

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 3 22 OCTOBER 2012 PAGES 112 TO 202

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

Page 112

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 22 OCTOBER 2012]
 2 [09:37] CHAIRPERSON: I want to begin by
 3 apologising for the late start this morning but one of our
 4 Commissioners was held up in the traffic quite some time
 5 which is the reason we couldn't start on time. This is a
 6 resumption of the proceedings of the commission of inquiry
 7 into the tragic incidents at or near the area commonly
 8 known as the Marikana Mine in the North Western Province.
 9 I understand that last week there were two meetings between
 10 a member of the commission and representatives of firstly
 11 the Bapo Ba Mogale Royal Family, also some people from the
 12 Bapo Ba Mogale community. I understand that their
 13 representatives are present today, is that correct? Who is
 14 here from those parties? I think someone must take you a
 15 microphone so we can get your, or you can come up to the
 16 microphone and put yourself on record. Give us your name,
 17 spell it, please, for the benefit of the transcribers and
 18 then tell us for whom you appear.
 19 MS KGOROEDIRA: I am Advocate Karabo
 20 Kgoroedira. We appear together with Advocate Masilo. We
 21 appear on behalf of Kosi Bob, Edward Mogale as well as his
 22 Royal Family.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Is there any
 24 other representative from the Bapo Ba Mogale family or
 25 community or are you the only representative?

Page 113

1 MS KGOROEDIRA: As far as I know, yes Mr
 2 Chair.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I ask the
 4 representatives of the parties, please to please put
 5 themselves on record. It's pleasant to see you all again.
 6 Welcome back. I hope that the fortnight that's elapsed
 7 since we were last together has been profitably spent. I
 8 understand members of the family are now able to be
 9 present. I want to thank the Department of Social
 10 Development and all those who were involved in making it
 11 possible for them to be here and to say they're very
 12 welcome, we're very pleased to see them. Yes?
 13 MR GUMBI: My name is Louis Gumbi, I'm
 14 representing police and present civil rights union, POPCRU.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Yes, you
 16 haven't yet applied, as I understand it, to take part in
 17 the proceedings but if you wish to, so to apply, I suggest
 18 you make a written application to the secretary and we will
 19 consider it. But of course you have the full right to be
 20 here, to having a watching brief and I understand there may
 21 be a desire on your part to have access to the
 22 documentation, and in that regard I would suggest you
 23 contact the evidence leaders who'll be able to assist you.
 24 But if you wish to actually participate in proceedings by
 25 making oral submissions and leading witnesses and cross-

Page 114

1 examining witnesses, you have to apply in writing for
 2 permission to do so, which will be considered in due
 3 course.
 4 MR GUMBI: I will do that.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I'll ask the
 6 parties please to put themselves on record. I think we
 7 proceed in order of seniority. I think Mr Bizos, you are
 8 the senior practitioner present, is that correct?
 9 MR BIZOS SC: I think so. I together
 10 with my colleagues whose names I've put on record
 11 previously appear for the Legal Resources Centre. I don't
 12 know whether you will merely want our presence to be
 13 announced or whether you want me to deal –
 14 CHAIRPERSON: No, I just want you to put
 15 yourself on record which you've now done.
 16 MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Yes. Mr Burger, I see
 18 you're here again for Lonmin?
 19 MR BURGER SC: Chairperson,
 20 Commissioners, we appear for Lonmin. I'm Schalk
 21 Burger, I'm assisted by my learned friends, Terry Motau and
 22 Horace Shozi from the Johannesburg Bar.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Who is here
 24 from the police?
 25 MR SEMENYA SC: Mr Chairman, I appear

Page 115

1 together with Mathibedi Ngalwana Sello and Baloyi on behalf
 2 of the police. My name is Ishmael Semanya.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Semanya. Who
 4 is here on behalf of AMCU?
 5 MR BRUINDERS SC: Members of the
 6 Commission, Ms Barnes and I appear for AMCU. My name is
 7 Tim Bruinders.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bruinders.
 9 Who is here for NUM?
 10 MR TIPP SC: Mr Chair, Commissioners, I
 11 am Karel Tipp, I appear for NUM together with my
 12 colleagues, Hamilton Maenetje and Thando Ntsonkota.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Now on behalf
 14 of the dependents of the deceased and the family of the
 15 deceased, we have two groups of counsel, as I understand
 16 it, is that fair? The one group is led by Mr Ntsebeza. Mr
 17 Ntsebeza, I see you're here this morning.
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, I am here and I
 19 appear with Mr Stuart Wilson, Ms Louise and Ms Motwenya on
 20 behalf of the deceased families.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. And Mr Mpofo?
 22 MR MPOFU: Thank you Chair, yes, I'm also
 23 here together with my learned friend, Mr Lesego Musi. We
 24 appear for the same three parties that were mentioned
 25 previously, namely the arrested and injured persons on the

Page 116

1 one hand, the Lonmin community committee which represents
 2 them and the Masutle family still under the provisional
 3 situation, Chair, because our request to the President, or
 4 attempts have not yet been finalised but we will keep you
 5 abreast as to that tender representation.

6 CHAIRPERSON: Anyone else who wishes to
 7 place him or herself on record as representing one or other
 8 of the parties or some party?

9 MS CHABEDI: Chairperson, I'm Dikeledi
 10 Chabedi for the Department of Mineral Resources. I'm led
 11 in this matter by Advocate Cassie Badenhorst SC and also
 12 assisted by Mr Louis de Bruin from the Johannesburg Bar,
 13 both of whom are not present today.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Is there anyone
 15 else?

16 MR LE ROUX: Mr Chairman, I'm Willem Le
 17 Roux. I appear for the Chamber of Mines.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Le Roux. If
 19 there's no one else who wishes to put him or herself on
 20 record, we now proceed with the opening statements. We
 21 requested the parties who were able to do so to make
 22 opening statements and to put on record their version of
 23 the events which form the subject matter of the first part
 24 of the inquiry. I think it's appropriate to begin with Mr
 25 Semenya. But before Mr Semenya starts, I think the

Page 117

1 interpreter must get an opportunity to interpret what's
 2 happened so far.

3 INTERPRETER: Thank you Chairperson.

4 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Interpreter.
 5 Mr Semenya, would you like to begin with your opening
 6 statements on behalf of your clients, the South African
 7 Police Service.

8 MR SEMENYA SC: Thank you, Chair and
 9 Members of the Commission. By way of introduction we're
 10 making an opening statement on behalf of the South African
 11 Police Service and the statement has six parts to it. We
 12 start by making general remarks which we consider important
 13 for setting the tone for our presentation. Then we
 14 identify the applicable standing orders, policy
 15 considerations, legislation and other instructions. We
 16 then foreshadowed to the best of our ability the evidence
 17 that will account for the tragic loss of lives on Monday,
 18 13 August 2012, the 13 August event we call it, and
 19 Thursday the 16th August 2012 around the kraal, which we
 20 describe as scene 1. Thereafter we turn to the events at
 21 what has now become known as koppie 3. This we term scene
 22 2. In the fifth instance we draw from the Commission's
 23 terms of reference to identify the roles that each of the
 24 parties represented here played in this tragic event. And
 25 lastly, we propose some recommendations around these

Page 118

1 matters.

2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Semenya. I
 3 understand the interpreter has a copy of the document from
 4 which you're reading, and so perhaps at the end of each
 5 paragraph, each appropriate division, you can stop to give
 6 him an opportunity to interpret.

7 MR SEMENYA SC: I'll do so, Chair. By
 8 way of general remarks, we state that it is with a deep
 9 sense of obligation to our nation that the South African
 10 Police Service appears before this Commission to account
 11 for the tragic events that culminated in the loss of human
 12 lives at Marikana between Thursday, 9 August 2012 and
 13 Thursday, 16 August 2012. It is indeed right that the
 14 police service and the National Commissioner in particular
 15 should come before this nation and account for the events
 16 of the period in question. The National Commissioner and
 17 entire police service welcome this opportunity.

18 It is also with a deep sense of regret that the
 19 police service approaches this Commission, regret because
 20 of a series of unfortunate events in the North Western
 21 Province in August of 2012 that visited the tragedy, loss
 22 and injury upon us as a nation and the police service.

23 The police service are duty-bound to use this
 24 opportunity and the forum today to express its deep regret
 25 at the loss of life that gave rise to what government has

Page 119

1 officially termed the Marikana tragedy. Lives were lost
 2 among the rank of mineworkers, ex-mineworkers, mine
 3 supervisors, mine security and the members of the police
 4 service itself. But before any of these persons or those
 5 injured were mineworkers, supervisors or police officers,
 6 they were in the first instance citizens and residents of
 7 this great nation.

8 They were members of families, communities and
 9 organisations who are poorer today as a result of various
 10 events at Marikana. Therefore as we set out to assist this
 11 Commission with establishing the facts around the Marikana
 12 tragedy we wish to underscore our regret at the loss of
 13 life and the injuries that affected various families,
 14 communities and sectoral groups at that time. Our thoughts
 15 are with the families on all sides of this equation who
 16 have lost loved ones and our best wishes go out to those
 17 who are recovering both physically and psychologically from
 18 this tragedy. The police service lost two members in one
 19 of the early incidents of the week commencing, Warrant
 20 Officer Monene, Warrant Officer Lepaaku and Lieutenant
 21 Baloyi who was severely injured, as we shall report in
 22 detail later in our evidence.

23 These members, as we stated earlier, were members
 24 of families and communities.

25 [09:57] The sentiment applies no less to the eight

Page 120

1 civilians who had lost their lives since Thursday, 9 August
 2 2012. It is necessary for us to stress this perspective
 3 because public commentators setting out to make sense of
 4 complex issues in our society often revert to a narrative
 5 that suggests a stand-off of sorts between the police on
 6 the one hand and the people on the other. This creates in
 7 the minds of many people the perception of the police as an
 8 alien and possibly hostile force removed from the people
 9 the police are meant to serve in terms of our
 10 constitutional mandate. In reality nothing can be further
 11 from the truth of the outlook and commitment of the South
 12 African police service. The Constitution of the Republic
 13 of South Africa, in particular chapter 11 directs that
 14 national security must reflect the resource of South
 15 Africans as individuals and as a nation to live as equals,
 16 to live in peace and harmony, to be free from fear and want
 17 and to seek a better life.

18 Furthermore, the Constitution imposes on the
 19 South African Police Service a responsibility to prevent,
 20 combat and investigate crime. To maintain public order,
 21 protect and secure the inhabitants of the Republic and
 22 their property and to uphold and enforce the law. To
 23 ensure that the police service leads up to the
 24 constitutional imperatives, all members are subjected to
 25 the Code of Conduct of the South African public police

Page 121

1 service published on 10 June 2005. The Code of Conduct is
 2 a written undertaking which each member of the South
 3 African Police Service is obliged to uphold in order to
 4 bring about a safe and secure environment for all people of
 5 South Africa. Members are called upon to make the Code of
 6 Conduct part of their code of life, principles and values.
 7 In addition, police services worldwide and in this country
 8 have standard operating procedures, formulated national
 9 instructions and guidelines. Police rely on them for their
 10 operational guidance. These FOPs, instructions and
 11 guidelines are there to ensure that everyone will act in a
 12 common way. This within the environment where police need
 13 to be self-disciplined while receiving their controlled and
 14 limited supervision. The following are some of the key
 15 benefits of using such an approach in policing. All
 16 concerned have the ability to anticipate each other's
 17 actions. Set a standard for all to monitor their
 18 colleagues. Help assure proper vigilance. Provide police
 19 with tested safe methods of handling normal and abnormal
 20 conditions or tasks. Facilitate communication where there
 21 is a task saturation and complexity. Keep officers
 22 operating, being proactive and planning ahead.

23 In terms of government outcomes based approach In terms of
 24 the programme of action which demands measurable
 25 performance and accountable delivery, the police service

Page 122

1 works alongside a range of departments in the justice,
 2 crime-prevention and security cluster of government. In
 3 this structure the work of the police service is part of an
 4 integrated system with the overall formal objective or
 5 outcome commonly known as outcome 3 of ensuring that all
 6 South Africans are and feel safe.

7 An important part of this backdrop is the
 8 extensive and at times uncompromising oversight to which
 9 the police service is subjected by our parliament and
 10 various institutions with mandates and powers to report
 11 publicly on the performance and ethics of the police
 12 service. In a rights based democracy, such oversight is
 13 welcomed as a means to ensure that we perform, that is the
 14 police service, its duties in accordance with the
 15 Constitution in a challenging and complex social and
 16 economic milieu. This milieu is addressed very directly in
 17 the terms of reference of this commission with clear
 18 injunctions for the Commission to examine the roles played
 19 by Lonmin PLC, the South African Police Service, the
 20 Association of Mineworkers and Construction Union, AMCU,
 21 their members and officials, the National Union of
 22 Mineworkers, its members and officials, the Department of
 23 Mineral Resource or any other government agency including
 24 the Department of Labour and individuals and loose
 25 groupings in fermenting and/or promoting a situation of

Page 123

1 conflict and confrontation which may have given rise to the
 2 tragic incidents, whether directly or indirectly.

3 Chairperson and members of the Commission, we
 4 believe the scope of this inquiry reflects the President's
 5 appreciation that Marikana represents a complex microcosm
 6 of many issues and situations in our broader society. Our
 7 police service of around 160 000 members, excluding
 8 civilians operate daily in this complex milieu where we are
 9 often called upon when other players or partners in our
 10 society have failed to resolve issues in their immediate
 11 domain. We shall in the course of our presentation here,
 12 demonstrate how the South African Police Service stepped
 13 into various breaches around Marikana. You will hear
 14 evidence that at various stages the police service tried to
 15 encourage mine management and labour representatives to
 16 engage in peaceful negotiations without involving itself in
 17 labour disputes. Specifically the police service tried to
 18 persuade AMCU and NUM to address differences and tensions
 19 between the two unions. Senior officers also made efforts
 20 to get the Lonmin management to address workers but
 21 management's constant refrain was that it was not prepared
 22 to negotiate outside collective bargaining structures.
 23 Lonmin management also described the protestors as
 24 "faceless". That notwithstanding, you will learn that by
 25 that time Lonmin management had in fact already reached

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 124</p> <p>1 agreement with workers outside collective bargaining 2 structures and much to the chagrin of the recognised trade 3 union. Chair, members of the Commission, we will also hear 4 evidence that the police service tried to create an 5 environment in which labour leaders could communicate with 6 members even when some members were dismissive of some of 7 the leadership formations. Subtle diplomacy by the police 8 service was often more intense and persistent than the 9 efforts that should have been made by the parties 10 themselves. You will hear that all of this was undertaken 11 while the police service also managed daily an escalation 12 intentions, violence and death with ten deaths accumulating 13 the days preceding the critical incident in which the 14 police service used lethal force against a section of the 15 crowd of protestors. You will hear that the use of lethal 16 force was the last possible resort. 17 [10:17] You will hear of the fluidity of the situation at 18 Marikana on Thursday, 16 August 2012, a situation that got 19 out of control and tragic, but unintended consequences 20 resulted. This happened despite meticulous scenario 21 planning by experienced generals and other senior officers 22 at the joint operation centre. It was an effort to achieve 23 the object of dispersing and disarming over 3 000 24 protesters and remove the more militant and obdurate ones 25 by way of arrest. You will also hear that as the labour</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 126</p> <p>1 evidence, it will be difficult to get to the bottom of 2 these events, without a proper interrogation of the inter- 3 union rivalry at Marikana/Lonmin which agreement in July 4 2012 directly with workers outside the collective 5 bargaining structures and the role that the Department of 6 Mineral Resources and other departments could have played 7 in monitoring the fulfilment of mining charter obligations 8 by Lonmin. Those obligations of the charter include mine 9 community development and housing and living conditions of 10 miners. We are also here with the understanding that 11 without engaging in unseemly muckraking or blame, this is 12 an opportunity for us to outline the forces that are at 13 play in the situation at Marikana and how the Police 14 Service set out to perform to the best of its ability in 15 very difficult and dangerous circumstances. But, 16 Chairperson, and members of the Commission, the Police 17 Service is also here with the understanding that we are a 18 developing society that often learns invaluable unforeseen 19 lessons under challenging conditions. In this spirit, the 20 Police Service remains open to learning from this process 21 and to do so as part of improving its practices, policies 22 and service to the community. The Police Service will do 23 so because it is in an imitable compact with all sectors of 24 South African society. There is no one, or no institution 25 on whom the Police Service can turn its back. There is no</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 125</p> <p>1 relations and security dimensions of the situation around 2 Marikana deteriorated, in the course of the week, the South 3 African Police Service remained focused on one key outcome, 4 a peaceful resolution in which lives and property would be 5 preserved. You will hear at no stage during this situation 6 did the South African Police Service premeditate loss of 7 life and injury as an unstoppable end game. 8 We pause here to point out that we have noted the 9 speed with which commentators have characterised and 10 labelled as a massacre the actions that circumstances 11 imposed on the individual police officers, faced with 12 imminent danger to their lives and those who fired many 13 shots in the reasonable belief that this was an answer to 14 the imminent danger they were in. This characterisation 15 brought with it the connotations, completed unfounded as we 16 shall seek to demonstrate of the events at Marikana as a 17 wilful, brutal campaign on the part of the South African 18 Police Service. We shall show that there was no murderous 19 intent on the part of the Police Service. The evidence 20 will regrettably show that some of the protesters intended 21 a blood bath. We are mindful of the President's injunction 22 in the immediate aftermath of these tragic events at 23 Marikana, that all of avoid finger-pointing and 24 recriminations. However, having considered the roles 25 played by various parties represented here as documented in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 127</p> <p>1 situation from which the Police Service can walk away 2 literally or figuratively given its constitutional 3 imperatives to protect life and property, secure the safety 4 and security of everyone and to uphold the law and order. 5 When death, injury or damage is suffered by any 6 member of our society, the South African Police Service is 7 called on to serve and to ensure that law and order is 8 maintained. When death, injury or damage results from 9 conflict among any constituencies the Police Service steps 10 in and conducts itself impartially. When police officers 11 are targeted the Police Service steps in, suppressing the 12 human response of the moment in order to render a 13 professional service. Some members who may have been 14 affected by the death of their colleagues in the events of 15 Monday, 13th August 2012, were removed from Marikana and 16 posted elsewhere. This is never easy. This was not easy 17 at Marikana, not when the Police Service tried to save the 18 injured or when it collected the dead, regardless of 19 whether they were police members or fellow citizens against 20 whom the police acted. In fact, this will never be easy, 21 but we hope that our presentation alongside all others that 22 will be made in the course of this Commission will help us 23 build a better society and a better Police Service, that 24 has learnt valuable lessons from this unprecedented course 25 of events.</p>

Page 128

1 The South African Police Service is committed to
 2 humane policing in a human society while retaining the
 3 capacity to deal with forces or individuals who actively
 4 threaten peace, order, stability and a better life to which
 5 we all aspire. As we touch on humane policing, it is
 6 appropriate at this point to indicate that the police
 7 submission to the Commission contains various graphic
 8 records of the violence that results from events around
 9 Marikana. With our respect to the families of those who
 10 have their lives, and still out of deep concern for the
 11 survivors of those incidents, these graphics will be
 12 detailed in the on screen presentations later. We do so
 13 without intending to extend any trauma and hurt to those
 14 affected.

15 Mr Chairman, members of the Commission, we also
 16 deal with applicable standing orders, policy
 17 considerations, legislation or other instructions that
 18 appertain to these matters. Under those headings, we
 19 propose to give a presentation regarding the training of
 20 the various units of the Police Service, the policy
 21 considerations which apply in crowd control and management,
 22 the constitutional mandate of the Police Service, and the
 23 various provisions of various statutes dealing with police
 24 conduct. These however, and the evidence will be, were not
 25 adequate instruments to deal with a treacherous situation

Page 129

1 of more than 3 000 belligerent protesters who were armed
 2 and resisting any effort to disarm.

3 Around the events that happened at the kraal, and
 4 also on 13 August, the evidence will show the following.
 5 By the time shooting occurred around the kraal on the
 6 afternoon of Thursday, 16 August 2012, numerous attempts by
 7 senior officers including General Mpembe and Lieutenant-
 8 Colonel MacIntosh had already been made since Monday, 13
 9 August 2012 to persuade protesters to disarm.
 10 [10:37] They had refused and proceeded to a koppie,
 11 killing two police officers and severely injuring another
 12 on their way there. They also robbed the police officers
 13 that they had killed and injured of two pistols, an R5
 14 rifle, a shotgun, a police two-way radio and ammunition.
 15 Teargas, stun grenades and rubber bullets were used to
 16 disperse them and stop them going into a residential
 17 informal settlement. None of these measures deterred the
 18 protesters. That was Monday, 13 August 2012. On Tuesday,
 19 14 August 2012, and Wednesday, 15 August 2012, the police
 20 service continued trying to negotiate with the protesters
 21 to disarm peacefully. The protesters demanded to speak
 22 with Lonmin management. Attempts were made by senior
 23 police officers to persuade the Lonmin management to
 24 address these protesters.
 25 Lonmin management refused, saying it was not

Page 130

1 prepared to engage protestors outside collective bargaining
 2 structures. They also labelled the protestors as, in
 3 quotes, "faceless," connoting they may not be their
 4 employees. Lonmin, however, later acknowledged that some
 5 of these were indeed their employees, when photographs of
 6 these were shown to them.

7 On Wednesday, 15 August 2012, the police service
 8 facilitated a meeting between AMCU, NUM and Lonmin
 9 management. At the end of that meeting, the police service
 10 facilitated that both unions separately address the
 11 protestors at the koppie and to persuade them to disarm.
 12 The protestors adhered at the NUM delegation and did not
 13 give them the opportunity to address them. The AMCU
 14 delegation was received well, but the protestors still did
 15 not disarm.

16 Chair, the evidence will show that the leader of
 17 AMCU, Mr Mathunjwa, is seen pleading on his knees, begging
 18 the protestors to disarm. They never did. Later that day,
 19 Mr Mathunjwa indicated to General Mpembe that by 9 o'clock
 20 in the morning, the following day, that is now Thursday, 16
 21 August 2012, the people will put down their weapons and
 22 that everyone will walk away happy. By 9:30 on Thursday,
 23 16 August 2012, the people had not laid down their weapons.
 24 It was reported later that the protestors will not disarm.
 25 The joint operation centre then took a decision at 13:30 to

Page 131

1 disperse the protestors, disarm them, and where necessary,
 2 effect arrests at 15h30. The implementation of this
 3 measure was preceded by the deployment of barbed wire, to
 4 send a message that the armed protestors may not cross the
 5 police line. The protestors defied this and attempted on
 6 three occasions to breach the police barbed wire. Teargas,
 7 stun grenades, water canons and rubber bullets were used to
 8 try and stop them from breaching the police line. This did
 9 not deter them. They had protected themselves from rubber
 10 bullets by wearing numerous layers of clothing and covering
 11 themselves with a blanket.

12 Chair, members of the Commission, you will hear
 13 evidence about the ineffectiveness of police-issue rubber
 14 bullets in such circumstances. You will also hear evidence
 15 that one of the leaders of the armed group of protestors,
 16 in a green blanket, who we later now know to be Mr Noki,
 17 confronted Lieutenant Colonel McIntosh who inside Nyala and
 18 said, we quote, "We are going to kill one another today."
 19 On the 3rd attempt, within a space of five minutes since the
 20 first attempt to breach the police line, the protestors
 21 managed to breach the police line around the kraal and came
 22 charging at police officers with dangerous sharp weapons
 23 and firearms.

24 Officers from the technical response team, which
 25 had been deployed as a support service and show of force,

Page 132

1 at virtually less than a heartbeat of charging protestors
2 open fire on the advancing protestors with live ammunition,
3 without instruction from anyone in the circumstances, where
4 they reasonably believed their lives and that of their
5 fellow members to be in imminent danger. Most regrettably,
6 16 protestors died on that occasion.

7 You will hear evidence that two pistols were
8 recovered at the scene from among the protestors, one of
9 which had been robbed off the police officers killed on
10 Monday, 13 August 2012.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, I see you're
12 now moving on to scene 2. Perhaps this is a convenient
13 stage to take the tea adjournment. Before we take the
14 adjournment, it's been brought to my attention that the
15 families have arrived and I think it's appropriate that we
16 should acknowledge their presence. We understand you've
17 come a long distance from the Eastern Cape. We understand
18 this whole matter is an occasion for great sadness to you,
19 but we think it appropriate that you should be here so you
20 can hear the evidence of what happened.

21 The process of bringing family members from
22 Lesotho and Swaziland is in progress, and officials of the
23 Commission are in the process of liaising with the Lesotho
24 Embassy and the Swazi Embassy in this regard. And the
25 attendance of family members from Lesotho and Swaziland

Page 133

1 will accordingly be secured for subsequent sittings of the
2 Commission.

3 The Commission will now adjourn for 15 minutes.

4 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES]

5 [11:16] CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, you were going
6 to move onto scene 2, the koppie, paragraph 45 of your
7 statement.

8 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, perhaps, before I
9 commence that, there is a party, I am told requires to put
10 themselves on record.

11 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, who wishes to put,
12 which party wishes to put itself on record?

13 MS MEYERFELD: Good morning,
14 Commissioners. My name is Bonita Meyersfeld from the
15 Centre – oh, do you want me to come up?

16 CHAIRPERSON: May I suggest that you move
17 to the microphone -

18 MS MEYERFELD: Certainly.

19 CHAIRPERSON: - so that what you say will
20 be heard, and come properly on record. We don't want when
21 we read the transcript to see inaudible at this point.

22 MS MEYERFELD: Good morning,
23 Commissioners. My name is Bonita Meyersfeld, I am the
24 director of the Centre for Applied Legal Studies. I am
25 here in my capacity as a representative of the South

Page 134

1 African Human Rights Commission, and we apologise and beg
2 your indulgence for our late participation in these
3 proceedings. Our – the approach of the South African Human
4 Rights Commission has been very considered. It is clear
5 that it does not wish to duplicate or replicate any of the
6 investigations underway by this Commission of Inquiry. The
7 Human Rights Commission would, however, be very grateful
8 for an opportunity to participate in these proceedings, in
9 the form of a watching brief, and, if appropriate, on
10 occasion, the members of the South African Human Rights
11 Commission would be grateful for an opportunity to present
12 submissions in the public interest and that would be
13 communicated to you in due course.

14 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you very much.
15 Of course, you don't permission to have a watching brief.
16 As far as participation is concerned in a more direct way,
17 you would require permission but we will deal with that as
18 and when it arises. Thank you.

19 MS MEYERFELD: Thank you very much.

20 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, perhaps you can
21 now proceed with paragraph 45.

22 MR SEMENYA SC: I see that the
23 interpreters are not here yet, Chair.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, the Interpreter is in
25 many ways, the most important person in proceedings of this

Page 135

1 kind. You are quite correct, we must wait for him to come
2 before we commence.

3 MR NTSEBEZA: Chair, may I just also
4 bring to your attention, the fact that during the tea
5 adjournment, the families were taken a venue where
6 apparently they are having tea, and it does not seem to
7 have been a synchronisation of how that will be factored
8 in.

9 CHAIRPERSON: We I did say when we
10 adjourned that we were adjourning for 15 minutes.

11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.

12 CHAIRPERSON: And we came back after 12
13 minutes, so everyone who was present when we adjourned,
14 would have known that we were likely to commence, or
15 recommence 15 minutes, or slightly longer than that, after
16 that. But I hear what you say and in future, perhaps that
17 point can be made more clearly to those who go away to this
18 other venue that you have referred to.

19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON: I understand that the
21 Interpreter was away arranging for other interpretation to
22 take place in a room close to the auditorium where we are
23 which is received a television feed, and the – what is
24 happening, is being interpreted into Setswana as I
25 understand it.

Page 136

1 INTERPRETER: Yes, they are being
 2 interpreting into Setswana, Venda and Shangaan.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that was the reason
 4 for the interruption and the hold up. I also have been
 5 informed that Ms Fundi, I don't know if – is Ms Fundi here?
 6 She must be in the other room, I imagine. So she will be
 7 watching it on the closed circuit television. Ms Fundi
 8 from Malawi has come, all the way from Malawi, to attend,
 9 and she's obviously, a very long and I am sure in many ways
 10 painful journey for her, and I just want to convey to her
 11 our appreciation that she's been able to arrive safely and
 12 to be in attendance when the evidence is led regarding the
 13 death of her family member. Yes, thank you, Mr Semenya, I
 14 think you can now move on to paragraph 45.
 15 MR SEMENYA SC: Thank you, Chair. We now
 16 address scene 2, which is at koppie 3. In this regard, the
 17 evidence will show the following, that protesters from
 18 scene 1 retreated to koppie 2, and were joined by other
 19 protesters who were not at scene 1. They then ran to
 20 koppie 3. The various Police Unit still with the
 21 objectors, dispersing the protesters into manageable
 22 smaller groups so as to disarm and arrest them for
 23 contravening numerous laws, surged through kopie 2. Their
 24 arming included the contravention of regulation of
 25 Gatherings Act and the provisions o the Dangerous Weapons

Page 137

1 Act. At koppie 3 water canons were used to disperse the
 2 protesters. Some dispersed westwards, and through the TRT
 3 line led by Captain Kitt without incident.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: TRT being the Tactical
 5 Response Team.
 6 MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. Others
 7 remained obdurate and police officers heard shots being
 8 fired from inside the koppie crevices and bushes.
 9 Believing this to be fire from the protesters, some of the
 10 police officers returned fire with sharp ammunition. Other
 11 police officers returned fire against specific protesters
 12 they had seen firing at them. The evidence will be that
 13 some of the 13 protesters who were shot and killed at
 14 Koppie 3, had charged police officers with dangerous sharp
 15 weapons and had been shot in self-defence. We account for
 16 this below. Others could have been killed when police
 17 officers returned sharp fire believing shots to have been
 18 fired from the bushes and crevices in the koppie by
 19 protesters. The police officers are prepared to accept
 20 that they may have been responding to "friendly fire"
 21 believing it to be fire from the protesters. Without
 22 forensic evidence, we are unable to give an unqualified
 23 account explaining the death of some of the persons inside
 24 koppie 3.
 25 Three firearms were found on the scene, and 13

Page 138

1 bodies were discovered. Using the lettering of the local
 2 criminal record centre, to identify each body found at
 3 koppie 3, an account of each of the bodies found at scene
 4 2, koppie 3, will be described below. We must point out
 5 however that too many members of the Police Service dispute
 6 the correctness of the Google map that we were given by the
 7 evidence leaders at the beginning of the Commission's
 8 sitting. The disputed aspects of that Google map will
 9 become apparent during evidence, if the evidence leaders
 10 should decide to submit it into evidence. The dispute
 11 relates to the number and location of sharp ammunition
 12 cartridges found in the koppie, among other things. So we
 13 propose to use the Google map for a very limited purpose of
 14 identifying the location of bodies found at koppie 3.
 15 Chair, and members of the Commission, the two
 16 bodies marked A and B, were part of the group that took
 17 position inside koppie 3. The group was armed with pangas,
 18 spears and knobkieries and charged out of the koppie
 19 towards the police line. The police shouted out to the
 20 charging group to stop and fired warning shots into the
 21 ground. The group retreated into the bushes and charged
 22 once again. The evidence will be that the police shot at
 23 the group when it did not stop in response to the warning
 24 shots and killed the two. The body marked C was inside the
 25 koppie and came out running towards the line of the police

Page 139

1 who were moving towards the koppie to effect arrests. The
 2 shooting from the koppie had stopped at this point. The
 3 person was armed with a spear and a knobkierie. The
 4 members of the Police Service shouted at the person to
 5 stop. The person broke his run, and walked towards the
 6 police. The police instructed the person to lie flat on
 7 the ground on his stomach. He knelt down and placed his
 8 hands on the ground without letting go of his weapons. A
 9 police officer approached the person to effect an arrest,
 10 the person jumped up with a spear in his hand and lunged at
 11 the police officer, missing the neck of the police officer.
 12 The police officer fired at the person, and the person
 13 continue to lunge and attempted a further assault on the
 14 police officer. The police officer continued to shoot at
 15 the person and another police officer also shot at that
 16 person. While continuing to shoot at the person the police
 17 officer under attach, tripped and fell on his back and the
 18 person fell on his back, next to the police officer.
 19 The bodies marked D, E, G, H, J, K, L and M,
 20 where among the large group of armed protesters who were
 21 inside the koppie. Gunshots were fired at the police from
 22 inside the koppie. The police fired shots in the direction
 23 of the firing group, killing these eight persons.
 24 [11:36] The police service does not yet have ballistic
 25 reports relating to these deaths, and is, at this stage,

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 140</p> <p>1 unable speak more specifically to each of the deaths. The 2 evidence may reveal that the response of some of the police 3 officers may have been disproportionate to the danger they 4 faced from the group of more than 200 armed protestors. 5 The body marked M was part of a group that came 6 from inside the koppie to the edge of the copy chanting and 7 armed with pangas, spears and knopkieries. Two members of 8 the group armed with spears charged out from the group 9 towards the police line. Despite repeated warnings the two 10 continued to charge and were shot and 1N was killed. 11 The body marked as O was among the persons who 12 were inside the koppie. The group was armed with pangas, 13 spears and knopkieries. The person was in the vicinity 14 from where gunshots were fired at police officers who were 15 walking into the koppie. The police returned fire in the 16 direction from which the gunfire came. A person charged at 17 the police who were in the koppie in the vicinity of O, and 18 the police shot at that person. In the absence of 19 ballistic reports, it is not possible at this stage to say 20 with certainty who is responsible for the shooting of this 21 person. 22 Chair, members of the Commission, we now address 23 the role of the other parties. At the outset we state that 24 failure of other role-players to play their part can never 25 on it's own be justification for the loss of life at</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 142</p> <p>1 with reference to the violent strikes. 2 Lonmin also has obligations under the Mining 3 Charter to improve the housing and living conditions of its 4 workers and to develop the community of which they are 5 part. Reliance will also be placed from what this 6 Commission has observed during the inspection in loco, very 7 little, if anything, has been achieved in this regard by 8 Lonmin. At the end we will argue that when living 9 conditions remain stagnant, while cost of living is on an 10 upward trend, it is inevitable that wages will leave behind 11 the affordability curve. Wage increase demands then become 12 inevitable as workers seek to do with their wages that 13 which the mining company has failed to do under the Mining 14 Charter. This also raises the question of enforcement. 15 The Department of Mineral Resources is charged with that 16 responsibility. The housing and living conditions standard 17 was developed by the Department of Mineral Resources in 18 conjunction with the Department of Housing in April 2009. 19 The argument will be that the apparent failure to monitor 20 progress in this regard, could very well have contributed 21 to the events culminating in this tragedy. 22 There is evidence also of violent rivalry between 23 NUM and AMCU. The evidence will be that in the days 24 leading up to Thursday, 16 August 2012, there were violent 25 clashes between members of NUM and AMCU, during which</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 141</p> <p>1 Marikana, but this failure cannot be ignored if we are to 2 learn from these events and seek to ensure that they do not 3 recur. In our submission, there is a real possibility that 4 this tragedy could have been averted if the parties 5 involved here had played their proper roles. 6 The evidence will show that on 23 July 2012 7 Lonmin struck a wage deal directly with workers outside the 8 collective bargaining process and only informed the unions 9 about the deal after it had been struck. The National 10 Union of Mineworkers, the recognised trade union at 11 Marikana, was not pleased. Yet when it really mattered, 12 tensions having risen to boiling point by August 2012, 13 Lonmin steadfastly refused even to address the protestors 14 on their wage increase demand, contending that the protest 15 was illegal and that it was not prepared to negotiate 16 outside the collective bargaining process. This 17 inconsistent approach, we will argue at the end of the 18 hearing, must have sent mixed messages to the protestors. 19 The argument will be that the workers must have believed 20 that if they could secure wage allowances from Lonmin, just 21 to base after their first demand for increases, and without 22 embarking on any industrial action, much more could be 23 achieved by upping the ante to violent, unprotected strike. 24 The argument will be ultimately that Lonmin created this 25 beast that it later found impossible to tame, and this is</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 143</p> <p>1 deaths were reported. Subsequent to the events of 16 2 August 2012, we have heard in the public media about union 3 office bearers being assassinated at Marikana. The sharp 4 question that arises is what role leaders of the rival 5 trade unions played to calm down the rising tensions. 6 Chair, members of the Commission, we shall argue 7 at the end of the hearing that little, if anything, was 8 done by these leaders, when it is their duty to avert what 9 inevitably proved to be a tragedy. The argument will 10 further be that the blame on the two unions is not 11 mitigated by Lonmin's conduct fanning the flames of inter- 12 union rivalry, when on 23 July 2012, it negotiated a wage 13 deal directly with workers, thereby upsetting collective 14 bargaining structures to the chagrin of NUM. 15 Although it is a sensitive issue, particularly at 16 this time, we have to ask whether the protesters, 17 themselves, could have played a more constructive role that 18 could have averted this tragedy. It will be argued at the 19 end of the hearing that whereas everyone, including the 20 workers, has a right of assembly under the Constitution, 21 the right to protest being a legitimate right of the 22 workers, this right could not be asserted outside the 23 parameters of the law. 24 The bearing of arms, the charging at the police, 25 the destruction of property, the killing of police</p>

Page 144

1 officers, security personnel and the members of the public,
 2 cannot be justified in a constitutional democracy. It will
 3 be argued therefore that the unions have a duty to
 4 inculcate discipline amongst its members.

5 Chair, members of the Commission, you will also
 6 hear evidence about the dogged refusal by the protestors to
 7 disarm. You will also hear evidence of an anthropologist
 8 who's an expert in the area, about the ritual that some of
 9 them underwent in the belief that they would be invincible
 10 and invulnerable. This vaguely attempts to explain the
 11 inexplicable conduct of charging at the police with spears,
 12 despite the force displayed by the police.

13 You will hear evidence about Mr Mathunjwa, the
 14 president of AMCU, begging them to disarm to no avail. You
 15 will hear about the protestors charging at the police,
 16 killing two officers, and attempting to kill scores more.
 17 You will hear about the leader of the protestors demanding
 18 to sign a pact of death with the police negotiators. You
 19 will see video footage of a protestor shooting at the
 20 police. You will see evidence of bullet marks on at least
 21 one of the police Nyalas.

22 [11:56] You will see evidence of vehicles torched by the
 23 protestors. You will hear evidence of the protestors
 24 threatened to kill two police officers who were recording
 25 video footage of the developments shortly before the tragic

Page 145

1 shooting at scene 1. Those police officers had to be
 2 removed and that explains in part the insufficient footage
 3 of the events of Thursday, 16 August 2012, both at scene 1
 4 and at scene 2.

5 Chairperson, and members of the Commission, we
 6 will at the end call for various recommendations. The
 7 first point we make is that the Marikana tragedy was a very
 8 first for the country. There was no history of protestors
 9 with such large number, bearing arms, posing immediate
 10 threat to the life and property, armed with dangerous
 11 weapons, sabre-rattling, with an intent to engage the
 12 Police in a mortal duel. The policies of crowd control and
 13 management have proved inadequate to contain this type of
 14 situation. The Police Service will then have to reconsider
 15 its practices, policies, training, equipment and additional
 16 resources to better help it address future events of this
 17 kind. A recommendation along this would therefore be
 18 apposite.

19 Whereas, Chair, and members of the Commission,
 20 Lonmin could have been within its rights to refuse
 21 engagement in salary negotiations with the armed
 22 protestors, it was evident from the Police requests that an
 23 engagement, albeit not culminating in the revision of the
 24 wage agreement concluded, could have assuaged the
 25 protestors and averted the armed conflict. We shall call

Page 146

1 for a recommendation that employers in such circumstances
 2 have a duty beyond accepting a contractual right. The duty
 3 must include taking action appropriate in the circumstances
 4 to save lives.

5 The tragedy in Marikana also shows that the duty
 6 of unions goes well beyond the narrow confines of
 7 industrial bargaining. They must also hold a moral duty to
 8 educate their members, particularly in relation to "floor
 9 crossing," where membership of the one is exchanged to the
 10 other. We shall call for a recommendation for unions to
 11 agree a protocol regulating the peaceful movement or change
 12 of union membership or the creation of competing unions.

13 The Department of Mineral Resources has bound
 14 itself to ensuring that the objectives of the Mining
 15 Charter have been observed, including consultations with
 16 communities on projects and conduct and assessment of their
 17 needs, as well as ensuring housing and living conditions
 18 are improved so as to facilitate ownership by family units.
 19 We shall call for a recommendation that the department must
 20 monitor the realisation of the Mining Charter objectives
 21 with greater vigilance and vigour.

22 Concluding the opening remarks on behalf of the
 23 South African Police Service, the National Commissioner of
 24 Police reiterates the Service's regret at the loss of
 25 lives, expresses her regret at the destruction of property

Page 147

1 and to those injured, extends her condolences to the
 2 families of the deceased, wishes speedy recovery for those
 3 injured, encourages better and responsible industrial
 4 relations between the mining employers and their workers,
 5 wishes the mining sector and their workers to make the
 6 rightful contribution in the country's economy, accepts the
 7 right of everyone to lawful protest, with corresponding
 8 obligation to do so within the limits of the law. She also
 9 expresses her gratitude to, and confidence in, the members
 10 of the Police Service who discharged their responsibilities
 11 in what was obviously a trying and unprecedented occasion.

12 Finally the Police Service remains committed to
 13 discharging its constitutional mandate to prevent, combat
 14 and investigate crime, maintain public order, protect and
 15 secure the inhabitants of the Republic and their property,
 16 and to uphold the law and to enforce it without fear or
 17 favour. Thank you, Mr Chairman, and members of the
 18 Commission.

19 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Semanya. I
 20 now call upon Mr Burger, on behalf of Lonmin to present the
 21 opening statement on behalf of his client.

22 MR BURGER SC: Thank you, Chairperson and
 23 Commissioners. Lonmin takes part at this stage of the
 24 inquiry to assist the Commission in exploring Theme 1,
 25 namely the events as they unfolded during the period 9 to

1 16 August 2012, first to facilitate and assist those
 2 families who've lost loved ones, and provide us to find
 3 closure. Second, to explore and understand the build-up to
 4 the events as they unfolded, because viewed in isolation,
 5 so we submit, no proper evaluation is possible. Third, to
 6 testify to the demands leading to the strike, the strike
 7 itself and the march on Friday, 10 August 2012, the
 8 confrontation between the striking workers and NUM
 9 officials on Saturday, the 11th of August 2012, the killings
 10 perpetrated on Sunday, the 12th of August 2012, the unrest
 11 and killings on Monday, the 13th of August 2012. In this
 12 process, we will address the interaction between the
 13 striking workers on the one hand, and Lonmin Security,
 14 South African Police Services and trade union
 15 representatives during the period in question. We will
 16 lead evidence as to the atypical violence, aggression, and
 17 criminal behaviour which accompanied the actions of the
 18 striking workers and which led to the death of members of
 19 the South African Police Service and Lonmin security
 20 officers and workers themselves.

21 Chair, we will co-operate by making available
 22 witness statements by senior management and security
 23 personnel of Lonmin, who were involved in interacting with
 24 the striking workers, the South African Police Service,
 25 NUM, AMCU and the DME and who witnessed certain of the

1 events during the period in question. As part of this
 2 process, we have already made available documents, emails,
 3 maps of the area, video recordings, and the log kept of the
 4 events as they unfolded.

5 According to the evidence we've been able to
 6 obtain thus far, the demand for a basic salary of R12 500
 7 by the rock drill operators surfaced in the second half of
 8 June 2012 at Lonmin's Karee shaft. In the statements to be
 9 filed, we briefly address the events as they unfolded from
 10 that time, but will seek to paint a more detailed picture
 11 from Thursday, the 9th of August 2012. You will however
 12 hear, Chair, that by Thursday, the 16th of August 2012, the
 13 area around the by now well known koppies near the informal
 14 settlement where a large crowd of striking workers had
 15 congregated, was under the control of the South African
 16 Police Service. Of the events as they unfolded on that
 17 fateful day, Lonmin and its security personnel have limited
 18 firsthand knowledge.

19 The events of the preceding day, Wednesday the
 20 15th of August, and the interaction between the main
 21 protagonists, being the striking workers, and the South
 22 African Police Service, as well as the representatives of
 23 NUM and AMCU, Lonmin employees acting as liaison and
 24 providers of interpreting services, will be addressed and
 25 should assist the Commission in forming a picture of what

1 transpired on that day. From the documentation and
 2 statements filed, you will also get an understanding of the
 3 interaction between the South African Police Service and
 4 the department on the one hand, and Lonmin security and
 5 management on the other, during the period in question.
 6 [12:16] Now the approach adopted by management to the
 7 RDO's salary demand as expressed by the striking employees,
 8 how that interaction unfolded of the violence which
 9 accompanied the strike, of the arrival of the South African
 10 Police Service at the mine in large numbers from Tuesday,
 11 the 14th of August 2012. Intimidation of Lonmin witnesses
 12 hampers our ability to assist the Commission, I hope only
 13 at this early stage, to consult with witnesses and to make
 14 statements available to the Commission. Offers of witness
 15 protection are being perceived by some of our witnesses as
 16 providing scant protection. We may well have to seek
 17 further guidance and assistance from the Commission if our
 18 efforts to obtain evidence is further compromised.

19 We as the legal team representing Lonmin intend
 20 to give you as Commission, Chair, and our colleagues
 21 leading the evidence, our full assistance to execute your
 22 mandate and to formulate recommendations which would, so we
 23 hope, assist in identifying and addressing those factors
 24 which have given rise to these tragic events in order to
 25 avoid a recurrence and to normalise relationships between

1 all role players involved.

2 In conclusion, Chair, if submissions are to be
 3 made about the causes of the tragedy, we will do so at the
 4 end of the evidence on Theme 1. We refrain from doing so
 5 in opening and refrain from engaging with those fingers
 6 already pointed, and I suspect still to be pointed, at this
 7 early stage.

8 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Burger. I
 9 now ask Mr Tipp to make the opening – it's described as an
 10 opening submission, but it's opening statement, I take it,
 11 on behalf of the National Union of Mine Workers.

12 MR TIPP SC: Thank you, Chair. Chair, we
 13 have prepared a written opening submission which has been
 14 lodged with all parties. There are certain subparagraph
 15 headings. I'll indicate those as I work through the
 16 document.

17 Firstly, introduction. The Commission is
 18 appointed with its primary focus to investigate matters of
 19 public, national and international concern arising out of
 20 the tragic events at Marikana from 11 August to 16 August
 21 2012, which led to the death of more than 44 people, injury
 22 to more than 70 people, many arrests, as well as damage and
 23 destruction to property.

24 The National Union of Mine Workers - which we
 25 abbreviate as NUM - has welcomed the appointment of the

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 152</p> <p>1 Commission and has committed itself to contribute wherever 2 possible to the conducting by the Commission of a thorough 3 inquiry into the causes of these events and the making by 4 it of appropriate recommendations.</p> <p>5 Paragraph 1.4 of the Terms of Reference of the 6 Commission stipulates that the conduct of NUM, its members 7 and its officials is to be investigated and reported on. 8 Certain particular aspects thereof are identified in 9 subparagraphs 1.4.1, 1.4.2 and 1.4.3. NUM will give its 10 full cooperation to the Commission in relation not only to 11 these paragraphs, but on any matter where it may be in a 12 position to advance the work of the Commission. Should it 13 be shown that any NUM members conducted themselves in an 14 unlawful manner, NUM will institute the appropriate 15 disciplinary steps in terms of its constitution and will 16 expect the law to take its course.</p> <p>17 The second topic is the ongoing violence and 18 intimidation at Marikana. As the Commission is aware its 19 proceedings take place in the context of ongoing volatility 20 and tension. The climate of violence and intimidation that 21 characterised the period leading up to 16 August 2012 has 22 not abated at Marikana and had since spread to other mines 23 in the Rustenburg area, leading to more deaths, injury and 24 destruction. This has a profound impact on the 25 Commission's proceedings. This is most clearly illustrated</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 154</p> <p>1 represented NUM at the pointing out. This inference has 2 been bolstered by a range of subsequent attacks on NUM 3 members in the Wonderkop Hostel complex and nearby 4 settlements, resulting in further deaths, injuries and 5 destruction of property. As a result many NUM branch 6 leaders and shop stewards have had to leave their 7 residences.</p> <p>8 These events have sharply exacerbated the 9 reluctance of NUM members and others to assume the role of 10 being witnesses before the Commission. That reluctance was 11 present from the beginning of our preparatory work on the 12 pertinent incidents. It was at no time indicative of any 13 unwillingness to assist the Commission, but had its source 14 solely in concerns about personal safety. This has had a 15 material impact on NUM's preparations for the inquiry and 16 we have communicated with the Commission regarding the 17 submission of the names of witnesses and their statements 18 and the need to give earnest attention to ways in which the 19 safety of potential witnesses can be effectively secured.</p> <p>20 NUM is anxious to have this matter addressed in 21 such a manner that the work of the Commission will not be 22 delayed or otherwise hampered. It has an unqualified 23 commitment to contribute to that work, which it views as 24 being of vital importance, but it also has an unqualified 25 commitment to the safety of its officials and members.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 153</p> <p>1 by the killing on Friday, 5 October 2012 of Mr Daluvuyo 2 Bongo. Mr Bongo was the Secretary of the Lonmin Western 3 Platinum Branch of NUM and was consulted on a number of 4 occasions on matters relevant to the issues requiring 5 investigation by the Commission. It was envisaged that he 6 would be a material witness and that his testimony would in 7 due course not only have been of assistance to the 8 Commission, but would also have advanced NUM's capacity to 9 present evidence as to its role in the events under 10 examination.</p> <p>11 It was as a result of these consultations that Mr 12 Bongo attended the Commission's inspections in loco on 1 13 and 2 October 2012. In particular on the latter date, it 14 was Mr Bongo who pointed out to the Commission various 15 matters at and near the NUM office within the Western Mine 16 Platinum precinct. Mr Bongo was shot and killed at his 17 place of residence in the Wonderkop Hostel complex, a 18 location visited by the Commission on 2 October 2012. The 19 shooting occurred between 5:30 and 6PM. He was hit by six 20 bullets. NUM does not at this stage have a conclusive 21 understanding of the event, but it would appear to be at 22 least a plausible inference that this was a deliberate and 23 targeted killing. That is how it is presently being 24 interpreted by officials and members of NUM. It is also 25 perceived as being connected to the fact that Mr Bongo</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 155</p> <p>1 Notwithstanding this, NUM offers the following submissions 2 at this stage of the Commission, each of which will be 3 briefly expanded upon below.</p> <p>4 Firstly, the unprotected strike had begun on 9 5 August 2012; secondly, the background to the unprotected 6 strike and developments in the area and the circumstances 7 that lead up to the events of 11 to 16 August 2012; 8 thirdly, collective bargaining issues that arise; fourthly, 9 the level of preparation and planning on the part of SAPS 10 during the days before 16 August 2012 and the conduct of 11 police officers at the time of the shooting on that day; 12 fifthly, the inquiry into the events subsequent to 16 13 August 2012.</p> <p>14 We then address the unprotected strike commencing 15 on 9 August 2012. The unprotected strike by the rock drill 16 operators - which we will abbreviate as RDO's - which 17 commenced on 9 August 2012 was from inception characterised 18 by high levels of intimidation and violence. The strike 19 soon descended into a complete disregard for the rights and 20 lives of non-strikers, resulting in the death of 10 people 21 between 9 and 15 August 2102. NUM believes that 22 unprotected strikes in general have catastrophic 23 consequences for all parties, but none more so than the 24 employees who participate in them. Not only do they lose 25 the dismissal protection of the constitutionally entrenched</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 156</p> <p>1 right to strike, but these strikes are often plagued by 2 significant levels of violence, intimidation and 3 destruction of property. 4 [12:36] It is for these reasons that NUM consistently 5 urged its members not to associate with the unprotected 6 strike, to continue reporting for duty, called for the 7 strikers to return to work and for their demands to be 8 channelled through established collective bargaining 9 processes and procedures. NUM also consistently urged 10 Lonmin and the SAPS to take steps to prevent the unlawful 11 conduct of the strikers and the intimidation and violence 12 directed at non-strikers. NUM is of the view that the 13 position it adopted in this regard gave rise to anti-NUM 14 sentiment amongst the strikers and violence towards its 15 members, officials and the union itself. Since the 16 commencement of the strike numerous mass meetings were 17 called by NUM encouraging its members to distance 18 themselves from the unprotected strike action and 19 associated violence and intimidation. NUM also actively 20 assisted its members as well as other employees who wanted 21 to report for work but who for one or other reason were 22 finding it difficult to get to work. On the morning of 11 23 August 2012, several hundred of the unprotected strikers 24 who appeared to include non-Lonmin employees gathered near 25 the Nhlondokop Stadium and marched towards the Western</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 158</p> <p>1 already provided for in the collective agreement. After a 2 protracted unprotected strike Impala acceded to that 3 demand. Many employees and former employees of Impala 4 Platinum mine and Lonmin reside in the same or nearby 5 townships, informal settlements and villages within the 6 vicinity of these mines. Events and conduct at a 7 particular mine or in a particular community permeates 8 through nearby mines and surrounding communities. In this 9 regard NUM understands that persons who were not Lonmin 10 employees, including former Lonmin and Impala Platinum 11 employees and residents from nearby communities were 12 involved in the Lonmin industrial unrest and also gathered 13 on the koppie near Marikana Mine. NUM submits that without 14 direct reference to recent labour disputes at other mines 15 in the Rustenburg area and to the circumstances of the 16 surrounding communities, the Commission would be deprived 17 of critical background and factual information required to 18 adequately probe the incidents at the Marikana Mine. 19 Without this information being properly placed before the 20 Commission the Lonmin incidents will not be placed in the 21 sufficiently complete context so as to enable the 22 Commission to make a fully informed evaluation of the 23 events and the conduct of the various parties. The 24 consideration of this background by the Commission will 25 materially contribute to a proper appreciation of the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 157</p> <p>1 Platinum branch offices of NUM. It is believed that the 2 marchers had malicious intent and upon their arrival in the 3 vicinity of the NUM offices a confrontation ensued between 4 the marchers and a number of NUM members during which 5 firearms were discharged. Although there already appeared 6 to be differing versions regarding this incident, NUM will 7 in due course lead evidence that in the circumstances the 8 use of firearms by NUM members was justified. 9 We now deal further with the background to the 10 unprotected strike. NUM is of the view that the tragic 11 events at Marikana have their roots in recent labour 12 disputes in the area, in particular at Lonmin's Karee mine 13 and the nearby Impala Platinum mine. These disputes were 14 also characterised by violence, intimidation and loss of 15 life and in the case of Impala Platinum mine the 16 undermining of agreed collective bargaining processes. As 17 at Lonmin, NUM and Impala had entered into a two-year 18 collective agreement dealing with wages and other 19 substantive terms and conditions of employment. During the 20 course of that agreement, Impala took a unilateral decision 21 to grant an additional wage increase to one category of 22 employees being miners. Another category of employees, the 23 RDOs, were aggrieved by this decision and embarked on an 24 unprotected strike in support of their demand that they too 25 should be granted an increase in addition to the increase</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 159</p> <p>1 events and incidents leading up to 16 August 2012. NUM is 2 also of the view that the social and economic circumstances 3 of the communities in the vicinity of the Marikana Mine 4 where many mine workers employed by Lonmin and other mines 5 reside, and associated community grievances and protests 6 contributed to the general situation leading to the Lonmin 7 incidents. We now deal with further submissions concerning 8 collective bargaining. NUM will give evidence of its 9 longstanding engagement in and commitment to the processes 10 of collective bargaining. These are rooted in the 11 Constitution of the Republic of South Africa and further 12 provided for in the Labour Relations Act, 66 of 1995. They 13 entail lawfully organised union and employer entities 14 functioning within the bargaining environment that not only 15 regulates their interaction but also provides for the 16 possibility of resort to lawful strike or lock-out 17 measures. They provide certainty and stability to the core 18 of South Africa's economy, the events at Marikana were 19 destructive of this regime. Notwithstanding the 20 significant gains made to wage levels in the mining 21 industry through collective bargaining processes over the 22 years, the overall level of mining wages remains low. The 23 work is hard and dangerous, living in social conditions are 24 for the most part deplorable. But the enforcement of wage 25 demands that are pursued not through a collective agreement</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 160</p> <p>1 reached after regulated negotiation in accordance with the 2 law or through regulated collective bargaining processes, 3 but through manifestly unprotected strike action, through 4 intimidation and through the wielding of weapons and acts 5 of violence to the extent of some killings during the days 6 before 16 August 2012 is both unacceptable and 7 unsustainable. The impact of an approach of this kind on 8 labour relations and economic activity is profoundly 9 negative.</p> <p>10 In response to the Marikana tragedy a range of 11 commentators have raised broad questions around the 12 functionality of the current collective bargaining system 13 within South Africa's industrial relations environment. It 14 is NUM's respectful submission that it is not the role of 15 this Commission to undertake an in-depth or general 16 examination of the country's collective bargaining system. 17 Such an exercise would be undesirable not only because of 18 its magnitude but because also an examination of this 19 nature impacts on all sectors of the economy and is best 20 undertaken by all affected parties in forums designed for 21 that purpose. Specific collective bargaining issues do 22 however arise in the Lonmin context which this Commission 23 should consider in probing the conduct of Lonmin, NUM and 24 AMCU as mandated by the terms of reference. For present 25 purposes, it is the conduct of the parties within the</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 162</p> <p>1 support of their original demand.</p> <p>2 As stated earlier, NUM not only distanced itself 3 from the unprotected strike and associated violence and 4 intimidation, but it took proactive steps to facilitate the 5 return to work of those employees who did not want to 6 participate in the strike, and encouraged the strikers to 7 channel their demands through the existing collective 8 bargaining structures and processes.</p> <p>9 CHAIRPERSON: I think perhaps this is an 10 appropriate stage for us to take the lunch adjournment, as 11 you're moving onto a new topic, the role of the South 12 African Police Services.</p> <p>13 MR TIPP SC: Yes.</p> <p>14 CHAIRPERSON: Very well, we will adjourn 15 now for an hour until 2 o'clock.</p> <p>16 [INQUIRY ADJOURNS INQUIRY RESUMES] 17 [14:01] CHAIRPERSON: Good afternoon. The 18 Commission resumes. I have been informed that the day 19 passes which people have today are only valid for today. 20 From tomorrow no-one will be allowed into this auditorium, 21 except the commissioners, unless they are in possession of 22 accreditation documents which contain their photographs. 23 So, apparently photographs have to be taken at the City 24 Hall. So we have decided that we will sit this afternoon 25 until 4 o'clock, we won't take a tea adjournment, we will</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 161</p> <p>1 current collective bargaining framework that must be 2 examined. Two broad collective bargaining and industrial 3 relations issues accordingly arise. First, the commitment 4 of the parties to honour existing collective bargaining 5 structures and agreements, and second, the approach of the 6 parties to the management of the unprotected industrial 7 action in this context and their endeavours to avoid the 8 catastrophic events that unfolded during the period in 9 question. Like Impala Lonmin's actions demonstrated a 10 fundamental undermining of agreed collective bargaining 11 processes and collective agreements.</p> <p>12 [12:56] The RDOs at Lonmin's Karee mine approached 13 Lonmin's management in the wake of the events at Impala, 14 with a demand that they should be granted an increase, in 15 addition to the increase provided for in the collective 16 agreement that was binding on them. In response to this 17 demand, Lonmin made a decision to award additional 18 allowances to RDOs and their assistants. Lonmin did not 19 negotiate with NUM, as the recognised collective bargaining 20 agent. NUM was simply informed of the company's decision 21 to grant the additional allowances. Not satisfied with 22 these additional allowances, and emboldened by the 23 company's willingness to deal directly with them and to 24 increase their pay during the currency of a collective 25 agreement, the RDOs embarked on an unprotected strike in</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 163</p> <p>1 sit straight through to 4 o'clock to enable those who 2 require, I take it, it is not the members of the public but 3 it is officials and counsel and representatives, an 4 opportunity to go to the town hall to arrange, or city 5 hall, to arrange for their photographs to be taken and 6 these accreditation documents to be issued. So, I am 7 telling you that now, so we are sitting straight through 8 till 4 o'clock without an adjournment and then, we will 9 then take the adjournment until tomorrow morning. I 10 understand the officials will be there until 6 o'clock 11 processing the application for accreditation documents. I 12 have also been informed that the air-conditioning is not 13 working properly and it is rather hot here in Rustenburg 14 and so in the circumstances I have, and my colleagues have 15 agreed to allow those who wish to do so to take off their 16 jackets. This indulgence only lasts for as long as the 17 air-conditioning doesn't work. But as far as this 18 afternoon is concerned, certainly the air-conditioning 19 apparently is not working, and for those who wish to take 20 off their jackets may do so. The indulgence only applies 21 to persons other than the commissioners who will have to 22 keep their jackets on. Mr Tipp, you were making your 23 opening statement, would you like to proceed?</p> <p>24 MR TIPP SC: Thank you Chair, 25 Commissioners. I had got to the point in the written</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 164</p> <p>1 document that we submitted which is the heading of, role of 2 the South African Police Services. It's paragraph 30 and 3 I'll proceed from there. Grave questions present 4 themselves in relation to the level of preparation and 5 planning on the part of SAPS during the days before 16 6 August 2012 and the conduct of police officers at the time 7 of the shooting on that day. NUM is aware that there are 8 other parties and representatives who will be giving 9 special attention to this aspect of the inquiry. In order 10 to avoid the duplication of material that is placed before 11 the Commission, NUM will wherever appropriate make 12 available to those representatives such information as it 13 has gathered in this regard. Of particular concern for NUM 14 was the inability of Lonmin security personnel to manage 15 the increasing levels of violence since the commencement of 16 the strike. NUM made repeated – of particular concern for 17 NUM was the inability of Lonmin security personnel to 18 manage the increasing levels of violence since the 19 commencement of the strike. NUM made repeated requests for 20 a significant increase in the presence of law enforcement 21 agencies to manage the security situation and avoid further 22 acts of violence and the loss of life and also repeatedly 23 engaged the SAPS during the daily Lonmin security briefings 24 on its efforts to disarm the strikers who were heavily 25 equipped with dangerous weapons.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 166</p> <p>1 directed towards the background to the unprotected strike 2 and to incidents and events subsequent to 16 August 2012 3 even on the basis that they will not become principle 4 concerns of the Commission. NUM hence believed it 5 advisable to secure an appropriate amendment to clarify the 6 Commission's powers in this regard. In contemplation of 7 this on 9 October 2012 NUM submitted a motivation to the 8 President proposing an amendment to the terms of reference 9 of the Commission as published in Government Gazette of 12 10 September 2012. A copy of NUM's submission was provided to 11 the Commission and to the parties. And that, Chair and 12 Commission, completes the opening statement for NUM.</p> <p>13 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Tipp. I just 14 want to make it clear in relation to what I said earlier 15 about the day passes. Members of the public don't require 16 day passes or any accreditation to come to the auditorium. 17 So, what I said earlier doesn't apply to them. Those who 18 are here using, having access to special facilities who 19 have day passes will find delaying further, that the day 20 pass won't let them in tomorrow and from tomorrow special 21 accreditation documents will be required which have 22 photographs of the holders thereof. I was talking about 23 that, that is the reason why we will adjourn at 4 o'clock 24 this afternoon. Members of the public don't have to worry 25 about it because they don't need day passes or</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 165</p> <p>1 Mr Chair, we deal next briefly with the question 2 of the inquiry into subsequent events. NUM is also of the 3 view that the examination by the Commission of a number of 4 events, incidents and statements that occurred or were made 5 after 16 August 2012 involving or bearing upon various 6 parties already identified in the terms of reference will 7 materially contribute to a proper appreciation of the 8 events, incidents and/or their conduct during the period on 9 and before that date. Subsequent events and incidents that 10 NUM believes require examination for this purpose include 11 (1) the peace accord signed on 6 September 2012 and the 12 associated negotiations. (2) the addendum to the wage 13 agreement signed on 18 September 2012 which ended the 14 unprotected strike. (3) the killing of NUM shop steward, 15 Mr Dumisani Ntinti on 11 September 2012 in the immediate 16 vicinity of the koppie and in similar circumstances to the 17 killing of Isaiah Twala on 14 August 2012. Fourthly, the 18 killing of NUM branch secretary, Mr Daluvuyo Bongo on 5 19 October 2012 and subsequent attacks on the members and 20 officials at the Wonderkop Hostel complex and surrounding 21 settlements.</p> <p>22 We next turn briefly and lastly to the terms of 23 reference of the Commission. In NUM's view there should be 24 no uncertainty that the Commission's present terms of 25 reference adequately encompass the enquiries that should be</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 167</p> <p>1 accreditation documents to get in. So, I hope that is 2 clear. Mr Bruinders, we didn't receive documents from you, 3 I don't know whether you propose making an opening 4 statement on behalf of AMCU?</p> <p>5 MR BRUINDERS SC: I do.</p> <p>6 CHAIRPERSON: Would you please proceed?</p> <p>7 MR BRUINDERS SC: I will. Members of the 8 Commission, an opening address is meant to tell a story. 9 Here it is meant to tell the story about the events of 9 to 10 16 August 2012 and how that story will unfold in the 11 evidence that will be led before you. It is a hard story 12 to tell not least because it is a story of so many deaths 13 that could have been avoided had rational, reasonable and 14 ultimately simple measures been taken. It is also hard 15 because AMCU has not had enough time to master the 16 thousands of pages of documentary evidence, nor has it 17 finalised the many witness statements that it has taken. 18 Members of the commission, AMCU will furnish the evidence 19 leaders with a number of statements. Commission, among 20 them is the statement of Mr Mathunjwa its President. His 21 statement tells a major part of the story we recount 22 briefly today.</p> <p>23 So how to tell that story. AMCU thought it best 24 to tell it chronologically. It does so in a written 25 opening statement, that statement is being finalised and</p>

Page 168

1 will be served on the Commission tomorrow. In the
 2 meanwhile we give a summary of the chronology of that story
 3 and it is the following. AMCU first became aware that the
 4 rock drill operators wanted to communicate their demand of
 5 a wage increase of R12 500 a month at Lonmin on 21 June and
 6 then 21 July 2012. On 21 July particularly these rock
 7 drill operators consisted of members of the NUM and AMCU
 8 mainly but it appears that the majority of these rock drill
 9 operators were members of the NUM. At first Lonmin
 10 management engaged directly with the rock drill operators,
 11 that is they engaged with them outside of the existing
 12 collective bargaining structures. And what also means is
 13 that they did not engage with the NUM or AMCU about the
 14 demand of the rock drill operators. Lonmin responded to
 15 this demand by unilaterally approving an allowance of R750
 16 a month for rock drill operators. Approval was unilateral
 17 because it was not done after bargaining collectively or
 18 even consulting with the NUM for AMCU. Having negotiated
 19 directly with the rock drill operators about their demand
 20 for a wage increase it appears that after the operators
 21 rejected the counter offer Lonmin refused to negotiate with
 22 them directly again until after 16 August 2012. That
 23 engagement too was unsuccessful. But Lonmin never engaged
 24 with AMCU over the demand by the rock drill operators.
 25 AMCU is unaware that Lonmin engaged with NUM over the

Page 169

1 demand. Lonmin first engaged with AMCU and the other
 2 unions and representatives of unaffiliated rock drill
 3 operators about their demand for a wage increase after 16
 4 August 2012 during the CCMA negotiations. In July 2012
 5 when Mr Mathunjwa was first informed by Lonmin about
 6 employees wanting to serve a memorandum on management, he
 7 asked Mr Mokwena of Lonmin to call a meeting of the trade
 8 unions who organised at Lonmin to discuss how to deal with
 9 that demand. By 10 August 2012 Lonmin had not called a
 10 meeting.
 11 [14:21] On that day, Lonmin again contacted Mr Mathunjwa
 12 to inform him about a march taking place on that day. Mr
 13 Mathunjwa repeated his request for a meeting, in writing
 14 this time, and in that letter to Lonmin, he called upon Mr
 15 Mokoena to call a meeting of all Unions to attempt to
 16 resolve the dispute between rock drill operators and
 17 Lonmin. Lonmin did not call a meeting in response to this
 18 request. Between July and 10 August 2012, AMCU is aware
 19 that rock drill operators from the NUM and AMCU, had met on
 20 a few occasions. They met without any participation by any
 21 union and they met to debate their demand and to decide
 22 what to do about it. On 10 August 2012, the rock drill
 23 operators marched to Lonmin offices. They wanted to
 24 communicate to Lonmin management their demand for an
 25 increase of R12 500 a month, and they wanted management to

Page 170

1 engage with them over their demand. Lonmin refused to
 2 speak to the rock drill operators about their demand. The
 3 Lonmin management advised the rock drill operators to
 4 approach the NUM about their demand.
 5 On 11 August 2012 rock drill operators marched to
 6 the NUM offices. As on 10 August 2012, they were unarmed.
 7 As on 10 August 2012 the march proceeded peacefully. That
 8 is until marchers got to about 500 metres from the NUM
 9 offices and that is when official of the NUM shot and
 10 killed two rock drill operators who participated in the
 11 March. As a result of the conduct of the NUM officials the
 12 rock drill operators decided to arm themselves in self-
 13 defence and to gather at the big koppie at Wonderkop where
 14 they thought they felt safe. That is where they gathered
 15 daily between 11 and 16 August 2012. They gathered in the
 16 morning, and left for their homes at night. On 12 August
 17 2012 the strikers at the koppie decided to march to the
 18 offices of the NUM to put their demand to the NUM and to
 19 complain about the shooting of their colleagues on the
 20 previous day.
 21 Again, roughly about 500 metres from the NUM
 22 offices they were prevented by Lonmin Security from
 23 proceeding any further. The marchers resisted the attempt
 24 by Lonmin Security to prevent them from marching to the NUM
 25 offices. Lonmin Security shot and killed two of the rock

Page 171

1 drill operators who participated in that march. There was
 2 a scuffle between marchers and Lonmin Security. As a
 3 result, two Security officers were killed.
 4 On 13 August 2012, an AMCU delegation met with
 5 strikers at the koppie. The delegation was asked by the
 6 strikers to ask Lonmin management to come to the koppie to
 7 engage with them about their demand for a wage increase.
 8 The delegation met with Lonmin management later, and
 9 conveyed the demand of the strikers to management.
 10 Management's response was that they would only speak to the
 11 strikers after they returned to work. The delegation
 12 returned to the koppie, where they communicated the
 13 response of the Lonmin management to the strikers. The
 14 strikers responded by informing the Lonmin – by informing
 15 the delegation, that is the AMCU delegation, that they
 16 would stay at the koppie until management came to the
 17 koppie to talk to them and engage with them there about
 18 their demand. During the course of 13 August 2012, a
 19 contingent of strikers marched from the koppie to Lonmin.
 20 When they got to the Lonmin offices, they were asked by
 21 management to take a back route on their way back to the
 22 koppie. On their way along that route, the contingent was
 23 stopped by South African Police Service officers. The SAPS
 24 shot and killed two participants in that contingent.
 25 During that encounter two police officers were killed.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 172</p> <p>1 On 14 August 2012 the strikers at the koppie, 2 asked the SAPS to ask Lonmin management to come to the 3 koppie to address them and talk to them there about their 4 demand. 5 On 15 August Mr Mathunjwa met with Lonmin 6 management, the SAPS and the NUM. At that meeting, Lonmin 7 agreed to engage with the strikers, if they renounced 8 violence and returned to work. Mr Mathunjwa went to the 9 koppie where he addressed the strikers and conveyed 10 management's offer to them. The strikers received Mr 11 Mathunjwa, but said to him that it was late, in other 12 words, it was late in the day. They wanted to continue 13 discussing this matter with Mr Mathunjwa at 9 on the 14 following morning. Mr Mathunjwa then contacted Lonmin 15 management and the SAPS. He reported that the strikers 16 were receptive to the offer by Lonmin. 17 A Mr Kgotla of Lonmin undertook to meet with Mr 18 Mathunjwa at 8 o'clock on the follow morning to talk about 19 how to induct returning strikers. The overwhelming 20 majority of the strikers left the koppie for their homes on 21 the night of 15 August 2012. On the morning of 16 August 22 2012, Mr Mathunjwa met with Mr Kwadi. Mr Kwadi is from 23 Lonmin. Mr Mathunjwa informed him about the undertaking 24 given by Mr Kgotla on the previous evening. Mr Kwadi did 25 not seem to know about this. He undertook to consult with</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 174</p> <p>1 and to ask to come to the koppie to listen to their demand 2 for a wage increase, and to talk to them about their 3 demand. Mr Mathunjwa left the koppie and tried to contact 4 Lonmin management and the SAPS. He asked to see a General 5 Mpenbe whom he believed to be in charged of the operation 6 at the koppie. General Mpenbe refused to talk to him 7 because he said that the Provincial Commissioner was now in 8 charge of that operation. Mr Mathunjwa asked to speak to 9 the Provincial Commissioner. He was informed that she was 10 unavailable. She was apparently at an ANC torch bearing 11 ceremony. Mr Mathunjwa tried to get hold of Mr Kwadi of 12 Lonmin. Mr Kwadi said that Lonmin management was not 13 prepared to meet with him, and that he should inform the 14 SAPS of the demand of the strikers to address them at the 15 koppie i.e. Mr Kwadi told Mr Mathunjwa to tell the SAPS of 16 the strikers' demand that Lonmin management talk to them at 17 the koppie. 18 Mr Mathunjwa was then got hold by telephone by a 19 Mr Seedat whom he believed to be a director of Lonmin to 20 ask him to assist to get management to talk to him or to 21 address the strikers. Mr Seedat undertook to see what he 22 could do. He never got back to Mr Mathunjwa. Mr Mathunjwa 23 tried again to contact the SAPS, to get their co-operation 24 in resolving the conflict between Lonmin and the strikers. 25 That attempt was unsuccessful.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 173</p> <p>1 his principals and to get back to Mr Mathunjwa. Later that 2 morning, Mr Kwadi informed Mr Mathunjwa that Lonmin refused 3 to engage with the strikers after they returned to work. 4 Mr Mathunjwa understood that to mean that Lonmin was 5 withdrawing its offer that it had made on the previous day. 6 That was the offer to talk to or engage with strikers if 7 they renounced violence and returned to work. Still later 8 that morning, Mr Mathunjwa spoke to the Provincial 9 Commissioner of Police over a mobile phone. The Provincial 10 Commissioner used the opportunity to scold Mr Mathunjwa 11 about why he was not a koppie. Mr Mathunjwa returned to 12 the koppie. This was the first time that he went to the 13 koppie on 16 August. Before doing so, he met with three 14 generals of the SAPS at its base outside the koppie. They 15 included the Provincial Commissioner. Mr Mathunjwa 16 informed them of what he was about to do, and then told 17 them about the withdrawal of the offer by Lonmin. The 18 Provincial Commissioner said, that was not her problem. 19 Mr Mathunjwa then went to the koppie. The SAPS 20 refused to supply a vehicle or any assistance to Mr 21 Mathunjwa to get there. He went to the koppie on his own 22 steam. He informed strikers at the koppie of the fact that 23 Lonmin had withdrawn its offer made on the previous day. 24 He asked them to leave the koppie and to return to work. 25 The strikers again asked Mr Mathunjwa to go back to Lonmin</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 175</p> <p>1 Having been deserted by Lonmin and the SAPS, Mr 2 Mathunjwa returned to the koppie for a second time on that 3 fateful day, on Thursday, 16 August 2012. He informed the 4 strikers that no one from Lonmin was prepared to talk to 5 him about the strikers' request or to accede to the request 6 to come to the koppie to engage with them about their 7 demand. He pleaded with the strikers to leave the koppie. 8 They informed him that they would stay and that they were 9 happy for him to leave. He left. 10 Not long after he had left the koppie, the SAPS 11 shot and killed strikers at the big koppie and later at the 12 small Koppie. Mr Mathunjwa and his team did not witness 13 the shooting. 14 [14:41] By 16 August 2012 neither Lonmin nor the SAPS had 15 communicated to the strikers on the koppie or indeed AMCU 16 or the NUM a written or oral time-based ultimatum to leave 17 the koppie on the pain of clearly defined consequences. 18 The strike did not end on 16 August. It continued until it 19 was finally settled when the rock drill operators and their 20 unions agreed to an increase. But not before Lonmin again 21 unsuccessfully negotiated with the strikers directly, 22 unilaterally and outside of the collective bargaining 23 structures. AMCU does not deal in great detail in this 24 opening address for the conduct of the SAPS on 16 August 25 2012. That is left for others this afternoon. But</p>

Page 176

1 according to AMCU's members, on that day, the SAPS
 2 surrounded them after they gathered on the koppie during
 3 the morning of 16 August. Many tried to leave when they
 4 saw the barbed wire being spanned to cage them in at the
 5 koppie. One group of strikers tried to get out at a gap in
 6 the barbed wire so that they could flee to the nearby
 7 informal settlement. When the SAPS closed the gap with
 8 barbed wire that group ran around a clump of shrubs to get
 9 around the barbed wire. When they emerged around the clump
 10 that group was mowed down by automatic gunfire by the TRT.
 11 At this stage it would be premature for AMCU to make
 12 recommendations about who was responsible for the events
 13 between 9 to 16 August 2012. That will be done after
 14 evidence has been led and witnesses have been subjected to
 15 cross-examination.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bruinders.
 17 The next party I'll call on is the Legal Resources Centre,
 18 Mr Bizos.

19 MR BIZOS SC: We have submitted a report.
 20 I'm not going to read out the whole of it. I would refer
 21 to page 1 which is really a matter of a formal nature and
 22 doesn't have any bearing. In paragraph 2 on page 2 we say
 23 that the LCR is a human rights organisation which promotes
 24 constitutionalism and the rule of law and in particular the
 25 interests of poor and marginalised communities. I want to

Page 177

1 pause here for a moment –

2 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, I think you
 3 should give the interpreter –

4 MR BIZOS SC: I want to, not to read out
 5 but to make a submission, that we in the Legal Resources
 6 Centre consider all the rights in the Constitution and in
 7 the Bill of Rights as sacrosanct. None is more sacrosanct
 8 than the right to life. I make this submission because I
 9 think that the Commission must not be drawn in, in the pre-
 10 , rather the 17th August where unfortunately ten people, or
 11 it may be 12 I'm not sure, have lost their lives. I would
 12 submit that listening to that evidence, the violence by
 13 supporters of one trade union or another, the intervention
 14 of the police with two casualties, appeared in my
 15 submission, as acts of revenge. Our constitution, our
 16 legislation, our common law does not sanction murder as an
 17 act of revenge. We are concerned that in one of the
 18 statements made by a police officer, he comes very near to
 19 saying that he shot to kill because two of his colleagues
 20 had been killed before by the striking miners. That is an
 21 excuse for the use of lethal force and acts of revenge. We
 22 wish to place on record that acts of revenge do not solve
 23 problems of workers, employers, the police, the people of
 24 the country as a whole.

25 We have carefully listened to the submissions

Page 178

1 made by our learned friend, Mr Semenya. He has said that
 2 it was planned and it made a sort of half a concession that
 3 it may have been unlawful violence in respect of the
 4 koppie. But in general terms we again, having read the
 5 documents that have been made available to us up to now,
 6 that the force used, the lethal force is not sanctioned by
 7 any of our laws, by the Constitution, by our legislation.
 8 It is significant, Mr Chairman and Members of the
 9 Commission, we have read a lot of paper. I think that
 10 we've got something like 14 files from all the documents
 11 that have been submitted. Maybe we missed it, but we have
 12 not seen any evidence of a single policeman being
 13 scratched, never mind shot at on the 17th, or 16th, I beg
 14 your pardon. The police are entitled to use lethal force
 15 in order to defend their lives. On the evidence that we
 16 have so far read, this great life-threatening danger didn't
 17 lead to the harm, physical harm of any police officer. By
 18 way of contrast 34 lives were lost on the 16th. Where is
 19 the proportionality that the Constitution, the legislation
 20 and the standing orders provide for? Was it thrown
 21 overboard by the police that turn machine guns, R4s, R5s
 22 and R6s are machine guns, Mr Chairman. In asking, you
 23 recall that we asked for a lot of documents, and I want to
 24 thank my learned friends acting for the police, they have
 25 been very generous, they have given us a lot of documents.

Page 179

1 But we wanted to know their plan. We got a plan. What
 2 does it say? That they used as a model a plan which was
 3 put together as to how you deal with a hostage – yes. Now
 4 I ask rhetorically, who is this Mr Scott that put this plan
 5 together to use a method of dealing with hostage takers in
 6 a situation where there were 3000 people, some of whom were
 7 armed? But there is no suggestion that they shot only at
 8 the armed people. We don't know and we may not find out
 9 precisely how many of the people that were actually shot by
 10 this in terms of the Scott plan.

11 We are going to call expert evidence that what
 12 the police planned and what they did on the 16th is unheard
 13 of in practically the whole world, that where you have 3000
 14 people, some of whom are armed, and you turn R4s, R5s and
 15 R6s against them. We are going to ask for permission to
 16 cross-examine those that formulated this plan to explain
 17 themselves. We will refer the Commission, contrary to what
 18 our learned friend has said that there are no precedents in
 19 South Africa and this is unique. Unhappily that is not
 20 historically correct. There were similar situations where
 21 commissions such as yours pronounced upon the conduct of
 22 the police in the particular cases. They have invariably
 23 suggested restrain and a strict liability against those who
 24 are too readily using violent means to put the end of
 25 lives. We will refer you to those findings, precedent and

1 cases to the Constitutional Court, the Supreme Court of
2 Appeal, the Provincial Divisions of how police are expected
3 to behave. There is even a standing order that we will
4 refer you to in the police documents that says that what
5 the judges say must be strictly adhered to. Unhappily what
6 the judges have said – and we will refer you to the
7 passages don't square up with the conduct of the police on
8 the 16th.

9 On the contrary, it's not what the judges have
10 tried to prevent that they pay regard to. It may well be
11 that they may have been influenced by irrational statements
12 made by some persons in high authority, shoot to kill.
13 That's not part of our jurisprudence, that is not the way
14 in which a police force is to behave. We hope to have an
15 opportunity to present that case to you. I'm very bad at
16 reading documents, Mr Chairman. You've got the document, I
17 don't want to read it out, but I wanted to make what our
18 main submissions are going to be. And this is why we are
19 here. The moment we heard this, Mr Chairman, we actually
20 engaged forensic and other experts in order to show, how
21 are they going to explain that the vast majority of their
22 wounds were in the back? [Inaudible] back to be shot. I'm
23 sorry, I think one of the Commissioners wanted to ask a
24 question perhaps.

25 CHAIRPERSON: She wanted you to do what I

1 wanted you to do earlier and that is give the interpreter a
2 chance to interpret, because you see what you say is
3 important that the people here who don't understand English
4 should –

5 MR BIZOS SC: Oh, I beg your pardon. I
6 know him to have a very good memory for many years.

7 INTERPRETER: Thank you for the
8 compliment, Mr Bizos.

9 [15:01] MR BIZOS SC: My attention has been drawn
10 by my learned friend to paragraph 9 in particular that I
11 should possibly read out on page 4. We pose the question,
12 who took the decision to adopt the plan that led to the
13 deployment of armed police and the policies followed on the
14 16th of August. We don't know who is going to take
15 responsibility and we invite the evidence leaders to have
16 the necessary consultations as to who we have to listen to,
17 to say that I take responsibility for what happened. Who
18 took the decision to use live ammunition? Were the
19 preparatory steps and decision making of SAPS and other
20 policing units which led to the shooting and deaths of the
21 16th of August, consistent with the applicable legal and
22 policy requirements?

23 At the inspection in loco, Mr Chairman, you were
24 shown places far away from the original shooting where
25 people who were injured, were hundreds of metres away from

1 where the original danger was, they were wounded, they have
2 told their story. Were they chased and were they were shot
3 at whilst they were running away, did the police have
4 regard to the decided cases that even if you intend
5 arresting a person, you don't shoot in order to kill them
6 or to inflict grievous bodily harm. Who took the decision
7 that this wild chase in the veld in hundreds of metres,
8 could take place? These are the questions, Mr Chairman,
9 that, how is the fact that, how is it, was it good luck or
10 the divine will that in this war situation, which one of
11 the witnesses for the police describes, there managed to be
12 34 deaths and not a single even minor injury? We haven't
13 seen any. I don't know whether our learned friends have
14 seen any and we believe that the conduct of the South
15 African Police set out in 1.1 and 1.24 which the commission
16 has adopted as the first theme of its proceedings. We
17 will, we are ready, we are ready to call the senior
18 officers that have taken these decisions and I may say at,
19 even at this early stage that they claim that both the
20 Commissioner of Police and the Minister actually authorised
21 this plan. If that is so, it may with respect be necessary
22 for all the persons that were responsible for this to be
23 interrogated by our learned friends even across and –
24 [inaudible]. Thank you for the opportunity, Mr Chairman.

25 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bizos. Mr

1 Ntsebeza, you are appearing on behalf of the families of 21
2 of the striking miners killed on the 16th of August. Would
3 you care you make your opening, do you wish to make your
4 opening statement now?

5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr
6 Commissioner and members of the commission. It's been a
7 long day, Mr Commissioner and I don't intend to make it any
8 longer than it has been. Mr Commissioner, opening
9 addresses have been marked with civility which they should
10 be, given the nature of the occasion and where everybody
11 have expressed feelings of regret, that everything has
12 happened and that there is a need for a reconciliation. I
13 wouldn't like to be the one to spoil the party and I
14 promise you, Mr Chairman and members of the commission, I
15 will not. There is a job however to be done and my job is
16 to tell you, hopefully not in the length of time that I am
17 told in my research it took Christopher Clark QC who was
18 counsel for the bloody Sunday inquiry that I talked about
19 on the last occasion, in Northern Ireland who took three
20 months to deliver his 1.25 million word opening address. I
21 certainly will not go that far. And may I add, indeed we
22 were told that each opening address will be delivered in 15
23 minutes by each representative and I intend to do my best
24 to keep within that timeslot.

25 CHAIRPERSON: 15 minutes or less.

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 184</p> <p>1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Mr Chairman, if 2 I will I will try and be within that mark. Mr Chairman, it 3 is fair to say that as we see in our opening statement 4 which was sent to you, that the central task of the 5 commission as we see it at this stage is to determine the 6 facts and the circumstances that surround the killing of 34 7 people by the South African Police Service on the 16th of 8 August 2012. There doesn't seem to be much doubt or 9 contestation about the fact that those 34 on the 16th of 10 August 2012 were killed by the police. We represent, as 11 you said Mr Chairman, families of 21 of those who were 12 killed on the day, the names and further particulars of 13 whom have been provided to you, Sir. We have organised to 14 find out how best we can say this, but at the end of the 15 day we will invite the commission to make the finding that 16 those who were killed and whom we represent, the families 17 of whom we represent were unlawfully killed by the SAPS. 18 It is our understanding that the SAPS will 19 contend, and that much seemed to emanate from the long 20 address that we were given at the beginning of the SAPS 21 presentation, that it opened fire on our clients next of 22 kin out of necessity. 23 More particularly our understanding is that 1, 24 their contention is that certain strikers were shot while 25 they ran, armed with pangas and machetes in closed</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 186</p> <p>1 reports mean. A typical post mortem report at our, in our 2 possession has the following conclusions, a total of eight 3 shotgun pellets entered the body 16 to the right lower 4 back, 2, one to the left lower back, 3, one to the back of 5 the head. In summary all the fatal projectile wounds were 6 sustained from the back. It seems to us therefore, that if 7 this evidence is sustained which we show on our reading of 8 the documents and we are the first who will concede that we 9 probably are wrong in some ways, but if it is shown to be 10 so that no less than 14 of the striking miners were shot 11 from behind, mainly in the back or in the back of the head, 12 that kind of evidence which we would submit is unlikely to 13 be contradicted, would then be wholly inconsistent with the 14 claims of necessity that the SAPS will seek to advance. 15 In the event we submit, this commission must 16 consider whether in those kind of circumstances, it would 17 be competent for anyone, let alone a policeman to shoot 18 someone in the back and then plead rationally that it was 19 an act of self defence. We will submit that it is not so. 20 Now whatever the truth of that tragic day, Chairman and 21 Commissioners, it cannot be that the SAPS could not have 22 acted differently. It could and should have brought the 23 day and indeed the gathering to an end peacefully and 24 without loss of life. That will be our contention. Indeed 25 we will contend that every step in our reading of the</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 185</p> <p>1 formation towards SAPS at crime scene 1 with the apparent 2 intent to attack the officers who were stationed there. It 3 seems also to be the contention by the SAPS that other 4 miners were shot whilst they resisted arrest, allegedly 5 with firearms, at a small koppie at crime scene number 2. 6 More cynically, and this would not appear in my written 7 statement, it would appear that the claim is that the SAPS 8 killed the miners because the miners charged at them 9 despite the SAPS manifest superiority of firepower, because 10 the miners believed that they were invincible because of a 11 muti that they had taken. This seems to be the 12 justification for the killing of those whom we were told 13 charged at the SAPS in this belief. 14 For us, Mr Chairman and the commissioners, the 15 subtext of this profound justification for the SAPS killing 16 the miners is that the miners, according to them, acted 17 like possessed vermin, that they had to be destroyed like 18 vermin and that they were destroyed like vermin and this we 19 will submit cannot be the attitude of a police service in a 20 post-apartheid democratic South Africa. 21 Moreover, Mr Chairman, we will submit the police 22 version in our contention is contradicted by much of the 23 independent documentary evidence so far disclosed to the 24 commission, particularly post-mortem reports which is going 25 to be an area of contestation as to exactly what those</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 187</p> <p>1 evidence, that the SAPS took leading up to and including 2 the 16th of August not only made the workers' deaths 3 foreseeable, in the end it made those deaths the most 4 likely result. 5 [15:21] We are the first to accept that in an orderly 6 society it is the duty of law enforcement agencies, as my 7 learned friend submitted, to disarm people who are armed, 8 dangerous in a decent society, that it is the task of the 9 South African Police Service to disperse people who are 10 gathered unlawfully in circumstances which bring discomfort 11 to others who have the right to that same area and space to 12 go on with their legitimates lives. But this, we will show 13 that whilst disarming and dispersing the miners may not 14 have been an illegitimate objective, something which we 15 accept. However, the manner and the timing of the SAPS 16 attempts to do so, inevitably invited injury and as it 17 sadly happened, death as well. 18 It appears that an attempt was made to negotiate 19 directly reasonably and meaningfully with the workers 20 gathered on the large koppie, known colloquially as the 21 mountain. Instead the commanders on the scene, which seems 22 to be admitted sent in National Union of Mineworkers and 23 Association of Mine Workers and Construction Union 24 officials to discuss their labour demands with the striking 25 workers. SAPS officers on the scene must have known by</p>

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 188</p> <p>1 that time that the workers were not under the immediate 2 control of either NUM or AMCU and therefore to rely 3 exclusively on NUM or AMCU to negotiate with the miners was 4 wholly inappropriate. At that stage, we will submit the 5 situation was a public order issue and not a labour issue, 6 at that stage, and should have been treated in a manner 7 consistent with recognised best practice in public order 8 situations. Sadly, it was not treated in that way.</p> <p>9 It appears, Chairman and Commissioner members, 10 that immediately prior to the killings, and this account 11 appears very clearly from the account given by Tim 12 Bruinders SC, it does appear that no direct order to 13 disperse was issued by SAPS to the striking miners, failing 14 which the Police would move in, disarm them and arrest 15 them, nor was there any ultimatum issued which required the 16 miners to lay down their weapons nor were the miners given 17 any opportunity to comply with any such order. In fact, 18 after what it describes as a show of force, which could 19 only have heightened tensions at the scene, the SAPS sought 20 to encircle and then kept the workers, a barbed wire fence 21 was placed around the mountain, blocking the miners' most 22 likely dispersal route, too the Inkameng Informal 23 Settlement, and it was this event, and this event alone, we 24 will submit, which precipitated the movement of the 25 strikers off the mountain. They had no choice but to move</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 190</p> <p>1 national and international instruments dealing with public 2 order, police and crowd control and we shall invite the 3 Commission to find that the SAPS conduct on 16 August fell 4 far short of these standards and in many ways blatantly 5 violated those standards. We will also ask you for leave 6 to introduce expert evidence relating to the miners' fatal 7 injuries and to the inappropriateness of the SAPS's 8 approach to the gathering on the mountain, because in the 9 end, our submission will be that the timing, the manner of 10 SAPS's response to the gathering on the mountain was or 11 were 1, aggressive, 2, misguided, 3, disproportionate, 4, 12 unreasonable, and 5, unlawful.</p> <p>13 Mr Chairman, and honourable members of the 14 Commission, I heard my learned friend and my most respected 15 leader of Lonmin saying that this is not a time to 16 apportion blame or point fingers, I think that's how he put 17 it. But please allow me to say that it is our contention 18 that whilst the primary responsibility lies with SAPS 19 insofar as it is agreed that they are the ones who were 20 responsible for the deaths on that day, we believe Lonmin 21 must also share the blame for the following reasons, 22 firstly, if response to the rock drill operators called 23 RDOs at the centre of the strike, ranged from feckless to 24 the imperious, finally Lonmin abrogated all responsibility 25 to the National Government.</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 189</p> <p>1 in numbers towards the police space and they were given 2 nowhere else to go.</p> <p>3 In these circumstances, we submit death and 4 injury were depressingly predictable but less predictable 5 was the fact that many of these miners would be shot, as we 6 have claimed in the back and in the back of the head 7 apparently while trying to escape. We will contend that 8 the use of automatic weapons was in itself astonishing, 9 especially in the absence of any indication that the miners 10 possessed more than three firearms and in the absence of 11 any suggestion that they had threatened to use them.</p> <p>12 Honourable Commission, it will be your unenviable 13 task to take into account the chilling allegations that are 14 made in documents and statements made to the independent 15 police investigative directorate, which contain accounts of 16 injured miners being shot dead by the Police whilst they 17 lay prostrate on the ground, in the immediate aftermath of 18 the first volley of Police fire. It is a matter for 19 comment that these harrowing accounts of what can only be 20 described as extrajudicial execution are more consistent 21 with the injuries disclosed in the post-mortem reports than 22 the explanations so far advanced by the Police. They 23 certainly do call for an answer, which we hope you will be 24 able to find. We will, with your leave, Mr Chairman, and 25 your Commissioners, seek to introduce and rely upon</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 191</p> <p>1 Prior to June 2012, Lonmin's response to the 2 RDO's apparently well-founded complaints of 3 disproportionately low pay was to hold them to a collective 4 agreement negotiated with the NUM. Lonmin insisted on 5 engaging with the RDOs within the existing collective 6 bargaining structures, which is laudable. In June and July 7 2012 however, Lonmin changed tack and openly engaged with 8 the RDOs outside Union structures, as we all know now on 3rd 9 of August it offered the RDOs a modest increase in some of 10 their allowances. When the RDOs rejected this offer, 11 Lonmin accused them of acting outside Union structures and 12 refused to engage with them, remarkably self serving, 13 inasmuch as Lonmin had negotiated with the RDOs outside 14 existing Union structures and then had dumped them when 15 they did not accept this offer.</p> <p>16 It seems fairly established, as some commentators 17 before me have indicated, that the evidence would show 18 fairly overwhelmingly that all the striking RDOs said they 19 wanted as a precondition to dispersal from the mountain was 20 a meeting with Lonmin's management to discuss their 21 grievances, and we shall, if necessary, lead evidence that 22 the miners repeatedly assured their families that all they 23 were waiting for was for Lonmin to arrange a meeting with 24 the strike committee. Lonmin consistently refused such a 25 meeting as Adv Bruinders said very clearly step by step,</p>

Page 192

1 even when it became obviously that substantial violence
 2 might ensue if that meeting didn't take place. We submit
 3 and we will show in evidence, that instead it instigated
 4 and escalated an excessive security response. It's letters
 5 to the Minister of Minerals and Energy are appalling. In
 6 one of them for example, dated the 13th of August 2010, when
 7 Chief Commercial Officer, called for the State, and I
 8 quote, "to bring its might to bear using resources at its
 9 disposal to resolutely bring the situation under control."
 10 Subsequent events give that letter an inflection that is as
 11 sinister as it is tragic.

12 Whether or not a meeting with Lonmin would have
 13 averted the deaths of the 16th of August, we may never know,
 14 but Lonmin's failure to consider meeting with the
 15 representatives of the striking workers –

16 [15:41] CHAIRPERSON: The interpreter has asked
 17 us to adjourn for a few minutes, they want to get – yes, he
 18 said for a few minutes. No, we don't have to adjourn then,
 19 just another interpreter who's going to take over for a few
 20 minutes. Yes, please proceed, Mr Ntsebeza, we've now got a
 21 new interpreter.

22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, thank you very
 23 much, Mr Chair. I was in paragraph 27 of my written
 24 submissions. Mr Chairman and honourable commissioners, we
 25 submit that whether or not the meeting with Lonmin would

Page 193

1 have averted the deaths of the 16th of August, that's now a
 2 matter of conjecture, but what we do say is that Lonmin's
 3 failure to consider meeting with representatives of the
 4 striking workers, was a tragically lost opportunity in the
 5 days leading up to the massacre. We contend that Lonmin
 6 was patently more interested in crushing the strike than in
 7 understanding its causes. There's another changing of the
 8 guard, I notice.

9 CHAIRPERSON: Thanks.

10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Chairman and
 11 commissioners, we are strongly making the submission we
 12 have just made, because after the massacre, Lonmin did
 13 agree to negotiate with the community of representatives
 14 elected from among the striking workers on the mountain.
 15 The representatives travelled to Rustenburg, where they
 16 negotiated with Lonmin management and ultimately agreed the
 17 wage increase that ended the strike.

18 What ultimately I'm going to show is that a
 19 revolution was always possible provided that Lonmin was
 20 willing to engage consistently and fairly with workers, and
 21 it is tragically most unfortunate that it had to take the
 22 terrible events of the 16th of August for that to be pressed
 23 home to Lonmin.

24 We will respectfully seek your permission, Mr
 25 Chairman and Commissioners, to introduce evidence from an

Page 194

1 expert on socio-economic circumstances underlying the
 2 mining industry. His name is Mr Gavin Hartford, and this
 3 we'll do in an attempt to show the root causes of the
 4 strike as the expert sees it.

5 The expert will say, amongst others, that at the
 6 heart of the Marikana strike lies a economic and social
 7 crisis in the mining communities. That at the root of the
 8 crisis is the migrant labour system, which can be traced to
 9 the 1880's and which sustained the economic base of the
 10 apartheid regime and has remained substantially unreformed
 11 in the 18 years since the advent of a democratic South
 12 Africa. On a lighter note, talking about the olden days,
 13 somebody pointed to me the colour code of the flag behind
 14 yourselves, which strongly reminds oneself of the Vier
 15 kleur, which was the Republic of South Africa's flag, as it
 16 then was. So I think this is the appropriate time to draw
 17 contrast that it does appear that the more things change
 18 however they still remain the same.

19 But on a more serious note, coming back to the
 20 topic, I felt I could resist that one, because this year
 21 that migrant labour system has remained substantially
 22 unreformed in the 18 years since the advent of democracy,
 23 and we point out that all our clients are sustained by
 24 migrant labour, and that some of the other miners killed on
 25 16 August, are migrant labourers from Lesotho and

Page 195

1 Swaziland, exactly as it was pre-1994.

2 It is therefore to say, if you allow us to call
 3 him, Mr Chair and Commissioners, that the specific
 4 migratory and housing conditions of migrants have led to a
 5 double economic burden of sustaining households, both in
 6 the rural family settings and homesteads, and immediately
 7 adjacent to the mines. That collective bargaining
 8 processes and institutions have failed dismally to address
 9 the causes of discontent in mine labouring communities, and
 10 that mine company management is complicit in this failure.

11 He will say that solving the underlying causes of
 12 labour unrest at Marikana, require radical reaping of the
 13 future of migrant labour of the collective bargaining
 14 system and of manager-employee relations at the mine level.
 15 And he will say that there is an urgent need to promote
 16 greater freedom of association at the mines, like Lonmin,
 17 as the first step towards restoring the legitimacy of the
 18 collective bargaining system.

19 What he will say is that what happened on the 16th
 20 of August was not the unfortunate result of a dispute
 21 between two labour unions. Indeed attempts by some to
 22 reduce the massacre to failings within the NUM or AMCU, are
 23 either unfortunately misguided or mischievous or both,
 24 because the evidence is that neither union had much control
 25 over the striking workers or the committee that represented

Page 196

1 them. NUM and AMCU members were shot in more of less equal
 2 measure.
 3 Through that evidence, and afterwards, we would
 4 hope to submit to you, Commissioners, that the massacre was
 5 the grimly predictable result of the deeply entrenched
 6 poverty in which migrant labourers are held. An
 7 undemocratic workplace, the winner take all kind of
 8 structure of our unions and our 50 plus one, absolutely
 9 undemocratic, Broken collective bargaining procedures and
 10 institutions, high-handed mine management and a militarised
 11 - unfortunately, apparently from these events, trigger-
 12 happy police force. It would be unfortunate indeed and
 13 would tragically obscure the truth our clients seek, where
 14 either the NUM or AMCU to be made to take responsibility
 15 for far-reaching structural and policy failings which
 16 throws South Africa's social and economic crisis into sharp
 17 review.
 18 Chairman, Commissioners, let me first say in
 19 making my final remarks about what is in paragraph 35 of my
 20 statement, that let me first thank the efforts that have
 21 been made to get the families of the deceased to this
 22 gathering. I have met them, Mr Chairman, and every single
 23 one of them has indicated that they wanted to be here, they
 24 want to be here, because they believe the Commission is
 25 geared to establish, if not for them, but for everybody who

Page 197

1 cares to watch the proceedings of this Commission, an
 2 indication, if not the entire truth, of what happened. For
 3 them, even the fact that they are grieving does not
 4 subtract from their desire to want to know, and for them,
 5 if the facts are such that they are uncomfortable for them
 6 to know, then they want an entitlement to be here to hear
 7 it for themselves, as you try the difficult task of putting
 8 before all of us and those who are here, the facts, and you
 9 as Commission directing the manner in which we should
 10 conduct ourselves in an endeavour to unlock the truth, and
 11 hopefully to engender that spirit of reconciliation that
 12 was talked about at the beginning of these proceedings.
 13 However we must first get at the truth. The
 14 efforts that has been made over the last 14 days, are
 15 applauded, but they have not gone far enough, and it is my
 16 opportunity to state, in the spirit of seeking to get it
 17 done correctly all the time, what has not happened, which
 18 should have happened.
 19 By and large, members of the family are here.
 20 Most of them coming from the Eastern Cape, but there are
 21 two examples which I need to put before you, Sir, and
 22 members of the Commission Zameka Mungu who is a relative of
 23 the deceased, Jackson Lehura from Lang Fletcher, for a
 24 reason which I suppose the Commission will investigate, has
 25 had to pay her way to be here.

Page 198

1 [16:01] And it appears that it is because she either was
 2 not contactable or she was not contacted. And to smoothen
 3 this, we would request whoever is making these arrangements
 4 to liaise with my attorneys all the time, because my
 5 attorneys are in constant contact with the people whom we
 6 represent. So that is where we are at. Secondly –
 7 CHAIRPERSON: May I interrupt you Sir?
 8 That's a fair request and we will see to it that it's
 9 complied with.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr
 11 Commissioner. Further, once again I would like the members
 12 of the Commission responsible for making these arrangements
 13 to liaise with my attorneys and establish what the glitches
 14 were for Gumuza, on behalf Yona family, and Ngweyi, N-G-W-
 15 E-Y-I, Gumuza, G-U-M-U-Z-A, Yona is Y-O-N-A. Ngweyi, on
 16 behalf of Michael Ngweyi, why or what the glitches were
 17 that nobody came to pick Mrs Ngweyi on behalf of Michael
 18 Ngweyi, even though arrangements had been made that she
 19 would be picked up.
 20 I am told by my learned friend that there is
 21 Qwelane, Q_W_E – oh Gwelani, G-W-E-L-A-N-I, from
 22 Lusikisiki, who apparently also would want to be here
 23 because one of the people close to him, is one of those who
 24 died. It is work-in-progress. It's something that can be
 25 dealt with, and I'm merely placing it on record.

Page 199

1 The one grievance that clearly is weighing
 2 heavily with the families, is the fact that it is only one
 3 family, or one person per family, who can be assisted to be
 4 here. We had made a request that the state or the
 5 Department of Social Development to take it out the
 6 parameters of controversy, the Department of Social
 7 Development should make available assistance for at least
 8 two persons per family.
 9 There are practical reasons for this, and may I
 10 just indicate that the tradition is that widows do not
 11 travel, or travel with the same kind of freedom that we, in
 12 our nuclear families have, even if there's been a death
 13 that has befallen the family. There usually is a
 14 requirement, traditional or other, you may think about
 15 that, and there'll be a debate about whether this is so,
 16 but the fact of the matter is that there are circumstances
 17 like those where, at least if the widow is going to be
 18 travelling somebody must assist her.
 19 Now, this requirement that one person per family
 20 must travel, has led to an untenable situation where,
 21 because of patriarchy, that decision being left with the
 22 families, men has selected men and they have left grieving
 23 widows at home, and yet it can't be otherwise. And without
 24 being childish about it, Mr Chairman and honourable members
 25 of the Commission, it does not sit well for a plea to be

Page 200

1 made that the resources are not limitless.

2 I certainly appreciate that I'm a taxpayer and I

3 would like to make sure that my tax money goes to

4 appropriate causes, but there are horses for courses, and I

5 want to say and make this submission as a plea, and make it

6 as politely as I can, it does not sit well with us that

7 families must be told that there are no funds, and there

8 may well be no funds, when, as I say in the submission,

9 there does not seem to be any the amount of – there does

10 not seem to any amount of restraint in the employment of

11 legal representatives on behalf of the state, and I can

12 then imagine, from the volume of the work, that this is

13 justified. I can understand that, and I'm not making this

14 thing facetiously, the submission, but to be told that

15 because we don't want to misuse your taxpayer's money by

16 allowing a minimum of two per family to attend these

17 proceedings, it is just disproportionate on a scale of

18 things. This is an occasion where we, as a country, must

19 redeem ourselves. It will be of no use, in our humble and

20 respectful submission if the families get out of this

21 entire exercise, which was set up for an objective, that

22 they get away from it feeling that they did not get an

23 equal opportunity to be part and parcel of it.

24 I know the argument has been made that it is not

25 even compulsory for the state or the government to make the

Page 202

1 worker is killed, is for the job that has been left vacant

2 to be offered to a family member. So she's now preparing

3 to leave her five children. Tsepiso, 17 years. Nowili, 13

4 years. Sizwe, 12 years. Xolile, 9 years. Noxolo, 3

5 years. She will leave those children to come to work at

6 Lonmin in terms of that tradition. Those children, in a

7 way that they mean to sharp relief an intersection between

8 the [inaudible] system and the rights-based society where

9 socio-economic rights are an ideal that is striven for.

10 Those children have lost their father to the police,

11 insofar as it is un-refuted that his father was killed by

12 the police, and they are now leaving their mother to the

13 migrant labour system. They now require a searching

14 examination from this commission and a full explanation of

15 the circumstances which press on them. The sad prospect of

16 a parentless childhood, things that you and I take for

17 granted. This society must promise us a better society

18 than the previous one. Your wisdom, the three of you, will

19 be sought in the search for an answer to those conundrums.

20 Thank you, Mr Chair, thank you, Commissioner.

21 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Ntsebeza,

22 we'll carry on tomorrow with the opening addresses. We

23 will adjourn now for the reasons I explained earlier until

24 9 o'clock tomorrow morning.

25 [INQUIRY ADJOURNED]

Page 201

1 provisions that it has made, for which we are thankful.

2 For instance, Mr Chairman, before I step down, it is none

3 to clear what is really happening to the families today.

4 After today, they will be here. They know that we are not

5 sitting from Wednesday. The question is whether that they

6 are going to be here between Wednesday and Monday when we

7 resume, or whether they will go back and then be brought

8 up. It is even none to clear what is meant by saying

9 families will be here as and when they are needed.

10 I just want to put this before you, Mr Chairman

11 and members of the Commission, because it is your

12 commission, and whenever you are advised of what is or is

13 not happening, it is important that you have had the

14 benefit of our submissions. We really would like this

15 matter of the families to be looked at. We need some

16 certainty. How long are they going to be here? Are there

17 arrangements in place that are going to be made? And my

18 attorneys, I offer, will always be there to liaise whoever

19 is in the commission to facilitate the bringing of the

20 families.

21 As I end, Mr Chairman, I bring the attention,

22 your attention, to a statement which tells the story of

23 Zameka Mungu, Z-A-M-E-K-A, M-U-N-G-U. She lost her husband

24 on the 16th of August. The events we will be focussing in

25 the next while. She feels that the custom at Lonmin when a

<p>A</p> <p>abated 152:22</p> <p>abbreviate 151:25 155:16</p> <p>ability 117:16 121:16 126:14 150:12</p> <p>able 113:8,23 116:21 136:11 149:5 189:24</p> <p>abnormal 121:19</p> <p>abreast 116:5</p> <p>abrogated 190:24</p> <p>absence 140:18 189:9 189:10</p> <p>absolutely 196:8</p> <p>accede 175:5</p> <p>acceded 158:2</p> <p>accept 137:19 187:5,15 191:15</p> <p>accepting 146:2</p> <p>accepts 147:6</p> <p>access 113:21 166:18</p> <p>accompanied 148:17 150:9</p> <p>accord 165:11</p> <p>account 117:17 118:10 118:15 137:15,23 138:3 188:10,11 189:13</p> <p>accountable 121:25</p> <p>accounts 189:15,19</p> <p>accreditation 162:22 163:6,11 166:16,21 167:1</p> <p>accumulating 124:12</p> <p>accused 191:11</p> <p>achieve 124:22</p> <p>achieved 141:23 142:7</p> <p>acknowledge 132:16</p> <p>acknowledged 130:4</p> <p>act 121:11 136:25 137:1 159:12 177:17 186:19</p> <p>acted 127:20 185:16 186:22</p> <p>acting 149:23 178:24 191:11</p> <p>action 121:24 141:22 146:3 156:18 160:3 161:7</p> <p>actions 121:17 125:10 148:17 161:9</p> <p>actively 128:3 156:19</p> <p>activity 160:8</p> <p>acts 160:4 164:22 177:15,21,22</p> <p>add 183:21</p> <p>addendum 165:12</p> <p>addition 121:7 157:25 161:15</p> <p>additional 145:15 157:21 161:17,21,22</p> <p>address 123:18,20 129:24 130:10,13 136:16 140:22 141:13 145:16 148:12 149:9</p>	<p>155:14 167:8 172:3 174:14,21 175:24 183:20,22 184:20 195:8</p> <p>addressed 122:16 149:24 154:20 172:9</p> <p>addresses 183:9 202:22</p> <p>addressing 150:23</p> <p>adequate 128:25</p> <p>adequately 158:18 165:25</p> <p>adhered 130:12 180:5</p> <p>adjacent 195:7</p> <p>adjourn 133:3 162:14 166:23 192:17,18 202:23</p> <p>adjourned 135:10,13 202:25</p> <p>adjourning 135:10</p> <p>adjournment 132:13 132:14 135:5 162:10 162:25 163:8,9</p> <p>ADJOURNS 133:4 162:16</p> <p>admitted 187:22</p> <p>adopt 181:12</p> <p>adopted 150:6 156:13 182:16</p> <p>Adv 191:25</p> <p>advance 152:12 186:14</p> <p>advanced 153:8 189:22</p> <p>advancing 132:2</p> <p>advent 194:11,22</p> <p>advisable 166:5</p> <p>advised 170:3 201:12</p> <p>Advocate 112:19,20 116:11</p> <p>affordability 142:11</p> <p>Africa 120:13 121:5 159:11 179:19 185:20 194:12</p> <p>African 117:6,10 118:9 120:12,19,25 121:3 122:19 123:12 125:3 125:6,17 126:24 127:6 128:1 134:1,3 134:10 146:23 148:14 148:19,24 149:15,22 150:3,9 162:12 164:2 171:23 182:15 184:7 187:9</p> <p>Africans 120:15 122:6</p> <p>Africa's 159:18 160:13 194:15 196:16</p> <p>aftermath 125:22 189:17</p> <p>afternoon 129:6 162:17 162:24 163:18 166:24 175:25</p> <p>agencies 164:21 187:6</p> <p>agency 122:23</p> <p>agent 161:20</p> <p>aggression 148:16</p> <p>aggressive 190:11</p> <p>aggrieved 157:23</p> <p>agree 146:11 193:13</p>	<p>agreed 157:16 161:10 163:15 172:7 175:20 190:19 193:16</p> <p>agreement 124:1 126:3 145:24 157:18,20 158:1 159:25 161:16 161:25 165:13 191:4</p> <p>agreements 161:5,11</p> <p>ahead 121:22</p> <p>air-conditioning 163:12,17,18</p> <p>albeit 145:23</p> <p>alien 120:8</p> <p>allegations 189:13</p> <p>allegedly 185:4</p> <p>allow 163:15 190:17 195:2</p> <p>allowance 168:15</p> <p>allowances 141:20 161:18,21,22 191:10</p> <p>allowed 162:20</p> <p>allowing 200:16</p> <p>alongside 122:1 127:21</p> <p>AMCU 115:4,6 122:20 123:18 130:8,13,17 142:23,25 144:14 148:25 149:23 160:24 167:4,15,18,23 168:3 168:7,13,18,24,25 169:1,18,19 171:4,15 175:15,23 176:11 188:2,3 195:22 196:1 196:14</p> <p>AMCU's 176:1</p> <p>amendment 166:5,8</p> <p>ammunition 129:14 132:2 137:10 138:11 181:18</p> <p>amount 200:9,10</p> <p>ANC 174:10</p> <p>and/or 122:25 165:8</p> <p>announced 114:13</p> <p>answer 125:13 189:23 202:19</p> <p>ante 141:23</p> <p>anthropologist 144:7</p> <p>anticipate 121:16</p> <p>anti-NUM 156:13</p> <p>anxious 154:20</p> <p>apartheid 194:10</p> <p>apologise 134:1</p> <p>apologising 112:3</p> <p>appalling 192:5</p> <p>apparent 138:9 142:19 185:1</p> <p>apparently 135:6 162:23 163:19 174:10 189:7 191:2 196:11 198:22</p> <p>Appeal 180:2</p> <p>appear 112:18,20,21 114:11,20,25 115:6 115:11,19,24 116:17 153:21 185:6,7 188:12 194:17</p> <p>appeared 156:24 157:5</p>	<p>177:14</p> <p>appearing 183:1</p> <p>appears 118:10 168:8 168:20 187:18 188:9 188:11 198:1</p> <p>appertain 128:18</p> <p>applauded 197:15</p> <p>applicable 117:14 128:16 181:21</p> <p>application 113:18 163:11</p> <p>applied 113:16 133:24</p> <p>applies 119:25 163:20</p> <p>apply 113:17 114:1 128:21 166:17</p> <p>appointed 151:18</p> <p>appointment 151:25</p> <p>apportion 190:16</p> <p>opposite 145:18</p> <p>appreciate 200:2</p> <p>appreciation 123:5 136:11 158:25 165:7</p> <p>approach 121:15,23 134:3 141:17 150:6 160:7 161:5 170:4 190:8</p> <p>approached 139:9 161:12</p> <p>approaches 118:19</p> <p>appropriate 116:24 118:5 128:6 132:15 132:19 134:9 146:3 152:4,14 162:10 164:11 166:5 194:16 200:4</p> <p>Approval 168:16</p> <p>approving 168:15</p> <p>April 142:18</p> <p>area 112:7 144:8 149:3 149:13 152:23 155:6 157:12 158:15 185:25 187:11</p> <p>argue 141:17 142:8 143:6</p> <p>argued 143:18 144:3</p> <p>argument 141:19,24 142:19 143:9 200:24</p> <p>arises 134:18 143:4</p> <p>arising 151:19</p> <p>arm 170:12</p> <p>armed 129:1 131:4,15 138:17 139:3,20 140:4,7,8,12 145:10 145:21,25 179:7,8,14 181:13 184:25 187:7</p> <p>arming 136:24</p> <p>arms 143:24 145:9</p> <p>arrange 163:4,5 191:23</p> <p>arrangements 198:3,12 198:18 201:17</p> <p>arranging 135:21</p> <p>arrest 124:25 136:22 139:9 185:4 188:14</p> <p>arrested 115:25</p> <p>arresting 182:5</p> <p>arrests 131:2 139:1</p>	<p>151:22</p> <p>arrival 150:9 157:2</p> <p>arrive 136:11</p> <p>arrived 132:15 169:7 171:5,20 172:2 173:24,25 174:4,8 178:23 192:16</p> <p>asking 178:22</p> <p>aspect 164:9</p> <p>aspects 138:8 152:8</p> <p>aspire 128:5</p> <p>assassinated 143:3</p> <p>assault 139:13</p> <p>assembly 143:20</p> <p>asserted 143:22</p> <p>assessment 146:16</p> <p>assist 113:23 119:10 147:24 148:1 149:25 150:12,23 154:13 174:20 199:18</p> <p>assistance 150:17,21 153:7 173:20 199:7</p> <p>assistants 161:18</p> <p>assisted 114:21 116:12 156:20 199:3</p> <p>associate 156:5</p> <p>associated 156:19 159:5 162:3 165:12</p> <p>association 122:20 187:23 195:16</p> <p>assuaged 145:24</p> <p>assume 154:9</p> <p>assure 121:18</p> <p>assured 191:22</p> <p>astounding 189:8</p> <p>attach 139:17</p> <p>attack 185:2</p> <p>attacks 154:2 165:19</p> <p>attempt 131:19,20 169:15 170:23 174:25 187:18 194:3</p> <p>attempted 131:5 139:13</p> <p>attempting 144:16</p> <p>attempts 116:4 129:6 129:22 144:10 187:16 195:21</p> <p>attend 136:8 200:16</p> <p>attendance 132:25 136:12</p> <p>attended 153:12</p> <p>attention 132:14 135:4 154:18 164:9 181:9 201:21,22</p> <p>attitude 185:19</p> <p>attorneys 198:4,5,13 201:18</p> <p>atypical 148:16</p> <p>auditorium 135:22 162:20 166:16</p> <p>authorised 182:20</p> <p>authority 180:12</p> <p>automatic 176:10 189:8</p> <p>avail 144:14</p>
---	---	--	---	--

<p>available 148:21 149:2 150:14 164:12 178:5 199:7</p> <p>avert 143:8</p> <p>averted 141:4 143:18 145:25 192:13 193:1</p> <p>avoid 125:23 150:25 161:7 164:10,21</p> <p>avoided 167:13</p> <p>award 161:17</p> <p>aware 152:18 164:7 168:3 169:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <hr/> <p>B 138:16</p> <p>Ba 112:11,12,24</p> <p>back 113:6 126:25 135:12 139:17,18 171:21,21 173:1,25 174:22 180:22,22 186:4,4,4,6,11,11,18 189:6,6 194:19 201:7</p> <p>backdrop 122:7</p> <p>background 155:5 157:9 158:17,24 166:1</p> <p>bad 180:15</p> <p>Badenhorst 116:11</p> <p>ballistic 139:24 140:19</p> <p>Baloyi 115:1 119:21</p> <p>Bapo 112:11,12,24</p> <p>Bar 114:22 116:12</p> <p>barbed 131:3,6 176:4,6 176:8,9 188:20</p> <p>bargaining 123:22 124:1 126:5 130:1 141:8,16 143:14 146:7 155:8 156:8 157:16 159:8,10,14 159:21 160:2,12,16 160:21 161:1,2,4,10 161:19 162:8 168:12 168:17 175:22 191:6 195:7,13,18 196:9</p> <p>Barnes 115:6</p> <p>base 141:21 173:14 194:9</p> <p>based 121:23 122:12</p> <p>basic 149:6</p> <p>basis 166:3</p> <p>bath 125:21</p> <p>bear 192:8</p> <p>bearers 143:3</p> <p>bearing 143:24 145:9 165:5 174:10 176:22</p> <p>beast 141:25</p> <p>befell 199:13</p> <p>beg 134:1 178:13 181:5</p> <p>began 155:4</p> <p>begging 130:17 144:14</p> <p>beginning 138:7 154:11 184:20 197:12</p> <p>behalf 112:21 115:1,4 115:13,20 117:6,10 146:22 147:20,21 151:11 167:4 183:1</p>	<p>198:14,16,17 200:11</p> <p>behave 180:3,14</p> <p>behaviour 148:17</p> <p>belief 125:13 144:9 185:13</p> <p>believe 123:4 182:14 190:20 196:24</p> <p>believed 132:4 141:19 157:1 166:4 174:5,19 185:10</p> <p>believes 155:21 165:10</p> <p>believing 137:9,17,21</p> <p>belligerent 129:1</p> <p>benefit 112:17 201:14</p> <p>benefits 121:15</p> <p>best 117:16 119:16 126:14 160:19 167:23 183:23 184:14 188:7</p> <p>better 120:17 127:23 127:23 128:4 145:16 147:3 202:17</p> <p>beyond 146:2,6</p> <p>big 170:13 175:11</p> <p>Bill 177:7</p> <p>binding 161:16</p> <p>Bizos 114:7,9,16 176:18,19 177:2,4 181:5,8,9 182:25</p> <p>blame 126:11 143:10 190:16,21</p> <p>blanket 131:11,16</p> <p>blatantly 190:4</p> <p>blocking 188:21</p> <p>blood 125:21</p> <p>bloody 183:18</p> <p>Bob 112:21</p> <p>bodies 138:1,3,14,16 139:19</p> <p>bodily 182:6</p> <p>body 138:2,24 140:5,11 186:3</p> <p>boiling 141:12</p> <p>bolstered 154:2</p> <p>Bongo 153:2,2,12,14,16 153:25 165:18</p> <p>Bonita 133:14,23</p> <p>bottom 126:1</p> <p>bound 146:13</p> <p>branch 153:3 154:5 157:1 165:18</p> <p>breach 131:6,20,21</p> <p>breaches 123:13</p> <p>breaching 131:8</p> <p>brief 113:20 134:9,15</p> <p>briefings 164:23</p> <p>briefly 149:9 155:3 165:1,22 167:22</p> <p>bring 121:4 135:4 187:10 192:8,9 201:21</p> <p>bringing 132:21 201:19</p> <p>broad 160:11 161:2</p> <p>broader 123:6</p> <p>broke 139:5</p> <p>Broken 196:9</p> <p>brought 125:15 132:14</p>	<p>186:22 201:7</p> <p>Bruin 116:12</p> <p>Bruinders 115:5,7,8 167:2,5,7 176:16 188:12 191:25</p> <p>brutal 125:17</p> <p>build 127:23</p> <p>build-up 148:3</p> <p>bullet 144:20</p> <p>bullets 129:15 131:7,10 131:14 153:20</p> <p>burden 195:5</p> <p>Burger 114:17,19,21 147:20,22 151:8</p> <p>bushes 137:8,18 138:21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <hr/> <p>C 138:24</p> <p>cage 176:4</p> <p>call 117:18 145:6,25 146:10,19 147:20 169:7,15,17 176:17 179:11 182:17 189:23 195:2</p> <p>called 121:5 123:9 127:7 156:6,17 169:9 169:14 190:22 192:7</p> <p>calm 143:5</p> <p>campaign 125:17</p> <p>canons 131:7 137:1</p> <p>can't 199:23</p> <p>capacity 128:3 133:25 153:8</p> <p>Cape 132:17 197:20</p> <p>Captain 137:3</p> <p>care 183:3</p> <p>carefully 177:25</p> <p>cares 197:1</p> <p>carry 202:22</p> <p>cartridges 138:12</p> <p>case 157:15 180:15</p> <p>cases 179:22 180:1 182:4</p> <p>Cassie 116:11</p> <p>casualties 177:14</p> <p>catastrophic 155:22 161:8</p> <p>category 157:21,22</p> <p>causes 151:3 152:3 193:7 194:3 195:9,11 200:4</p> <p>CCMA 169:4</p> <p>central 184:4</p> <p>centre 114:11 124:22 130:25 133:15,24 138:2 176:17 177:6 190:23</p> <p>ceremony 174:11</p> <p>certain 148:25 151:14 152:8 184:24</p> <p>certainly 133:18 163:18 183:21 189:23 200:2</p> <p>certainty 140:20 159:17 201:16</p> <p>Chabedi 116:9,10</p>	<p>chagrin 124:2 143:14</p> <p>Chair 113:2 115:10,22 116:3 117:8 118:7 124:3 130:16 131:12 133:8 134:23 135:3 136:15 137:6 138:15 140:22 143:6 144:5 145:19 148:21 149:12 150:20 151:2,12,12 163:24 165:1 166:11 192:23 195:3 202:20</p> <p>Chairman 114:25 116:16 128:15 147:17 178:8,22 180:16,19 181:23 182:8,24 183:14 184:1,2,11 185:14,21 186:20 188:9 189:24 190:13 192:24 193:10,25 196:18,22 199:24 201:2,10,21</p> <p>Chairperson 112:2,23 113:3,15 114:5,14,17 114:19,23 115:3,8,13 115:21 116:6,9,14,18 117:3,4 118:2 123:3 126:16 132:11 133:5 133:11,16,19 134:14 134:20,24 135:9,12 135:20 136:3 137:4 145:5 147:19,22 151:8 162:9,14,17 166:13 167:6 176:16 177:2 180:25 182:25 183:25 192:16 193:9 198:7 202:21</p> <p>challenging 122:15 126:19</p> <p>Chamber 116:17</p> <p>chance 181:2</p> <p>change 146:11 194:17</p> <p>changed 191:7</p> <p>changing 193:7</p> <p>channel 162:7</p> <p>channelled 156:8</p> <p>chanting 140:6</p> <p>chapter 120:13</p> <p>characterisation 125:14</p> <p>characterised 125:9 152:21 155:17 157:14</p> <p>charge 140:10 174:8</p> <p>charged 137:14 138:18 138:21 140:8,16 142:15 174:5 185:8 185:13</p> <p>charging 131:22 132:1 138:20 143:24 144:11 144:15</p> <p>charter 126:7,8 142:3 142:14 146:15,20</p> <p>chase 182:7</p> <p>chased 182:2</p> <p>Chief 192:7</p> <p>childhood 202:16</p> <p>childish 199:24</p>	<p>children 202:3,5,6,10</p> <p>chilling 189:13</p> <p>choice 188:25</p> <p>Christopher 183:17</p> <p>chronologically 167:24</p> <p>chronology 168:2</p> <p>circuit 136:7</p> <p>circumstances 125:10 126:15 131:14 132:3 146:1,3 155:6 157:7 158:15 159:2 163:14 165:16 184:6 186:16 187:10 189:3 194:1 199:16 202:15</p> <p>citizens 119:6 127:19</p> <p>city 162:23 163:4</p> <p>civil 113:14</p> <p>civilians 120:1 123:8</p> <p>civility 183:9</p> <p>claim 182:19 185:7</p> <p>claimed 189:6</p> <p>claims 186:14</p> <p>clarify 166:5</p> <p>Clark 183:17</p> <p>clashes 142:25</p> <p>clear 122:17 134:4 166:14 167:2 201:3,8</p> <p>clearly 135:17 152:25 175:17 188:11 191:25 199:1</p> <p>client 147:21</p> <p>clients 117:6 184:21 194:23 196:13</p> <p>climate 152:20</p> <p>close 135:22 198:23</p> <p>closed 136:7 176:7 184:25</p> <p>closure 148:3</p> <p>clothing 131:10</p> <p>clump 176:8,9</p> <p>cluster 122:2</p> <p>code 120:25 121:1,5,6 194:13</p> <p>colleagues 114:10 115:12 121:18 127:14 150:20 163:14 170:19 177:19</p> <p>collected 127:18</p> <p>collective 123:22 124:1 126:4 130:1 141:8,16 143:13 155:8 156:8 157:16,18 158:1 159:8,10,21,25 160:2 160:12,16,21 161:1,2 161:4,10,11,15,19,24 162:7 168:12 175:22 191:3,5 195:7,13,18 196:9</p> <p>collectively 168:17</p> <p>colloquially 187:20</p> <p>Colonel 129:8 131:17</p> <p>colour 194:13</p> <p>combat 120:20 147:13</p> <p>come 112:15 118:15 132:17 133:15,20 135:1 136:8 166:16</p>
--	---	---	---	---

<p>171:6 172:2 174:1 175:6 202:5 comes 177:18 coming 194:19 197:20 commanders 187:21 commence 133:9 135:2 135:14 commenced 155:17 commencement 156:16 164:15,19 commencing 119:19 155:14 comment 189:19 commentators 120:3 125:9 160:11 191:16 Commercial 192:7 Commissioner 118:14 118:16 146:23 173:9 173:10,15,18 174:7,9 182:20 183:6,7,8 188:9 198:11 202:20 commissioners 112:4 114:20 115:10 133:14 133:23 147:23 162:21 163:21,25 180:23 185:14 186:21 189:25 192:24 193:11,25 195:3 196:4,18 commissions 179:21 Commission's 117:22 138:7 152:25 153:12 165:24 166:6 commitment 120:11 154:23,25 159:9 161:3 committed 128:1 147:12 152:1 committee 116:1 191:24 195:25 common 121:12 177:16 commonly 112:7 122:5 communicate 124:5 168:4 169:24 communicated 134:13 154:16 171:12 175:15 communication 121:20 communities 119:8,14 119:24 146:16 158:8 158:11,16 159:3 176:25 194:7 195:9 community 112:12,25 116:1 126:9,22 142:4 158:7 159:5 193:13 compact 126:23 company 142:13 195:10 company's 161:20,23 competent 186:17 competing 146:12 complain 170:19 complaints 191:2 complete 155:19 158:21 completed 125:15 completes 166:12 complex 120:4 122:15</p>	<p>123:5,8 153:17 154:3 165:20 complexity 121:21 complicit 195:10 complied 198:9 compliment 181:8 comply 188:17 compromised 150:18 compulsory 200:25 concede 186:8 concern 128:10 151:19 164:13,16 concerned 121:16 134:16 163:18 177:17 concerning 159:7 concerns 154:14 166:4 concession 178:2 concluded 145:24 Concluding 146:22 conclusion 151:2 conclusions 186:2 conclusive 153:20 conditions 121:20 126:9,19 142:3,9,16 146:17 157:19 159:23 195:4 condolences 147:1 conduct 120:25 121:1,6 128:24 143:11 144:11 146:16 152:6 155:10 156:11 158:6,23 160:23,25 164:6 165:8 170:11 175:24 179:21 180:7 182:14 190:3 197:10 conducted 152:13 conducting 152:2 conducts 127:10 confidence 147:9 confines 146:6 conflict 123:1 127:9 145:25 174:24 confrontation 123:1 148:8 157:3 confronted 131:17 congregated 149:15 conjecture 193:2 conjunction 142:18 connected 153:25 connotations 125:15 connoting 130:3 consequences 124:19 155:23 175:17 consider 113:19 117:12 160:23 177:6 186:16 192:14 193:3 consideration 158:24 considerations 117:15 128:17,21 considered 114:2 125:24 134:4 consisted 168:7 consistent 181:21 188:7 189:20 consistently 156:4,9 191:24 193:20</p>	<p>constant 123:21 198:5 constituencies 127:9 constitution 120:12,18 122:15 143:20 152:15 159:11 177:6,15 178:7,19 constitutional 120:10 120:24 127:2 128:22 144:2 147:13 180:1 constitutionalism 176:24 constitutionally 155:25 Construction 122:20 187:23 constructive 143:17 consult 150:13 172:25 consultations 146:15 153:11 181:16 consulted 153:3 consulting 168:18 contact 113:23 174:3 174:23 198:5 contactable 198:2 contacted 169:11 172:14 198:2 contain 145:13 162:22 189:15 contains 128:7 contemplation 166:6 contend 184:19 186:25 189:7 193:5 contending 141:14 contention 184:24 185:3,22 186:24 190:17 contestation 184:9 185:25 context 152:19 158:21 160:22 161:7 contingent 171:19,22 171:24 continue 139:13 156:6 172:12 continued 129:20 139:14 140:10 175:18 continuing 139:16 contractual 146:2 contradicted 185:22 186:13 contrary 179:17 180:9 contrast 178:18 194:17 contravening 136:23 contravention 136:24 contribute 152:1 154:23 158:25 165:7 contributed 142:20 159:6 contribution 147:6 control 124:19 128:21 145:12 149:15 188:2 190:2 192:9 195:24 controlled 121:13 controversy 199:6 conundrums 202:19 convenient 132:12 convey 136:10</p>	<p>conveyed 171:9 172:9 cooperation 152:10 copy 118:3 140:6 166:10 core 159:17 correct 112:13 114:8 135:1 179:20 correctly 197:17 correctness 138:6 corresponding 147:7 cost 142:9 couldn't 112:5 counsel 115:15 163:3 183:18 counter 168:21 country 121:7 145:8 177:24 200:18 country's 147:6 160:16 course 113:19 114:3 123:11 125:2 127:22 127:24 134:13,15 152:16 153:7 157:7 157:20 171:18 courses 200:4 Court 180:1,1 covering 131:10 co-operate 148:21 co-operation 174:23 create 124:4 created 141:24 creates 120:6 creation 146:12 crevices 137:8,18 crime 120:20 147:14 185:1,5 crime-prevention 122:2 criminal 138:2 148:17 crisis 194:7,8 196:16 critical 124:13 158:17 cross 113:25 131:4 crossing 146:9 cross-examination 176:15 cross-examine 179:16 crowd 124:15 128:21 145:12 149:14 190:2 crushing 193:6 culminated 118:11 culminating 142:21 145:23 currency 161:24 current 160:12 161:1 curve 142:11 custom 201:25 cynically 185:6</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <hr/> <p>D 139:19 daily 123:8 124:11 164:23 170:15 Daluvuyo 153:1 165:18 damage 127:5,8 151:22 danger 125:12,14 132:5 140:3 178:16 182:1 dangerous 126:15</p>	<p>131:22 136:25 137:14 145:10 159:23 164:25 187:8 date 153:13 165:9 dated 192:6 day 130:18,20 149:17 149:19 150:1 155:11 162:18 164:7 166:15 166:16,19,19,25 169:11,12 170:20 172:12 173:5,23 175:3 176:1 183:7 184:12,15 186:20,23 190:20 days 124:13 142:23 155:10 160:5 164:5 193:5 194:12 197:14 de 116:12 dead 127:18 189:16 deal 114:13 128:3,16 128:25 134:17 141:7 141:9 143:13 157:9 159:7 161:23 165:1 169:8 175:23 179:3 dealing 128:23 157:18 179:5 190:1 dealt 198:25 death 124:12 127:5,8 127:14 136:13 137:23 144:18 148:18 151:21 155:20 187:17 189:3 199:12 deaths 124:12 139:25 140:1 143:1 152:23 154:4 167:12 181:20 182:12 187:2,3 190:20 192:13 193:1 debate 169:21 199:15 deceased 115:14,15,20 147:2 196:21 197:23 decent 187:8 decide 138:10 169:21 decided 162:24 170:12 170:17 182:4 decision 130:25 157:20 157:23 161:17,20 181:12,18,19 182:6 199:21 decisions 182:18 deep 118:8,18,24 128:10 deeply 196:5 defence 170:13 186:19 defend 178:15 defied 131:5 defined 175:17 delayed 154:22 delaying 166:19 delegation 130:12,14 171:4,5,8,11,15,15 deliberate 153:22 deliver 183:20 delivered 183:22 delivery 121:25 demand 141:14,21 149:6 150:7 157:24</p>
--	---	--	---	---

158:3 161:14,17 162:1 168:4,14,15,19 168:24 169:1,3,9,21 169:24 170:1,2,4,18 171:7,9,18 172:4 174:1,3,14,16 175:7 demanded 129:21 demanding 144:17 demands 121:24 142:11 148:6 156:7 159:25 162:7 187:24 democracy 122:12 144:2 194:22 democratic 185:20 194:11 demonstrate 123:12 125:16 demonstrated 161:9 department 113:9 116:10 122:22,24 126:5 142:15,17,18 146:13,19 150:4 199:5,6 departments 122:1 126:6 dependents 115:14 deplorable 159:24 deployed 131:25 deployment 131:3 181:13 depressingly 189:4 deprived 158:16 descended 155:19 describe 117:20 described 123:23 138:4 151:9 189:20 describes 182:11 188:18 deserted 175:1 designed 160:20 desire 113:21 197:4 despite 124:20 140:9 144:12 185:9 destroyed 185:17,18 destruction 143:25 146:25 151:23 152:24 154:5 156:3 destructive 159:19 detail 119:22 175:23 detailed 128:12 149:10 deter 131:9 deteriorated 125:2 determine 184:5 deterred 129:17 develop 142:4 developed 142:17 developing 126:18 development 113:10 126:9 199:5,7 developments 144:25 155:6 didn't 167:2 178:16 192:2 died 132:6 198:24 differences 123:18 differently 186:22	differing 157:6 difficult 126:1,15 156:22 197:7 Dikeledi 116:9 dimensions 125:1 diplomacy 124:7 direct 134:16 158:14 188:12 directed 156:12 166:1 directing 197:9 direction 139:22 140:16 directly 122:16 123:2 126:4 141:7 143:13 161:23 168:10,19,22 175:21 187:19 director 133:24 174:19 directorate 189:15 directs 120:13 disarm 129:2,9,21 130:11,15,18,24 131:1 136:22 144:7 144:14 164:24 187:7 188:14 disarming 124:23 187:13 discharged 147:10 157:5 discharging 147:13 disciplinary 152:15 discipline 144:4 disclosed 185:23 189:21 discomfort 187:10 discontent 195:9 discovered 138:1 discuss 169:8 187:24 191:20 discussing 172:13 dismally 195:8 dismissal 155:25 dismissive 124:6 dispersal 188:22 191:19 disperse 129:16 131:1 137:1 187:9 188:13 dispersed 137:2 dispersing 124:23 136:21 187:13 displayed 144:12 disposal 192:9 disproportionate 140:3 190:11 200:17 disproportionately 191:3 dispute 138:5,10 169:16 195:20 disputed 138:8 disputes 123:17 157:12 157:13 158:14 disregard 155:19 distance 132:17 156:17 distanced 162:2 divine 182:10 division 118:5 Divisions 180:2	DME 148:25 document 118:3 151:16 164:1 180:16 documentary 167:16 185:23 documentation 113:22 150:1 documented 125:25 documents 149:2 162:22 163:6,11 166:21 167:1,2 178:5 178:10,23,25 180:4 180:16 186:8 189:14 doesn't 163:17 166:17 176:22 dogged 144:6 doing 151:4 173:13 domain 123:11 don't 114:11 133:20 134:15 136:5 166:15 166:24,25 167:3 179:8 180:7,17 181:3 192:18 200:15 double 195:5 doubt 184:8 draw 117:22 194:16 drawn 177:9 181:9 drill 149:7 155:15 168:4,7,8,10,14,16,19 168:24 169:2,16,19 169:22 170:2,3,5,10 170:12 171:1 175:19 190:22 due 114:2 134:13 153:7 157:7 duel 145:12 Dumisani 165:15 dumped 191:14 duplicate 134:5 duplication 164:10 duties 122:14 duty 143:8 144:3 146:2 146:2,5,7 156:6 187:6 duty-bound 118:23	efforts 123:19 124:9 150:18 164:24 196:20 197:14 eight 119:25 139:23 186:2 either 188:2 195:23 196:14 198:1 elapsed 113:6 elected 193:14 emails 149:2 emanate 184:19 embarked 157:23 161:25 embarking 141:22 Embassy 132:24,24 emboldened 161:22 emerged 176:9 employed 159:4 employees 130:4,5 149:23 150:7 155:24 156:20,24 157:22,22 158:3,3,10,11 162:5 169:6 employer 159:13 employers 146:1 147:4 177:23 employment 157:19 200:10 enable 158:21 163:1 encircle 188:20 encompass 165:25 encounter 171:25 encourage 123:15 encouraged 162:6 encourages 147:3 encouraging 156:17 endeavour 197:10 endeavours 161:7 ended 165:13 193:17 Energy 192:5 enforce 120:22 147:16 enforcement 142:14 159:24 164:20 187:6 engage 123:16 130:1 145:11 168:13 170:1 171:7,17 172:7 173:3 173:6 175:6 191:12 193:20 engaged 164:23 168:10 168:11,23,25 169:1 180:20 191:7 engagement 145:21,23 159:9 168:23 engaging 126:11 151:5 191:5 engender 197:11 English 181:3 enquiries 165:25 ensue 192:2 ensued 157:3 ensure 120:23 121:11 122:13 127:7 141:2 ensuring 122:5 146:14 146:17 entail 159:13 entered 157:17 186:3	entire 118:17 197:2 200:21 entities 159:13 entitled 178:14 entitlement 197:6 entrenched 155:25 196:5 environment 121:4,12 124:5 159:14 160:13 envisaged 153:5 equal 196:1 200:23 equals 120:15 equation 119:15 equipment 145:15 equipped 164:25 escalated 192:4 escalation 124:11 escape 189:7 especially 189:9 establish 196:25 198:13 established 156:8 191:16 establishing 119:11 ethics 122:11 evaluation 148:5 158:22 evening 172:24 event 117:18,24 153:21 186:15 188:23,23 events 116:23 117:20 118:11,15,20 119:10 125:16,22 126:2 127:14,25 128:8 129:3 141:2 142:21 143:1 145:3,16 147:25 148:4 149:1,4 149:9,16,19 150:24 151:20 152:3 153:9 154:8 155:7,12 157:11 158:6,23 159:1,18 161:8,13 165:2,4,8,9 166:2 167:9 176:12 192:10 193:22 196:11 201:24 everybody 183:10 196:25 evidence 113:23 117:16 119:22 123:14 124:4 125:19 126:1 128:24 129:4 130:16 131:13 131:14 132:7,20 136:12,17 137:12,22 138:7,9,9,10,22 140:2 141:6 142:22,23 144:6,7,13,20,22,23 148:16 149:5 150:18 150:21 151:4 153:9 157:7 159:8 167:11 167:16,18 176:14 177:12 178:12,15 179:11 181:15 185:23 186:7,12 187:1 190:6 191:17,21 192:3 193:25 195:24 196:3 evident 145:22 exacerbated 154:8
E				
E 139:19 earlier 119:23 162:2 166:14,17 181:1 202:23 early 119:19 150:13 151:7 182:19 earnest 154:18 Eastern 132:17 197:20 easy 127:16,16,20 economic 122:16 159:2 160:8 194:6,9 195:5 196:16 economy 147:6 159:18 160:19 edge 140:6 educate 146:8 Edward 112:21 effect 131:2 139:1,9 effectively 154:19 effort 124:22 129:2				

<p>exactly 185:25 195:1 examination 153:10 160:16,18 165:3,10 202:14 examine 122:18 examined 161:2 examining 114:1 example 192:6 examples 197:21 excessive 192:4 exchanged 146:9 excluding 123:7 exclusively 188:3 excuse 177:21 execute 150:21 execution 189:20 exercise 160:17 200:21 existing 161:4 162:7 168:11 191:5,14 expanded 155:3 expect 152:16 expected 180:2 experienced 124:21 expert 144:8 179:11 190:6 194:1,4,5 experts 180:20 explain 144:10 179:16 180:21 explained 202:23 explaining 137:23 explains 145:2 explanation 202:14 explanations 189:22 explore 148:3 exploring 147:24 express 118:24 expressed 150:7 183:11 expresses 146:25 147:9 extend 128:13 extends 147:1 extensive 122:8 extent 160:5 extrajudicial 189:20 ex-mineworkers 119:2 E-Y-I 198:15</p>	<p>failings 195:22 196:15 failure 140:24 141:1 142:19 192:14 193:3 195:10 fair 115:16 184:3 198:8 fairly 191:16,18 193:20 families 115:20 119:8 119:13,15,24 128:9 132:15 135:5 147:2 148:2 183:1 184:11 184:16 191:22 196:21 199:2,12,22 200:7,20 201:3,9,15,20 family 112:11,22,24 113:8 115:14 116:2 132:21,25 136:13 146:18 195:6 197:19 198:14 199:3,3,8,13 199:19 200:16 202:2 fanning 143:11 far 113:1 117:2 134:16 149:6 163:17 178:16 181:24 183:21 185:23 189:22 190:4 197:15 far-reaching 196:15 fatal 186:5 190:6 fateful 149:17 175:3 father 202:10,11 favour 147:17 fear 120:16 147:16 feckless 190:23 feed 135:23 feel 122:6 feeling 200:22 feelings 183:11 feels 201:25 fell 139:17,18 190:3 fellow 127:19 132:5 felt 170:14 194:20 fence 188:20 fermenting 122:25 fifth 117:22 fifthly 155:12 figuratively 127:2 filed 149:9 150:2 files 178:10 final 196:19 finalised 116:4 167:17 167:25 finally 147:12 175:19 190:24 find 148:2 166:19 179:8 184:14 189:24 190:3 finding 156:22 184:15 findings 179:25 fingers 151:5 190:16 finger-pointing 125:23 fire 132:2 137:9,10,11 137:17,20,21 140:15 184:21 189:18 firearms 131:23 137:25 157:5,8 185:5 189:10 fired 125:12 137:8,18 138:20 139:12,21,22 140:14 firepower 185:9</p>	<p>firing 137:12 139:23 first 116:23 119:6 131:20 141:21 145:7 145:8 148:1 161:3 168:3,9 169:1,5 173:12 182:16 186:8 187:5 189:18 195:17 196:18,20 197:13 firsthand 149:18 firstly 112:10 151:17 155:4 190:22 five 131:19 202:3 flag 194:13,15 flames 143:11 flat 139:6 flee 176:6 Fletcher 197:23 floor 146:8 fluidity 124:17 focus 151:18 focused 125:3 focussing 201:24 follow 172:18 followed 181:13 following 121:14 129:4 130:20 136:17 155:1 168:3 172:14 186:2 190:21 footage 144:19,25 145:2 FOPs 121:10 force 120:8 124:14,16 131:25 144:12 177:21 178:6,6,14 180:14 188:18 196:12 forces 126:12 128:3 forensic 137:22 180:20 foreseeable 187:3 foreshadowed 117:16 form 116:23 134:9 formal 122:4 176:21 formation 185:1 formations 124:7 former 158:3,10 forming 149:25 formulate 150:22 formulated 121:8 179:16 fortnight 113:6 forum 118:24 forums 160:20 found 137:25 138:2,3 138:12,14 141:25 fourthly 155:8 165:17 framework 161:1 free 120:16 freedom 195:16 199:11 Friday 148:7 153:1 friend 115:23 178:1 179:18 181:10 187:7 190:14 198:20 friendly 137:20 friends 114:21 178:24 182:13,23 fulfilment 126:7 full 113:19 150:21</p>	<p> 152:10 202:14 fully 158:22 functionality 160:12 functioning 159:14 fundamental 161:10 Fundi 136:5,5,7 funds 200:7,8 furnish 167:18 further 120:10 139:13 143:10 150:17,18 154:4 157:9 159:7,11 164:21 166:19 170:23 184:12 198:11 Furthermore 120:18 future 135:16 145:16 195:13</p>	<p>grant 157:21 161:21 granted 157:25 161:14 202:17 graphic 128:7 graphics 128:11 grateful 134:7,11 gratitude 147:9 Grave 164:3 great 119:7 132:18 175:23 178:16 greater 146:21 195:16 green 131:16 grenades 129:15 131:7 grievance 199:1 grievances 159:5 191:21 grieving 197:3 199:22 grievous 182:6 grimly 196:5 ground 138:21 139:7,8 189:17 group 115:16 131:15 138:16,17,20,21,23 139:20,23 140:4,5,8,8 140:12 176:5,8,10 groupings 122:25 groups 115:15 119:14 136:22 guard 193:8 guidance 121:10 150:17 guidelines 121:9,11 Gumbi 113:13,13 114:4 Gumuza 198:14,15 gunfire 140:16 176:10 guns 178:21,22 gunshots 139:21 140:14 Gwelani 198:21 G-U-M-U-Z-A 198:15 G-W-E-L-A-N-I 198:21</p>
F				
<p>faced 125:11 140:4 faceless 123:24 130:3 facetiously 200:14 facilitate 121:20 146:18 148:1 162:4 201:19 facilitated 130:8,10 facilities 166:18 fact 123:25 127:20 135:4 153:25 173:22 182:9 184:9 188:17 189:5 197:3 199:2,16 factored 135:7 factors 150:23 facts 119:11 184:6 197:5,8 factual 158:17 failed 123:10 142:13 195:8 failing 188:13</p>	<p>failings 195:22 196:15 failure 140:24 141:1 142:19 192:14 193:3 195:10 fair 115:16 184:3 198:8 fairly 191:16,18 193:20 families 115:20 119:8 119:13,15,24 128:9 132:15 135:5 147:2 148:2 183:1 184:11 184:16 191:22 196:21 199:2,12,22 200:7,20 201:3,9,15,20 family 112:11,22,24 113:8 115:14 116:2 132:21,25 136:13 146:18 195:6 197:19 198:14 199:3,3,8,13 199:19 200:16 202:2 fanning 143:11 far 113:1 117:2 134:16 149:6 163:17 178:16 181:24 183:21 185:23 189:22 190:4 197:15 far-reaching 196:15 fatal 186:5 190:6 fateful 149:17 175:3 father 202:10,11 favour 147:17 fear 120:16 147:16 feckless 190:23 feed 135:23 feel 122:6 feeling 200:22 feelings 183:11 feels 201:25 fell 139:17,18 190:3 fellow 127:19 132:5 felt 170:14 194:20 fence 188:20 fermenting 122:25 fifth 117:22 fifthly 155:12 figuratively 127:2 filed 149:9 150:2 files 178:10 final 196:19 finalised 116:4 167:17 167:25 finally 147:12 175:19 190:24 find 148:2 166:19 179:8 184:14 189:24 190:3 finding 156:22 184:15 findings 179:25 fingers 151:5 190:16 finger-pointing 125:23 fire 132:2 137:9,10,11 137:17,20,21 140:15 184:21 189:18 firearms 131:23 137:25 157:5,8 185:5 189:10 fired 125:12 137:8,18 138:20 139:12,21,22 140:14 firepower 185:9</p>	<p>firing 137:12 139:23 first 116:23 119:6 131:20 141:21 145:7 145:8 148:1 161:3 168:3,9 169:1,5 173:12 182:16 186:8 187:5 189:18 195:17 196:18,20 197:13 firsthand 149:18 firstly 112:10 151:17 155:4 190:22 five 131:19 202:3 flag 194:13,15 flames 143:11 flat 139:6 flee 176:6 Fletcher 197:23 floor 146:8 fluidity 124:17 focus 151:18 focused 125:3 focussing 201:24 follow 172:18 followed 181:13 following 121:14 129:4 130:20 136:17 155:1 168:3 172:14 186:2 190:21 footage 144:19,25 145:2 FOPs 121:10 force 120:8 124:14,16 131:25 144:12 177:21 178:6,6,14 180:14 188:18 196:12 forces 126:12 128:3 forensic 137:22 180:20 foreseeable 187:3 foreshadowed 117:16 form 116:23 134:9 formal 122:4 176:21 formation 185:1 formations 124:7 former 158:3,10 forming 149:25 formulate 150:22 formulated 121:8 179:16 fortnight 113:6 forum 118:24 forums 160:20 found 137:25 138:2,3 138:12,14 141:25 fourthly 155:8 165:17 framework 161:1 free 120:16 freedom 195:16 199:11 Friday 148:7 153:1 friend 115:23 178:1 179:18 181:10 187:7 190:14 198:20 friendly 137:20 friends 114:21 178:24 182:13,23 fulfilment 126:7 full 113:19 150:21</p>	<p> 152:10 202:14 fully 158:22 functionality 160:12 functioning 159:14 fundamental 161:10 Fundi 136:5,5,7 funds 200:7,8 furnish 167:18 further 120:10 139:13 143:10 150:17,18 154:4 157:9 159:7,11 164:21 166:19 170:23 184:12 198:11 Furthermore 120:18 future 135:16 145:16 195:13</p>	<p>grant 157:21 161:21 granted 157:25 161:14 202:17 graphic 128:7 graphics 128:11 grateful 134:7,11 gratitude 147:9 Grave 164:3 great 119:7 132:18 175:23 178:16 greater 146:21 195:16 green 131:16 grenades 129:15 131:7 grievance 199:1 grievances 159:5 191:21 grieving 197:3 199:22 grievous 182:6 grimly 196:5 ground 138:21 139:7,8 189:17 group 115:16 131:15 138:16,17,20,21,23 139:20,23 140:4,5,8,8 140:12 176:5,8,10 groupings 122:25 groups 115:15 119:14 136:22 guard 193:8 guidance 121:10 150:17 guidelines 121:9,11 Gumbi 113:13,13 114:4 Gumuza 198:14,15 gunfire 140:16 176:10 guns 178:21,22 gunshots 139:21 140:14 Gwelani 198:21 G-U-M-U-Z-A 198:15 G-W-E-L-A-N-I 198:21</p>
H				
<p>H 139:19 half 149:7 178:2 hall 162:24 163:4,5 Hamilton 115:12 hampered 154:22 hampers 150:12 hand 116:1 120:6 139:10 148:13 150:4 handling 121:19 hands 139:8 happened 117:2 124:20 129:3 132:20 181:17 183:12 187:17 195:19 197:2,17,18 happening 135:24 201:3,13 happy 130:22 175:9 196:12 hard 159:23 167:11,14 harm 178:17,17 182:6 harmony 120:16 harrowing 189:19</p>	<p>H 139:19 half 149:7 178:2 hall 162:24 163:4,5 Hamilton 115:12 hampered 154:22 hampers 150:12 hand 116:1 120:6 139:10 148:13 150:4 handling 121:19 hands 139:8 happened 117:2 124:20 129:3 132:20 181:17 183:12 187:17 195:19 197:2,17,18 happening 135:24 201:3,13 happy 130:22 175:9 196:12 hard 159:23 167:11,14 harm 178:17,17 182:6 harmony 120:16 harrowing 189:19</p>	<p>H 139:19 half 149:7 178:2 hall 162:24 163:4,5 Hamilton 115:12 hampered 154:22 hampers 150:12 hand 116:1 120:6 139:10 148:13 150:4 handling 121:19 hands 139:8 happened 117:2 124:20 129:3 132:20 181:17 183:12 187:17 195:19 197:2,17,18 happening 135:24 201:3,13 happy 130:22 175:9 196:12 hard 159:23 167:11,14 harm 178:17,17 182:6 harmony 120:16 harrowing 189:19</p>	<p>H 139:19 half 149:7 178:2 hall 162:24 163:4,5 Hamilton 115:12 hampered 154:22 hampers 150:12 hand 116:1 120:6 139:10 148:13 150:4 handling 121:19 hands 139:8 happened 117:2 124:20 129:3 132:20 181:17 183:12 187:17 195:19 197:2,17,18 happening 135:24 201:3,13 happy 130:22 175:9 196:12 hard 159:23 167:11,14 harm 178:17,17 182:6 harmony 120:16 harrowing 189:19</p>	<p>H 139:19 half 149:7 178:2 hall 162:24 163:4,5 Hamilton 115:12 hampered 154:22 hampers 150:12 hand 116:1 120:6 139:10 148:13 150:4 handling 121:19 hands 139:8 happened 117:2 124:20 129:3 132:20 181:17 183:12 187:17 195:19 197:2,17,18 happening 135:24 201:3,13 happy 130:22 175:9 196:12 hard 159:23 167:11,14 harm 178:17,17 182:6 harmony 120:16 harrowing 189:19</p>

<p>Hartford 194:2 haven't 113:16 head 186:5,11 189:6 heading 164:1 headings 128:18 151:15 hear 123:13 124:3,10 124:15,17,25 125:5 131:12,14 132:7,20 135:16 144:6,7,13,15 144:17,23 149:12 197:6 heard 133:20 137:7 143:2 180:19 190:14 hearing 141:18 143:7 143:19 heart 194:6 heartbeat 132:1 heavily 164:24 199:2 heightened 188:19 held 112:4 196:6 help 121:18 127:22 145:16 high 155:18 180:12 high-handed 196:10 historically 179:20 history 145:8 hit 153:19 hold 136:4 146:7 174:11,18 191:3 holders 166:22 home 193:23 199:23 homes 170:16 172:20 homesteads 195:6 honour 161:4 honourable 189:12 190:13 192:24 199:24 hope 113:6 127:21 150:12,23 167:1 180:14 189:23 196:4 hopefully 183:16 197:11 Horace 114:22 horses 200:4 hostage 179:3,5 Hostel 153:17 154:3 165:20 hostile 120:8 hot 163:13 hour 162:15 households 195:5 housing 126:9 142:3,16 142:18 146:17 195:4 human 118:11 127:12 128:2 134:1,3,7,10 176:23 humane 128:2,5 humble 200:19 hundred 156:23 hundreds 181:25 182:7 hurt 128:13 husband 201:23</p>	<p>identify 117:14,23 138:2 identifying 138:14 150:23 ignored 141:1 illegal 141:15 illegitimate 187:14 illustrated 152:25 imagine 136:6 200:12 imitable 126:23 immediate 123:10 125:22 145:9 165:15 188:1 189:17 immediately 188:10 195:6 imminent 125:12,14 132:5 impact 152:24 154:15 160:7 impacts 160:19 Impala 157:13,15,17 157:20 158:2,3,10 161:9,13 impartially 127:10 imperatives 120:24 127:3 imperious 190:24 implementation 131:2 importance 154:24 important 117:12 122:7 134:25 181:3 201:13 imposed 125:11 imposes 120:18 impossible 141:25 improve 142:3 improved 146:18 improving 126:21 inability 164:14,17 inadequate 145:13 inappropriate 188:4 inappropriateness 190:7 inasmuch 191:13 inaudible 133:21 180:22 182:24 202:8 inception 155:17 incident 124:13 137:3 157:6 incidents 112:7 119:19 123:2 128:11 154:12 158:18,20 159:1,7 165:4,8,9 166:2 include 126:8 146:3 156:24 165:10 included 136:24 173:15 including 122:23 129:7 143:19 146:15 158:10 187:1 inconsistent 141:17 186:13 increase 141:14 142:11 157:21,25,25 161:14 161:15,24 164:20 168:5,20 169:3,25 171:7 174:2 175:20</p>	<p>191:9 193:17 increases 141:21 increasing 164:15,18 inculcate 144:4 independent 185:23 189:14 indicate 128:6 151:15 199:10 indicated 130:19 191:17 196:23 indication 189:9 197:2 indicative 154:12 indirectly 123:2 individual 125:11 individuals 120:15 122:24 128:3 induct 172:19 indulgence 134:2 163:16,20 industrial 141:22 146:7 147:3 158:12 160:13 161:2,6 industry 159:21 194:2 ineffectiveness 131:13 inevitable 142:10,12 inevitably 143:9 187:16 inexplicable 144:11 inference 153:22 154:1 inflection 192:10 inflict 182:6 influenced 180:11 inform 169:12 174:13 informal 129:17 149:13 158:5 176:7 188:22 information 158:17,19 164:12 informed 136:5 141:8 158:22 161:20 162:18 163:12 169:5 172:23 173:2,16,22 174:9 175:3,8 informing 171:14,14 inhabitants 120:21 147:15 injunction 125:21 injunctions 122:18 injured 115:25 119:5 119:21 127:18 129:13 147:1,3 181:25 189:16 injuries 119:13 154:4 189:21 190:7 injuring 129:11 injury 118:22 125:7 127:5,8 151:21 152:23 182:12 187:16 189:4 Inkameng 188:22 inquiry 112:6 116:24 123:4 133:4,4 134:6 147:24 152:3 154:15 155:12 162:16,16 164:9 165:2 183:18 202:25 inside 131:17 137:8,23 138:17,24 139:21,22</p>	<p>140:6,12 insisted 191:4 insofar 190:19 202:11 inspection 142:6 181:23 inspections 153:12 instance 117:22 119:6 201:2 instigated 192:3 institute 152:14 institution 126:24 institutions 122:10 195:8 196:10 instructed 139:6 instruction 132:3 instructions 117:15 121:9,10 128:17 instruments 128:25 190:1 insufficient 145:2 integrated 122:4 intend 150:19 182:4 183:7,23 intended 125:20 intending 128:13 intense 124:8 intent 125:19 145:11 157:2 185:2 intentions 124:12 inter 126:2 143:11 interacting 148:23 interaction 148:12 149:20 150:3,8 159:15 interest 134:12 interested 193:6 interests 176:25 international 151:19 190:1 interpret 117:1 118:6 181:2 interpretation 135:21 interpreted 135:24 153:24 interpreter 117:1,3,4 118:3 134:24 135:21 136:1 177:3 181:1,7 192:16,19,21 interpreters 134:23 interpreting 136:2 149:24 interrogated 182:23 interrogation 126:2 interrupt 198:7 interruption 136:4 intersection 202:7 intervention 177:13 intimidation 150:11 152:18,20 155:18 156:2,11,19 157:14 160:4 162:4 introduce 189:25 190:6 193:25 introduction 117:9 151:17 invaluable 126:18</p>	<p>invariably 179:22 investigate 120:20 147:14 151:18 197:24 investigated 152:7 investigation 153:5 investigations 134:6 investigative 189:15 invincible 144:9 185:10 invite 181:15 184:15 190:2 invited 187:16 involved 113:10 141:5 148:23 151:1 158:12 involving 123:16 165:5 invulnerable 144:10 in-depth 160:15 Ireland 183:19 irrationa 180:11 Isaiah 165:17 Ishmael 115:2 isolation 148:4 issue 143:15 188:5,5 issued 163:6 188:13,15 issues 120:4 123:6,10 153:4 155:8 160:21 161:3 it's 113:5 116:24 132:14,15 140:25 151:9,10 164:2 180:9 192:4 198:8,24 I'll 114:5 118:7 164:3 176:17 I'm 113:13 114:20,21 115:22 116:9,10,16 176:20 177:11 180:15 180:22 193:18 198:25 200:2,13 I've 114:10 i.e 174:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>J 139:19 jackets 163:16,20,22 Jackson 197:23 job 183:15,15 202:1 Johannesburg 114:22 116:12 joined 136:18 joint 124:22 130:25 journey 136:10 judges 180:5,6,9 July 126:3 141:6 143:12 168:6,6 169:4 169:18 191:6 jumped 139:10 June 121:1 149:8 168:5 191:1,6 jurisprudence 180:13 justice 122:1 justification 140:25 185:12,15 justified 144:2 157:8 200:13</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">K</p> <p>K 139:19</p>
---	--	---	--	--

<p>Karabo 112:19 Karee 149:8 157:12 161:12 Karel 115:11 keep 116:4 121:21 163:22 183:24 kept 149:3 188:20 key 121:14 125:3 Kgoroadira 112:19,20 113:1 Kgotla 172:17,24 kill 131:18 144:16,24 177:19 180:12 182:5 killed 129:13 132:9 137:13,16 138:24 140:10 153:16 170:10 170:25 171:3,24,25 175:11 177:20 183:2 184:10,12,16,17 185:8 194:24 202:1 202:11 killing 129:11 139:23 143:25 144:16 153:1 153:23 165:14,17,18 184:6 185:12,15 killings 148:9,11 160:5 188:10 kin 184:22 kind 135:1 145:17 160:7 186:12,16 196:7 199:11 Kitt 137:3 kleur 194:15 knees 130:17 knelt 139:7 knobkierie 139:3 knobkieries 138:18 knopkieries 140:7,13 know 113:1 114:12 131:16 136:5 167:3 172:25 179:1,8 181:6 181:14 182:13 191:8 192:13 197:4,6 200:24 201:4 knowledge 149:18 known 112:8 117:21 122:5 135:14 149:13 187:20,25 kopie 136:23 koppie 117:21 129:10 130:11 133:6 136:16 136:18,20 137:1,8,14 137:18,24 138:3,4,12 138:14,17,18,25 139:1,2,21,22 140:6 140:12,15,17 158:13 165:16 170:13,17 171:5,6,12,16,17,19 171:22 172:1,3,9,20 173:11,12,13,14,19 173:21,22,24 174:1,3 174:6,15,17 175:2,6,7 175:10,11,12,15,17 176:2,5 178:4 185:5 187:20 koppies 149:13</p>	<p>Kosi 112:21 kraal 117:19 129:3,5 131:21 Kwadi 172:22,22,24 173:2 174:11,12,15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">L</p> <hr/> <p>L 139:19 labelled 125:10 130:2 labour 122:24 123:15 123:17 124:5,25 157:11 158:14 159:12 160:8 187:24 188:5 194:8,21,24 195:12 195:13,21 202:13 labourers 194:25 196:6 labouring 195:9 laid 130:23 Lang 197:23 large 139:20 145:9 149:14 150:10 187:20 197:19 lastly 117:25 165:22 lasts 163:16 late 112:3 134:2 172:11 172:12 laudable 191:6 law 120:22 127:4,7 143:23 147:8,16 152:16 160:2 164:20 176:24 177:16 187:6 lawful 147:7 159:16 lawfully 159:13 laws 136:23 178:7 lay 188:16 189:17 layers 131:10 LCR 176:23 Le 116:16,16,18 lead 148:16 155:7 157:7 178:17 191:21 leader 130:16 144:17 190:15 leaders 113:23 124:5 131:15 138:7,9 143:4 143:8 154:6 167:19 181:15 leadership 124:7 leading 113:25 142:24 148:6 150:21 152:21 152:23 159:1,6 187:1 193:5 leads 120:23 learn 123:24 141:2 learned 114:21 115:23 178:1,24 179:18 181:10 182:13,23 187:7 190:14 198:20 learning 126:20 learns 126:18 learnt 127:24 leave 142:10 154:6 173:24 175:7,9,16 176:3 189:24 190:5 202:3,5 leaving 202:12 led 115:16 116:10</p>	<p>136:12 137:3 148:18 151:21 167:11 176:14 181:12,20 195:4 199:20 left 170:16 172:20 174:3 175:9,10,25 186:4 199:21,22 202:1 legal 114:11 133:24 150:19 176:17 177:5 181:21 200:11 legislation 117:15 128:17 177:16 178:7 178:19 legitimacy 195:17 legitimate 143:21 legitimates 187:12 Lehura 197:23 length 183:16 Lepaaku 119:20 Lesego 115:23 Lesotho 132:22,23,25 194:25 lessons 126:19 127:24 lethal 124:14,15 177:21 178:6,14 letter 169:14 192:10 lettering 138:1 letters 192:4 letting 139:8 level 155:9 159:22 164:4 195:14 levels 155:18 156:2 159:20 164:15,18 liability 179:23 liaise 198:4,13 201:18 liaising 132:23 liaison 149:23 lie 139:6 lies 190:18 194:6 Lieutenant 119:20 129:7 131:17 life 118:25 119:13 120:17 121:6 125:7 127:3 128:4 140:25 145:10 157:15 164:22 177:8 186:24 life-threatening 178:16 lighter 194:12 limited 121:14 138:13 149:17 limitless 200:1 limits 147:8 line 131:5,8,20,21 137:3 138:19,25 140:9 listen 174:1 181:16 listened 177:25 listening 177:12 literally 127:2 little 142:7 143:7 live 120:15,16 132:2 181:18 lives 117:17 118:12 119:1 120:1 125:4,12 128:10 132:4 146:4</p>	<p>146:25 155:20 177:11 178:15,18 179:25 187:12 living 126:9 142:3,8,9 142:16 146:17 159:23 local 138:1 location 138:11,14 153:18 lock-out 159:16 loco 142:6 153:12 181:23 lodged 151:14 log 149:3 long 132:17 136:9 163:16 175:10 183:7 184:19 201:16 longer 135:15 183:8 longstanding 159:9 Lonmin's 143:11 149:8 157:12 161:9,12,13 191:1,20 192:14 193:2 looked 201:15 loose 122:24 lose 155:24 loss 117:17 118:11,21 118:25 119:12 125:6 140:25 146:24 157:14 164:22 186:24 lost 119:1,16,18 120:1 148:2 177:11 178:18 193:4 201:23 202:10 lot 178:9,23,25 Louis 113:13 116:12 Louise 115:19 loved 119:16 148:2 low 159:22 191:3 lower 186:3,4 luck 182:9 lunch 162:10 lunge 139:13 lunged 139:10 Lusikisiki 198:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">M</p> <hr/> <p>M 139:19 140:5 machetes 184:25 machine 178:21,22 MacIntosh 129:8 Maenetje 115:12 magnitude 160:18 main 149:20 180:18 maintain 120:20 147:14 maintained 127:8 major 167:21 majority 168:8 172:20 180:21 making 113:10,25 117:10,12 148:21 152:3 163:22 167:3 181:19 193:11 196:19 198:3,12 200:13 Malawi 136:8,8 malicious 157:2 manage 164:14,18,21</p>	<p>manageable 136:21 managed 124:11 131:21 182:11 management 123:15,20 123:23,25 128:21 129:22,23,25 130:9 145:13 148:22 150:5 150:6 161:6,13 168:10 169:6,24,25 170:3 171:6,8,9,13,16 171:21 172:2,6,15 174:4,12,16,20 191:20 193:16 195:10 196:10 management's 123:21 171:10 172:10 manager-employee 195:14 mandate 120:10 128:22 147:13 150:22 mandated 160:24 mandates 122:10 manifest 185:9 manifestly 160:3 manner 152:14 154:21 187:15 188:6 190:9 197:9 map 138:6,8,13 maps 149:3 march 148:7 169:12 170:7,11,17 171:1 marched 156:25 169:23 170:5 171:19 marchers 157:2,4 170:8,23 171:2 marching 170:24 marginalised 176:25 Marikana 112:8 118:12 119:1,10,11 123:5,13 124:18 125:2,16,23 126:13 127:15,17 128:9 141:1,11 143:3 145:7 146:5 151:20 152:18 152:22 157:11 158:13 158:18 159:3,18 160:10 195:12 Marikana/Lonmin 126:3 Marikina 194:6 mark 184:2 marked 138:16,24 139:19 140:5,11 183:9 marks 144:20 Masilo 112:20 mass 156:16 massacre 125:10 193:5 193:12 195:22 196:4 master 167:15 Masutle 116:2 material 153:6 154:15 164:10 materially 158:25 165:7 Mathibedi 115:1</p>
--	--	--	---	--

<p>Mathunjwa 130:17,19 144:13 167:20 169:5 169:11,13 172:5,8,11 172:13,14,18,22,23 173:1,2,4,8,10,11,15 173:19,21,25 174:3,8 174:11,15,18,22,22 175:2,12</p> <p>matter 116:11,23 132:18 152:11 154:20 172:13 176:21 189:18 193:2 199:16 201:15</p> <p>mattered 141:11</p> <p>matters 118:1 128:18 151:18 153:4,15</p> <p>McIntosh 131:17</p> <p>mean 173:4 186:1 202:7</p> <p>meaningfully 187:19</p> <p>means 122:13 168:12 179:24</p> <p>meant 120:9 167:8,9 201:8</p> <p>measurable 121:24</p> <p>measure 131:3 196:2</p> <p>measures 129:17 159:17 167:14</p> <p>media 143:2</p> <p>meet 172:17 174:13</p> <p>meeting 130:8,9 169:7 169:10,13,15,17 172:6 191:20,23,25 192:2,12,14,25 193:3</p> <p>meetings 112:9 156:16</p> <p>member 112:10 121:2 127:6 136:13 202:2</p> <p>members 113:8 115:5 117:9 119:3,8,18,23 119:23 120:24 121:5 122:21,22 123:3,7 124:3,6,6 126:16 127:13,19 128:15 131:12 132:5,21,25 134:10 138:5,15 139:4 140:7,22 142:25 143:6 144:1,4 144:5 145:5,19 146:8 147:9,17 148:18 152:6,13 153:24 154:3,9,25 156:5,15 156:17,20 157:4,8 163:2 165:19 166:15 166:24 167:7,18 168:7,9 176:1 178:8 183:6,14 188:9 190:13 196:1 197:19 197:22 198:11 199:24 201:11</p> <p>membership 146:9,12</p> <p>memorandum 169:6</p> <p>memory 181:6</p> <p>men 199:22,22</p> <p>mentioned 115:24</p> <p>merely 114:12 198:25</p> <p>message 131:4</p> <p>messages 141:18</p>	<p>met 169:19,20,21 171:4 171:8 172:5,22 173:13 196:22</p> <p>method 179:5</p> <p>methods 121:19</p> <p>meticulous 124:20</p> <p>metres 170:8,21 181:25 182:7</p> <p>MEYERFELD 133:13 133:18,22 134:19</p> <p>Meyersfeld 133:14,23</p> <p>Michael 198:16,17</p> <p>microcosm 123:5</p> <p>microphone 112:15,16 133:17</p> <p>migrant 194:8,21,24,25 195:13 196:6 202:13</p> <p>migrants 195:4</p> <p>migratory 195:4</p> <p>milieu 122:16,16 123:8</p> <p>militant 124:24</p> <p>militarised 196:10</p> <p>million 183:20</p> <p>mind 178:13</p> <p>mindful 125:21</p> <p>minds 120:7</p> <p>mine 112:8 119:2,3 123:15 126:8 150:10 151:11,24 153:15 157:12,13,15 158:4,7 158:13,18 159:3,4 161:12 187:23 195:9 195:10,14 196:10</p> <p>Mineral 116:10 122:23 126:6 142:15,17 146:13</p> <p>Minerals 192:5</p> <p>miners 126:10 157:22 177:20 183:2 185:4,8 185:8,10,16,16 186:10 187:13 188:3 188:13,16,16,21 189:5,9,16 190:6 191:22 194:24</p> <p>mines 116:17 152:22 158:6,8,14 159:4 195:7,16</p> <p>mineworkers 119:2,5 122:20,22 141:10 187:22</p> <p>minimum 200:16</p> <p>mining 126:7 142:2,13 142:13 146:14,20 147:4,5 159:20,22 194:2,7</p> <p>Minister 182:20 192:5</p> <p>minor 182:12</p> <p>minutes 131:19 133:3 135:10,13,15 183:23 183:25 192:17,18,20</p> <p>mischievous 195:23</p> <p>misguided 190:11 195:23</p> <p>missed 178:11</p> <p>missing 139:11</p> <p>misuse 200:15</p>	<p>mitigated 143:11</p> <p>mixed 141:18</p> <p>mobile 173:9</p> <p>model 179:2</p> <p>modest 191:9</p> <p>Mogale 112:11,12,21 112:24</p> <p>Mokoena 169:15</p> <p>Mokwena 169:7</p> <p>moment 127:12 177:1 180:19</p> <p>Monday 117:17 127:15 129:18 132:10 148:11 201:6</p> <p>Monday,13 129:8</p> <p>Monene 119:20</p> <p>money 200:3,15</p> <p>monitor 121:17 142:19 146:20</p> <p>monitoring 126:7</p> <p>month 168:5,16 169:25</p> <p>months 183:20</p> <p>moral 146:7</p> <p>morning 112:3 115:17 130:20 133:13,22 156:22 163:9 170:16 172:14,18,21 173:2,8 176:3 202:24</p> <p>mortal 145:12</p> <p>mortem 186:1</p> <p>Motau 114:21</p> <p>mother 202:12</p> <p>motivation 166:7</p> <p>Motwenya 115:19</p> <p>mountain 187:21 188:21,25 190:8,10 191:19 193:14</p> <p>move 133:6,16 136:14 188:14,25</p> <p>movement 146:11 188:24</p> <p>moving 132:12 139:1 162:11</p> <p>mowed 176:10</p> <p>Mpembe 129:7 130:19 174:5,6</p> <p>Mpofu 115:21,22</p> <p>muckraking 126:11</p> <p>Mungu 197:22 201:23</p> <p>murder 177:16</p> <p>murderous 125:18</p> <p>Musi 115:23</p> <p>muti 185:11</p> <p>M-U-N-G-U 201:23</p>	<p>120:14 121:8 122:21 141:9 146:23 151:11 151:19,24 187:22 190:1,25</p> <p>nature 160:19 176:21 183:10</p> <p>near 112:7 149:13 153:15 156:24 158:13 177:18</p> <p>nearby 154:3 157:13 158:4,8,11 176:6</p> <p>necessary 120:2 131:1 181:16 182:21 191:21</p> <p>necessity 184:22 186:14</p> <p>neck 139:11</p> <p>need 121:12 154:18 166:25 183:12 195:15 197:21 201:15</p> <p>needed 201:9</p> <p>needs 146:17</p> <p>negative 160:9</p> <p>negotiate 123:22 129:20 141:15 161:19 168:21 187:18 188:3 193:13</p> <p>negotiated 143:12 168:18 175:21 191:4 191:13 193:16</p> <p>negotiation 160:1</p> <p>negotiations 123:16 145:21 165:12 169:4</p> <p>negotiators 144:18</p> <p>neither 175:14 195:24</p> <p>never 127:16,20 130:18 140:24 168:23 174:22 178:13 192:13</p> <p>new 162:11 192:21</p> <p>Ngalwana 115:1</p> <p>Ngweyi 198:14,15,16 198:17,18</p> <p>Nhlondokop 156:25</p> <p>night 170:16 172:21</p> <p>Noki 131:16</p> <p>non-Lonmin 156:24</p> <p>non-strikers 155:20 156:12</p> <p>normal 121:19</p> <p>normalise 150:25</p> <p>North 112:8 118:20</p> <p>Northern 183:19</p> <p>note 194:12,19</p> <p>noted 125:8</p> <p>notice 193:8</p> <p>notwithstanding 123:24 155:1 159:19</p> <p>Nowili 202:3</p> <p>Noxolo 202:4</p> <p>no-one 162:20</p> <p>Ntinti 165:15</p> <p>Ntsebeza 115:16,17,18 135:3,11,19 183:1,5 184:1 192:20,22 193:10 198:10 202:21</p> <p>Ntsonkota 115:12</p> <p>nuclear 199:12</p>	<p>number 138:11 145:9 153:3 157:4 165:3 167:19 185:5</p> <p>numbers 150:10 189:1</p> <p>numerous 129:6 131:10 136:23 156:16</p> <p>NUM's 153:8 154:15 160:14 165:23 166:10</p> <p>Nyala 131:17</p> <p>Nyalas 144:21</p> <p>N-G-W 198:14</p>
O				
<p>o 136:25 140:11,17</p> <p>obdurate 124:24 137:7</p> <p>object 124:23</p> <p>objective 122:4 187:14 200:21</p> <p>objectives 146:14,20</p> <p>objectors 136:21</p> <p>obligation 118:9 147:8</p> <p>obligations 126:7,8 142:2</p> <p>obliged 121:3</p> <p>obscure 196:13</p> <p>observed 142:6 146:15</p> <p>obtain 149:6 150:18</p> <p>obviously 136:9 147:11 192:1</p> <p>occasion 132:6,18 134:10 147:11 183:10 183:19 200:18</p> <p>occasions 131:6 153:4 169:20</p> <p>occurred 129:5 153:19 165:4</p> <p>October 112:1 153:1,13 153:18 165:19 166:7</p> <p>offer 168:21 172:10,16 173:5,6,17,23 191:10 191:15 201:18</p> <p>offered 191:9 202:2</p> <p>offers 150:14 155:1</p> <p>office 143:3 153:15</p> <p>officer 119:20,20 139:9 139:11,11,12,14,14 139:15,17,18 177:18 178:17 192:7</p> <p>officers 119:5 121:21 123:19 124:21 125:11 127:10 129:7,11,12 129:23 131:22,24 132:9 137:7,10,11,14 137:17,19 140:3,14 144:1,16,24 145:1 148:20 155:11 164:6 171:3,23,25 182:18 185:2 187:25</p> <p>offices 157:1,3 169:23 170:6,9,18,22,25 171:20</p> <p>official 170:9</p> <p>officially 119:1</p> <p>officials 122:21,22 132:22 148:9 152:7 153:24 154:25 156:15</p>				

<p>163:3,10 165:20 170:11 187:24 oh 133:15 181:5 198:21 olden 194:12 once 138:22 198:11 ones 119:16 124:24 148:2 190:19 oneself 194:14 ongoing 152:17,19 open 126:20 132:2 opened 184:21 opening 116:20,22 117:5,10 146:22 147:21 151:5,9,10,10 151:13 163:23 166:12 167:3,8,25 175:24 183:3,4,8,20,22 184:3 202:22 openly 191:7 operate 123:8 operating 121:8,22 operation 124:22 130:25 174:5,8 operational 121:10 operators 149:7 155:16 168:4,7,9,10,14,16,19 168:20,24 169:3,16 169:19,23 170:2,3,5 170:10,12 171:1 175:19 190:22 opportunity 117:1 118:6,17,24 126:12 130:13 134:8,11 163:4 173:10 180:15 182:24 188:17 193:4 197:16 200:23 oral 113:25 175:16 order 114:7 120:20 121:3 127:4,7,12 128:4 147:14 150:24 164:9 178:15 180:3 180:20 182:5 188:5,7 188:12,17 190:2 orderly 187:5 orders 117:14 128:16 178:20 organisation 176:23 organisations 119:9 organised 159:13 169:8 184:13 original 162:1 181:24 182:1 other's 121:16 outcome 122:5,5 125:3 outcomes 121:23 outline 126:12 outlook 120:11 outset 140:23 outside 123:22 124:1 126:4 130:1 141:7,16 143:22 168:11 173:14 175:22 191:8,11,13 overall 122:4 159:22 overboard 178:21 oversight 122:8,12 overwhelming 172:19</p>	<p>overwhelmingly 191:18 ownership 146:18 o'clock 130:19 162:15 162:25 163:1,8,10 166:23 172:18 202:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <hr/> <p>pact 144:18 page 176:21,22 181:11 pages 167:16 pain 175:17 painful 136:10 paint 149:10 pangas 138:17 140:7,12 184:25 paper 178:9 paragraph 118:5 133:6 134:21 136:14 152:5 164:2 176:22 181:10 192:23 196:19 paragraphs 152:11 parameters 143:23 199:6 parcel 200:23 pardon 178:14 181:5 parentless 202:16 parliament 122:9 part 113:16,21 116:23 121:6 122:3,7 125:17 125:19 126:21 138:16 140:5,24 142:5 145:2 147:23 149:1 155:9 159:24 164:5 167:21 180:13 200:23 participate 113:24 134:8 155:24 162:6 participated 170:10 171:1 participates 171:24 participation 134:2,16 169:20 particular 118:14 120:13 152:8 153:13 157:12 158:7,7 164:13,16 176:24 179:22 181:10 particularly 143:15 146:8 168:6 184:23 185:24 particulars 184:12 parties 112:14 113:4 114:6 115:24 116:8 116:21 117:24 124:9 125:25 140:23 141:4 151:14 155:23 158:23 160:20,25 161:4,6 164:8 165:6 166:11 partners 123:9 parts 117:11 party 116:8 133:9,12 176:17 183:13 pass 166:20 passages 180:7 passes 162:19 166:15 166:16,19,25</p>	<p>patently 193:6 patriarchy 199:21 pause 125:8 177:1 pay 161:24 180:10 191:3 197:25 peace 120:16 128:4 165:11 peaceful 123:16 125:4 146:11 peacefully 129:21 170:7 186:23 pellets 186:3 people 112:11 120:6,7 120:8 121:4 130:21 130:23 151:21,22 155:20 162:19 177:10 177:23 179:6,8,9,14 181:3,25 184:7 187:7 187:9 198:5,23 perceived 150:15 153:25 perception 120:7 perform 122:13 126:14 performance 121:25 122:11 period 118:16 147:25 148:15 149:1 150:5 152:21 161:8 165:8 permeates 158:7 permission 114:2 134:15,17 179:15 193:24 perpetrated 148:10 persistent 124:8 person 134:25 139:3,4 139:5,6,9,10,12,12,15 139:16,16,18 140:13 140:16,18,21 182:5 199:3,19 personal 154:14 personnel 144:1 148:23 149:17 164:14,17 persons 115:25 119:4 137:23 139:23 140:11 158:9 163:21 180:12 182:22 199:8 perspective 120:2 persuade 123:18 129:9 129:23 130:11 pertinent 154:12 phone 173:9 photographs 130:5 162:22,23 163:5 166:22 physical 178:17 physically 119:17 pick 198:17 picked 198:19 picture 149:10,25 pistols 129:13 132:7 place 116:7 135:22 152:19 153:17 169:12 177:22 182:8 192:2 201:17 placed 139:7 142:5 158:19,20 164:10</p>	<p>188:21 places 181:24 placing 198:25 plagued 156:1 plan 179:1,1,2,4,10,16 181:12 182:21 planned 178:2 179:12 planning 121:22 124:21 155:9 164:5 Platinum 153:3,16 157:1,13,15 158:4,10 plausible 153:22 play 126:13 140:24 played 117:24 122:18 125:25 126:6 141:5 143:5,17 players 123:9 151:1 PLC 122:19 plea 199:25 200:5 plead 186:18 pleaded 175:7 pleading 130:17 pleasant 113:5 please 112:17 113:4,4 114:6 167:6 190:17 192:20 pleased 113:12 141:11 plus 196:8 point 125:8 128:6 133:21 135:17 138:4 139:2 141:12 145:7 163:25 190:16 194:23 pointed 151:6,6 153:14 194:13 pointing 154:1 policeman 178:12 186:17 police-issue 131:13 policies 126:21 145:12 145:15 181:13 policing 121:15 128:2,5 181:20 policy 117:14 128:16 128:20 181:22 196:15 politely 200:6 poor 176:25 poorer 119:9 POPCRU 113:14 pose 181:11 posing 145:9 position 138:17 152:12 156:13 possessed 185:17 189:10 possession 162:21 186:2 possibility 141:3 159:16 possible 113:11 124:16 140:19 148:5 152:2 193:19 possibly 120:8 181:11 post 186:1 posted 127:16 post-apartheid 185:20 post-mortem 185:24</p>	<p>189:21 potential 154:19 poverty 196:6 powers 122:10 166:6 practical 199:9 practically 179:13 practice 188:7 practices 126:21 145:15 practitioner 114:8 pre 177:9 preceded 131:3 precedent 179:25 precedents 179:18 preceding 124:13 149:19 precinct 153:16 precipitated 188:24 precisely 179:9 precondition 191:19 predictable 189:4,4 196:5 premature 176:11 premeditate 125:6 preparation 155:9 164:4 preparations 154:15 preparatory 154:11 181:19 prepared 123:21 130:1 137:19 141:15 151:13 174:13 175:4 preparing 202:2 presence 114:12 132:16 164:20 present 112:13 113:9 113:14 114:8 116:13 134:11 135:13 147:20 153:9 154:11 160:24 164:3 165:24 180:15 presentation 117:13 123:11 127:21 128:19 184:21 presentations 128:12 presently 153:23 preserved 125:5 president 116:3 144:14 166:8 167:20 President's 123:4 125:21 press 202:15 pressed 193:22 prevent 120:19 147:13 156:10 170:24 180:10 prevented 170:22 previous 170:20 172:24 173:5,23 202:18 previously 114:11 115:25 pre-1994 195:1 primary 151:18 190:18 principals 173:1 principle 166:3 principles 121:6 prior 188:10 191:1 proactive 121:22 162:4</p>
---	---	---	---	--

<p>probably 186:9 probe 158:18 probing 160:23 problem 173:18 problems 177:23 procedures 121:8 156:9 196:9 proceed 114:7 116:20 134:21 163:23 164:3 167:6 192:20 proceeded 129:10 170:7 proceeding 170:23 proceedings 112:1,6 113:17,24 134:3,8,25 152:19,25 182:16 197:1,12 200:17 process 126:20 132:21 132:23 141:8,16 148:12 149:2 processes 156:9 157:16 159:9,21 160:2 161:11 162:8 195:8 processing 163:11 professional 127:13 profitably 113:7 profound 152:24 185:15 profoundly 160:8 programme 121:24 progress 132:22 142:20 projectile 186:5 projects 146:16 promise 183:14 202:17 promote 195:15 promotes 176:23 promoting 122:25 pronounced 179:21 proper 121:18 126:2 141:5 148:5 158:25 165:7 properly 133:20 158:19 163:13 property 120:22 125:4 127:3 143:25 145:10 146:25 147:15 151:23 154:5 156:3 proportionality 178:19 propose 117:25 128:19 138:13 167:3 proposing 166:8 prospect 202:15 prostrate 189:17 protagonists 149:21 protect 120:21 127:3 147:14 protected 131:9 protection 150:15,16 155:25 protest 141:14 143:21 147:7 protesters 124:24 125:20 129:1,9 136:17,19,21 137:2,9 137:11,13,19,21 139:20 143:16 144:23</p>	<p>144:23 145:8,22,25 protestor 144:19 protestors 123:23 124:15 129:18,20,21 129:24 130:1,2,11,12 130:14,18,24 131:1,4 131:5,15,20 132:1,2,6 132:8 140:4 141:13 141:18 144:6,15,17 protests 159:5 protocol 146:11 protracted 158:2 proved 143:9 145:13 provide 121:18 148:2 159:17 178:20 provided 158:1 159:12 161:15 166:10 184:13 193:19 providers 149:24 provides 159:15 providing 150:16 Province 112:8 118:21 Provincial 173:8,9,15 173:18 174:7,9 180:2 provisional 116:2 provisions 128:23 136:25 201:1 psychologically 119:17 public 120:3,20,25 134:12 143:2 144:1 147:14 151:19 163:2 166:15,24 188:5,7 190:1 publicly 122:11 published 121:1 166:9 purpose 138:13 160:21 165:10 purposes 160:25 pursued 159:25 put 112:16 113:4 114:6 114:10,14 116:19,22 130:21 133:9,11,12 170:18 179:3,4,24 190:16 197:21 201:10 putting 197:7</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <p>QC 183:17 question 118:16 142:14 143:4 148:15 149:1 150:5 161:9 165:1 180:24 181:11 201:5 questions 160:11 164:3 182:8 quite 112:4 135:1 quote 131:18 192:8 quotes 130:3 Qwelane 198:21 Q_W_E 198:21</p> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <p>radical 195:12 radio 129:14 raised 160:11 raises 142:14 ran 136:19 176:8</p>	<p>184:25 range 122:1 154:2 160:10 ranged 190:23 rank 119:2 rational 167:13 rationally 186:18 RDOs 157:23 161:12 161:18,25 190:23 191:5,8,9,10,13,18 RDO's 150:7 155:16 191:2 reached 123:25 160:1 read 133:21 176:20 177:4 178:4,9,16 180:17 181:11 readily 179:24 reading 118:4 180:16 186:7,25 ready 182:17,17 real 141:3 realisation 146:20 reality 120:10 really 141:11 176:21 201:3,14 reaping 195:12 reason 112:5 136:3 156:21 166:23 197:24 reasonable 125:13 167:13 reasonably 132:4 187:19 reasons 156:4 190:21 199:9 202:23 recall 178:23 receive 167:2 received 130:14 135:23 172:10 receiving 121:13 receptive 172:16 recognised 124:2 141:10 161:19 188:7 recommence 135:15 recommendation 145:17 146:1,10,19 recommendations 117:25 145:6 150:22 152:4 176:12 reconciliation 183:12 197:11 reconsider 145:14 record 112:16 113:5 114:6,10,15 116:7,20 116:22 133:10,12,20 138:2 177:22 198:25 recording 144:24 recordings 149:3 records 128:8 recount 167:21 recovered 132:8 recovering 119:17 recovery 147:2 recriminations 125:24 recur 141:3 recurrence 150:25 redeem 200:19</p>	<p>reduce 195:22 refer 176:20 179:17,25 180:4,6 reference 117:23 122:17 142:1 152:5 158:14 160:24 165:6 165:23,25 166:8 referred 135:18 reflect 120:14 reflects 123:4 refrain 123:21 151:4,5 refusal 144:6 refuse 145:20 refused 129:10,25 141:13 168:21 170:1 173:2,20 174:6 191:12,24 regard 113:22 132:24 136:16 142:7,20 156:13 158:9 164:13 166:6 180:10 182:4 regarding 128:19 136:12 154:16 157:6 regardless 127:18 regime 159:19 194:10 regret 118:18,19,24 119:12 146:24,25 183:11 regrettably 125:20 132:5 regulated 160:1,2 regulates 159:15 regulating 146:11 regulation 136:24 reiterates 146:24 rejected 168:21 191:10 relates 138:11 relating 139:25 190:6 relation 146:8 152:10 164:4 166:14 relations 125:1 147:4 159:12 160:8,13 161:3 195:14 relationships 150:25 relative 197:22 relevant 153:4 Reliance 142:5 relief 202:7 reluctance 154:9,10 rely 121:9 188:2 189:25 remain 142:9 194:18 remained 125:3 137:7 194:10,21 remains 126:20 147:12 159:22 remarkably 191:12 remarks 117:12 118:8 146:22 196:19 reminds 194:14 remove 124:24 removed 120:8 127:15 145:2 render 127:12 renounced 172:7 173:7 repeated 140:9 164:16 164:19 169:13</p>	<p>repeatedly 164:22 191:22 replicate 134:5 report 119:21 122:10 156:21 176:19 186:1 reported 130:24 143:1 152:7 172:15 reporting 156:6 reports 139:25 140:19 185:24 186:1 189:21 represent 184:10,16,17 198:6 representation 116:5 representative 112:24 112:25 133:25 183:23 representatives 112:10 112:13 113:4 123:15 148:15 149:22 163:3 164:8,12 169:2 192:15 193:3,13,15 200:11 represented 117:24 125:25 154:1 195:25 representing 113:14 116:7 150:19 represents 116:1 123:5 Republic 120:12,21 147:15 159:11 194:15 request 116:3 169:13 169:18 175:5,5 198:3 198:8 199:4 requested 116:21 requests 145:22 164:19 require 134:17 163:2 165:10 166:15 195:12 202:13 required 158:17 166:21 188:15 requirement 199:14,19 requirements 181:22 requires 133:9 requiring 153:4 research 183:17 reside 158:4 159:5 residence 153:17 residences 154:7 residential 129:16 residents 119:6 158:11 resist 194:20 resisted 170:23 185:4 resisting 129:2 resolutely 192:9 resolution 125:4 resolve 123:10 169:16 resolving 174:24 resort 124:16 159:16 resource 120:14 122:23 resources 114:11 116:10 126:6 142:15 142:17 145:16 146:13 176:17 177:5 192:8 200:1 respect 128:9 178:3 182:21 respected 190:14 respectful 160:14</p>
---	---	---	---	---

<p>200:20 respectfully 193:24 responded 168:14 171:14 responding 137:20 response 127:12 131:24 137:5 138:23 140:2 160:10 161:16 169:17 171:10,13 190:10,22 191:1 192:4 responsibilities 147:10 responsibility 120:19 142:16 181:15,17 190:18,24 196:14 responsible 140:20 147:3 176:12 182:22 190:20 198:12 restoring 195:17 restrain 179:23 restraint 200:10 result 119:9 153:11 154:5 170:11 171:3 187:4 195:20 196:5 resulted 124:20 resulting 154:4 155:20 results 127:8 128:8 resume 201:7 resumes 133:4 162:16 162:18 resumption 112:6 retaining 128:2 retreated 136:18 138:21 return 156:7 162:5 173:24 returned 137:10,11,17 140:15 171:11,12 172:8 173:3,7,11 175:2 returning 172:19 reveal 140:2 revenge 177:15,17,21 177:22 revert 120:4 review 196:17 revision 145:23 revolution 193:19 rhetorically 179:4 rifle 129:14 right 113:19 118:13 143:20,21,21,22 146:2 147:7 156:1 177:8 186:3 187:11 rightful 147:6 rights 113:14 122:12 134:1,4,7,10 145:20 155:19 176:23 177:6 177:7 202:9 rights-based 202:8 rise 118:25 123:1 150:24 156:13 risen 141:12 rising 143:5 ritual 144:8 rival 143:4 rivalry 126:3 142:22</p>	<p>143:12 robbed 129:12 132:9 rock 149:7 155:15 168:4,6,8,10,14,16,19 168:24 169:2,16,19 169:22 170:2,3,5,10 170:12,25 175:19 190:22 role 126:5 140:23 143:4 143:17 151:1 153:9 154:9 160:14 162:11 164:1 roles 117:23 122:18 125:24 141:5 role-players 140:24 room 135:22 136:6 root 194:3,7 rooted 159:10 roots 157:11 roughly 170:21 route 171:21,22 188:22 Roux 116:16,17,18 Royal 112:11,22 rubber 129:15 131:7,9 131:13 rule 176:24 run 139:5 running 138:25 182:3 rural 195:6 Rustenburg 152:23 158:15 163:13 193:15 R12 149:6 168:5 169:25 R4s 178:21 179:14 R5 129:13 R5s 178:21 179:14 R6s 178:22 179:15 R750 168:15 <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <hr/> sabre-rattling 145:11 sacrosanct 177:7,7 sad 202:15 sadly 187:17 188:8 sadness 132:18 safe 121:4,19 122:6 170:14 safely 136:11 safety 127:3 154:14,19 154:25 salary 145:21 149:6 150:7 sanction 177:16 sanctioned 178:6 SAPS 155:9 156:10 164:5,23 171:23 172:2,6,15 173:14,19 174:4,14,15,23 175:1 175:10,14,24 176:1,7 181:19 184:17,18,20 185:1,3,7,9,13,15 186:14,21 187:1,15 187:25 188:13,19 190:3,18 SAPS's 190:7,10 satisfied 161:21 saturation 121:21</p>	<p>Saturday 148:9 save 127:17 146:4 saw 176:4 saying 129:25 177:19 190:15 201:8 says 180:4 SC 114:9,16,19,25 115:5,10,18 116:11 117:8 118:7 133:8 134:22 135:11,19 136:15 137:6 147:22 151:12 162:13 163:24 167:5,7 176:19 177:4 181:5,9 183:5 184:1 188:12 192:22 193:10 198:10 scale 200:17 scant 150:16 scenario 124:20 scene 117:20,21 132:8 132:12 133:6 136:16 136:18,19 137:25 138:3 145:1,3,4 185:1 185:5 187:21,25 188:19 Schalk 114:20 scold 173:10 scope 123:4 scores 144:16 Scott 179:4,10 scratched 178:13 screen 128:12 scuffle 171:2 search 202:19 searching 202:13 second 148:3 149:7 152:17 161:5 175:2 secondly 155:5 198:6 secretary 113:18 153:2 165:18 section 124:14 sector 147:5 sectoral 119:14 sectors 126:23 160:19 secure 120:21 121:4 127:3 141:20 147:15 166:5 secured 133:1 154:19 security 119:3 120:14 122:2 125:1 127:4 144:1 148:13,19,22 149:17 150:4 164:14 164:17,21,23 170:22 170:24,25 171:2,3 192:4 see 113:5,12 114:17 115:17 132:11 133:21 134:22 144:19,20,22 174:4,21 181:2 184:3 184:5 198:8 Seedat 174:19,21 seek 120:17 125:16 141:2 142:12 149:10 150:16 186:14 189:25 193:24 196:13 seeking 197:16</p>	<p>seen 130:17 137:12 178:12 182:13,14 sees 194:4 selected 199:22 self 170:12 186:19 191:12 self-defence 137:15 self-disciplined 121:13 Sello 115:1 Semenya 114:25 115:2 115:3 116:25,25 117:5,8 118:2,7 132:11 133:5,8 134:20,22 136:13,15 137:6 147:19 178:1 send 131:4 senior 114:8 123:19 124:21 129:7,22 148:22 182:17 seniority 114:7 sense 118:9,18 120:3 sensitive 143:15 sent 141:18 184:4 187:22 sentiment 119:25 156:14 separately 130:10 September 165:11,13 165:15 166:10 series 118:20 serious 194:19 serve 120:9 127:7 169:6 served 168:1 service 117:7,11 118:10 118:14,17,19,22,23 119:4,18 120:12,19 120:23 121:1,3,25 122:3,9,12,14,19 123:7,12,14,17 124:4 124:8,11,14 125:3,6 125:18,19 126:14,17 126:20,22,22,25 127:1,6,9,11,13,17,23 128:1,20,22 129:20 130:7,9 131:25 138:5 139:4,24 145:14 146:23 147:10,12 148:19,24 149:16,22 150:3,10 171:23 184:7 185:19 187:9 services 121:7 148:14 149:24 162:12 164:2 Service's 146:24 servicing 191:12 set 119:10 121:17 126:14 182:15 200:21 Setswana 135:24 136:2 setting 117:13 120:3 settings 195:6 settled 175:19 settlement 129:17 149:14 176:7 188:23 settlements 154:4 158:5 165:21 severely 119:21 129:11</p>	<p>shaft 149:8 Shangaan 136:2 share 190:21 sharp 131:22 137:10,14 137:17 138:11 143:3 196:16 202:7 sharply 154:8 she's 136:9,11 202:2 shoot 139:14,16 180:12 182:5 186:17 shooting 129:5 139:2 140:20 144:19 145:1 153:19 155:11 164:7 170:19 175:13 181:20 181:24 shop 154:6 165:14 short 190:4 shortly 144:25 shot 137:13,15 138:22 139:15 140:10,18 153:16 170:9,25 171:24 175:11 177:19 178:13 179:7,9 180:22 182:2 184:24 185:4 186:10 189:5 189:16 196:1 shotgun 129:14 186:3 shots 125:13 137:7,17 138:20,24 139:22 shouted 138:19 139:4 show 125:18,20 129:4 130:16 131:25 136:17 141:6 180:20 186:7 187:12 188:18 191:17 192:3 193:18 194:3 shown 130:6 152:13 181:24 186:9 shows 146:5 Shozi 114:22 shrubs 176:8 sides 119:15 sign 144:18 signed 165:11,13 significant 156:2 159:20 164:20 178:8 similar 165:16 179:20 simple 167:14 simply 161:20 single 178:12 182:12 196:22 sinister 192:11 Sir 184:13 197:21 198:7 sit 162:24 163:1 199:25 200:6 sitting 138:8 163:7 201:5 sittings 133:1 situation 116:3 122:25 124:17,18 125:1,5 126:13 127:1 128:25 145:14 159:6 164:21 179:6 182:10 188:5 192:9 199:20 situations 123:6 179:20 188:8</p>
--	--	--	--	--

<p>six 117:11 153:19 Sizwe 202:4 slightly 135:15 small 175:12 185:5 smaller 136:22 smoothen 198:2 social 113:9 122:15 159:2,23 194:6 196:16 199:5,6 society 120:4 123:6,10 126:18,24 127:6,23 128:2 187:6,8 202:8 202:17,17 socio-economic 194:1 202:9 solely 154:14 solve 177:22 solving 195:11 somebody 194:13 199:18 soon 155:19 sorry 180:23 sort 178:2 sorts 120:5 sought 188:19 202:19 source 154:13 South 117:6,10 118:9 120:11,13,14,19,25 121:2,5 122:6,19 123:12 125:2,6,17 126:24 127:6 128:1 133:25 134:3,10 146:23 148:14,19,24 149:15,21 150:3,9 159:11,18 160:13 162:11 164:2 171:23 179:19 182:14 184:7 185:20 187:9 194:11 194:15 196:16 space 131:19 187:11 189:1 spanned 176:4 speak 129:21 140:1 170:2 171:10 174:8 spear 139:3,10 spears 138:18 140:7,8 140:13 144:11 special 164:9 166:18,20 specific 137:11 160:21 195:3 specifically 123:17 140:1 speed 125:9 speedy 147:2 spell 112:17 spent 113:7 spirit 126:19 197:11,16 spoil 183:13 spoke 173:8 spread 152:22 square 180:7 stability 128:4 159:17 Stadium 156:25 stage 125:5 132:13 139:25 140:19 147:23 150:13 151:7 153:20</p>	<p> 155:2 162:10 176:11 182:19 184:5 188:4,6 stages 123:14 stagnant 142:9 standard 121:8,17 142:16 standards 190:4,5 standing 117:14 128:16 178:20 180:3 stand-off 120:5 start 112:3,5 117:12 starts 116:25 state 118:8 140:23 192:7 197:16 199:4 200:11,25 stated 119:23 162:2 statement 117:10,11 133:7 147:21 151:10 163:23 166:12 167:4 167:20,21,25,25 183:4 184:3 185:7 196:20 201:22 statements 116:20,22 117:6 148:22 149:8 150:2,14 154:17 165:4 167:17,19 177:18 180:11 189:14 stationed 185:2 statutes 128:23 stay 171:16 175:8 steadfastly 141:13 steam 173:22 step 186:25 191:25,25 195:17 201:2 stepped 123:12 steps 127:9,11 152:15 156:10 162:4 181:19 steward 165:14 stewards 154:6 stipulates 152:6 stomach 139:7 stop 118:5 129:16 131:8 138:20,23 139:5 stopped 139:2 171:23 story 167:8,9,10,11,12 167:21,23 168:2 182:2 201:22 straight 163:1,7 stress 120:2 strict 179:23 strictly 180:5 strike 141:23 148:6,6 150:9 155:4,6,14,15 155:18 156:1,6,16,18 157:10,24 158:2 159:16 160:3 161:25 162:3,6 164:16,19 165:14 166:1 175:18 190:23 191:24 193:6 193:17 194:4,6 strikers 156:7,11,14,23 162:6 164:24 170:17 171:5,6,9,11,13,14,19 172:1,7,9,10,15,19,20 173:3,6,22,25 174:14</p>	<p> 174:16,21,24 175:4,5 175:7,11,15,21 176:5 184:24 188:25 strikes 142:1 155:22 156:1 striking 148:8,13,18,24 149:14,21 150:7 177:20 183:2 186:10 187:24 188:13 191:18 192:15 193:4,14 195:25 striven 202:9 strongly 193:11 194:14 struck 141:7,9 structural 196:15 structure 122:3 196:8 structures 123:22 124:2 126:5 130:2 143:14 161:5 162:8 168:12 175:23 191:6 191:8,11,14 Stuart 115:19 Studies 133:24 stun 129:15 131:7 subject 116:23 subjected 120:24 122:9 176:14 submission 128:7 141:3 151:10,13 154:17 160:14 166:10 177:5 177:8,15 190:9 193:11 200:5,8,14,20 submissions 113:25 134:12 151:2 155:1 159:7 177:25 180:18 192:24 201:14 submit 138:10 148:5 177:12 185:19,21 186:12,15,19 188:4 188:24 189:3 192:2 192:25 196:4 submits 158:13 submitted 164:1 166:7 176:19 178:11 187:7 subparagraph 151:14 subparagraphs 152:9 subsequent 133:1 143:1 154:2 155:12 165:2,9,19 166:2 192:10 substantial 192:1 substantially 194:10,21 substantive 157:19 subtext 185:15 Subtle 124:7 subtract 197:4 suffered 127:5 sufficiently 158:21 suggest 113:17,22 133:16 suggested 179:23 suggestion 179:7 189:11 suggests 120:5 summary 168:2 186:5 Sunday 148:10 183:18</p>	<p>superiority 185:9 supervision 121:14 supervisors 119:3,5 supply 173:20 support 131:25 157:24 162:1 supporters 177:13 suppose 197:24 suppressing 127:11 Supreme 180:1 sure 136:9 177:11 200:3 surfaced 149:7 surged 136:23 surround 184:6 surrounded 176:2 surrounding 158:8,16 165:20 survivors 128:11 suspect 151:6 sustained 186:6,7 194:9 194:23 sustaining 195:5 Swazi 132:24 Swaziland 132:22,25 195:1 synchronisation 135:7 system 122:4 160:12,16 194:8,21 195:14,18 202:8,13</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <hr/> <p>tack 191:7 Tactical 137:4 take 112:14 113:16 132:13,13 135:22 151:10 152:16,19 156:10 162:10,25 163:2,9,15,19 171:21 181:14,17 182:8 189:13 192:2,19 193:21 196:7,14 199:5 202:16 taken 135:5 162:23 163:5 167:14,17 182:18 185:11 takers 179:5 takes 147:23 talk 171:17 172:3,18 173:6 174:2,6,16,20 175:4 talked 183:18 197:12 talking 166:22 194:12 tame 141:25 targeted 127:11 153:23 task 121:21 184:4 187:8 189:13 197:7 tasks 121:20 tax 200:3 taxpayer 200:2 taxpayer's 200:15 tea 132:13 135:4,6 162:25 team 131:24 137:5 150:19 175:12 Teargas 129:15 131:6</p>	<p>technical 131:24 telephone 174:18 television 135:23 136:7 tell 112:18 167:8,9,12 167:23,24 174:15 183:16 telling 163:7 tells 167:21 201:22 ten 124:12 177:10 tender 116:5 tension 152:20 tensions 123:18 141:12 143:5 188:19 term 117:21 termed 119:1 terms 117:23 120:9 121:23 122:17 152:5 152:15 157:19 160:24 165:6,22,24 166:8 178:4 179:10 202:6 terrible 193:22 Terry 114:21 tested 121:19 testify 148:6 testimony 153:6 Thando 115:12 thank 112:23 113:3,9 113:15 114:5,23 115:3,8,13,21,22 116:14,18 117:3,4,8 118:2 134:14,18,19 135:19 136:13,15 147:17,19,22 151:8 151:12 163:24 166:13 176:16 178:24 181:7 182:24,25 183:5 192:22 196:20 198:10 202:20,20,21 thankful 201:1 Thanks 193:9 that's 113:6 180:13 190:16 193:1 198:8 theme 147:24 151:4 182:16 thereof 152:8 166:22 there'll 199:15 there's 116:19 193:7 199:12 they're 113:11 thing 200:14 things 138:12 194:17 200:18 202:16 think 112:14 114:6,7,9 116:24,25 132:15,19 136:14 162:9 177:2,9 178:9 180:23 190:16 194:16 199:14 Third 148:5 thirdly 155:8 thorough 152:2 thought 167:23 170:14 thoughts 119:14 thousands 167:16 threat 145:10 threaten 128:4 threatened 144:24</p>
--	---	--	--	---

189:11 three 115:24 131:6 137:25 173:13 183:19 189:10 202:18 thrown 178:20 throws 196:16 Thursday 117:19 118:12,13 120:1 124:18 129:6 130:20 130:22 142:24 145:3 149:11,12 175:3 till 163:8 Tim 115:7 188:11 time 112:4,5 119:14 123:25 129:5 143:16 149:10 154:12 155:11 164:6 167:15 169:14 173:12 175:2 183:16 188:1 190:15 194:16 197:17 198:4 times 122:8 timeslot 183:24 time-based 175:16 timing 187:15 190:9 Tipp 115:10,11 151:9 151:12 162:13 163:22 163:24 166:13 today 112:13 116:13 118:24 119:9 131:18 162:19,19 167:22 201:3,4 told 133:9 173:16 174:15 182:2 183:17 183:22 185:12 198:20 200:7,14 tomorrow 162:20 163:9 166:20,20 168:1 202:22,24 tone 117:13 topic 152:17 162:11 194:20 torch 174:10 torched 144:22 total 186:2 touch 128:5 town 163:4 townships 158:5 traced 194:8 trade 124:2 141:10 143:5 148:14 169:7 177:13 tradition 199:10 202:6 traditional 199:14 traffic 112:4 tragedy 118:21 119:1 119:12,18 141:4 142:21 143:9,18 145:7 146:5 151:3 160:10 tragic 112:7 117:17,24 118:11 123:2 124:19 125:22 144:25 150:24 151:20 157:10 186:20 192:11 tragically 193:4,21 196:13	training 128:19 145:15 transcribers 112:17 transcript 133:21 transpired 150:1 trauma 128:13 travel 199:11,11,20 travelled 193:15 travelling 199:18 treacherous 128:25 treated 188:6,8 trend 142:10 tried 123:14,17 124:4 127:17 174:3,11,23 176:3,5 180:10 trigger 196:11 tripped 139:17 TRT 137:2,4 176:10 truth 120:11 186:20 196:13 197:2,10,13 try 131:8 184:2 197:7 trying 129:20 147:11 189:7 Tsepo 202:3 Tuesday 129:18 150:10 turn 117:20 126:25 165:22 178:21 179:14 Twala 165:17 two 112:9 115:15 119:18 123:19 129:11 129:13 132:7 138:15 138:24 140:7,9 143:10 144:16,24 161:2 170:10,25 171:3,24,25 177:14 177:19 195:21 197:21 199:8 200:16 two-way 129:14 two-year 157:17 type 145:13 typical 186:1	understanding 126:10 126:17 150:2 153:21 184:18,23 193:7 understands 158:9 undertake 173:4 undertaken 160:15 undertaken 124:10 160:20 undertaking 121:2 172:23 undertook 172:17,25 174:21 underway 134:6 underwent 144:9 undesirable 160:17 unenviable 189:12 unfold 167:10 unfolded 147:25 148:4 149:4,9,16 150:8 161:8 unforeseen 126:18 unfortunate 118:20 193:21 195:20 196:12 unfortunately 177:10 195:23 196:11 unfounded 125:15 Unhappily 179:19 180:5 unheard 179:12 unilateral 157:20 168:16 unilaterally 168:15 175:22 unintended 124:19 union 113:14 122:20,21 124:3 126:3 141:10 141:10 143:2,12 146:12 148:14 151:11 151:24 156:15 159:13 169:21 177:13 187:22 187:23 191:8,11,14 195:24 unions 123:19 130:10 141:8 143:5,10 144:3 146:6,10,12 169:2,8 169:15 175:20 195:21 196:8 unique 179:19 Unit 136:20 units 128:20 146:18 181:20 unlawful 152:14 156:10 178:3 190:12 unlawfully 184:17 187:10 unlock 197:10 unprecedented 127:24 147:11 unprotected 141:23 155:4,5,14,15,22 156:5,18,23 157:10 157:24 158:2 160:3 161:6,25 162:3 165:14 166:1 unqualified 137:22 154:22,24	unreasonable 190:12 unreformed 194:10,22 unrest 148:10 158:12 195:12 unseemly 126:11 unstoppable 125:7 unsuccessful 168:23 174:25 unsuccessfully 175:21 unsustainable 160:7 untenable 199:20 unwillingness 154:13 un-refuted 202:11 uphold 120:22 121:3 127:4 147:16 upping 141:23 upsetting 143:13 upward 142:10 urged 156:5,9 urgent 195:15 use 118:23 124:15 138:13 157:8 177:21 178:14 179:5 181:18 189:8,11 200:19 usually 199:13	173:7 177:12 178:3 192:1 violent 141:23 142:1,22 142:24 179:24 virtually 132:1 visited 118:21 153:18 vital 154:24 volatility 152:19 volley 189:18 volume 200:12
			W	
			wage 141:7,14,20 142:11 143:12 145:24 157:21 159:20,24 165:12 168:5,20 169:3 171:7 174:2 193:17 wages 142:10,12 157:18 159:22 wait 135:1 waiting 191:23 wake 161:13 walk 127:1 130:22 walked 139:5 walking 140:15 want 112:2 113:9 114:12,13,14 120:16 133:15,20 136:10 162:5 166:14 176:25 177:4 178:23 180:17 192:17 196:24 197:4 197:6 198:22 200:5 200:15 201:10 wanted 156:20 168:4 169:23,25 172:12 179:1 180:17,23,25 181:1 191:19 196:23 wanting 169:6 war 182:10 warning 138:20,23 warnings 140:9 Warrant 119:19,20 watch 197:1 watching 113:20 134:9 134:15 136:7 water 131:7 137:1 way 117:9 118:8 121:12 124:25 129:12 134:16 136:8 171:21,22 178:18 180:13 188:8 197:25 202:7 ways 134:25 136:9 154:18 186:9 190:4 weapons 130:21,23 131:22 136:25 137:15 139:8 145:11 160:4 164:25 188:16 189:8 wearing 131:10 Wednesday 129:19 130:7 149:19 201:5,6 week 112:9 119:19 125:2 weighing 199:1 welcome 113:6,12 118:17	
	U			
	ultimately 141:24 167:14 193:16,18 ultimatum 175:16 188:15 unable 137:22 140:1 unacceptable 160:6 unaffiliated 169:2 unarmed 170:6 unavailable 174:10 unaware 168:25 uncertainty 165:24 uncomfortable 197:5 uncompromising 122:8 undemocratic 196:7,9 underlying 194:1 195:11 undermining 157:16 161:10 underscore 119:12 understand 112:9,12 113:8,16,20 115:15 118:3 132:16,17 135:20,25 148:3 163:10 181:3 200:13			
			V	
			vacant 202:1 vaguely 144:10 valid 162:19 valuable 127:24 values 121:6 various 119:9,13 122:10 123:13,14 125:25 128:7,20,23 128:23 136:20 145:6 153:14 158:23 165:5 vast 180:21 vehicle 173:20 vehicles 144:22 veld 182:7 Venda 136:2 venue 135:5,18 vermin 185:17,18,18 version 116:22 185:22 versions 157:6 vicinity 140:13,17 157:3 158:6 159:3 165:16 video 144:19,25 149:3 Vier 194:14 view 156:12 157:10 159:2 165:3,23 viewed 148:4 views 154:23 vigilance 121:18 146:21 vigour 146:21 villages 158:5 violated 190:5 violence 124:12 128:8 148:16 150:8 152:17 152:20 155:18 156:2 156:11,14,19 157:14 160:5 162:3 164:15 164:18,22 172:8	

<p>welcomed 122:13 151:25 well-founded 191:2 went 172:8 173:12,19 173:21 Western 112:8 118:20 153:2,15 156:25 westwards 137:2 we'll 194:3 202:22 we're 113:12 117:9 we've 149:5 178:10 192:20 what's 117:1 whilst 182:3 185:4 187:13 189:16 190:18 wholly 186:13 188:4 who'll 113:23 who's 144:8 192:19 who've 148:2 widow 199:17 widows 199:10,23 wielding 160:4 wild 182:7 wilful 125:17 Willem 116:16 willing 193:20 willingness 161:23 Wilson 115:19 winner 196:7 wire 131:3,6 176:4,6,8 176:9 188:20 wisdom 202:18 wish 113:17,24 119:12 134:5 163:15,19 177:22 183:3 wishes 116:6,19 119:16 133:11,12 147:2,5 withdrawal 173:17 withdrawing 173:5 withdrawn 173:23 witness 148:22 150:14 153:6 167:17 175:12 witnessed 148:25 witnesses 113:25 114:1 150:11,13,15 154:10 154:17,19 176:14 182:11 Wonderkop 153:17 154:3 165:20 170:13 won't 162:25 166:20 word 183:20 words 172:12 work 122:3 151:15 152:12 154:11,21,23 156:7,21,22 159:23 162:5 163:17 171:11 172:8 173:3,7,24 200:12 202:5 worker 202:1 workers 123:20 124:1 126:4 141:7,19 142:4 142:12 143:13,20,22 147:4,5 148:8,13,18 148:20,24 149:14,21 151:11,24 159:4 177:23 187:2,19,23</p>	<p>187:25 188:1,20 192:15 193:4,14,20 195:25 working 163:13,19 workplace 196:7 works 122:1 work-in-progress 198:24 world 179:13 worldwide 121:7 worry 166:24 wouldn't 183:13 wounded 182:1 wounds 180:22 186:5 writing 114:1 169:13 written 113:18 121:2 151:13 163:25 167:24 175:16 185:6 192:23 wrong 186:9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p>Xolile 202:4</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <p>year 194:20 years 159:22 181:6 194:11,22 202:3,4,4,4 202:5 Yona 198:14,15 you're 114:18 115:17 118:4 132:11 162:11 you've 114:15 132:16 180:16 Y-O-N-A 198:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Z</p> <p>Zameka 197:22 201:23 Z-A-M-E-K-A 201:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <p>000 123:7 124:23 129:1 09:37 112:2 09:57 119:25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>1 117:20 136:18,19 145:1,3 147:24 151:4 153:12 165:11 176:21 184:23 185:1 190:11 1N 140:10 1.1 182:15 1.24 182:15 1.25 183:20 1.4 152:5 1.4.1 152:9 1.4.2 152:9 1.4.3 152:9 10 121:1 148:7 155:20 169:9,18,22 170:6,7 10:17 124:17 10:37 129:10 11 120:13 151:20 155:7 156:22 165:15 170:5 170:15 11th 148:9 11:16 133:5</p>	<p>11:36 139:24 11:56 144:22 12 135:12 166:9 170:16 177:11 202:4 12th 148:10 12:16 150:6 12:36 156:4 12:56 161:12 13 117:18,18 129:4,18 132:10 137:13,25 171:4,18 202:3 13th 127:15 148:11 192:6 13:30 130:25 14 129:19 165:17 172:1 178:10 186:10 197:14 14th 150:11 14:01 162:17 14:21 169:11 14:41 175:14 15 129:19 130:7 133:3 135:10,15 155:21 172:5,21 183:22,25 15h30 131:2 15th 149:20 15:01 181:9 15:21 187:5 15:41 192:16 16 118:13 124:18 129:6 130:20,23 132:6 142:24 143:1 145:3 148:1 151:20 152:21 155:7,10,12 159:1 160:6 164:5 165:5 166:2 167:10 168:22 169:3 170:15 172:21 173:13 175:3,14,18 175:24 176:3,13 186:3 190:3 194:25 16th 117:19 149:12 178:13,18 179:12 180:8 181:14,21 183:2 184:7,9 187:2 192:13 193:1,22 195:19 201:24 16:01 198:1 160 123:7 17 202:3 17th 177:10 178:13 18 165:13 194:11,22 1880's 194:9 1995 159:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>2 117:22 132:12 133:6 136:16,18,23 138:4 145:4 153:13,18 162:15 165:12 176:22 176:22 185:5 186:4 190:11 200 140:4 2005 121:1 2009 142:18 2010 192:6 21 168:5,6,6 183:1 184:11</p>	<p>2102 155:21 22 112:1 23 141:6 143:12 27 192:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3 117:21 122:5 124:23 129:1 136:16,20 137:1,14,24 138:3,4 138:14,17 165:14 186:4 190:11 202:4 3rd 131:19 191:8 30 164:2 3000 179:6,13 34 178:18 182:12 184:6 184:9 35 196:19</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4 162:25 163:1,8 166:23 181:11 190:11 44 151:21 45 133:6 134:21 136:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>5 153:1 165:18 190:12 5:30 153:19 50 196:8 500 149:6 168:5 169:25 170:8,21</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <p>6 163:10 165:11 6PM 153:19 66 159:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>70 151:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">8</p> <p>8 172:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9 118:12 120:1 130:19 147:25 155:4,15,17 155:21 166:7 167:9 172:13 176:13 181:10 202:4,24 9th 149:11 9:30 130:22</p>
---	--	---	--