p> <p>11 MR BRUINDERS SC: What wounds?</p> <p>12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I cannot say whether</p> <p>13 it was a stab or a gunshot.</p> <p>14 MR BRUINDERS SC: And where was this</p> <p>15 wound?</p> <p>16 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I observed one wound</p> <p>17 at the back of his neck.</p> <p>18 MR BRUINDERS SC: And any other wounds?</p> <p>19 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, he was</p> <p>20 also having a scratch on his left cheek.</p> <p>21 MR BRUINDERS SC: Any other wounds?</p> <p>22 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: No, they were the only</p> <p>23 wounds, Chairperson.</p> <p>24 MR BRUINDERS SC: The wound at the back</p> <p>25 of his neck, what did it look like to you?</p>

Page 650

1 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bruinders, I don't want
 2 to unnecessarily interrupt you but I take it that the post-
 3 mortem report is before us. So is there any point in
 4 checking the accuracy of the memory of this witness on
 5 something which is objectively ascertainable?
 6 MR BRUINDERS SC: Chair –
 7 CHAIRPERSON: I've made my point, you can
 8 proceed.
 9 MR BRUINDERS SC: No Chair, with respect,
 10 it's a point well taken. I want to, though, ask whether –
 11 we haven't seen the post-mortem report and so I want to ask
 12 this witness whether he knows, but let me ask him. Do you
 13 know whether there is a post-mortem report for this, the
 14 person you saw at G?
 15 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, I know.
 16 MR BRUINDERS SC: Where is that post-
 17 mortem report, do you know?
 18 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: No, I don't have any
 19 idea.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Chaskalson, as I
 21 understand it, is in charge of post-mortem reports. So –
 22 he's not here at the moment, he's obviously working on
 23 another aspect of the case but I imagine tomorrow morning
 24 you can ask him and obtain the post-mortem report.
 25 MR BRUINDERS SC: We will follow that.

Page 651

1 Just for purposes of the record, the witness has said there
 2 is one. We haven't seen one and we'll follow this up with
 3 Mr Chaskalson. Captain, on the second day of the
 4 inspection in loco you pointed out the crime scene of the
 5 13th.
 6 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, correct.
 7 MR BRUINDERS SC: The note that my
 8 attorney has of your pointing out is that you, in answer to
 9 a question, confirmed that this witness had a gunshot wound
 10 to the back of the neck or head. Would that be right?
 11 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: No, I never said that.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bruinders, again if -
 13 the proceedings at the inspection were recorded, I don't
 14 know if they've been transcribed but they were recorded, so
 15 again if anything turns on this point you can check it from
 16 the transcript when it's available but again, even if the
 17 witness was wrong on that point, once we get the post-
 18 mortem reports we'll see whether there was a gunshot wound
 19 and unless something turns on his perception then I don't
 20 know if we need spend any more time on it, but I've made
 21 the point to you.
 22 MR BRUINDERS SC: We'll move on.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, good idea.
 24 MR BRUINDERS SC: Were you at all
 25 involved in the crime scene at what I think is called scene

Page 652

1 1 and 2 of the 16th?
 2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was only at scene 1.
 3 MR BRUINDERS SC: When was that?
 4 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: The 16th.
 5 MR BRUINDERS SC: What time?
 6 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: 21:47.
 7 MR BRUINDERS SC: Why were you there?
 8 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was called to come
 9 and assist because it was a big scene.
 10 MR BRUINDERS SC: What did you assist
 11 with?
 12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was assisting with
 13 collecting of exhibits and doing measurements.
 14 MR BRUINDERS SC: Whom did you assist?
 15 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Warrant Officer
 16 Thamae.
 17 MR BRUINDERS SC: So the crime scene
 18 investigator in charge of scene 1 was Warrant Officer
 19 Thamae?
 20 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, it was Warrant
 21 Officer Thamae.
 22 MR BRUINDERS SC: And I take it that he
 23 will come and give evidence about what he found at that
 24 crime scene.
 25 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Yes, Chairperson,

Page 653

1 that's correct.
 2 MR BRUINDERS SC: Before you arrived at
 3 the crime scene on the 16th, where were you?
 4 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was at – in
 5 Rustenburg.
 6 MR BRUINDERS SC: And where in Rustenburg
 7 were you?
 8 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was at my
 9 residential place.
 10 MR BRUINDERS SC: So you were off duty on
 11 that day?
 12 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: I was off duty after
 13 four but during the day I was on duty.
 14 MR BRUINDERS SC: And where were you on
 15 duty?
 16 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Rustenburg LCRC.
 17 MR BRUINDERS SC: So the first time you
 18 were called out to scene 1 and the Wonderkop area was after
 19 nine on the 16th.
 20 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, it was
 21 before eight because I arrived at the crime scene 21:47.
 22 MR BRUINDERS SC: And the first time you
 23 got there on that day was at 21:47.
 24 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Are you referring at
 25 scene 1?

Page 654

1 MR BRUINDERS SC: Yes.

2 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Correct, Chairperson.

3 MR BRUINDERS SC: Can I take an

4 instruction? No further questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bruinders.

6 Are you next, Mr Mpofo?

7 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chair.

8 CHAIRPERSON: I think actually Mr Bizos

9 and the way we were doing it, in order of seniority – Mr

10 Bizos, do you want to ask any questions?

11 MR BIZOS SC: No, thank you.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza isn't here, so

13 you'd better take over.

14 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you Chair.

15 CHAIRPERSON: Have you got questions to

16 ask?

17 MR MPOFU: Chair, I'm not really going to

18 ask questions, I just want to place something on record,

19 more for the Commission than the witness. Just to say that

20 as in the case of –

21 CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to do it while

22 the witness is here?

23 MR MPOFU: Yes, yes.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Alright.

25 MR MPOFU: Because you might want to

Page 655

1 convey the message to him, Mr Chairperson. I just want to

2 say that as in the case of the previous witness, we would

3 like to reserve the right – it's less likely in the case of

4 this witness than the previous one but since the people who

5 were in custody are only now being in the process of being

6 released, if anything comes out of those consultations

7 which might necessitate recalling the witness, obviously

8 they're not going to dispute the measurements but for what

9 it's worth, if the witness can just be –

10 CHAIRPERSON: I indicated to you that if

11 you wished to have, if you apply for the recall of the

12 witnesses who've testified because you've obtained

13 meaningful instructions from the people who were not

14 available previously, then any application of that kind

15 would be entertained.

16 MR MPOFU: Yes.

17 CHAIRPERSON: And if successful, would be

18 granted.

19 MR MPOFU: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON: Anybody else want to ask

21 questions? No. Any re-examination, Mr Madlanga?

22 MR MADLANGA SC: Chairman, commissioners,

23 to say that I forgot – it makes me feel terrible. Chair, I

24 did not ask the witness how many cartridges and cartridge

25 cases and what type the cartridges or cartridge cases they

Page 656

1 found were.

2 CHAIRPERSON: I don't think anyone will

3 object to your asking that question.

4 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, thank you,

5 Chair.

6 CHAIRPERSON: And if they do object I'll

7 overrule the objection. Carry on.

8 RE-EXAMINATION BY MR MADLANGA SC: Thank

9 you, thank you. Captain, at B10 where, what looks like a

10 motor vehicle, where you indicated that there were

11 cartridge cases, what cartridge cases were these and how

12 many were there?

13 CAPTAIN MOSHWANA: Chairperson, I've

14 collected one R5 cartridge case and 16 x 9 millimetre

15 cartridge cases, one-six.

16 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chair, no

17 further questions.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Any questions arising from

19 the new matter covered in re-examination? Thank you,

20 Captain, you are excused.

21 [NO FURTHER QUESTIONS – WITNESS EXCUSED]

22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Madlanga?

23 MR MADLANGA SC: Commissioners, the next

24 witness is – I'm just looking for the rank – it's Warrant

25 Officer Opperman.

Page 657

1 CHAIRPERSON: Warrant Officer, do you

2 wish to swear or to affirm?

3 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: To swear.

4 CHAIRPERSON: Would you raise your right

5 and do you swear that the evidence you will give before

6 this Commission will be the truth, the whole truth and

7 nothing but the truth, say so help me God.

8 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: So help me

9 God.

10 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may be

11 seated.

12 EXAMINATION BY MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you

13 –

14 CHAIRPERSON: The statement is before us,

15 I take it, it will be E?

16 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes, yes, Chair, thank

17 you very much. Warrant Officer, details relating to your

18 experience, training, et cetera are reflected in the

19 statement, unsigned statement. I want you to read into the

20 record paragraphs 4 and 5 of the statement.

21 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: "On the 12th of

22 August 2012 I attended and processed a crime scene

23 involving Marikana CAS107/89/2012 which is in respect of

24 the two Lonmin security officials. Captain Phule pointed

25 out to me two burnt motor vehicles, cartridges and two

Page 658

1 bodies. Using these points and my own observation I took
 2 photos and measurements of the scene and I compiled a photo
 3 plan." I also collected exhibits from the scene, Mr Chair.
 4 MR MADLANGA SC: What exhibits did you
 5 collect?
 6 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: It was
 7 cartridge cases that were found on the scene, Mr
 8 Chairperson.
 9 MR MADLANGA SC: And can you describe the
 10 cartridge cases that you found?
 11 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: It was shotgun
 12 cartridge cases and two rubber or teargas cartridge cases.
 13 MR MADLANGA SC: Before we go further, do
 14 you confirm the correctness of your statement?
 15 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 16 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 17 MR MADLANGA SC: May I refer you to the
 18 Google map in the slides? I'm referring the witness to
 19 B12, commissioners. There you have points, a point marked
 20 A and another point marked NUM offices. Where is it that
 21 you found the bodies, the burnt motor vehicles and the
 22 cartridges? Is it where it's written NUM offices or is it
 23 where it's marked A or is it elsewhere?
 24 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: It is where
 25 it's marked A, Mr Chairperson.

Page 659

1 [16:25] MR MADLANGA SC: I see in B13, the next
 2 page, you give measurements. Do you want to read those
 3 into the record?
 4 CHAIRPERSON: It's one measurement.
 5 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chair. Let
 6 me just read it and confirm if that is correct. It says
 7 here – or perhaps let me just read what is above. It says,
 8 "A the position of Marikana CAS107/08/2012 and Wonderkop
 9 Hostel. Red marker position of NUM offices" and then the
 10 measurement, "A to NUM offices 250 metres." Do you confirm
 11 that?
 12 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is the
 13 measurements taken by Colonel Botha, Mr Chairperson.
 14 MR MADLANGA SC: Is there anything else
 15 that you would like to tell the Commission about your
 16 processing of this particular scene?
 17 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: No, Mr
 18 Chairperson.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Madlanga. Mr
 20 Semenya, do you have any cross-examination?
 21 MR SEMENYA SC: No, we do not, Chair.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip?
 23 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR TIP SC: Thank
 24 you, Mr Chair. Warrant Officer Opperman, it's clear from
 25 your statement that you attended a scene with two bodies.

Page 660

1 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 2 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 3 MR TIP SC: Whom you have identified as
 4 Lonmin security officials.
 5 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 6 correct, Mr Chair.
 7 MR TIP SC: There has been the suggestion
 8 in these proceedings that there were also two people who
 9 were participating in the strike who were killed on the
 10 scene. Do you have any knowledge of that?
 11 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: I don't know
 12 of any other persons that were killed, Mr Chair.
 13 MR TIP SC: You found no other bodies on
 14 the scene?
 15 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: No other
 16 bodies were found on the scene.
 17 MR TIP SC: Thank you, Mr Chairperson.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Bruinders?
 19 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR BRUINDERS SC:
 20 Thank you, Commission, Chair. Who is Captain Phule?
 21 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: He's a Captain
 22 stationed at Marikana police station, Mr Chairperson.
 23 MR BRUINDERS SC: Why did he point the
 24 bodies out to you?
 25 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: When I arrived

Page 661

1 at the scene he met me and he told me that he's going to
 2 investigate the case and he was on the scene and he showed
 3 some points to me, Mr Chairperson.
 4 MR BRUINDERS SC: So is he a detective
 5 who was investigating what had happened on the 12th?
 6 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 7 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 8 MR BRUINDERS SC: And he's a detective
 9 stationed at Marikana?
 10 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 11 correct.
 12 MR BRUINDERS SC: Nothing else.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos?
 14 MR BIZOS SC: No questions.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Absent Mr Ntsebeza, is Mr
 16 Mpofo – do you wish to ask any questions?
 17 MR MPOFU SC: No thank you, Chairperson.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry Mr Burger, I didn't
 19 give you a chance. Do you want to ask any questions?
 20 MR BURGER SC: No thank you, Chair.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Anyone want to ask
 22 questions? I know the family of the deceased is
 23 represented, does their representative want to ask any
 24 questions?
 25 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR RAMPHELE: Thank

Page 662

1 you, Chair. Warrant Officer Opperman, what time did you
 2 attend to the scene that you referred to?
 3 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: I arrived at
 4 the scene at 25 minutes past 12, Mr Chairperson.
 5 MR RAMPHELE: And what was the date?
 6 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: It was on the
 7 12th of August.
 8 MR RAMPHELE: So this is just about two
 9 hours after the incident had happened?
 10 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 11 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 12 MR RAMPHELE: Do you remember who all was
 13 there?
 14 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: I can remember
 15 Captain Phule and Colonel Madoda, also of the detectives.
 16 MR RAMPHELE: Were the bodies of the
 17 deceased still at the scene?
 18 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That is
 19 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 20 MR RAMPHELE: And you say how far from
 21 where the bodies were lying were the NUM offices, what is
 22 the distance?
 23 CHAIRPERSON: He did - say that
 24 Lieutenant-Colonel Botha measured it because it was 250
 25 metres.

Page 663

1 MR RAMPHELE: Thank you, Chair. And can
 2 you describe just in brief how these bodies were that you
 3 found there?
 4 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: I found two
 5 bodies on the scene. One of them was, the legs you could
 6 see were still half in the vehicle. That body was badly
 7 burned and I could also see a hack mark or a mark on the
 8 head of that body. The second body was a few metres from
 9 the vehicle. There were burn marks on the chest and his
 10 trousers were also burned and he had wounds in his face.
 11 MR RAMPHELE: Now the car they were
 12 travelling in, what type of car was this? Or the car that
 13 you found a body sort of like protruding from, what type of
 14 car was that?
 15 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: At that stage
 16 you couldn't determine what type of car it was because both
 17 vehicles were totally burnt.
 18 MR RAMPHELE: But do you remember whether
 19 these were like sedans or like trucks or what type?
 20 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: Both vehicles
 21 were sedan vehicles.
 22 MR RAMPHELE: Now this was two hours
 23 after the incident, were the only police officers that were
 24 there, Phule and Madoda? Were they the only - except for
 25 you, of course?

Page 664

1 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: There were
 2 also police officers of Marikana police station and some of
 3 the security of Lonmin.
 4 MR RAMPHELE: And you yourself did not,
 5 you only arrived at the scene two hours - you were not
 6 there before? You yourself don't - you don't have any
 7 information about what happened there.
 8 WARRANT OFFICER OPPERMAN: That's
 9 correct, Mr Chairperson.
 10 MR RAMPHELE: Thank you, there's no
 11 further questions.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Anyone else want to ask
 13 questions?
 14 MR MADLANGA SC: None, thank you Chair.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Warrant Officer,
 16 you are excused.
 17 [NO FURTHER QUESTIONS - WITNESS EXCUSED]
 18 MR MADLANGA SC: The next witness,
 19 Chair and commissioners, is going to be quite long - or
 20 perhaps because we still have a bit of time I should start
 21 but he will not complete his evidence-in-chief, but I have
 22 no problem starting.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Let's start because the
 24 half an hour used today won't be required tomorrow. Carry
 25 on.

Page 665

1 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chair. May I
 2 call Captain Mohlaki, please?
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Captain, do you wish to
 4 swear or to affirm?
 5 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: To swear.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Do you swear that the
 7 evidence you'll give before this Commission will be the
 8 truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth. Please
 9 raise your right hand and say so help me God.
 10 CAPTAIN APOLLO JEREMIAH MOHLAKI: So help
 11 me God.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, you may be
 13 seated. They tell me that - have you turned your
 14 microphone on? You're no longer a source of interference.
 15 EXAMINATION BY MR MADLANGA SC: Captain,
 16 just for - it should be FJ.
 17 Thank you, thank you Chair. And Captain, your
 18 experience, training, et cetera are reflected in the
 19 statement. Do you confirm the correctness of the entire
 20 contents of the statement?
 21 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair
 22 and the commissioners.
 23 MR MADLANGA SC: Commissioners, I've been
 24 advised by Ms or Adv Malunga that the media are interested
 25 in the full names of the people. Captain, is it so that

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 666</p> <p>1 your full names are Apollo Jeremiah Mohlaki, Mohlaki being 2 M-O-H-L-A-K-I. 3 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair 4 and commissioners, Apollo Jeremiah Mohlaki. 5 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you. Captain, can 6 you read paragraphs 4 and 5 of your statement into the 7 record? 8 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thank you, Chair and 9 commissioners. "I am instructed in photography" – 10 MR MADLANGA SC: No, no, sorry – sorry. 11 CHAIRPERSON: There are two paragraph 12 4's, I think he means paragraph 4 bis or you mean paragraph 13 4 bis which is the top of the second page. 14 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes Chair, thank you 15 very much. Paragraph 4 on the next page, yes. 16 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thank you, Chair and 17 commissioners. "On the 16 August 2012 I attended and 18 processed a crime scene involving Marikana CAS138/8/2012 19 and at what has come to be known as scene 2 at Wonderkop 20 Marikana. Warrant Officer Monama indicated some points to 21 me. Using these points and my own observation I took 22 photos and measurements of the scene. Constable Molefe 23 made a video recording of the scene. I compiled a photo 24 plan using an aerial photo of the scene. I also collected 25 exhibits from the scene."</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 668</p> <p>1 departed. 2 CHAIRPERSON: No, you made the entries in 3 your diary more or less contemporaneously – 4 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair. 5 CHAIRPERSON: You refresh your memory 6 from the entries therein? 7 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair. 8 CHAIRPERSON: Okay, you may look at your 9 diary. 10 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thank you, Chair and 11 commissioners. I started at 16:00 on the 16th of August 12 2012. Then I departed the scene at 15:10 the following 13 day, the 17th August 2012. 14 MR MADLANGA SC: Does that mean 15 throughout that period from 16:00 to 15:10, you say, you 16 did not knock off at all, you just worked flat out 17 continuously? 18 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, M'Lord 19 and commissioners. 20 MR MADLANGA SC: Let me take you to a 21 Google map that is on the slide in front of you – 22 CHAIRPERSON: Before we have the Google 23 map, can I just ask him a question? Did I understand you 24 to say that at 16:00 on the 16th August you were at the 25 scene?</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 667</p> <p>1 MR MADLANGA SC: On the 1st of October 2 2012 you took part in an inspection in loco that was held 3 at what you referred to as scene 2, not so? 4 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair 5 and commissioners. 6 MR MADLANGA SC: And there you pointed 7 out various spots to the Commission. 8 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair 9 and commissioners. 10 MR MADLANGA SC: Do you confirm the 11 truthfulness of what you pointed out to the Commission at 12 the inspection? 13 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair 14 and commissioners. 15 MR MADLANGA SC: Now can you tell the 16 Commission from what time to what time you processed scene 17 2? 18 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thank you, Chair and 19 commissioners. I don't know, can I refer to my diary? 20 MR MADLANGA SC: Yes, you may. Chair? 21 CHAIRPERSON: I take it your diary, the 22 entries in your diary were made more or less 23 contemporaneously, were they? 24 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Chair, I did record the 25 time that I started but I'm not sure about the time I</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 669</p> <p>1 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, Chair 2 and commissioners. 3 CHAIRPERSON: Had the incident happened 4 yet? 5 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Come again, sir? 6 CHAIRPERSON: Had the shooting happened 7 yet, shootings happened yet? 8 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Ja, when we arrived 9 there I think the scene was still active because the 10 police, with the movement of the police officials and the 11 paramedics at the scene. 12 [16:45] MR MADLANGA SC: Was there any shooting 13 taking place when you arrived there? 14 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Not at all, Chair and 15 commissioners. 16 MR MADLANGA SC: When you, or just before 17 you went to process that scene at 16:00, where had you 18 been? 19 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: We were posted at, they 20 call it holding area 1, somewhere around Lonmin. It was an 21 open veld where we were requested to stay as to be on 22 standby. 23 MR MADLANGA SC: And who is it that had 24 asked you to be on standby there? 25 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Chair, I think if you</p>

Page 670

1 allow me to explain what happened according to the briefing
 2 that I got on the 16th. In the morning of the 16th 2012
 3 August, I attended a morning briefing.
 4 MR MADLANGA SC: Where was this briefing?
 5 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: The briefing was held
 6 at Lonmin JOC.
 7 MR MADLANGA SC: And who conducted the
 8 briefing?
 9 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: There were a couple of
 10 senior officers from SAPS. I still remember General
 11 Adeline, Brigadier Calitz, Brigadier –
 12 MR MADLANGA SC: Captain, please be
 13 careful. Do not speak at the same time as the interpreter.
 14 There will be problems with the transcription. You should
 15 wait until he is done.
 16 INTERPRETER: Thank you.
 17 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thanks, Chair and
 18 commissioners.
 19 MR MADLANGA SC: Now, would the name
 20 perhaps not be General Annandale?
 21 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: I get difficulty
 22 pronouncing that surname but just like on that version,
 23 yes, Annandale.
 24 MR MADLANGA SC: And I thought you
 25 mentioned the second, or rather another name as well. Who

Page 671

1 did you say or rather what's that name?
 2 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: It was Brigadier
 3 Calitz.
 4 MR MADLANGA SC: And what exactly was the
 5 briefing?
 6 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: We were – we have to
 7 submit our strand. Our strand, I'm referring that when
 8 they ask the representative from LCRC how many members are
 9 there, then I have to account, then we were four. Then the
 10 briefing was, we must be on standby. There is an
 11 information or agreement that there will be a possibility
 12 of the people who are gathering at the mine, at the koppie,
 13 they will be surrendering some dangerous traditional
 14 weapons, possibly with some unlawful ammunition that will
 15 be in their possession and they will withdraw. Then we
 16 will be called to come and record, take photos with the
 17 detectives of those dangerous traditional weapons.
 18 MR MADLANGA SC: What time or round about
 19 what time was this briefing?
 20 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thanks, Chair and
 21 commissioners, I'll have to refer to my diary. I arrived
 22 there at 16:05 – sorry, 06:05 in the morning.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: You were asked what time
 24 was the briefing. You got there at five past six in the
 25 morning, what time was the briefing actually?

Page 672

1 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thank you, Chair and
 2 commissioners. When I got there they were already started
 3 with the briefing.
 4 MR MADLANGA SC: After the briefing did
 5 you immediately proceed to the forward holding, or rather
 6 to forward holding area number 1 or did you remain at
 7 Lonmin for some time?
 8 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: After the briefing I
 9 went outside to brief the three members that I was posted
 10 with at Lonmin. I never recorded the time when we departed
 11 there but I will estimate past nine to 10 we went to that
 12 holding area.
 13 MR MADLANGA SC: Did you ever leave that
 14 holding area or were you there until the time you attended
 15 at scene 2 at the time that you earlier indicated?
 16 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: That's correct, sir, I
 17 stayed there until we were called to come and process the
 18 crime scene.
 19 MR MADLANGA SC: Can I now take you to
 20 the Google map? B46, Chair and commissioners, B46. I do
 21 not know if you were here when the South African Police
 22 Service made its opening statement but if you were not,
 23 part of what that statement said was that the South African
 24 Police Service takes issue with your positioning of the
 25 cartridges on B46, which is the Google map. Do you wish to

Page 673

1 comment on that? Do you accept that there are inaccuracies
 2 in – or ja, with regard to where the cartridge cases or
 3 cartridges have been placed on the Google map?
 4 MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, perhaps we
 5 were misunderstood. The issue with the Google map was
 6 simply that there certainly were more cartridges than were
 7 captured by the LCRC, not that those captured are in
 8 incorrect places.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, I take it that
 10 shortens this part of the evidence.
 11 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, I'm indebted
 12 to my learned colleague but I will still ask the question
 13 in a different way. Now forgetting about what the SAPS
 14 presentation says, are there inaccuracies in the reflection
 15 of where the cartridge cases were on the Google map?
 16 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Correct, Chair and
 17 commissioners.
 18 MR MADLANGA SC: I think the correct verb
 19 that you use in your technical language is to plot, who
 20 plotted the cartridges on this Google map?
 21 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: It was Lieutenant-
 22 Colonel Scott.
 23 MR MADLANGA SC: Can you explain how that
 24 came about and how exactly that unfolded?
 25 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Thanks, Chair and

1 commissioners. We visited Potchefstroom for consultation
 2 with the SAPS advocates. I just want to check and confirm
 3 the date. That's correct, 2012/09/11. After consultation
 4 with – it was three advocates representing SAPS – because
 5 we were not briefed when I left Rustenburg to Potch, that
 6 they will need a model of a crime scene so that they can
 7 understand what happened on that day of the 16th of August
 8 2012, so I did some rough sketches to indicate to them. So
 9 fortunately Lieutenant-Colonel Scott was there in the
 10 conference room, but not the room where we were with the
 11 advocate. So he asked me that he can help us with the
 12 model of the crime scene if I'm having the co-ordinates of
 13 the crime scene. Then I explained to Colonel Scott that I
 14 do have co-ordinates but I don't have any documents with me
 15 so that I can present to him to plot those points, then I
 16 will e-mail the GPS readings.
 17 MR MADLANGA SC: And the GPS readings are
 18 what you have been referring to as co-ordinates?
 19 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Yes, Chair and
 20 commissioners. Then I'm not sure about the date but I did
 21 e-mail Colonel Scott the co-ordinates to plot for me and he
 22 e-mailed back the Google Earth with plots of these points.
 23 MR MADLANGA SC: And are you satisfied
 24 with how he plotted the cartridge cases, et cetera on the
 25 Google map?

1 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: Not at all because when
 2 I compared the Google map, some of the points, with my
 3 rough sketch, some points were not matching.
 4 MR MADLANGA SC: Can you address those?
 5 Can you explain to the Chairperson and commissioners what
 6 the inaccuracies are?
 7 CHAIRPERSON: May I ask, have you re-
 8 plotted them on another Google map? It would be easier if
 9 you re-plotted them rather than just told us by referring
 10 to Lieutenant-Colonel Scott's map, which ones are wrong.
 11 Have you done that, re-plotted them?
 12 CAPTAIN MOHLAKI: No Chair, I've just
 13 drawn a sketch plan that is on the following slide.
 14 MR MADLANGA SC: May I refer the
 15 commissioners to B47? But I wanted us to deal with this
 16 more fully because when one then looks at the sketch, the
 17 sketch and the Google map, there will be a mismatch at
 18 certain places.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: Alright.
 20 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Is this a suitable stage
 22 for us to adjourn or do you want to perform that exercise
 23 before we adjourn?
 24 MR MADLANGA SC: A suitable stage, Chair.
 25 CHAIRPERSON: Very well.

1 MR MADLANGA SC: Chair, may I just ask
 2 quickly-quickly to hand up a page, it should be part of –
 3 it should be part of B, Chair, perhaps let's mark it B88,
 4 the very last page of Exhibit B and –
 5 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you Mr Madlanga.
 6 MR MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chair.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Have your
 8 learned friends got copies of this?
 9 MR MADLANGA SC: I asked that they be
 10 given copies - was it this morning – this morning, Chair.
 11 Colleagues, it's a document marked "Scene 2 legend."
 12 Please don't ask me about the word "legend" there. I
 13 myself do not know what the import is.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: It's a kind of a key to the
 15 map. Mr Mpofo, did you want to tell us what legend was or
 16 have you got some other statement to make?
 17 MR MPOFU SC: No, Chair, I'm assuring
 18 that Mr Madlanga is done. It's a completely unrelated
 19 matter. Chair, I simply wanted to indicate something and
 20 also the fact that tomorrow morning I might want to address
 21 one or two preliminary issues when you give the slot for
 22 preliminary issues in the morning, but one of them will
 23 relate – I've seen that at least five of the arrested
 24 people have just walked in and I just wanted to express my
 25 gratitude to you, Chair, and to Mr Semenya for the

1 assistance and – but I'll give, once I've spoken to them
 2 I'll give a fuller report as to who is not here and so on,
 3 as part of what I will say tomorrow morning.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: I don't know that I deserve
 5 any gratitude but I understand that Mr Semenya does. I'm
 6 glad you put it on record.
 7 MR MPOFU SC: I insist, Chair, that you
 8 do – and the commissioners – for any assistance that you
 9 gave us and the space for the discussions that were
 10 obviously fruitful. Thank you.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: I'm glad that the
 12 discussions that were held yesterday, which were to find
 13 out a way of solving that particular problem, have
 14 ultimately come to a successful conclusion and I want to
 15 congratulate, on behalf of my colleagues and myself, all
 16 those who took part in those discussions which were not
 17 only successful but I understand conducted in a very
 18 harmonious and appropriate manner and it reflects credit on
 19 everyone concerned.
 20 MR SEMENYA SC: Thanks Chair.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: We will adjourn until 9AM
 22 tomorrow morning.
 23 [INQUIRY ADJOURNED]
 24 .
 25 .

A				
<p>able 498:13 514:3 534:24 546:8 551:1 557:8,8 626:17,22 636:15 absence 556:20 609:18 613:3,18 622:20,24 Absent 661:15 Absolutely 591:24 accept 506:22,25 507:2 541:18 545:8 561:22 562:5 573:21,22 574:11 575:2,24 577:2 580:14,17 581:3,7,8 582:9,10 584:21 589:23 590:2 595:11,14 596:21 601:18 603:25 627:17 627:19 673:1 acceptable 551:9 acceptance 561:19 accepted 518:25 access 621:16 accompanied 617:24 account 671:9 accounted 601:14 accounts 517:10 accuracy 650:4 accurate 507:13 act 510:17 580:23 581:5 action 556:11 635:14 actions 507:24,25 active 543:1 568:10,14 669:9 actual 508:2 509:3 549:15 627:4 additional 580:10 address 545:21,23,24 675:4 676:20 addressed 490:12 501:25 600:6 addressing 507:7 Adeline 670:11 adequate 501:15 adjourn 527:20 594:4 675:22,23 677:21 ADJOURNED 677:23 adjournment 527:12 527:13,15,19 593:17 594:4,12 637:17 ADJOURNS 527:22 594:7 637:20 admissible 508:20 admit 510:1 Adv 490:23 491:9,9,14 532:17 533:10 541:13 551:11 638:7 665:24 advance 493:16 advanced 490:18,20 545:4 advise 490:16 advised 665:24 advocate 542:6 674:11 advocates 674:2,4</p>	<p>aerial 539:14,25 540:8 566:22 568:25 580:23 581:2,5 586:12 592:20 597:2 607:22 621:16 623:24 624:1 625:5,25 628:23 641:13 666:24 Affairs 606:16 affirm 639:10 657:2 665:4 affixed 497:12 498:3,8 afgelê 491:19 Africa 490:9,13 African 546:12 578:3 595:17 600:5 602:12 609:8,13 611:19 612:3 638:16,18 672:21,23 Afrikaans 633:16,18 afternoon 490:5 575:9 584:17,24 585:2 agenda 532:22 agendas 536:3,3 ago 608:21 agree 543:25 544:5,8 555:12 558:22 559:21 611:23 624:6 642:1 agreed 594:14 610:9 agreement 671:11 agrees 490:20 Aid 490:4,9,13 air 503:19,22 516:20 533:5 566:22 567:13 567:14 575:12 579:4 580:16 581:10 585:7 588:13 589:22,25 590:4,13 614:17 615:2,6 632:7,9 airborne 566:7 568:16 568:23 569:9,18 571:18 aircraft 505:21 album 521:1,2 522:1 550:9 552:9 algemene 593:9 allegations 556:5 alleged 556:11 559:5 allow 494:19 562:24 670:1 allowed 491:13 allowing 505:20 alright 520:12 552:18 573:9 621:6 623:23 654:24 675:19 amateur 522:7 ammunition 556:7 565:2 600:25 671:14 analysis 546:16,16 André 504:8,9,11 505:4 and/or 556:14 584:8 Annandale 500:6,19,22 501:12 503:4,6 532:14 533:8,15 534:8 536:10 670:20 670:23 announce 620:16</p>	<p>annual 507:20 answer 497:16 506:9 511:16 512:25 513:23 513:25 525:13 526:17 527:7 529:24 530:5 538:4 545:14 554:6 558:11 559:11 560:10 560:11 568:22 569:6 570:10,14 571:2 578:11 579:12,14,17 579:20 585:18 588:25 594:17 618:7,24 619:3 621:14 622:2,3 624:15 633:13 634:1 651:8 answered 525:5 619:14 620:2 answering 512:24 620:4 answers 546:9 561:3 618:14 634:23 anxiety 494:22 anxious 590:12 anybody 589:16 613:14 655:20 anymore 515:10 562:17 anyway 562:6,16 567:22 apart 524:23 589:17 623:25 Apollo 665:10 666:1,4 apparently 521:11 appear 502:5 515:15 549:9 552:24 560:18 561:5 613:6 appeared 495:3 615:22 appearing 510:22 638:10 appears 527:2 561:3 617:6 621:3 applicable 507:21 application 655:14 apply 655:11 applying 491:12 appreciate 545:8 approaching 494:4 514:19 appropriate 505:3 527:15 546:4 551:4 562:4,5 677:18 area 499:8,9,10,13,25 513:19 514:6 523:1 542:14,23,23 557:7 570:19,19 571:10,18 572:11 575:3,11 589:23 607:18 653:18 669:20 672:6,12,14 areas 499:8 513:12 514:1 515:4 545:9 546:25 aren't 559:9 argue 559:18 584:14 arguments 490:18,20 526:22 arises 527:12</p>	<p>arising 541:22 608:6,7 616:15 656:18 arm 495:22 armed 565:2,6 arms 566:25 arose 562:21 arranged 552:15 arrangement 550:20 550:22 551:10 arrested 490:14,24 515:13 621:8 676:23 arrive 498:23 584:16 648:3 arrived 496:4 498:21 498:22,24 502:2 590:10 648:5 653:2 653:21 660:25 662:3 664:5 669:8,13 671:21 ascertain 525:11 556:18 593:17 ascertainable 650:5 ascribed 512:2 aside 502:1 asked 495:12 496:16 501:1,24 506:14 514:22 516:17,19 525:24 526:18 533:1 539:1 541:2,15 548:3 554:5 563:2 589:19 596:13,22 597:1,5,8 597:10,14,19 605:16 605:18 606:1 611:5 612:25 618:14 619:8 619:12,15 621:12,17 621:24 622:5 624:13 633:23 634:8,10,16 634:24 669:24 671:23 674:11 676:9 asking 502:25 507:3 517:8 523:2 534:20 534:25 538:20 545:4 545:17 546:21 550:14 556:2 561:1,6 562:17 589:16 600:1 627:10 634:16 647:13 656:3 asks 526:25 590:25 aspect 567:20 573:1,10 608:8 650:23 aspects 558:10 assist 497:1 519:11 545:12 547:1 580:9 652:9,10,14 assistance 677:1,8 assisted 547:6 assisting 652:12 assume 499:12 527:24 532:21 537:2 571:9 575:8,14 584:7 588:16 599:2 626:21 641:4 assumed 625:25 assumes 559:4 assuming 499:15,18 assumption 524:18 571:13,15</p>	<p>assuring 676:17 astonished 638:24 atmosphere 494:19 atrocities 559:8,9 attached 508:6 521:1,1 attempt 512:7 attend 531:17 589:10 601:5 646:12 662:2 attendance 532:13,18 538:13 609:9 612:3 attended 531:15,19,21 532:4,6,19 534:4,7 535:7,25 536:4 640:23 657:22 659:25 666:17 670:3 672:14 attendees 500:25 attention 507:9 513:20 537:2,11 543:18,20 544:1,3 611:15 613:1 636:20 attorney 542:6 651:8 Attorneys 490:15,25 audiovisual 610:11 612:5,14,24 August 496:2 503:1 522:23 532:8 543:11 543:15 569:4 575:2 579:19 580:13 581:5 584:1 589:23 592:14 594:16 595:3 606:18 606:23 608:17 614:16 615:23 622:11 628:16 640:23 657:22 662:7 666:17 668:11,13,24 670:3 674:7 avail 519:14 available 491:18 518:4 522:23 523:5 526:13 527:3 546:25 551:16 551:22 557:17 593:13 595:8,8 607:23 610:21 612:18 624:9 624:11 627:14 651:16 655:14 aware 499:14 500:15 501:1,5 507:21 508:22 514:11 525:16 525:23 526:4 528:15 531:5 537:16,17 540:3 545:11 550:20 583:16,19 598:19 611:20 612:4 617:8 630:4 632:17 A1 507:15 A1-size 607:13,24 A197/1 532:13 A197/2 501:4 A197/3 500:18 A213 519:1</p>
				<p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>B 507:16 646:11,14 647:6,6,9,11,14 676:3 676:4 back 503:7 520:24 531:3 541:25 551:8</p>

558:19 572:4 576:18 577:3,6 590:10 602:23 605:13,16 606:2 614:15 617:19 628:1 635:24 649:17 649:24 651:10 674:22 backdrop 494:17 background 526:24 563:4 bad 520:17 badger 510:22 badly 663:6 bail 621:3 623:1 Baloyi 563:17 Bar 491:10 563:15 based 498:22 basically 542:13 basis 518:24 batteries 501:15,22 battery 501:19 battle 514:15 battling 515:5,6 bear 567:22 591:18 bearing 639:20 beg 567:5 646:22 beginning 506:14 507:16 508:15 590:10 590:11 600:7 begins 508:2 509:4 behalf 573:3 584:14 600:5 618:3,5 677:15 belief 602:24 believe 550:21 560:14 624:24 639:23 believing 600:23 601:16,19 bell 601:20 belonged 621:10 623:24 belonging 621:9 623:2 623:9 benefited 506:18 best 534:16 better 496:17 514:2 623:14 654:13 beyond 540:3 big 545:10 575:15 587:5,13 588:7 589:8 589:10,15 593:4,8,8 601:7 652:9 bis 666:12,13 bit 530:19 531:4 540:10 541:14 556:1 584:19 584:19 664:20 Bizos 620:12,14,17,21 654:8,10,11 661:13 661:14 black 522:1 blissfully 584:3 bloodstain 546:15,16 blue 637:4 board 490:4,11,17,19 boarded 563:18 bodies 529:7,7,11,13 556:8 581:13 583:21 632:10 633:21 636:12	658:1,21 659:25 660:13,16,24 662:16 662:21 663:2,5 body 529:14,22 642:7 642:25 643:14 644:6 644:6,18 645:3,3,10 645:11,16 647:17 648:23 649:1 663:6,8 663:8,13 Bolmulwa 517:25 519:7 Botha's 550:7 596:4 639:23 641:14 645:17 647:6 bottom 520:15 549:2 brand 631:15 brass 499:14 595:17 598:6 609:8 break 508:11,12 517:9 517:12 breaking 622:12 brief 567:25 599:10,10 663:2 672:9 briefed 674:5 briefing 567:9 670:1,3 670:4,5,8 671:5,10,19 671:24,25 672:3,4,8 briefly 586:6 590:8 617:19 Brig 513:15,18 Brigadiers 532:15 bring 496:15,16,16,17 567:20 625:20 Brits 548:25 broke 601:4 607:15 622:8 brought 496:17 497:2 508:22 600:19 Bruinders 616:14,17 617:1,6,13,18,23 618:1,8,11,15,19,23 619:8,14,17,20,23 620:4,10,11 646:5,8 646:14,22 647:8,15 647:18,23 648:2,7,11 648:14,18,21,25 649:3,6,8,11,14,18,21 649:24 650:1,6,9,16 650:25 651:7,12,22 651:24 652:3,5,7,10 652:14,17,22 653:2,6 653:10,14,17,22 654:1,3,5 660:18,19 660:23 661:4,8,12 Budlender 490:23 541:13 bullet 508:2,3,5,6,8,10 508:11,16,18 bundle 507:6,6 550:9 565:13 621:4,4,5 burn 663:9 burned 663:7,10 burnt 657:25 658:21 663:17 Burton 528:10 bushes 600:23 601:17	business 493:25 494:5 494:9 578:15 busy 520:20 547:22 567:18 582:6 byways 557:5 B1 646:17,25 B10 643:6,9 644:1 656:9 B11 644:12 B12 658:19 B13 659:1 B46 672:20,20,25 B47 675:15 B88 676:3 B9 641:9 643:3 <hr/> C C 507:18 621:5 Calitz 670:11 671:3 call 502:1 524:4 542:17 563:9 570:20 572:19 585:11 586:24 594:23 604:7 617:8,8 648:19 665:2 669:20 called 573:10 614:6 616:6 651:25 652:8 653:18 671:16 672:17 calls 541:17 cameraman 625:3 cameras 497:7,9,10,19 501:16,17,21 621:15 623:5,22 624:14,16 624:17,19 625:20 627:18 628:25 camera's 495:22 508:4 605:8,14 606:3 cannon 627:17,22,25 628:4 cannons 628:3,10,17,24 cannon's 627:21 canon 524:13,14 canons 600:12,17,17,19 can't 494:7 513:23 515:23 520:15,17 523:22 524:4 532:2 537:14 538:2 544:10 551:2 553:4,20 554:18 558:1 569:6 569:24 571:14,24 575:18 577:2 581:23 583:6,23 584:18 587:10 588:4,5 598:13,17 600:16,18 601:6,8 604:23 608:9 610:2,5 613:8 614:25 618:13 619:1 621:3 627:20 629:16 630:11 636:22,24 cap 509:13,14 capable 628:17 capacity 580:2,4 capture 501:5 513:7 515:7,19 558:15 569:9 625:20 captured 563:19 564:7 564:17,18,19 623:3	632:22,23 673:7,7 capturing 512:3 car 663:11,12,12,14,16 card 508:20 career 608:25 careful 670:13 carried 588:17 carry 494:24 523:10 535:1,4 542:10 551:24 562:8 563:11 567:22 656:7 664:24 cartridge 643:18 645:10 655:24,25 656:11,11,14,15 658:7,10,12,12 673:2 673:15 674:24 cartridges 655:24,25 657:25 658:22 672:25 673:3,6,20 CAS 507:21 528:23 case 508:22 534:21 543:21 544:2,10,10 547:9 560:16,20 562:1,10 592:10 613:9 614:7 643:7 650:23 654:20 655:2 655:3 656:14 661:2 cases 530:9 542:20 543:12,15 643:18 645:10 655:25,25 656:11,11,15 658:7 658:10,12,12 673:2 673:15 674:24 CAS107/08/2012 659:8 CAS107/89/2012 657:23 CAS115 530:6 643:9 CAS115-119/8/2012 529:4 CAS115/8/2012 640:24 642:25 645:12 CAS116/08/2012 641:25 CAS116/8/2012 644:20 CAS117 529:12,12 CAS117/8/2012 645:18 CAS119 529:15 CAS121 530:2 CAS138/8/2012 666:18 caught 537:1,11 caused 510:6 CCTV 621:9,11,15 623:2,5,5,8,21,22,25 624:1 627:18 628:22 CD 606:13,14 central 614:14 centre 496:4 499:10 532:9 certain 548:5 565:16 594:1 596:1 604:18 631:19 633:13 642:13 642:15 675:18 certainly 497:18 562:3 609:14 673:6 cetera 640:19 657:18 665:18 674:24	chaired 534:3 535:6 536:7,9,9,13 chairman 490:7 494:16 496:23,25 505:1 507:4 511:19 514:9 517:2,4 519:13,23 520:5 521:18 522:5 522:14 527:16,18 528:1,8 540:1,24 541:5,13,19 563:13 566:1 567:24 594:11 606:1 637:23 639:5 646:2 655:22 challenging 609:22 chance 558:3 661:19 change 490:21 changed 508:14 charge 578:14 650:21 652:18 charged 501:19,21 601:12 Chaskalson 491:20 492:1,9 493:5,7 494:2 551:12 650:20 651:3 check 498:1 501:13,19 570:22 624:21,25 625:1,17,22 651:15 674:2 checking 628:16 650:4 cheek 649:20 chest 663:9 chief 490:8 choice 517:7 choppers 503:17 522:25 523:14,16 624:19 circle 644:2 circling 571:18 circulated 493:19 536:3 circumstances 542:15 citizen 599:3,5 civil 590:4 civilian 505:25 506:5,9 631:13 642:7,25 648:24 civilians 641:1 claim 545:1 clarify 510:14 619:7 clarity 532:23 542:13 562:25 584:16 618:14 636:15 638:10 clause 559:15 clear 540:9 542:6 556:12,19 559:14 560:17,21 562:16 610:20 612:6,7 659:24 clearer 512:8 599:25 clearly 508:12 515:23 553:9 555:10 557:7 557:15 577:1 578:14 590:24 596:10 604:20 607:9 615:18 625:21 clients 545:1 close 641:21 644:2
--	---	--	--	---

<p>closely 570:21 closer 503:10 553:8 567:20 closing 503:3 clothing 505:8 506:11 631:13 cold-blooded 559:2 cold-bloodedly 556:17 colleague 609:7 673:12 colleagues 563:9 574:21 638:9 676:11 677:15 collect 658:5 collected 612:10,19 656:14 658:3 666:24 collecting 652:13 collision 635:18 Colonel's 550:14 629:5 637:18 colour 522:3 641:20 Column 507:15,16,18 507:19,19,20 columns 507:15 COM 500:24 532:9 come 493:13 496:1,22 504:25 505:3 523:14 526:9 532:5 572:4 605:13 613:14 619:4 639:7 652:8,23 666:19 669:5 671:16 672:17 677:14 comes 560:13 562:4 577:2 655:6 coming 545:18 577:6 command 580:23 581:2 581:6,15 586:12 commander 500:20 503:11 559:24 560:3 564:13 commanders 598:2 commence 503:5,8,12 584:23 commenced 630:20 commencing 627:13 comment 507:5 544:11 554:9 558:1 565:5 578:16,17 585:22,23 586:10,17 590:6 629:2 673:1 commentary 507:10 613:15,25 commentator 508:5 commented 533:14 comments 506:24 507:19 508:16 commission 490:3 492:4,12,13,18,25 493:15,17 494:6 496:3 518:6 521:24 526:9 527:20,23 530:19,23 531:1 536:18 538:8,15 547:5,16 560:17,17 560:19 561:24 563:20 564:6 565:9 568:8 575:1,21 579:17</p>	<p>580:9 581:12 583:8 586:14 588:16 590:18 592:11 594:4,8 599:2 600:6 602:7,11 603:11 610:3 624:9 627:4 637:21 639:13 654:19 657:6 659:15 660:20 665:7 667:7 667:11,16 commissioned 517:24 517:24 commissioner 499:25 500:3 517:25 519:7 530:25 536:17 537:6 577:2 578:11 602:6 602:10,16 commissioners 490:8 519:13 637:7 639:6 639:22,23 645:19 655:22 656:23 658:19 664:19 665:22,23 666:4,9,17 667:5,9,14 667:19 668:11,19 669:2,15 670:18 671:21 672:2,20 673:17 674:1,20 675:5,15 677:8 Commission's 490:19 committee 490:17,20 common 621:25 comms 575:17,18 communicate 559:14 communication 575:3 575:10,16 577:12 580:18,19 621:16 623:24 624:1 628:23 communications 635:7 635:10 636:8,10,16 636:17 company 609:25 compare 588:24 compared 675:2 comparisons 546:14 compiled 520:25 658:2 666:23 complete 529:23 664:21 completely 676:18 complied 509:2 560:23 561:5,20 562:1 comply 510:7 561:12 comprehensive 536:16 computer 549:7 601:5 comrades 588:23 concede 562:14 conceded 523:13 concentrate 570:19 636:25 concentration 525:10 concern 493:9 599:5 concerned 517:1 539:7 557:3 639:1 677:19 concerns 493:8,9 conclude 522:13 615:5 concluded 516:16 517:2,6</p>	<p>concludes 614:13 conclusion 602:14,18 602:21 607:1 677:14 concur 519:24 conditions 508:17 conducted 670:7 677:17 conference 492:2 574:25 674:10 confidence 599:16 confine 507:2 confirm 490:22 496:6,8 506:3,6,9 511:22 522:10 535:13 554:2 554:3 584:19 612:8,8 623:19,20 628:24 637:8,13 640:15,17 642:17 646:10 658:14 659:6,10 665:19 667:10 674:2 confirmed 492:23 518:12 651:9 confirming 514:13 congratulate 677:15 connection 492:19 consider 491:24 493:24 513:17 522:22 523:11 523:12 considered 490:18 523:3 consisted 629:21 Constant 666:22 constant 571:11,18,24 575:2,9,17,18 consultation 674:1,3 consultations 655:6 contact 571:11,14,19 571:22,24 575:22 contacted 572:4 contain 518:6 contained 628:10 CONTD 528:7 contemporaneously 667:23 668:3 content 513:14 514:2 515:20 613:23 635:7 contents 492:19,20 640:15 665:20 context 582:4 contextualised 502:20 continue 494:12 642:21 645:1,8 CONTINUED 495:2 continuous 542:22 continuously 668:17 contrary 629:16 contravention 492:21 contribution 595:16 596:3,4 605:13 control 569:10 582:3,8 582:12 586:19 controversial 613:22 controversy 612:6 convened 532:2 convenient 493:24 594:2,3</p>	<p>convening 531:25 conversation 502:3,6 502:20 583:13,24 604:11 convey 655:1 cool 585:5 copies 491:17 496:19 497:3 641:9 676:8,10 copy 519:14,21 522:1 639:24 641:4 CORNELIUS 495:1 corrected 603:24 correcting 630:18,19 630:21 correction 587:8 correctly 514:22 529:10 539:23 548:20 548:24 615:9 631:17 632:16 633:3 correctness 637:9 642:18 658:14 665:19 couldn't 525:6 539:17 576:18 605:2 616:10 663:16 could've 506:9 558:14 583:4 616:10 counsel 497:18 511:5,9 518:10 524:21 526:18 526:24 533:6 538:20 539:8 541:20 562:19 647:1 counsel's 538:24 count 514:25 country 610:1 couple 528:13 670:9 course 534:18 556:18 590:14,16 603:2,4 663:25 court 508:22 cover 546:9 568:1 coverage 616:5 covered 526:21 532:24 567:17 656:19 covering 497:13 498:2 co-ordinates 674:12,14 674:18,21 co-pilot 504:2,11,13 520:22 521:9,11,11 521:12,17,21 585:13 credibility 609:23 credit 677:18 crevices 600:23 601:17 crew 503:24 504:2,14 504:15 521:14,17 crime 498:7 509:7 532:16 542:18 543:1 543:1 546:13 568:10 568:13,14 595:24 597:8,9,12 618:6,9,25 619:6 625:10,11 633:25 634:2,20,21 640:24 641:14,14 647:7 648:3,10,17,19 651:4,25 652:17,24 653:3,21 657:22 666:18 672:18 674:6</p>	<p>674:12,13 crimes 596:7 criminal 492:21 criminalistic 544:19 546:12 Criminology 596:9 cross 567:17 630:17 643:18 646:6 crossed 643:13 crosses 643:15 cross-examination 495:2 515:3 528:7 544:22 547:21 551:6 561:4 567:20 608:6 616:14,16,17 621:1 627:13 637:7 646:8 659:20,23 660:19 661:25 cross-examine 541:24 620:20 cross-examiner 506:24 cross-examining 494:14 527:24 594:9 crowd 514:18 582:3,5,8 582:12 586:19,21 587:5,12 588:11 crowds 565:3,10,23 588:7 curious 634:9 custody 655:5 C05 642:6 644:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>D 507:19 640:8,9,11 dangerous 601:13 671:13,17 date 507:16 508:3 509:4 535:14 553:21 553:22 631:7,9 662:5 674:3,20 dated 490:12 519:8 dates 528:24 day 496:2 497:10,13 499:13,20 500:16,24 501:2,23 506:17,25 508:3 509:4 521:3 525:20 526:11 531:7 531:18,19,20,20 532:18 533:2,4 534:3 534:9,12 535:6,10,13 536:7,7,9 538:5,11 548:11 553:19 564:7 564:17 565:1 567:3 575:8 578:5,15 582:3 582:14,19 584:16 585:20 588:13 592:25 593:3,19 618:20 624:3 639:22 651:3 653:11,13,23 668:13 674:7 days 531:6,10,11,12,16 531:16,16,22 535:9 535:16,17,18,18 536:10 537:10 538:6 538:12,13,23 539:11 540:5 588:21 589:5</p>
---	---	---	---	--

<p>589:15 596:3 602:20 602:23 618:2,20,24 619:2,25 620:7,9 622:13 628:8 629:14 day's 593:5 dead 581:13,20 583:19 583:21 631:25 636:12 641:1 deal 546:10 547:21 563:20 568:5 573:4 589:3 646:20 675:15 dealing 502:9 573:3 death 560:20 debate 529:21 559:18 560:8 594:15 606:15 606:20,21 debating 517:4,5,19 610:18 debriefing 597:6 628:2 deceased 649:4,6 661:22 662:17 decide 521:22 542:19 582:18 decided 490:24 501:3 decision 490:5,21,22 603:8 deduce 606:7 defective 605:9,11 define 546:7 defined 559:2 defines 493:19 definitely 584:11 622:23 definition 492:5 493:8 493:12 554:14 deliberately 563:5 deliberations 616:6 demand 587:4 departed 648:17 668:1 668:12 672:10 Department 606:16 depends 559:1 depicts 556:23 deployment 628:18 deprive 563:5 describe 556:9 658:9 663:2 described 493:13 502:9 638:8 deserve 677:4 despite 607:17 detail 531:4 574:23 599:16 609:15 detailed 506:16 details 626:5,7 657:17 detective 661:4,8 detectives 662:15 671:17 determine 548:18 599:20 663:16 determined 510:23 diary 496:14,18,20 497:2 533:24 535:6 667:19,21,22 668:3,9 671:21 didn't 505:16,21 510:7</p>	<p>512:7 513:25 514:18 521:8 529:23 533:2 558:16 563:3,4 568:21 569:9 583:1 591:3,4,14 604:21 609:20 618:4 621:10 626:1 628:12 629:15 633:5 634:3,5,16,18 638:9 647:10,20 648:1 661:18 die 491:19 570:20 579:5 593:9 died 529:4,9,14 530:6 594:1 different 511:6 564:6 573:6 634:17 642:23 673:13 differently 603:24 difficult 506:22,25 507:2 534:6,13 538:17 560:10 562:1 599:8 difficulty 556:4 577:12 591:17 670:21 digital 495:10,19,21,21 495:24 501:20 504:21 508:19,21 516:9,23 520:20 521:4 526:3 548:12,15 550:14 552:10 603:19 direct 513:12 575:21 577:24 578:15 directed 635:23 direction 569:11 570:2 directions 581:6 directive 548:1,3,6 559:13,16,22 574:9 directly 547:22 636:11 dirt 641:17,20,21 644:22 disabused 562:7 disagree 610:23,24 disallow 545:22 561:10 disallowing 547:20 disarmed 502:22 566:21 567:13 disarming 502:11,14 566:8,24 disbarred 638:22 disclosed 493:1 discourage 559:4 discovered 492:11,24 606:3 discovery 492:4 discuss 502:12 607:14 608:1 discussed 490:16 525:4 532:11 537:12 593:19 594:19,25 595:10 597:22 599:14,17 600:10 601:7,8 633:3 633:4 discussing 594:12 discussion 490:10 523:5 537:7 594:18 595:3 597:3,20,23</p>	<p>601:2,24 616:24 discussions 537:13 593:12,23 599:7 634:25 677:9,12,16 dispersal 502:11 512:22 514:6 566:8 566:13 disperse 565:3,23 600:12 dispersed 502:22 514:6 566:15,21 567:12 571:1 586:2,4 587:13 588:8 600:13,20 dispersment 565:14 dispersing 514:25 565:10 displayed 563:20 565:8 609:12 dispute 515:23 564:10 573:24 575:14 630:10 655:8 disputes 625:12 disrespect 545:15 disseminate 492:17 distance 646:10,14 647:13 662:22 distinct 636:3 disturbing 591:21,23 divisional 574:8 docket 621:20 630:22 630:22,24,25 dockets 543:4 document 492:11,18,20 492:24 493:19,22,24 496:14,18 500:18 507:6,6 573:10,11,13 573:14,15 574:8,13 676:11 documents 492:3 496:17 550:9 584:22 627:15,16,24 631:1,3 674:14 doesn't 502:5 508:25 510:1 515:18 516:22 523:20 526:7 527:3 549:3 561:4 567:18 585:17 592:5 624:11 625:7 633:11 637:7 doing 510:6 521:3 559:5 579:13 620:3 652:13 654:9 Donkerhoek 640:25 door 627:21 doubt 540:3 605:23 downloaded 520:25 downloading 506:15 Dr 530:14,15 draft 573:15,17,20 574:3,3 draw 507:8 drawn 507:14 675:13 drink 585:5 drive 550:22 602:23 driving 570:7 dropped 606:2 drove 606:2</p>	<p>due 637:4 duly 548:4 Dumisa 541:17 duration 507:17 519:4 duties 506:20 duty 561:7 585:24 653:10,12,13,15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <hr/> <p>E 507:19 657:15 earlier 490:22 511:10 518:12 539:5,17 540:25 561:4 600:11 608:23 624:14 638:6 644:22 672:15 early 516:18 588:1 earphones 576:13,15 576:19,22 577:3 Earth 674:22 easier 675:8 eastern 644:10 easy 507:2 534:18 637:1 educated 541:14 eed 491:19 594:10 effect 534:21 561:25 605:25 eight 495:11,16,21 531:21 535:18 538:12 538:23 539:11 540:5 602:22 605:11,14 606:4 618:1,20,24 619:24 620:7,9 628:8 648:15 653:21 either 516:18 521:22 523:18 545:16 562:5 571:19 586:7 587:23 588:5 629:23 636:11 electronic 519:22 electronics 520:18 elicits 559:11 eliminate 625:11 630:6 Elizabeth 494:23 528:9 else's 620:5 elucidate 520:19 613:15 emails 520:25 embarked 532:11 615:7 emergencies 558:22 encircling 523:1 571:10 encounter 616:19,21 Endeavour 567:22 endeavoured 525:11 endeavouring 534:22 ended 594:17 ends 581:14 Energy 606:16 enlarge 557:13,25 607:13,24 enlarged 555:10 557:16 enlargement 557:21,25 enlarging 554:13 enlighten 515:5 enquiries 548:5 628:7 enquiry 506:14 547:2</p>	<p>ensure 501:14,15 ensuring 559:7 entail 566:16,19 entailed 566:19 entertained 655:15 entire 665:19 entirely 542:18 entries 667:22 668:2,6 equipment 588:18 equipped 624:20 escape 613:6,19 essentially 608:6 establish 546:23 549:18 608:14 646:17 established 497:18 558:17 estimate 672:11 estimated 514:9 estimation 647:20,22 et 640:19 657:18 665:18 674:24 etcetera 508:16 evaluation 610:22 evening 648:15 event 545:19 547:19 594:13 595:18 610:22 613:22 614:13 events 496:2 497:13 501:5 515:19 522:23 539:7 540:21 580:11 582:20 585:21 590:14 590:16 593:18 594:13 595:2 600:8 604:15 604:17 606:17,22 615:23 eventually 531:1 everybody 593:9 everybody's 621:13 evidence 490:19 491:22 493:18 494:12 502:5 502:10 507:25 508:19 509:1 518:5,11 522:13,15,24 523:5 525:7 526:8 531:5 540:3,19 548:10 553:12 556:18 557:17 557:17 558:9 561:24 561:25 562:15 568:24 572:9 582:21 583:8 591:18 592:21 596:16 601:11 603:16 605:24 606:6,8 607:4 608:9 610:7,18,20 612:13 612:19 621:6 630:21 631:20 635:10 637:22 639:13 645:20 652:23 657:5 665:7 673:10 evidence-in-chief 664:21 exact 548:21 exactly 506:17 557:9 634:11 671:4 673:24 examination 567:18 630:18 639:19 646:7 657:12 665:15 examining 612:5</p>
---	---	---	---	--

<p>example 508:7,9,13,17 556:15 575:21</p> <p>excerpt 615:13</p> <p>exchanged 492:4</p> <p>excused 637:22,24 656:20,21 664:16,17</p> <p>executive 490:9,17,19</p> <p>exercise 547:16 627:3 675:22</p> <p>exhibit 640:3,6,11 676:4</p> <p>exhibits 652:13 658:3,4 666:25</p> <p>exist 630:8,11</p> <p>existed 624:8</p> <p>existence 624:12</p> <p>exists 623:18 624:10</p> <p>expect 545:14 590:14</p> <p>expected 498:1</p> <p>experience 498:6,10 542:22 543:17 546:1 546:1 568:9 640:18 657:18 665:18</p> <p>experienced 548:25,25 564:11</p> <p>expert 497:25 526:19 542:18 544:19,19 546:12 549:7 557:16 625:19,23</p> <p>expertise 499:20 542:14 543:9,11 544:18 545:16 546:8 546:12,18 568:9</p> <p>explain 502:17 517:11 543:3 547:25 593:7 596:14 613:25 616:22 621:13 644:18 670:1 673:23 675:5</p> <p>explained 634:4 674:13</p> <p>explaining 495:4 516:10</p> <p>explanation 503:13 607:5</p> <p>explicit 628:16</p> <p>explore 502:6 582:2</p> <p>express 676:24</p> <p>expressed 493:2,9,10 493:14</p> <p>extended 498:17 556:14</p> <p>extensively 548:3</p> <p>extent 559:6,10 582:2 586:12 595:2 638:3</p> <p>extra 541:22 554:6 562:20 567:19 589:25</p> <p>e-mail 490:8,12,23 674:16,21</p> <p>e-mailed 674:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>F 507:20</p> <p>face 494:22 663:10</p> <p>facility 511:22 554:11</p> <p>fact 557:4 559:3,6 561:7,13,13 569:16 594:5 600:11 607:2</p>	<p>607:17 625:2,12 629:8,17 676:20</p> <p>facts 575:20 586:5,13 586:20</p> <p>failed 585:20 612:25</p> <p>fair 499:6 504:10 519:19,24 524:18 527:4 614:8,10</p> <p>fairly 534:18</p> <p>families 491:10 542:4</p> <p>family 563:18 661:22</p> <p>far 498:17 502:5 504:21 509:2 539:7 540:3 541:10 548:17 550:20 570:4 583:12 597:16 602:9 603:20 604:16 611:16 616:4 624:4 638:25 643:19 662:20</p> <p>fashion 580:12</p> <p>fast 620:25</p> <p>fault 508:14 516:3,6,11 526:7</p> <p>favourable 513:18</p> <p>feedback 596:1 597:9 599:10</p> <p>feel 585:25 655:23</p> <p>feet 508:10</p> <p>felt 603:6</p> <p>field 543:8,11 544:18 545:16 546:7,7,11,18 556:9 604:18</p> <p>figures 574:9,10</p> <p>file 518:2</p> <p>files 518:6</p> <p>filing 546:14</p> <p>film 549:3 586:8 590:25 591:25 606:11,12 613:9</p> <p>filmed 613:24</p> <p>filming 591:6</p> <p>finalise 494:1</p> <p>finalised 602:20</p> <p>finally 616:4 628:21</p> <p>find 506:21,25 507:1 515:6 525:2 544:7 551:15 560:10 591:20 642:3 648:21 677:12</p> <p>finding 561:20 562:11</p> <p>findings 493:15 561:23 562:3</p> <p>fine 533:8 602:25</p> <p>fingerprint 544:19</p> <p>fingerprints 546:14,15</p> <p>finished 512:25</p> <p>fire 586:21 600:23,24 600:25 601:16,19,19</p> <p>fired 556:8 579:25 587:16,19 600:22 601:16 622:8</p> <p>firing 601:1 622:12</p> <p>first 492:3,6,10 493:10 493:12,21,25 494:5,9 495:23 501:14 508:15 519:9 520:3 534:3,9 534:12 535:10,13</p>	<p>536:6,7,9 543:23 546:6 551:23 552:6,8 552:19 556:5 568:15 569:21 575:1 578:13 580:10 581:12 582:20 582:21 584:15 587:7 587:15,23 588:9,9,22 591:15 592:12 593:3 597:19 601:21 602:15 608:18,25 616:2 629:8 632:7 639:22 653:17,22</p> <p>firstly 521:2 573:11 576:4 617:20</p> <p>fitted 497:6,9,10,19,20</p> <p>five 529:3,6,6,25 531:10,15,16 594:5,6 615:15 619:2 671:24 676:23</p> <p>FJ 665:16</p> <p>flat 668:16</p> <p>fleeting 512:2</p> <p>flew 570:5 578:23 624:22</p> <p>flight 569:3 574:24 590:10,11</p> <p>flighted 514:16 537:20 537:23 540:4,8,13,18 540:20,22</p> <p>flow 614:8</p> <p>flowing 492:2</p> <p>flustered 590:12</p> <p>fly 569:11 570:2,16 571:4 576:10 578:24 585:9,17</p> <p>flying 625:18</p> <p>focal 513:19</p> <p>focus 512:8 615:22</p> <p>folio 550:6,7</p> <p>follow 534:23 549:10 592:5 650:25 651:2</p> <p>followed 576:24 599:11</p> <p>following 507:14 508:1 519:12 586:6 621:24 643:10 668:12 675:13</p> <p>follows 490:10 570:9</p> <p>footage 495:4 514:16 515:4 537:25 538:3,7 538:13,14 539:5,8,10 539:18,18 540:4,13 559:4 564:17 591:25 593:13 595:8 604:6 612:10,17 616:5,9 617:2,7,9,14,16,16 622:10 623:2,5,6,9,22 623:25 624:1 627:18 628:3,6,9 629:4,5,9 629:10,10,13,14,17 629:18 630:3,4,5,7 631:21</p> <p>footages 537:20,23,23 565:8</p> <p>footprints 546:17</p> <p>force 500:20 503:11 638:16,18</p> <p>forces 581:7</p>	<p>forget 642:8</p> <p>forgetting 673:13</p> <p>forgive 507:5 509:25 524:22 531:3 545:3 589:15</p> <p>forgiven 510:3</p> <p>forgot 655:23</p> <p>form 539:6</p> <p>formal 501:25 627:4</p> <p>format 507:20 589:5 593:2</p> <p>forth 518:7</p> <p>fortunately 568:4 674:9</p> <p>forward 597:4,7 639:7 672:5,6</p> <p>found 529:7,12,20,22 530:3 556:9 604:18 619:12 641:1 642:7 643:13 644:6 647:17 652:23 656:1 658:7 658:10,21 660:13,16 663:3,4,13</p> <p>foundation 496:12 534:22</p> <p>four 503:10,17 529:7 531:11,16 551:19 619:2 636:2,3,3,15 637:19 648:13,15 653:13 671:9</p> <p>frank 610:3</p> <p>frankly 527:3</p> <p>free 585:23</p> <p>Friday 494:8 531:8 535:20 608:18,18</p> <p>friend 519:15 541:8 620:14,24 631:24 646:17</p> <p>friendly 601:19</p> <p>friends 584:23 627:12 676:8</p> <p>Fritz 505:6,8 512:15 513:18,23 532:15 533:11,16 570:20 571:5 572:15 576:4,6 576:12,25 577:19,24 578:1,5,8,14,18 579:1 579:6,8,13,22 580:1 581:9,23 584:8 586:14,24 635:11</p> <p>Fritz's 579:18</p> <p>front 563:9 595:16 600:3 627:18 628:1 631:5 641:4 642:6 644:19 645:3,16 668:21</p> <p>fruitful 677:10</p> <p>fruitfully 545:6 627:9</p> <p>full 508:4 665:25 666:1</p> <p>fuller 677:2</p> <p>fully 560:25 610:9 675:16</p> <p>function 577:23 578:1 578:5,8 582:1,3,14,17 582:20 584:15,15 585:21 586:13,19</p>	<p>functions 582:2,15,19</p> <p>fund 490:24</p> <p>funding 490:13</p> <p>funeral 508:8</p> <p>further 490:10 491:21 493:2,16 497:24 521:19 525:14 527:14 527:25 540:10 541:21 543:15 556:24 561:21 562:8,12,19 563:10 566:2 573:4 574:16 608:5 614:7 616:14 616:17 620:10 621:17 622:6 637:14,24 641:21 654:4 656:17 656:21 658:13 664:11 664:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <hr/> <p>G 646:11,15 647:6 648:18 650:14</p> <p>gainsay 537:9</p> <p>gather 514:3 522:13</p> <p>gathered 538:6</p> <p>gathering 501:25 508:7 523:4 671:12</p> <p>general 499:22 500:6,9 500:22 505:6 532:14 533:8,9 534:8,11 536:10,10,11 537:13 594:19,21 598:12 604:9 607:24 616:23 617:7 670:10,20</p> <p>generally 571:3 578:23</p> <p>generals 596:9</p> <p>gentleman 505:8 530:13 552:1</p> <p>Geographic 510:4</p> <p>getting 566:7 614:10</p> <p>gist 598:6,9</p> <p>give 520:2 532:6 541:20 544:3 546:4,8 547:17 547:19 548:20 549:15 554:14 555:15 557:3 563:8 565:5 578:21 578:22 580:3 581:6 590:13 597:5,8 598:5 598:9 599:10 607:5 612:17 613:15,20,25 614:23 618:14 626:4 639:13 640:5 644:12 647:3,19,22 652:23 657:5 659:2 661:19 665:7 676:21 677:1,2</p> <p>given 493:23 500:19 509:2 513:3 514:2 516:14 517:21 519:24 526:10 536:15 553:12 553:14 561:3 562:15 566:11 571:3 572:17 575:23,24,25 587:4 596:1 610:7 621:7 631:20 676:10</p> <p>giving 543:14 570:1</p> <p>glad 677:6,11</p> <p>glitch 549:6,14</p>
--	--	---	--	---

<p>go 498:2,6 513:3,12 514:1 528:15 535:12 547:12 553:8 555:4 557:4 561:6 562:18 567:14 570:12 581:10 585:7 588:22 592:3 597:4,7 605:12 607:12 611:2 614:15 614:16 621:24 625:25 627:15 635:24 637:2 637:3 644:5 647:9,10 658:13 God 639:15,16 657:7,9 665:9,11 goes 507:23 567:13 585:7 637:3 going 498:1 499:15 502:20,21,22 503:20 504:9 505:22 532:10 534:6,13 541:8 542:19 552:7 554:6 559:9,18 562:3 567:11,12,20 570:20 581:16 586:17 610:17 610:19 613:8 620:12 620:13 654:17 655:8 661:1 664:19 goings 501:2 514:2 good 490:2 507:1 521:25 554:1 614:20 615:9 651:23 Google 592:21 646:25 658:18 668:21,22 672:20,25 673:3,5,15 673:20 674:22,25 675:2,8,17 GPS 592:23 674:16,17 granted 491:15 496:24 655:18 gratitude 676:25 677:5 great 586:9 grenade 565:17,20,22 572:21 582:7 587:15 588:10,11 grenades 572:13 579:25 586:21 587:15 635:11 ground 503:18 509:16 509:21 511:7,8 512:12,19 514:2 515:11 520:24 554:18 556:16 558:19 566:9 566:13 572:2,5 577:21 581:7,13,20 583:9,20,21,22 584:3 584:4 585:12,21 586:1,15 587:4,11 590:19 600:18 615:1 621:17 628:24 group 588:10 616:23 622:7,11 groups 514:24 601:4 guess 504:9 guidance 549:17 guide 574:5 Gumbi 562:23 563:6,13</p>	<p>563:14 564:2,5,11,16 564:25 565:7,15,22 566:1 gunshot 649:13 651:9 651:18 guy 505:22 guys 568:13 599:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <hr/> <p>hack 663:7 half 527:11 531:18,19 531:22 535:18 538:5 538:11,12,23 539:11 540:5 602:22 618:2 618:20,24 619:24 620:7,9 628:8,15 648:15,15 663:6 664:24 hall 597:5 hand 497:14,17 541:25 575:10,12 637:1 639:7,15 665:9 676:2 handed 504:21 517:23 518:11 520:20,24 524:2 537:16 550:11 639:22 640:3 handle 522:9,10 happen 570:6 593:5 618:15,18,19 happened 495:14 509:7 516:17,18,22 517:10 523:19,21 537:7,20 540:12,17 549:24 554:25 555:3,21,23 556:12 557:22 558:1 558:3,15 561:2,15 569:17 583:4 591:4 591:15 592:18 593:12 593:14 594:23 595:4 595:4,6,7,9 596:10,14 598:1,17 599:4,20 603:5 613:7 621:16 628:9 632:8,18 633:4 634:11 661:5 662:9 664:7 669:3,6,7 670:1 674:7 happening 509:16 510:11 512:12,19 557:10,15 558:22,25 583:9 584:4 586:7 632:5 happenings 537:13 539:2 hard 550:22 641:4,9 harmonious 677:18 hasn't 541:24 553:13 639:1 haven't 506:20 532:23 557:4 650:11 651:2 head 500:11 534:14 633:16 651:10 663:8 heading 574:8 heads 507:14 hear 570:21 576:7,17 576:18 577:1,2,6,7,10 577:12,14 589:16,18</p>	<p>600:8 628:12 636:11 636:15,17,19 heard 494:18 510:14 525:13 567:17 576:13 576:21,21 584:24,25 600:22 602:1,1 631:24 633:22 636:18 636:22 638:13 hearing 492:13 493:12 621:3 623:1 hearings 492:6,25 493:9,16,21 held 497:14,17 502:8 530:20 535:17,19 628:15 637:1 667:2 670:5 677:12 helicopter 497:12,19,21 524:7,9,23 525:10,12 539:9 558:5,14 568:16 570:10 577:24 578:6 579:13,19 580:23 581:12,14 582:1,4,5,8,14,19 583:17 584:1,3 587:2 587:4 588:22 589:22 589:25 590:4 591:19 596:11 597:14 598:21 608:24 614:20 615:19 625:1,18 631:13 635:1,3 helicopters 497:6,9,19 501:9 524:17 525:18 575:4,12 588:13,24 614:24 624:14 627:1 635:18 help 527:3 533:5 545:18 548:8 557:19 587:1,5 591:5 621:5 639:15,16 657:7,8 665:9,10 674:11 helpful 614:10 helping 568:2 helps 559:20 560:9 het 491:19 he'd 614:6 he's 494:14 500:13,18 505:17 520:10 539:3 542:19 546:1,1,8 552:1 560:9 572:18 576:25 577:3 614:3,3 622:5 650:22,22 660:21 661:1,8 high 500:19 503:11 587:4,11,12 higher 505:20 highly 613:22 hindsight 564:22 569:21 582:23 hold 594:2 holding 669:20 672:5,6 672:12,14 home 602:24 honourable 565:9 hope 538:25 545:3 632:15 634:23 hospital 529:9,14</p>	<p>Hostel 659:9 hour 664:24 hours 648:13 662:9 663:22 664:5 house 642:6,7 643:14 644:19 645:3,16 hundred 514:19 515:1 515:8 hurry 590:12 husbands 494:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <hr/> <p>idea 581:16 636:16 646:10 650:19 651:23 identifications 546:15 identified 552:20 621:8 660:3 identify 554:15 580:10 626:9,9,18 images 563:19 564:8,18 imagine 526:18 534:17 626:22 650:23 immediately 509:10,24 510:11 511:3 603:25 672:5 implying 612:13 import 676:13 importance 612:4 important 492:8 526:20 557:2 560:15 560:21 595:17 imprecise 556:1 impression 511:20 512:1,9 514:5 517:2 636:3 inaccuracies 673:1,14 675:6 inadequacy 542:10 inaudible 570:15 incident 529:17 543:17 554:21,25 555:3,16 555:18,19,20,21 556:5,21 569:21 582:21 594:22 600:14 603:5 604:17 621:18 623:3 628:18 662:9 663:23 669:3 incidents 507:24 542:16 543:7 556:13 569:8,9,16 594:15,23 625:21 inclination 562:11,14 include 515:12 529:20 included 515:21,22,24 515:25 518:7 530:6 including 518:21,23 inconceivable 584:8 609:24 incorrect 578:12 605:1 632:25 673:8 incorrectly 632:23 indebted 673:11 indicate 527:12 552:13 563:1 641:10,13 674:8 676:19 indicated 494:6 503:12</p>	<p>532:11 546:2 548:14 553:11 573:19 655:10 656:10 666:20 672:15 indicating 561:23 indication 546:4 548:10 552:5 614:23 individual 556:20 influenced 635:20 636:11 informal 556:10 586:2 642:6,6 643:14 644:19 645:3,16 information 490:4 508:1 534:17,19,25 543:14 547:18 554:6 559:20 560:9 566:10 577:9 592:10,10 610:11 619:5,9 626:21 627:5,14 647:4 664:7 671:11 informed 566:20 inhibiting 582:6 injured 490:14,24 input 581:6 inquired 595:18 inquiry 492:19 518:13 527:22,22 534:18 545:4,19 574:22 594:7,7 637:20,20 677:23 inquisitive 598:19 632:18 633:6,11,14 634:4,9,23 inside 565:7 576:3 600:22 635:1,3 insight 613:20 insist 677:7 inspect 565:4 626:6 inspected 627:24 inspection 637:10 642:9,19 651:4,13 667:2,12 Inspector 592:21 installed 624:14,16,22 627:17 628:1 instance 509:3 522:24 532:5 534:10 538:1 instances 544:5 instructed 503:6 572:19 590:4 666:9 instruction 513:14 567:7 570:11 575:23 578:25 585:6 590:9 590:13,15 654:4 instructions 526:19 527:18 559:24 570:15 571:3 577:8 578:21 578:22 635:11 655:13 insufficient 493:11 intelligence 532:16 intend 494:24,25 563:5 640:2 interact 559:23 interaction 546:24 560:15 interest 544:15 563:16</p>
---	---	---	--	---

563:17 607:18 interested 511:5 596:10 599:13 665:24 interface 547:7 interfere 544:22 interference 665:14 interject 491:21 interpreter 553:13 633:15 670:13,16 interrogated 597:1 interrupt 524:22 534:16 567:16 626:20 650:2 interrupted 525:2 investigate 544:10 661:2 investigated 648:4 investigating 547:9,9 661:5 investigation 545:12 546:23 investigator 652:18 invite 507:10 invited 592:25 595:12 inviting 613:14 involved 542:12 543:23 543:24 601:25 603:6 651:25 involving 640:24 657:23 666:18 IPED 518:2,6,13 IPID 627:15,24 631:1,2 irrelevant 586:9 Isaacs 532:16 isn't 499:25 521:12 560:8 561:9 608:21 625:11 654:12 issue 494:1 521:8 534:24 672:24 673:5 issues 492:5 493:8,12 493:20,20 521:23 542:12 544:25 548:5 574:23 676:21,22 item 493:25 494:5,9 items 604:14 it'll 534:18 640:10 I'd 507:8 646:9 I'll 567:25 575:19 599:12 609:23 I'm 516:3 517:1,5,8 521:7,21 522:19 524:8 525:23 560:21 561:23 563:15,15 565:24,25 569:5 571:12 572:20 573:8 573:20 574:3,9 575:20 580:25 599:7 600:1 604:24,24 605:1,1,19 608:17,18 609:18 610:17,19 612:1 613:8,16,17,21 614:2,9 I've 509:1 510:8 515:21 515:24 520:6 524:2 597:24	J ja 499:17 520:4 541:6 595:9 643:7 669:8 673:2 JACOBUS 495:1 Jeremiah 665:10 666:1 666:4 JOC 500:24 503:8 532:8,25 567:11 571:11,19,22,24,25 575:3,10,18,22 577:17,19 584:17 585:2,3 628:15 670:6 jocularly 528:8 jog 599:24 600:14 Johannesburg 563:15 joint 496:4 499:8,9 Judge 490:11 545:9 junior 541:6	koppies 601:17 kraal 583:22 633:21	L labelled 503:4 land 599:3 landed 520:24 landing 585:12 landscape 510:5 language 604:10 673:19 laptop 620:3,6 622:21 622:23 641:8 Lastly 615:11 637:6 late 495:13 516:15,18 517:3 605:19 launch 582:7 lawyers 638:14,15,15 lay 496:12 534:22 LCRC 568:12 595:25 597:12 617:21,24 618:3,5 653:16 671:8 673:7 LCRCs 542:25 595:24 596:6 599:11 lead 600:11 639:4 leaders 493:18 518:5 592:21 leading 490:19 leaked 492:12 learn 543:4 learned 519:15 541:7 584:22 609:7 620:14 620:24 627:12 631:24 646:17 673:12 676:8 learnt 634:7 leave 541:6 562:16 616:11 623:13,16 637:8 672:13 lecture 597:5,8 led 560:19 594:22 600:1,13 left 495:3 503:10 516:19 533:5 569:3 584:23 641:3,4 643:8 649:20 674:5 legal 490:4,9,13,13,15 532:17 598:16 602:11 638:4,8 legend 676:11,12,15 legs 663:5 length 508:10 614:20 lens 509:13,14 Lepaaku 491:11 563:17 letter 640:6 643:8 647:6 let's 494:24 503:15 504:4 531:18 533:24 536:6 547:11 548:7 551:15 552:18 560:12 589:12 596:11 601:10 638:10 664:23 676:3 liberal 515:7 liberty 512:14 513:1,12 Lieutenant 497:1	499:21 532:13 563:17 614:4 673:21 lieutenant-colonel 494:13 503:7 528:4,5 578:3 607:5 609:17 641:14 645:17 662:24 674:9 675:10 lift 546:14 light 555:15 562:2,20 563:11 630:8 637:4 638:12 lighten 494:19 lighter 641:19 likelihood 559:8 line 547:2,21 553:18 554:5,8,25 561:9,10 600:13 604:9,18 614:9 616:24 621:25 647:13 linear 641:19 lines 600:11 634:12,14 lingering 638:3 list 501:13 532:24 564:10 listed 500:25 listen 570:21 636:20 literally 593:14 little 530:19 531:4 540:10 541:14 557:15 live 609:1 623:3 625:11 lives 584:2 598:24 living 514:6 location 569:12 loco 637:10 642:9 651:4 667:2 logbooks 528:16 logs 528:14,14,16 626:23 long 494:17,24,25 524:24 527:17 530:20 531:7,9 556:17 561:6 608:21 609:4 648:7 664:19 longer 528:10 636:19 665:14 Lonmin 492:11 499:9 541:9 543:6,22 544:7 545:10 547:6 574:21 589:21,22 590:1,1,1,5 606:22 617:2,4,9 657:24 660:4 664:3 669:20 670:6 672:7 672:10 look 514:23 515:15 516:23 517:15 521:20 548:22 549:5 550:17 555:3 556:3 564:21 580:20 583:5 595:2 600:1 604:21 607:8,9 607:14,15,25 609:20 613:23 616:9 622:3 627:15 648:25 649:25 668:8 looked 495:10 516:25 523:23 538:2 539:15 595:7,22,23 604:20	608:13 609:19,20,21 looking 612:4 622:20 622:22 641:5,6 656:24 looks 564:16 605:19 644:2 656:9 675:16 lose 584:2 lost 533:24 598:24 lot 512:20 532:1 534:5 534:7 536:23 537:3,4 540:17 576:20 579:4 581:22 589:7,9 590:22 593:12 597:25 597:25 598:1,2,15,16 601:4 619:11 620:2 633:25 636:9 637:5 Louis 563:14 LRC 625:19 lunch 594:5 luncheon 593:17 594:12 lying 556:16 649:4 662:21
	K keep 494:24,25 527:17 528:10,14,16 567:25 keeping 507:12,13 527:17 640:6 kept 528:9 key 676:14 Kidd 600:14,15 601:25 killed 556:8 581:16 583:11,18,24 590:22 592:20 598:7 601:12 601:15 603:5 660:9 660:12 killings 555:23 569:17 591:20 592:13 593:20 593:20 killings 583:15 586:15 591:13 592:5,6,8 kilometre 647:24 kind 514:17 528:16 543:17 544:16 545:5 545:14 626:21 655:14 676:14 kinds 543:6 544:5 Klein 598:25 knew 503:10 611:11 knock 668:16 knowing 526:19,20 knowledge 534:4 621:25 660:10 known 534:9 542:8 622:23 666:19 knows 650:12 Kolonel 594:9 koppie 502:10,18,21 514:10,14 515:10 516:1 530:3 555:19 555:21,24 556:10,11 557:9,10,15 558:18 569:23 570:19 575:4 575:11 577:16 579:3 583:3,15 589:23 598:25 600:23 601:12 607:22 615:23 635:21 671:12			M Madoda 662:15 663:24 magnification 557:18 MAHLANGU 553:10 553:21,25 633:17 main 593:18 607:4,18 644:18,21 major 500:5 585:15 majority 564:2 Major-General 500:19 501:12 503:4,6,11 532:14,14 making 499:19 520:20 521:7 551:5 571:15 572:9 610:9,21 Maluleke 490:15,25 Malunga 665:24 man 649:6,7 management 490:17 manner 677:18 map 592:21 658:18 668:21,23 672:20,25 673:3,5,15,20 674:25 675:2,8,10,17 676:15 march 544:14 marches 542:22 543:5 543:13,16,20 Marikana 499:7 517:18 519:4,10 529:4,12 543:12,16 640:24,25 657:23 659:8 660:22 661:9 664:2 666:18,20 mark 640:10 663:7,7 676:3 marked 564:19,23 621:4 643:6,7,8 658:19,20,23,25 676:11 marker 659:9 marks 663:9 married 528:12	

<p>Maseba 491:10 MASEBE 491:9,14 matching 675:3 material 522:25 523:13 523:16,23,24 524:7,9 524:11,12,14,17,23 524:23 525:10,12,12 525:13,17 526:3,3,3 526:10,12,15,15,16 526:22,24 527:2,3 539:22 540:21 541:1 541:22 546:22,25 547:6 567:19 603:11 603:12,18 604:1,14 604:15 611:20,21 612:5,15,24 614:6 616:15 623:3 624:25 629:20 materials 522:24 matter 490:12,16,21 492:10 493:6,7,21 494:4,11 512:4 513:14 515:20 539:6 544:16 561:21 562:12 567:21 568:6,6 573:3 600:3 614:11 656:19 676:19 matters 491:21,24 492:1,8 568:1 594:14 620:13 Mbombo 499:22 532:14 533:13 534:12 mean 495:13 509:22 512:11 516:15,20 518:23 531:16 537:5 545:15 546:1 554:9 566:7,13,17 568:2,4 569:8 570:1 576:16 583:25 587:11 591:14 592:15 595:9 599:21 600:20 613:4 616:22 626:2 633:12,25 636:11 666:12 668:14 meaningful 545:14 546:9 655:13 means 522:2 558:4 560:2 609:19 666:12 meant 510:22 519:11 measure 647:20 648:1 measured 662:24 measurement 645:14 645:16 646:9 647:6 659:4,10 measurements 644:13 644:18 652:13 655:8 658:2 659:2,13 666:22 mechanism 605:9 606:3 media 665:24 meet 531:7 590:19 meeting 493:3,10 500:24 502:7,9,13 503:2 508:7 522:16 522:20,23 524:24 526:11 530:20,21</p>	<p>531:4,7 532:2,7,8,9 532:18,25 533:2,4 534:3,4,7 535:7,7,11 536:7,13,16,22 538:23 539:11 540:6 541:9,11 589:5 593:4 593:8,9 601:4,7,8,24 602:1 612:17 617:14 617:19 619:5 624:2,3 628:14,15,19 629:14 meetings 499:14 531:6 531:25 532:4,5 535:17 537:9 539:22 540:14 541:9 589:9 589:11,15 593:15 607:14,15 member 505:25 559:23 565:24,25 members 560:2 568:13 595:25 597:11 598:15 599:11,23 601:25 607:13 638:16,17 671:8 672:9 memory 496:15 508:20 575:20 599:24,25 600:14 650:4 668:5 mention 622:14 624:2 mentioned 529:25 630:21 632:9 670:25 merely 544:25 561:23 573:20 574:4 message 655:1 Messrs 490:25 met 567:10 585:4 661:1 metres 643:22 644:19 645:4,11,18 647:22 659:10 662:25 663:8 microphone 576:13,14 576:17 577:1 665:14 might've 534:10 636:18,22 millimetre 656:14 mind 562:7 567:22 633:12 636:13 mine 621:10,11,15 671:12 miners 490:14,25 556:16 559:3 604:8 616:23 617:8,10 mines 499:9 Mining 606:16 minor 609:3 minute 501:3,13 503:1 503:4,5 532:13 615:12 minutes 495:11,16,21 514:16 515:7 516:25 517:11 519:5 522:19 522:19 527:21 581:14 587:3,9,23 605:11,15 606:4 609:4 615:9,16 629:1 662:4 misapprehension 562:7 misbehaved 526:23 mismatch 675:17 missed 509:1 533:12</p>	<p>mission 528:16 mistake 501:12 521:21 522:14 mistaken 535:23 misunderstanding 638:3 misunderstood 607:20 673:5 Mlambo 490:11 model 674:6,12 Mogagabe 566:4,6,12 566:16,23 567:2,5,8 567:15,24 568:7,15 568:19 569:2,7,15,25 571:8,16 572:1,6,12 572:16,22 573:3 Mohlaki 665:2,5,10,21 666:1,1,3,4,8,16 667:4,8,13,18,24 668:4,7,10,18 669:1,5 669:8,14,19,25 670:5 670:9,17,21 671:2,6 671:20 672:1,8,16 673:16,21,25 674:19 675:1,12 Molefe 666:22 moment 509:11 532:5 545:4 567:22 636:11 636:23,24 650:22 moments 503:16 512:3 Monama 666:20 Monday 493:25 494:5 494:8,9 531:8 535:14 535:20,22 604:8 608:17 Monene 491:11 monitor 621:9,14 622:2 monitors 623:2,9 month 631:10 Moolman 532:17 533:11 638:7 morning 490:2,17 491:7 605:25 650:23 670:2,3 671:22,25 676:10,10,20,22 677:3,22 mortem 650:3,17 651:18 mortems 528:23 529:20 530:10 Moses 639:6,16 Moshwana 529:13 639:6,11,16 640:17 640:22 641:6,12,23 642:2,5,11,15,20,24 643:4,11,17,21,25 644:4,8,11,14,17,24 645:2,6,9,15 646:12 647:2,5,10,21,25 648:5,9,12,16,20,23 649:2,4,7,9,12,16,19 649:22 650:15,18 651:6,11 652:2,4,6,8 652:12,15,20,25 653:4,8,12,16,20,24 654:2 656:13</p>	<p>Mosweu 517:25 519:7 motor 641:20 644:2 656:10 657:25 658:21 move 545:9 560:11 561:11,17 565:12 570:23 579:4 651:22 moved 556:11 579:2 635:20 movement 669:10 moving 508:9,10 509:23 510:10,19 511:3,9 514:22 516:4 581:21 591:10 633:9 Mpembe 532:15 533:9 533:16 604:9 616:23 617:7 Mpofu 491:5 515:3 654:6,7,14,17,23,25 655:16,19 661:16,17 676:15,17 677:7 Msimang 490:15,25 murder 559:3 MUSHWANA 501:10 must've 591:15 M'Lord 668:18 M-O-H-L-A-K-I 666:2 M-P-E-M-B-E 532:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <hr/> <p>n 621:15 641:21 Naidoo 536:11,11 607:24 name 504:5,8,16 505:11,12 508:4,5 530:13 542:4 563:14 620:20 638:25 639:21 670:19,25 671:1 names 532:24 533:12 533:21 534:8 665:25 666:1 national 510:4 530:25 533:17 536:17 537:6 602:6,10 natural 634:10 nature 510:6,8 610:10 near 514:17 nearly 527:10 necessarily 511:2 545:18 614:10 633:12 necessary 521:22 547:16 586:21 necessitate 655:7 necessitated 509:17 neck 649:17,25 651:10 need 510:16 542:23 566:21 567:11 590:23 611:20 651:20 674:6 negotiated 604:9 never 506:20 523:20 540:14 627:21 631:20 651:11 672:10 new 491:7 567:17 568:6 616:15 656:19 news 494:18 591:21 616:5,5,9 Ngcukait 620:15</p>	<p>Ngcukaitobi 620:16,22 620:23 621:1,22 622:5,16,19,25 623:7 623:12,16,23 624:6 624:13,21,24 625:9 625:15,17 626:4,8,12 626:17,24 627:6,11 627:23 628:7,14,21 629:6,12,19,24 630:2 630:6,12 night 527:11 nine 531:12 532:18 533:2,4 535:9 537:10 538:6 588:21 589:5 589:15 592:25 593:19 596:3 602:20,23 622:13 624:2 629:14 653:19 672:11 nine-day 574:25 594:13 595:20 596:22 597:18 599:17 603:1,4 604:1 Nkosi 530:14,15 nods 633:15 nog 491:18 594:9 normal 509:7 590:14 590:16 normally 509:6 542:15 568:12 north 641:21 note 534:14 616:12 626:14 640:7 651:7 notes 588:24 603:21,23 605:24 no-one 570:15 596:13 596:25 628:2 Ntsebenza 541:17 NUM 658:20,22 659:9 659:10 662:21 number 507:16,20,21 508:4 514:18 540:11 556:7,8,15 574:2 581:13 594:2 607:22 610:8 626:13,15 633:7 634:25 642:6 643:7 644:12,19 672:6 numbers 514:17 528:23 nuuskierig 633:15,22 634:9 Nyala 508:9 Nyalas 512:4 514:23 524:13 525:18 541:15 541:18 N-G-C-U-K-A-I-T 620:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">O</p> <hr/> <p>oath 494:14 521:9 528:6 637:9,13 Oaths 517:25 519:7 obdurate 600:21 object 566:7 656:3,6 objection 656:7 objectively 650:5 obligation 513:7</p>
--	--	---	---	--

<p>obliged 548:4 observation 543:7 563:21 584:15 621:18 658:1 666:21 observations 641:11 observe 622:1 observed 565:1,10,16 615:15 622:6 630:19 642:22 643:16 649:16 obtain 534:17,19 650:24 obtained 524:12 655:12 obtaining 547:15 obvious 585:14 obviously 513:6 516:15 521:20 537:7 550:25 569:22 573:4 595:24 599:6,14 633:4 635:23 644:9 646:21 650:22 655:7 677:10 occasion 578:21 595:18 632:4 occasions 565:16 588:8 occur 559:8 occurred 569:8,18 occurrence 512:17 occurs 544:23 October 490:1,12 492:3 492:23 594:15 637:10 637:13 642:9 667:1 offence 492:22 offer 611:14 office 500:11 officer 490:9 491:11,11 504:17 505:5 520:21 520:23 521:5 528:3 538:2 539:20 547:10 550:5,13 552:10 560:20 563:17 564:12 572:20 591:19 592:12 592:22 619:18 629:22 638:8 652:15,18,21 656:25 657:1,3,8,17 657:21 658:6,11,15 658:24 659:12,17,24 660:1,5,11,15,21,25 661:6,10 662:1,3,6,10 662:14,18 663:4,15 663:20 664:1,8,15 666:20 officers 532:2 542:5 553:19 554:25 563:21 563:22 564:3,7,19,25 565:10,16 592:13 600:22,24,25 601:13 601:15,18 609:13,25 611:15,19 612:2,14 612:21,25 613:21 663:23 664:2 670:10 offices 658:20,22 659:9 659:10 662:21 official 546:4 574:12 628:8 officials 559:15 657:24 660:4 669:10 Oh 501:10 519:21</p>	<p>521:15,18 530:1 541:6 566:4 573:8 643:7 okay 495:25 498:20 501:20,23 504:10 516:13 517:14 518:19 520:12,13 523:25 526:1 529:1 530:1 533:23 535:24 538:18 541:12 551:21 559:21 562:9 601:23 616:22 621:23 642:24 668:8 old 568:6 om 491:19 omission 560:18 omitted 509:11 once 490:16 561:16 651:17 677:1 onder 491:18 594:10 ones 497:10 568:10 580:10 624:20 675:10 one-six 656:15 open 492:24 509:13 547:17 549:1 576:14 627:21 669:21 opened 509:14 543:5 opening 600:2,5 621:19 672:22 operate 546:25 548:2 operated 575:12 628:2 operating 546:2 551:13 operation 496:3 502:23 503:5,8,12 512:4 513:4,7 515:20 517:18 520:23 532:9 532:10 546:5 575:8 575:15 577:24 584:24 585:15 609:1 610:10 611:21 operational 565:25 574:10 575:11 581:1 582:11 586:23 operations 496:4 499:8 499:10 526:21 559:24 572:19 operator 507:19 508:4 508:6 559:14,22 operators 501:4,9,25 Opperman 592:12,22 656:25 657:3,8,21 658:6,11,15,24 659:12,17,24 660:1,5 660:11,15,21,25 661:6,10 662:1,3,6,10 662:14,18 663:4,15 663:20 664:1,8 opportunity 513:8 520:3 541:21,24 557:3 563:5,10 578:13 opposite 629:16 opposition 493:2,14 OPS 565:24 oral 536:14,21,21 570:11 order 507:7,8,12,21</p>	<p>510:8 524:11,16 526:20,21 544:15,18 544:23 549:19 554:1 560:1,1,22,22,24 561:4 562:1 572:1,13 572:17 573:10,24 574:1,2 579:24 580:3 620:22 654:9 orders 561:19 567:3 570:2 ordinarily 542:22 544:4 organisation 545:10 orientate 600:4 original 497:2 outcome 597:23 outside 567:10 585:4,5 627:4 672:9 outstanding 529:24 overall 514:13 overcast 508:18 overrule 656:7 o'clock 575:9 o'clock 498:21 584:17 584:20 585:2,9 O-B-I 620:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <hr/> <p>page 496:20 573:19 600:2,4,7 621:5,20,24 646:18 659:2 666:13 666:15 676:2,4 pages 507:9 papa 541:14,16,17,18 paragraph 507:11 517:17 519:9 520:19 600:7 666:11,12,12 666:15 paragraphs 640:21 657:20 666:6 paramedics 669:11 paraphrase 632:13 paraphrasing 589:14 632:16 pardon 567:5 646:22 parking 585:11,12 607:19 part 506:19 512:21 514:6 518:2,13 521:2 531:20 539:4 546:21 551:6 554:13 557:14 558:20 560:18 570:18 571:1 581:17 593:22 594:18 599:7 600:4 601:21 631:1,2 635:6 641:17,18,19 667:2 672:23 673:10 676:2 676:3 677:3,16 participate 491:13 542:9 participated 642:13 participating 660:9 participation 642:19 particular 513:19 523:6 534:20 537:1 543:21 554:13 557:14</p>	<p>595:13 659:16 677:13 particularise 603:12 particularly 525:22 541:22 562:21 625:11 parties 491:3 493:1,14 493:22,23 518:5 541:21,23 607:23 party 491:7 passage 520:1 passive 543:1 568:10 568:13 pattern 546:15,16 pay 636:20 penny 606:2 percentage 636:4 perception 651:19 perfect 602:17 perform 547:16 559:9 585:20 675:22 performance 584:14 602:17 performed 530:9 578:5 581:4 582:2,4,14,19 586:13 performing 580:18 period 556:6,14,19 571:9,17 584:2 593:19 594:20 595:20 596:3,22 597:18 599:17 602:24 603:13 604:1 605:17 668:15 periods 558:3 perished 542:5 permanent 638:15 permissible 623:10 permission 492:17,25 496:23,24 560:4 574:22 person 492:16,18 504:13,20 505:24 529:8,20,22 530:3,6 560:2 567:12 572:19 576:9 581:1 582:11 588:22 596:21 602:2 609:24 613:9,24 617:21 631:14 650:14 personally 542:20 596:4 630:4 personnel 617:2,5 persons 560:18 660:12 person's 631:21 persuade 490:21 560:8 phase 492:6 493:8,12 493:21 Phew 588:4 Phokeng 498:22,24 phone 599:12 photo 495:24 521:1,1 522:1 550:9 552:9 557:12 658:2 666:23 666:24 photograph 510:7 522:1 546:13 552:25 557:14 560:12 561:11 561:17 641:13 646:25 photographed 520:23</p>	<p>570:24 photographer 521:25 photographic 526:3 photographing 521:4 photographs 521:25 522:4 525:18 549:23 550:5,12,21,21 551:7 551:15,21 552:7,8,9 552:13,14,16,19,22 552:23 557:19 561:1 603:18 607:3 619:18 620:6 629:21 photography 522:6,9 666:9 photos 505:18 526:5 538:1,1 539:14,25 540:8 549:9,12,14,18 568:25 597:2 603:15 607:8,9,9,11,21,22 612:17 633:25 634:3 658:2 666:22 671:16 Phule 657:24 660:20 662:15 663:24 physically 530:9 pick 594:18 picture 503:16 548:21 554:12,13 555:6 556:3,22 557:9 590:18 pictures 539:19 piece 591:21 607:4 609:3 Pillay 519:21 520:15 Pillay's 640:6 pilot 504:1,2,5,14,15 512:15 513:12 514:1 521:9 569:10 570:1,5 570:11,22 571:3,20 576:10 578:22,23 584:8 585:12,16,17 635:17 pilots 528:14,15 pivotal 580:18 594:14 595:3 place 501:14 503:2 507:18 508:3 509:4 521:2 537:24 541:12 556:14,20 563:14 569:22,23 582:7 587:3 594:23 597:6 608:15 611:22 612:6 622:1 635:1,14 647:16 653:9 654:18 669:13 placed 492:10 549:20 625:24 673:3 places 673:8 675:18 plan 569:3 584:23 658:3 666:24 675:13 planning 499:15 526:11 566:20 played 580:8 596:7 613:13,18,18 632:15 632:16 playing 598:20 please 490:6 492:8</p>
---	---	--	--	--

<p>494:23 512:15,16 522:14 527:12,15 541:25 542:9 552:6 552:20,21 561:17 563:7,11 587:6 601:22 632:25 639:7 639:14 640:13,20 645:1 646:6 665:2,8 670:12 676:12</p> <p>pleases 557:6 pleasure 612:1 plenary 593:4,5,7 plot 673:19 674:15,21 plots 674:22 plotted 673:20 674:24 675:8 Plus 529:8 plus-minus 643:22 647:22 648:12 pm 490:8 point 508:9 511:6 513:20 525:9 532:24 533:5,6 540:2 546:10 551:4 557:2 561:12 561:16 563:2 571:4 573:4 578:24 579:22 596:11 597:3,20 610:19 633:10 638:14 647:9,11 650:3,7,10 651:15,17,21 658:19 658:20 660:23 pointed 495:5 637:9 642:13,15,18 651:4 657:24 667:6,11 pointing 651:8 points 546:9 562:20 598:3 614:13 658:1 658:19 661:3 666:20 666:21 674:15,22 675:2,3 policeman 506:2 529:9 529:14 544:18 559:3 565:5 599:4 policemen 509:9 541:11 544:24 554:15 554:18,19 559:5 564:1,22,23 589:6,8,9 607:11 617:4 policing 526:21 544:15 544:24 POP 507:25 508:5 544:18 559:15,23 560:1,2,2,3 573:11,13 574:5,10 POPCRU 563:16 POPS 568:13 portion 492:20 601:9 position 603:25 609:25 645:10 659:8,9 positioning 672:24 positive 559:11 possession 525:19 671:15 possibility 613:19 614:3,4,8 622:24 630:7 671:11</p>	<p>possible 506:11 545:1 557:13 567:25 586:18 605:18 635:18 648:1 possibly 496:13 524:12 539:6 551:3 613:8 627:3,9 628:23 647:23 671:14 post 528:22 529:19 530:9 580:24 581:2,6 586:12 650:2,16 651:17 posted 669:19 672:9 post-mortem 650:11,13 650:21,24 post-mortems 528:20 528:25 529:3 Potch 592:25 606:8,10 617:14,19 674:5 Potchefstroom 522:16 522:20 530:20 538:6 574:25 588:21,25 589:2,4,21 593:5 594:13 596:23 598:7 598:24 600:10 601:2 602:5 605:13,18,22 606:15 607:2 608:11 609:7 611:9 612:3 616:1,7 622:14 624:2 628:2,9 629:13 638:5 674:1 potentially 628:25 power 561:7 powerful 625:20,24 practice 546:5 practising 638:15 precede 511:21 precise 497:16 556:21 precisely 546:7 precision 493:11,19 preface 571:15 prefer 642:22 preliminary 494:11,18 676:21,22 premises 621:10,11,15 preparation 523:8 prepare 530:23,24 536:16 602:5 prepared 552:9 562:13 601:18 presence 539:10 613:7 622:14,17 635:15 present 532:4 537:4 540:5 593:9 595:19 602:12 612:20,22 613:24 619:17 638:14 674:15 presentation 523:8 530:22,23,25 602:7,9 602:10,20 618:2,5 622:17 673:14 presentations 593:3 602:14 presented 490:23 513:8 538:14 562:2 622:11 presenting 620:5 presently 575:20</p>	<p>President 490:11 press 492:13 pressing 614:9 presumably 522:3 524:15 552:8 611:3 presume 498:14 505:17 513:22 516:1 536:12 574:13 611:6 625:6 presumed 506:2 Pretoria 491:10 500:14 Pretorius 503:7 532:16 533:10 prevent 558:21,25 previous 568:22 655:2 655:4 previously 494:6 511:6 521:16 539:13 568:3 655:14 pre-hearing 492:2,10 492:23 493:3,10 primary 625:15 prime 508:19 principle 493:3,15 prior 625:2 627:12 private 505:8 506:10 probability 588:17 probable 546:25 probably 503:13 532:6 551:22 554:17 563:4 633:15,16 probe 574:23 575:19 probing 544:6,9 problem 493:4 638:24 664:22 677:13 problems 670:14 proceed 494:15,17 520:11 547:23 552:6 567:21 623:12 640:13 650:8 672:5 proceeding 563:16 579:17 proceedings 490:1 491:13,16 542:9 561:8 600:7 651:13 660:8 proceeds 533:6 process 581:18 587:2 590:23 655:5 669:17 672:17 processed 595:25 619:12 640:24 641:18 641:19 657:22 666:18 667:16 processes 492:4,12 547:13,15,20,25 599:11 processing 596:7 597:9 599:12 618:6 659:16 produce 613:1 628:3 produced 584:22 608:24 612:15 615:25 616:6 productive 627:2 programme 548:24 549:6,14 promise 528:9</p>	<p>promoted 504:23 521:11 pronouncing 670:22 proper 506:24 507:13 properties 548:20,24 549:5,12,13,14 552:24 553:1 propose 547:20 562:17 proposing 545:21 propositions 614:14 protesters 569:17 600:12,24 601:1,11 601:17,20 protestors 502:9 554:15 protocols 546:3 547:25 protruding 663:13 proud 602:17 provide 558:9 626:22 provided 549:10 550:8 559:23 providing 490:13 province 595:24 provincial 499:24 500:3 provisional 562:11,14 provisions 492:14 public 507:7 526:21 544:15,18,23 publish 492:19 published 492:15 493:2 purely 608:8 purports 507:7 purpose 502:8 530:21 536:15 560:7 572:17 602:4,8 610:9,20 611:3,6 612:5 625:10 purposes 507:12 521:23 561:14 621:13 651:1 pursue 528:19 608:9 put 491:7,21 514:9 515:2 520:2,3 540:2 542:1 552:7 559:10 560:9,25 570:15 575:7 576:23 580:8 581:25 582:4,5 584:13 589:21 590:3 609:8 610:8,19 614:14 620:19 629:9 630:2,8 632:14 677:6 putting 573:20 puzzled 550:18 606:2 607:2</p>	<p>633:11 664:19 quote 528:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <p>radio 501:16 571:23 575:2,10,16,24 576:1 576:3,7 577:11,12,21 580:18,19 583:13 632:11,12 635:2 radios 501:15 railway 604:9,18 616:24 647:13 raining 508:18 raise 493:6 494:12 614:13 639:14 657:4 665:9 raised 494:10 541:25 raises 521:19 raising 552:5 Ramphele 542:3,4,11 542:21 543:3,10,21 544:4,12,21 545:8,13 545:23 546:20 547:4 547:11,14,24 548:9 548:14,19 549:8,16 550:1,3,6,10,16 551:4 551:8,9,10,19,23 552:12,17,23 553:5 553:18 554:20,24 555:4,6,8,11,14,23,25 556:25 557:6 558:2,8 558:13,20 559:13,21 560:4,7,14 561:18 562:9 661:25 662:5,8 662:12,16,20 663:1 663:11,18,22 664:4 664:10 ran 570:7 rank 504:7 505:20 508:4 521:21 656:24 reached 602:14 read 492:14 510:8 519:9 520:3,6,7,10 524:11 532:25 560:1 560:5,6 564:10 573:12 574:7 584:22 600:9 601:10,10 621:6,23 639:21 640:20,20 644:16 657:19 659:2,6,7 666:6 reading 574:11 592:23 readings 674:16,17 reads 490:9 503:6 574:8 ready 551:7 552:2 585:8,17 real 521:24 realise 516:3 605:14 realised 495:10,15 509:13 510:16 549:4 583:22 605:21,22 632:7,7 really 511:11 524:4 532:2 553:20 558:1 570:18 573:25 598:18</p>
---	--	--	--	---

612:8 614:12 616:10 636:25 654:17 rear 627:19 reason 495:12 508:12 510:10 534:20,25 542:8 546:21 548:23 558:20 563:4 624:11 625:15,25 reasonable 519:17 reasons 490:23 535:2,4 619:7 625:14 recall 504:21 506:13 514:15 523:15 533:8 533:19,20 534:9,11 536:20 537:25 538:2 539:13,17,19 540:4,8 541:11 572:6 577:18 595:22 596:25 597:16 601:6,8 602:3 603:20 604:2,3,11,19,20,23 606:24 608:9,12 609:16,19,20 610:2 613:17 615:9,16 624:5 628:13 629:17 631:17,25 632:2,18 632:20 635:6,9,10,14 635:17 636:3,5,7,10 636:13,22,24 637:5 655:11 recalled 609:15 recalling 655:7 recalls 629:21 recap 496:1 receive 513:19 559:24 591:21 received 490:4 493:22 549:18 578:24 recollect 611:17 recollection 540:20 607:2 610:18 reconvene 493:25 record 491:8,22 492:10 500:24 507:11 513:3 519:2,3 541:13 542:1 542:25 552:7 560:7 563:14 566:8 568:13 568:14 580:11 586:7 590:25 591:16 620:18 620:20 629:1 640:21 644:16 651:1 654:18 657:20 659:3 666:7 667:24 671:16 677:6 recorded 495:6 506:15 508:1 537:24 559:10 582:22,24 583:1,3,4,5 591:4,11,14 603:24 630:19 651:13,14 672:10 recording 495:6 507:17 507:17,18 508:2,3 508:7,8,12,15,16,20 508:21 509:3,4,5 510:20 511:4 513:22 514:17 517:10,13 519:3,4 520:20 521:4 525:17 542:24 548:20	558:21 559:7 568:9 568:12,16 582:20 585:21 587:3 591:3,8 591:9,12,13 596:16 607:4 625:10 630:7 666:23 recordings 507:24 542:16 records 507:13 528:21 626:25 record's 638:11 record-keeping 507:11 rectify 568:22 Red 659:9 refer 638:9 658:17 667:19 671:21 675:14 reference 496:13 511:10,11 524:12 526:23 541:18 560:16 628:16 638:7,7 referred 502:10 517:15 518:17 551:12 594:16 630:17 631:12 638:4 643:14 644:22 662:2 667:3 referring 510:25 511:1 518:10 519:15 544:13 547:25 641:9 644:3 644:22 646:17 647:1 648:9 653:24 658:18 671:7 674:18 675:9 refers 541:15 reflect 514:18 reflected 640:19 657:18 665:18 reflection 673:14 reflects 677:18 reformulate 603:22 629:11,25 refresh 668:5 refuted 526:23 regard 622:6 638:25 673:2 regarded 517:9 regarding 490:4 508:17 register 507:14 registration 626:13,15 regrouping 570:24 586:2 regularly 560:23 regulate 561:8 regulation 492:15,20 492:21 regulations 492:15 561:8,13 relate 529:16 542:13 561:1 567:18 676:23 related 507:25 relates 492:3,5 629:18 relating 620:12 627:1 657:17 relation 492:9 493:8 548:1 561:15 562:21 relationship 641:13 release 572:13,21 released 565:20 655:6	releasing 565:17 relevance 508:21 relevant 494:21 497:1 507:10 508:21 517:19 522:24 523:5 544:25 546:22 547:22 560:5 627:2 reliable 579:14 610:11 relied 623:25 rely 586:5 remain 672:6 remainder 535:16 remained 600:21 remaining 535:18 remark 541:4 remarkable 526:12,25 527:2,9 540:25 remarked 540:25 remarks 503:3 571:15 remind 611:1 reminded 494:13 repeat 495:7 538:9 554:22 568:3 569:14 609:23 611:24 646:13 repeating 527:1 rephrase 538:16 571:16 rephrased 541:2 report 503:7 506:14,16 536:17 537:1 602:5 602:15 650:3,11,13 650:17,24 677:2 reported 543:12,15 544:3,14 reporting 507:12,13 reports 536:15,21 537:16 543:22 602:5 650:21 651:18 represent 491:10 574:21 representation 490:14 537:6 representations 536:21 representative 589:21 661:23 671:8 representatives 491:3 598:16 602:11 627:5 represented 490:15,25 595:23 661:23 representing 541:23 542:4 563:15 674:4 represents 573:6 request 491:15,17,25 513:19 519:17 612:14 612:21 627:12 requested 607:12,24 611:2 612:16 625:4 669:21 require 543:7,18,20 547:18 required 498:12 543:25 664:24 reserve 655:3 residential 653:9 respect 535:16,17 546:24 586:9 650:9	657:23 respond 513:18 549:21 552:14 585:23 responded 548:4 responding 601:19 631:23 response 561:3 576:14 577:15 632:23,25 633:1 634:10 635:6 rest 544:10 562:9 636:17 restricted 614:9 result 568:5 resulted 569:17 resume 637:19 resumes 490:3 527:22 527:23 594:7,8 637:20,21 resuming 494:8 return 572:2 575:24 590:17 returned 600:24,25 601:15 review 610:12,16 611:22 re-examination 630:15 630:16 655:21 656:8 656:19 re-militarised 639:1 re-plotted 675:9,11 re-traversing 568:6 Rice 550:23 Richard 528:10 right 496:5 517:7 522:12 536:2 541:7 545:20 547:19 570:16 587:24 603:7,17 620:24 621:2 633:19 639:15 651:10 655:3 657:4 665:9 ring 601:20 risk 500:19 503:11 638:22 river 529:21,22 530:7 road 570:25 616:24 641:17,20,22 644:18 644:21,22 role 578:18 579:18,22 580:7,10,13,18,22 581:4,9 595:12,19 596:6 606:16,22 roles 580:8 Roman 574:9,10 room 589:6 674:10,10 rough 674:8 675:3 roughly 641:3 round 671:18 rounds 556:7 route 540:12 613:19 row 563:9 rubber 658:12 rule 561:9 running 512:7 513:13 515:22 565:13 586:3 591:10 Rustenburg 653:5,6,16	674:5 R5 656:14 <hr/> S SA 523:8 526:15 574:13 623:5 sad 494:18 safe 498:21 safely 558:8 sake 554:1 638:11 SAPS 497:6 499:14 505:25 507:6 517:17 517:18 519:10 520:23 522:15 525:17,19 537:22,25 538:8 550:22 575:4,12 600:2 616:19 617:19 621:9 623:2,9,19,21 623:22,24 624:8,15 626:11,22 627:5 638:8,25 670:10 673:13 674:2,4 sat 591:9 601:5 satisfactory 494:3,3 satisfied 562:10 674:23 save 551:22 saw 505:9 509:20,20 510:9,14,15,16,18,23 511:2,6,7,9 512:12 513:13 515:11 518:9 518:9 539:8,22 563:11 565:11 570:6 581:21 591:9,10,10 600:17,20 615:11 616:18,22,22,25 617:14 629:4,4,7 633:25 634:1,2 650:14 saying 494:20 498:16 498:19,25 509:15 510:15 537:10 538:15 547:8 577:15 581:17 584:5 613:6,17 614:3 614:3 631:25 632:2 638:21 says 495:13 507:12,15 523:18 526:20 553:3 574:1 577:1 621:19 622:7 659:6,7 673:14 scared 587:5 scenes 543:1,1 546:13 568:10,13,14 590:23 595:25 597:8,9,12 598:14 599:13 611:21 618:6,9,25 619:6 634:20,21 641:14,15 Scott 503:7 524:3 609:17 611:17 612:10 612:18,20,24 614:5,5 673:22 674:9,13,21 Scott's 675:10 scratch 649:20 screen 553:8 554:12 641:2,5,7,8 scroll 520:15 scrutinised 611:22
---	---	--	---	---

<p>scrutiny 610:21 613:1 seasoned 625:2 seated 639:18 657:11 665:13 second 492:5 493:6,7 493:14 499:4 508:16 530:5 556:21,23 574:24 576:9 579:11 580:22 582:25 583:14 587:19 588:3,10 591:16 602:6 608:18 615:13 635:16 651:3 663:8 666:13 670:25 secondly 543:23 573:14 seconds 519:5 security 542:5 543:22 560:20 592:13 617:2 617:4,9 657:24 660:4 664:3 sedan 663:21 sedans 663:19 seeing 533:20 536:15 seek 534:19 613:6 seeking 525:2 562:25 seeks 647:4 seen 524:24 527:4 538:22 557:18 601:1 603:17 608:10 614:6 616:2 617:11 621:23 627:25 628:5,24 650:11 651:2 676:23 selected 508:9 self-defence 601:14 Semenya 562:19,22,24 563:8 566:4 572:25 573:6,9,14,18,23 574:4,7,15,17 603:14 603:17 637:25 638:1 638:2,12,21 645:23 659:20,21 673:4 676:25 677:5,20 Semenya's 638:14 seminar 592:25 595:16 senior 536:12 545:25 546:3 591:19 609:25 611:15,19 612:2,13 612:21,24 613:21 670:10 seniority 654:9 sense 516:22 531:6 532:6 542:10 634:4 642:13 sensible 551:5 sent 490:8 592:3 634:19 sentence 519:9 separated 641:17 separately 589:4 September 492:15 516:14 517:16 519:2 519:8 605:21 608:18 sequence 501:5 sergeant 504:23,24 505:5 539:20 550:5 552:10 572:20 603:19 607:3 629:22 serial 507:16,20</p>	<p>serious 542:20 596:12 serve 582:7 service 523:8 546:13 574:13 578:3,4 600:6 602:12 609:13 611:20 623:5 638:16,19,20 672:22,24 services 532:17 609:9 session 547:17 567:9 593:4,5 608:11,15 609:7 618:16,18 628:2 sessions 499:15 set 501:16 507:15 552:2 settlement 556:10 settlements 586:2 seven 535:18 587:9,10 587:23 588:5 619:2 sharp 600:25 601:13,16 602:2 she's 504:23,24 521:14 521:16,17,21 shielding 508:13 shoot 509:18 shooting 495:14 543:13 543:23 558:3,14,18 569:8,23 583:14,22 591:3 597:19 622:1,7 630:8 632:8 669:6,12 shootings 543:15,19 544:13 556:20 591:13 629:2 669:7 short 502:19 520:4 546:17 556:6 shorten 646:3 shortens 673:10 shortly 585:9 shot 556:17 601:12,14 602:3 614:1 632:8 635:12 shotgun 658:11 shots 600:22 601:16 622:8,12 shouldn't 542:9 545:7 should've 495:14 show 535:6 548:24 549:3 551:7 552:6,20 573:18 607:9 642:1 643:2 showed 538:21 609:18 613:3 616:19 661:2 showing 622:11 642:22 shown 511:20 524:1,4 524:24 525:3,3,6 526:13 538:7,8,11,13 538:14,21 539:10,14 539:15,18,20 549:21 550:21,24 551:16,17 552:22 562:21 567:19 603:10,11,12,21 604:1,12,14,15 605:2 605:4 608:10 610:3 615:13 629:13,17,18 629:21 shows 549:2 605:20 610:1 617:9</p>	<p>side 512:13 530:7 570:25 577:9 616:24 638:12 643:24 644:10 647:17 sideways 614:15 sight 631:20 639:21 significance 624:25 Silwane 532:15 533:16 533:16,22 simply 576:13 673:6 676:19 sit 494:7 sits 504:13 sitting 494:7 576:17,25 636:18,23 sittings 627:4 situated 607:10 situation 544:7,13 545:10 556:4 580:7 580:13,23 594:22 six 530:16,17 615:16 619:2 671:24 sketch 675:3,13,16,17 sketches 674:8 skill 498:12 sky 498:2 slide 641:3,10 642:1,23 643:3,9,10 668:21 675:13 slides 549:9 658:18 slightly 511:6 641:3 slot 676:21 small 555:19,21 556:11 588:10 smaller 601:4,8 607:14 607:15 solving 677:13 somebody 545:2 620:5 631:12 sorry 491:21 498:19 500:3,3 501:10 520:6 520:14 523:10 524:6 525:24 528:22 529:23 533:7,7 538:17 545:13 547:14 549:11 554:22 557:21,24 558:7 566:4 572:25 573:8 575:6 579:9,15 586:16 592:16 593:6 604:21,24 605:1 611:24 633:3,9 638:20 639:2 661:18 666:10,10 671:22 sort 521:24 542:24 543:7,18,25 544:6 545:11 555:14 557:9 612:25 663:13 sorts 518:6 sought 619:5 sound 492:7 568:17 soundtrack 508:2 509:3 source 610:11 665:14 sources 524:18 592:10 592:16 622:10 624:1 South 490:9,13 546:12</p>	<p>578:3 595:17 600:5 602:12 609:8,13 611:19 612:2 638:16 638:18 672:21,23 space 556:6 677:9 spare 620:3 speak 560:3 576:6,13 596:8 670:13 speaking 526:18 571:3 571:22,23 special 500:24 532:8,8 specialised 500:19 503:11 specific 495:12 497:10 498:12 513:3 537:14 577:20 598:3,14 601:1 612:14 619:7 626:18 specifically 510:12 525:24 563:16 577:19 577:20 597:1 611:2 633:5 specifics 598:3 speculate 556:2 spell 620:17,20 spend 610:18 648:7 651:20 spent 622:13 627:9 spoke 549:11 551:11 576:3,17 577:19,21 597:23 603:15 623:8 spoken 621:9 628:22 677:1 spot 569:11 642:24 643:5 644:3 spotlight 636:24 spots 642:14,16 667:7 spotting 494:21 spur 509:11 Squirrel 626:16 stab 649:13 stage 491:4 496:1 508:1 512:5 514:24 522:3 527:12,14 532:9,10 532:10 544:25 545:19 550:18 556:13 558:17 570:17,22 576:7 583:3,4 587:19,19,20 587:21 588:1 594:3 613:3 625:6 632:3 634:20 637:17 639:8 639:8 663:15 675:21 675:24 stages 494:18 512:11 588:1 637:3 stand 551:5 553:8 603:23 Standards 574:10 standby 669:22,24 671:10 standing 507:8 510:8 515:24 524:11,16 526:19,20 552:4 560:1,1,22,22,24 561:4,12,19,25 565:13 570:8 573:10</p>	<p>573:24 574:1,2 585:11 625:3 start 509:17 533:24 574:25 594:6 600:11 617:20 621:2 664:20 664:23 started 509:10,21,24 510:10 511:4,8 515:9 549:2 572:9 581:19 667:25 668:11 672:2 starting 510:19 585:15 664:22 state 633:1 stated 508:12 statement 505:2,2 516:14,19 517:15,21 518:2,7,8,10,12,21,23 518:25 519:1,5,7,8,14 519:24 520:5,13,16 535:10 549:1 569:14 600:2,5 630:18,18,21 631:5,7,9 639:20 640:15,19,21 657:14 657:19,19,20 658:14 659:25 665:19,20 666:6 672:22,23 676:16 statements 495:6 518:7 518:22 519:20 598:4 598:15 states 492:16 station 543:13,16 660:22 664:2 stationed 660:22 661:9 status 492:3 stay 582:15 669:21 stayed 672:17 steeds 594:10 step 504:5,5 614:15 stick 579:21 stomach 649:5 stones 508:13 stood 585:4 615:3 stop 527:13 534:21 557:1 627:7 stormed 602:2 story 494:20 568:4 strand 671:7,7 strange 568:17 strategic 581:6 stream 643:13,15,18,19 643:22,24 644:10 645:4,10,11 647:17 street 643:1 648:24 strike 660:9 strikers 569:18 604:7 616:20 617:10 strip 585:12 strong 559:8 structured 537:9 struggling 512:5 stuck 568:4 636:13 stuff 570:25 593:13 594:24 598:4 599:21 619:5 stun 565:17,19,22</p>
---	--	---	--	--

572:13,21 579:25 582:7 586:21 587:15 587:15 588:10,11 635:11 subject 493:20 512:4 513:14 539:6 575:1 submission 493:23 578:13 579:11 586:6 586:17,20 submissions 561:14 578:11 submit 579:16 585:19 586:11 671:7 submitted 492:18 560:10 subsequent 611:22 628:1 subsequently 610:12 610:22 substance 632:24 substantial 556:7 substitute 585:16 sub-group 613:13 sub-meetings 589:8 sub-room 613:13 successful 655:17 677:14,17 suggest 522:15 553:7 560:11 568:5 611:18 613:8 627:8 suggested 494:4 suggesting 612:2 613:12,17,23 suggestion 494:3 556:15 612:8 660:7 suitable 527:12 675:21 675:24 summarised 562:15 summary 527:4 support 617:24 suppose 505:19 515:18 520:2,21,22 supposed 513:22 520:22 550:4 564:14 585:22 586:4 sure 496:7 498:14 500:13 513:1 515:14 521:22 522:19 534:16 535:24 536:8 541:7 545:18 547:17 551:4 556:23 557:19 561:8 569:5 571:12 572:20 574:3 587:9 588:21 608:17,19 609:18 613:21 614:2,9 616:9 616:10 627:2,3,16 628:11 632:24 633:10 646:20 667:25 674:20 surely 537:8 623:18 624:7 surname 504:9 620:23 670:22 surrendering 671:13 surrounding 515:4 surveillance 545:12 546:21	swear 554:19 639:10 639:11,12 657:2,3,5 665:4,5,6 switch 509:17 510:24 switched 509:8,9,12,12 509:21,23 510:19 511:3 568:24 572:10 swore 518:25 sworn 553:13 s.u.o 495:1 <hr/> T <hr/> table 556:5 tabled 492:13,24 Takarane 491:9 take 491:13,16 494:15 495:8 503:20 504:4,9 505:17 506:8 516:24 520:12 521:19,25 524:18 525:14 527:13 527:18,18 531:3 536:6 539:3 540:10 542:7 544:23 549:3 552:5 556:24 557:11 560:12 561:21 562:12 572:9 575:9 577:16 586:8 587:3 591:21 594:4 597:6 599:15 603:1,3 614:15 617:18 626:14 627:24 637:16 640:2,6 641:10 647:12 650:2 652:22 654:3,13 657:15 667:21 668:20 671:16 672:19 673:9 taken 495:24 526:5 538:1 539:19 548:21 549:19 550:12,23 552:10,25 555:11 556:23 559:4,7 567:1 596:19 597:2 607:3 610:12 612:18 615:18 619:21 628:3 629:22 635:1 650:10 659:13 takes 627:18 672:24 talk 514:13 516:5 talked 524:6 549:13 talking 501:11 515:8 520:8 524:8 537:4 539:3 555:22 576:21 576:21,25 581:22 598:1,15 617:7,10 638:17 talks 621:19 tape 507:20,20 508:11 509:22 tapes 508:14 taping 509:10,21,24 511:8 task 502:23 513:3 tasking 502:13 Taylor 494:23 528:10 te 491:19 tea 637:16 teach 596:9 team 490:15,19 573:7	617:24 638:4 teargas 658:12 technical 673:19 telephone 490:10 tell 490:6 491:24 492:8 502:7 526:9 527:15 530:12 533:2 534:2 535:3,10 542:14 553:14 556:3,22 566:6 568:19,21,25 581:11 583:10 590:1 590:19 591:2,12,24 592:11,17 599:16 601:22 603:10 604:4 622:6 632:4 640:7 642:21 643:20 659:15 665:13 667:15 676:15 telling 547:4 551:14 584:9 613:14 623:8 623:18 tells 506:16,16 559:16 terms 543:17 546:3 549:19 560:16 594:19 594:21 598:12 terrible 655:23 test 508:19 testified 518:24 564:5 565:15 569:7,15 655:12 testimony 639:23 Thamae 652:16,19,21 thankfully 638:21 Thanks 670:17 671:20 673:25 677:20 that's 497:16 498:18 502:18 511:12,15 512:20,22 514:7 517:12,20 519:3 524:18 525:7,8 526:17 530:2 538:24 539:16,24 540:9,12 541:6 542:17 543:8 546:17,18 547:22 553:12 555:19 556:17 561:13 562:15 563:4 565:3 566:15 568:2 568:11 570:8,24 571:6 573:19 574:12 586:16,23 592:12 596:17 599:1 603:14 603:25 612:9,18 613:11,19 614:4 620:1 622:24 623:24 624:7 629:3 631:4 633:17 641:20 642:20 646:19,25 653:1 theme 493:13,16,21 thereof 502:11 507:9 thereto 497:1 507:10 522:24 there's 496:14 516:15 518:25 524:11 526:8 529:24 542:8 548:23 549:6,13 559:3 560:17 573:4 579:3 581:15 583:14 585:15	585:16,16,16 590:22 614:4 621:17 626:1 627:18,19 629:10 641:20 646:9 664:10 they'd 613:23 they'll 545:18 they're 492:1 502:21 502:22 559:5 567:11 582:6 596:10 602:17 655:8 they've 651:14 thing 501:14 541:7,16 581:12 588:23 590:25 603:4 things 501:3 502:8 516:16 523:19 534:22 537:14 540:12,17 556:12 570:6 595:9 597:25,25 598:17 599:9 602:25 619:6 619:13,22,24 620:2 633:21 634:1 636:10 637:5 640:7 646:3 thinking 580:6 613:21 thinks 556:3 third 493:1 560:12 581:25 582:3 586:18 635:22 Thirdly 573:23 thought 510:13 512:3 514:8 521:10 549:12 573:2 604:4 609:11 625:7 670:24 three 518:22 551:19,23 551:23 552:6,8,19,19 569:3 580:8 582:15 584:17,19,20 585:2,9 588:13 600:11 614:24 635:10 672:9 674:4 throwing 508:13 thrown 635:12,13 thrust 497:20 thumb 552:5 Thursday 494:7 535:23 tidy 573:1,10 till 535:20,23 608:17 times 496:20 537:19 549:19 601:4 timing 516:11 556:21 606:3 tiny 636:4 Tip 608:3,4,7,14,20,23 609:3,6,11,22 610:7 610:17 611:1,8,11,14 611:18 612:1,12,20 612:23 613:5,12,20 614:2,12,19,23 615:5 615:11,15,18,22,25 616:4,11,13 659:22 659:23 660:3,7,13,17 title 507:11,18 today 494:7 496:18 624:8 626:18 664:24 told 494:20,22,23 496:3 526:10 528:8,9 532:7 541:14 562:3 567:11	568:3 573:17 574:9 584:12 590:22 591:6 591:7,8,11,19 600:8 603:10 608:23 614:5 614:6 620:24 625:19 633:20,21 661:1 675:9 tomorrow 494:7 650:23 664:24 676:20 677:3,22 top 499:14 573:19 595:16 598:6 609:8 609:13 643:7 666:13 topic 494:10 total 503:17 totally 663:17 traditional 671:13,17 traffic 579:4 tragedies 558:22 584:9 586:7 tragedy 558:25 559:2,2 tragic 595:18 trained 498:15 522:6,9 546:16 training 498:17 640:19 657:18 665:18 transcribed 491:16 651:14 transcript 621:3 622:3 651:16 transcription 670:14 transcripts 491:17 translation 633:16 travelling 663:12 trip 581:14 trousers 663:10 TRT 600:13 trucks 663:19 true 494:20 526:25 556:17 623:1 trust 493:3 truth 519:1 614:10 623:8,18 639:14,14 657:6,6,7 665:8,8,8 truthfulness 640:15 667:11 try 567:25 591:5 646:16 trying 503:9 515:18 538:17 546:23 575:20 582:1 599:7 636:25 Tshepiso 542:4 Tuesday 516:17 517:23 518:24 606:1 turned 665:13 turns 637:2 651:15,19 twice 528:12 two 491:21 493:9 502:6 516:15 523:18,21 529:11,13 535:2 543:15 546:17 551:18 558:3 569:3,8,16 572:13 574:23 576:3 578:10 583:21,21,21 586:7 587:15 588:8
--	---	---	--	---

592:13 593:18 594:6
 594:14,15 602:5,14
 604:14 622:10 623:25
 627:17 631:25 632:10
 636:21 640:25 657:24
 657:25,25 658:12
 659:25 660:8 662:8
 663:4,22 664:5
 666:11 676:21
type 549:1 626:15
 631:15,15 655:25
 663:12,13,16,19
typically 593:4

U

u 491:18,18,19 594:9
ultimately 677:14
unable 603:9
unaware 584:4
uncertain 616:12
unclarity 558:10
uncompleted 528:19
understand 490:3
 491:6 511:7,23
 529:10 538:19,24,25
 539:22 542:14 545:17
 547:13 548:19 550:13
 551:20 556:4,13
 563:6 566:12,24,25
 583:8 587:14 590:9
 592:9 593:3 595:1
 596:15 599:4 604:10
 604:13 612:12,23
 617:20 618:3 638:9
 650:21 668:23 674:7
 677:5,17
understanding 519:11
 545:25 547:15,20
 548:16 566:15 591:18
 621:14 641:16 643:12
understood 525:7
 530:21 536:18 539:17
 539:21 587:22 633:11
 638:6
undertaken 610:22
 627:13
unduly 544:22 557:2
 561:9
unfair 578:12 631:4
unfairly 567:16
unfolded 502:23
 673:24
unfolds 501:5
unfortunate 603:5
uniform 563:23,24
 564:1,3
uniformed 564:19,22
unions 543:24
unit 508:5 546:2 564:13
units 564:6 575:3,11
 577:16
unlawful 671:14
unlimited 557:4
unnecessarily 650:2
unrelated 676:18
unreliable 579:19

unsigned 639:20
 657:19
upstairs 552:1
urgency 509:16 510:7
 510:17
urgent 510:24 511:2
use 498:7,15 561:14
 582:11 592:11 673:19
useful 559:7
usually 561:20

V

Van 501:24 502:1
 503:2,10 513:2,15
 532:15 533:16,19
 534:10 567:4,6
 568:20 570:3 571:19
 572:3 575:23 578:23
 578:25 585:4 590:9
 590:11,19,21 611:2,8
 621:7 622:3,9 623:1,8
 623:17 628:22
vans 607:19
vantage 508:9 596:11
various 556:12 619:10
 619:11 667:7
vehicle 508:10 641:20
 644:2 656:10 663:6,9
vehicles 509:23 510:9
 510:15,19,25 511:2,3
 511:9,11 512:5
 513:13 515:22 564:20
 564:23 565:11 570:7
 581:21 591:10 607:10
 607:11,21 657:25
 658:21 663:17,20,21
veld 512:20 514:5,24
 516:1 669:21
Venter 504:18,19 505:5
 505:5 520:21,23
 521:5 538:2 539:20
 550:13 552:11 572:20
 597:2 603:19 607:3
 619:18 629:22
Venter's 550:5
verb 635:12 673:18
vergadering 593:10
Vermaak 583:20
 631:25 632:4,9 636:1
version 600:1 670:22
verskyningsbevoegd...
 542:8
vertel 491:19
vicinity 499:7 614:20
videod 512:19,21,22
 514:7
videograph 546:13
 569:24 592:8
videographed 512:12
 515:11 570:8 571:1
 585:25 586:1 605:20
videographing 515:10
videoing 510:10 630:20
videos 525:24 542:20
 603:21 612:10
view 512:8 561:19

583:8 594:5 625:5,25
viewed 550:24 615:12
viewing 552:3 613:24
visible 643:5
visited 674:1
visiting 499:4
visual 539:21 603:18
 629:20
volatile 542:23

W

W 643:8
waarheid 491:19
wait 670:15
waited 585:6
walked 570:6 676:24
walking 515:25 565:13
 586:3
want 495:8 505:21
 510:6,21 519:11
 520:2,2 525:14
 527:13,14 534:15
 542:1 544:21 546:9
 547:12,21 550:18
 551:17 555:5,6,9
 557:1 561:13,14
 563:2,8 567:15
 571:13 573:4 574:22
 578:16 581:25 582:1
 584:13 585:22 589:3
 590:8 593:14 599:16
 600:9 601:10 604:7
 608:8 611:18 614:15
 626:20 627:7,8,15,23
 636:16,23 641:10
 644:15 645:6 650:1
 650:10,11 654:10,18
 654:21,25 655:1,20
 657:19 659:2 661:19
 661:21,23 664:12
 674:2 675:22 676:15
 676:20 677:14
wanted 503:5 520:18
 528:19 548:4 549:18
 560:12 562:24 563:20
 578:24 614:13 620:17
 633:4,13 675:15
 676:19,24
wants 503:8 511:10
 539:8 541:7
warned 635:17
Warrant 491:11,11
 504:17 505:5 520:21
 520:23 521:5 528:3
 538:1 539:20 550:5
 550:13 552:10 563:17
 572:20 592:12,22
 619:18 629:22 652:15
 652:18,20 656:24
 657:1,3,8,17,21 658:6
 658:11,15,24 659:12
 659:17,24 660:1,5,11
 660:15,21,25 661:6
 661:10 662:1,3,6,10
 662:14,18 663:4,15
 663:20 664:1,8,15

666:20
Warrant-Officer 597:2
 603:19
warring 543:24
wasn't 496:7 499:17
 511:2 531:18,19,20
 533:11,22 554:18
 566:19 570:4 571:3
 585:3 587:13 590:1
 599:13 602:20 606:5
 609:3 613:7 615:20
 632:24,24 634:22
waste 561:9
wasting 534:23
wat 491:19
watch 516:24 553:17
 594:6 637:17,18
watched 596:25 619:20
watching 620:5
water 524:13,14 600:12
 600:17,17,19 627:17
 627:21,22,25 628:3,4
 628:10,17,23
way 494:4 503:9 517:5
 526:10 551:5 557:25
 559:7 567:18 626:8
 630:3 654:9 673:13
 677:13
ways 557:5
weapons 601:13 602:2
 671:14,17
weather 508:17
week 514:9 518:24
 524:24 530:20 531:5
 531:7,9,10,11
weeklong 522:16
weeks 609:6
went 499:1 501:13
 515:6 548:1 568:24
 581:10 585:4,5
 602:16,25,25 634:21
 669:17 672:9,11
weren't 515:10 533:3
western 643:24 644:10
westwards 600:13
we'll 494:5 532:4
 551:22 556:18 561:25
 563:8 594:6 633:19
 640:10 651:2,18,22
we're 494:7,8 547:22
 552:7 581:15 587:11
we've 493:13 516:16
 527:4 548:24,25
 562:2 567:17 568:2
 594:16 608:10
what's 511:16 527:7
 533:11 557:15 584:4
 588:24 603:1 634:11
 671:1
Where's 553:1
whilst 521:3
white 509:13 522:2
 570:23
who's 551:12
who've 655:12
wish 490:16 491:3

493:6 494:15,16
 527:25 545:21 553:8
 563:10 566:4 639:9
 639:10 657:2 661:16
 665:3 672:25
wished 655:11
wishes 491:7 494:12
 541:24
withdraw 623:17
 671:15
withdrawn 623:15
witness 519:14,20,25
 523:18,19 527:24
 528:8 534:16,24
 535:10 541:3 545:5
 545:20 547:19 548:8
 556:2,22 559:18
 562:18 603:15 623:11
 627:3,10 629:9
 630:15 637:24 639:4
 639:6 641:9 645:20
 645:22 646:20 650:4
 650:12 651:1,9,17
 654:19,22 655:2,4,7,9
 655:24 656:21,24
 658:18 664:17,18
witnesses 545:6 655:12
witness's 541:3
wonder 534:19 545:7
 621:5
Wonderkop 517:18
 653:18 659:8 666:19
won't 494:17 521:19
 534:21 574:6 664:24
word 517:6 527:17
 676:12
words 503:24 506:16
 621:23
work 521:23 548:10
 601:6 620:3 628:17
 643:8
worked 668:16
working 620:6 625:1
 650:22
workings 542:14
worry 494:23
worth 655:9
wouldn't 505:10
 522:20 526:12 535:16
 580:20 634:10
would've 499:13
 540:21 584:11 638:24
wound 649:15,16,24
 651:9,18
wounds 649:8,10,11,18
 649:21,23 663:10
written 492:17 536:3
 537:15 644:7 658:22
wrong 512:1,8 530:22
 530:23 548:23 549:4
 560:9 602:25 603:7
 604:24 605:9 651:17
 675:10

X

x 656:14

XX 574:9

Y

year 507:16
years 542:21 544:20
 546:1 568:18 578:4
 625:3
yesterday 490:5 493:22
 495:3 511:20 514:23
 518:17,22 528:18
 529:21 538:21,21
 539:9 541:14 610:8
 615:11 629:5,8 631:9
 677:12
you'd 496:17 506:18
 562:20 654:13
you'll 509:12 511:25
 530:21 545:3 570:21
 586:25 593:6 600:4
 665:7
you're 491:12 499:18
 519:20 534:23 537:9
 542:12 545:17,17
 550:14,25 551:7
 556:2 559:13,18
 561:1 567:18,19
 568:16 578:2 581:12
 581:13 584:1 585:17
 587:2 589:15 591:19
 595:16 602:23 621:24
 636:18 637:22 638:22
 647:12 665:14
you've 494:9,10 526:7
 534:20 540:17 549:10
 558:13 559:19 562:10
 578:4 607:8 621:22
 621:23 631:20,20
 655:12

Z

zoom 512:7,10,16
 557:7,8
zoomed 514:1
zooming 511:22 554:12
Zyl 501:24 502:1 503:3
 503:10 513:3,15
 532:15 533:16,19
 534:10 567:4,6
 568:20 570:3 571:19
 572:3 575:23 578:23
 578:25 585:4 590:9
 590:11,19,21 611:2,8
 621:7 622:3,10 623:1
 623:8,17 628:22

0

000 514:10,14 515:6
001075 517:16 519:6
001120 519:1
06:05 671:22
08 517:17
09:05 490:2
09:25 499:19
09:45 507:23

1

1 493:8,13,16,21 507:6
 507:16 508:3 532:10
 556:6 582:21 583:18
 593:20 594:16 595:4
 595:7 597:19 598:7
 598:12 600:4 607:19
 652:1,2,18 653:18,25
 669:20 672:6
1st 516:14 519:2 605:21
 631:9 667:1
10 527:11 615:9 618:13
 672:11
10th 543:5,11
10:05 516:2
10:25 526:2
10:51 527:23
101 596:10
11th 543:5,14
11:11 537:22
11:31 547:11
11:51 559:12
115 529:13
116 529:13
116/8/2012 640:25
118 529:12,13
12 662:4
12th 517:16 519:8
 542:5,12 549:24
 560:20 561:2,15
 592:13,20 657:21
 661:5 662:7
12:11 570:4
12:31 582:10
12:51 592:7
120 645:18
13 587:9,23 588:5,5
 593:20 598:24 601:11
13th 498:24 499:1
 528:20 529:8,17
 539:5 549:24 604:8
 604:17 605:3 616:18
 619:21 629:18 640:23
 648:2 651:5
13:30 500:24 502:8
 503:2 526:11
14 492:21 555:12
 593:23
14th 528:20 530:3
 568:23
14:02 594:8
14:22 604:2
14:42 614:12
15 527:21
15:00 496:4,7
15:02 624:23
15:10 668:12,15
15:15 503:8
15:18:10 555:12
15:22 636:14
15:30 503:5,9,12
15:45 637:21
15:49 495:7,13 516:21
15:53 614:21
16 507:11 517:17 553:6
 583:17 593:20 594:1
 594:16 598:7 615:23

656:14 666:17
16th 496:2,20 499:1
 503:1 522:23 523:6
 525:20,22 529:1
 532:8 533:1 537:13
 537:20,24 539:1,2,7
 539:12,14 540:22
 548:11 549:25 550:1
 553:22 555:16,18
 561:2 569:4 574:24
 575:2,8 579:19
 580:13 581:5 584:1
 589:22 594:15 595:3
 595:13 596:11,14
 604:16 606:17,23
 614:15 621:8 622:1
 628:15 629:13 630:20
 631:14 652:1,4 653:3
 653:19 668:11,24
 670:2,2 674:7
16.3 507:23
16:00 668:11,15,24
 669:17
16:04 553:3,5
16:04.1736 553:6
16:05 648:5 671:22
16:25 659:1
16:31 648:6
16:45 669:12
17th 668:13
17(1)(b) 492:21
17:40 572:11
18 594:1
19 600:2,7
195 621:5,20
196 621:5,24

2

2 508:3 532:10 583:11
 593:21,24 594:16
 595:5,7 598:18,20
 599:17,20,21 600:9
 607:19,22 632:15,16
 634:7,21 652:1
 666:19 667:3,17
 672:15 676:11
2nd 637:10,12 642:9
20 553:22 574:9,9
 618:13 637:19
20th 553:22
20:15 648:17
2012 490:1,12 492:16
 496:2 517:16,17
 519:2,8 574:10
 579:19 594:17 628:16
 640:23 642:10 657:22
 666:17 667:2 668:12
 668:13 670:2 674:8
2012/09/11 674:3
201208 553:6,22
21:47 652:6 653:21,23
24 492:23
24th 492:2,11
25 588:5 637:17 662:4
250 659:10 662:24
26 542:21 544:20 546:1

568:18 578:4 625:3
26-year 608:25
27th 622:11
28 490:12 492:15

3

3 498:21 508:5 514:10
 514:14 515:6 532:10
 575:9 601:12
3:30 584:24 585:2,15
30 490:1 600:2 618:13
300 515:13
31 584:2
34 603:5
36 553:25

4

4 492:15 508:6 640:21
 657:20 666:6,12,13
 666:15
4's 666:12
4.17 553:22
4:17 553:10
40 581:14 618:13
41 514:16 515:6 519:4
 609:4 615:12 629:1
41-minute 609:12
 613:22
42 587:3
45 600:8
45.4 600:11
45.5 601:11

5

5 508:8 621:25 640:21
 657:20 666:6
5:26 490:8
50 643:22
500 645:4,7
5131 552:14
5132 552:14
5134 552:14 555:4
550 645:7

6

6 508:10 517:17 519:9
 520:19
6th 606:17
649 573:19
687 507:9
688 507:9

7

7 508:11
74.4 645:11

8

8 516:25 519:5 647:22
80% 586:8

9

9 656:14
9AM 677:21
9th 595:3 606:17,22
 631:9
900 647:22

93.5 644:19